

**FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS
REGULAR MEETING**

May 03, 2023
10:00 AM



Fulton County Government Center
Assembly Hall
141 Pryor Street SW
Atlanta, Georgia 30303



MINUTES-RATIFIED

This document has been ratified or approved by the Board of Commissioners, and is not binding on the County or any officer.

Ratification Date: June 7, 2023

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Robert L. Pitts **10:01 a.m.**

ROLL CALL: Tonya R. Grier, Clerk to the Commission

Robert L. Pitts, Chairman (At-Large)	PRESENT
Bridget Thorne, Commissioner (District 1)	PRESENT
Bob Ellis, Vice-Chairman (District 2)	PRESENT
Dana Barrett, Commissioner (District 3)	PRESENT
Natalie Hall, Commissioner (District 4)	PRESENT
Marvin S. Arrington, Jr., Commissioner (District 5)	ABSENT
Khadijah Abdur-Rahman, Commissioner (District 6)	PRESENT

INVOCATION: Reverend Clifton Dawkins, Jr., County Chaplain

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Recite in unison

ANNOUNCEMENTS

PLEASE SWITCH ALL ELECTRONIC DEVICES (CELL PHONES, PAGERS, PDAs, ETC.) TO THE SILENT POSITION DURING THIS MEETING TO AVOID INTERRUPTIONS.

IF YOU NEED REASONABLE MODIFICATIONS DUE TO A DISABILITY, INCLUDING COMMUNICATIONS IN AN ALTERNATE FORMAT PLEASE CONTACT THE OFFICE OF THE CLERK TO THE COMMISSION. FOR TDD/TTY OR GEORGIA RELAY SERVICE ACCESS DIAL 711.

CONSENT AGENDA**23-0290 Board of Commissioners**

Adoption of the Consent Agenda - All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Regular Meeting Agenda for separate consideration. **(ADOPTED AS AMENDED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to adopt as amended by removing items #23-0292 as requested by Commissioner Barrett, and #23-0301 as requested by Commissioner Hall, for separate consideration. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

23-0291 Board of Commissioners

Proclamations for Spreading on the Minutes. **(SPREAD ON THE MINUTES UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Proclamation recognizing "Charles E. Johnson, II Remembrance Day." **(Hall)**
April 15, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Dione Nicole Starks Morton Remembrance Day."
(Abdur-Rahman)
April 15, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Ivory Lee Young, Sr. Remembrance Day."
(Arrington/Pitts/Hall/Abdur-Rahman)
April 21, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Carolyn Long Banks Remembrance Day."
(Abdur-Rahman/Pitts/Hall/Arrington)
April 21, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Chloe Bailey Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**
April 22, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Bryce Brooks Remembrance Day." **(Hall)**
April 22, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Joyce Killian Remembrance Day." **(Arrington)**
April 22, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Dr. Dawn Samad Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**
April 24, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Robert Bob Mants, Jr. Remembrance Day."
(Abdur-Rahman)
April 25, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Georgia State Women At Work Series Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**
April 26, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Debbie Seidel Blount Appreciation Day." **(Ellis)**
May 5, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Atlanta Suburban Alumnae Delta Sigma Theta Sorority, Inc. Appreciation Day." **(Pitts)**
May 6, 2023

Commissioners' District Board Appointments

23-0292 Board of Commissioners

ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING OFFICERS (MOTION TO APPROVE FAILED)

Term = 2 Years

Two-year terms pursuant to Section 34-67(a) of the Fulton County Civil Service Act.

Commissioner Thorne has nominated Alex Kaufmann and Kurt Hilbert for appointments to two-year terms.

ITEM REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA FOR SEPARATE CONSIDERATION AS REQUESTED BY COMMISSIONER BARRETT

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, and Ellis
Nay: Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman
Absent: Arrington
Did Not Vote: Pitts, and Hall

Arts and Libraries

23-0293 Library

Request approval to increase the spending authority, Fulton County Library System 22ITB0111B-EC, E-Rate Category 1 - Broadband internet Access in an amount not to exceed \$9,684.00 with AT&T Corporation (Atlanta, GA) to include the State portion of E-Rate funding which provides broadband internet access for all library locations. 100% grant funded. Effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Infrastructure and Economic Development**23-0294 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of an Indemnification, Maintenance, and Land Use Agreement for Private Improvement between Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, and Jen Georgia 18, LLC, for the purpose granting conditional approval to allow stormwater piping within the County's existing sanitary sewer easement at 314 Thompson Street et al, Alpharetta, Georgia 30009. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0295 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of an Indemnification, Maintenance, and Land Use Agreement for Private Improvement between Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, and Jen Georgia 18, LLC, for the purpose of granting conditional approval to allow stormwater piping and tree planters within the County's existing water line easement area at 314 Thompson Street et al, Alpharetta, Georgia 30009. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0296 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a Resolution approving an Intergovernmental Agreement between Fulton County and the City of Union City for the purpose of allowing the Department of Senior Services to utilize City-owned property located at 5285 Lakeside Drive, Union City, Georgia 30291 to provide congregate meals and other senior services to Fulton County seniors; to authorize the Chairman to sign the Intergovernmental Agreement and any related documents to implement the same; to authorize the County Attorney to approve the Intergovernmental Agreement and any related documents as to form and make necessary modifications prior to execution to protect the County's interests. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0297 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of an Indemnification, Maintenance, and Land Use Agreement for Private Improvement between Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, and LWV TPA GA 400, LLC for the purpose of granting conditional approval to allow stormwater piping to remain within a portion of Fulton County's existing water line easement at 0 Lakeview Parkway, Alpharetta, Georgia 30009. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0298 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of an Indemnification, Maintenance, and Land Use Agreement for Private Improvement between Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, and LWV TPA GA 400, LLC for the purpose granting conditional approval to allow stormwater piping to remain within a portion of the County's existing sanitary sewer easement at 0 Lakeview Parkway, Alpharetta, Georgia 30009. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0299 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a Sewer Easement Dedication of 1,395 square feet to Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, from the Downtown Development Authority of the City of Roswell, Georgia, for the purpose of constructing the West Alley Development Project at 37 Mimosa Boulevard, Roswell, Georgia 30075. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Justice and Safety**23-0300 Emergency Management**

Request approval of the Atlanta Region Commission's Metro Atlanta Urban Area Security Initiative Memorandum of Understanding regarding Department of Homeland Security grant funding awarded to the Atlanta-Fulton County Emergency Management Agency - AFCEMA (Grant Years 2020 & 2021). **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0301 Superior Court Clerk

The appointment of Che' Alexander as Chief Deputy Clerk spread upon the minutes of the Board of Commissioners. **(APPROVED)**

ITEM REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA FOR SEPARATE CONSIDERATION AS REQUESTED BY COMMISSIONER HALL

A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Pitts

Absent: Arrington

Abstain: Hall

23-0302 District Attorney

Request approval of an award without competition - District Attorney, 2021 U.S. Department of Justice's Bureau of Justice Assistance (BJA), BJA Byrne Criminal Justice Innovation Program (BCJI) Grant, Grant Award No. 15PBJA-21-GG-04117-BCJI with Applied Research Services named as a sub-awardee in the Grant in an amount not to exceed \$183,000.00. Effective upon BOC approval through the term of the Grant. 100% grant funded. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

REGULAR MEETING AGENDA**23-0303 Board of Commissioners**

Adoption of the Regular Meeting Agenda. **(ADOPTED AS AMENDED)**

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to adopt as amended by moving up item #23-0322 as requested by Commissioner Thorne. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to reconsider the Regular Meeting Agenda to move up item #23-0301. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Pitts, and Ellis

23-0304 Clerk to the Commission

Ratification of Minutes. **(RATIFIED)**

Regular Meeting Minutes, April 12, 2023

Recess Meeting Post Agenda Minutes, April 19, 2023

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to ratify the meeting minutes. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

23-0305 Board of Commissioners

Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. **(PRESENTED)**

Proclamation recognizing "Able Mable Thomas Appreciation Day." **(Hall/BOC)**

Proclamation recognizing "Detention Officer Brooklyn Unitas Appreciation Day." **(Thorne/Pitts/Ellis/Barrett/Hall/Abdur-Rahman)**

Proclamation recognizing "County Attorney's Office Appreciation Day." **(Thorne/Pitts/Ellis/Barrett/Hall/Abdur-Rahman)**

Proclamation recognizing "Mental Health Month." **(Hall/Arrington/BOC)**

Proclamation recognizing "Older Americans Month." **(Hall/BOC)**

Proclamation recognizing “National Therapy Animal Day.” **(Hall/BOC)**

~~*Proclamation recognizing “Deputy Clarence Houston Appreciation Day.” **(Hall)**~~

Proclamation recognizing “Law Day and Law Week.” **(Abdur-Rahman/
Pitts/Ellis/Thorne/Barrett/Hall)**

Proclamation recognizing “Harry Belafonte Remembrance Day.” **(Abdur-Rahman/
Pitts/Ellis/Thorne/Barrett/Hall)**

**removed during the meeting*

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to extend the allotted amount of time for presentation of proclamations. The motion passed by the following voice vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Pitts

PUBLIC HEARINGS**23-0306 Board of Commissioners**

Public Comment - Citizens are allowed to voice County related opinions, concerns, requests, etc. during the Public Comment portion of the Commission meeting. **Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, whether such persons are commenting in-person, via emails or via Zoom or other electronic media (i.e., phone call). Non-Fulton County citizens will only be heard after all in-person Fulton County citizens, representatives of business and organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, have been heard and the time allotted for public comment has not expired, except as otherwise provided in this code section. County staff shall verify the residency of each public speaker prior to such person being heard by the board. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. Members of the public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The Public Comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes at the Regular Meeting, nor will this portion exceed thirty minutes at the Recess Meeting.** In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Similarly, written comments (that were timely submitted) not previously read, may be read at the end of the meeting. For more information or to arrange a speaking date, contact the Clerk's Office. **(CONDUCTED)**

13 Speakers: Rev. Raymond Washington (MARTA); Michael Harper (Lashawn Thompson); Shenita Thompson (Lashawn Thompson); Brad McCrae (Lashawn Thompson); Emma Jean Davis (Senior Services); Micah Herskind (Fulton County Jail); Dominique Grant (Fulton County Jail); Devin Barrington-Ward (Lashawn Thompson); James Davenport (MARTA); Sabrina Jones (Justice); Rev. Lydia Meredith (DFCS); Jimmy Hill (Justice) and Kathy Scott-Lykes (Justice)

2 Zoom Speakers: Matt Rowenczack (Decorum) and Ben Howard (Senior Services)

1 Emailed Comment: Kat Davis (Fulton County Animal Services)

PRESENTATIONS TO THE BOARD**Atlanta Regional Commission****23-0307 Board of Commissioners**

