

FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

RECESS MEETING

December 21, 2022

10:00 AM



Fulton County Government Center
Assembly Hall
141 Pryor Street SW
Atlanta, Georgia 30303



MINUTES-RATIFIED

This document has been ratified or approved by the Board of Commissioners, and is not binding on the County or any officer.

Ratification Date: January 18, 2023

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Robert L. Pitts **10:04 a.m.**

ROLL CALL: Tonya R. Grier, Clerk to the Commission

Robert L. Pitts, Chairman (At-Large)	PRESENT
Liz Hausmann, Vice-Chairman (District 1)	PRESENT
Bob Ellis, Commissioner (District 2)	PRESENT
Lee Morris, Commissioner (District 3)	PRESENT
Natalie Hall, Commissioner (District 4)	PRESENT
Marvin S. Arrington, Jr., Commissioner (District 5)	PRESENT
Khadijah Abdur-Rahman, Commissioner (District 6)	PRESENT

INVOCATION: Reverend Clifton Dawkins, Jr., County Chaplain

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Recite in unison

ANNOUNCEMENTS

PLEASE SWITCH ALL ELECTRONIC DEVICES (CELL PHONES, PAGERS, PDAs, ETC.) TO THE SILENT POSITION DURING THIS MEETING TO AVOID INTERRUPTIONS.

IF YOU NEED REASONABLE MODIFICATIONS DUE TO A DISABILITY, INCLUDING COMMUNICATIONS IN AN ALTERNATE FORMAT PLEASE CONTACT THE OFFICE OF THE CLERK TO THE COMMISSION. FOR TDD/TTY OR GEORGIA RELAY SERVICE ACCESS DIAL 711.

CONSENT AGENDA

22-0955 Board of Commissioners

Adoption of the Consent Agenda - All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Recess Meeting Agenda for separate consideration. **(ADOPTED AS AMENDED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Hausmann and seconded by Commissioner Morris, to adopt the Consent Agenda as amended by removing item #22-0966 for separate consideration as requested by Chairman Pitts. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0956 Board of Commissioners

Proclamations for Spreading on the Minutes. **(SPREAD ON THE MINUTES UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Proclamation recognizing “Melissa Booker Middlebrook Appreciation Day.” **(Abdur-Rahman)**
December 3, 2022

Proclamation recognizing “Archie Emerson Appreciation Day.” **(Hall)**
December 10, 2022

Proclamation recognizing “Mission Agape Appreciation Day.” **(Abdur-Rahman)**
December 18, 2022

Commissioners' District Board Appointments

22-0957 Board of Commissioners

RESIDENTIAL CARE FACILITIES FOR THE ELDERLY AUTHORITY OF FULTON COUNTY **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Seven (7) directors appointed by the Board of Commissioners for initial terms of 2, 4, and 6 years, and thereafter for staggered terms of six (6) years. In the event of vacancies (RCM January 18, 1989, item #29) the Board of Commissioners shall appoint a person to serve.

Terms below expire: 12/31/2022
Jennifer Jones **(Ellis/District 2)**
Barbara McKee **(Carn/District 6)**

Commissioner Ellis nominated Jennifer Jones for a District reappointment to a term ending December 3, 2028.

22-0958 Board of Commissioners
ANIMAL WELFARE HEARING BOARD (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

The Animal Welfare Hearing Board shall consist of seven (7) members appointed by the Board of Commissioners. Each Commissioner shall appoint one member to serve for two years. Thereafter, all members may be appointed for an additional term of three years and until their successors are appointed.

Terms below expire: 12/31/2023
Vacant **(Resigned)(Pitts)**

Chairman Pitts nominated K.E. Levy for a District appointment to an unexpired term ending December 31, 2023.

Open & Responsible Government

22-0959 Human Resources Management
Request approval to renew an existing Independent Contractor Agreement between Fulton County and E. Anthony Daniels, PC, to provide legal counsel/representation to the Grievance Review Committee in the amount of \$35,098.00. This action exercises the first two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

22-0960 Finance
Ratification of November 2022 Grants Activity Report. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

22-0961 Finance
Request approval of the FY2023 Water and Sewer Budget. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Arts and Libraries

22-0962 Library
Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners approving the Form Contract, entitled "Memorandum of Agreement for Therapy Animal Programming within the Fulton County Library System" for use in the Fulton County Library System Therapy Animal Program; authorizing the County Manager or his designee to execute such Form Memorandum of Agreements and related documents; authorizing the County Attorney to approve the Form Memorandum of Agreements to form and to make changes thereto prior to execution; and for other related purposes. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

22-0963 Arts and Culture

Request approval to amend the Co-Marketing Agreement and acceptance of a grant in the amount of \$10,000.00 from Microsoft Corporation (Redmond, WA) to support facility and operational expenses of the Public Art Futures Lab, an initiative of the Public Art Program. The grant does not require a cash match. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

22-0964 Arts and Culture

Request approval of a public art contract to commission David Moore and Adam Deck to create a three site-specific, original works of art at three locations determined by the County using materials reclaimed from the Rogers Bridge, Johns Creek in the amount of \$54,700.00, and authorization of the County Attorney to approve the public art contract as to form and to make necessary changes to the contract to protect the County prior to execution. The term is upon BOC approval through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Health and Human Services

22-0965 Public Works

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Public Works, 20ITB112420A-FB, Emergency Sewage Cleanup Services in an amount not to exceed \$101,890.00 with American Property Restoration (Atlanta, GA), to provide emergency sewage cleanup services. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

22-0966 Community Development

Spreading on the Board of Commissioners Meeting Minutes. Contract between Fulton County and the National Black College Alumni Hall of Fame Foundation, Inc., a Georgia non-profit corporation (“NBCAHF”), in an amount not to exceed \$150,000.00 to serve as a catalyst and partner to help ensure the stability, viability, and excellence of the nation’s Historically Black Colleges and Universities (“HBCUs”) by implementing programs and initiatives that guarantee the success of future leaders of our nation. Effective upon BOC approval - December 31, 2022. **(APPROVED)**

ITEM REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA FOR SEPARATE CONSIDERATION AS REQUESTED BY CHAIRMAN PITTS

A motion was made by Commissioner Morris and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Ellis

22-0967 Community Development

Request approval to enter into a Memorandum of Agreement ("MOA") between Fulton County, as the GA 502 Fulton County Continuum of Care ("CoC") Collaborative Applicant, and the Georgia Department of Community Affairs, on behalf of the Georgia Housing and Finance Authority ("GHFA"), regarding the management of the State of Georgia's Homeless Management Information System ("HMIS"). The term is from December 1, 2022, through November 30, 2023. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

22-0968 Behavioral Health and Development Disabilities

Request approval to increase the spending authority - Department of Behavioral Health and Developmental Disabilities (BHDD) in an amount not to exceed \$15,237.00 with Farber Specialty Vehicles (Columbus, GA) to cover additional costs associated with the customized mobile vehicle unit for community outreach efforts throughout Fulton County These are grant funds (Mobile Unit for AHL 1 Grant) and the additional costs have been approved by the Grantor. Effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Infrastructure and Economic Development**22-0969 Select Fulton**

Request approval to increase the spending authority - Department of Economic Development, Select Fulton Workforce Development Division, 22RFP0121B-PS, WIOA Adult and Dislocated Worker Services via USDOL, ETA National Emergency Grant, to serve eligible COVID-19 Dislocated Worker clients, in the amount of \$697,000.00 with Arbor E&T, LLC dba Equus Workforce Solutions (Equus) (Louisville, KY) to provide comprehensive career services for Adult and Dislocated Workers for the Fulton County Local Workforce Development Board. Effective upon BOC approval. 100% grant funded. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

RECESS MEETING AGENDA**22-0970 Board of Commissioners**

Adoption of the Recess Meeting Agenda. **(ADOPTED AS AMENDED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Morris, to adopt the Recess Meeting Agenda as amended by revising item #22-0972 as requested by Commissioner Hall. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0971 Board of Commissioners

Ratification of Minutes. **(RATIFIED)**

Regular Meeting Post Agenda Minutes, December 7, 2022

Recess Meeting Minutes, November 16, 2022

A motion was made by Commissioner Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to ratify the meeting minutes. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Morris

22-0972 Board of Commissioners

Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. **(PRESENTED)**

Proclamation recognizing “Commissioner Liz Hausmann Appreciation Day.” **(BOC)**

Proclamation recognizing “Commissioner Lee Morris Appreciation Day.” **(BOC)**

Proclamation recognizing “Chief Judge Christopher Brasher Appreciation Day.” **(Hall)**

~~*Proclamation recognizing “100 Black Men of America, Inc. Appreciation Day.” **(Hall)**~~

~~*Proclamation recognizing “Medical Examiner’s Accreditation Week.” **(Hall)**~~

**removed during the meeting*

PUBLIC HEARINGS**22-0973 Board of Commissioners**

Public Comment - Citizens are allowed to voice County related opinions, concerns, requests, etc. during the Public Comment portion of the Commission meeting.

Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, whether such persons are commenting in-person, via emails or via Zoom or other electronic media (i.e., phone call). Non-Fulton County citizens will only be heard after all in-person Fulton County citizens, representatives of business and organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, have been heard and the time allotted for public comment has not expired, except as otherwise provided in this code section. County staff shall verify the residency of each public speaker prior to such person being heard by the board. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. Members of the public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The Public Comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes at the Regular Meeting, nor will this portion exceed thirty minutes at the Recess Meeting. In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Similarly, written comments (that were timely submitted) not previously read, may be read at the end of the meeting. For more information or to arrange a speaking date, contact the Clerk's Office. **(CONDUCTED)**

2 Speakers: Shirley Coleman (Grant Increase) and Linda Adams (Senior Services)

2 Zoom Speakers: Kevin Muldowney (Elections) and Ben Howard (Senior Services/Item #22-0929)

1 Emailed Comment: Richard King (Property Taxes)

COUNTY MANAGER'S RENEWAL ITEMS

Open & Responsible Government

22-0974 Information Technology

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Information Technology, 21ITB1007B-PS, Network Equipment Maintenance & Support in an amount not to exceed \$3,652,260.25 with Presidio Inc. (New York, NY) to provide provisioning, maintenance and support services of network and physical security equipment County-wide. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective January 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Ellis, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0975 Information Technology

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Department of Information Technology, 21ITB0101B-EC, Countywide Audio-Visual Services and Systems in a total amount not to exceed \$1,258,400.00 with (A) AVI-SPL LLC (Duluth, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$941,700.00 and (B) Basesix Systems, LLC (Marietta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$316,700.00, to provide Countywide audio-visual systems, equipment, support and services. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal option remains. Effective January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Ellis, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0976 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 19ITB432768K-JAJ, Task Order Contract for Minor Construction Projects in an amount not to exceed \$6,000,000.00 with (A) Brown & Root Industries Services, LLC (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed of \$1,000,000.00; (B) Astra Construction Services, LLC (Woodstock, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$1,000,000.00; (C) Complete Contracting Partners, LLC, formally CRM Construction Services, LLC (Austell, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$1,000,000.00; (D) Hawk Construction Company, LLC (Ellenwood, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$1,000,000.00; (E) Prime Contractors, Inc. (Powder Springs, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$1,000,000.00; and (F) Rubio and Sons Interior, Inc. (Dacula, GA), in an amount not to exceed \$1,000,000.00, to provide standby repair, alteration, modernization, maintenance, rehabilitation, and construction of buildings, structures, or other real property projects on a "task order" basis for Fulton County. This action exercises the third of three renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023.

(APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Ellis, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Pitts

22-0977 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 21RFP127274K-BKJ, Comprehensive Operation and Preventive and Predictive Maintenance Services for the Fulton County Jail and the South Fulton Municipal Regional Jail in an amount not to exceed \$5,531,120.00 with Johnson Controls, Inc., (Atlanta, GA), to provide comprehensive operation, preventive and corrective maintenance services for the Fulton County Jail, Jail South Annex in Union City, and the Fulton County North Annex Jail in Alpharetta. This action exercises the second of four renewal options. Two renewal options remain. Effective Dates: January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023.

(APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Ellis, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Pitts

22-0978 Human Resources Management

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Human Resources Management, 20RFP0810B-EC, Family and Medical Leave (FMLA) Act Administration Services, in the amount of \$97,037.00 with Sedgwick Claims Management, Inc. (Memphis, TN) to provide comprehensive FMLA administration for the Fulton County workforce. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Ellis

Health and Human Services**22-0929 Senior Services**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Senior Services, 21RFP000027A-CJC, Senior Transportation Services in the amount of \$6,386,735.47 with Transdev, Incorporated (East Point, GA) to provide transportation services for Senior Services and Behavioral Health programs. This is the first of four renewal options. Three renewal options remain. Effective January 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023. **(HELD ON 12/7/22) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Ellis, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Hausmann

Did Not Vote: Morris

22-0979 Public Works

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Public Works, 21ITB000014A-CJC, Sanitary Sewer Easement Maintenance in the amount of \$871,732.29 with NaturChem, Inc., (Conyers, GA) to provide sanitary sewer easement maintenance in both North and South Fulton service areas. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Hausmann and seconded by Commissioner Morris, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Ellis

COUNTY MANAGER'S ITEMS

Open & Responsible Government

22-0980 County Manager

Presentation of Fulton County Operational Report. **(PRESENTED)**

22-0981 Purchasing and Contract Compliance

Request approval of a Resolution to extend emergency purchasing authority of the Chairman and County Manager for COVID-19 related purchases; and for other purposes. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Morris and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0982 Finance

Discussion of FY2023 Proposed Budget. **(DISCUSSED)**

22-0983 Registration & Elections

Request approval to process outstanding and current invoices via purchase order - Department of Registration & Elections, in the total amount not to exceed \$65,794.63 with (A) H&M Development and Management, LLC dba Decatur Atlanta Printing (Decatur, GA) in the amount of \$57,073.13 and (B) Patriot Signage, Inc. (Cincinnati, OH) in the amount of \$8,721.50 for providing printing services for the November 8, 2022 General Election and December 6, 2022 Runoff. Effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Hausmann, and Ellis

22-0984 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a statewide contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, SWC# 99999-001-SPD0000100-0002, Office, Computer and Educational Furniture not to exceed the amount of \$149,417.09 with Office Design Concepts Georgia dba Affordable Interior Systems, Inc (Leominster, MA), to provide new office furnishings, including delivery and installation services, for the Fulton County Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Court. Effective upon BOC approval. This is a one-time procurement. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Morris, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Hausmann

22-0985 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidders - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 22ITB134621K-JAJ, Roof Maintenance, Repair and Replacement Services Countywide in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000.00 with (A) RYCARS Construction, LLC (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$700,000.00, (B) Ideal Building Solutions, LLC (Norcross, GA) an amount not to exceed \$500,000.00, and (C) Ben Hill Roofing and Siding Co, Inc (Douglasville, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$300,000.00, to provide standby roof maintenance, repair, and replacement services on an "as-needed" basis for Countywide facilities effective January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023, with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Arrington, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Pitts

22-0986 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a statewide contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, SWC#99999-001-SPD0000203-0001, SWC#99999-001-SPD0000203-0003, and SWC#99999-001-SPD0000203-0004, Tires, Tubes, Accessories and Repair Services in the total amount of \$175,000.00 with (A) Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations, LLC d/b/a Atlanta Commercial Tire, Inc. (Forest Park, GA) in an amount of \$25,000.00; (B) The Goodyear Tire & Rubber Company d/b/a Nextire Commercial, Inc. (Decatur, GA) in the amount of \$125,000.00; and (C) Continental Tire the Americas d/b/a Hill Tire Company, Inc. (Forest Park, GA) in the amount of \$25,000.00, to provide tires, tubes, accessories and repair services for Fulton County fleet vehicles. Effective dates: January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Arrington, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0987 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval to amend an existing contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 21RFP127274K-BKJ, Comprehensive Operation and Preventive and Predictive Maintenance Services for the Fulton County Jail and the South Fulton Municipal Regional Jail with Johnson Controls, Inc., (Atlanta, GA), to add the Fulton County North Annex Jail, located at 2565 Old Milton Parkway, Alpharetta, GA 30009. Effective January 1, 2023. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Health and Human Services**22-0988 Senior Services**

Request approval of recommended proposals - Senior Services 22RFP035A-CJC, Aging Services in the total amount of \$4,487,656.46 with (A) Senior Services North, Inc. (Alpharetta, GA) in the amount of \$1,779,844.50; (B) South Fulton Senior Services (College Park, GA) in the amount of \$1,469,171.63; and (C) Visiting Nurses Health Systems (Atlanta, GA) in the amount of \$1,238,640.33 to provide Aging Services for Fulton County seniors aged 60 and above. Effective January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023 with four renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0989 Public Works

Request approval of a Public Private Partnership Memorandum Of Understanding (P3MOU) between Fulton County and the Georgia Department of Transportation (GDOT) for sewer relocations associated with Project PI-0017135, to add two (2) new at-grade and elevated, barrier separated express lanes in both directions along I-285 between Chattahoochee River and Peachtree Industrial Boulevard, and in both directions along SR 400 from Glenridge Connector to the North Springs MARTA Station, at no cost to Fulton County. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Arrington, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0990 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 22ITBC073A-KM, Fire Hydrants and Parts in the amount of \$386,728.00 with Core & Main, LP (Athens, GA), to provide fire hydrants and parts. Effective January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023 with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Hausmann and seconded by Commissioner Morris, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Hausmann

22-0991 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 22ITBC074A-JWT, Corporation Stops and Brass Fittings in the amount of \$397,959.03 with Delta Municipal Supply Company (Lawrenceville, GA) to provide corporation stops and brass fittings. Effective January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023 with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Hausmann and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0992 Behavioral Health and Development Disabilities

Request approval of a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with Linking Efforts Against Drugs (LEAD) in the amount of \$23,500.00 for a Countywide TEXT-4-HELP program. Effective January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Hausmann and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

COMMISSIONERS' ACTION ITEMS**22-0884 Board of Commissioners**

Request approval of a Resolution consenting to and ratifying the use of Fulton County Ad Valorem property tax increment for a project located in Westside Tax Allocation Bond District Number 1- Atlanta/Westside. **(Morris) (HELD ON 11/16/22 AND 12/7/22) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Morris and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0952 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution to establish supplement for the Tax Commissioner and for other purposes. **(Pitts) (HELD ON 12/7/22) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Chairman Pitts and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Hausmann, Ellis, and Morris

22-0993 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners expressing support of the 117th Congress' House Resolution 1382 and Senate Resolution 790 which commemorate the Atlanta Race Massacre by honoring the victims and reaffirming the commitment of the United States Congress to combat hatred, injustice and white supremacy; and for other purposes. **(Hall)**
(APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Hausmann

22-0994 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners urging the Georgia General Assembly to pass a Resolution acknowledging the atrocities of the Atlanta Race Massacre on 1906, honoring the victims, and reaffirming the State of Georgia's commitment to combat hatred, injustice and white supremacy; and for other purposes. **(Hall)** **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0995 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners repealing Resolution 02-1414 and Resolution 03-1465 to conclude Fulton County's participation in the Princeton Lakes and Eastside TADS contingent upon certain findings by County staff; authorizing and directing the County Manager to send notice to the City of Atlanta of this decision by the Board of Commissioners upon verification that no outstanding Fulton County obligations with the Princeton Lakes and Eastside TADS exist; directing County staff to continue to actively review all remaining TADS and present a Resolution to the Board of Commissioners when necessary to repeal and conclude Fulton County's participation in any TAD determined to have no outstanding Fulton County obligations remaining; and for other purposes. **(Morris/Ellis) (APPROVED)**

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Morris and seconded by Commissioner Ellis, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, and Arrington

Nay: Hall

Did Not Vote: Abdur-Rahman

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Arrington, to hold. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yea: Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Hausmann, Ellis, and Morris

Did Not Vote: Pitts, and Arrington

22-0996 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizing the foreclosure crisis affecting the citizens of Fulton County, Georgia; expressing the Board of Commissioners' desire to assist Fulton County homeowners, homeowners associations, condominium associations, and property owners act associations in avoiding the foreclosure process; urging the Fulton County Superior Court to work with designated agencies to utilize available funding to prevent foreclosures; directing the Fulton County department of Community Development to provide resources to those at risk of being foreclosed upon; and for other purposes. **(Arrington) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Commissioners' District Board Appointments

**22-0894 Board of Commissioners
FULTON-DEKALB HOSPITAL AUTHORITY D/B/A GRADY HEALTH SYSTEM
(HELD ON 12/7/22) (APPROVED)**

Consists of ten (10) trustees (members). The Board of Commissioners of Fulton County appoints seven (7) trustees (members) and the Board of Commissioners of DeKalb County appoints three (3). (See Fulton County Code § 13-2-11). The Fulton County Code does not prescribe the method of appointment; however, historically, each Commissioner has appointed one person to serve.

Term = 4 years

Term below expires: 12/31/2024

Vacant (**District 6**)

Commissioner Abdur-Rahman nominated Thomas W. Dortch III for a District reappointment to an unexpired term ending December 31, 2024.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Hausmann

Commissioners' Full Board Appointments

**22-0997 Board of Commissioners
AUDIT COMMITTEE (APPROVED)**

Pursuant to Resolution #15-0461, adopted by the Board of Commissioners on May 20, 2015, the appointment process for the Audit Committee consists of the following amendments to the Fulton County Code of Ordinances Section 2-231: The Initial Audit Committee shall be composed as follows: (1.) Five (5) voting members; (2.) The initial Committee members shall include two (2) members of the Board of Commissioners and three (3.) citizens with expertise in the areas of accounting, auditing, internal control and local government operations; (3) The citizen members will be appointed by a majority vote of the Board of Commissioners. may not hold any elected office, may not be employed by the county, nor have any direct or indirect business relationship with the County; (4.) The citizen members will serve at the pleasure of the Board of Commissioners and may be removed at any time, with or without cause; (5.) The citizen members shall be paid a stipend of \$250.00 for each meeting attended but in no event shall the total stipend for a year exceed \$1,000.00; and Commissioners who serve as committee members will receive no compensation; and (6) Members of the Committee shall select a Chairperson from among its members annually.

Terms below expire: 12/31/2022

Commissioner Bob Ellis (**BOC - Commissioner**)

Commissioner Lee Morris (**BOC - Commissioner**)

Chairman Pitts nominated Commissioner Ellis (BOC-Commissioner) for a Full Board reappointment to a term ending December 31, 2024.

Term below expires: 12/31/2024

Vacant (**BOC-Citizen**)

Chairman Pitts nominated Ambuj "AJ" Jain (BOC-Citizen) for a Full Board appointment to a term ending December 31, 2024.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-0998 Board of Commissioners**BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE FULTON COUNTY EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM (APPROVED)**

Trustee position #1 is the Chairman or designee. Trustee positions #2 and #3, members of the Fulton County Commission, shall be designated or elected at a regular January meeting for one (1) year or until their successors have been appointed and qualified. Trustee Positions #4 and #5 are members of the Board of Trustees by virtue of their County position; hence their terms expire when their positions with the County terminate. Trustee Positions #6, #7, #8, #9, #10, #11, and #12 are held for four (4) years, after serving the initial staggered terms prescribed in the enabling Resolution.

Terms below expire: 12/31/2022

Commissioner Bob Ellis (**Position #3/BOC**)

Commissioner Khadijah Abdur-Rahman (**Position #2/BOC**)

Commissioner Abdur-Rahman nominated Commissioner Ellis (Position #3/BOC) for Full Board reappointment to a term ending December 31, 2023.

Commissioner Ellis nominated Commissioner Abdur-Rahman (Position #2/BOC) for Full Board reappointment to a term ending December 31, 2023.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Morris, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Arrington

COUNTY MANAGER'S PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION ITEMS**Justice and Safety****22-0999 Sheriff**

Discussion: Fulton County Sheriff Labat - FY2023 Budget (**DISCUSSED**)

COMMISSIONERS' PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION ITEMS**22-1000 Board of Commissioners**

Discussion: Invest Atlanta Board of Directors November 17, 2022 Meeting Summary (**Morris**) (**DISCUSSED**)

22-1001 Board of Commissioners

Discussion: Atlanta BeltLine, Inc. December 14, 2022 CEO Report (**Morris**) (**DISCUSSED**)

22-1002 Board of Commissioners

Discussion: Council on Aging Audit (**Pitts**) (**DISCUSSED**)

22-1003 Board of Commissioners

Discussion: Magistrate Court Clerk and Staff Positions **(Pitts) (HELD)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to hold. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

22-1004 Board of Commissioners

Discussion: Boards, Authorities, Commissions and Task Forces **(Pitts) (HELD)**

EXECUTIVE SESSION

22-1005 Board of Commissioners

Executive **(CLOSED)** Sessions regarding litigation **(County Attorney)**, real estate **(County Manager)**, and personnel **(Pitts)**. **(APPROVED)**

PRESENT IN THE EXECUTIVE SESSION REGARDING LITIGATION, REAL ESTATE, AND PERSONNEL: Chairman Pitts, Vice-Chairman Hausmann, Commissioners: Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington and Abdur-Rahman; County Manager Dick Anderson; Chief Financial Officer Sharon Whitmore; Director of Finance Hakeem Oshikoya, Chief Human Resources Officer Kenneth Hermon; Budget Manager Sabrina McTier; County Attorney Y. Soo Jo; and Clerk to the Commission Tonya R. Grier.

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to enter into Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Ellis, Morris, Hall, and Arrington

Did Not Vote: Hausmann, and Abdur-Rahman

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Ellis, to approve the request for authorization for the County Manager to negotiate and finalize an offer for the purchase of property as discussed in item #5 in Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Hausmann, Ellis, Morris, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:38 p.m.

FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONER'S
RECESS MEETING
DECEMBER 21, 2022
10:00 A.M.

Alexander Solutions, LLC

(Whereupon, the meeting was called to order at 10:04 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Good morning and welcome to the Board of Commissioners of Fulton County Meeting. This is December 21st 2022. It is 10:04 a.m. Madam Clerk, please call the roll."

CLERK GRIER: "Chairman Robb Pitts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Vice Chairman Liz Hausmann."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Bob Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Lee Morris."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Natalie Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Marvin Arrington, Jr. Commissioner Khadijah Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Mr. Chairman, you have a quorum."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. All right. Please rise for the invocation followed by the Pledge of Allegiance."

(Whereupon the invocation was given by Reverend Dawkins followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk. Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 2, Consent Agenda, **22-0955**, Adoption of the Consent Agenda - All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the

County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Recess Meeting Agenda for separate consideration."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Any items, Madam Clerk?"

CLERK GRIER: "I don't have any."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioners?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. On page 4, item number 0966. All right. I'll entertain a motion to approve as amended. A motion to approve as amended by Commissioner -- Vice Chair Hausmann, seconded by Commissioner Morris. Please, vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Are you removing 66?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "All right."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: ""On page 5, Recess Meeting Agenda, **22-0970**, Adoption of the Recess Meeting Agenda. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board we have an amendment to today's Agenda. On page 5, 22-0972, we're removing the Proclamations recognizing '100 Black Men of America' and the 'Medical Examiner's Accreditation Week' sponsored by Commissioner Hall. These Proclamations will be heard at a later meeting. That's all I have."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: That's all? Anything, Commissioners?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve the agenda as amended. The motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Morris. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0971**, Ratification of Minutes. Regular Meeting Post Agenda Minutes, December 7th. Recess Meeting Minutes, November 16th, 2022."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Ellis; it's seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please, vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0972**, Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. The first proclamation is recognizing 'Commissioner Liz Hausmann Appreciation Day' sponsored by Chairman Pitts and the Full Board of Commissioners".

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Let's come on down. Let's get all of the friends and family here of Commissioner Hausmann -- Vice Chair Hausmann, Liz. Come on down. Yeah, well, I know definitely -- yeah, well, I know the lady here in the vest is pretty shy, so. You can balance it out. We got former -- you got staff they can come on down -- former staff, so. All right. A all y'all folks up there and outside, you can come down here, too. Oh, well, you know who your friends are, so. All right. Come on down, Edward. We're definitely -- this is not. We don't really have -- this is not enough to really celebrate the service that these two folks have provided, so it's a little bit of a token; and to sort of truly demonstrate, you know, how in to service they are. We're going to feed them and celebrate them, and then they're going to turn around and sit with us for eight hours during this Commission meeting, right? So, can't leave early. All right. All right. WHEREAS, Commissioner Liz Hausmann has served on the Fulton Board of Commissioners since 2011 representing the City of Johns Creek and portions of Alpharetta, Roswell, and Sandy Springs. With prior experience on the inaugural's Johns Creek City Council and Fulton County Board of Education. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Hausmann's extensive experience in local governments led her colleagues to name her to the leadership position of Fulton County Vice Chairman in 2015 and 2016, as well as in 2022. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Hausmann was instrumental in bringing services to her community with the establishment of the Maxwell Road office and connected local businesses to reuse water from the Johns Creek environmental campus, renovation of all public libraries, and the creation of two new library branches in North Fulton, installation of public art at Collie Creek, and the

reopening of the Alpharetta Jail Annex in 2022. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Hausmann prioritized cooperation with Fulton County cities and spurred the creation of regular meetings between the Board of Commissioners and Fulton Mayors, resulting in ground breaking regional transportation and infrastructure solutions such as T-SPLOST 1 and 2, and the Fulton County Transit Master Plan. And WHEREAS during Commissioner Hausmann's tenure as the executive sponsor for economic development, Fulton County experience tremendous job creation, local business growth, and business relocations all while maintaining the lowest responsible millage rate and tax burden to Fulton County taxpayers. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Hausmann also played an important role in maintaining the public health and safety of Fulton County and worked to outsource behavior health services for more innovative and better health outcomes; raise awareness of the dangers of substance abuse, and pass legislation providing Fulton's first responders with Narcan at the beginning of the opioid epidemic which enabled them to save lives. And passed legislation to share CARES Act resources with Fulton County cities during the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic. WHEREAS, Commissioner Hausmann's leadership extended beyond the borders of Fulton County, and include a service to statewide organization such as the Criminal Justice Coordinating Council, Fort McPherson Local Redevelopment Authority Board, the Georgia House Commission on Transit Governance and Finance, and the Association of County Commissioners of Georgia. And leadership positions on the Board of Managers Executive Committee, and Policy Counsel, as well as service to the National Association of Counties with two terms as Chairman of the Transportation Policy Steering Committee. WHEREAS, Commissioner Hausmann services as a Fulton County Commissioner will conclude at the end of 2022; as she leaves behind an aspirational legacy of achieving success through regional collaboration. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Board of Commissioners commends Vice Chair Liz Hausmann for her long-standing service to the citizens of Fulton County, and does hereby proclaim Wednesday, December 21, 2022, as 'Vice Chairman Liz Hausmann Appreciation Day' in Fulton County Georgia."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I see you looking at me. You know I had to say something because we have spent many a day and night on the phone and texting each other; talking to each other. And, you know, we really started back when Commissioner Garner was here as a County Commissioner and it continued. And our friendship and our collaboration got even stronger once I became Commissioner. And we started off with an unspoken rule of, you know we're going to be very honest with each other; if we support something, we will say it. If we don't, we will say it and we always gave each other an explanation as to why: never wavering on our word, and I'm a hundred percent

for truth. And if -- I don't care if it hurts my feelings, I want to know the truth and that's what you always gave me was the honest to God truth. And so, I'm really sad to see you going. People may, you know, a lot of people were shocked at the collaboration that we have, but you are a genuine person. And I appreciate you for that. And, you know; if you need anything beyond this, just contact me. You know we will talk about anything and everything. Thank you for your service; and, hey, Natalie -- hey, Natalie."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Commissioner, this is for you. And I just wanted to say, it has truly been a pleasure to work with you. And although we had many differences, what I found over my eight years is that we had more in common than we did apart. We both cared about the citizens of Fulton County. And so, I thank you for your service to Fulton County, and we're still going to need you. So have your phone ready".

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Vice Chair Hausmann, I said it earlier and I'll say it again. Many times I didn't know if you wanted to kick or kiss me, but as my seatmate, I learned so much from you. Whether I disagreed with you or not, you are passionate about the taxpayers; you are passionate about making sure that we did right by Fulton County. And as you leave and embark on a new journey, we are definitely going to miss you. We're going to miss your leadership. And I appreciate you and I wish you well."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "And I know we all said some remarks up here, so I'm going to abbreviate that I'm not going to say anymore. We have -- Vice Chair, we have -- but you get to come up here and share with us."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Well, thank you and, yes -- I'll going to try and make it through some brief remarks without crying, but it's been 12 years. And I know, Mr. Chairman you're going to be timing this, so I'm going to do my best to do it quickly. But, yeah, 12 years is a long time. I want to thank my friends and family and my longtime staff and former staff for coming today. It means the world to me. Sorry. The proclamation was wonderful and there's so many things that I'm so thrilled that I was a part. You know, when we created the City of Johns Creek 20 years ago almost, it was an easy sale to the community because folks felt like the county did not pay attention to them. And I think we change that in a lot of ways and that's what I'm most proud of is changing the image of the county. I ran initially for this seat for three reasons. I wanted to bring physical responsibility to the county while keeping taxes low. Bringing on Dick Anderson as County Manager really was the step that made those things possible. And I'll be forever grateful to the leadership of Dick Anderson to get the finances in order

with the help of the Commissioners, and at our direction, but to really right-size this ship, fix our buildings, you know, improve our customer service; just the list is almost endless for the improvements that have been made under his leadership and I just want to publicly thank him for that. I also ran because I felt like that the taxpayers that pay for everything, should get a return on that investment. And I'm very proud of all the services that are now north of the river that really weren't there 12 years ago. So that's another thing I'm very proud of. And then most proud of the relationships with our cities. I'll never forget going down to the GMA Conference with box lunches, and literally introducing ourselves to each other. We had 12 Mayors at that point that were there and really didn't know each other at all; and the work we accomplished since that point has been quite significant. We don't always agree, but we communicate and I hope that continues. It's so important for the lifeblood of the county and the cities that we all serve. So, I'm very, very pleased with that. There's some unfinished projects. There's always going to be unfinished projects; 4700 our healthcare in North Fulton, our facility are really pleased to see that is starting back up. We paused during COVID, so that'll be coming on the next couple of years. The animal shelter is under construction; that'll be coming on next year. I'm really, really proud of that work, but there's a lot of looming issues: the talk of a new jail, the issue with our healthcare delivery crises, the next Commission has a lot to deal with, so I'll be watching. Always ready to help in any way that I can. But in closing I just want to say that nationally, Fulton County is a leader, and we're also recognized as being one of the toughest Commissions' to serve on. I've heard if time and time again with folks across the country because we're politically divided. But I want to tell you that that's what makes our county so great is that we can work together. And I think we've proven that and to Commissioner Hall kind of went into that: We in public, we try and put on the same face, we fight, you know, about things often, but that's healthy. It's healthy for our community, so I'm going to miss y'all. It's been a pleasure and I just thank you so much."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'Commissioner Lee Morris Appreciation Day' sponsored by Chairman Pitts and the Full Board of Commissioners".

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Come on down."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Yes, friends and family, please join us."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Staff."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Staff. It is truly my pleasure to have the duty and the responsibility to read this proclamation honoring Commissioner Lee Morris and

his tenure as Fulton County Commissioner; and even before that as an Atlanta City Council-member. The proclamation reads as follows: WHEREAS, Commissioner Lee Morris was born in Greenville, Alabama and in his youth lived in 14 different cities before graduating from the public schools in suburban Washington, D.C. He earned his undergraduate degree from Duke University and his law degree from Emory University School of Law. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Morris has been active for 45 years in his church, Saint Dustan's Episcopal having served as vestryman, treasurer, youth advisor, Sunday school teacher, choir member, occasional soloist, and guitarist. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Morris spent the majority of his career as General Counsel and chief financial officer for Stevens and Wilkinson, an Atlanta-based architectural engineering firm. And he served two years -- two four-year terms on the Atlanta City Council in the 1990s where he chaired the city's utilities and zoning committees, and the finance executive committee. Was an outspoken critic of corruption and waste in government. And was a proponent of stronger environmental policy, new urbanism, alternatives to automobile oriented policies, and campaign finance reform. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Morris served two four-year terms on the Fulton County Commission, and served as a member of the audit committee that defined benefit committee, the defined contribution committee, represented Fulton County on the Invest Atlanta Board of Directors, and the Atlanta Beltline Board of Directors; and served as priority area sponsor for justice and safety on the Justice Coordinating Council, the Justice Reinvested Initiative, and Project Orca. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Morris has always believed in government transparency, and helped to establish the whistleblower hotline through his work on the audit committee. And he worked to increase transparency at the department -- at the Development Authority of Fulton County; successfully securing open meetings, published agenda, and seats for school board members on the Authority. And WHEREAS, Commissioner Morris also known as the 'Taxpayers Friend' has never voted for a tax increase and the millage rate never increased during his tenure. He also worked to clarify and expand Homestead exemptions. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes Commissioner Lee Morris for his commitment to service and for his outstanding representation of the citizens of District 3 and Fulton County, and does hereby proclaim Wednesday, December 21st, 2022 as 'Commissioner Lee Morris Appreciation Day' in Fulton County. Let's hear it -- give him a big round of applause".

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I said this earlier at the reception, but Commissioner Morris, you're more than a seatmate. You've been a mentor for me. Our days go back to the Atlanta City Council days when I was very outspoken on some of the criticism of leadership, and I stood by myself and that criticism and you were one of

the people that came to me and said, you know, if you're right stand on it; don't feel bad about it. I am so sad -- well, one part of me is sad that you're not going to be here because I won't be able to have you to yield your time to me anymore. But more importantly, I'm glad that you will be able to spend time with your grandchildren, with your lovely mate, and I know as long as you don't change your number on me that you will continue to mentor and guide me. And I appreciate and love you dearly".

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "I said a few things earlier, but one more thing and I just wanted to say, as you were going through the proclamation. I just thought about Commissioner Morris as, you know, there's a lot -- in the political world today, you know, people see things they don't like; a lot of politician's their style is to be acclaimed, right? You know, whether it's on social media or whatnot Commissioner Morris saw a lot of things he didn't like, but he figured out the way to not only have the right voice about it without alienating people, but to do it in a way to get something done about it. And there are a lot of lessons that can be learned from that. It's something that I've taken in terms of observing Commissioner Morris in the way that he's conducted himself and continues to conduct himself today. So, thank you for everything. Thank you for your leadership and, you know, I have a feeling for both Vice Chair Hausmann and Commissioner Morris that service is in their DNA, and we've probably not seen the last of them. And they're going to be engaged with us in different capacities making -- continue to make our communities better."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Commissioner Morris, I wish you well. You know, you were one of the first congratulation's cards that I received when I was elected, and one of the first to reach out and meet with me. I have to go back down memory lane, meeting with you at Seasons 52 in Buckhead; you telling me about your history and, you know, the story of your first beginnings and how you got to where you are today. And it was very humble beginnings, so it helped me understand the real man behind Lee Morris, the statesmen, the person who really does care about the people, and I appreciate you so much for that. You never hesitated to contact me if you needed to talk about something and you were very honest about it. I appreciate all of that and I wish you well. And I know that this is not the last time that we will see you. So farewell, but we'll see you again."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Lee, I couldn't let this opportunity go by without thanking you for your solid measured thoughtful leadership that you brought to Fulton County. And it's been an honor to serve with you. And I've always known that your wisdom just was far and wide and you had many, many talents. Didn't know you played the guitar. I got a guitar upstairs; I'm going to come to you. Will you give me some

lessons? All the best to you. You've earned it. You deserve all of the accolades that you're getting today and you deserve the time off to spend with your precious children here. So, thank you again".

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "I'll be quick, Mr. Chairman. I do want to acknowledge the folks who are up here with me. My partner, Marilyn Morgan, my youngest daughter, Jessie and her husband, Tim; my two youngest grandchildren, Roy and Max, wherever he is. And my incredible staff, Jenn Thomas and Michelle Anderson. I've always said that one of the greatest honors someone can have is to be elected by their friends and neighbors to represent them in government. But of course with that honor, comes great responsibility; and I've always tried to remember that and act accordingly. It has been a great honor to serve with these incredible colleagues all of whom I learned to respect and admire. Their passionate; and in some cases their very vocal passion and in other cases -- in all the cases, just wisdom and compassion and concern for the citizens of Fulton County. That is what is activated on all of the actions of these six colleagues over the years. And it's also been an honor to work with the great folks in Fulton County. My experience with the City wasn't one that sometimes you could admire some of the folks who worked in there. You all remember the days; I think we put 35 folks in prison from that administration. That doesn't happen in Fulton County. Fulton County is an incredibly well-run government; and it's a tribute to everyone who works in Fulton County that that's the case in every department I've experienced. I do want to take a minute to thank Jenn Thomas who's professional demeanor has meant the world to me over the past however many years you came over, eight. She came over not as my Chief of Staff, Harriet came over as my Chief of Staff, initially and then she went back to Robb to my loss. But Jenn has been an incredible, incredible Chief of Staff. And Michelle Anderson, whose infectious cheerfulness is an incredible tribute. These two have done so much for Fulton County because they respond to those citizens and those constituents and make them happy, and make them trust in and like Fulton County, and that is a huge, huge thing in government. So I want to thank them. And I want to thank my family. My sweet Jessie, who walked door to door with me in '93 when I first ran for City Council. She was eight. My older kids didn't really care to do that, but Jessie did. And she's always had an interest in government. And my sweet grandchildren -- that's why we do this for our grandchildren -- children and grandchildren in the future. so, thank you. It's been a tremendous honor for my eight years. This is sort of needed. It's like being able to attend your own funeral to hear all these good things about you. You can't do that, you know, at your real funeral. But anyway, thank you all so much."

CLERK GRIER: "The last proclamation is recognizing 'Chief Judge Christopher Brasher Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "There we go. All right. Judge Brasher, it is an honor to present you with this proclamation because we are truly going to miss you. You've done a lot -- just conversations behind-the-scenes to get things done; and the collaboration and togetherness that you have in your heart to work for the people is commendable. And so, the proclamation reads: WHEREAS, Chief Judge Christopher Brasher has served on the Superior Court of Fulton County since 2006, and has chosen to end his time on the bench in December of 2022. And WHEREAS, Judge Brasher has previously served as assistant district attorney, Alcovy Judicial Circuit from 1991 to 1995, Assistant Attorney General, Georgia Attorney General's Office from 1995 to 1997, and Senior Assistant Attorney General, Public Safety Section of the Georgia Attorney General's Office from 1997 to 2006. And WHEREAS, while in practice, Judge Brasher appeared in state and federal courts across Georgia, including appearances in the Superior Courts of over 110 counties, and also made dozens of appellate arguments in the Georgia Supreme Court, the Georgia Court of Appeals, the Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals, and the United States Supreme Court. And WHEREAS, Judge Brasher is a board member of the North Fulton Bar Association, a member of the Atlanta Bar Association, and the Lawyers Club of Atlanta, a Master of Lamar Inn of Court at Emory University, and has served as Chairman of the Georgia Crime Victims Compensation Commission. And WHEREAS, Judge Brasher's greatest achievement is his family including his wife of 30 years, Jennifer, and their two adult children. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, That the Fulton County Board of Commissioners commends Chief Judge Christopher Brasher for 16 years of dedicated service to the Fulton County judicial system, and does hereby proclaim Wednesday, December 7th, 2022 as 'Chief Judge Christopher Brasher Appreciation Day' in Fulton County, Georgia. Thank you for your service Chief Judge Brasher."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "As someone who's had to appear before Judge Brasher as an attorney, it is truly been a pleasure to work with you in the courtroom to see how you handle and operate your courtroom in an efficient manner. And I'm just thankful that we have judges like you, who operate with integrity, and it is just -- it has been a pleasure to be an attorney in your presence and in your court. So we thank you for your service, judge. We know that you do it because you're committed to the residents of Fulton County. Thank you."

CHIEF JUDGE CHRISTOPHER BRASHER: "Thank y'all very much. I want to say, thank you especially to the Commissioners for your leadership; for your partnership. So

as a judge, personally, my take on this undertaking if you will, was to be steward of authority and to be a good steward of authority. Because I realized that the awesome responsibility I had as a judge was for me to keep safe; not for me to keep. And so, I always tried to do whatever I did as a judge with that in mind because we had to make decisions that affected people's lives and livelihoods on a daily basis. As Chief Judge for the last three years, I sought to not only come over here to ask, but also to explain. And to engage in a conversation as opposed to telling something. And I hope that that has been well received. I think that we've made some significant strides with our court system that is due primarily to the leadership of the Commission, but I also want to specifically thank Dick Anderson and Alton Adams. I don't think that in a time of great trouble like COVID, I could have looked across the street, across Pryor Street and found better -- better partners to work with than the Commissioners and with Dick Anderson and Alton Adams. And so, that's meant a lot to me, personally, but it's meant a lot to the county. There are a lot of things that happens in the justice system that people don't see. And so, being able to have an opportunity to explain how it works, what's necessary, and to have that listened to and acted upon has been extremely gratifying, and it's made our justice system better here in Fulton County. So thank you all very much for that. I am very appreciative of the proclamation and of the recognition, but I must much more appreciative of the relationship that is interdependent. So thank you all very much. I appreciate that. I also want to mention thank you to folks on my side of the street, if you will, led by David Summerlin our great court administrator. David has led us through a number of very difficult challenges not the least of which is COVID, so thank you very much to him. I think his partnership over here has meant a lot as well. And then Max Arrechea, who was my judicial assistant for a long time is here. On behalf of my work-family and so thank y'all very much for that as well. So, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "One, two, three. Come on now. Let's go. All right. Madame Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 6, Public Hearings, **22-0973**, Public Comment. Citizens wishing to participate in public comment will be allowed to appear in person or may choose to participate virtually via Zoom videoconferencing, or by submitting their comments in writing by registering on the county website www.fultoncountyga.gov. Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. The public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The public comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30

minutes. In the event the 30 minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have received two speaker cards here in Assembly Hall. Will Shirley Coleman and Linda Adams, please come down."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. And as always, when you have two minutes remaining, I will say -- simply say, 15 seconds and that will be your -- to conclude your remarks."

SHIRLEY COLEMAN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning and Happy Holidays everyone. My name is Shirley Henderson Coleman. I'm director of development and marketing with Sadie G. Mays Health and Rehabilitation Center. We've been here before, so I just wanted to remind you that we are here and looking forward to working with you guys. We're located in northwest Atlanta on Anderson Avenue just off of ML King Drive near I-20 West. And we're a two hundred and six beds skilled, non-profit -- excuse me -- 206 beds nonprofit skilled nursing facility. And we provide long-term nursing home care, short-term rehabilitation, respite and hospice care. So this is our 75th year in operation. And we've been partners with Fulton County from the beginning. We're grateful for the partnership, too. When our founded, Mrs. Sadie Gray Mays needed a place to go to help the sick, blind, elderly African-Americans and poor whites of our community, Fulton County did it in the old Battle Hill Sanatorium and that was our first facility. And later, when we were able to build a new building in 1968, we contracted with Fulton County to take care of the sick and indigent elderly citizens of Fulton County. So we've been partners for a long time and we'd like to of course continue and strengthen that partnership. We've been faithfully serving the citizens of Fulton County every sense, and we've never close our doors. 81 percent of our residents who come in to our facility are Fulton County residents. 87% are Medicaid recipients and they deserve, of course, quality care, equipment, and facilities. So we receive a grant from Fulton County --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds.

SHIRLEY COLEMAN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- oh. We receive a grant; we would like you all to increase that grant per our contract and we appreciate this consideration. Thank you very much."

LINDA ADAMS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. Linda Adams, residents of the Vine City Neighborhood. Fulton County seniors are appreciative of the Fulton County neighborhood centers. They give us places to gather together and learn various

activities. It has come to my attention that recommendation has been made for vendors -- for vendors to manage the center next year. It appears that the recommended vendors or the same ones who are currently managing the centers. There have been some concerns around management at one of the centers in particular; and we'll like to understand how these recommendations are made? Are we to understand that the recommended vendors are the only qualified entity that submitted proposals? That information has not been made public. In essence, there are -- we are stuck with who we have because no one else can do the job. Lastly, are the senior voices considered when making these recommendations? As the recipient of the services, it's only fair that our voices, opinions, and feedback be used to make decisions that impact us. Again, we are appreciative, but we have rights as residents and voters in this county to impact decisions that are made on behalf of us, seniors. Thank you."

CLERK GRIER: Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board we have three speakers on Zoom."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Good morning, Commissioners. The first person to speak is Kevin Muldowney."

KEVIN MULDOWNEY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. First, I'd like to thank Commissioner Hausmann and Morris for the years of dedication and service. You guys will be missed. Thank you. It's clear Fulton BRE needs to clean house. Freshens everyone mind is the shamble of the Runoff Election we certified last week. The early voting lines were horrendous. Average weights times on the north side ran one to two hours with three hour waits common in the last two days. Some have claimed voter suppression; the news station would have been running with that narrative if it were the case on the south side of the county where the lines were quite a bit shorter. Are it could have been just ineptness on the part of the Fulton BRE. A typical Runoff has a narrow early -- a narrow early voting window, and in this case seven voting days rather than 19. But the BRE decided to open up only 23 early voting sites rather than the usual 36. It's no wonder the lines were so long. We then had the normal 200 or more precincts open on Election Day with average wait times of a few minutes. Terrible planning and execution. Ocee Library, again on the north side, as of December ninth had not reconciled their early voting, and did not expect to have it completed before Wednesday's two days after certification. I suspect this scenario at this location was not a complete outlier. Sounds like they may have certified with incomplete data. If we asked the BRE's IT Director, Dominique Olamo [Phonetic]. He will tell you as he's told you before, I'll get back to you. Speaking of Dominique, I

understand he recently bought a hundred thousand dollar Range Rover; pretty impressive on a 70,000-dollar salary --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds.

KEVIN MULDOWNEY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- from the county. Maybe he has a second income or so wealth from his country of citizenship, Nigeria. As I stated above we need to clean house. Nadine Williams is Richard Barron 2.0. She cannot be appointed as the permanent director and Dominique Olamo."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "The next person to speak is Ben Howard."

BEN HOWARD, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Greetings one and all; Ben Howard, Senior Advocate, Public Policy Analyst. They say, when the cats away the mice will play. The management of senior services saw to it that the Commission on Elder Affairs was away on vacation this December. And so it is that on Agenda Item 22-0929, Senior Services Management gets to present the unilateral grant on the contract for senior citizens transportation services with Transdev. And while on vacation, Commission on Elder Affairs members don't get to record a appreciation for Agenda Item 22-0996, and the proposed Resolution to help homeowners avoid the foreclosure process; and they get to opine on 22-0998, the proposal to fund aging services to seniors 60 years of age and older. And finally, they weren't advised to tune in to the Commission Chairman, Robb Pitts discussion about the Council on Aging Audit, item 22-1002. But vacation is over on January 2nd. Stay tuned."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "The last person to speak is Sheriee Davis. Sheriee Davis."

SHERIEE DAVIS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "I'm sorry. I did not raise my hand to speak."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "And that concludes the Zoom public comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

CLERK GRIER: "And we have one e-mailed in comment."

REGINA WALLER, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "The e-mail comment is from Richard King. I will not be able to attend the meeting. I do have a question. If people paid their

property taxes, can they get a new facial on their house? This concludes the e-mail comment. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Continue, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "Continuing on page 6, County Manager's Renewal Items Under Open and Responsible Government, **22-0974**, Information Technology: Request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$3,652,260.25 to provide maintenance support services of network and physical security equipment countywide."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, it's seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Any questions?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. No questions. Cast your vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 7, **22-0975**: Request approval to renew existing contracts in an amount not to exceed \$941,700 to provide countywide audiovisual systems equipment support and services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, it is seconded by Commissioner Ellis -- excuse me, Commissioner Ellis. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Mr. Chair."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Point of clarification: I think the total amount not to exceed is showing as 1.258. And it looks like there are two contracts; one is for 941 - \$941,700 and the second for \$316,700."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "That's correct."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Is that correct?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Yes."

CLERK GRIER: "Okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Commissioner Arrington. All right. The motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Ellis."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0976**, Real Estate and Asset Management: Request approval to renew existing contracts in an amount not to exceed \$6 million to provide standby repair maintenance and construction buildings and other real property projects."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, again seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0977**: Request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$5,531,120 to provide comprehensive operation preventative and corrective maintenance services for Fulton County Jail South Annex in Union City and North Annex Jail in Alpharetta."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, it's seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Vice Chair Hausmann you have the floor."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Yes, thank you, Mr. Chairman, I just had a quick question. I know we're in the process of -- we haven't completed it of moving folks out of Union City. Union City is listed as being part of this contract, so I'm just curious with what exactly is happening at Union City at this point?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: Commissioner, the Sheriff's office, to my understanding, completed the move out of the inmates all over this past weekend. However, we feel it prudent to keep the building in the contract so that we could do closeout services; not to mention we're not quite sure what the ultimate disposition of the facility will be. The contract term allows the county to provide a 30-day notice to the contractor to terminate service at any locations overall. And so that's our strategy moving forward."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So you're going to go ahead with this work or you going to wait just to see what might be happening there?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "So because the inmates have just recently been moved, one of the things that we have to do is we have to winterize the facility, shut down equipment, and things of that nature to close out the building. So our goal was to simply continue with the contract service, get all of those things taken care of; and depending upon what the ultimate disposition is with the building, we'll terminate that portion of the contract with a 30-day notice to the contractor."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "All right. My comment to that would be: I understand, you know, the need to tighten everything up if we're leaving it. But I would hope that we're not doing anything outside of that because I mean with the resources that we have, and they're so stretched, I would just hope that we would not be doing anything that's not completely necessary in that facility."

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Commissioner just an FYI: This is not to exceed amount as well."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So let me follow up on that. I'm not sure that I understand exactly what you've said. This is five million dollars on a facility that we're closing, so I need to hear more."

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "You know, sir, it's -- the contract covers --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- three --"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "-- yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I understand. What are the three?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "The three are the main jail located at 901 Rice Street, the jail South Annex located at 6500 Watson Street in Union City, as well as the North Jail Annex that we recently opened in Alpharetta at the Alpharetta Public Safety Training Center."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And how much now is going to -- how much of this, you think, is going to be spent on Union City and Alpharetta?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Alpharetta the quote that we received from the vendor was 244,401 that dollar amount includes \$75,000 for contingency services for things that are billable under the terms of conditions of the contract. The amount for the Union City jail --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- don't leave -- don't leave Alpharetta yet. How many -- how many inmates have we -- since our supposedly reopened, how many inmates are typically housed at -- in Alpharetta?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: The Sheriff's office would have to answer that question, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I'm told its two. Is that correct or incorrect?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Chairman Pitts, we think the capacity at Alpharetta is around --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- not capacity."

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "-- it's around 40 --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- not capacity."

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Right. We don't have the information on how many are actually housed there."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. From my perspective this has been a boondoggle on that Alpharetta jail from day one. No. 2, I can't see spending a penny on Union City that's going to be vacated or has been vacated. Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "A --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- particularly when the budget challenges that we have and you're going to have the Sheriff come in here later on today, this afternoon and as Mr. Adams is fond of say, every time he comes he leaves with 5 million. So maybe this is the 5 million or in addition to this five another five. Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah, I guess, just sort of a few things to clarify about this. All right. So this is a not to exceed contract, correct, right? So this is work orders. And if I read the papers right, this is obviously a fairly -- it presents some fairly unique maintenance challenges, but we got 1300 work orders a month roughly on this if I read that correct?"

CLERK GRIER: "That is correct, sir."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. So throughout, you know, kind of the entirety of the different facilities that we have, obviously it's probably over weighted it at the main sort of jail complex. And it looked like in terms of sort of past expenditures -- I think last year's contract was an up to amount of a little bit less than this, right? Or is it about the same amount?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "It was less the dollar value that has been added for the Alpharetta facility."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Right. So about 5.2 --"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "-- 5.2, yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Right. But our actual spend is probably going to trend down. Through 11/21 the actual spend is about 4.2 million?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Yes, through the 11th I can tell you because we just completed the year-end closeout --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- right."

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "-- that we have spent right at \$5 million on this contract."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. So, I mean, look, I mean, we've had a lot of discussion about jail capacity and, you know, obviously we need as much of it as we can get it right now in terms of optimization of that, I mean, I think that we do need to hear more from the Sheriff in terms of what his plans are to optimize those facilities. Whether that's Union City, you know, to continue to utilize Union City on some sort of capacity. And obviously the ramp-up of, you know, we got access to AC/DC; somewhere 20 beds, but we only have about 75 or a hundred, I think in that facility now, right?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Yes."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "I'm sure we have about -- when we moved, we had about 300 women in the facility as of Saturday."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Three hundred as of now?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "That's correct."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. That's a little bit confusing because the paper sort of indicted that the Mayor of Atlanta -- that the agreement said that we can move like a hundred a month."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Once we moved the women which we agreed --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: -- okay."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: -- and then it can be incrementally a hundred a month."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah, so, you know, I mean, I think in terms of optionality in terms of the facilities, it's important and I do think in terms of, you know, of kind of understanding -- I guess it's -- I did have some sort of -- he can go into this when he's here -- he indicated -- the Sheriff indicated to me this morning that the Alpharetta facility was being used as sort of a drop-off and they are doing, you know, kind of different offenders are coming in there and they're transported down so that's working as intended. And it sounds like they've moved about ten to 15 people up there recently as well. So obviously maximization of these facilities as we open them up, we need to understand that how that's working in the transparency end of that. To your point on that, Mr. Chairman, but I do think, you know, given the challenges we've had with jail capacity, the notion of sort of shuttering any of these facilities right now at the moment is probably not the most prudent thing to do."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you Commissioner. Commissioner Morris."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Yes, I just wanted to find out exactly what Johnson Controls is going to do? It talks about maintenance and that sort of thing. I've known them from my prior life; you know HVAC controls and that sort of thing; not construction."

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Yes, while as a corporate entity HVAC controls is their wheelhouse. Johnson Controls has long since expanded into site maintenance. And so, Johnson Controls is responsible for all aspects of preventive, predictive, and corrective maintenance at the jail facilities. That includes not only your HVAC systems, but also your fire alarm systems, plumbing systems. Essentially, our modus operandi, if you will, is if it is broken, Johnson Controls is responsible for repairing it. And in certain cases those things are billable to the county outside of their base cost. Those things are typically related to vandalism which is at a higher rate at the jail."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Okay. So that would include drywall?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Absolutely --"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "-- and things like that?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "There won't be any more maintenance contracts coming along?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "No, sir, it is an all-inclusive contract."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Thank you. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Other questions or comments?"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Just one last question."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Just point of clarification, too: This particular contract in terms of where it resides in sort of the viewing of our budget, it sits outside of the Sheriff's budget, correct?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "That is correct."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Right. So, in terms of just sort of true cost of sort of just running the entirety of, you know, our jail operations this is -- this is -- we looked at -- this is the Sheriff's budget. This may not necessarily encompass all of the costs associated with it. I just wanted to make that point since we're on this. I suspect this is probably about -- in terms of this is a top ten contract for us, roughly?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Roughly, yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Ms. Whitaker, you don't think it's a top ten?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Maybe not a top ten, but it's in the top 20."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Top 20, okay. All right."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Commissioner Ellis. Motion on the floor is to approve. Please, vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, one nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Continue, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "Bottom of page 7, **22-0978**, Human Resources Management: Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$97,037 to provide comprehensive FMLA administration."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. The motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please, vote. I'm sorry, Commissioner Ellis -- strike that. Commissioner Morris."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Just a quick question. Wasn't this the contract that at least one department opted out of before? Or I'm I thinking of something else?"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HR OFFICER: "Good morning, Commissioner Morris. Yes, you are correct; the department that opted out with the Sheriff's Department. We have been working with them on the transition back into the contract, so hopefully -- I know they've made a lot of progress working with the vendors, so hopefully by next year we'll have them fully integrated into the existing contracts so it's now all-inclusive."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "By next year you mean 2023?"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HR OFFICER: "Yes, 2023."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: Good, good, good. It was unfortunate; I think the former Sheriff opted out of that."

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HR OFFICER: "Yep."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Please, vote."

CLERK GRIER: And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "Page 8 --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "-- I should be on there."