Presentation - ARC's New Strategic Plan and Update on the Long-Range Transportation Plan **(PRESENTED)**

COUNTY MANAGER'S ITEMS**Open & Responsible Government****23-0308 Finance**

Review and approval of May 3, 2023 Budget Soundings **(PRESENTED/ APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

23-0309 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 23ITB136993C-GS, Medical and Clinical General Cleaning Services in an amount of not to exceed \$330,218.00 with Intercontinental Commercial Services, Inc. (ICS, Inc.) (Lawrenceville, GA), to provide the highest quality medical and clinical general cleaning services for selected Fulton County Health facilities to be provided upon execution of contract through December 31, 2023 with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

23-0310 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of recommended proposals - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 22RFP135756C-GS, Janitorial Services for Fulton County Government Center Complex (Group A) and Justice Center Facilities (Group B) in a total amount not to exceed \$1,476,729.00 with (A) ABM Industry Groups, LLC (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$570,430.00; and (B) American Facility Services, Inc. (Alpharetta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$906,299.00, to provide the highest quality janitorial services for the Government Center Complex and Justice Center Facilities. Effective May 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023, with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Hall

23-0311 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a recommended proposal - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, RFP#22RFP136202K-DB, Real Estate Development Consultant Services, in an amount not to exceed \$150,000.00 with BAE Urban Economics, Inc. (Roswell, GA), to provide real estate development, planning and consultant services including evaluation, procurement, and technical advisory services for the County as needed. Effective upon execution of Contract for a three year period with one, one year renewal option. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Pitts

Arts and Libraries**23-0312 Library**

Request approval for usage of Beltline TAD Funds - Fulton County Library System, TAD Funding in an amount not to exceed One Million Five Hundred Fifty Thousand dollars (\$1,550,000.00) to replace and refresh end of life and end of support network equipment at twenty-one (21) library locations as recommended by the Fulton County Library System Board of Trustees. This request is effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Health and Human Services**23-0313 Public Works**

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Public Works, 22ITB136410K-BKJ, Pine Valley Phase 2A Interceptor Sewer Replacement in an amount not to exceed \$7,536,975.00 with Wade Coots Company, Inc. (Austell, GA), to provide all labor, material and equipment to remove and replace approximately 4,062 feet of 30" to 48" RCP gravity sewer pipe with 54" HOBAS Fiberglass pipe and epoxy coated precast concrete manholes. Effective upon execution of contract for 180 consecutive/calendar days upon issuance of the Notice to Proceed. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

23-0314 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 22ITBC091A-KM, Ductile Iron Pipe, Restraining Gaskets and Tapping Saddles in the amount not to exceed \$175,589.69 with Ferguson Waterworks (Norcross, GA), to provide ductile iron pipe, restraining gaskets and tapping saddles. Effective upon BOC approval with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Pitts

23-0315 Senior Services

Request approval to decrease spending authority - Visiting Nurse Health System, 22RFP035A-CJC, Aging Services in the amount of \$123,864.03 with Visiting Nurse Health System (Alpharetta, GA) to reduce the contract award amount to exclude the project income amount that was inadvertently included. Effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

23-0316 Senior Services

Request approval for Fulton County Finance Department to enter into a contract with new broker CIMA World, Inc. to provide liability, accident and excess automobile liability insurance coverage for senior AmeriCorps volunteers and authorize the Finance Director to pay related costs of \$4000.00 to acquire the CIMA coverage. Effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Infrastructure and Economic Development**23-0317 Select Fulton**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Select Fulton - Workforce Development Division, 22RFP0119B-PS, One Stop Operator in the amount of \$125,000.00 with Arbor E&T, LLC dba Equus Workforce Solutions (Louisville, KY) to provide the coordination and facilitation of a "One- Stop Operator" service. This action exercises the first of three renewal options. Two renewal options remain. Effective dates: July 1, 2023 through June 30, 2024. This contract is 100% grant funded. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Ellis

23-0318 Select Fulton

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Select Fulton - Workforce Development Divisions, 22RFP0121B-PS, Adult and Dislocated Services for Select Fulton in the amount of \$1,725,125.00 with Arbor E&T, LLC dba Equus Workforce Solutions (Louisville, KY) to provide adult and dislocated career center services. This action exercises the first of three renewal options. Two renewal options remain. Effective July 1, 2023 through June 30, 2024. This contract is 100% grant funded. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

23-0319 Select Fulton

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Select Fulton Workforce Development Divisions 22RFP0120B-PS, Youth Services for Select Fulton in the amount of \$600,000.00 with Arbor E&T, LLC dba Equus Workforce Solutions (Louisville, KY) to provide youth career center services. This action exercises the first of three renewal options. Two renewal options remain. Effective dates: July 1, 2023 through June 30, 2024. This contract is 100% grant funded. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

COMMISSIONERS' ACTION ITEMS**23-0253 Board of Commissioners**

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners directing the County Manager and County Attorney to develop a plan for the Board of Commissioners' consideration for Legislation authorizing a Countywide Special Local Option Sales Tax to support Healthcare infrastructure and foster stabilization on Healthcare services Countywide; and for other matters. **(Ellis) (HELD ON 4/19/23) (MOTION TO APPROVE FAILED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, and Ellis
Nay: Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman
Absent: Arrington
Abstain: Hall
Did Not Vote: Pitts

23-0320 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners adopting desired goals and standards for criminal cases handled within the Fulton County Justice System; urging all elected and appointed officials serving in a Fulton justice capacity to focus their efforts towards meeting these standards; and for other purposes. **(Ellis)**

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve. **(NO VOTE TAKEN)**

b. A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to hold. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman
Nay: Ellis
Absent: Arrington
Did Not Vote: Pitts

Commissioners' Full Board Appointments

23-0254

Board of Commissioners

HOSPITAL AUTHORITY OF FULTON COUNTY (NORTHSIDE) (HELD ON 4/12/23 AND 4/19/23) (HELD)

The Board of Commissioners shall submit a slate of three (3) names, per position, to the Hospital Authority of Fulton County, for selection of one (1) person to be appointed by the Authority for each position.

Term = 4 years, staggered

Term below expires: 4/1/2024

Dr. Thomas W. Gable (BOC Position #2) (Deceased)

The Board of Trustees of the Hospital Authority of Fulton County (Northside) submitted the following slate of names for the Board of Commissioners' consideration to fill the unexpired term of Dr. Thomas Gable (Position #2) ending April 1, 2024. (Ellis)

Position #2

Kenneth Kupke, M.D.

Marc Soneshine, M.D.

Jennifer Amerson, M.D.

a. A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, and Ellis

Nay: Pitts, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Abstain: Barrett

b. A motion was made by Chairman Pitts and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to hold. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Thorne

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Ellis

COUNTY MANAGER'S PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION ITEMS

Health and Human Services

23-0321 Senior Services

Presentation and request approval of the Senior Transportation Uber/Lyft Program update and implementation of such.

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Ellis, to approve a \$5 cost share. **(NO VOTE TAKEN)**

Commissioner Barrett withdrew the motion.

b. A motion was made by Chairman Pitts and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve option #4, which will result in a \$1.5 million deficit keeping the cost share at \$1. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Thorne, and Ellis

c. A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve a \$3 cost share. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, and Ellis

Nay: Pitts, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Abstain: Barrett

Infrastructure and Economic Development

23-0322 Select Fulton

Presentation on Select Fulton - Workforce Development update to Board of Commissioners. **(PRESENTED)**

EXECUTIVE SESSION**23-0323 Board of Commissioners**

Executive (**CLOSED**) Sessions regarding litigation (**County Attorney**), real estate (**County Manager**), and personnel (**Pitts**). (**APPROVED**)

PRESENT IN THE EXECUTIVE SESSION REGARDING LITIGATION, REAL ESTATE AND PERSONNEL: Chairman Pitts, Vice-Chairman Ellis, Commissioners: Thorne, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman; County Manager Dick Anderson; County Attorney Y. Soo Jo; and Clerk to the Commission Tonya R. Grier. Commissioner Arrington was absent.

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to enter into Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Ellis

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve the request for representation in item #1 as discussed in Executive Session.. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

c. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve the request for settlement authority in item #3 as discussed in Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Arrington

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:57 p.m.

FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONER'S
REGULAR MEETING

MAY 3, 2023

10:00 A.M.

Alexander Solution, LLC

(Whereupon, the meeting was called to order at 10:01 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, good morning ladies and gentlemen, and welcome, rather, to the regular meeting of the Fulton County Board of Commissioners. Today is May 3rd, 2023. It is 10:01 a.m. Madam Clerk, please call the roll."

CLERK GRIER: "Chairman Robb Pitts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Bridget Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Vice Chairman Bob Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Dana Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Natalie Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Marvin Arrington, Jr. Commissioner Khadijah Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Mr. Chairman, you have a quorum."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. And for the record, Commissioner Arrington is home recuperating from surgery. Please rise for the invocation followed by the Pledge of Allegiance."

(Whereupon, the invocation was given by Reverend Dawkins followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. You may be seated. Continue, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 2, Consent Agenda, **23-0290**, Adoption of the Consent Agenda. All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Regular Meeting Agenda for separate consideration. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have an item on the bottom of page 4 of the Consent Agenda, 23-0301, Superior Court Clerk, the appointment of Che' Alexander as Chief Deputy Clerk. Commissioner Hall has requested to remove this item for separate consideration."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, thank you. I was going to ask if that was going to be removed as well. Anyone else?"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yes, I would also like to --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "-- thank you, Mr. Chairman. I would also like to remove item 23-0292, page 3 -- page 3, 0292 from the Consent Agenda."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "0292. All right, any others, Commissioners?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. I'll entertain a motion to approve the Consent Agenda as amended. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 5, Regular Meeting Agenda, **23-0303**. Adoption of the Regular Meeting Agenda. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have one item requested to be moved up by Commissioner Thorne. Bottom of page 10, Presentation by Select Fulton Workforce Development update. Commissioner Thorne, would like this item heard before the Select Fulton action items, so that will be after item 23-0316 on page 8."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, I was going to recommend that one, too. Thank you, Commissioner Thorne. All right, anything else, Commissioners? Any changes?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to adopt the Agenda -- Regular Agenda as amended. Motion to adopt by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Cast your vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0304**, Ratification of Minutes, Regular Meeting Minutes, April 12th. Recess Meeting Post Agenda Minutes, April 19th, 2023."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Additions, corrections? If, none?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0305**, Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. The first proclamation is recognizing 'Able Mable Thomas Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Hall with Full BOC support."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, now just a moment, Commissioners. We have nine proclamations. We have 30 minutes for proclamations. Five minutes -- maximum of five minutes each. That's about 45 minutes, so we may not get to all of them unless you make a motion to hear all of them, if we don't get to them. So in the interest of time, when you're making your acceptance remarks, if you can limit those to a minute, it would really help us out today with so many proclamations. All right. First one; let's go. First one; repeat the first one again. "