CLERK GRIER: "Okay. Six yeas with Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 8, under Health and Human Services, **22-0929**, Senior Services: Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$6,386,735.47 to provide transportation services for Senior Services and Behavioral Health programs."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: ". On your recall this was before us at our last meeting, and it was held for additional information."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Good morning, Commissioners, Pamela Rosshell, Chief Operating Officer, Health Human Services and Public Works. Yes, Chairman Pitts there were a few questions when this item was presented and recommended for approval at the last meeting. This morning I would like to draw your attention to the presentation on June 15th, where the Board approved this contract initially, as well as answer your questions regarding ridership and fuel implications. So, moving quickly through this presentation: Again -- next slide, please -- the Board did approve this contract initially in June and today, we are answering your questions regarding fuel implications, riderships, and other recommendations. Next slide, please. This is two -- this is one of two transportation modes that Senior Services uses to provide transportation services for eligible seniors. Today we are talking specifically about Transdev, which is the bus service that provides services to dialysis, neighborhood senior centers, adult day health, multipurpose, medical appointments, and community trips. This is also the same transportation system that provides service to our developmental disabilities partners and they attend our training centers throughout the community. Next slide, please. Overall, we have seen a substantial increase in the Uber and Lyft experience and the Transdev bus service has pretty much maintained a stable ridership. Next slide, please. One of the questions from last Board meeting was the difference in cost. Here you see the revenue hour is how we measure the cost per unit for the traditional bus service which is 54 -- \$52.45. This is for an average of seven riders at a time. There are often more than that and usually more than that; but on average there are seven riders on a Transdev bus at one time. In comparison, we pay \$19.39 per trip for one Uber/Lyft rider or \$17.31 for a Lyft rider. I want to draw your attention to the number of registered riders for the bus service. There was a question about the actual number of riders. To date, we have out of the nine -- 100 -- 1,455 riders, approximately 945 riders have actually ride -- road Transdev this year. Next slide, please."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Could you repeat that, please?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, sir. Could you go back a slide? So chairman, you see the number of registered riders, 1,455. The number of actual riders to date is 945. So, we have a registration system in the Department of Senior Services. Any constituent in the community in need of transportation for the bus or the Uber/Lyft service, they call, we collect information, and they are registered to ride the bus or Uber/Lyft. They may not actually request a ride, but they have registered. So, the distinction here is that 1,455 individuals have called Senior Services and said, I would like to register to ride. Only 945 of them have actually taken a ride. Next slide, please. This is the comparison of cost for the bus transportation. We are requesting today approval of the contract from 2022 through 2026 and you can see the incremental costs over the life of the contract. Next slide, please. The Board, again, took action to approve the RFP in June and fully funded the contract through 2026. You also allocated an additional \$1.8 million for the Uber/Lyft program at that time. Next slide, please. There was a question regarding the fuel costs, and today we're presenting information about fuel costs over time. So the projections here are based on 51 buses and an average monthly cost of 56,000 to 75,000 monthly for fuel costs. I would like to point out that this is a commercial rate, and also we anticipate that this includes any markup from the vendor. In the column where you see N/A and to be determined, those columns are blank because our proposal before you today will have the county pay for the fuel. So here you see the fuel is anywhere from 613 up to 937,000 from 2022 through 2026. Because the county is a member of the statewide contract, we are able to save at a minimum, 12 percent on fuel costs because we are a part of a large fuel cooperative across the state. So we are able to then add those savings or count those savings against what you see here. We were unable to tell you specifically how much we will save because we don't have the actual fuel cost. My commitment is to provide a quarterly report once we have actuals, so that you can see the 12 percent or more cost savings per quarter. So again, the vendor is proposing that their fuel costs, at a commercial rate, in 2022 through 2026 is 600,000 to 937,000 because the county is a part of a cooperative, we will say 12 percent or more against these cost. Next slide, please. There was also a question regarding continuity of services because of the recent issues with the theft of converters. The commitments and the actions taken regarding these improvements are here. Armed security will patrol the Transdev facilities 24/7; security fencing will surround the facility; the external perimeter outside the fence of the facility is now being monitored by a motion detection system. Senior services is continuing to develop their contingency plan to avoid any disruption of service for any reason and Transdev -- which will include Transdev's ability to replace vehicles with other fleets; and our ability to issue a standby solicitation for senior transportation, as well as a partnership with

MARTA. Once that plan is finalized, we will present the contingency plan to mitigate disruption in services for the future. Next slide, please. So today, we are requesting and seeking approval for the renewal of this contract as presented before you. That concludes the presentation, Mr. Chairman."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Just a general question here. How many seniors do we serve on an annual basis do we provide transportation for?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "We provide -- so far this year under Uber/Lyft --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- well, I mean, both Transdev, Uber, and Lyft."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "So under Senior Services traditional bus 1,455 are registered, 945 have ridden. So the number of seniors that have actually registered for Uber/Lyft is 4,289; the actual riders ranges between 1300 and 1500."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thirteen hundred and --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: -- fifteen hundred, yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Per -- and that's for Transdev and Uber and Lyft -- the total number -- all I'm asking --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- how many seniors do we provide transportation for on an annual basis?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Approximately, 2200 total for both programs."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. And the cost on an annual basis Transdev, Uber and Lyft? I think it's worthwhile, I just want to get the number straight. It's about 6 7 million or 8.""

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "So, the cost for Uber/Lyft for Transdev this year is 6 thousand -- 6 million -- 6.2 million just for this year. Next year that increases to 6.7 million and it increases every year."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: So we -- 6 million, is that the good number?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir. It increases to 7.9 million in 2026."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Right. But as you stand before us today 6 million for 2200 seniors."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "That's just for Transdev. You're trying to divide the two service?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No, no, No. I'm not trying to divide them. I used to know the numbers. How many seniors do we provide transportation for either with -- including Transdev and Uber and Lyft?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Approximately, 2200."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. And the total costs of that for Transdev, Uber, and Lyft; I thought it was about 8 million?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "It is."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Eight million?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "For the -- okay. All right. All right. Vice Chair Hausmann, Commissioner Arrington, Commissioner Hall."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "First of all thank you for putting this chart together. I'm looking at the comparative table slide and following up on the Chairman's question, 6.2 is the contract right now that's before us for Transdev?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, ma'am."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "What is the -- and that is for 900 and some odd?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "That is the number of seniors that have ridden to date."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Nine hundred and -- "

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- and 45."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- 45?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, ma'am."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "What is the Uber number; that cost number? Uber/lyft number; rideshare number?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "That is now approximately 2 million."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Two million. Okay. So, the 8 million that the Chairman mentioned is the two together. And then your revenue hour calculation does not include gas?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "It will not in the future. Here is what we're currently -- the current trip cost, no, it does not include gas."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "All right. So the 6.2 then we need to add another 600 and something thousand; so it's 7 million basically --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- yes."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- including gas. Okay. So now we're at 9 million?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Okay. All right. Commissioners and Dr. Roshell, I mean, looking at this comparison and just about every category it is far more cost-effective for us to use ridesharing until you get to the point where the wheelchair access, and the limited ability of some people's physical need with dialysis or, you know, the things that are medically necessary for folks to do, but this is striking; the difference. And you know, it's kind of hard to justify healthy seniors going to a senior center and spending this kind of money when the ridesharing is so much more affordable. So again, I got one leg out the door here, but I hope that y'all are all looking at this and taking it seriously. We all value our ability to get folks, our seniors that can't drive where they need to go. It's far safer that the list is endless for the reasons that we do it, but we have to be able to afford it."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "And so, we've talked about this for years and finally see it on a slide. It's just very striking just how much more financially advantageous to the county to concentrate on the ridesharing. So I'm real hesitant to approve this contract. I know it's, you know, time sensitive, but, I mean, in good conscience, I'm not

sure I can, you know, agree that it's worth \$7 million to serve 900 folks and we can almost buy them cars for that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What's the math on that? What is that per person? I got 900 into -- what is it?"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Seven million dollars."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "But it's nine million --"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: (Not on the mic.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Y'all agree with that? I mean the numbers speak for themselves. And I don't want anybody to misunderstand what we're asking --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- I am not suggesting --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- I have seen it and we value the transportation --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- yeah."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: -- but for what we provide they would not have access to doctors, groceries, and doctors' appointments, pharmacies; but that being said, how much is it per?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Approximately, 6,000."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Per person?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "If you divide 942, the number of actual seniors that have ridden into to 6.2 million."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Do we know how we compare with other sister counties? Or do our sister counties provide these same services?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "We are very unique, Mr. Chairman.""

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We are very --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- unique in that we are one of very few counties that provide this level of transportation support."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "And that's all I have, Mr. Chairman."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I am -- I know you can make numbers say anything. I don't know Commissioner -- Vice Chair Hausmann if I agree that the ride shares are cheaper because the 52.45 an hour is an average of seven riders. So if I divide 52.45 by 7, I'm down to about \$7 per trip. And so, I would submit that \$7 per trip is more effective and more cost-efficient than \$19 per trip for one rider. The question I have is about minority participation. What type of minority participation and disadvantaged business participation is there on this contract?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Good afternoon, Commissioner. So the minority participation is very limited because of the subcontracting opportunities. The only subcontracting opportunities this contracts has been uniforms and fuel; and the fuel cost the county is now going to absorb. But the majority of the labor is minority, so that's where this contract is. The majority of it is drivers, the other is the uniforms and the fuel costs."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I think I'll keep my thoughts to myself on that. You know it sounds like we're good enough to drive the bus, but we're not good enough to get in on the contract. That's what that sounds like to me."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Well, Commissioner, I'm --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: -- I'm not going to support that."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Commissioner, I'm sorry, we have to base it on the availability of the subcontracts opportunities under the contracts, so when you look at the contract, it is to provide the service. The majority of the service is the drivers. It's either driving, the fuel for it, or the uniforms. That's it. That's all this contract provides."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Sounds like a bad contract to me. Availability of subcontractors -- so there's no minority or female prime contractors that can be a part of this?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "So there were contractors --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- even though we have a 30 percent encouragement rate. Shouldn't there be 30 percent minority participation in this and all contracts?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "We do not have a goal-based program, so it is not a mandatory goal-based program."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Don't we encourage?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Yes, we do, sir."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Okay."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "And we did bid this out twice. Both times we only received one bid and that was with Transdev. So we tried to make the contract appropriate, but they have to provide the 54 buses. There's a lot to this contract that makes it a little unique."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Did you say you only received one bid?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "One bid and we bidder it out twice. In the future, what we have been told has been that the cost to do the buses or to lease the buses is very cost prohibitive. The county requires that the vendor provide the 54 buses, so that's a cost prohibitive thing for a lot of companies to take on."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "What if any discussions have we had with MARTA? I know they have three prime contractors and they have a disability service. Have we talked or thought about partnering with them?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "I'll defer to, Dr. Roshell."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "So we do work with MARTA on the disability side of the house for transportation. There is a cost for that to the consumer, and the feedback that we've gotten from constituents at \$4 a ride or more for the MARTA services that it was cost prohibitive for many of the consumers. So that's as far as that conversation has gone, Commissioner Arrington."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's a good point, Commissioner."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Well, Transdev is one of the MARTA providers. MARTA's already paying them a higher revenue rate than that -- a higher average rate

than that. So we might need to have some additional conversations with MARTA and their vendors that they already have under contract."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Great point."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "They're already providing this service with disabilities. And so, we might be able to look at that. Certainly, for me I want to see minority participation. If y'all want my vote, I need to see 30 percent disadvantage business participation. And so, if they don't have that then I'm not voting for that. That's just me. Now, I had one more item, but I can't think of it now so --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- we'll come back. Okay. All right. Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I'm a little confused as well because I was told that there was a minority business that bid on this that was the transportation business, so I'm a little shocked to hear you say that there was only one. And, Mr. Chair and I just had a little conversation; he too thought the same thing, so I'm confused. And I agree with Commissioner Arrington that we do need more minority participation. This is huge. You're right. Now, I too want to go back to the Uber and Lyft conversation about wheelchair accessibility because I read the Uber contract. I read the policies and everything. And they have a policy not only for those with disabilities, but they have a policy call service animal and assisted device policy. And so, there are specific drivers who are there to provide service to those who use wheelchairs, walkers crutches, canes, and treat them the same as anyone that would have some luggage. And they can do not just deny service to anyone that has a service animal as well. So are we keeping track of that service because it sounds like from the conversation that there is no tracking of that; and whether or not we are providing those services to the seniors who have some sort of disability or using some sort of assisted device or service animal?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "So, we do keep track of - we have a record here; that's 4,289 seniors that have registered. We do keep track of the type of trips. If the senior does need a little extra assistance that is a part of the conversation with the dispatch team that is at Common Courtesy. Overall, however, when we look at adult day health which many of those seniors are more frail, and some of the seniors that are going to community trips and medical appointments, those seniors primarily use Transdev. We do not prohibit them from using Uber/Lyft, but as a whole, they primarily prefer the Transdev mode."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So it's their decision to use Transdev? It's not that Uber and Lyft doesn't provide the service?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "That is correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Because if they were not then that would go against their policy because it clearly states in the policy that they provide those services. And they specifically talk to their drivers and ensure that their drivers understand how to provide that supportive type of ride. Okay. Thank you for clearing that up."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "You're welcome."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Oh and I'm sorry. I'm sorry. Let me see. I had a senior text and say that we need to understand is are these rides safe because apparently there was a senior who was injured on a ride. No one took a report or anything and they didn't handle it correctly on a regular Transdev ride. So can you speak to that, you know, what the safety policy or protocols are?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, ma'am. And we can get you more information about the incident that you've referenced. I'm not aware of that as I stand here today. But the difference on a Uber/Lyft ride versus Transdev from a safety protocol is that there are monitors that are on the Transdev bus that provide extra extra assistance and oversight."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And this was on one of the buses; it wasn't on Uber/Lyft?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yeah."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "So the safety protocols on the Transdev bus, there are monitors on the bus that assist with onboarding and exiting the bus and just general oversight for the ride."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And the monitor is an individual person other than the rider -
-"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- I mean the driver, right?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "That is correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So I will try to -- I'll get the senior to speak with you before you leave."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. Thank you."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "You're welcome."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis -- I'm sorry. Commissioner Arrington, are you finished?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I thought about my other thing. Commissioner Ellis was gracious enough. My other issue is electric vehicles. Do we have any idea like, you know, when they're going to be phasing these gas vehicles out? Are they phasing electric vehicles in because ideally that gas cost should -- it might be one price now, but we ought to be working on a plan to reduce it or eliminate it."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Thank you, Commissioner Arrington. We'll certainly -- we have not had a conversation with Transdev about the conversion to electric bus services, but we can follow up for you."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I mean, I assume they probably have some in their fleet now you know. Maybe not all, but they probably have some. And they ought to already have a plan for that."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "We'll check it out, Commissioner."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah. Just a few things -- maybe a (inaudible.) This is a renewal, right?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "This was not a re-solicitation. This is just a renewal of this particular contract?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, it was re-solicited and the Board approve the contract in June."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "In June?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "And now it's up for renewal."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Up for renewal. All right. So that's -- I think that's an important distinction on that. You know second, you know, I guess, you know, it's easy to sort of look at the cost sort of in a vacuum and sort of arrive at, you know, ideas and thoughts. But just may be a few sort of counterpoints for us to think about, right? Here you're transporting some of the most -- some of our most vulnerable citizens, right? And I know this is sort of framed in this context of seniors, but I don't want to lose sight of the fact that we're also transporting a number of folks with developmental disabilities. A significant portion of these costs are going to be defrayed from grants, right? I believe on the last time that we talked of the 6.4, I think there was about 4.6 million or so of this component as grant funded, roughly; does that sound about right?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "There is a component that is grant funded and we can --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "I looked at the components, it looks like 4.6 of the 6.4 is grant."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "4.6 is the general fund."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "That's the general fund?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. And the other component -- so that's -- so we're a little bit -- we do get some grant fund portion of this. But in terms of just sort of cost; and I guess this is sort of where it becomes tricky, right? You know, I think, you know, if you look at sort of stats about what the average cost on a vehicle in the United States is about 10,700 bucks a year or something like that, right? Obviously, these folks who use this service don't, you know, have the ability to drive. Transit providers which provide sort of the transit service to the general public; and we have an example of, you know, our own transit system which we, you know, participate in as a signator on a contract operated a streetcar. I think they cost about \$6 million a year and the average ridership is about 500. So -- and that's fixed routes. That's not a bunch of fixed routes. So it's a -- this is a complicated form of transit, right? Probably, some of the most complicated. Transit systems don't like to do transit for folks with disabilities, that's what they try to subcontract it and that sort of stuff. That's why they're often times some of the most

difficult people to deal with. If you've had relatives that need transport for, you know, medical appointments and that sort of stuff, you find that private providers for, you know, sort of non-ambulatory, you know, stuff, they're costly, right? It's probably 60, 75, probably a hundred bucks a trip or more in the metro area. So this is a very valuable service and then, you know, but it's a small number of folks, right? But it's critical to the people that do use it. You know, I am concerned about sort of the cost trend and we've gone -- we go through this discussion about every two or three years in terms of ups and downs of cost trends. We did -- I mean the growth in cost on this was sort of may be a mask a little bit with COVID certainly. With utilization we did Uber/Lyft program definitely sort of curtail sort of the significant growth of cost that we were seeing if we go back to probably '16 to '17, you know, sort of timeframe, right? We launched Uber/Lyft in -- was it '17?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "In seventeen."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Seventeen."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "It was a pilot."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Pilot in '17. And then, you know kind of where we're at now. You know the other thing that, you know, I'm interested on this and particularly on the traditional bus piece. And, you know, that the number of riders that we have right now. And obviously, I think, within this there's the opportunity for us to grow ridership and sort of contain this within this cost footprint at this time, correct?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes. We can contain the cost if we reduced the number of routes because the bus can support anywhere from seven to 30 riders at a time. We have not seen the need to implement a -- a structure to put a waitlist in place or to curb the service in that way. We could reduce the number of routes perhaps."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "And what -- let me rephrase my question. In terms of the number of people that are participating, how much of a -- how much correlation is there between the number of folks that are participating versus the number of folks that we had utilizing our senior centers and our DD centers on a daily basis? Is it -- is there a fairly -- is that a fairly strong correlation or loose?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "It is. It is a very strong correlation because with the inception of the senior center program model transportation was offered."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Right."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "And so, there's never been a time in the history of the county providing the service have we only relied on individual transportation for participation in the programs."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "You have a rough idea in terms of where we at in terms of participation levels at our centers today versus 2019? I mean, are we at 80 percent, 60 percent, 70 percent?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "I would say for adult day for example it's nearly 100 percent."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "For adult day?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "For adult day."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "You understand that --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- same for IDD. For multipurpose it's probably 40/60, 40 percent of the participants are riding the bus; 60 percent are driving."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "No, that's not my question. In terms of -- at a center today, right? In terms of the number of people that are showing participating in activities; doing stuff there regardless of how they got there?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Today versus 2019; are we at 2019 levels; are we at 80 percent, 70 percent?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, we have seen a steady increase in participation in multipurpose for a variety of reasons, yes."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "So do you have an idea of what the percentage might be?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "If I had to take an educated guess, I would say, we have seen an increase of at least 20 percent per year."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Decrease?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Increase."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Increase in what?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Increase in the participation every year 20 percent more -- 20 percent more increase."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. Maybe you and I are not on the same wavelength."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "No, we're not."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "All right. So, take any multipurpose center --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- yes."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: -- all right. Let's take whatever. Let's take the Bowden Center --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- okay."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- the number of people that are showing up and doing activities there in 2019 on an average bases; today it's up --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- that's correct."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- it's not down, so the pandemic low in terms of participation --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- yes."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- that's gone."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Right."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. All right. I was just trying to understand --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: -- yes."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Are we back at optimization at -- of activity at our centers. Is it back to pre-pandemic?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "So we just reinstated full programming the summer of this year. So we have not had a full year of uninterrupted program participation since 2020. But we are seeing an increase from 2020 to now that we have reopened the facilities fully. Yes, we are continuing to see --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- okay."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- optimal participation over time from August of this year to now."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "But based on the ridership we're seeing right now with this, there's some opportunities to enhance ridership and enhance participation at our facilities at the same time?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "And that's something that I think that needs to be sort of a, you know, point of focus, right? As, you know, we're offering these services and we want to build some outreach to what is an aging population, many times people do not understand what the services that are available in their area or the opportunity to get there because they don't think they have the ability to get there. So, you know, since we are going to invest in this, I would like for us also see us sort of talk about how we're going to invest in our outreach into the communities to get more participation within, you know, within our centers as well, so that we can optimize this particular contract. So when we're coming back next year and having the conversation, this isn't a number of about 900. It's a number that's, you know, more like, you know, 1400."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "And thank you for that, Commissioner Ellis. What I can share with you and we will distribute this to the entire Board through memo is that I have asked the department to create a marketing and outreach plan --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- right."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- and so, we can share that with you. It includes things like senior service open houses and a variety of other types of outreach components to increase participation in our programs and to improve our partnerships. So we will disseminate that plan to you and show you what some of the outcomes have been for this year."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "All right. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Vice Chair Hausmann."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Yes. Again, this is a very interesting conversation. And I do remember when we started talking about rideshare in 2017 or whenever it was."

It wasn't easy to get this pilot program off the ground because no one thought we needed to make any adjustments to the way we were doing business. So just for the record, I'm really pleased that we did go in that direction and that we have seen what it meant to the county because we're obviously serving far more people for a lot less money than we were back in the day. So, and I want to go back to this trip -- per trip because that was calculated. I mean, you can calculate all kind of things. Nine hundred and forty-five folks, obviously are taking multiple trips, right? So it's not 7.50 per person. I mean, how many -- what's the average person's number of trips; do you keep up with that data?

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes. So it ranges from the constituent that rides to the center every day to -- for Transdev, to a constituent that may have four trips a month because it's only for medical appointments. So there's a range."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So -- because I mean, if you just did the 7.50 times 945, I mean, that virtually nothing. So obviously that's a different way calculated. It might be useful as you go forward, you know, what really the costs are. But I just have to say that looking at this it just seems to me that we should be making sure that everybody understands the Lyft option -- the Uber/ Lyft option. As many folks as possible can transition and not eliminate this huge contract, but scale it back. I mean, it's just -- it's not feasible to continue at this level based on the service that's provided and the number of people that are provided that service. So, I'm just really, you know, as I began head out, you know, to greener pastures, I just really, really hope that we continue to really make sure that the money that's going to this needed service serves the most people at the most economical way possible to the county because this is just not sustainable in my opinion."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Thank you, Chairman. Dr. Roshell, is this the contract that when you bid out it's hard to get actual companies to bid on because of the nature of it; it's transportation? We've seen transportation costs increase. Is this the contract that allows us -- we're responsible for the fuel? I'm I -- is it -- is this the correct contract?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, ma'am, as Ms. Strong-Whitaker indicated, her team did put this contract out for consideration twice and at both times Ms. Strong-Whitaker, we only had the one."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Yes, I think some of the confusion is that we had multiple bidders on the bus and shuttle contract that the county had out at the same time. So we did have multiple contractors for that. But for this one we only received one bidder both times we solicited for it."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "That's very important because in a day of increased costs when it comes to transportation, increased maintenance there are a lot of factors that are not known by the public. I understand Vice Chair's concerns, I really do. The problem that I have is we've got to understand that this is a different day and age post-COVID, and we're not completely out of COVID. And I think to what Commissioner Ellis said, in marketing and doing a better -- on that instance, we may need to put a little bit more emphasis. However, to rebid -- and you said you rebid this twice?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Yes, Commissioner."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "That speaks volumes. That means that nobody really once to do that. And more importantly they don't want to do it at the cost that's cost prohibitive of them having the contract if they can't make some type of profit off of it. That should be considered when it comes to our seniors. I don't think there is a Commissioner up here that doesn't want seniors to have transportation. They just want it cost-effective. But I think we need to be fair in letting the public know that we're providing a service, we're providing it for our seniors, and it looks like the road is getting a little bumpy with transportation, with cost of maintenance, with the area of how do any company continue to stay in the black when they're trying to offer services. I don't think it's fair for us to give the impression that someone is charging us too much when that's a particular area of challenge across-the-board. What I would like to know from you is: If this contract does not pass today, what will happen?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "We would need to provide notice to seniors and the developmental disability families that we would need to discontinue transportation on Transdev."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "And that will take a affect when?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "This contract expires December 31st, so we would have to put a notification plan in place starting January 1."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "So, I think it would be disingenuous of this Board not to approve this. I mean that's my opinion, and, you know, what people say about opinions. But if we could approve other renewals; if we can do what we do in other cases, does this may be need a little fine-tuning or better marketing? But I know for a fact since we approved this back in June?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "June 15th."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I've been looking in to it trying to educate myself on it so I can make an educated decision, and it looks as though nobody else wants to do this. That's the reality. I mean, maybe I can say that and not get in trouble. And I may get in trouble anyway; it doesn't matter. But if we've got companies out here that are shying away from this contract, it is because it is not advantageous for them. So, I would suggest -- and I hear you, Vice Chair and I hear you, Chairman. I would suggest that we approve this contract and do whatever fine-tuning that we need to do in-house. Because if one senior or one developmentally disabled individual suffers because of the decision we make today, I'm not going to be party to that. So will ask my colleagues to, please approve this. Please take into consideration that this is a challenge now when it comes to transportation costs, when it comes to transportation maintenance, when it comes to refueling cost; but we approved this back in June. So, please pass it. Please do not allow any of our lesser of these to suffer because we want to make a decision based on a dollar amount that truly we don't have control over. You know, when I think about my car, I think about my insurance, i think about tune-ups, I think about tires; they've quadrupled in the last 24 months. And so, I would ask all of the Commissioners, please pass this. Let's not allow any -- any of our seniors or our developmentally disabled to suffer because if one suffers that's going to be on our back. Thank you, Dr. Roshell."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "You're welcome."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I'm going to support this because I don't think that we really have enough time to effectively communicate that to our seniors. But I want to see minority or disadvantaged business participation. You know it's not good enough that they can hire us to drive the bus -- that's insufficient, okay?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Yes, Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I want -- me, personally, I'm not -- I can't speak for the Board. Me, personally, I want to see a minimum of 30 percent disadvantaged business participation on this and all contracts. And I think that -- my recollection is that we passed a Resolution encouraging that and that we -- I couldn't even understand how it comes to us without that. I don't care if it's one company bidding or not. We still need to tell them, hey, we expect you to have 30 percent disadvantaged business participation; one company or not. And, you know, I know, Ms. Strong-Whitaker does a good job, but I don't know who this is advertised to, I don't know how it's advertised, I don't know how long it's advertised, how long was the advertisement out? How many people was it sent too, right? Like, I don't know all of those details. I trusted her to do a good job in that respect. But, you know, before I can start talking about how many people responded, I would have to know all of the answers to those questions. But I do know that there are qualified disadvantaged businesses in Fulton County that can do more than just drive a bus and answer a phone, okay?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So, I don't want a -- you know they might have 90 percent minorities working at the company, but if they don't have 30 percent at the top level, they still haven't met what we're looking for at least what I'm looking for. And so that's what I'm looking for. I need to see participation and I frankly -- I really want to make it -- I really want to do a Friendly Amendment to make it contingent on that. But because we're only a week away, I don't, you know, I don't know if that can be done in a weeks' time or so, between now and January 1st. But --"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "-- Commissioner if I may. The total participation at this point is not .70; and it probably would have been higher, but we took the fuel costs out of the contract. I will go back to Transdev and work on that. I will also provide you with all of the information regarding the time that the contract was out on the street; it was about 60 days. I will provide you all of that information. One of the big barriers to this contract is that the contractor has to provide the 54 buses. If the county owned the 54 buses and they were managing it, I know we would have much greater participation. But this contract is they have to provide the 54 buses and it includes them paying for the lease of those buses, the maintenance, everything; it's an all-in contract. So that has made it a huge barrier for a lot of companies to do that. And

so that's a lot of the feedback that we received when we went back out to ask, why didn't you bid on this? Those are some of the -- the -- that's a lot of the feedback that we got back."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "All right. Well, like I said, I know we MARTA has three contractors that provide it and they have it leased. And I don't know if those buses is theirs. Those are probably MARTA owned buses. So we, again, we may need to involve MARTA --"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "-- yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- in this conversation --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- we will."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Maybe a way for them to save some money and for us to save some money. At the same time they may already have routes. They may be running the same routes."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "We will certainly follow up with MARTA and report back to the Board."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Thank you, Commissioners. Let's move on now. The motion on the floor is to approve. Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please, vote. This is the first of three renewals -- four rather. It will be coming back next year."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk, let's go."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion passes; five yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Continue."

CLERK GRIER: "Continuing on page 8, **22-0979**, Public Works: Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$871,732.29 to provide sanitary sewer easement maintenance in both North and South Fulton service area."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Vice Chair Hausmann, seconded by Commissioner Morris. Please, vote."