CLERK GRIER: "Able Mable Thomas Appreciation Day."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Go to the next one."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'Detention Officer Brooklyn Unitas Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Thorne."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, we're beginning proclamations at 10:07 a.m. We got 30 minutes."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I just wanted to recognize Brooklyn Unitas from the Sheriff's office. She was in an altercation working with the mental inmates in the mental health area of the jail, and part of her ear was bitten off in an altercation and her elbow was broken. She's a young, brave 25-year-old. She went to school in Cobb County and went to Kennesaw State, and is currently studying to get her master's degree in public administration for nonprofits. She has a heart to serve our community like so many other law enforcement officers that we have in our county. And every day, they don't know what they're going to face, what challenges they're going to face. But as soon as she recovers, Brooklyn is ready to go back to service because she loves working in the Sheriff's office in the jail with the inmates. So I'll read the proclamation here: "On April 7th 2023, Fulton County Sheriff's Detention Officer Brooklyn Unitas demonstrated extraordinary bravery and dedication to duty in the face of a violent attack by an inmate at the Fulton County Jail. And Officer Unitas was carrying out her duties in the performance of her sworn duty as a law enforcement officer when she was suddenly attacked by an inmate who tackled her to the ground and bite off part of her ear. And despite the brutal and unprovoked assault, Officer Unitas showed remarkable courage, professionalism, and resilience in fighting off the inmate and calling for backup. While still managing to keep the situation under control and prevent further harm to herself, her colleagues, and other inmates. And Officer Unitas' quick thinking, calm demeanor, and unwavering commitment to public safety in the face of adversity exemplify the highest ideals of law enforcement; and serves as a shining example of the dedication and sacrifice exhibited by the men and women of the Fulton County Sheriff's office. All citizens of Fulton County are called upon to join us in honoring and thanking Officer Unitas for her service. And in supporting the men and women of the Fulton County Sheriff's office who put themselves in harm's way every day to keep our communities safe and secure. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes Detention Officer Brooklyn Unitas for her outstanding service, bravery, and heroism; and extend our sincere gratitude and heartfelt appreciation for her selfless sacrifice and unwavering commitment to duty; and does hereby proclaim, Wednesday, May 3rd 2023 as 'Detention Officer Brooklyn Unitas Appreciation Day' in Fulton County, Georgia."

DETENTION OFFICER BROOKLYN UNITAS: "Hello. I just want to thank Commissioner Thorne and the Board of Commissioners as well as Sheriff Patrick Labat and the Sheriff's office. It is much appreciated. So, thank you."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'Able Mable Thomas Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Hall with Full Board Support."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Anyone who came to support Able Mable, please come down. Come on down and just spread out on each side. All right, come on down. We're waiting for you. All right, we're waiting for you. Somebody left this right here. All right, is that everyone? Okay. If you know Able Mable, you know her to be a powerhouse of a woman; a legend in her own right and it is an honor to be able to honor her while she is still here with us. The story behind this woman is a great and grand story. And for

anyone who does not know Able Mable, you need to get to know her. And so, I am truly honored to present this proclamation because she has been like family to me for so many years; telling me stories along the way, calling me saying you better get some food over here for these people. And so, much more, and just doing things in the community, always inviting me everywhere to be a part of what she's doing. And women's reproductive health started with Able Mable, and people don't know that. But she has been a champion for that when there was no champion. And so, I'm going to go ahead and read the proclamation because I could get on a roll right now about Able Mable. And the proclamation reads: WHEREAS, Able Mable Thomas has been a powerful voice for change, freedom, justice, and equality for all Georgians and disenfranchised people around the world. Throughout her tenure, Able Mable fought for issues including educational reform, women's reproductive health, living wages, racial profiling, economic development, access to healthcare or senior issues; and WHEREAS, Able Mable is a native of Atlanta and is a graduate of Booker T. Washington High School. She earned a scholarship to Georgia State University where she played basketball for the Lady Panthers and earned her Bachelor of Science degree in public administration. And WHEREAS, her incredible service began in 1984 when she was chosen as a presidential delegate for candidate Reverend Jesse Jackson at the Democratic National Convention held in San Francisco, California. While there she formally announced her candidacy for the Georgia House of Representatives where she won a highly contested battle with a long-standing incumbent. And WHEREAS, in 1997, she again sought another public office winning the Atlanta City Council Post One At-Large Seat, which allowed her to focus on quality-of-life issues most impacting people throughout Atlanta. As a council member, she was responsible for passing the Affordable Housing Policy Bill, obtaining 4.9 million for Atlanta green space conservation, and was a major stakeholder in community efforts to secure the Historic Westside Revitalization Project. Well, my, my. I didn't know all of that. You know, the Mayor just announced like 300 million toward affordable housing, but it started right here; WHEREAS, Able Mable has been a successful Executive Director of the Greater Vine City Opportunities Program, Incorporated, which provides youth and family enrichment and educational opportunities for high-risk urban youth. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes Able Mable Thomas for her many years of leadership and dedication to the quality of life of all Georgians; and does hereby proclaim Wednesday May 3rd 2023 as 'Able Mable Thomas Appreciation Day' in Fulton County, Georgia. Able Mable, Able Mable, Able Mable, Able Mable.

ABLE MABLE THOMAS, RECIPIENT: "Able Mable, she's the one. She's the one to get the job done."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "You know when you got Able Mable, I curtsy to her. And the reason why she is the queen of the movement in the City of Atlanta, in Fulton County, the State of Georgia when it was unpopular to stand on the right side; when it was unpopular to stand with poor people; when it was unpopular to say a word

to the right, she was there. I would not be Commissioner Khadijah without Able Mable, and I stand here or should I curtsy to the queen."

ABLE MABLE THOMAS, RECIPIENT: "I was watching that movie the 'Crown,' so maybe she should curtsy. First giving honor to God who is the leader of my life, it is always a blessing to be among the people. The people united would never be defeated. All right? Is that right? All right. So I would like to thank Natalie Hall for not thinking it robbery to acknowledge me. And, you know, the people say give people flowers, you know, while they're living and that sound good; but do you all know anything I don't know about? There's a lot of people -- a lot of people been calling me talking about I want to honor you. What's going on now? Let me just put this on the record, Mark Twain says the news of my demise has been greatly exaggerated. All right, so thank everybody, on the Fulton County Commission, the Honorable Rob Pitts, the Honorable Natalie Hall, the Honorable Khadijah, and the newer councilmembers. I'm already -- but I can't see you -- just a minute, so I appreciate you all. Thank y'all. I appreciate y'all, okay? All right. I must admit I don't get a chance to come down to the county as much as I hang out in the city, and I hang out at the state capital. But one thing I do want to put on the record is -- this my niece. She work for Fulton County; don't mess with her. This is my niece, Trina Thomas, okay? All right. How you doing over there? Yeah, I know you. All right. All right. I ain't trying to be funny, but ain't these folks looking good up here? Look at these colors they got on. Jean Davis been known me for a long time. But what I do want to say is -- is that the Lord's been good to me. If I had a known I was doing what I was doing, I don't know if I would have did it. All it was -- is I was driven, you know, by something from the inside saying that I need to speak up. And one thing I always ask, and I want to put this in people mind because in the space of what's going on in Atlanta and throughout the country; do working-class, low wealth communities or poor people straight out have the right to, number one, control, direct, or even have voice in their own community? I submit to you they must have it, but the level that we're working on right now is just having voice. You do not control English Avenue, Vine City where I virtually live. There's many people from the outside, corporate interests, you know, that are controlling our communities. And when you even want to organize the people around it, they are so overwhelmed by the billionaire factor. Are y'all listening to me? Because in some small way, they believe that maybe they'll get some money from the big banks and the Chick-Fil-A's and all these other interests that we don't even call by name. They want, you know, us to just go along to get along. But I know good and well the Lord didn't put me here to get along -- to go along and get along. In other words, what the Lord has used me in Atlanta as a pathway leader, to sort of open the doors for men and women, you know, for them to believe that they can serve and sometimes women don't believe that they are being heard. What I say to women is, you must believe that what you have to say is worthy of being heard. You have to push your way into this door, and that's why when you have leadership like Natalie Hall who sees the vision, is willing to work the vision out for the people. One thing I want to put on the record and Natalie mentioned it briefly: In June of 1994, I appeared at a conference in Chicago, Illinois. It was about 200 white women, and I saw about 11 other black women beside myself. First thing I do when I look in the room, I want to organize it. So even

when I was looking at this room, I was thinking about organizing it better, integrating more white and black together. So I was thinking about integrating this room a little bit more. But I organize it, so the Spirit said to me, I'm at this pro-choice conference -- the Spirit says to me, go to each black woman and ask that they have their box lunch -- since we have box luncheon -- with me. They didn't know me. Two of them did. Cynthia Nuville and Loretta Ross, they knew me. So they would -- so at lunchtime, we walked into the room, and the question I asked them is, do you believe that what's being said in the other room specifically works with black women and black women's health? They said, well, a little bit, you know, but, you know, it could be more. And at that time, I give you the context -- at that time, Hillary Clinton was going all over the country selling the Healthcare Reform Bill. But she had not put in a lot of things around reproductive health, because she didn't want to offend nobody, all right? So, on that same said day, we coined the phrase 'Reproductive Justice'. Some of y'all believe that reproduction and justice have been together for a long time. It's only been together since June of 1994, we got together and we coined that phrase. So I'm one of what they call the 12 Mothers of the Reproductive Justice Movement in America; but I'm not just one of the 12, I am the convener. So when you hear Planned Parenthood, every group you hear say it, relatively it was 12 black women in a room. And they say Reproductive Justice more than anything now. But the Lord has been good to me. So what he has done in life is put me on the scene of where something is happening big. He put me on the scene, you know. I played on the Georgia State University's first women's basketball team, NCAA basketball team. Put me on the scene where something's happening; the youngest state representative in the State of Georgia. Put me on the scene where something is happening. The person that I was in the race with, who was a very honorable lady was the first African-American woman to be state representative. The Lord let me come after the great Grace Hamilton; put me on the scene, where something was happening. And so, the life that I've lived has been one I tried to be of honor and integrity, and not be afraid, and if I'm afraid, I go anyway. Even if you're afraid when it comes to righteousness, you must go anyway. I'm the author of the first mandated benefit of the State of Georgia; tell me what the second one is? There's no such thing as a second mandated benefit. That benefit requires insurance companies to pay for mammograms, Pap smears, and the prostate cancer bill; and when we got ready to pass the bill, all Democrats, women, all Republican women, Independent women, all signed up for the bill. We did not let any gap -- no offense, guys -- sign off on the bill, because we wanted to show the powerful women united, you know. And so, but one thing for sure, I love myself some Tyrone Brooks. What Tyrone Brooks did when he saw it, he said, oh, no, I'm signing it. So there was a guy signing it, Tyrone Brooks saw it and signed it. But all, and to this day, there's never been a bill of that significance that every Republican and Democratic woman signed off on because it become so partisan, that even a good idea is still a partisan idea. Are y'all listening to me? But I will give a shout out to Buddy Childress who was the chair of the health and ecology committee, who said to me, if you add prostate cancer to it -- he had just went through a bout with it -- I can help you get the bill passed. That's very important, y'all, because you understand, I'm talking about the insurance industry, and so, you pay your premium all day long, but when you get ready to get your money, they gone to fight you