CLERK GRIER: And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "22-0980, County Manager. Presentation of Fulton County Operational Report."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Mr. Manager."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Yes, sir, Mr. Chairman and Commissioners. Good afternoon two minutes in. This is thee counting back since March of 2020 about the 50th report. I just want to say to Commissioners Hausmann and Morris, I'm thankful for being able to present this. I should have done a commemorative version of this for you, but of course we've shifted now to the operational report as opposed to COVID. But because of 12 sub-variants now the flu and RSV, and cases on the rise, we will provide a high-level report on those. And the positives are in the red zone, as well as cases being up over a hundred percent; positivity rate at 11.2, up a hundred percent and hospitalization at 170, up 85 percent. There are some renewed reasons for concern. Matt Kallmyer will be able to answer your questions as we delve in to that first section. In addition to those issues, the public health emergency declaration made by this Board, sponsored by Commissioner Arrington we are engaging EMY on a limited planning effort for the next five to seven weeks to flesh out all the options to address the healthcare gaps that result from the hospital closures. That would include expansion of access to current providers, communications to the public, and financial operational alternatives for review. We will include more detail in our next report and certainly we'll be working with you in the interim. Dr. Roshell is leading this effort and can respond to any questions you may have today. But, please, know that were moving out in this manner and bringing, I hope, a comprehensive view to this as cities are somewhat, as you may read in the press, going in somewhat different directions everywhere from websites to new authorities. So, I think having data driven with financials and potential partners identified will serve us well, more importantly the citizens well. Project Orca continues. You'll note that we have about 60,000 open cases. We've made great progress, but that has clearly slowed with about 3,000 cases being resolved over the last three months. That run rate, obviously of a thousand a month and 60,000 open cases would not suffice to clear the backlog by 2024. Also, we are building a backlog for 2022. Alton will discuss that with you. I think the conversations with our justice partners at a steering committee level, will have to focus on a gap closure plan as this because more and more acutely obvious. The Orca financials -- as well included in your note from last

week that we did receive a 7.3 million reimbursement check from FEMA. That's outstanding news. We do have 16 million still left to receive, so maintenance and reserves are still prudent and we'll continue to do that. We've also included a snapshot of all our general fund financials and vacancies; and Sharon Whitmore our CFO will provide any details needed. As well we've included the emergency purchase order report in this deck as is our now going forward practice. Last what we're going to do today is provide an overview of very significant capital project. It's the creation of 600,000 square-foot operational center in South Fulton. It will house all of our election functions, staff as well as BMD storage, lock and accuracy testing, audits, training, press briefing, et cetera; and really give us a one-stop shop for all of those functions. Giving us, I think, a significant boost in terms of the ability to manage a very complicated undertaking. It'll also house our court records, evidence for our Fulton County Sheriff's Office, Fulton County Police, capabilities of D.R.E.A.M., as well as Emergency Management will be there. And as well we are scoping out how to make this a center for government continuity of operations if, in fact, we had an either natural or man-made disaster in downtown Atlanta requiring closure of this facility. I did tour it last Friday. It's something really to see it on a first-hand basis. We encourage all of you to take a look. We'll be glad to schedule the tour. The date for Elections to actually move in will be closer to March timeframe, so certainly when we do that, I think, the press conference to commemorate that will be in order. While not included in this report, of course, we also have in the Agenda the 2023 budget proposal, so we'll look for further discussion and guidance direction to make any changes necessary before you began your consideration in January; and then hopefully approve on; Sharon and Hakeem will be prepared to discuss that. So, Mr. Chairman, I want to turn it over to Matt to hit this first section and then we'll see if there's any questions."

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes, sir."

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We'll be brief, sir. Can we just go to slide four which is the (inaudible.) overall coverage slide. I'll ask, Mr. Schuster to go ahead and run us through some point. Also, on slide five, we're not going to transition there just yet. You'll see a little bit of flu. I can assure you that that is starting a lot earlier than has traditionally has done in our community. It's working its way through our team in Emergency Management. It is something we need to take note of. If you haven't had the opportunity to get your flu vaccine this season, please do so as soon as possible. But that being said, Mr. Schuster, please walk us through just the highlights on slide four."

DOUG SCHUSTER, EMSI: "Good afternoon, Commissioners. Sound check. Can you hear me?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."

DOUG SCHUSTER, EMSI: "Okay. As County Manager discussed there are now 12 sub-variants within Georgia. We're being led now with the B.Q surge, and B.Q.1.1 and they account for over 70 percent of all new cases in Georgia. The winter COVID surge has begun in conjunction with extremely high flu and RSV cases leading to extremely low bed availability; the lowest since the start of the pandemic. Our cases percent positives and hospitalization have all increased significantly since the last BOC. And percent positives which is an extremely important marker is now what we consider in a dangerous red zone. Our mobile vaccination teams continue to work within the community and we're averaging a hundred and 50 vaccines per week for the last six weeks. Epi data shows that 87 percent of all COVID hospitalizations and deaths are now from the unvaccinated population. And the Board of Health continues to recommend boosters and masking is encouraged when in enclosed spaces and around our most vulnerable population. And good news on the monkey pox front -- M-pox front is that only 28 cases since October 1st; and the US average for the last three days has been zero cases in the United States. Next slide. Real quickly on the flu: As you can compare on the top slide with the flu in past seasons, this season is the red which you see to the far-left, which is a much earlier start and it continues to persist and it looks like it might be in another uptick. But if flu is strong out there we are seeing the COVID rise. And just for some perspective on numbers: Last week 5,168 visits to the county hospitals for flu; and since -- in the last seven weeks, 47,000 citizens have gone to our healthcare system. Next slide. Since the last Board of Commissioners meeting, COVID is up a hundred and 4 percent for cases which is pretty significant considering that the case -- it really are only documented within the hospital where we're doing most of the PCR testing. A lot of the at home cases don't get reported, so that's a very significant rise with limited availability there. And like I said, 11.2 percent in positivity it means we have a very high consequence rates; and then a hundred and 70 -- up 85 percent in the hospitals since the last BOC meeting. And then our deaths are right around -- we've been right around one death per day in Fulton County since June 1st and that is persisting. And there's a lot of immunity out there that leads to that, but I just want to say one more time that the people that are/have severe consequences in the hospital and dying are in 87 percent from the unvaccinated population. Next slide. These are the metrics that the CDC tracks. All three metrics on risk to the hospital community and

cases are rising. Just be aware that this only tracks COVID's effects on hospitals. If we included other respiratory illnesses, this would be way into the high orange category. So as flu rages we are now seeing that rise. And so, there is some significant strain on the hospitals. Next slide."

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Thank you, Doug. Just wanted to go ahead and finally wrap up with the fact that it is holiday season and we're going to be getting together with family and friends. If you have any one that is vulnerable in your family, someone that has a illness that would put them at a higher risk, please take advantage of testing to ensure that your safe prior to go in and also masking as well. We had our coordination meeting with the Board of Health yesterday for our joint response, and Dr. Paxton has been making it an initiative to ensure the amount of senior citizens action increase are taking advantage of the current bivalent booster. Those numbers are really, really low, so that'll be one of the main pushes that we work with them in January to go ahead and increase those numbers. Also, the Department of Public Health has released an antigen test kits. We're going to receive some of those and work with the Board of Health to distribute within our communities. If you haven't seen it yet, the United States Postal Service has opened up again their ability for each household to be able to go ahead and get an antigen test kit. Please go to United States Postal Service's website; you can register for that. Also has a great link there if you do have a test kit at home that you see that's may be expired, don't throw it away. Take a look at that link; it actually has by manufacturer which ones are able to go ahead and extend that particular test kit at your house. Also, last thing is st make sure PCR test are available. South Fulton Annex we have it at the Center for Rehabilitation over by the old AMC Hospital, as well as 47 North Point -- 4700 -- excuse me in Alpharetta; and we have two kiosk locations, one at our North Annex and one at Adamsville Regional Health Center that people can take advantage. Thank you, Mr. Chairman."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Thank you. Hold on one second. Vice Chair."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Hello."

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Hello, ma'am."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Just a quick question about the emergency declaration status. I've heard news reports said on the federal level they're talking about suspending that designation. What does that mean for everything we're doing here?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Well, when it comes to the FEMA one that we have done our efforts on thus far that actually expires on 12/31 of this year, so that was a 90 percent reimbursement rate. Ten percent still fell within the County. For that process that is not going to be extended at this particular point in time. There is a different declaration through Health and Human Services that actually is looking to be sunset sometime beginning first quarter of next year. I'm not sure of the exact date with that. That will impact Medicaid and people that have been taken advantage of Medicaid benefits through that program as well. Dr. Roshell may be able to go ahead and offer a little bit more of insight with that; but that is another thing that we're watching closely as the folks that will be losing benefits through Medicaid in the first quarter next year."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Does the state still have a declaration of emergency for COVID?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Not that I'm aware of. They've just enacted one for the weather that's coming this weekend --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- right."

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "-- but not that I'm aware of. I believe -- let me correct myself, ma'am. I believe there is one, but it's more along the logistic slide, so I have to double check that to make sure I can give you the most appropriate answer."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So are correlating state of emergency that we've been operating under. What's the -- any comment on that?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Ours has been correlated with the FEMA one, ma'am."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "The FEMA?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "So everything we've been doing is to be able to go ahead and showcase that we're still in that response mode to be able to be eligible for that 90 percent reimbursement and that's what we have been working towards."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So that ends 12/31?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Yes, ma'am regretfully that does."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Okay."

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "So, any of our efforts from that point forward we'd have to switch to ARPA allocations"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So go back to the regular procurement rules and all the things that we suspended for COVID needs?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "I'd have to defer to the County manager of how that would proceed, ma'am."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "I think -- let us evaluate that and come back because I think the answer is probably, yes, but I don't know with all the details yet."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "All right. And I do have another health-related question is this the health section of the report?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "I'll do my best. I'm not, Dr. Paxton, but I'll do my best."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So there's been some unfortunate news reports about our restaurant inspection program. And I know several of us had reached out. Can you give us an update on that or can someone answer the status of what you found out; what's happening?"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Mr. Manager, you'd like for me to make a comment? I know you discussed it as well with Dr. Paxton."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Yes, so, yes, there are -- we had a call, the Board of Health yesterday, and I think she has responded to several questions that folks had on her staffing levels. If I remember the numbers right, there were, I think, 39 authorized staff and she was at about 30 to 31. That did create a backlog of restaurants for review? I don't think its years in the making because I think she plans to present a plan for catch-up in fairly short order. And in some of the ones that were mentioned, they're doubling down on those immediately. I think the thing that perhaps caught us off guard was there wasn't a great deal of discussion or good visibility into this. Perhaps we could have been more helpful, but nonetheless going forward what we ask

yesterday is that in each quarter its Board of Health reports that we now include environmental health and restaurant inspections in that. The last piece was one question that was received was there more technology that could be embedded in the mobile health or in the environmental health job where they're not going back to the office to fill our reports and like. And one of the first writing exercises that I went on as County Manager was with one of them and from that the Board did invest in laptops and other mobile capabilities. So they truly do not have to go back to the office as they're completing their reports. Generally, while mobile both their expense reports and their restaurants report. So, I think, it's more function of just numbers of people against number of restaurants to be evaluated. But even as she discussed the -- at an optimal level of the numbers, the number of staff that we have today, they're operating at the optimal could cover the number of inspections required of twice a year. So again, I think this is not as far behind as it otherwise could be, or maybe it is perceived to be, and she'll present a catch-up plan; and going forward have that included in each quarterly presentation at this point."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Thank you for that. So when I reached out to you, you were unaware of the problem. What was the response to the lack of communication with this being an issue? Because I mean if you were called, it took us a long time to make the move to join the health -- health system, right? And I recall vividly the conversations that nothing was going to change, service levels was going to be just what they were when we were doing it. In fact it was going to get better. So communication is very important and obviously -- because I was blindsided by the news story, and I think others were as well; so what about the communication piece?"

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Well, I think, she believes certainly that she communicated through our general key performance indicators process that there was staffing issues. What I don't think either I heard or was communicated was how much or the quantitative value of what impact that represented. So, I think, I'll take some of the blame for that as well in tightening up our KPI processes. We should have ample ability to hear from them. On the other hand, I would say, if I were running it, I'd probably put my hand up and say, hey, we got an issue here that's public. I don't know that the news report -- and in fact I would say it more emphatically -- I think the news report perhaps overstates what the problem is."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Well, that's good to know. I mean, it's an important area of health that is something that all the news media focuses on, as you know. So it's very, very much in the forefront of what folks expect us to do. So, I just think, it's important that we address whatever issue head-on and make sure that it's corrected --"

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "-- yes, ma'am."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: -- and I know y'all do that. Thank you."

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Yes, ma'am."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah, really my comment was following up of what Vice Chair Hausmann. So we'll have this in the report going forward, so we can monitor it and look at?"

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "And, you know, I think along those lines, too, you know, I know this issue is what we covered is the Board of Health, but it's still -- we didn't get much further pass just sort of the traditional sort of COVID data that we've reporting; not to diminish the importance of sort of the flu and the COVID related data. But in particular, you know, and this is sort of always our -- always our constant struggle with sort of, you know, the functional area of government that don't directly report to our manger whether it's, you know, health, judicial, Board of Elections, or Assessors. You know, we've had some ups and downs with that. We've gotten tremendously better about sort of tightening, sharing information, collaboration with the teams. So I don't, you know, hopefully this is sort of one of those things that happen; it doesn't repeat itself, but, you know, I think this operational report is a great opportunity for us to be able to have some dialogue on these things and have some visibility into, you know, some sort of key metric information; and this is particularly importance. So if there's other areas that get service in terms of you having that conversation that go beyond this that, we should be sort of tracking and have some visibility into, I think it's important to have that. So I'm glad we'll have that and sort of see where the progress we're making on it. Hopefully, you know, it' an issue that's sort of, you know, rectified in short order. So, thanks."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, sir. Thank you."

MATTHEW KALLMYER, DIRECTOR, AFCEMA/ANIMAL CTRL: "Thank you, Mr. Chairman."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Continue, Mr. Manager."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Yes, we'll ask, Alton Adams to overview the Orca report, if the Clerk will go to that."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Thank you, County Manager. Chairman Pitts, Vice Chairman Hausmann, Commissioners. I am going to take you through an update. I'll touch on some highlights and have you take questions as we go through it or at the end of the session. Next page, please. As you can see from this slide, we started officially kicked off Project Orca one year and two weeks ago. Since that time, we've disposed of 87,500 cases with the remaining 61,691 pending and remaining to be disposed of. The next slide talks to the starting point in December of 2021, and the last three months in terms of the cases. As the County Manager pointed out, the pace has slowed fairly significantly since the summer. Not unexpected, however. First of all the forecast itself was a straight line; we didn't build any model. We didn't take into account any seasonality or other things that typically impact the flow of cases. That having been said, it is clear to his point that we cannot continue at this pace, and we need to make some changes or to focus on some things. I would expect that as we open up the system; i.e. we didn't start selecting juries in the courtroom until October 31st, I would expect that that's going to continue to accelerate the pace. However, that's offset a bit because the mix of our cases civil versus criminal has changed, and we knew that as we in fact started moving in to the criminal area and particularly migrated from prosecution to the actual court system we were in fact going to see a bit of slowdown. The next page talks specifically to the progress of performance over the last month and the project to date. A couple of things I want to point out here: The November performance is off-pace a bit mostly concern, however about two areas: The Solicitor General and Magistrate Court. There are probably a number of different reasons for that; certainly in the case of Magistrate. One of the challenges we have there is staffing. They continue to operate about 50 percent of the staff that had been allocated as part of Project Orca, and some of that has to do with attracting and retaining the folks. But that clearly is impacting the throughput. It's something that obviously we continue to focus on. In the case of the Solicitor, it may be a function of the mix of cases that they're focused on; but those are the two areas that you would look at and say, I'm not quite sure why they're slowing down at the pace that they are. That having been said, we continue to be 17,000 cases to the good. That cushion is eroding a bit, but we continue to be a bit ahead of the pace that we had anticipated; here again from a straight line perspective on this model or this forecast was first developed a year ago. On page 14, talks to the dispose cases by judge. I think the point that I would make here is that half of our judges they would expect are above average. We have a couple of judges that kind of have a bigger impact than others and there are a number of

reasons for that in part is because Judge Eaton, in particular, inherited cases from the previous judge. And so, I would say overall, I think we are making good progress; but clearly, we have some outliers that impact the overall number in terms of dispose cases. Next slide similar to Superior Court, State Court disposed cases is somewhat the same in terms of, you know, the number of cases disposed being in part impacted by a number of things including what was inherited. But we do have a bit of a big gap between our judges who have disposed of cases at a very high rate versus others. Here again, something that we track, I'm not sure there's any action, so to speak, but this does give you a sense of the variance between the various judges in the system. The next page talks to our hiring progress. A couple of things I will point out here: The Public Defender has really made great progress in terms of hiring. That's really important because the Public Defender, as you know, is part of the ability to move these cases through the system. The DA continues to have a high number or high percentage of their hires already on board as does the Solicitor. As we have seen in the past, we have concerns, challenges when it comes to the Sheriff and the Marshal. And that has to do -- really a microcosm of the overall situation that you have with deputies and officers in the system. So, I guess, the big take away here is good progress with the Public Defender; good progress with the Prosecutors that's a big part of being able to move the cases through the system as quickly as we would like. One of the questions that we've been asked, if we can go to the next page, page 17, please: One of the questions that's come up, and I think in particular, Commissioner Ellis ask that we take a look at this is: Are we in fact building a back log in the system for Post-Orca cases? And Tim -- Tim, thank you. And the question is, yes, but not unexpected. And the reason for that is a couple of things: One, as I mentioned, we did not resume the full jury selection in the courtrooms until October, so as a result we really weren't moving at the pace that you would have expected, or that we would target for the bulk of 2022. And the second thing is when you talk about, you know, are we building a backlog, there are multiple definitions. We do know that the length of cases vary in terms of when they're resolved; however, what we did do for purpose of our analysis, is go back to Pre-COVID and use that as our starting point or our benchmark. And why you might say, well, geez, we might have been building a backlog even in 2019, what we did want to do is compare 2019 Pre-COVID to where we are today. And so, if you take for example Superior Court civil cases, 2019 we initiated 6,241 of those, and we were able to dispose 56 percent of those cases were disposed in 2019, so at a rate of 56 percent. And as you would imagine some of those cases were would have come at the end of 2019, and would have carried over in to 2020. But in terms of cases that came in and the ones that's disposed of 56 percent of those was disposed of within that year. If you compare that to a 2022, 6,209 cases were initiated, and 3,118 were in fact

disposed of for 50 percent. So slightly off the pace, but not really as bad as -- not a big issue. On the other hand, if you look at our criminal cases, here again, for Superior Court 11,000 of those initiated in 2019, of those approximately 50 percent were disposed of in 2019. If you look at where we are today in 2020, only 25 percent of the cases that were initiated in 2022 were in fact disposed of in 2022. So we are 50 percent off the pace of where we were in 2019, and therefore we've got some ground to make up if we in fact are going to get back to the point where we are in fact, not quote, unquote building a backlog. We're certainly not building it at a pace that exceeds where we were Pre-COVID. Let me stop there because I know I've covered a lot. I throw a lot of numbers out. I just want to see if there's any questions before I proceed."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "You want comments now or you want me to give you -- finish up. I mean, I got specific remarks on this stuff, but --"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "-- well, let me -- were there anything on those two that I covered? But if you want me to, I'll go through this -- this particular slide and then I could, you know, I can take questions on the whole thing."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Okay. So, if you kind of take a look at the last column, what we tried to do is point out where there are significant concerns, significant decline off the pace of 2019. Where we seem to be doing, okay, and where we're actually either ahead of the pace or right on where we were Pre-COVID. The areas of biggest concern, here again, not unexpected criminal cases in Superior Court; the DA in terms of the pace of the cases being disposed of. Our criminal cases, here again, State Court; and then with the Solicitor that we've talked about briefly as it pertains to Orca, but similar in terms of being off the pace a bit. If you look at 2019, 91 percent of the cases that were initiated by the Solicitor in 2019 were disposed of in 2019. Right now we're tracking about 57 percent. And so, here again, there are a number reasons why you would expect this to happen; and there are a number of things that I think are going to improve this. But if you said, hey, are we building a backlog that was higher than -- that is higher than the pace we were Pre-COVID, the answer for the most part will be, yes. Now, Dick, said, well, hey, what's the actual number translated into? So, if you -- if you were to -- if we were tracking at the same pace as 2019, we will actually be 16,000 cases better than we are today. And so, that's the magnitude of the gap between where we are today, and the pace that we were tracking in 2019. The next question -- one

that, Dick typically asks is, so what are we going to do about it? What can we do about it? And I took the opportunity to go back to a presentation that we made to the Board of Commissioners in November of 2019. We had met with a number of the justice partners and we basically looked at, you know, we say there's no new ideas, right? We went back and looked at some presentations and analysis that had started with the Barry Mahoney study in 1999, a Blue Ribbon Study in 2006, an extension JRI Study in 2017. They -- for the most part -- made a series of recommendations; all very similar. They recommended a unified court with a Chief Judge with executive authority they recommended case processing standards; they recommended separating civil and criminal divisions; they recommended consolidation of key administrative functions in the justice system; and they recommended expanded diversion. So if you want to talk about how we make a difference, those are some of the things that basically have surfaced for the last 20 years. Whenever we ask, well, how do we improve the system? Some of those we have made progress on. We have increased diversion; we have made some progress in the key administrative functions. But when it comes to some of the core things, those still, quite frankly, for a number of reasons areas that we have not been able to make substantial progress on. The next slide talks to the jail population. As you can see we're off a bit from the peak of September of this year where we exceeded 3500 individuals. Probably, a couple of reasons for that: One, is that we are in fact seeing a -- an acceleration and pace of jury trials, which will help. However, that's going to be offset a bit by the increase in crime which is fairly well documented and we continue to see arrested that in fact have an impact on the jail population. But overall over the last couple of months, we've seen a bit of a decline in terms of the overall number in the jail. Page 19, talks --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- Mr. Adams."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "-- yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Before you leave this page, I still need an answer to how many people in the Alpharetta Jail?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "I will let the Sheriff talk to that because I'm not aware of the number. So he's here, so he can answer that question when he's up, I guess, or."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It's reflected on this."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "That is correct. We don't -- I don't have a number in terms of the actual number of people in the Alpharetta Jail at this point in time. The detainees by judges is shown on the next page. Here again, just to give you a sense of

how that's spread out: Obviously, that's going to vary by the type of case that's shown across the judges. This does give you a sense or the magnitude across the system. And in closing, kind of the formal presentation, we continue to see obviously increase in violent crime impacting the jail population, impacting the types of cases that we had, and the more violent the charges, the more complex the cases and the result the longer it takes to resolve. We have talked and you're going to hear from the Sheriff for more detail about the recruitment challenges of sworn officers; and while we haven't seen a big -- well, you've heard about the uptick in COVID, but we also need to be concerned about anything that could be spread across the population including the flu and other things. So, I'm going to stop there. I'm happy to take any questions."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "All right. So, I guess, I'm working backwards just to, you know, sort of going forward, I mean, it looks like on the jail population report also don't have sort of information about AC/DC; but we'll start having that in the future reports. You know, if you can just may be put numbers on it, you know, kind of each facility so we can kind of see it. Obviously, you know the encouraging sign a little bit is that the number went tick down slightly, right; in terms of, you know, we're not at a peak at our main jail. So going forward, we'll see that you know with all of these and we'll also add in terms of this chart on 18, we'll see AC/DC on here. It won't just say out of county. Out of county will just mean the Cobb agreement or something else."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "We can break out Cobb and AC/DC --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- yeah, I think it will be useful to see kind of what we're seeing in terms of utilization on those. So, right now, I think going in to next year, we got, what, a 28 million number? A number on inmate outsourcing. And so, not insignificant and supplement, we should sort of track and sort of have there before us. The -- you know, which should also reflect the true cost of, you know, kind of jail operations which that 20 million is not in the Sheriff's budget either. On -- I guess, I'm sort of go back and, you know, the -- and I appreciate sort of the summary of what'll we do about it kind of thing and those remarks. You know, obviously the page 17 highlight; so we are building backlog. We're building it in the criminals space which we all know taken us the most kind of -- kind of plow through as it is. You know, I think certainly the -- it's probably a lot of good things that's been done on, you know, with our justice partners. I guess the part about 17 that, you know, just did surprised me the most relative to the criminal activity is it looks like the number of cases initiated, you know,

intuitively I thought it would have been up versus 2019, but it's actually significantly down."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "You mean in terms of the cases initiated?"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "In the criminal category. I mean, so to your point, may be some things like diversion and some other stuff is actually working on a numerical standpoint. I mean, I'm looking at it like a criminal initiated cases in Superior Court of 11,000 versus 5700."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "And some of that might be the ones that made it through the system that, you know, part of that when we talk about what's in Superior Court, a number of those will be --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- are with the DA."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "-- will be the DA. That's correct."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "But when you put those two together, you know, whatever the 17,000 --"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "-- yeah."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: -- versus 22,000 and change or so. And in the same thing with, you know, if I want to sort of pair the -- and I know there's direct correlation -- State Court and Solicitor's. I mean, the numbers are down --"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "-- we'll take a look at that Commissioner, I'll see if I can get an answer -- "

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- see if that's a real, you know, if that's a real thing or just some sort of -- is there some sort of false-positive there or something like that. But I think we got good dashboards, right? You know, better dashboard than we had, you know, in decades, right? You know to be able to look at what, how the courts are functioning. You brought up of things that, you know, have been, you know, best practices recommended, but some of those things are outside of the control of what we can do anything about, right? I mean, ultimately, some of those things are going to have to be -- this Board, here, we can't mandate them and all that sort of stuff that I mean by that. So, you know, yeah, I think maybe as we continue to move through this, you know, maybe something to consider, you know, on some periodic basis, you know, having you know whether it's a chief judge or some others come down and, you know,

for a talk with us about what they see going on, and how pleased they are with the progress, and what they're going to do. Just hear from them; not just you --"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "-- right."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- right? So, I think that's something for us sort of worth talking about. You know, kind of how we want to bring those other stakeholders here to talk to sort of talk to us about, you know, what's going on. And, you know, the viability of some of the types of best practices that you might suggest that, you know, are going to require, shall we say, turf to be seated, right? And, you know, collaboration which often times is not necessarily the easiest thing. I don't mean that in a critical way, but it's just a practical thing, right? When you got a historical structure, it's hard to break down; and sometimes there's very legitimate reasons for those structures to exist. You know, but, you just can't just sort of sit there and sort of spouse these must be some best practices for us to consider and not evaluate them and close them out and see if they're viable or we want to entertain them, or there's no way, no how, and we should just stop talking about it, right? So that's, I mean, that's just my observation and comments on -- you know, 17's concerning. I had asked for this and I was concerned we were sort of sensing that we were having another backlog building, and we are. The other thing is somewhat will tie-in to probably more the remarks around the civil stuff, but on the hiring progress and the ability of funds, right? This is also, you know, kind of some my remarks here. On the hiring progress when you look at some of the lower levels of progress with some areas, right? And a blend of what Orca driven and what's not Orca driven that sort of stuff, if we got some sort of, you know, basically, essentially, earmark of the next three years funding via Orca for all of these areas, and we're not hiring at the Orca levels for, you know, certain places, do we somehow need to reposition and utilize those funds to address this macro set of issues in dealing with. And I think we need to sort of continue that conversation in the context of the budget. And I know we got later on a discussion related to, I don't know, something about the Magistrate Court which may be a whole different issue that's intended to be discussed. But when delayed effect of COVID which is going to play out within, you know, I think within the court system is evictions, right? I mean, it's sort of a mask maybe what the historical level of evictions were because of the amount of the emergency relief that was being brought into the system. But that's probably going to grow or will grow as we get back to whatever historical numbers were as this emergency relief, you know, goes away. So in order to may be deal with that oncoming backlog, should we relook at that component of Orca and have more of a fine-tuned plan around addressing that piece which we think is going to emerge. So I just call that out and as I look at this, you know,

I believe that a couple of areas that are, you know, going to be drivers around that are a couple of the areas that have may be had a little bit less hiring success that being, you know, the Marshal and Magistrate Court. So just something as we kind of continue to sort of budgetary discussions and other things that I wanted to sort of raise and keep an eye on."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Okay. If I can, a couple of comments: Your point about the recommendations is, I think, right on point. The one that I think we have the ability to influence, and I think I have a very significant impact -- it has been proven is case processing status. That's one that if you look at the difference between a courtroom that has those in fact if you look at our system, court processing standards were a part of Family Court for some time and they have performed better than average. Whereas the court systems have not in part because there hasn't been a full embracing and implementation deployment of case processing status and the way that quite frankly should. So that's one where it doesn't require any legislative action. It doesn't require any major changes other than some courts adopting what some of the other courts are already doing and that's perhaps one that we could focus on. Your second point about hiring, I think is a good one. We have in fact however, re-budgeted -- we've taken into account these lags in terms of where we want it to be and used that to actually fund the extension of these positions through September of 2024. So it was taken into account; we've already kind of in a sense swept some of these and accounted for that in the budget. We need to continue to do that, but we did anticipate that that's something that we need to take advantage of as we extended the funding for these positions for 80 percent of these positions into September of 2024. And to your point about the evictions: I do think it's worth having a look at everything that's impacting those. I mean, some of those might have to do with the court system. Some of those might have to do with the Marshal. Remember the Marshal sent a request to us asking for resources. Some of that may in fact have to do with things that are beyond the scope of what we do here. But I do think it's worth looking at -- looking at it in the totality and stepping and saying, what makes sense in terms of investing whether it be in magistrate resources or other resources."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah. Quick question on the case standard stuff: Do we have metrics on that right now? I mean, we may not be employing them, but do we have --we can say, okay, these are what the standards are generally accepted you know for different levels of cases and here's where we stack up right now?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "We -- it's been a couple of years since we did that analysis. The last time we looked at it, we -- for example, we looked at state -- the state

standard. The goal, if I remember correctly, is that for 98 percent of your felony cases should be disposed of within 365 days. We were tracking at 70 percent. We're probably tracking at a similar success rate in terms of civil cases. The only court system that's actually exceeding the target was Family Court and that's because sometimes (inaudible.) So there are metrics we have to take a look at and perhaps look in detail at the difference between where we do use court -- where we do use the case processing and where we don't. We haven't done that yet. But in terms of the evidence about case processing and its ability to impact throughput that information is pretty readily available."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: Okay. Maybe -- I wouldn't mind talking with you about that in terms of just -- regardless of what the court is doing just sort of may be just sort have some general-dashboard which we looked at, you know, as the court choose to do anything about that at least we've got something in front of us that says, you know, here's what -- here's how we generally stack it up, okay?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Arrington and it's 12:49. Commissioner Arrington."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, thank you. Can you go back one page on that slide? I'm a little confused by those numbers -- one more page -- with the District Attorney numbers and the case numbers. Maybe, it was 17, yeah, 17. I'm trying to understand how the District Attorney can have 11,000 cases, but the Superior Court can only have 5,700. The District Attorney initiates her cases in the Superior Court. So how can those numbers be different? And how can there be such a wide variance of almost 5,000 cases? Something's not right."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "And I'll take a look at that Commissioner. I think part of the difference would be the cases that are computed to Superior Court are cases that have already been indicted and that move -- they've moved and have been assigned to a judge. And then cases that have not been indicted or passed onto a judge would still remain in the DA. But I will go back and take a look at that. That's the primary distinction between the two."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Yeah, because either that means if the DA has 11,000 cases and only half of those go through Superior Court that means it's going to be another half in the line for 2023?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Well, remember we -- even if it's in the jail, we have more than 1200 individuals who have yet to be indicted. And so, obviously there are

number of people who are out on bail who may be waiting -- let me go back and take a look, but I think that's the biggest distinction. I need to go back and just make sure I answer your question. But that's the biggest distinction is that they haven't been necessarily charged or indicted and moved into either State Court or in this case in Superior Court."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "And I think the important thing for the public to know is that the abstract that you have their jury selection and jury trials didn't start until October 31st, 2022, right? And so that's huge."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Anything else, Mr. Adams?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "No, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. Mr. Manager?"