for your money. So they was totally against it, but we organized it and we was able to get it passed. All I'm trying to tell you is that I want to thank you for -- the Lord for the services that he could put inside of me that made me want to be and to do the things I've done. And before I left -- before I left, the last thing I want to say is, we talk about expanding Medicaid, but in reality the only people who have expanded Medicaid -- the first people to expand Medicaid was black women, because black women die three to four more times more than white women in childbirth. And so, we want to change the time from two months from being on Medicaid after you come back from having a baby to at least a year, and we moved it six and then we move it to a year. Put \$21 million in the budget in the middle of a pandemic. And what we're standing for is that our families get a -- our families throughout Georgia must live. Our children must live. Infant mortality -- Fulton County was one of the first that did a task force on infant mortality. And I got a chance to serve on it so, Fulton County is strong; Fulton County got some issues like all governments have issues, but the relatively is you have to have honor. And we have honor in the people that are here today and who's on this particular commission, so we would hope that they would continue with integrity and fight for the people of Fulton County. All right. Thank you. Power to the people, and I love you."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Power to the people. Let's take this picture. Let that microphone go now."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Call the next one, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation recognizing is 'County Attorney's Office Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Thorne."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne -- all right, colleagues, it's 10:30. We have seven more minutes for proclamations. All right, county attorneys, come on down, it's 10:31."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "You gotta chop-chop-chop. You know how it goes down here. Yeah, it's a big group we got here. We got the entire attorney's office. What a pleasure it is to honor all of you today. I haven't met all of you, but I hope to someday meet each and every one because I have so much as a new commissioner, and as all of us as commissioners appreciate the work that the County Attorney's Office does every day for us. Making sure we stay within the guidelines, advising us -- I mean, Soo Jo will drop everything and come to my office to explain something, even though she has a ton of work to do. I've heard that such and such stayed up until 10:30 at night working on something. Such and such spent all night working on something. So they go above and beyond the call of duty with us, and I was just at the state convention for commissioners over the weekend, and I asked the question and they said, Commissioner Thorne, you know you have one of the best offices in the state. And so, they are statewide recognized. It made me feel so good that I can get great advisement from them. So it's my pleasure to honor them: WHEREAS, the office of the Fulton County Attorney which advises all departments in Fulton County government, the seven

member Board of Commissioners, and handles all of the civil litigation and general governance needs of the county; and WHEREAS, the County Attorney's Office under the leadership of Soo Jo is comprised of a team of professionals, some of whom have been on staff for nearly 30 years; and WHEREAS, the County Attorney's Office performs other important functions such as preparing Legislation and Resolutions for the Board of Commissioners, researching and preparing legal opinions, interpreting local, state, and federal laws for Fulton County officials, and negotiating contracts for major development projects as well as overseeing a variety of property and tax matters and WHEREAS, the County Attorney's efforts to serve the legal needs and best interests of residents has resulted in the office being recognized as In-House Legal Department of the Year by the legal newspaper, The Daily Report in 2019; and WHEREAS, the exceptional employees in the County Attorney's Office are valued and appreciated for their dedicated service to the elected officials, employees, and citizens of Fulton County. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Board of Commissioners of Fulton County recognizes the Fulton County Attorney's Office for their hard work and dedication; and does hereby proclaim Wednesday, May 3rd 2023 as the 'Fulton County Attorney's Office Appreciation Day' in Fulton County, Georgia."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I will keep this short and sweet per instructions. Thank you so much to Commissioner Thorne and all of our commissioners for this wonderful recognition. I just want to say how proud I am of all the people who are standing here today. Everyone in our office, all of the attorneys and legal professionals who work tirelessly behind the scenes every day to provide the best advice and legal representation possible for Fulton County, which we all find meaning in public service. And we are so happy and thankful that we have a moment of recognition for that; so we thank our commissioners very much for this honor and please rest assured that we will continue to work hard to represent you to the best of our ability and provide the best advice always so that you can make your informed decision as you are authorized to do. Thank you so much."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Call the next one, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'Mental Health Month' sponsored by Commissioners Hall, Arrington, and Thorne."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Mila, Mila, come down, please."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Come on down. Commissioners it's 10:37."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I'm sorry. This is mental health."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: Commissioners, it's 10:37. Now the time has expired, but there are about six more proclamations. What your pleasure?

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Mental health."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. What's your pleasure?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yeah, we're going to keep it going. The people are here. We're not going to have people come here and we don't honor them."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute. Just a minute. We have 30 minutes for proclamations. Do you want to extend that time, I'll entertain a motion --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute. Just a minute, please. Just a minute. The motion to extend the time to 11 o'clock. All right. Is there a second?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Second. Second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Properly moved and seconded. We'll extend proclamation until 11 o'clock. Those in favor say aye, oppose, no. It's approved. Go ahead."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Good morning to you. Good morning. Come on down for mental health month. Come and join us everyone for mental health month. Right? Love the support for mental health month. All right. Let's get started. I don't see anyone. First, I want to thank Ladisa -- Ladisa; I got Senior Services on the mind. LaTrina, thank you for being on the Zoom last night for the MPU meeting. Mental health is paramount. We have to do more in this area and we definitely cannot lock people up in jail who are having a mental health crisis. We have to -- yes, we have to provide the wraparound services. We have to get them in a position of being sustainable before we move them into a position of being successful, and that is not locking them in jail. So, thank you, LaTrina. She is a champion for mental health. She's working on the new behavioral health crisis center. If you don't know about it, you need to find out about it, because Fulton County is going to have their first behavior health crisis center. Thank you to our County Manager and our county executives for that. We even had Atlanta City Council Member, Antonio Lewis ask us to add a drunk tank to that so that people have somewhere to go and dry out before getting back on the road, so that they don't harm themselves or other people, and we are here for all of that. So, this proclamation reads: WHEREAS, mental health conditions are real and prevalent in our communities and throughout our nation leading many people to face challenges in life that can impact their mental health; and WHEREAS, mental health is essential to overall health and well-being, and prevention is an effective way to reduce the burden of mental health conditions; and WHEREAS, one in five people will experience a mental illness during their lifetime; and there are practical tools that all people can use to improve their mental health and increase resiliency; and WHEREAS this year's theme, 'Look Around, Look Within'. It's focused on how surroundings impact mental health and specifically addresses the importance of safe and stable housing, healthy home environments,

neighborhoods and towns, and the outdoors in nature. We will help people understand how these areas impact their mental health, offer recommendations that people can take to improve their surroundings, and offer suggestions for coping if change isn't realistic; and WHEREAS recovery is a unique and personal journey that requires trial and error to determine what works best for each individual. And all organizations and individuals in a community share the burden of mental health problems and has a responsibility to promote mental wellness and prevention efforts. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners calls upon the citizens, governmental entities, public and private institutions, businesses, and schools in Fulton County to commit our community to increasing awareness and understanding of mental health. The steps our citizens can take to protect their mental health and the need to provide appropriate and accessible services for all people with mental health conditions; and does hereby proclaim the month of May 2023 as Mental Health Month in Fulton County, Georgia. Thank you all for your work to the Department of Behavioral Health and Developmental Disabilities, the Board of Health, and our nonprofit partners. Thank you all for the work that you do in this area."

LATRINA FOSTER, DIRECTOR, FC BHDD: "Good morning everyone. LaTrina Foster, Director for the Fulton County Department of Behavioral Health and Developmental Disabilities. I want you to take a look around me right now. These are all of our community partners who have stood up and committed to make a change in the world within mental health in Fulton County. I want to thank our Fulton County behavioral health network. We have River Edge. We have NAMI here with us today, Silence of Shame is here today, Georgia Hope is here today, Sisters on the Rise -- Women on the Rise -- I'm sorry, they're here today. We have Chris180 here today. We have Grady here today. So I just want to thank all of our partners, Summit Counseling Center. And we cannot make this happen if we do not collectively come together to knock down the barriers to access behavior health services. My charge to each one of you is to commit -- commit to yourself, commit to your neighbor, commit to your family and friends, to check in; make sure they're okay, because people are experiencing loneliness as a part of post COVID, and loneliness leads to medical conditions including depression. So it's up to each one of us to ensure that our neighbors, our friends and our family are okay. Thank you so much."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'Older Americans Month' sponsored by Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Is Ladisa and the Department of Senior Services -- Ladisa. Oh, okay. All right. Yes, spread on out. Well, you know, I love my seniors, and your department does everything to support everything I try to do in the community with them from the Beltline tours to every single bingo game; and we have so much fun. So I really appreciate you and your team, and those who may be watching who aren't able to be here. You said they're working hard, and I know they are. The proclamation reads: WHEREAS, Fulton County adopted the Health and Human Services strategic priority areas of supporting vulnerable residents in our social services and preventing health

disparities by educating residents and connecting them to available resources; and WHEREAS, the Department of Senior Services supports independence, health and delays, cognitive decline through initiatives for seniors, caregivers, and the community by providing programs in group and individual settings through preventive intervention and supportive services; and WHEREAS, these critical services support independence, impacts social isolation, improve physical or cognitive abilities, and includes transportation, in-home services, home delivered meals, direct and virtual life programs in the areas of life enrichment, health, and fitness; and WHEREAS, we recognize the value of the Older Americans Act, the Administration on Aging, Older Americans, and our continued need for them to inspire, influence, and enrich individuals of all ages and future generations; and WHEREAS, this year's theme, 'Aging Unbound', provides an opportunity to explore the many different ways Fulton County residents age. Customize programs that highlight these unique experiences and acknowledge the benefits extended to all when older adults remain engaged independent and involved. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners urges every resident to take time in May to connect with seniors in their community, learn about their past experiences, and present-day contributions. Consider their needs and engage with agencies and partners providing services to support successful aging in place; and does hereby proclaim May 2023 as 'Older Americans Month' in Fulton County, Georgia. Thank you for your work."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "Good morning. Ladisa Onyiliogwu, Director for Department of Senior Services. Commissioner Hall, thank you so much for sponsoring this proclamation. And thank you to the entire board for your continued support of the Department of Senior Services. Barbara Cook will be accepting today's proclamation. She's a very special team member of ours, has been serving Fulton County for 30 years, and is the life enrichment coordinator at HJC Bowden, Senior Multipurpose Facility, and she's our resident historian that knows everything about aging, Ms. Cook."

BARBARA COOK, RECIPIENT: "I am honored and thank you for this proclamation. I am a senior, and I work at the HJC Bowden Center. I'm the multi-purpose program coordinator. We now have four multipurpose facilities in Atlanta, in then Fulton County. And I have had the privilege of working with each one of the center's persons who they are named for. I've work with Barbara Bowden, HJC Bowden, which is located in East Point; I worked with Commissioner Darnell's mother, who the Darnell Center was named after. I've worked with Ms. Benson who Benson was named after. And last, as well as the Mill Center. I work with Ms. Helen Mill. So I know what these seniors put into helping and asking for these facilities. So when you turn 55, feel free to attend one of them. At the centers, you will get all of the information you need. We have a lot of education, other programs to share with you. We offer reading, sewing, knitting, crocheting -- all type of art; and most of all, fitness programs. And we plan programs through the whole year. Senior Service works all year. We work 12 months planning. I can guarantee you right now we have some programs already in our minds and on the board for 2024. We go home every day feeling happy because we have served Fulton

County seniors all over this city. I can guarantee you, we have made at least 100 to 150 seniors happy. So, thank you."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'National Therapy Animal Day' sponsored by Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Mila, come on over. Thank you, Mila Aynard for contacting our office about this National Therapy Animal Appreciation Day. You know our Sheriff, he teaches us about how to use pets to do so many things, so many great things with the people of Fulton County. And so, it's an honor to present this proclamation to you: WHEREAS, there are thousands of pet partners, therapy animal teams serving in communities across the United States; and WHEREAS, Pet Partners has designated April 30th as National Therapy Animal Day; and WHEREAS, Pet Partners therapy animal teams in Atlanta play an essential role in improving human health and well-being through the human animal bond; and WHEREAS, Pet Partners therapy animal teams makes millions of visits per year in settings such as hospitals, nursing homes, schools, and hospice; and WHEREAS, Pet Partners therapy animal teams interact with a variety of people in our community including veterans, seniors, patients, students facing literacy challenges, and those approaching end of life; and WHEREAS, these exceptional therapy animals who partner with their human companions bring comfort and healing to those in need. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners, recognizes therapy animals and Pet Partners as essential members of the lives of those in need and encourages our citizens to celebrate our therapy animals and their human handlers; and does hereby proclaim Sunday, April 30th 2023 as 'National Therapy Animal Appreciation Day' in Fulton County, Georgia. Congratulations. You want to speak? Come on over."

MILA AYNARD, RECIPIENT: "I want to say thank you for acknowledging the work that therapy animals do each day, and I feel honored to accept this proclamation for the therapy animal teams in Fulton County."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'Law Day and Law Week' sponsored by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "It's not that one. It says Deputy Clarence Houston. Oh, Sheriff, he's not here? Okay, go to the next one."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Thank you, Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Can I get all of our attorneys that are here. Those -- if we have any law students in the house and Soo Jo, I know our County Attorney, you've been up here once, but please join us, because we want to recognize what we call Law Day. We have the Judge Ashley Todd of Fulton County, Magistrate

Court Judge, Atlanta John Marshall class of 1999. Judge Ashley Drake, Fulton County Magistrate Court Judge, Atlanta John Marshall class of 2011, and A. J. Doucett -- I hope I'm saying that correctly, Director of Alumni Relations at Atlanta John Marshall Law School. Unfortunately, Dean Gatewood could not be here today. Did I miss anybody? Okay. WHEREAS, Law Day is observed on May 1st of every year and is a celebration of our great heritage of liberty, justice, equality, rule of law, and the independence of the judicial branch of the government under law; WHEREAS, Law Day and Law Week honors practices in keeping with the 14th Amendment to the Constitution of these United States of America; and WHEREAS, the Law Day 2023, 65th Anniversary theme, 'Cornerstones of Democracy, Civics, Civility, and Collaboration'; and WHEREAS, citizens of the United States are presented with the legal foundation to achieve the basic rights of fairness, equality, and justice, and many dedicated professionals continue to endeavor to guarantee the due process right of citizens to life, liberty, and property; and WHEREAS, the Fulton County justice system will celebrate Law Day and Law Week 2023, observances that serve as a reminder of our stake in the Rule of Law and the need to reinforce the law with pride, dignity, integrity, self-discipline, and strong determination to succeed. And I will add: if you ever, ever, ever want respect for the law, show up to court without a lawyer and see what happens. That's my personal commentary. That is not my colleague saying that. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Commissioners of Fulton County recognize and commends the members of the judiciary for their ongoing work to uphold the Constitution of the United States and the State of Georgia, and the Fulton County Code of Laws; and does hereby proclaim Monday, May 1st 2023 as Law Day and the week of May 1st through May 5th 2023 as Law Week in Fulton County, Georgia."

JUDGE ASHLEY DRAKE, RECIPIENT: "Thank you, Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, and the Board of Commissioners for this recognition and honor. I'm Judge Ashley Drake with the Fulton County Magistrate Court, and I'm joined with my fellow alum and Atlanta John Marshall Law School Director of Alumni Relations, A. J. Doucett, and we accept this recognition on behalf of Dean Gatewood, John Marshall, and our legal community in Fulton. The last paragraph of the Lawyer's Creed states in part: To the public and our system of justice, we offer service. We will strive to improve the law and our legal system, and to make the law and our legal system available to all. Thank you."

CLERK GRIER: "The last proclamation is recognizing 'Harry Belafonte Remembrance Day' sponsored by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Now, I'm going to kind of speed this up a little because I do understand we had quite a few proclamations. But Harry Belafonte did so much for the United States internationally. And as a board -- this is a Full Board proclamation -- we want to recognize. WHEREAS, Harry Belafonte's legacy began when he was a young man in Harlem, New York City and fell in love with the theater; and began taking acting classes alongside Marlon Brando, Tony Curtis, Bea Arthur, and Sidney Poitier. He subsequently received the coveted Tony award for his 1954

performance in John Murray's Anderson's Almanac; and WHEREAS, Mr. Belafonte began his career in music as a club singer to pay for his acting classes and his breakthrough album, Calypso, became the first LP in the world to sell over one million copies within a year. And he was also credited with introducing American audiences to Calypso music, dubbing him the King of Calypso. And how many of us know that famous "Day-o, aye, aye-o, daylight come and we wanna go home." I'm not a singer, okay? I'm a legislator. Stay in my Lane. WHEREAS, Belafonte was the first recipient of the Nelson Mandela courage award and was honored at the White House with the 1994 National Medal of Arts from President Clinton. He also received honorary degrees from City University of New York, Spelman College, Tufts University, and a doctorate of humane letters from Columbia University among others. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes Harry Belafonte for a life of activism and for his tremendous contribution to the arts; and does hereby proclaim Tuesday, April 25th 2023 as 'Harry Belafonte Remembrance Day' in Fulton County, Georgia. Please put your hands together for a citizen that did so much for his country. Thank you."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "All right, Madam Clerk. Go ahead and resume the meeting."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 6, Public Hearings, **23-0306**, Public Comment - Citizens wishing to participate in public comments will be allowed to appear in person or may choose to participate virtually via Zoom videoconferencing or by submitting their comments in writing by registering on the county's website www.fultoncountyga.gov. Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. The public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The public comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes. In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached, prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we will start with the speakers here in Assembly Hall. We have received 13 speaker cards. Will the first six speakers please come down: Reverend Raymond Washington, Michael Harper, Brad McCrae, Shenita Thompson, Emma Jean Davis, and Micah Herskind."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, before we begin, a couple of ground rules: First of all, when you have -- each speaker is allotted two minutes. When you have 15 seconds remaining of your two minutes, I'll simply say 15 seconds, and that's your key to conclude your remarks. Second of all, we do not allow any placards in the Assembly Hall. So I see three or four, so you need to lower those placards in the back. Thank you. Now, colleagues it's 10:05; we have 30 minutes -- 30 minutes -- 11:05, rather. Thirty minutes for public comment. If we've not heard everyone within that timeframe, then we will take

up remaining comments, Zoom, e-mails, et cetera, at the end of the meeting. First speaker."

REVEREND RAYMOND WASHINGTON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Mr. Chair, as a Civil Rights activist serving the people, I couldn't believe that MARTA Police Department on 01/24 of this year violated my due process. And they do do business in this jurisdiction. Many civilians ride MARTA. On this particular day, sir, they denied me a medical aid. And when I was injured in transit, not only did they violate my due process, they handcuffed me and then alleged that I had a criminal trespassing. When, in retrospect, they knew that that was false. I paid to enter the train, and after paying to enter the train, I requested to speak to a supervisor. After requesting to speak to a supervisor, they took me to the DeKalb County Jail, Chairman Pitts, and then when they took me to the DeKalb County Jail, they knew in retrospect that those allegations where false. I bring this up today because it is an absolute embarrassment to any civilian that's riding MARTA. We pay to ride MARTA. There is no way without probable cause or reasonable suspicion that any civilian should entertain what I had to entertain on that day. That is an absolute embarrassment, not only to find out, Mr. Chair, and let me explain it to you. I rode in the back of a transport with no seatbelt and they were high-fiving each other for the arrest, because we are Civil Rights activists and worked in the community serving the case with George Floyd, Rashard Brooks, --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

REVEREND RAYMOND WASHINGTON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- and many other cases. So I bring this up to you today, sir. I'm about to end. I bring this up to you today, Madam Khadijah, because it is an embarrassment to the civilians of Fulton County. Thank you."

MICHAEL HARPER, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Michael Harper. I'm one of the family attorneys for the family of LaShawn Thompson. We all know about his tragic and horrible death at the Fulton County Jail. And I'm here today to present his family to you. It is one thing to hear about these horrific deaths. It's another thing to actually hear directly from the family who has been impacted by such a tragedy. Sheriff Labat has stood with the family. He has apologized to the family both publicly and privately. He has taken responsibility for what happened to LaShawn Thompson. We have not heard from anyone from Fulton County. We have not heard from the Commissioners, so this is an opportunity for you guys to speak directly to the family. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next speaker."

SHENITA THOMPSON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Shenita Thompson, the sister of LaShawn Thompson. He was eaten alive by bedbugs at the Fulton County Jail. What happened to my brother was horrible. I'm sorry. It should not have happened to no one. He loved Atlanta so much, and for this to happen to him in

Atlanta is horrible. Respectfully, I come to you to ask you -- I'm sorry. How could you -- how could this happen to him if you guys oversee the jail? I'm sorry, it's just emotional. I can't even (Audience clapping.). And I just want to ask, are you guys going to do any investigation into what happened in his death, and we just want justice for what happened to him. And I just want you guys to see him as your brother, as your family member, because what happened to him was just horrible, and nobody shouldn't go through that. He had bugs in his eyes, his ears, his nose, and he died with his eyes open. We want justice."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next speaker."