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Yes, sir, there are financials are included if anyone has any questions. We didn't intend on making a presentation, but if they do, we're prepared to answer those. Otherwise, we'll move to overview of the operations center in South Fulton."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Questions?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "All right. Mr. Tim Diamond has been working on this project and done (inaudible.) work again. Did a walk through this last Friday; it's very impressive. So, Tim wants to give you a short overview of what this facility looks like and then ultimately, of course, invite you there for your own tour."

TIM DIAMOND, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Thank you, Mr. Anderson. Good to see you, Commissioners. I'll give you just a brief update on the new central warehouse. Next slide. So this is a different variety of pictures of the warehouse. As you can see the landscaping is in. Next slide. So just a reminder that we designed the warehouse to be transformational for our logistical paradigms; that we were consolidating seven outdated facilities into a single new logistical operational center; creating efficiencies and effective service support, and looking to reduce the cost of our county operations. And then this is a list as the Manager indicated earlier for the

agencies at the central warehouse. We'll consolidating all of Elections, so their almost about half of it. It will housed EMA's emergency response supply, Clerk of the Court records, the Sheriff's office warehouse off of English Avenue, as well as evidence; D.R.E.A.M's warehouse off of Milton Avenue; the Police Department and the Marshal's evidence; and then we have a community break room for approximately 600,000 square feet. Next slide. So what's going to be following: Pictures of the progress. As you can see the exterior has been completed and is doing very well. In the lower right-hand corner is the entrance to Elections which will have a public facing entrance in to it. Next slide, please. These are interior shots of the Elections which they are now finishing up and looking to dry out the floor to be able to lay the floor. So Elections is going very well. Next slide, please. More of the Elections; just a variety of pictures: the mailroom, the entrance area, the break room, and then the BRE conference room. Next slide, please. This is the Elections warehouse. It's a sizable area, but it's well scaled to their needs and the demising wall for where EMA begins. Next slide, please. Miscellaneous pictures of D.R.E.A.M's warehouse, IT's, EMA as well as the framing that's going up. They have started Phase II, and the good news is that we were just told the other day it looks like they're going to be able to run a little ahead of schedule for Phase II. Next slide, please. Just some more interior shots for different areas: Clerk of the Court, the Sheriff, and the IT. Next slide, please. So this is the anticipated construction milestones based upon the delivery of the materials. Obviously in today's marketplace, but they've commenced Phase II as of the end of November. They will complete the base building shell by the end of this month. We anticipate at the end of January, the Elections phase will be substantially complete, and were looking to have a certificate of occupancy for the Elections as of the end of January. Furniture will be installed in mid-February, and we're anticipating operations for Elections by March 29th. And then right now the anticipated schedule for Phase II which is everybody else other than Elections is June 5th with a June 8th certificate of occupancy. Next slide. So, I'll take any questions that you all might have."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Morris."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Just a quick one, Mr. Diamond. Tell us and the public the extent to which departments have their own secure entrances an overall security especially with respect to the Elections."

TIM DIAMOND, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Sure. Election's has a secured insurance that the public will enter into and then be guided over to the areas to observe ballot counting and the like. There's a camera system in there -- inside of Elections that will monitor each of the doors and the different areas for all of the agencies are access

control. So everybody has a secured insurance and they will be monitored by our security systems and security force 24/7 around-the-clock. And then, I believe Election's will also have security personnel inside of their -- inside of their suite."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "And I think I recall from earlier discussions about this that there won't be a way into the Elections area from inside the building."

TIM DIAMOND, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: That's correct. There's a hard partition between the Election's department and the rest of the warehouse. And each of the agencies is partitioned by a floor to ceiling wall, so it will be impossible for people to just jump around anywhere they want to."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Good. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman".

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Thank you, Chairman. Did I hear you say that you're ahead of schedule or it looks like Phase -*"

TIM DIAMOND, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "-- they picked up Phase II, yes, ma'am. We're trying to understand what that means, but they've made very good progress in terms of building on Phase II."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Can I get you to share that with other agencies that seem to be behind schedule. I think that's a great thing that you all are either on task or ahead, so I just wanted to openly commend you all for that. I think that's a --"

TIM DIAMOND, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "-- it's a team effort."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I think that's a great thing and I know in this day and age when costs and supplies and material played in to it, I think that's a great feat to be ahead or either on schedule. So I just wanted to openly commend you for that."

TIM DIAMOND, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Well, thank you very much. It's a team effort."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Other questions or comments?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Great. Thank you, sir."

TIM DIAMOND, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Thank you, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Mr. Manager."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Mr. Chairman that concludes our report."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Commissioners, it's right at 1 o'clock now. I want to make a suggestion that we recess for lunch and Executive Session and when we can back, the Sheriff is here, and the Magistrate Court, and the Superior Court -- they're both here; we take those right after lunch. We'll adjust the Agenda. I'll entertain a motion to recess for lunch and Executive Session where we'll discuss the issues of real estate, litigation, and personnel. All right. Let's vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Sheriff, we should be back by 2, 2:15, no later than 2:30. We'll take you first and then Magistrate and --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- probably around 3."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you."

CLERK GRIER: And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

(Executive Session began at 1:00 p.m.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Without objection, we will resume the regular order of business. Madam County Attorney, where are you?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Thank you, Chairman Pitts. Is there a motion to approve the request for authorization for the County Manager to negotiate and finalize an offer for the purchase of property as set forth in Item Number 5 of the Executive Session Agenda?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Please vote. I'll record Commissioner --"

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- Vice Chair Hausmann is voting, yes. Next item. Madam Clerk."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "No. She's got to do the vote."

CLERK GRIER: "That passes unanimously."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: ""No further action items from Executive Session."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Before we recessed for lunch and Executive Session, we agreed to amend an agenda. Without objection, we'd hear from the Sheriff. And what's that -- sound that item regarding the Sheriff."

CLERK GRIER: "It's on page 14 under Justice and Safety, **22-0999**: Discussion: Fiscal Year 2023 Budget."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Good afternoon, Sheriff, come on up."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Good afternoon, how we doing? Is this thing on? Outstanding. Thank you all. First of all, if I may -- perfect, thank you. Thank you. If I can start with a really public thank you to the Commissioners Morris and Hausmann. We have a couple of things that will be delivered to you on behalf of the Fulton County Sheriff's office, not that piece. That piece is where we are now. For the rest of Commissioners, correct. And we have a couple tokens of our appreciation for the partnerships as I said earlier. As I said earlier, sometimes we agree, sometimes we disagree, and sometimes we agree to disagree. So to that end, I will tell you and go through this particular presentation, unlike the last one, minus the shanks and the dogs, et cetera. So that said, there are a couple questions that I've heard throughout the morning that I want to make sure we address as well. First of all, we did move into AC/DC this past Saturday. We didn't move 350 as the new reported, we moved 305 young ladies. All day, if you will, not a single complaint in terms of where we come from and where we are now. Ultimately, one of the things that we took into consideration, we worked with Madam DA and our Solicitor General at the behest of the Mayor to analyze, through their departments, analyze each young lady's file and circumstance. And to that end, there were right around 69 recommendations and 40 consent bonds. So we immediately were able to slash the number of individuals going over to AC/DC in terms of our females, female population. To that end, we still have nearly 500 people sleeping on the floor in our --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute, before you leave Union City, are all the females out of Union City now?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So that's a great, great catch. So yes, all the females, as of Saturday are out of Union City."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And in AC/DC?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "They are in AC/DC. Now, we have not turned the keys over. And one of the things that was brought to my attention, I believe, was brought to your attention, Mr. Chairman, was the K-9 Cellmate Program. That is something that hopefully, we can discuss at some point as we get ready to move forward, because they lost their home. And they have to be out by the end of the year. More important -- or equally as important to me and Mr. Davis and his team have done a great job. Equally as important is, as we plan for the future, I heard conversation around, not necessarily shuttering it, but winterizing the facility, et cetera. One, I think it is absolutely necessary. And two, I think we need to plan, much like Cobb County has done, they've devised and put portions of cells aside for mental health occupancy. So if there's an opportunity down the road for us to look at mental health, look at competency programs in conjunction with the state. The state, in and of itself, has taken Cobb out of hand and said, we will sponsor 30 of those cells and 30 of those individuals that need competency restoration. So there may be an opportunity there from that perspective. Alright. So, any other questions about Union City and -- from there?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "(Off-mic-comments.) There are no inmates there? I heard you say there are no females there --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "No inmates."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "There are no inmates there?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "No inmates. No inmates at the Union City facility or the South Annex better call, but certainly an opportunity to repurpose that for the betterment of our community as a whole. The Alpharetta Jail, I --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute, just before you -- one more question on Union City. No inmates and no personnel?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "No inmates, no personnel. However, we do do a routine check and we will continue to maintain it. So Mr. Davis and I are looking to -- I don't want that to be shuttered to the point that --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Understand -- but no personnel, meaning, no Deputies?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "No Deputies. No Detention Officers. We are all over at AC/DC. Months ago, we started this plan to be able to, as we hire, be able to staff AC/DC. And so we're doing that and the results have been astounding. I will send each one of you -- we're working on a video now. We should have it shortly, either this afternoon or tomorrow, where you have groups of young ladies, really talking about the

differences, right. Being able to put somebody in a two-person cell as opposed to six, eight, ten women living in the same confined space; being able to walk in -- one of the things that was most exciting, walking in and young ladies saying, look, this is fresh air. I mean, it is -- I haven't smelled this kind of fresh air in months, in years, right. And so to that point, I mentioned earlier that we worked with Madam DA and the Solicitor General's office, Mr. Gammage, in making sure that those individuals that could -- have been there a year or longer that needed some kind of assistance, right, Public Defender's office, maybe, they weren't as aggressive as they could be. But giving people an opportunity to get a judicial release, and so hence, when that was approved, several, up 40 ladies actually were able to get out. So Union City, we're good? Alpharetta, right now, in Alpharetta, we had 25 detainees, 24 of them belong to us. Us, being the Fulton County Sheriff's office. Now, so we've got nothing but for positive feedback from the Chiefs in that area in as much as they are able to drop individuals off, we will process them in. And we have a transport mechanism where if you're there X amount of hours, you get transported down to 911. If not, you get processed and seen by the individual -- or individual county's first appearance process there. Just hung up with the Chief in -- not Milton, Johns Creek. Johns Creek, they -- they're loving it, right. There are a couple different Northern cities including Alpharetta that have outstanding IGA's that are waiting to be officially accepted. So Milton has completed theirs and Chief Mitchell is, again, excited about the usage of the facility, getting his team back out on the street. So the response has been positive. And to that extent, they wanted to -- each one of the Chiefs wanted to complement the Chair and Commissioners for making that a reality. Us being able to get police on -- back on the street is one of the things that has been very helpful. So let me break that down for you. Twenty-four of those individuals are Fulton County inmates, those particular inmates are -- we started a Veterans Unit. So if you're a veteran, you've been locked up, we got Veteran Affairs that can go up and have a conversation with you, mental health component to that. And so that's where they were as well. As well as a few high-profile detainees that don't mix well between 901 and the Marietta Annex, all right. Any questions about Alpharetta? All right, hearing none. First of all, again, people say, well, Sheriff, why are you here, right? You'll see a memo in your packet that we just sent, and we certainly can get you this electronically as well. One of the things that you will find, as I continue to walk this journey with each one of you all, one of the things you'll find in your package is a memo dated toward the mid of the year, where we told you what we needed as a Sheriff's office to function. All right. So we've kind of summarized that in this upcoming memo. I won't go line by line, but I will tell you where you can find the information, what that looks like. So numeral one, right, the budgetary restoration of \$5 million proposed reduction. So our budget adjusted last year was \$129 million. The proposal we got this

year was \$124 million, minus the \$5 million, which I was -- I take to understand -- we've had numerous conversations with County Manager and the team, so I do want to thank them for making themselves available to have these conversations. That \$5 million is based on the vacancies. The problem with that is that using the methodology that we've learned over the last 700-plus days, we take those County -- those vacancies, we pay bonuses out of them. We take those County -- those vacancies and we unfund them accordingly to pay starting salaries higher than minimum. We got a police officer that's leaving City of South Fulton, been patrolling for five, ten years, you don't start them out at the bare-bones minimum. And so those are the kinds of things we've been able to do with that. So you'll also see that we're asking that that be refunded, so that we have a place to start. Refunding of the unfunded positions, that is another ask that we discussed toward -- when we had the Academy award-winning piece with the dogs and the rest of the units here. The unfunding is where, again, we have created additional hierarchy and additional opportunities for people to join our -- our team. We unfunded several of -- not several -- a lot of those positions in order to compete across the County. And so we're asking that that be refunded. The compensation and salary adjustment this is -- I'm at number 3. We discussed as we moved through our midterm ask, or midyear sounding, we discussed where we are losing ground is not paying a really competitive salary. Yes, certainly people are appreciative. When I first took office, we gave Detention Officers and we gave Deputies a pay raise. Last year, we gave the 7 percent pay raise with you all's guidance and leadership, and that was across the board. This year, I am trying to get our Detention Officers up to 63,000 and our Deputy Sheriffs up to 70,000. Now, the numbers that you see in these charts, we worked with Mr. Hermon and his team to provide these numbers as we get ready, as we go through the rest of the presentation. So I knew that was going to be a question, where did you get these numbers, what does that look like, et cetera. As we talk about - - as we move to number 4, we talk about the triple time. And we've had this conversation and what you'll also see in your package is a legislation from DeKalb County, what they are paying law enforcement and those that work inside the jail, doesn't matter if you're civilian or sworn, triple time. Now, there is a sunset period on it. And what I am asking for is that as we approach the 2023 budget, we set up a program, and it can be a pilot program for 12 months, which we will come back in six-month period halfway through, and report out on our retention rate. We will report out on our hiring rate based on this triple time and some of that retention, those retention opportunities from there, all right. So now, those calculations, again, were -- we computed those with the help of our County HR, Mr. Hermon and his team. And so they speak for themselves, but just in case, I'll walk through. You see the 852,000 that is the civilian estimates as comp time -- comp time paid and earned. And then below that,

you'll see the sworn, all total that's a \$17 million ask, and that includes a payout. So last, would hear Commissioner Hausmann ask, do we pay the individuals that have gotten to 7 million? Okay. So based on the recent numbers, that's a \$7 million ask, but one of the questions that Commissioner Hausmann had during our last setting was, do we take those that have already accrued to 40 and 480 and paid them out. And so there's an ask that's the total there, all right. So, as we continue, you'll see on subsequent page, page 3, the midyear budget ask for last year and overtime conversation from there. So what you will also see in conclusion in this memo is that, as of January 4th, I am declaring that the Fulton County Sheriff's office will no longer be a compensatory time agency, period. So, the key is, how do we fund that. So constitutionally, I can make that declaration. I am doing so now. I will do it again January 4th. We're going to pay our people overtime as we go, on a more traditional 171, again, and Mr. Chairman, we had the conversation last night. I lost two or three people to Cobb County this week alone because they don't have to wait to get paid overtime, they get paid as they go. And those numbers are actually coming. So the top box, right, in terms of our original funding, one of the things that I've said traditionally is that, we traditionally get underfunded for our overtime, and then we scratch and claw to get to what we need ultimately there. And then the last box, the golden box --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Hold --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So Mr. Sheriff, would you repeat what you said about, you're declaring something and you have the authority to declare. I want to know what you're declaring and --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- why you --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Absolutely."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- think you have the authority."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Absolutely. So one of the conversations we had last I was here was, as a County, our CFO reminded us that we currently have -- we operate under a compensatory obligation, right. I'm not sure if that's a proper term. But we are compensatory-accrual County, right. So meaning that, I come to work for Fulton County as a Deputy, I have to accrue 480 hours before I can make overtime. So I got to spend half our -- half a year on an IOU, right? If I come as a civilian, I have to accrue 240

hours before I'm allowed to make overtime. Now, if I get to 480 and I decide I'm going to take two weeks off, I'm back down to 400 hours, and then I have to accrue the other 80 hours before I can again then make overtime, right. So, there are a subset of individuals who Mr. Hermon and his team have identified have amassed 480 hours. I have a constitutional -- I have the constitutional authority to say, we are no longer to going to be a compensatory time agency."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Now, where is that?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So that is -- and Mr. Hermon, I don't know if you want to chime in. That -- and we will get you the legal ramifications of -- legal --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I'd like to see --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "-- piece there --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- where you believe that you have the authority --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "I don't believe --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- the sole authority -- you don't have to do it now, but I need to know where that is."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Oh, look here. Oh, I stole Mike too. Did I -- so the official code is 15-16-10."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You get that, Madam County Attorney? Okay."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Right. And -- thank you, but all of this has been vetted, right? We discussed last time. The pain point here is, last week -- thank you -- last we discussed this, it was a discussion item and no one brought it forth as a -- an action item. And so ultimately with the all of these things, in conclusion, we will ask that at some point, right, you all determine when that -- what that looks like, that these be turned into action items. Because I cannot constitutionally fulfill my duties, my constitutional duties without these things, without moving forward in a positive direction to retain people, recruit people, maintain a competitive salary, keep those in our jail safe, right. This is a plan set forth to make our County jail safe, our County safe is a whole, and certainly, what you will see -- and I like -- I like simple, right. What you will see in this conclusion is this box, right, the original 124 was a proposed. Number 1, the budget restoration of the FY23 budget proposal reduction, I mentioned that earlier. Unfunding those positions, I mentioned that. I'm on page 3 at the bottom. The

compensation salary adjustment, top of page 4. The triple time, which I certainly would agree needs to be in a pilot format, if possible. Number 5, the overtime payment, the accrual process. And then number 6, the payout of the accrual balances, what that looks like. Now, the other piece to that is, so this is a \$200 million ask, right. This does not include the \$11 million that we asked for in the midyear for capital expenses, when we talked about redoing the ninth floor, when we talked about vehicles, when we talked about vehicles out of the life cycle, when we talked about Tasers. We talked about -- all that's in the original budget request that I presented to you all. Now, here's a couple of unique opportunities that -- now, I wanted to walk through that memo because I wanted to get to this next part fairly quickly. You have in your package on the right-hand side, our analysis of the budget for this year, right. So what you will see is that the Sheriff's office has a \$5 million reduction, taking us back to the 124 I mentioned earlier. Every other -- well, 25 departments have a budget increase. So to a layperson, right, you are funding everybody else's increase based on the money that was taken from the Sheriff's office. Now, here's the other thing I learned over the last couple of budget cycles, as Commissioner Arrington would kindly point out. If we want to go from being best in -- being okay in class to best in class, what does that look like? You'll also see in your budget -- in your package from us, the Fulton County four-team benchmark counties. And so we painstakingly did the same thing that our Finance team has done over the years, the same thing our HR team has done over the years. And what you will see, using the same methodology and included Cobb County, Gwinnett County, as well as DeKalb County. You will see that from our benchmark perspective, we rank 15 out of 15. We rank dead last when it comes to the amount per inmate we spend. We are dead first in the number of inmates we house. And so when you look at Charlotte Mecklenburg, for instance, and they are -- well, Franklin County, Ohio, let's start there. They have less inmates, they spent -- their Sheriff's office is allocated \$184 million. You look at, obviously Texas; they figure they do everything bigger. It's bigger in Texas, Travis, Texas, \$211 million; Shelby, Tennessee, \$185 million. There are a couple outliers in here, obviously, Pinellas County, Florida, \$208 million; Orange County, Florida, \$337 million, right. They do a really good job in terms of what they can -- what they are provided to constitutionally do their jobs. And all right, with that, I'll take any questions. Certainly, I know, Mr. Chairman, you'll have somebody fact check all of this for us. And so we certainly expect that. But I do want to take an opportunity to thank Mr. Hermon and his team. I -- certainly, our County Manager. We've had a lot of conversations around this, and how do we -- and he likes to say, good, better, best. I like to say, better and best, because I don't do anything halfway. And so that's where we are. So ultimately, the ask is two -- that our budget be set at \$211 million. That would really put us a long way ahead of the rest of the state and becoming -- continuing

to be the Number 1 Sheriff's office in the country. If there are any questions, I certainly will take those. And --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. There's a lineup. Commissioner Arrington, Commissioner Ellis, Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Commissioner Arrington, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you, Sheriff Labat for this information and taking the time to put it together, you and your staff. You know, I think that there is likely a temperature to do some or most, if not all of the things that you're asking for. The problem I think is, I don't think we can identify \$200 million out of next year's budget. So I wonder if there is a four or five-year plan to stagger that in, right. Because we've got to balance the resources. Obviously, we know you need more. And I think several members of the Board are willing to give you more. But to say that we could afford 200 million out of 2023's budget, might not be possible. If there's a three to five-year phase in that might be more achievable, right. And so then that way there's a certain amount this year, next year, and we might be able to get there. And so I would certainly look at that. The other thing, I'm glad that you included this overtime policy, you know. I think one of the challenges, unlike increasing the salaries is, you know, what prevents someone from getting a thousand hours of overtime, right? What limits? And that may be have to -- be one of the policies where, hey, there's a cap on the amount of overtime hours anyone can get under this program, right. And, you know, there's only a certain amount of -- I see you propose it as a pilot program. And so maybe there's only a certain amount available for the pilot program to test it to see if it works, to see if it makes sense. But I think certainly, people want to support your efforts for retention. I think one of the things that stuck out to me in one of the earliest slides about ORCA was that you've been unable to fill positions. And I don't think that's -- I don't think that's your fault because everyone else up there was filling positions. I think that is the salary is too low for those positions. And so I think, you know, certainly at least for me, I don't want to speak for anyone else, I'm certainly willing to do that. And I think they'll be a lot more support for that. The other thing that I would -- would say is, you know, again, as we balance resources, you know, you've got six asks on here. And, you know, again, as we talk about maybe a three to five-year plan or whatever, you know, maybe you take two this year and two next year, you know, over the three to five-year plan, right. And so I don't know that, again, that there's any way that we can necessarily find all six for 2023 at the level that you're asking for. But that doesn't mean that it can't be done and maybe we knock one or two out in 2023, and then we bring on maybe one or two, 2024 as we look at the rollout. So I would certainly like to talk to you about that. And then as

far as your authority, I, you know, I'm going to take you at your word on the authority, like, that's not really my issue. My issue is what, if any, impact might that have on the County as a whole, right? You know, will there be other people saying that they can do that? Will there be other Constitutional Officers saying that they can do that and what is the broader impact --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I can answer that."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- on doing that when we have certain employees under comp time system? And so my request -- certainly, I'm not questioning your authority. My request would be that we kind of flush those implications out, the unintended consequences before you make -- before you exert your authority. My request would be to make sure that we talk about those issues before you exert that authority. And then we're left holding the bill for any unintended consequences that may result. So I'll leave it there, but again, thank you for your time and, you know, I think, you know, we're going to do -- try to do as much as we can to get you as much as we can. I just don't -- there's no way we're going to be able to do it in one year."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So first let -- if I may, just may say, thank you. I certainly understand the concerns. I appreciate the consideration. I do want to make a point of clarification, if I can. When it comes to ORCA, and you saw the number that said 13. That is not a true reflection of what we've been able to hire. So the last year two years, we've hired 497 people. And in that space -- no, we hired 438 individuals and 227 this year alone. We've not been able to retain people because of the way the County does business. And so again, I will certainly look at the unintended con -- I can tell you what the unintended consequence is. It's the Marshals is going to lose people because they no longer have to work comp time, accrue comp time. The PD is going to lose people because they no longer have to work comp time. And we're in a space of paying people triple time, raising the salaries, and moving forward. That will be that piece. From a civilian perspective, there are a number of individuals, and that will fall in Mr. Hermon's shop, that have to accrue 240 hours. And we're asking our civilian, or we call them professional staff, to do the same thing. But, you know, many times that's the crux of what makes the jail run, right. So as I was having a conversation with one of the other Commissioners earlier, I certainly appreciate the consideration, appreciate the approach. I believe it is my responsibility as a Constitutional Officer to make sure you know what I need. And then I think we work -- my opinion is, we work from there, from that perspective. And there are some phase approaches, or we could do like -- and see I got a pretty good memory when I'm -- when I want to. One of the things that -- one of the HR individuals, when they were doing the research between Cobb and Gwinnett, et

cetera, what generally happens is, the budget is ratified, turned over to the Sheriff, and everybody gets out of the Sheriff's way. And what I mean is, I can then, let's say, we come to a number, then I can come and say, okay, we can fit this in to this year's budget. Great example of that might be -- and I think this what some of the phased approach you're talking about. We have \$7 million in payout for people that have accrued, in the Sheriff's office, 480 and 240. First year, we may pay half of that, right, or a quarter of that to get people to -- and pay out like we did years ago when I believe Commissioner Morris was on the City Council, and everybody was accruing comp time and vacation time and they set a standard of what you had to take per year. There were opportunities for us to do that. And so I certainly appreciate that and certainly receive that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, thank you. Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah, just I'll amplify a couple of things that Commissioner Arrington said. And I do think one key, I mean, there's certainly a lot of information here that's useful for us to consider as we think about the ultimate budget. But we need to understand, you know, prioritization, you know, around certain of these areas. And so I've got a couple -- I've got -- I've got three specific asks I'd like to get in terms of just sort of information from you as we sort of think about our budget are maybe not related to some of the stuff that you presented. And that's with three of the units that you have. And here's what I'm interested in. And the Motor Unit, the Traffic Unit, and the Scorpion Unit slash Special Ops, you know, just not right now, off the top of your head. But just at some point I'd like to see the number of people you've got working in those, personnel costs associated with those, and sort of the equipment costs associated with those and what those expenditures have been over the past couple years. So I'm interested in just sort of understanding that, you know, just in a larger picture. The other thing and I shared this with our Management team, in terms of just the way we think about, you know, our resource allocation. And I think it's a miss, and sort of our Management team missed this, and I think it's, you know, missing in the analysis here too. We want to do stuff with Cobb County's, you're -- yes, your individual budget's 124 million. But within our -- right now in the early phases of this, or mid phases of this proposed 2023 budget, the allocation to the Sheriff's Department is really \$152.2 million, okay. So there's this 124, plus there's 28 million of inmate outsourcing associated. No, that is. I mean, in terms of what we're spending for jail operations and the total of the Sheriff's Department, what we're allocating, that's 152.2 million. So what bucket it fits in or whatever, but what the costs associated with it, are jail ops plus the Sheriff's ops. We slid it over here and into a non-agency bucket. But, right, there's \$152.2 million of costs

associated with this whole ball of wax, sitting in the proposed budget right now. So if we, you know, compare that where we were dollars allocated back in 2020, it's about a 32 percent increase in terms of dollars allocated. I'm not arguing whether those numbers are right, wrong, or indifferent. I'm just talking about in terms of whether we need to look at it and think about where our allocation to spend is; we need to look at sort of true numbers, right. And make sure we don't have other things that -- so there's dangers in terms of sort of comparing ourselves to other places and all that sort of stuff. There is some relevancy to it, you know, you can look at the Travis County Texas thing. I just pulled up online to look at their starting -- they got a higher number in here. But they got an advertisement for a Correctional Officer starting at 50,000. So maybe it's a comp on one end, but maybe it's not a good comp on the other end. So I'm just saying that to say, there's some relevancy here. But there's also sometimes we wind up talking about apples and oranges. What I'll look at, and this certainly predates you being here. But since my time on this Board, one consistent thing is that we cannot hire an adequate number of folks to work in the jail, whether it's Detention Officers or the Deputies that are working there, right? So that has been something that's been persistent. So to me the best thing we collectively could all do is try to figure out some way to bright break the cycle on that, and come up with something and really measure it and see if it's working. And I think certainly, maybe, you know, compensation is a component of that, maybe it's not all of that, working conditions, et cetera. Maybe I misheard you in the way you were describing the AC/DC piece, but it sounded like you might have more interest in folks working there than you would be at Rice Street, right, at the current pay rates versus a different pay rate. So, you know, we -- that somehow to me, I mean, at the core of really kind of our big issue that we've be dealing with, that's at the core of it. And you've got some solutions that are proposed here that I think components of have validity. Not necessarily sure how much I -- how much I buy into the concept of the triple time or some of the different pieces of that. I understand you, you know, you feel like you've got the authority on the 480 piece. But, you know, I guess that's sort of, you have the authority, but you know, do you have the funding to do it, right? That's really the -- that's really more of the question. Because I think I've heard you on that; is that correct?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Correct."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. And then on the salary components of it, it's, you know, we've been hiring -- like, you noted too, we've been hiring folks, but we'll turn around and we're losing them. And, you know, I'm sure a component of this is comp, but you know, how much of its comp and sort of where's the right flexion point to hit on

it? So I mean, as we're thinking about it in the context of what I heard from you and what I feel are, like, our really critical needs. The areas of focus are compensation for Detention Officers and the Deputies working in the jail and some component of overtime. Seem to me to be to sort of potentially, the two biggest issues and drivers that we need to think about in terms of our build out of our budget. So I mean, that's -- I don't know if you have some sort of comments relative to that or not. But yeah, that's what -- those are my takeaways from looking at all of the issues and raw numbers as well as the raw numbers."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So if I may --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Really quickly. The Scorpion Team Motors Unit and Traffic Unit, one, I introduced each of them to the Board at the last dog and pony show. What I will tell you is, there is a component that you don't see. So these individuals were brought -- instead of carrying 300 vacancies, these individuals were brought to do exactly what I said I was going to do prior to taking office, and that is fight crime. And so, to that extent, you look at the Scorpion Unit, who have -- who have captured almost 60 people charged with homicide, right. The Motors Unit, who has -- see here is the level of flexibility in building the Sheriff's office we've gotten to. So when one person showed up last Friday to work intake with a 150 inmates in there and it was critically dangerous, I called the Scorpion Unit, said, go get five people, have them come to intake. The next day when nobody showed up to work, I called the Motors Unit, said, stop what you're doing, let's go work intake, right. I called the Traffic Unit and said, let's go work these floors, right. So that allows me, as the Sheriff, the flexibility to be able to do other things. And here's the key, right, these folks want to fight crime. And in that space, they'll either do it for us if we compensate them accordingly and provide an environment where we do that, or they'll do it for somebody else. Because many of them are seasoned crime fighters, so that piece, I -- I get there. The other piece that is worth noting, Cobb County for instance, when you go talk to the Sheriff, they don't hire for Detention Officers, they hire for Deputy Sheriffs. So last conversation he and I had last night, Mr. Chairman, he said, I might have five or ten Detention Officers. I hire for Deputy Sheriffs so I can continue to train them, but I can also pay them a higher salary. And then I'll -- I'll -- two more points, really quickly to that piece. One of the things that you all as we go through this next legislative cycle, the conversation around raising law enforcement salaries at a state level. You will see legislation that comes out or you will see recommended legislation comes out, which takes about two years to process in total. The recommended salary for law enforcement, beginning at 56,000 across the

state. So don't be surprised when you see that. And then lastly, the \$28 million that we talked about that went with our adjusted budget of 129 is not mine, right. It's not mine to spend. While you may calculate it in that space, what I end up doing is fighting with the administration to give and take. So there may be an answer in that if you take that out of Non-Agency, put it in my budget, then one of the things that the County Manager and I talked about is the 500 individuals that are paid for out at Cobb County budgeted through that \$28 million, is there some wiggle room in there to accomplish one or two of these tasks. And if that's the case, again, I certainly, I receive that and I want to be good partners in making that happen. And that's ultimately the direction that we're talking about moving."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah, I'm not -- and my point is, from what the dollars we're allocating to it, I'm thinking about it -- I'm -- it doesn't matter what line item it is under to me. I mean, we're all for the -- what we're spending it for is for the entirety of these operations. And, you know, if we were in a different position in terms of staffing, right, not to say you wouldn't want to do this. But in theory, I guess, is you have additional capacity at ACDC, and you have an empty facility at Union City. Union City could be fully utilized, ACDC could be fully utilized, you know, Rice Street could be depopulated to the extent necessary. And the Cobb County arrangement would no longer be necessary. But we're not --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "We're saying the same thing --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- going to be able to get to that point with the certain levels of staffing. So, you know, in essence, we're sort of paying for that, you know, with the outsourcing, the components of that. So, you know, as that rolls off, there are other funds that could roll in, but you know, we have to have access to that in order to kind of deal with the entirety of the issue we've got right now."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "I -- honestly, Mr. --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Go ahead."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "-- Commissioner, I think we're saying the same thing."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. All right. Yeah, so that's -- all right. So and on the other, I understand that. I'm just interested in sort of the numbers of people associated with those particular units. So, you know, when you have an op -- I mean, I understand, you shared sort of the impact of that. But I am just sort of interested in the number of people."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Absolutely."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "And, you know, if -- if the strategy is that that's a portion of what those folks do and they're also engaged in the jail, you know, we got to have some sort of raw numbers to kind of piece together what that looks like for us, right. Because the biggest piece that we're hearing from probably is, you know, folks about, what are you doing about the jail from a funding standpoint, right? So then that becomes a question that gets asked of us about other operations that, you know, you feel are priority, but maybe other people feel like, you know, that those are the responsibilities of others. And I'm not looking to get into that argument. But that's why I asked the question."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "And I appreciate that. But I do think that, Mr. Chairman, worth --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Quickly, quickly."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "-- saying, right. Worth stating, that's the reason right now, I'm sitting with a RICO case with 28 defendants in a -- in one singular courtroom. But because of that staffing, I'm able to provide a secure environment and not have another Brian Nichols. And those are the kinds of things that are important. I'm sorry. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Thank you, Chairman. Sheriff, can you give me that code again that you mentioned. I would like to peruse that myself, if you don't mind giving me that code again."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "15-16-10. And it's actually at the bottom of page 1."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "It's 15-16-10?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "10, yes, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Okay."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "And it's at the bottom of your memo, page 1. Thank you."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I'll be brief, Chairman. Is it safe to say for my perspective that you are dealing with a hiring issue and a retention issue?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Yes, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Now, when it comes to your hiring issue, can you explain for the public, what -- what is handicapping you? Or what is a problem in you able to attract individuals to come and work at a -- as a either a Corrections or a Sheriff in Fulton County?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So first of all, thank you. And I'll be really quickly -- really quick. So to that extent, the jail itself, 901, is the hugest deterrent on the planet. We'll hire individuals and we'll take them to the jail in their first week of recruit training. And people decide, this is not for me, right. It is -- it is certainly overcrowded. I'm still stepping over bodies. And what you see is limited movement. And so to Commissioner Ellis' point earlier, one of the things we did to augment that was, really, really bring back the excitement in law enforcement and attract really good individuals to go out and fight crime. And that's that's been our approach. Now, part of that that status, if you will, whether it be Scorpion, Traffic Unit, and/or any other units we have, K-9 Unit, whatever that looks like, is that you have to work in the jail as well, right. And what does that look like? Where do those resources come from? And just, we have been in -- we've been pigeonholed in the space of not -- again, your counterparts in DeKalb County -- and this was CEO Thurmond's call, where he instituted the triple time. And according to him and according to the Sheriff Melody Maddox, she sees the engagement and people willing to work and work extra hours. Because we're asking people to work overtime anyway. But what we're doing is asking them to work overtime and giving them a IOU. And so when people really embody the fact that, I can't get paid overtime until I amass 480 hours, I can go work for another government and do the same things. And so those are the kinds of things that make it tough to recruit. But even with that, we've -- we paid special attention to recruiting and hiring. And we've done a good job of hiring individuals. There are some people that don't want to fight crime, they want to manage those that have broken the law. And so we put them inside the jail for X amount of months. So, they -- that is something they want to do and try and change people's lives from there. So in that -- with that opportunity, we've done a really good job of hiring, again, just in 2022 alone to date, 227 people. And over the past -- over the course of two years, 438 people. Then we go into the retention piece, and what that looks like. And I'm glad you asked because one of the things that we talked about is -- and this is -- this may predate many of you taken office. But the change in the pension system, how that has affected law enforcement across the country. So we got an individual, one individual in particular, who has -- who resigned this week with five years, or so he gets his pension from here. And he's going to Cobb County. And he's going to stay there

five years, and then he's going to go to DeKalb County. And that -- that is something that, on a state level, the legislators -- the legislatives are grappling with to figure out how we even potentially do a statewide law enforcement retirement plan. And so one of the other things is, is people are going to Florida, for instance. Florida has a drop program, where in their pension, you do your time in that pension, you can do another three years at that same salary and amass and accrue your pension at the same salary. So there are a lot of things to include. And we offered this at the state level, but law enforcement across the state come up and -- with a plan for the -- they don't have to pay taxes, state taxes, what does that look like? So we're holistically to recruit and retain good talent."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "So -- so Sheriff, I don't want to play devil's advocate, but I'm going to have to for the sake of the Fulton County taxpayer. Is there -- say if this Board were able to give you the amount of money that you're asking for, do you believe given the conditions at the jail, would it truly make a difference in hiring, or would it make a difference in the retention and the turnover rate?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "And so I would honestly say all the above, right. It would set the tone here and the County and the State to be able to start a Deputy off at \$70,000. I'd have -- I would be in a position I believe that Cobb County was in earlier this year with a waiting list of people trying to come to Fulton County. The triple time piece is something that DeKalb's already doing. I mentioned that earlier. I believe, even if for a year, for us to study, for us to come back as an administration and as Sheriff's office, not department, office, we'd be able to come to you and say, okay, here, here's what the data shows, right. We got people working less -- but working more, taking less sick time. We have people coming to work more often and what that looks like. We won't know until I have something to show you. But honestly, with those three questions, I'd definitely say absolutely, yes."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "My last final question to you, Sheriff, is what do you consider to be -- what would be our future for Fulton County Sheriff's Department if you were not able to get the funding that you need?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "The future doesn't look too, too good, right. Unless everybody up there is going to come man a post at the County jail, right, we're not going to have the people to run the County jail. We just absolutely won't. To Commissioner Ellis' point, I have staff members that are now going over to ACDC, understanding how it is run. It is a cleaner environment; one that I don't feel my life is in jeopardy every day because I'm running that -- that particular unit, I'm responsible for it. There's a theory of

ownership, that's one thing we teach in direct supervision. And that is, it's mine, right. And I have -- I have to take that ownership, the individuals under my care and custody. And again, it's like my Mama used to say, right, you get what you pay for. And so every time you see a Detention Officer, a Specialist, a Security Specialist bringing American Deli in and the lining of the Chinese food is marijuana, you get what you pay for. And so, someone -- I'm not sure if it was you, Commissioner or not, someone mentioned in the last presentation, when you have people that are worth millions of dollars and you have somebody that's underpaid, is the risk to them to bring a cellphone in, bring contraband in, is that worth it for them? Now, we put additional security measures in place. We've arrested some of the very individuals that work for us. But I would tell you, we would be in a very poor -- we will get -- be in a very poor position as we get ready to move forward."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Sheriff, this will be my last question. What I want you to articulate, because there is -- there is a concern that you're doing more than you should be doing. There are critics that would say, you have a role and you may have extended that role. And so, as someone who is a steward of the Fulton County taxpayer, I would say to you that crime is all time -- it's at a all-time high in Fulton County. There's not a day that go past that Fulton County is not on the national scene for a death or something. So I know to walk in your shoes is a balancing act. But what would you say to those critics that would say; maybe you're doing a little bit too much, maybe you're not staying in your lane. I'm not saying these are my words. What I'm trying to do is give you an opportunity to speak to the Fulton County taxpayer who that may be a concern to."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "And certainly, I thank you. And I get it every day, whether I get it on social media, unlike previous administrations, right, I'm accessible. People know how to find me. I get a text message, email, whatever that looks like. And I make it my business to respond. One of our team members will respond within 24 hours. It's a new day at the Fulton County Sheriff's office. As the sheriff, I have three constitutional responsibilities: Protect the courts, not just protect the court, service the court. That means warrants, both criminal and civil; run the County jail; and be the Chief Law Enforcement Officer in the State, period, full stop. What I would tell my critics, and I have said this. Tell people to quit committing crimes, right. That'll solve all our problems. If we can get the one -- the unique thing about where we are, and I think Alton's done a really good job of that, of putting this data out. And that is, while violent crime, Chief Schierbaum will tell you, crime as overall in Atlanta is down one or 2 percent. Violent crime is still up. And those individuals, every time -- and you bring up

a really good point. Every time you look on the news and you see somebody; whether it be Johns Creek, whether it be Palmetto, whether it be Atlanta, it doesn't matter where it is. If it's in the Fulton County, confines of Fulton County, those individuals are coming to the Fulton County jail. So I can tell you, we got the Spa shooter. We got the individual that shot and killed a young lady out at -- at Lenox Square. We would have the two teenagers that killed the 12 and the 15-year-old if they weren't teenagers, right. And when they turn of age, we'll have them too. And so, I tell my critics, it's really simple, we got to get to our babies earlier, right. By middle school, we have surpassed that age. And that's what we do at the Fulton County Sheriff's office. So thank you for the opportunity. I appreciate it. And again, we can get this done. We can get it done."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Vice Chair Hausmann. It's 3:30, we have to hear from -"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Thank you. A lot of my questions have been answered already. So I'm going to try and not repeat anything that's already been said. Current state at the Rice Street facility, you still have folks sleeping in the hallways?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Yes, ma'am. So we have upwards of 480, almost 500 people sleeping on the boats, yes, ma'am."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "And the reason we're not moving them over to AC/DC is what?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So it's a phased approach. So -- and that was why it was important to move the 305 young ladies over in December. Because as we approach January, we have staged and we're doing the same thing. This is a unique opportunity for us, working with the DA and working with the Solicitor's office to individually look at those persons we want to move. So we have -- so the housing units are set up that we can move 56 next and another 56 individuals; so, 100-plus individuals are ready to go. But we're taking this time because, again, the IGA is a phased approach; one, to staff up. So every new hire that we have now that's a Detention Officer, we're training them in direct supervision first. And so we'll be able to in January, move at least another 100 individuals. In February, another 100 individuals, until we get to 700. The opportunity there is to get people off the floor individually, provide a little more mental health services, and get people behind doors. We are in such capacity, it is such a state of emergency there that we have individuals that are mentally incapacitated that are being housed with other mentally individuals -- mentally incapacitated individuals because we just don't have the space. And so that phased approach over the next four, five months, we'll have an additional 400 detainees over

there as long as we can continue to on this pace, we have now to hire individuals and retain individuals."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Okay. Because that seems to be like the most dangerous situation that --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Yes, ma'am."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- you have with people sleeping all over the place and making trouble. If you could do one thing right now. If we gave you carte blanche to do one thing that you've asked for, what would that be?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "I'd start raising salaries, paying people what they're worth. Because we have people that honestly, don't make a living wage, where they could actually work internally to the jail and other places fighting crime and not have to work a second or a third job, right. I think that would upset the apple cart across the State."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Starting salary is what?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So you got two starting salaries. And this, the way this is proposed in here, \$70,000 for Detention Officers --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "No, currents, current."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Oh, current salary, sorry. It's 45 for Detention Officers and 50 for Deputies. And my professional team has not -- this takes into account the professional team, but they --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Yeah, that's low across the Metro. How much does it cost us to train a new employee?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So it just depends on the position, right. Detention Officers actually do two weeks' worth of training, and then they do on-the-job training. So anywhere -- for Detention Officers, we amass this over from a past study, anywhere between \$89,000 over that course, and upwards of \$100,000 for Deputies."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So \$100,000 ballpark to train an employee that's making half of that?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Correct."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "What's their commitment when they sign on after they're trained to stay with us?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Great question. One thing that we have been able to do is use that \$5 million, which we no longer have in this proposed budget, and offer signing bonuses. And so what we were working with Finance to have first, second, and third-quarter salary savings, and paying up to \$9,000 in sign-on bonuses. That has been the incentive. The incentive there is to say three years. And it's a reduction every -- every year as to the amount you have to pay back if you leave."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Yeah. I've never understood why we would invest so much and then not pay folks enough to want -- to have them want to stay. It's never made any sense to me. So your salary issue is a real issue."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Yes, ma'am."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Okay? I don't think anybody up here would disagree with that basic premise. Triple time, you know, that's an open-ended idea that I don't know that -- I mean, I'm not going to be here. But I don't know how I could possibly wrap my head around a concept that we have no idea what the numbers would be for that. But if you're paying folks a real salary on the front end, you can plan for that and you understand exactly what your outlook is going to be from a budget perspective. I think it's reasonable also to pay folks overtime. You and I had that conversation. This having a wait is also one of those things that it's hard to make sense out of. So, I mean, a lot of what you're asking for is reasonable. But I think we have to be realistic, as Commissioner Arrington said. Your ask is just not achievable all at once, you know?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Well, I certainly appreciate that. And the data is there. And we use the same metrics that --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Well, the data might be there, but the money is not."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "No. I don't disagree with you. I don't disagree with you. But keep in mind, there are two things that your Sheriff did. When Commissioner Arrington mentioned we need these -- this information before we make decisions. Midyear, I got the -- I played by the rules, I got the information into the budget tool and to the administration from that perspective. Using the same calculations, we know what the data is, we pay X for overtime. And according to Mr. Hermon and his team, you double that, you have achieved triple time. So you know that piece. And I agree with Commissioner Ellis, we need to create a sunset environment there. Without doing it

and taking a holistic approach, we will -- we'll be piece mailing this, which is what we've done for years. And so I certainly appreciate it."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Well, again, I don't think anybody up here is saying your requests aren't legit, most of them anyway. But that doesn't mean we have the funds available to make it happen, is all I'm trying to convey."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "I'm clear."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "And -- and if we did agree, we're talking about a three-mill increase to pay for that. That's a lot of money to ask people to pay. And so I mean, there's a conversation here that really needs to happen. And there does need to be some consideration to what we can do and what we want to do and how to -- how to close that gap, okay?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "I absolutely agree."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "We also have to recognize that looming over your operation is the need for a new jail. So that's going to be extremely expensive. I was disappointed to not see the study by the end of the year that we have been working on. But that being said, I've got enough information on that to know it's going to be more than we anticipated even if we don't do everything that's going to be recommended. So, you know, this idea of outsourcing and the costs, where we could be keeping that money here in your department and paying folks, rather than sending them wherever, makes a whole lot of sense to me. And I hope that that's something that we look at. But I think we all have to come together in a way where we're realistic on, you know, what's the major things that need to happen, concentrate on them first. I like your concept of perhaps, using Union City as some sort of mental health facility. I think the State might buy into that, help us achieve that if we presented that, right? They're looking at all sorts of mental health issues. So, to me, there's a lot of things that could be done in what you're asking for. It may not happen immediately, but I mean, a lot of it makes really good sense. It's just a matter of being able to come up with the funds."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "I agree."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "And that's going to be a struggle. I mean, you have to realize that is going to be a struggle."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "I agree."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So three-mill tax increase is a big, big ask."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Well, again, as I have to rely on the County Manager. It's not my area of expertise, right. I'll have to --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Well, I just want the public to know, three-mill tax increase is under consideration and a jail has to be built. So somebody's got to pay for that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Thank you, Vice Chair. We're about to run out of time. I want to save my comments to budget time. And Commissioner Morris won't be here. But I'll answer -- ask his questions at that time. All right, Commissioner."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. First, Sheriff, I want to just say, thank you for coming in and being the type of Sheriff who has been informative, collaborative, a team player, who has contacted us directly, and just to talk about the issues and the things that you need. I can tell you from, not only my years now as a Commissioner, but prior to that, as Chief of Staff to the late Commissioner Joan Garner that this is -- I think we may have said this at a previous meeting that, this is more information that we've ever received from the Sheriff's Department. And so I want to thank you for that and let you know how much I appreciate it. You know, I've consistently heard and seen in the community that you and your team are out there with the people. So I think that, you know, one of the things I have not seen is, do you have a glossy booklet of all the services and programs that the Sheriff's office provides to the residents of Fulton County? Because that's something that I always saw come through to the desk. And my question was always, where did you do this? But I don't have to ask that question of you, because my constituents consistently tell me that they've seen you in their neighborhoods. They've seen you in their -- at their events. They've seen your team. You have your table, you have your banner, you have your tablecloth, and all your information. And so I think that you need a glossy booklet too. And because one of the things that I want to make sure people know is that, let's dispel the myth that you're asking for this money because you want to lock up more people. That is not the case. You're addressing issues that were there before you even became our Sheriff. And you're trying to raise the standard for humanity within the jail and within the -- your workforce. These are our Fulton County Employees regardless of the fact that they are Sheriff's office employees. And we want to make sure that they are safe and well compensated like everybody else. And so I want to ask you, because it was baffling to me when you said earlier that the number that we had did not match your number as far as hiring. And you read your numbers and you said, even this year alone you've hired about 227 individuals. So what is the number of positions that you need to fill to be adequately staffed that are currently vacant?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So -- so let me provide a little more clarity. I was talking about the ORCA numbers, right. So it shows 13 individuals. But a lot of people, unless you are seasoned, and you don't need health insurance and those kinds of things. In certain aspects, you don't want the -- necessarily the higher salary, you want the stabilization of a job. And so our vacancies and our unfunded positions are what part of this package asked for. And so ultimately in terms of vacancies, so we got 153 vacancies now. And again, one we just filled though, to your -- to your previous question, is a Director of Communications. And her task by midyear, is to have one of those glossy, you know, feel-good story kind of things. So that you can see -- see and touch. Remember we did it midyear, we did it live and in person."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "And so I --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "That was the Academy award-winning presentation, all right."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "That was the one Chairman said he was given out Oscars for. So we will, in turn, make sure we have that. Through midyear, we wanted to make sure we did a real good job. Not -- we have to do a better job of telling our own story. But we had -- to Commissioner Ellis' point, when I first became Sheriff, right, we had to show him proof. And so our part -- my goal was to be a part of our community from a holistic perspective. And so you'll have that come midyear. And so again, but specifically, 153 vacancies."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "That's great. And you mentioned living wage. And I truly do not believe a living wage is a living wage. Because I've seen where we have had employees that made a living wage who were on assisted programs for daycare and housing and food and other things. And once we supposedly were giving them what's supposed to be a living wage, all of those services that they need, they no longer could qualify for. And now it had to come out of their pocket, which made them actually more in a worse situation than they were before. And so a living wage -- and you can, anyone can Google this. You can't -- there's no such thing as a starter home anymore. And you can't really survive in Atlanta making 45,000, \$50,000, with inflation and everything else that has happened. And so, you know, the fact that you're trying to raise that a little bit is commendable. But also, because I know how important it is to train people. But I know that when they leave, you have just lost that total investment. And that's something's that another Sheriff's Department doesn't have to pay because

now these people are trained and experienced. And so it's important to me to definitely pay people up front and get them to stay. So I'm hoping that we can do that. I don't want anybody to look at this sheet that you provided where it speaks to the four -- negative 4 percent and think that we're not trying to fund public safety. Because anyone who has watched the news should have seen recently all over the news and social media about the 12-year-old who was shot and killed. And then the 15-year-old who died later on in the hospital. And then the mother and grandmother in Buckhead who was killed over her car. I mean, this is just too much. And, you know, I know that you've reached out to all of the law enforcement across the County to ask about assisting because everybody is short staffed in law enforcement across the County. And I just want to ask you, have you had any pushback on assisting across the County with crime, because crime is terrible everywhere in Fulton County."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "And so to your point, and it's a great point, I was out there the night the 12-year-old was killed on 17th Street Bridge. Chief Schierbaum and I -- we are in lockstep. The other Chiefs around the County are in lockstep. In terms of Atlanta and Fulton County as whole is unique. Both from a law enforcement perspective, on the federal level, state level, the local level. We don't have some of the problems you see across the country. A shining example of that right now in those courtrooms with my specialized units, two Deputies from Douglasville, two Deputies from Henry County, four Deputies from Cobb County, all right, as well as Gwinnett County. So collectively, we have done a good job from a law enforcement perspective. We do need to do a better job of telling our own story and a better job of making sure our community continue -- we continue to close the gap and build more trust in our community. And we'll get there, but those are things, just examples of what you're talking about."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Well, thank you, Sheriff. And I -- Mr. County Manager, Madam CFO, the \$5 million that -- that's showing no longer in his budget from this chart, where would that come from if we were to try to give him at least that \$5 million back? Or where could it come from?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "You could reduce the funds that we've set aside for inmate outsourcing to restore that portion. If you were to consider that we funded inmate outsourcing at the contracted capacity rates of 500 beds at Cobb County and 700 beds at the Atlanta Detention Center. But we have not fully utilized all of the beds at Cobb County. So you could potentially look for savings within that agreement and use those resources. Otherwise, we would have to look at

eliminating funding from somewhere else within the budget or add an alternative revenue source like a millage rate increase to support the additional resources."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. So, Sheriff, inmate outsourcing? What did you call it, inmate outsourcing?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "We -- yes, ma'am. We call it inmate outsourcing."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay."

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "That's the term that the Finance Department has used for a number of years."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Well, what kind of impact would that have on you if that's where the 5 million came from?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So again, and our CFO is correct. And our County Manager and I have talked about that. While -- and Cobb County is a good example. Cobb County is having staffing issues as well. So we -- if we were to cut that in half, there would be a revenue stream -- or I don't think it's a proper term, right -- for us to be able to do that. I do think though, we need to look at where the 5 million was pulled from and restore it from that perspective. Because we're able to -- again, it goes back to what I was saying to Commissioner Ellis, I got it, nobody -- y'all don't care about the buckets, right. You -- from where you sit, you don't have to -- from the lens you look through, you don't have to worry about the buckets. I have to worry about the buckets, because the buckets don't -- aren't under my control. So if that were an opportunity, that's the beginning, right. That is an opportunity for us to look actually, beyond the \$5 million, I think. And when we talked about it, Mr. County Manager, it would be closer to \$7 million. And that may be a space that we can accomplish one or two of the other targeted opportunities."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So you're saying it would be okay to take that 5 million from that particular bucket, as you call it, to help you -- to put it back in your budget?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "So I would say through the lens that I'm looking through, if based on what we spent, based on their capacity to not house any more than 250 detainees, it'll be closer to \$7 million, which will allow me to accomplish a couple of different things. But I would not pigeonhole myself and not say that if all things improved throughout the year and we were able to get additional people off the floor, Cobb County was able to house 250 additional people, I'd be right back here at least

providing you, from a transparent perspective, the additional information so that you know where we are. And the opportunity to even go back to that outsourcing piece and add additional funding there."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And Sharon, can you confirm that \$7 million that our Sheriff has mentioned?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "As I recall, Commissioner Hausmann -- I mean, Commissioner Hall, the total cost for Cobb County at 500 beds, was 14.6 million. So if you cut it in half that would be 7 million, yes, yes, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So you would be willing for us to do that to give you that \$7 million?"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "I'd be willing to follow your lead. I know Mr. Chair, he's -- there's going to be a whole bunch of conversation around what that looks like. I do appreciate it. So the answer is -- the short answer is, yes, right. I'm not turning down anything but my collar. So let's make sure. And we -- we've painstakingly gone through that piece to make sure we're able to answer those questions legitimately. But that would then get us -- that would move us a long way to a solid, yes."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Right. And then you could stagger like, Commissioner Arrington said, stagger some of these things over the next couple years. Because 2023, as we all know, currently is not looking like the year to really allow us to do a lot of extras. But you would at least get your \$7 million without a millage rate increase. Because you just said, you got a bucket to pull it from, and --"

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Yes, ma'am. So -- so let me offer this --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "-- if I may. And I'll be short. One of the highlights of this and increased collaboration, certainly the \$7 million, that's where the bucket comes from. I think turning these into action items, then forces us to give you more answers, right. It doesn't say that it has to be approved at this amount of money. But it does force the conversation of, what does this pilot project look like? What does refunding this money look like? To Commissioner Arrington's point, what are the unintended consequences when the Sheriff gets up here and tells his entire staff, we're no longer a compensatory time agency? What does that look like? So I think that if we turn it into -- and that's in the conclusion. I'm asking that we turn this into an action item, you get more answers. You, being plural."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. So is it possible for us to approve that \$7 million at least so that's done? That's like, a good gesture toward making the Sheriff's Department move in the right direction."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, let me say this --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "It's a bucket that it's coming out of. You want to do it all --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioners, listen, what's before us now -- I've been pretty lenient today. This is a discussion presentation by the Sheriff, and what he wants at -- for the 2023 budget. We're going to deal -- be dealing with the budget later on today, a discussion on it. And we're going to have -- approve a budget early next year when the -- unfortunately, Hausmann and Morris won't be here. But I would hope that we would not make any motions today. We've taken -- the Sheriff has been kind enough to provide us what he considers to be responsive to requests that we had. We have that, I think we should take that into consideration, but not make any decisions on anything that he's asked for today. That just my recommendation."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Anything else today on this item? All right. Thank you, Sheriff. Next item."

PATRICK LABAT, SHERIFF: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. It's 3:55. We got a lot to cover. Madam Magistrate, come on up. What's -- is that the next?"

CLERK GRIER: "It's on the bottom of page 14, **22-1003**: Discussion: Magistrate Court and staff positions, sponsored by Chairman Pitts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Sheriff, you're out of order here, now, you're on the floor. You're - this is my jail here now."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Good afternoon. I'd like to begin by thanking Commissioners Morris and Vice Chairman Hausmann for their faithful and dedicated service to all of Fulton County. Chairman Pitts, Honorable Members of the Board of Commission, I am Cassandra Kirk. I serve as the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County. I want to thank you for the opportunity to address you all about the ongoing needs of the Court. And I'd like to begin by providing a little bit of background

discussion. I'm going -- I am joined today by Margaret Stagmeier. And I'd like for her to give a community perspective on where we are. I think I'm going to return the Sheriff's phone as Ms. Stagmeier walks forward."

MARGARET STAGMEIER, TRISTAR REAL ESTATE: "Good afternoon, thank you for your time. I'm Marji Stagmeier and I am a landlord --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just speak up a little bit, please ma'am."

MARGARET STAGMEIER, TRISTAR REAL ESTATE: "Yeah. I am Margaret Stagmeier, thank you, Judge Kirk. And I'm a landlord in Fulton County, I have several properties. I run an edu-housing model, meaning, we like to take older, dangerous-type dwellings. We partner with low-performing schools by providing free after-school and summer programs. And our goal is to basically improve education through stabilized housing. So we are in mission-based property management and landlord in Atlanta. In 2020, I started the Star-C Eviction Relief Fund. Our goal is to raise \$50,000. We raised \$12.5 million. And we expanded it to any affordable housing landlord, apartment landlord in 18 counties. We've helped 4200 families pay rent in the last two years including many families in Fulton. So, I say this to tell you, we are a mission-based apartment landlords. And we're extremely concerned about the delays in the Magistrate Court with eviction filings. And I'm listening to Sheriff Labat talk about trying to get \$7 million in to raise his budget. I can come up with \$60 million for the County. By just investing 3 million in the Magistrate Court, you're going to expedite the ability of landlords to pay rent. Right now, the delays in evictions is costing landlords \$339 million, okay, 339 million, which equates to \$60 million in property taxes that y'all can collect. So, in conclusion, and I know we're really pressed on time. I'm just asking the County to consider funding the Magistrate Court properly, so that landlords can have at least a tool, an eviction as a tool in their toolbox to help families pay rent and basically to improve the property tax collections for Fulton. Does anybody have any questions?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No."