BRIAN MCCRAE, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Brian McCrae. I'm the younger brother of LaShawn Thompson who died in Fulton County jail. My brother died so inhumanely. Somebody left him in that cell like roadkill. I want the commission -- the Commissioners to view my brother as your brother, as your grandson, and your son. Somebody should be held accountable for this. So I come before your committee respectfully to ask the committee what's going to be done about it. How did this happen in you guy's jail? Are you guys having your own investigation about this? And what's going to be done -- who's going to be held accountable to the full extent of the law? I want to ask the committee how are they going to help my family get justice? Not tomorrow, not next month, not next year, but today. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next speaker."

EMMA JEAN DAVIS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. Good morning. My name is Emma Jean Davis. I live at 510 Mill Street, Atlanta, Georgia. My District 6 (unintelligible.). Anyway, I'd like to say blessings to all of you, and I'd like to congratulate you on getting elected. Brother Rob Pitts, I was disappointed when you walked out of the room. I need you to know that. I like to say I'm proud of everything you do. However, that there is one county Commissioner I want to pay special recognition to today. Her name is Natalie Hall. What happened earlier today, I don't know how the Lord told me to come today, but he sure did. Natalie Hall comes to my community with this wonderful smile on her face, knocking on doors, asking are you all right, Ms. Jean? Is there anything I can do? I want you to know how appreciative seniors are for what you do for us. I also want to say about how you honored my -- my legend over here, my fearless warrior, is what I call her, Able Mable Thomas. Also, I want you to know that on Monday, I had a crisis at my house. And when you came with mental health today, I don't know where this is coming from. I wrote my words today, but I can't say it. I want everybody to know when you come and show up; you want to know that we are, okay. I ain't got but 27 minutes left. I also want you to know that you sent somebody to help the Westview Seniors. I called at the last minute and you came. So I just want to give you --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

EMMA JEAN DAVIS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- thank you so much. You took up one. I want you to know that we appreciate you. I want you to know I have left you a list of things we want, a senior workforce. The Star Line is not working, and we need a senior workforce. You got the tip -- you got the little sheet I left every one of you one."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, ma'am."

EMMA JEAN DAVIS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "And thank you very much."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. Next speaker."

MICAH HERSKIND, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. My name is Micah Herskind. I'm with the Southern Centers For Human Rights. And I want start by saying we stand in full solidarity with the family, Mr. Thompson. It's no secret that the Fulton County Jail has been in crisis for decades now. It's been under lawsuits since almost the minute that it was built. And long-standing patterns of mismanagement resulted last year in a death rate at the Fulton County Jail higher than the death rate at Rikers Island, the notoriously violent jail in New York City. But in recent years, this county has taken really one approach to the crisis, and that has been to sign blank check after blank check for the Sheriff's office and for the jail. Where there's been more deaths, there's been more money; more abuse, more money. More people sitting on the floor, more money. More contraband smuggled in by guards, more money. Meanwhile, attempts to depopulate the jail have been resisted at every turn. You don't need to go back far. In 2018, the chief magistrate judge effectively told this Body that bail reform was impossible. In 2020, when public defenders filed a Habeas suit to try to free people at the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, it was fiercely resisted by the County Attorney successfully. This past fall before some of you were on the commission, you all resisted and ultimately ignored expert recommendation from the ACLU and other bodies to safely depopulate the jail. And what we've seen from all of this is that more money has not solved the problem. A new jail will not solve the problem. We're looking at long-standing patterns of neglect and abuse and mismanagement. When someone gets eaten alive in a jail, that is not because there's not enough money for the jail, it's just not. And you should all look at this as Mr. Thompson's family members just said, as your jail. It's the Sheriff's jail, but it's the jail that you fund. And the only response we've really seen so far from this Body has been to actually allocate more money for the Sheriff's office that just allowed this to happen. Seven months passed --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

MICAH HERSKIND, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- before really any action happened, and that normalizes the level of violence and neglect that is really not, okay. There should be hearing after hearing getting to the bottom of how this happened. Today, the recommendation and the solution is the same that it's been for months, which is to

depopulate the jail, and experts are still ready to assist you in doing that. So, please work with us. Depopulate the jail, thank you."

CLERK GRIER: "Next seven speakers: "Dominique Grant, Devin Barrington-Ward, James Davenport, Sabrina Jones, Reverend Lydia Meredith, Jimmy Hill, and Kathy Scott-Lykes."

DOMINIQUE GRANT, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners, and thank you to those in the community that stand with me and behind me. My name is Dominique Grant and I'm with Women on the Rise. Last year I started with my organization and had the opportunity to view the work from a different perspective. As an MBA grad, long-time corporate employee, and even a former White House intern, I've been taught to review problems from all standpoints; to not only view things from a personal perspective but from a physical perspective. To be frank, a lot of what I've seen has made no sense, and it still doesn't. Last year, I stood behind-the-scenes while we worked tirelessly to not only explain the moral implications of this jail, but the financial implications. Our alliance provided you all and Atlanta City Council fiscal analysis and report after report that gave guidance from the people that serve -- that you serve to make this right. It did not involve jailing more people and that did not involve subjecting them to an institution that you all have admitted is disgusting. It did not involve using \$2 billion for new cages that will ultimately see the same demise. It provided a solution, and I gave you all the opportunity to solve a human rights issue. Instead, Fulton County was given \$5 million last week to the same person that has proven he cannot retain staff to keep conditions safe. The blood of LaShawn Thompson and everyone else that has lost their life at the jail doesn't only land at the Sheriff, but with the people that keep funding his tirade. People remain in cages regardless of what cleaning company you hire and what hazmat suits needed because they are poor. Thank you."

DEVIN BARRINGTON-WARD, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Devin Barrington-Ward, Communities Over Cages ATL. It's so fitting that I come today on Mental Health Awareness Day. It's also fitting that I come today when my mentor, Mable Able Thomas, is being honored by this Body; so I feel indemnified to take you all to task. Because one day I know you all will be upset, you'll be annoyed, you'll roll your eyes; all of the things. But the fact of the matter is that we told y'all. Several times in several meetings with Commissioner Hall, with Commissioner Pitts, Commissioner Khadijah, we've had conversations about this very issue at Fulton County. Mark my words, Patrick Labat is going to get you all sued. Patrick Labat is leading you all down a pathway of destruction, right? Because a man was eaten alive by bedbugs. Let the weight of that sit in this room for a second. A man was eaten alive by bedbugs while many people on this commission quote Dr. King and talk about how this is his cradle of Civil Rights. How does that happen in the City of Atlanta? I know how it happened; when you all pay lip service to community organizers like myself. I'm offended because on the 15th of February, I was appointed to the Smart Justice Safety Committee, later to find out that this committee is inactive. What are you all doing? Why is this committee at this time, a

Smart Justice Safety Committee, inactive? Why? Why are we giving \$5 million to someone who is unable to run his office? Why are we giving \$5 million to a Sheriff's Department that is enshrouded in controversy? Right now, we have a deputy --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

DEVIN BARRINGTON-WARD, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- that's being indicted by a grand jury for sex trafficking. This is not a lawful institution. They're everything, but. And so, again, in two, three, four, five years, just like I told the Commissioners down in Clayton County, I was right."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. Next speaker."

JAMES DAVENPORT, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. First giving honor to God who I often times call my conductor. I don't have a Ph.D., but I do have a G-O-D. The hat you see me wearing, Hit and Run Help, that's based on my brother being killed back in 2013, run over, left for dead. Commissioner Hall, since you mentioned mental health, after this, both of his sons suffered mental health crises and took their own lives, okay? My other topic is simple. I've told you the last time I was here; we need to do something about MARTA. You all control the purse strings. Tell MARTA to stop what they doing. And you all have heard of taxation without representation. That's all we are getting from the Commissioners and the city Council. You all have allowed MARTA to do any and everything that they want to. You talk about them eliminating bus service on the 183 route, it don't make sense. People lives are at stake. Have any of you seen that curve that goes around? But they've eliminated these bus services. I was the person during the pandemic to protest MARTA. When Collie Greenwood had the audacity to cut out bus service. Matter of fact, I did it alone and I will do it again. Shame on you all, giving MARTA permission to do what they do. Over \$530 million a year, then --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

JAMES DAVENPORT, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- and they actually charge me every so often, every three years to buy a card to pay to get in. It doesn't make sense. When are you all going to stop dealing with big business and start serving the people who elected you? It doesn't make sense."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, sir. Thank you. Next speaker."

SABRINA JONES, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. Hope all is well with all of you all. My name Sabrina Jones. I'm from Atlanta, Georgia. I'm a constituent citizen. I was born in Fourth Ward where William Holmes Borders was and raised down there with Dr. Martin Luther King. I'm going to address my son; Terrell John was killed in Tucson, Arizona. I am his mother; it was all over the news. I have his death certificate say for government use only. I have his obituary. He was killed in Pima County -- pulled his

Fulton County records. So when they pulled his Fulton County records, I pulled my son Fulton County records, too. We gone talk about police and Fulton County Sheriff Officer. He's a Douglas High School Alumni; went to Douglas High School. First incarceration said he was criminal trespassing when he graduated in 2007. 2016, October 2016, DeMarco West and A. Holme got my son at a four-way stop sign. This happened in 2016. Because of his record, there is an open case in Tucson. He never did a police report of Fulton County up under DO Jackson. He waited until Sheriff Patrick Labat got in office and decided to do this Fulton County police report on my son. Now, the catch to this whole situation is, he did a warrant. On one warrant say a case number from APD in 11/2009. On the police report he did up under Patrick Labat, said another case --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- all right, 15 seconds, ma'am.

SABRINA JONES, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- and I just want justice for them do right. And we talked about the stuff with the young man with the bed bugs. So we just asking for justice. Thank y'all."

LYDIA MEREDITH, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. The DFCS Advisory Board of Fulton County extends heartfelt appreciation to every Commissioner, but especially Commissioner Natalie Hall, Chief of Staff, Anita Harris, and Director Jonathan Harris; and her entire team for the leadership in answering the call to inspire DFCS staff who works entirely day and night to serve children and families in Fulton County with complex needs. Fulton County has the greatest caseload in Georgia, and this Resolution that recently passed tells every DFCS staff member, we see you, we need you, and we thank you; please continue to serve. We continue to advocate to end the hoteling of children and youth with complex needs in Fulton County. According to State Commissioner, Candace Gross, on average 50 children are hoteled each day in unsuitable spaces where these children miss school, do not receive appropriate care, or nutrition. Again, Commissioner Hall and her team are leading these efforts by surveying unused and under utilized Fulton County facilities to retrofit into a youth wellness Center for children with complex needs. Again, thank you, Commissioners, for living up to the mission to strengthen families and communities. Thank you so much for your time."