MARGARET STAGMEIER, TRISTAR REAL ESTATE: "Okay."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "I do have just one quick question."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I'm sorry. Go ahead, Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "I mean I -- listen at this. I did see some of your analysis. And I think that 60 million is highly flawed and not accurate. And I -- I'll test that with our Assessors. I'm not diminishing that we don't have a problem. But I think for purposes

of our -- really, our budgetary discussion, we really need to try to keep this as factual based with presentations from our administrative officials as opposed to external folks -"

MARGARET STAGMEIER, TRISTAR REAL ESTATE: "Okay."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "-- you know, coming in. I appreciate the perspective. And I understand what the issues are. But what I think we got to be really careful about, some of this stuff that's being shared in terms of some of these numbers that are being thrown around. We just really need to be practical, realistic, and sort of honest as we're trying to have these discussions."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "I appreciate that. Created by a local legislation in 2014, your Magistrate Court is in a unique position. We are developing from a nascent entity to one that is attempting to address our COVID health cases, coupled with hastily implemented technology and staffing choices made from necessity over the years. Our program inventory includes judicial, administrative, and clerical services. And our mission is to inform, engage, and empower our community. Now, is the time for this Commission to assist the Court by examining the relationship between our administrative services, our business processes, our technology, our clerk functions to align our overall organization's strategy as a unified Court. I note that when Alton Adams was speaking, the Mahoney study, which predates this Magistrate Court, mentioned two things. It mentioned a unified court and it mentioned one Chief to direct that court. Magistrate Court is the only court currently that has one Chief to direct all cases as they relate to that court. Magistrate Court is also the only court that has -- that actually is functioning, I would say, is highly functioning right now. I'd ask this Commission that we need a better solution for us -- for a sustainable staffing. Each of our technological and process milestones was instituted to safeguard procedural fairness, encourage meaningful opportunities for engagement with self-represented litigants, and to promote public trust. And while the Court has made tremendous strides in managing, creating, and propagating case-management priorities and case time to disposition standards, our heavy caseloads and lack of permanent administrative resources, stifle the ability of Fulton residents and court users to experience a more responsive court. The efficiency and sustainability of the current dual-leadership structure with a divided staff and fluctuating resources, has not been effective. Magistrate Court Fulton County will be unable to function once we complete our backlog cases. Alton has told you that with ARPA and Orca, we have been funding several positions. But this Commission has been helpful in providing us additional positions. But we keep piece mailing it. It's always a band aid. I'd like to share a few undisputed facts. Number one, one elected leader exists for Magistrate Court that is the Chief

Magistrate Court Judge. Number two, the statute requires that the -- requires the Court to function including the Clerk, at the direction of the assigned Chief Magistrate Judge. Number three, this Court, since its inception in 2014, has been underfunded and understaffed. Number four, the needs of the Magistrate Court grow, while the resources available are shrinking. I have placed before you, a book, a folder with Magistrate Court information in it. It is our inventory. It is also the structure that Cobb County runs as well as a listing of a survey from the other Magistrate Courts around the County. I want to talk to you about one more fact. And that is that the Court's enabling legislation did not identify or structure a clerical staff. And the court staff, this Court's staff was literally carved out a State Court as the two Courts separated in 2015. During the 2015 budget season for 2016, the County Finance Director and the former Clerk of State and Magistrate Court identified 39 clerical staff to transfer to the Magistrate Court for us to begin our journey. In good faith, I, as the Chief Magistrate Judge, appointed and the Clerk of Superior Court accepted the appointment as the Clerk of Magistrate Court before the end of December 2015. The resources were increased by this Board in 2017 specifically as it related to Magistrate Court positions. And those positions exist today, but they are not accessible to support our Judges. And so as I conclude, on behalf of the Magistrate Court, I asked several questions. How do we support our Judges? There are 30 Judges; there are eight full-time that need support. Where are the resources to support those Judges? And how can they be allocated? We ask today for your help in creating a Court that the State Legislature envisioned when it created this Magistrate Court in 2014. I'm happy to answer any questions."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. When you came to my office, I asked you to summarize what the problem is and a solution to the problem. That's what I want to get to today."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So the issue to me seems to be that there are 39 positions in Superior Court; is that correct?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "So I would say that there were 39 positions given to the Clerk of Superior Court to function for Magistrate Court."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. But it's 39 --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "There were 39 --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- that you would like to have those 39 in Magistrate Court?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "So -- so actually, I would like to return them like we did when we separated --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I got that. So return --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "-- from State Court --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "At issue is these 39 positions that are in Superior Court now that you believe should be, should be returned to the Magistrate Court; is that correct?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "So I'm going to -- I'm going to wordsmith just a bit. So the 39 positions were given from Magistrate Court Clerk functions. They weren't given to Superior Court. There were an additional 19 people that were given in 2019 -- 2017 again for Magistrate Court functions. So that's 58 people that sit somewhere in the Superior Court/Magistrate Court mealier that could be used."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Now what I'm hearing and I'll be very honest with you. I don't say this -- well, hopefully I don't -- I'm really tired of this issue."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Me too."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And what it has been described to me -- I'm going to be very plain, very blunt, because I've said that to you and I've said that Ms. Robinson as well."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It has been described to me by those who understand this a lot better than I do that it's, this is a personal fight between Judge Kirk and Ms. Tina Robinson. And I don't know how to resolve this, but I want to resolve it today. At issue is these 39 or 59 people, however many there are. And so that's what we're going to deal with here today."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And get this over with, one way or the other."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir. And I appreciate that as -- and if I could simply add, this is not a personality. For me this is all about

business. Each time I come here and I say I need funding. Each time I turn to Sharon, I say, I need funding. It is because some service or personnel has been withdrawn from the use by the Magistrate Court. My only avenue is to ask this Board, to ask the ARPA people, ORCA people, give me money. The money exists, it pains me --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Just a minute. Just a minute."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "-- to keep asking --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "The two of you, have the two of you talked at all."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "We have not talked since the MOU ended in 2021. And in 2022 at the --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Now, listen --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "-- beginning of this --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- stop, stop --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "This is just a mess. Now let me hear --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "This is mess. I agree with you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- from Commissioner -- Commissioner Hausmann, Vice Chair Hausmann. Commissioner Hall."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I want to resolve this today, one way or the other."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So Mr. Chairman, you're asking the same questions I was going to ask. So these 59 people, where -- who's -- who do they report to? What do they do?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "They report to the Clerk. I have no idea what they do."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "But they're assigned to you?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "So they are assigned -- so 39 of them and that number is actually now 34. so, five of them have gone somewhere. Those 34 people sit with the Clerk because I pointed the Clerk of Superior Court to be the Clerk of Magistrate Court. This relationship has not been a good one, a smooth one, an easy one --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So she's your Clerk and y'all haven't talked in over year?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "We've probably not talked in longer than a year."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "And you say this isn't personalities? That makes no sense, Judge."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Well, so what I say is, this is business. And so when someone tells me that we're going to perform services to you -- for you anymore. And my first response is to ask Sharon to give me money. And so --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Well, your first response should be to try and work out the problem so that y'all can work together."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Okay."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "I mean, you've heard the whole day today, we don't have money laying around that's not allocated or needed for something. We've got way more need than we have revenue to deal with it --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Correct. I'm asking for a budget-neutral transfer just like we did it from State Court. The problem is I am functioning as -- and I apologize for cutting you off. I am functioning as the Chief Magistrate Judge for a Magistrate Court which I do not control. When I am speaking with people in the public and they go, this is what happened in Magistrate Court. I say, no, that's what happened when you were in the Clerk's office. That's not something I could fix. I can address that --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "You can fix the relationship with -- I mean, we don't -- we work with a lot of people that we don't --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Correct."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- get along with all the time."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Absolutely."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "That's being an adult."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Absolutely."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So I just -- I don't understand this. The Chairman, none of us understand this problem. We're all Fulton County. Y'all have extremely difficult jobs, you need to work together --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "All right, so --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- to make it happen."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "All right. So here's what I would ask. Our statute says that the Magistrate Clerk is to work at the direction of the Magistrate Court Chief Magistrate. Can you all make that happen? That is why we are here."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "It doesn't mean you're the boss. It means that --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "I don't want to be the boss --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- you have -- she has duties that she performs for your Court. That's what that means."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Absolutely. That's absolutely correct. But it also means that those 39 people were brought there and they were meant to staff our Court. They were meant to be case managers for our Judges. They were meant to be -- like, so that's what they did when they were with us a State Court --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So they're not doing that work?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "They're not doing that now."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Why are they not doing that work?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "You should ask the Clerk. I have no idea."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "No, you should ask the Clerk."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "So I --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "-- asked for the staff."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "I mean, no --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "So I don't want to be childish."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Stop. Just a minute."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "I agree with you. This --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Judge. Judge Kirk, just a minute, please."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Let me hear from the Commissioners, then I want to ask the County Attorney to weigh in on this."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Thank you, Mr. Chairman."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "I apologize."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall, you want to be heard?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I was about to ask the County Attorney to weigh in as well. But also was going to ask Kenneth Hermon, but I don't see him there. Because we're talking about positions and where they are and what they do and all of that. That should be able to be clarified by our Chief Human Resources Officer. It shouldn't be a question at all because aren't those Fulton County employees?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "They are."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So what is the question? That's ridiculous to me that we're sitting here trying to determine what 39 positions are, what they do, and who they report to, and all that. HR should be able to tell us. And then as far as it was explained to me, this all happened due to a resolution brought forward by the Board of Commissioners that was basically a collaboration of the two of you. And when I say the two of you, I mean Chief Judge Cassandra Kirk and the Clerk to Superior and Magistrate Court Cathelene Tina Robinson; is that correct?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "That is correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "In 2016, you are correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "In 2016. So let me -- let me make sure I'm clear on this. So this is not something that by law was already -- that needed to be rectified or corrected by resolution. This was something that was brought forward by two intelligent, powerful women who have their own areas. And it was a decision that was supposed to help both of you, correct?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. And Madam County Attorney?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Thank you, Commissioner Hall. As I understand it, the history of this issue is that the Magistrate Court Clerk's function was originally, as far back as I can recall, with the Clerk of the State Court. They are, under statute, there are three places where the Magistrate Court Clerk's function can reside. One of them can be handled through the Clerk of the State Court or it can be handled through the Clerk of the Superior Court, or the County Commission can authorize the Chief Magistrate Judge to either select someone, serve as the Clerk herself, or have another Judge serve on her Court as the Clerk of the Magistrate Court. So the three places they can reside: State Court Clerk, Superior Court Clerk, or somewhere within the Magistrate Court itself. That is something that can be provided for by a local law. But because it is not in our County, it has been designated through the actions of the Board of Commissioners, the -- my understanding is consistent with yours, that in 2016, which at the time the function resided with the Clerk of the State Court as it is one of the legitimate options under the statute. That the change from State Court to Clerk of the Superior Court was initiated by Clerk Robinson and Chief Judge Kirk. And that that was brought forward to the Board of Commissioners, and then accomplished via resolution at that time. If the Board chooses to change that arrangement for whatever reason, that would need to be done by another resolution, changing the location of where the Magistrate Court Clerk's function would reside within the County."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So, with all that being said, let me make sure I'm clear. It has always been the Chief Judge of Magistrate Court's decision to make, where she wanted that function to be?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "It is the decision of the Board of Commissioners, the governing authority of the County. In the absence of local law, which our --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "In the absence of local law --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "-- County does not have local law. It is -- it is the decision -- as to where the function will reside is with the Board of Commissioners. In this most recent instance, the change was initiated at the request, I believe, of Clerk Robinson and Chief Judge Kirk."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So by law, our Clerk to Superior and Magistrate Court is both, but --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Currently, under the 2016 resolution, yes."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- only based on the 2016 resolution passed by this Board of Commissioners?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes, Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So prior to that, what was the Clerk? Was she only the Clerk to Superior --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Superior, only."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Court? And that was by law. But not --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Via her election."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- not based on the 2016 resolution. So she's literally a constitutional officer of --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "For purposes of Superior Court Clerk."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- for purposes of Superior Court only; is that correct?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "That is correct. And then the addition of the Magistrate Court Clerk function was accomplished via the 2016 resolution."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Based on the two of them coming to the Board of Commissioners and requesting it?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, got it. So hot off the press, I received a email from, of course, one of the largest development organizations, the HJ Russell. And it's

addressing the fact that Magistrate Court is not -- not working at its full capacity to be able to handle evictions; is that correct?"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "That is correct. And that is what Ms. Stagmeier spoke to. That is correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. Well, these -- this data that was sent to me by them is staggering because it's talking about the financial loss in Fulton County being 60 million in tax revenue, due to the current backlog of cases that Magistrate Court, rental housing providers in Fulton County are losing an estimated \$336.1 million at an average rent of 1400 annually. And it just goes on to talk about the public safety risk that they're seeing in all of their properties. And people now, the renters, basically have this -- the saying of, you know, you can just get over it and not pay your rent because Magistrate Court can't do the evictions anyway. So they're seeing this happen across Fulton County in their properties, and that is a travesty. So this, is this part of the issue of what you were speaking about as it relates to the positions and --"

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "It is. It's exactly the issue, yes; that is correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes, ma'am. Can you come to the mic?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute, now."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "One at a time."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "I was just simply saying to Commissioner Hall that that is the issue. And that is the reason that what is we are trying -- what we are trying to address. It is a staffing issue, it is an administrative issue. But is also a staffing, where are the resources issue. That's the question."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So, the problem I have is, why -- okay, what are they also doing that we may not know? Because you said you didn't know what they're doing. So I would like to hear from our Clerk to find out what are these 39 individuals doing that -- I mean, period, what are they doing?"

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "Good afternoon, Commissioners. First, let me say to Commissioner Hausmann and to Commissioner Morris, congratulations on your new chapter. I will miss you both. I know that you all

are tired of this. I know you are. This is impacting the citizens that we have vowed to serve, both me, as the Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Courts and the Chief Magistrate. We have both vowed to serve the public. I am a little confused because I actually thought, and the Marshal is here as well, I actually thought that we would be discussing this crisis of the evictions, the status in this County. That's why I thought we were here. I spoke to Mr. Stephen Davis, who is the Director of the Atlanta Apartment Association. As a matter a fact, we have a presentation for you that I'm going to ask Ms. Robinson to present --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No, no, just minute. Just a minute."

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "We don't have to do that --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Hold it. Just a minute."

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "But Commissioner, what I want to say is this --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Ms. Robinson, just a minute. Just a minute. Just a minute. Just a minute, everybody. We have a lot to cover here on the agenda today. And I don't think we're going to be able to resolve this today like --"

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "Yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- I thought we could. So what I'd like to recommend is that we table this issue -- what?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Can they get with HR and --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We -- just -- I don't know who needs to be involved in it."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yeah."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- but whoever needs to be involved, whether it's HR, the County Attorney --"

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- and the two of you."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And come back and --"

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "I agree."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- have something for us at our next meeting."

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "I agree. Thank you, Chairman."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Now, that's what I'd like to recommend to -- just a minute. Just a minute."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Now, that's what I'm proposing, Commissioners. Any objections to that?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "No objection whatsoever --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute. Yes, yes. Commissioner Arrington, please."

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "But what's on the table is taking positions --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Ms. Robinson. Ms. Robinson, please. Please. Do you want to be heard? If there are no objections, that's route we're going --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "There are no objections, but Chairman, I would -- you know, if we were in court, I would send y'all to mediation."

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "Been there done that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "And so -- and so I would say, I think there's a fix for this Chairman. I just think --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We can't fix it today."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "We can't fix it today. But I think there's a fix for this. We're not going to be able to fix it today. It kind of -- it does -- it does bother me

that I have two well-respected women of color. Now, I have to be honest with y'all. This is heartbreaking to me. And I would be remiss if I did not tell you all, I hold both of you all in the highest respect. And I'm not saying that you don't -- you both don't hold each other in respect. But I think, just like with a marriage and communication breaks down and sometimes you have to have a counselor to come in and step in and show both sides. Chairman, I would be open to us holding this."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Is that a motion."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "A motion. I make a motion."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Is that a second?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "That was exactly what I was going to do, so absolutely --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. There's --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- a second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. There's a motion on the floor to hold and properly seconded. Let's vote on that motion, please. Madam Clerk."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "We're holding a discussion?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes. Holding a --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "We're holding it for --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- for them get all the --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Give them an --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- County executives --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- opportunity to -- all these parties --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- County Attorney -- yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- to get together."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "HR, yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And come back with a solution."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You got to put that in the machine?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I seconded, yes. Yes, ma'am?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I just want to be heard. I'm next in the queue. I just want to know how many people do y'all need? I don't want to get in between whatever y'all got going on. How many people do you need out of the 58 or 59 people? How many people do you need out of 58 or 59? If we had to add more people to make up the differences or whatever, I just -- how many people do y'all need? That's all I want to know."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Now, just a minute. Not today, you'll have time to do that between now and the next meeting. Just to -- Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "And I'll add to this too. Just not bring other people into this conversation. That 60-million number is not worth the paper it's printed on. Don't come in here -- just like when we had the ACLU trying to come in here with that bunch of nonsense. Do not bring other people in here. This is something that you all have got to work through on your own. It's got to be factual based. And we cannot be wasting all kind of -- this amount of time and energy and resources."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. All right. The motion on the floor is to hold this matter until the next and we will resolve it at the next meeting. All parties will get together in the meantime and work this out. And I'll be part of those discussions as well. Let's vote. Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open to hold."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Lord have mercy."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion passes unanimously."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. Next item."

CATHELENE ROBINSON, CLERK, SUP. & MAG. COURT: "Thank you, Commissioners."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "I want to say thank you. I also want to let -- I actually want to make you all aware that we have State --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam. Judge Kirk. Judge Kirk, thank you. Thank you."

CASSANDRA KIRK, CHIEF MAGISTRATE JUDGE: "Yes, sir, thank you very much for the time."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "That is really bad."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk, continue please."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 8 under Open and Responsible Government --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Quickly."

CLERK GRIER: "-- **22-0981**: Purchasing and Contract Compliance. Request approval of resolution to extend emergency purchasing authority of the Chairman and County Manager for COVID-19 related purchases."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Morris, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote. Let's roll, Ms. Clerk, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "The vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0982**: Finance. Discussion of the Fiscal Year 2023 Proposed Budget."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We heard a lot about the budget today, particularly from the Sheriff. Anything you want to add, Madam CFO?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Mr. Chairman, all I was going to add is that when we come back in January at the first meeting, we will have updated the budget booklet to include the 12/31/2022 yearend results. And any recommended changes that we have as a result of where we ended the year for timing differences and for -- and things like that. Other than that, we'll be ready to take final action on the budget in January."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Ellis. And we will approve that no later than the second meeting in January?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Yes, Mr. Chairman."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah. I just --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "One thing I did want to -- before kind of the final numbers came in and all that sort of stuff. One thing is I did -- that I wanted to go on record with - I know we'll have this further discussion. If there are, you know, quote-unquote excess funds, you know, I think we definitely heard from the Sheriff, who needs some stuff that we'll kind of wrestle around with that. And then we've got some funds identified to kind of look at already in our budget. But the two other areas that I think that are worth kind of looking at and, you know, potentially sort of having a placeholder on excess funds. Number one is, reinstatement of the Pay for Performance, you know, bonus for all employees. And then number two, building a future reserve for facility needs. And I know we, you know, we've got -- certainly we're a long ways away from understanding, kind of, jail needs and facility needs and all that. But we know there will be one. And I think one of things that we, you know, seriously would need to do is start to think about, how we begin to -- we may be able to bond some of the stuff. Who knows how we're going to be able to finance it. But I think we need to start looking at placing some markers within our budgets in terms of building a reserve for funds associated with that capital build that we know that's going to happen. And I just wanted to -- I want to go on record on those two particular issues in terms of consideration, or giving, you know, giving those a sort of key consideration for any use of excess funds."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Commissioner. All right, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0983**: Registration and Election. Request approval to process outstanding and current invoices in the total amount not to exceed 65,794.63 for providing printing services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I have a motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 9, **22-0984**: Real Estate and Asset Management. Request approval of a statewide contract not to exceed the amount of \$149,417.09 to provide new office furnishing for the Fulton County Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Court."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approval by Commissioner Hall, seconded by -- oh, okay. Seconded by Commissioner Morris. Commissioner Ellis, Vice Chair Hausmann."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Is this redo of these facilities potentially house positions that may be associated to the Magistrate Court?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Unfortunately, I cannot answer that. This is a part of a million-dollar capital allocation for the Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Court. And this is one of the final aspects of a build out that is currently underway, procuring the furniture. But this is, I believe, TG-200. Or TG-200 is the ground floor, Suite 200 in the Justice Tower."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Vice Chair Hausmann."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "So this is a consolidation, a separation? What is this?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "This item has -- it's absolutely unrelated to the former issue and has nothing to do with the two entities."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "But it says it's for the Fulton County Clerk of Superior Court/Magistrate Court."

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "That is how the -- that office is referred to now, formally, the Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Court."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "It seems to me like this item ought to be held until y'all have the discussion. Yeah, is this time sensitive?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "This -- I'm sorry. This is just simply a part of the office suite for the Clerk."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "The question though, is it time sensitive?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, D.R.E.A.M.: "Yes, very much so. We were delayed five months due to the Permitting office for the city of Atlanta. There was actually a --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Okay, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It's time sensitive. I got it. All right. Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "(Off-mic comments) I was going to say the same thing as Commissioner, I would hold it to --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "(Off-mic comments) If it's time sensitive -- (off-mic comments) --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. All right. Motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0985**: Request approval of lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$1,000,500 to provide standby roof maintenance repair replacement services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Arrington. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0986**: Request approval of a statewide contract in the total amount of \$175,000 to provide tires, tube accessories repair services for Fulton County fleet vehicles."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Arrington. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "22-0987: Request approval to amend an existing contract to add the Fulton County North Annex jail."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Good afternoon, Commissioners. This action should have actually been first before the renewal. We needed to amend the contract to add the -- the jail, the Alpharetta jail before we renewed it. So this action item should have been first."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. And the price is \$244,401. All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. The motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 10, under Health and Human Services, 22-0988: Senior Services. Request approval of a recommended proposal in the total amount of \$4,487,656.46 to provide aging services for Fulton County seniors age 60 and above."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. A favorable motion by Commissioner Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "22-0989: Public Works. Request approval of a public-private partnership MOU between Fulton County and the Georgia Department of Transportation for sewer relocations."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Arrington. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "22-0990: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in the amount of 386,728 to provide fire hydrants and parts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It's a motion to approve by Vice Chair Hausmann, seconded by Commissioner Morris. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0991**: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount of \$397,959.03 to provide Corporation Stops and Brass Fittings."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Vice Chair Hausmann, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0992**: Behavioral Health and Development Disabilities. Request approval of an MOU in amount of 23,500 for a Countywide TEXT-4-HELP program."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Favorable motion by Vice Chair Hausmann, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Question, Commissioner Hall has -- you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I just wanted to know, are we reaching youth in private, charter, and homeschools? And how are we doing that? Anybody here to speak to that? I thought I saw -- is this Latrina's item."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, ma'am. She had to step away. So this is available to students across Fulton County. Your question about the --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Reaching --"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- private schools --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yeah, and homeschools."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "I can get that information for you."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. Thank you so much."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "You're welcome."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. A favorable motion by Vice Chair Hausmann, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioners' Action Items. **22-0884**: Request approval of a resolution consenting to and ratifying the use of Fulton County ad valorem property tax increment for a special -- for a project located in Westside TAD Tax Allocation Bond District Number 1."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Morris, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Commissioner Morris, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Yeah, this has been held a couple of times. It's a \$200,000 grant to -- from the Westside TAD, which as you all know by now, requires consent from the County Commission because it -- because it's subsequent to 2018, when the Commission extended the Westside TAD on the condition that it gets to approve the projects. This is, again, a \$200,000 grant to renovate the façade of the Olde Herren's, which is now the theater there. I know we held it up because of concern about TADs generally. But I don't think there's any reason to continue to hold this one. It's a good project and isn't going to save us any money if we reject it. So I hope everybody will approve it now."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Commissioner. The motion on the floor is to approve by Commissioner Morris, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Cast your vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 11, **22-0952**: Request approval of a resolution to establish supplement for the Tax Commissioner and for other purposes, sponsored by Chairman Pitts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. This was held at the last meeting for additional information, which you received. What it does is it increases the Tax Commissioner's salary, base salary by 20,000 so that he would now be making, I guess, it's 20,000 more than the Tax Assessor. It's -- I'll move approval. Is there a second? All right. Commissioner. Is there a second? Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. All right. Commissioner Ellis, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Yeah. You know, one of the things is that it's sort of been a struggle with a few places within County Government is understanding sort of the full picture of compensation for elected officials. And I guess on its face, you know, certainly, if all the funds that an elected official received would be their County salary or supplements, it'll be one thing. But just so we understand sort of apples and oranges. I believe the data, which this was captured from our HR -- our Director of Personnel Mr. Hermon. The total compensation right now, I believe that you shared with us that the Tax Commissioner is receiving in both in terms of his base compensation through base COLAs, longevity kind of salary that sort of stuff, plus other fees that he's collecting is \$533,978; is that correct?"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "That's correct, Commissioner."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. All right. Well given that, I certainly cannot support that. I don't think that makes any sense whatsoever. If you've got, you know, somebody receiving that kind of funds based on their public service to then ask for a supplemental addition on top of that. In addition to that, while we're on this topic, and we had one of these folks here before us today, if we'd stayed longer, I would have asked her personally about it. This week we learned that there's surprisingly a practice going on within the context of the Superior Court Clerk office, whereby certain Clerks throughout the County including our -- or throughout the State including our own, were collecting a certain amount of processing fees for passports. And according to this article that was reported, which it appears that the Clerk has not disputed based upon the statement she made. That our own Clerk pocketed more than \$360,000 in passport processing fees. And if we had known that prior to going in this discussion about additional supplements, if we adjusted hers with that last around, I certainly would have not have been in support of that either. So -- and I look back at some of the disclosures. I looked back specifically at the financial disclosure that we're all required to do. And I don't know what the requirements are or not. But there's a piece in there that talks about honorary and some fees associated that we would -- that (indiscernible) as a result of our job. Those are not disclosed in those forms. So I don't know what the legalities of that are or they aren't. But one of the things that I'm interested in doing, because I think it's ridiculous that we have to learn about this in the context of somebody else reporting it. Every elected official, if they're receiving some sort of compensation as a result of doing their job that's outside of the base that they receive, should have to disclose it to the public. I want to figure out a way for us to survey or have our own disclosure and supplement to that personal financial disclosure within the County from all of our elected officials. It should be clear and there should not be any

question about it. It's an embarrassment that we should have to learn about this through the newspaper that through a service that we decided to fund that we've got somebody making fun -- making money off the backs of the people in the processing fee. That's a joke. So anyway, that's -- I'll work with our County Attorney's office on that. But since we were on this topic and it's sort of a deluded issue because of this nature of fees and other sort of stuff that are collected, I just want to go on record with that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you for bringing that up because I have made a note to ask the Clerk about that issue while she was here today. But I forgot in the -- yeah, I forgot about that. But I agree with you. And I'm not sure what -- what's at our disposal to find out exactly what happened. I'm certain that County personnel were used, I'm certain that County equipment was used. And it was an -- it is an embarrassment. It was an embarrassment. I didn't know about it until the Manager showed me an article about it. So that -- we've not heard the end of this. So Madam County Attorney, I'd like to work with you and Commissioner Ellis on finding out exactly what we could do. And we'll need to get to the bottom of this and maybe have her come before us at our next meeting as well. All right. On the issue that's before us, Vice Chair Hausmann, regarding the 20,000 increase for the Tax Commissioner."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Yes. I just think for the benefit of the public, we should explain the reason that this request has been made."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "I think it's a legitimate question."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, you want to -- well, I mean, there was a -- I had a conversation with the -- try to be brief and summarize -- with the Tax Commissioner, who was concerned that in his position, and I was shocked to find out how -- how low his base compensation was. And when he learned that the new Tax Assessor was coming in at a much higher salary, he had done a survey and found and concluded that in other jurisdictions, the Tax Commissioners are at a higher level than Tax Assessors. So he came to me and asked me to put this paper before us, which I support, and I did so. So that's why it's on the agenda."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Okay. So this would not be offset by a reduction in any of the other compensation that he currently gets from outside sources that for tax collections that he does throughout the County, correct?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It would not. And I'm told that the \$20,000 will come from savings -- help me out, Madam CFO -- within his department's budget as I understand it."

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "I'm going to have to defer to Hakeem. I wasn't involved in the review process for that. But I believe that it could be funded from salary savings out of his budget this year. And we'd have to probably look at his vacancy rate next year to identify a position that would not be filled to cover in his 2023 budget without having to make any adjustment to his budget."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Because I asked him specifically that question. He's talked to someone in his office and they told him that it would come from his existing budget. So I introduced the paper based upon the information that I received from him."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Okay. So, in essence, if this is granted, the new salary would be \$594,000 --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Not -- well, I don't know --"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "-- for the new compensation?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- what the total compensation would be. This would be \$20,000 - -"

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Mr. Hermon, is that right?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- added to his base salary."

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "Yes. If we are -- the resolution intent is to pay him, I think, \$20,000 more than the incoming Chief Appraiser, then his total compensation would go to 594."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Well, I mean, we said up 20,000, but this is actually a supplement of 60,000 on -- that's before us, correct?"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "Yes, that's to get him to be \$20,000 more, on a base pay compensation, than the Chief Appraiser."