JIMMY HALL, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, everyone – good afternoon. I'm Jimmy Hill. First of all, I want to offer my condolences to the family of LaShawn Thompson. I'm Jimmy Hill, Father of Jimmy Atchison. If you'll remember, my son was murdered. He was unarmed, surrendered, shot and killed by former Atlanta police officer January 22nd, 2019. Johnny had been met with many obstacles and hurdles. A Fulton County Grand Jury indicted this Officer Sung Kim for the murder of my son, Jimmy Atchison in December of '22; and charged him with felony murder, aggravated assault and violation of oath. And though his attorney have filed a motion to have this case moved to federal court, I want to know why we have not yet received the support of the Fulton County Commission You know for many years -- what has happened to integrity, the dignity, character, and godly principles in Atlanta? Where people continue

to remain silent and ignore these killings of our loved ones by police? I'm not saying all police are bad, but there are some bad apples and they need to be held accountable. Yet no one wants to have the courage to step up and stand up and speak out against this injustice of police brutality. How can anyone feel comfortable after hearing the voice, the pain, and the cries of help from these families? You know, May 19th, last year, 2022; we laid my son's mother, Cynthia Atchison to rest. She died from a broken heart while in this fight. Justice delayed being justice denied. So I just want to say I that I wish someone that have some type of heart would be encouraged to step up and speak out against this injustice and Commissioner Robb Pitts --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

JIMMY HALL, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- I had met you in 2012 in which you made a lot of false promises to me concerning my son, Curtis Jordan. He was murdered by two young black men here in Atlanta at the age of 18. We've got and fought for ourselves; you didn't do nothing then and you ain't doing nothing now. Just step up. Step up to your responsibility."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next speaker."

KATHY SCOTT-LYKES, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Kathy Scott-Lykes. I'm the mother of Jarvis Lykes who was murdered by a Georgia State Trooper in Columbus, Georgia on December 29th 2017. My reason for being here this morning is to show my condolences to the Thompson family, but also to give me an opportunity to look at what the County Commissioner Chambers look like and what you all do. And I sat and I listened to all of these proclamations that was given today, but the one that really stood out to me was the county attorney. You see, because the one that I wanted to talk to unfortunately isn't here today, and that was Marvin Arrington Jr., who was my attorney during my son's civil action lawsuit, wrongful death case. And I want to let you all know that what I have seen and observed through you all is the same thing that Marvin Arrington did to me and my family as being a counselor, but he was an ineffective counselor. He did not do what he should have done to help my son's case. And with him doing what he did by withdrawing from my son's case after being on his case over two years, he decided to withdraw from my case, let me set, to telling me that his case was not winnable. How can you tell me a case is not winnable when you haven't even been to court yet? So when I looked and saw you all giving these proclamations to these county attorneys this morning, it just makes me wonder, is all attorneys the same as Marvin Arrington, Jr.? I just want to know, because he did not do any justice for me or my family. And he waited six months before the statute of limitations ran out to want to withdraw from my son's case, after being on his case over two years."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds, ma'am."

KATHY SCOTT-LYKES, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- thank you, Mr. Pitts, and I appreciate you for listening to me and I appreciate you all for what you do, but look, you all need to step it up and Marvin Arrington Jr. definitely needs to do something about his professionalism as being an attorney. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next speaker."

CLERK GRIER: "Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have two speakers on Zoom and one e-mailed in comment."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Good morning, Commissioners. The first person to speak is Matt Rowenzcak."

MATT ROWENZCAK, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners, can you hear me?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes, sir."

MATT ROWENZCAK, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Great. Do we agree that we need to respect one another? It's a very simple question. There's no catch. There's no dodge a moment. Do you believe that we should respect one another? I'm generally asking the question because I'm starting to believe that some of you may not actually believe that. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, no one that I know has an issue with your passion. I respect that. The issue is you use skin color to attack someone. You know it and I know it. Commissioner Barrett, you mentioned on a podcast that Commissioner Abdur-Rahman didn't say, 'you are white privileged or you're white privileged'. She said that sounds like white privilege. That's interesting. For the sake of time, let me quote her for you. Quote, 'I am personally offended by your white privilege. I will not sit here and listen to your white privilege. Your white privilege does not cross over to I-20 South.' Maybe that sounds more familiar. Somehow you've seemed to have left that part out. You also suggested that Commissioner Thorne should have let it go. Well, next time someone makes a joke about Jews or an antisemitic remark, I'll assume that you'll just let it go. But wait, that did happen in your District, and you put forth a Resolution condemning that behavior and rightfully so. Your comments sound pretty disingenuous and hypocritical when you start talking about someone's character. Well, if you get the facts right, you know, maybe focus on that. I believe that you and Commissioner Abdur-Rahman can do better; and Commissioner Arrington on the other hand, pretty much has lost all credibility. He can't even sit and listen to residents of this county. A pretty basic responsibility for being a Commissioner, don't you think? Maybe someday soon we can improve the reputation of this county and listen to a lot of the public comments that we've heard this morning and give at least a few minutes for public comment."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, thank you. Thank you."

MATT ROWENZCAK, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- instead of an hour for proclamations."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "The next person to speak is Ben Howard."

BEN HOWARD, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Greetings one and all. Ben Howard, Senior Advocate, Public Policy Analyst. At the April meeting of the Development Authority of Fulton County, I used the Zoom feature to raise my hand during public comment indicating I had something to say. Throughout that meeting, exhaustive meeting, my raised hand was ignored. I now say to you and to the public, what I would have to said to them absent my disbarment: Greetings Development Authority Board Members. Ben Howard, Senior Advocate, Public Policy Analyst. The Development Authority recently has been afforded a board spot on the Fulton County Commission on Elder Affairs. Your voice and votes on that Elder Affairs Commission can do much toward enhancing the quality of life of senior citizens in our county. I suggest that you can authenticate your interests and your concern by adding to your standard agenda, perhaps under Item J, Commission on Elder Affairs Reports. Such an addition and such reports, I submit, would be coincident with our county's citizen's participation plan. Thanks for your time and consideration, and I thank all of you for yours."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "And that concludes the Zoom public comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You have one more minute. Anything else, anybody else?"

CLERK GRIER: "One e-mailed comment."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

REGINA WALLER, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "I'm working there. And these animals are living in terrible conditions. To be honest, I think a lot of the solution would be to ban breeding. I understand that this would be a difficult ask; however, I do not feel like it would be hard for them to have a far fuller and better trained staff. I also recently saw something on Facebook that was in a different state with live cameras in the shelter. Since technology is so big in this day and age, I don't feel like that would be a lot to ask. Please, please install video cameras in the shelter throughout so that citizens of Fulton County can check on these poor animals. This is quite disturbing. That concludes the e-mail comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, 30 minutes exactly. Continue, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "Continuing on page 6, Presentations to the Board, **23-0307**. ARC's New Strategic Plan and Update on the Long-Range Transportation Plan."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Good morning, Madam Executive Director. Good to see you."

ANNA ROACH, CEO, ATL REGIONAL COMMISSION: "Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Members of the Fulton County Board of Commissioners. I want to thank you, Chairman Pitts, as well as the Board, and the County Manager, my former boss and still mentor, Dick Anderson, for providing the opportunity for me to be here today to talk with the Board. I have to say it does feel a little strange being on this side of the podium. Once again, it's a little bit of a homecoming for me for sure, but it is important that I share with the Board of Commissioners what we are -- what we have on task right now at the Atlanta Regional Commission that impacts Fulton County. But before I get started, I do want to acknowledge the folks on the ARC Board that provide solid representation on behalf of Fulton County. Of course, Chairman Robb Pitts serves as a member of our board. His opinion is always valued on the ARC Board, and he's, as you know, not very shy about sharing his opinions and certainly ask the right questions to move our region forward. Fulton County Mayors, Rusty Paul and Vince Williams also serve on our board and are highly engaged in all discussions. More significantly, both serve as members of our Transportation Air Quality Committee. You probably know it as TAQC. Fulton continues to be a vital partner to the Atlanta Regional Commission and has significant and good representation. Next slide. So for this discussion, I will focus our comments on transportation. That's one of the region's most significant challenges, and you'll see in a moment that we are conducting a major update to our Metropolitan Transportation Plan, something that we only do every four years. So it's important for us to connect with you all as we go through that process. This plan is certainly designed to shape not just Fulton County, but the entire region for decades to come. Our MTP is a 30-year plan. Again, we update it every four years, and you will see it put in action through our transportation improvement plan multiple times throughout the year. And so, every time we do this for your update, it's important for us to make sure our community voices are represented throughout that plan. Next slide. But before I jump into the specifics of the plan update, I do want to take a moment just to talk about the Atlanta Regional Commission and the work that it is accomplishing across the region, but more specifically here in Fulton County. ARC is one of 12 regional commissions in the State of Georgia established by the Georgia Planning Act to help and support communities with their community plans and comprehensive planning. Over the years, ARC's portfolio has expanded from just transportation planning to include things like community development, aging services, water resources management, workforce development, and homeland security through our URC Program. Actually, your very own Chief Yates serves in a leadership role on our URC Program. And through those multiple services provided through the Atlanta Regional Commission, we support Fulton in many, many ways. As an example, last year alone, the Atlanta Regional Commission allocated over \$551 million in federal and state transportation funds across Fulton County for projects within the county. We also provided \$2.8 million in state and federal funding to the Fulton County Department of Aging Services for Critical Services. Fulton County remains one of our strongest county in terms of the way that you supplement the federal funding that comes to the region for senior services. And so, we are glad to partner with you in that regard to provide critical services like congregate meals, in-home meals, as well as senior transportation. And