VICE CHAIRMAN HAUSMANN: "Okay. I think we all agree that our Tax Commissioner does an outstanding job collecting taxes for Fulton County. That's not under dispute whatsoever. But the salary level is a constant source of criticism to the County. There's going to be article after this conversation, I'm sure. And the public just doesn't approve of it. They just don't. I would say he's probably the highest paid official

in Fulton County and perhaps in Georgia. Again, he does an excellent job, but I think that the salary is quite nice already and then some. So I just don't see how I could possibly support it. I don't see how he could ask for it, quite frankly."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I just want some clarity on the additional income that he receives. Because I thought it was always in the state legislation that the Tax Commissioner of Fulton County could receive a bonus based on how -- what percentage of taxes they collected. Is that correct or, no? What -- explain it."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "The legal provision is not for a bonus, but rather a per-parcel for taxes collected in -- under certain circumstances."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Well, to me, that's a bonus one way or the other. It's kind of like, you know, you did your job at an exemplary level and so you get this bonus check. You know, it's the same thing to me in just layman's terms for a senior or anybody in -- a regular resident. And this was always the law; is that correct?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "The additional compensation that the Tax Commissioner receives is provided for under the law, yes."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Right. And so was this the law before he became our Tax Commissioner, or was this a law that was put --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I would have to confirm --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- in place --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "-- but I believe it was longstanding --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So it was a --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "-- statewide."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- longstanding law prior to him coming on board as our Tax Commissioner. Any Tax Commissioner before him could have received this bonus pay had they collected the percentage of taxes per parcel that he has at the rate that he has?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "To my knowledge, our Tax Commissioner is not collecting compensation under any special legislation specific to Fulton County."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And so how is he receiving it?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Through statewide legislation --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Statewide legislation."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "-- that would apply under those circumstances to other Tax Commissioners."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Right, okay. And then what other ways is he receiving additional compensation? Is it his contract?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I have not done a full analysis of all of those sources of his additional income. We can provide that. But as I understand it, it is largely consisting of per-parcel collection provisions."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So in looking at this, the problem -- is there a problem with him making this extra pay because he's the only one that has ever achieved this? Has anyone else achieved this that was a Tax Commissioner before him? Were there other -- others who got these -- that collected so much and received this additional pay?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "We have not done a full analysis of comparing various Tax Commissioners. I would imagine some of it -- the differential is accounted for by the size of our County and the number of parcels."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. So he's not doing anything that he would -- he's not doing anything other than, he's falling under the law that his position was written under. I see you, Denval, shaking your head, yes. So -- so he's getting these because he is following the law. He's -- it's not like he's just getting an extra pay. His base pay is what?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Is it 194?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Mr. Hermon?"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "184, Commissioner."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. What is the -- we have people in the County who make more than that. We have department -- what's the highest-paid department head make?"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "That would be the County Manager, I think it's at 300, correct?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "300,000?"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So -- and then what is the pay you mentioned the Tax Assessor that's coming on board, what's the pay of the Tax Assessor? Because this is all a part of the reason why he wants his pay -- his base pay."

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "The base pay the Board of Assessors were able to negotiate for the new tax -- Chief Appraiser, sorry, was 225."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I'll be quick. When this was first brought to my attention, I did do some due diligence. And it seems to be a practice that was accepted and done at the State. This, not anything that we enacted, per se, Fulton County. Is that correct, County Attorney?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "That is correct."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "And so, Chairman, I'm going to support this because I think the tax collection rate and where we are going into 2023, and we've had the Sheriff come before us today, we've had the Clerk and the Chief Judge, Magistrate Judge, we may have to make decisions that may not be the most popular decision, but they're prudent decisions as to where we are. And so until the State does something on their end to resolve this, I think it's unfair to put that burden at the County level, at the Fulton County level. And so I'm going to support this. I do understand it being a problem looking at the entire amount of money that he makes. But as a sitting Commissioner, I am uncomfortable looking at the entire amount of money that our Tax Commissioner makes when the General Assembly did not take issue with that with other Tax Commissioners. I think that's that you may be setting up a unfair bias in my opinion, let me say that. And so I'm going to support this because Fulton County has the highest or one of the best tax collection rates. I would hate to see, and I'm not saying that he would walk away, but part of our job is to make decisions that are not necessarily popular, but they're prudent for the operation of business. So, I'm going to support this. And until something is done at the State level, because I think it would be

unfair to -- for it to be for one Tax Commissioner as opposed to another one. I just think that, in my opinion that would be unfair. And so I'm going to support this. I'm going to support this because it is needed at this time. And the risk of what happens if we don't do this is far greater in my opinion. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Morris."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "I'll try to be brief. I do have a little history on this issue. Because when Dr. Ferdinand was not an elected Tax Commissioner, but was an appointed Tax Commissioner of Fulton County, he came to the city of Atlanta to our Finance Executive Committee seeking the dollar per parcel. It's not a bonus, Commissioner Hall. It is -- it was explained to me that it was anachronism back when the Tax Commissioners in rural counties would knock on doors collecting taxes, and apparently it was not a requirement that they collect city taxes, but only county taxes. And so the General Assembly allowed them to collect the city taxes under a contract with the cities in return for a fee that would be a personal fee and not a county fee even though the work would be done by county employees and county facilities and everything else. We rejected that request at the time because the City Attorney said that the law only allowed elected Tax Commissioners to collect that fee, not appointed Tax Commissioners. And the portion of the City that was in DeKalb County was collected by the DeKalb County Tax Commissioner, who was elected. And so the city of Atlanta paid him a fee, but not Dr. Ferdinand. And Dr. Ferdinand then declined to collect the city of Atlanta taxes, which was a bit of a disaster for us. We had to hurriedly develop a Tax Collection Department and software and everything else and had abysmal collections. Dr. Ferdinand does a fabulous job. He's terrific at his job. But I'm not going to be able to support this. Back to some more history. So there have been efforts in the General Assembly to undo this. Wendell Willard had one passed, I think, by the House and Senate killed it to undo it some years ago to require the Tax Commissioners to collect city taxes and not receive any additional fee. The County could negotiate a fee for the County to do that. But at any rate, it's my understanding is the General Assembly has passed a law to -- but its grand parented existing contracts. And that's why Dr. Ferdinand continues to be able to collect these, but new Tax Commissioner throughout the state cannot. So it will be fixed when all of the existing Tax Commissioners with contracts to do this have moved on and been replaced by new Tax Commissioners in various counties who will no longer be able to collect this fee. But just so the public knows, the issue here for the -- and it's been in the press all the time. He -- the last report I did see some years ago showed that he was the highest-paid elected official in the state of Georgia. Football coaches, of course, are the

highest-paid employees of governments. But he was the highest-paid elected official. He -- if this information is correct and I assume it is, the personal compensation he receives from the cities is \$309,305. That's on top of his salary, making his earnings currently \$534,000, roughly. So, while if he were not collecting that fee, I'd support a bigger -- bigger increase than the 60 because he is so good. But the public is concerned about it, they don't like it, they can't stand it. And I don't think it's fair myself, and I've told him that. I told him that when he came to us years ago with the city of Atlanta, Mr. Chairman. So I'm not going to be able to support it. I think the \$534,000 is -- is probably enough. Thanks."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis. What?"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "(Off-mic comments.)"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Anyone else? All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, three nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0993**: Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners expressing support of the 117th Congress House Resolution 1382 and Senate Resolution 790, which commemorate the Atlanta Race Massacre by honoring the victims and reaffirming the commitment of the United States Congress to combat hatred, injustice and white supremacy, and for other purposes, sponsored by Commissioner Hall."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Arrington, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I just wanted to say that this was brought to me because our Congresswoman Nikema Williams and our Senator John Ossoff introduced this. And was asked that the County followed suit to just show some support for this 17th Congress-House Resolution. And so that is what this is all about. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0994**: Request approval of a Resolution urging the Georgia General Assembly to pass a Resolution acknowledging the atrocities of the Atlanta Race Massacre of 1906, sponsored by Commissioner Hall."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approve by Commissioner Arrington, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And this one is just simply to urge the General Assembly to pass a similar resolution. And I believe they are already in talks with those at the General Assembly. Thank you."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-0995**: Request approval of a Resolution repealing Resolution 02-1414 and 03-1456 -- 65 to conclude Fulton County's participation and the Princeton Lakes Eastside TADs contingent upon certain findings by County staff, sponsored by Commissioners Morris and Ellis."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We have motion to approve by Commissioner Morris, seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Speakers are Commissioner Arrington, Commissioner Morris, Commissioner Hall, Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So, you know, I see this says -- it appears, I think we might be doing this backwards. It appears that this says we're going to take this action and then inform the City. It seems to me that we would want to talk to the City first before taking any such action and see what their temperature is on it. So I'm not willing to support this today, because I guess, unless someone can tell me that they've already spoken to the City, Commissioner Morris, and that the City is okay with this. Princeton Lakes, you know, I don't know the size of the TAD. Some of that is in East Point. And I, you know, maybe it's only -- these TADs are only in the city of Atlanta. But I would want to know that we have spoken with the City and/or Invest Atlanta and that these people -- and if they're no longer using this, nor have any idea or anything in the works, I just think it's backwards for us to take an action and then inform someone. I think we should work better with our municipal partners, speak to them on a

front end, get their inclusion and input before taking an action that's going to affect more than just us."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Morris."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Yeah. I think, the inform, and the Resolution is the formal inform that's being talked about here. I have not had discussions at Invest Atlanta specifically about the -- this particular paper. We felt like it was timely because we wanted to take this action before January 1st so that we would not be sending any revenues for these two TADs over to the City for next year. One of the things we talked about in the budget discussions was trying to look at the TADs and decide whether we needed to continue to be injecting our general fund revenues into these. Now that the -- the TADs in the County that the County is involved with, I think represent 8.7 or 9 percent or so of the tax digest, which means we're not going to be able to do anymore for any cities if we don't clear some of these up. We picked these two because Princeton Lakes, the Invest Atlanta and the City have already decided they're not going to do anymore projects in the Princeton Lakes TAD. It's a small one, but at the last Invest Atlanta meeting, I asked about the Princeton Lakes Reserve and they said, well there's no debt, it's just that we reserved all that because we -- that we've already decided we're not going to do anymore projects in that TAD. So there's really no point in us sending any more money over there to be sitting in that bank account when they're not going to be doing anymore projects. The Eastside TAD was the other one. There is no bond indebtedness on that one. And many of you recall that Mayor Keisha Lance-Bottoms actually proposed to end the Eastside TAD because they thought that they had already fulfilled its obligation. So it's incredibly well-funded now. And there's a general sense that the -- that that TAD has fulfilled the purposes for which it was formed. At there's no reason for us to continue to send our general fund dollars over there. It's -- I've reminded the Invest Atlanta Board and the Beltline Board, for that matter recently that they really need to -- to recognize the County. As a Board Member, I wasn't even invited to most of the groundbreaking and ribbon cuttings. But -- but I've said to them, you know, the County actually puts more of its general fund money into these TADs than the city of Atlanta does. Because our -- while the city of Atlanta's overall millage rate is higher than the County's millage rate, the general fund millage rate of the County that goes into the TADs is higher than the City's general fund millage rate. The City has a lot of bond millage rate that makes our overall millage rate higher than the County's. But -- so we put more of our general fund money into these City TADs than the city of Atlanta does. So the Eastside TAD, by last -- by the last report, had \$110 million sitting there in cash. And again, Mayor Bottoms was going to close that one two or three or

four years ago. So it's logical to me that we not send any of our 2023 money over to that one, or certainly the Princeton Lakes TAD, which Invest Atlanta has already concluded and announced at its last meeting, they're not doing anymore projects out of. So -- so that was the purpose of us bringing this forward so that we -- so we could notify the City formally before January 1st, which was my understanding of when we needed to do that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Commissioner. Motion on the floor is to approve. Commissioner Hall, Commissioner Arrington, Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'd like to see something in writing that speaks to the fact that the city of Atlanta is no longer going to do anymore projects out of that TAD before doing anything. And if there's no debt then there is no need for this resolution. And I would also like to know how much money, how much of the County's money is just sitting there that is not being used. And a conversation like Commissioner Arrington said, should be had to address that. If there is funding that we've sent over that's not going to be used then, yeah, it should be refunded. But that should be a conversation that should be had and it should be done in the appropriate manner with in writing. And if anything needs to be signed to receive that money back, whatever that process may be. But is this going to allow you to get that money back? I don't see what's so funny. Oh, okay. So the money that we already have in there, you're saying how much of this money is Fulton County's money that's already in the TAD?"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Well, I don't have an accounting for that. The point really here is to not send any more money over there, which we -- which we're going to need in 2023 budget and subsequent budgets. That was the point. When they closed -- when they formally closed Princeton Lakes, I assume they'll send proportionately to the -- to APS and to the County and to the City general fund, the funds -- the funds in the Princeton Lakes was about six or -- six to \$7 million, it's not big. Eastside was, like I said, 110 million, not -- that's after -- after paying the committed items."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So you've said a lot that doesn't make any sense to me because I don't have anything from the City that addresses \$110 million you said they have to pay some obligations. Some part of that belongs to Fulton County. Then there's six to \$7 million, which you said is not a lot. But to me that is a lot, because we could do a lot with six to \$7 million. I can do a lot with just \$150,000. So I think that with all of that, this really needs to be held. For one, because there are a lot of questions that need to be answered and we need to get some clarity from the City on

where they stand with this. You're also -- we're talking about Roswell has TADs as well. And they have their own City Economic Development as well. I mean, there's so many TADs. We need to review them, not just by city; we need to review the TADs as a whole. And I just -- I want -- I'd make a substitute motion to hold it until our new BOC members on board because these TAD -- they need to be able to weigh in on whether or not they want these TADs to be repealed."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. There's a substitute motion to hold. Is there a second? Is there a second? Motion -- all right, seconded by Commissioner Arrington. Motion on the floor then is to hold. Let's vote on the motion to hold."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open on the motion to hold."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Come on, let's go."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion fails; two yeas, three nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Back to the main motion, which is to approve."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So Mr. Chair, I think I was next in the --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You were. Commissioner Arrington, followed by Commissioner Ellis. The motion -- again, the motion of the floor is to approve."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So Commissioner Morris, I wish you had gone first because you seem to present some of the information that I was concerned about, at least in regards to the Invest Atlanta already saying they're not going to use at least one of these TADs. I think more importantly though, was the information you said -- so I want to understand this. So if we don't do it by January 1st, we will have to make an additional contribution to both of these TADs?"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "That was my understanding, but I could certainly be corrected by the County Attorney or the CFO. Samir, do you have some information on this?"

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, ECONOMIC DEV DIR.: "Good evening, Samir Abdullahi, Director of Economic Development. Per the existing resolutions that we have between the County and the City, each year we would make a contribution for each of the TADs. So that is already ascribed in the existing resolution unless something like this was passed to say we would pull that back before the expiration period of the TADs. And each of those last about 25 years."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "But January 1st is, as I understand it, is a key date because that's the date the property is assessed as of."

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, ECONOMIC DEV DIR.: "Correct."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "And it's either assessed as part of a TAD or it's assessed as general fund --"

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, ECONOMIC DEV DIR.: "Right. And a lot of the Assessors --"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "-- revenue. I think that's the point of the January 1st."

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, ECONOMIC DEV DIR.: "Correct, yeah."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "And so and -- so my follow-up question then is, similar to what Commissioner Hall, what is your understanding of what would be done with these excess funds? And -- and how soon, right? You say it's \$110 million in one of them?"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "As I understand it, Commissioner Arrington, what this paper would do is keep us from sending any of our 2023 general fund taxes to these two TADs. It would not cause the TAD to the end and a refund of the excess money coming back to us yet. The City could continue with the Eastside -- they indicated, again at the Invest Atlanta Board, they're not going to do anymore projects at Princeton Lakes. But it's my understanding, they could continue with the Eastside TAD money to continue to do projects. And when they're through with it, I guess, send us back the taxes --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So do we know what the sunset dates are on both of these TADs?"

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, ECONOMIC DEV DIR.: "Yeah."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "I think Samir had -- oh, excuse me."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Thirty, right?"

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, ECONOMIC DEV DIR.: "The Princeton Lake TADs, our commitment ends 2027. And for the Eastside TAD, is 2028."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "All right, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "I just want to go on record in support of this. And appreciate working with Commissioner Morris on it. I think he outlined it, you know, very well. You know, this just proves to the taxpayer here, we've got, you know, both -- both TADs, if we're going to sunset pretty soon, and one that's got more than adequate amount of funds to, you know, to do any sort of development projects that they want to continue to do. But, you know, given the many and multiple needs that we've got at the County, certainly the ability to have the opportunity to potentially redeploy \$7 million or so, would be very impactful to -- to our citizens. And, you know, certainly, the action we would take, as we -- you all -- as I believe in conversations with the Attorney, County Attorney, that if we took an action here it doesn't do anything to remove our rights to any excess funds that may be sitting in either of those TADs at the expiration of the TADs. We would still have rights to whatever portion of our increment that, you know, residually was there; is that correct?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "At the end of the TAD, our County would be entitled to a refund of any unobligated funds in proportion to what we contributed."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay. Yeah, so I think -- and then in the resolution itself also, you know, it does before we act, you know, it directs it to sort of confirm -- confirm this again, which we've already got the data that, you know, that does confirm it, but directs our staff to confirm it again before we take that action. And the time sensitivity too, it is, I think particularly -- particularly important for us to act on it. I don't think does any sort of undue harm to anybody. And the TADs will continue to exist regardless of the action we take here."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Well, what is the resolution number that you're referring to, Samir?"

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, ECONOMIC DEV DIR.: "I'm sorry?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "The resolution that you referred to, what's that?"

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, ECONOMIC DEV DIR.: "So each agreement or each TAD that the County has funding, there is an existing or original resolution that we agreed to between the County and the City to provide that funding for traditionally, about 25-year period. So, there's several resolutions for each one of the TADs."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. Madam County Attorney, do you have that information about the resolutions?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I do not have it handy, but we can pull that and provide that for you."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you. Please, if you could send that to me, I would appreciate that. And I still -- I'm looking at this resolution and there's a line in here that says, whereas, the Board of Commissioners also finds it necessary for County staff to actively review all remaining TADs in which the County participates to determine whether the County can discontinue its participation. And I still stand on the fact that we need to not look at this by city, we need to look at this as a whole, because there are many TADs, and come back with an overall solution. If they're going to stop projects in these TADs, then let them provide us with written communication that they're going to stop. And if they're going to allow us to retrieve our funding, then let them say that. But there is nothing before us, I haven't seen anything. Has something been sent to us that I don't know about or haven't seen, Commissioner Ellis and Commissioner Morris, that speaks what you're saying was said? Is there something in writing that they've provided or this is all hearsay?"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "No. There's nothing the City has provided us. The Development Authority, Select Fulton has taken a look at it along with the County Attorney's office to see whether we can just do this under those resolutions. Well, while there are expected end dates of these things, the resolutions allow us to cease it unless there's indebtedness that has already been committed. It's been my understanding from our review of all of these. So, and again, you know, there was some sentiment, I think, from some folks to end a lot of these. I mean, to end our involvement on a lot of these. But these were --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "What folks were those?"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "-- these were the two --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "That's nobody in my district. What folks were you speaking of? I'm sorry."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Well, I think Select Atlanta was tasked to take a look at it after the discussions with respect to the budget and the need to look at the possibility of looking at that TAD revenue that we send over to the various TADs. I'm not sure -- really, most of the recent TADs outside of Atlanta, we don't -- we did not agree to participate in, if it's my understanding. So it was simply a look and review of these. And because, again, Eastside, the City was going to close several years ago, its having fulfilled its purposes. And with Princeton Lakes, it has no debt and -- and Invest Atlanta

let us know at the last meeting that they're not going to be anymore projects funded out of it. So those two seem terribly logical to start with. You know, I certainly could have thrown -- thrown Campbellton Road and Hollowell and Metropolitan Parkway and Stadium, and maybe a few others. But staff needs to look at those, I think, because there hasn't been an indication, one that they fulfilled their purposes, or two that the City's decided not to perceive of anymore projects. So that's why -- that's why we put forth these two. That's -- it's fairly simple, I think."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "The operative words that you said was that they were going to close them, so why didn't they?"

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Well, I think they -- I think they will be. I'm not sure what that process is going to be for the City and Invest Atlanta with respect to Princeton Lakes. You know, you probably read the press about Eastside, Mayor Bottoms wanted to terminate the Eastside TAD, thinking that it had fulfilled its purposes, as I said, some years ago. That was all in the press. I think it had something to do with the Westside TAD and the Gulch. And I think some Council Members representing that area sort of rose up and -- and she backed down from that. But I think the facts are pretty much that the -- that TAD has filled its purposes and probably greatly overfunded right now."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And Council Members represent residents. So I'm sure that, as a Mayor, she knew that those Council Members were representing their residents who did not want that to happen. And I haven't had not one resident in my district who's concerned about the TADs other than to be concerned that this was on here. And they did not approve of us doing anything with the TADs other than being a participant and a partner. So I still go back to what Commissioner Arrington said at the beginning of this. That I think there's a conversation to be had, and probably something in writing that needs to be in place before we just start removing ourselves, repealing TADs on the County's side. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, you want to be heard again? The motion on the floor is to approve."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "No."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. So let's vote, please. The motion on the floor is to approve. Madam Clerk, let's go."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "22-0996: Request approval of a resolution recognizing the foreclosure crisis affecting the citizens of Fulton County, expressing the Board of Commissioners' desire to assist Fulton County homeowners, homeowners' associations, condominiums associations, and property owner act associations in avoiding the foreclosure process, sponsored by Commissioner Arrington."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. The motion to approve by Commissioner Arrington is seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Colleagues, you know I've been pushing for this for a while. Mr. Adams still doesn't like me because I was pushing so hard on this. I could not get the court. I tried to wait for the court to take action on their own. They will not take any action. So I'm asking that we formally ask them to take action. It's \$354 million from the U.S. Treasury that was given to the state of Georgia. They have spent about \$50 million. So there's about \$300 million available to help people save their homes. And I have no idea in the world, why the Superior Court would not want to help Fulton County and Georgia residents save their homes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 12 -- Unanimous? Unanimous with Commissioner Ellis."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 12, 22-0894: Fulton-DeKalb Hospital Authority. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman has Thomas W. Dortch, III for a district reappointment to unexpired term, ending December 31st, 2024."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I just wanted to make the Clerk aware, it says term below expires 12/31/2022. Madam Clerk, that's incorrect. That should say 12/31/2024."

CLERK GRIER: "Yes, so noted."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 13, **22-0997**: Audit Committee. Chairman Pitts has nominated Commissioner Ellis for a Full-Board reappointment to a term ending December 31st, 2024. And AJ Jain for a Full-Board appointment to a term ending December 31st, 2024."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays. Okay. Unanimous with Commissioner Arrington."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 14, Board of Trustees. **22-0998**: Board of Trustees of the Fulton County Employees Retirement System. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman has nominated Commissioner Ellis for a Full-Board reappointment to a term ending December 31st, 2023. Commissioner Ellis has nominated Commissioner Abdur-Rahman for a Full-Board reappointment to a term ending December 31st, 2023."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Morris. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-1000**: Discussion: Invest Atlanta Board of Directors November 17th, 2022, meeting, sponsored by Commissioner Morris."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Morris."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Yeah. As usual, I've presented the summary of the minutes of the last Invest Atlanta Board meeting. If you need any more information on any of the items, you can call me at home."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. All right, next item."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-1001**: Atlanta Beltline December 14th, 2022, CEO Report, sponsored by Commissioner Morris."

COMMISSIONER MORRIS: "Same thing with respect to the Beltline CEO Report. We had a very short meeting. I think one or two agenda, small agenda items. But CEO Report gives you some information about the great progress on the trails construction and design and affordable housing units that the Beltline has been able to foster. So, enjoy."

CLERK GRIER: "**22-1002**: Discussion: Council on Aging audit, sponsored by Chairman Pitts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Where -- Mr. Nicks, come on up. All right, I had asked Mr. Nicks to start an audit on this group. Where are we, Mr. Nicks?"

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And this is the senior group that you -- that Ben Howard talks about at every Board Meeting. And this has been a very -- well, influential, important senior group for us for -- through the years. But it's fallen by the wayside here recently. Mr. Nicks."

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "Yeah. Mr. Chairman, Madam Vice Chair, other distinguished Members of the Board, I will be brief. We were asked to look at the contracts involving this agency. It is the Council of Aging. They have received roughly \$338,000, 230 under the Community Service Grants, and another \$100,000 was awarded to them during COVID from COVID funds. Because of some medical issues, one of the very important Managers of this organization has not been able to function on a day-to-day basis. And as such, they made a decision to sort of shut down their operations, put their books in storage, and no services are currently being provided. We have been trying for a good month and a half now to actually get the documents so

that we can conduct the audit. However, we have been unable to ascertain those records. We're working with other members of the Board to try to get those records. We are right now, talking to the accounting firm that actually did their year-end report so that we can try to ascertain the information we need to verify that the dollars were spent for what they were intended. At this point, again, until we get those records -- because all we have are the reports that were submitted to our Department of Community Development. And until we get reports, we cannot close the loop to show source documents that would support those reports."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "I'll answer any questions."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Any questions?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Do we know how much money that they say that they have spent? All --"

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "Yes, yes."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- 330,000? How much?"

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "Yes. They said that they have spent all of the money, yes. And if we look at the reports that they have submitted, they actually give us a number of people that they have supported. They have supported 200 people based on the reports that they have submitted. But again, we don't have any source documents, so that we can verify any of this information at this point."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So can you send us the reports that they sent to you?"

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "Absolutely."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "And what -- how long do you propose that we wait, continue to wait to get these records before we take some type of other action?"

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "Thank you for that question, sure. Again, I received an email since I've been in this room that one of the Board Members has reached out to the accounting firm again and is waiting at -- on a response. I believe that once we get a response from the accounting firm, we will get something, I'm not sure what. But -- so I would suggest that we give it -- give me another week. I've been providing the Chairman with updates on this on a regular basis. And, you know, if I

have not received what we need in a week, I will certainly reach back to the full Board and let you know."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Okay, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Chairman, I'll be brief. This is very concerning to me. You know, we hear Mr. Howard every time. And I'm a little concerned that whatever the reason is that you don't have the documentation. I never thought you would ever come before us and not have documentation. This is definitely a first for me. I don't know about my colleagues. And it is concerning. I would ask that within a week's time, if you would let my office know --"

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "Absolutely."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "-- if -- is any movement. Because if we -- if we're about the business of being stewards of the taxpayer dollars for Fulton County, we got to hold everybody to that."

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "I agree."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Not just the ones that we like or dislike."

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "Yes, I agree."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "And I'm just really concerned that in your position, usually when someone gets something from you, they're -- they at least try to be timely. And I'm not saying -- you know, things do happen. But this seems to be an issue where movement seems to be very slow on."

ANTHONY NICKS, COUNTY AUDITOR: "And I think part of the problem is that the person who was at the top of the organization had a lot of control. And the Board Members that are now trying to help us get this information, did not have access to all of the things that they probably should have. In addition to that, I think that there was an Executive Director who left, and they were in the process of trying to install another person in that position. However, it did not happen before the operation was closed down."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Thank you for giving me that information. Chairman, I would think in light of the email that you sent out with the concerns for the Boards and how they're handled, I think this should go under that concern as well."

Because when one person has that kind of control, that's not good. And so I would just make a suggestion to you, friendly suggestion to you that maybe we need to look at if not revamping, trying to see how -- what we can do in the future to make sure that this doesn't happen again."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Dr. Roshell, did you have some additional information of this organization?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. So the first thing that I would like to add is that the Council on Aging is an independent nonprofit. They were actually dissolved by the Secretary of State in October of this year."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Dissolved?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Their -- dissolved, administratively dissolved because they did not pay their administration fees to the Secretary of State. So as far as them being an organization in Georgia, as of today unless they decide to pay those fees, they're actually dissolved as an organization. The other item I'd like to add is what their connection is to Fulton County outside of the funding that they applied for and that their applications are vetted and they applied for. What Mr. Howard has been pointing out is that because the organization has not been functioning, they have not been participating on the Fulton County Commission on Elderly Affairs. And so there is a void in that Commission because the Council on Aging, by bylaws, is a voting member of the Fulton County Commission on Elderly Affairs. So again, they're an independent organization. They were given voting rights through the bylaws as a voting member. What we can do and what we will recommend to the Board next month, we have been advised by the County Attorney's office to continue to monitor the administrative dissolution of the organization since they can come back, is to present a resolution to the Board, amending the bylaws for the Commission on Elderly Affairs and appointing new organizations so that there isn't a void. And so that would be the remedy to close the gap on what Mr. Howard has been pointing out. That because the Council on Aging, an independent organization, has not been attending those meetings that was his concern. And our resolution to that is to amend the Fulton County Commission on Elder Affairs bylaws and add other organizations in its place."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Thank you, Dr. Roshell. Oh, I'm sorry."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "(Off-mic comments.)"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "And I mean, you know, I really want to do a motion to go get our money back, right. If they're not active and they're not doing anything, why are we giving them money?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "So Commissioner Arrington, you are absolutely right. This issue, as far as the unresponsiveness of the organization is recent. The history of the County funding the organization dates back to 2018. Since 2018 that organization has complied with all of our reporting requirements. It was only discovered that they were unresponsive to a more in-depth audit over whenever the County Auditor was commissioned to -- to dig deeper. So absolutely in no way am I saying that they should not be held accountable. I just wanted to provide some additional context as to how the organization is connected."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "(Off-mic comments) -- to be at our next meeting, so they can answer these questions."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Thank you, Mr. Nicks. Continue, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 15 --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Are you -- Dr. Roshell, you'll notify the Board?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, thank you."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 15, **22-1004**: Discussion: Boards, Authorities, Commissions, and Task Force."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. It's 5:36. I want to have some in-depth discussion about how we make appointments to these Boards, Authorities, and so forth. So I want to hold this until our next meeting to give us time to --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Can I just make --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- really talk about this."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Can you give me one --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Sir, yes. Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "I meant to bring this up earlier. This only relates to this item because there's an Arts Council. But can we administratively extend the CFS out for a couple weeks. I've heard some folks -- and I had talked to Mr. Manuel about this."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "We can certainly, from a department operational standpoint, extend that date. We will provide notice to the public and we --"

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "-- will provide information to the Board to share with your constituents."

COMMISSIONER ELLIS: "Okay, thanks."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "And can we add Councils to Boards, Authorities, Councils, Commissions and Task Force?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Awesome. Council will be left out, so I --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "But I thought it was on there. Should be, okay. All right. Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "Next item is on the Consent Agenda, pulled by Chairman Pitts. On page 4, **22-0966**: Community Development. For spreading on the meeting minutes, contract between Fulton County and the National Black College Alumni Hall of Fame --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Just two quick -- what was the exact amount of that exact contract?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "So the Board approved the funding for the National Black Hall of Fame on January 19th of \$150,000."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It was 150,000?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And that was one-time?"

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS/PUBLIC WORKS: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, thank you. Anything else? All right. Motion, we need a motion. All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Morris and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Any other items?"

CLERK GRIER: "No further items."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. No other matters to come before us, we're adjourned. Thank you very much."

(There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:39 p.m.)