finally, through our livable centers initiative, that grant is a program I'm really proud of at the Atlanta Regional Commission. It's been around for several decades, but the purpose of those grants are to create vibrant walkable places across -- across the county and across the region. And so far, we have worked with 48 Fulton County communities over the years including nine in South Fulton and nine in North Fulton. And many in between in the City of Atlanta to round out several projects there. Next slide. So in addition to again that broad portfolio, transportation planning is the core of what we do at the Atlanta Regional Commission. And we do that through our federal designation as the Metropolitan Planning Organization for the 20 county area. We are charged in that role with developing and maintaining our Long-Range Transportation Plan which we, of course, don't do alone. We rely on conversation with public works departments, we rely on partnerships with planning departments and the like in order to maintain and update that plan. The MTP, as we call it, allocates approximately \$173 billion across our 20 counties over the course of the plan. Again, this thirty-year version of the plan goes all the way through 2050 and covers again over 173 billion in investments. And so, that's the significance of us ensuring that all communities are reflected in that plan, and so your cooperation is significant. Next slide. So the things that are on our minds as we approach this four your update to the plan are significant. You know, our world looks very different than it did four years ago. One of the most significant things that we are planning for is the fact that our region is growing extremely fast. We're one of the fastest growing regions in the country. Our ARC forecast is that Metro Atlanta will add approximately 1.8 million people by the end of our plan in 2050. To put that in context, that's like moving the entire metro national region to Metro Atlanta. And here in Fulton County, you all are contributing healthily and handsomely to that growth as well. Fulton will add approximately 125 residents by 2050 and will remain the largest county in our region and in the state, reaching a total population of 1.3 million. Some of you may recall if you've been here long enough when the entire Atlanta Region was 1.3 million. Now, that just represents Fulton County. So another big driver that will inform much of what we do when we update this plan is technology. Think about the electrification aspirations of the federal government right now. It's at a pace that we're all called to action to adopt. It's going to be something that is rapidly changing as the adoption rate for electric vehicles tick up and that impacts transportation and will impact how we invest in transportation in the future; artificial intelligence as well. You can't pick up a newspaper without understanding that the world is looking closely at how artificial intelligence and EV tolls will impact the way that we fund and invest in transportation. And the elephant in the room, the one that we are all familiar with and have experienced over last several years, COVID-19, which fundamentally changed the way that we commute. It impacted our commute patterns. We are now going to work at different times creating different types of bottlenecks then we're traditionally used to. Our peak travel times now are across the day as opposed to around the 9 o'clock hour, or around the 5 o'clock hour, and the like. So you got the COVID-19 pandemic. You've got different types of technology, the growth of our region that are driving those changes that we plan to make; but there's also climate change that we have to keep in mind. We're in a good place in our region now where we don't have to advocate that climate change is real. I think we've all experienced the weather

severities to show that there's something -- whatever you call it -- there's something that we need to address, and it also impacts transportation. The other thing that we're watching closely is manufacturing. You know, there's been a historic statement that the United States -- manufacturing is dying in the United States. That's not what we're seeing, particularly in Metro Atlanta. Manufacturing is surging here and in green technology areas as well. So you can see the Hyundai investments that are here, the EV battery investments, and businesses that have relocated in Metro Atlanta. All of that is going to impact how we plan for transportation and housing in our region. And so, finally, the other thing, I'd say the sixth and final thing that's on our mind as we look at this update, are the new federal priorities. The federal government in the bipartisan infrastructure law has basically and fundamentally transformed what we have historically understood to be infrastructure across our region and across the United States. It now includes things that we have to keep in mind like equity investments, like broadband. COVID-19, again made us realize that broadband is a part of our critical infrastructure in this country. So again, as we look at the plan, we're not just looking at improving road and bridges across the metro Atlanta region. There are several things that are going to be critical to the updates that we are putting in this four-year plan. Next slide. I'm not going to spend a ton of time on this slide. I just wanted to emphasize that the MTP, the Metropolitan Transportation Plan policy objectives are in line with the strategic framework that was adopted by our board. The most significant thing I can leave you with in terms of that strategic framework is that our goal for the region is very, very simple. It's one great region. And we don't attempt to achieve that ourselves in the Atlanta Regional Commission. It will take significant partnerships like the one we have with Fulton. Next slide. The next two slides I'll talk about how we are focusing on Fulton County in particular in this upcoming Metropolitan Plan Update. The focus will be to ease congestion in some of the region's most significant bottlenecks. So here in Fulton County, of course, the ongoing work on Georgia 400 and I-25 will be incredibly important for hundreds, thousands of commuters on a daily basis. But they're also major updates happening on Medlock Bridge Road and States Bridge Road as well as for our North Fulton Commissioners. And for our South Fulton Commissioners, significant transportation investments in the East Point street corridor in downtown East Point. In terms of transit, MARTA is planning investments across the county as well, including high-capacity transit. You may be feeling a little bit of the pain of that around the government center as they prepare for bus rapid transit in this area; but corridors like Hamilton -- the Campbellton Road corridor is bringing improved rapid and faster commute times based on MARTA's investments in those areas. I do want to take a little bit of time to talk about our investment at the Atlanta Regional Commission in the reduction of the use of single occupancy vehicle for commutes to work. That's going to be very important to reaching our carbon reduction goals as well, and also to reducing congestion across the region. I want to wrap up the Fulton County investments by talking just a bit about the trail network expansion that's going on in Fulton County. Path 400 has proposed a multiuse trail within the Georgia 400 right-of-way and another multiuse trail connecting the Georgia International Convention Center to downtown College Park. So those are some of the few examples of things that will be prioritized as we look at the next four-year update of this plan. Next slide. Not touching on too

much here, just highlighting the other priorities that we have as we are doing this update. Increasing access and ensuring that we are investing in an equitable way is a priority of this federal government. You will see that the federal government for access, not just in discretionary funds but to formula funds requires transportation agencies to ensure that previously under invested communities are now being properly invested in going forward; so that is a priority for the Atlanta Regional Commission as well. Next slide. Again, I just want to reinforce that it doesn't make a ton of sense to have the leadership at the Atlanta Regional Commission, the staff at the Atlanta Regional Commission be the only ones to identify the things that are important to the Fulton County community. It's important to us that each of you as Commissioners ensure that your constituency knows that there are opportunities for them to tell us, that from a transportation improvement standpoint, the things that are important to them for their communities, and we've got several opportunities to do that. We will do outreach and focus groups. We will have a survey up. The federal government requires for us to have a level of citizen participation, and so any assistance that you can help in getting the word out about the Metropolitan Transportation Plan Update would be helpful for us as well. Next slide. Just a call to action on this next slide, for Fulton government -- Fulton County government to be a partner with the Atlanta Regional Commission to achieve and create one great region. We can do so by starting to work together on the update of our transportation plan, which is the issue at hand right now. So, thank you, Mr. Chairman; I'm glad to entertain any questions."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, thank you very much, Ms. Roach. Any questions or comments? Any questions or comments?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Could you speak briefly about -- this group would be interested in the proposed health summit that we've been talking about. The health care summit."

ANNA ROACH, CEO, ATL REGIONAL COMMISSION: "You should not have had to ask that question. I apologize for not raising it without your prompting, Mr. Chairman. One of the things that Chairman Pitts has been very vocal about on our board is the fact that, you know, transportation is good, but it's sort of addressed like at a very, very high level. It's not the thing that keeps him up at night. It's not the thing that necessarily keeps anyone of you up at night. The things that are important to you all on a day-to-day basis are things like public safety. And in his instance, health with the loss of WellStar that their presence in downtown. And so, Chairman Pitts has challenged us to take that on as a planning vertical at the Atlanta Regional Commission. We certainly don't yet have the federal funding to be able to do that, but we have pursued some congressionally-directed funding for us to have the ability to do that on a broader scale. In the meantime, while we await a decision on that, we're working with Chairman Pitts and the Chair of the Atlanta Regional Commission to do a public -- a public health summit. We will focus on health access to the existing both clinics as well as

emergency rooms; and also begin to study the response times necessary to get to an access those services as well. So I do appreciate Chairman Pitts' prompting to get us started on that work."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Thank you. Any questions?"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I do have one follow-up question. Thank you for the great work that you're doing over there, Anna. I'm glad to know that you all are looking at the healthcare and that to know -- which is what I already knew, that the Chairman was actively advocating because there is a healthcare disparity. Do you have kind of like a general -- and I don't want you to be specific if you can't -- but just a general guideline of when that healthcare summit and what you all -- what we can expect, because I really would like to support that considering I live in 30311 and I know, before the change, you were one of my constituents and this affected you.

ANNA ROACH, CEO, ATL REGIONAL COMMISSION: "Absolutely."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "So if you could just let, you know, me know, kind of -- not a confirmed timeline, but when I can look forward to seeing this."

ANNA ROACH, CEO, ATL REGIONAL COMMISSION: "We do have a day. The date that we selected is July 10th. If that is a Monday, I'm correct. If it's not a Monday, I got to check back with that. But July 10th is the date that we have confirmed. We've checked with the Chairman he's available for that day. The members of this board will receive an invitation to the health summit as well, but the members of the ARC Board will be invited as well. It is solution oriented. I think we'll start the day off by presenting information about access across Fulton County specifically because the County Manager and the Chairman have already engaged with EY to do that study in the county. So what our Research and Analytics Department will be doing is expanding that study to the region. And so, we'll present the results of that study to the attendees of the summit; probably get a panel with public health or public hospital providers to talk a bit about the impact on publicly funded hospitals. In terms of access, we'll talk a little bit about probably through another panel the ambulance response times and the times it takes ambulances to get back into service after having to drive certain distances to hospitals. And then we will conclude with round tables where leaders, like yourselves, could start to come up with ways in which we can try to get at that problem. So that's -- don't hold me to the schedule -- the agenda is developing and we need to meet with the Chairman to make sure everything is straight, but that's just kind of a review of what we plan to cover."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Thank you for that and also thank you for confirming what I already knew, which is the County Manager and the Chairman has been looking at this issue of healthcare disparity; and have been working on it for quite a while, and I appreciate both of them. But more importantly, I appreciate the

collaboration with ARC and what you all are doing to help us attack that problem. Thank you."

ANNA ROACH, CEO, ATL REGIONAL COMMISSION: "Thank you, Commissioner."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, other comments?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you so much. Madam Clerk, continue."

CLERK GRIER: "Bottom of page 6, County Manager Items under Open and Responsible Government, **23-0308**, Finance: Review and approval of the May 3rd Budget Soundings."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Mr. Chairman, if I may. We have the Clerk to Superior and Magistrate Court sitting here waiting for item 23-0301, which was pulled from the Consent Agenda for further consideration. Can we move that item up? At least to follow the one that has been sounded."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What's your pleasure?"

(Commissioner Abdur-Rahman not on mic.)

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, all right. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Properly moved and seconded that the item on --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- on page 4."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Page 4, item 23-0301 be moved up after 308. There's a proper motion on the floor to move it up. Madam Clerk? All right, motion to move it up by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, and it's seconded by Commissioner Thorne."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item. We'll continue with the one that you sounded."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0308**, Finance: Review and approval of May 3rd 2023 budget soundings. "

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Mr. Chairman, the item that's before you today includes two additions to the annual hardware and software maintenance and support list. They are both items that don't require any additional funding, just the increase to the amount listed on the AML."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Ellis; it's seconded by Commissioner Hall -- Vice Chair Ellis. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, the next item."

CLERK GRIER: "Page 4 of the Consent Agenda, **23-0301**, Superior Court Clerk: The appointment of Che' Alexander as the Chief Deputy Clerk."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I had a question about this particular item for our County Attorney, because I was a little bit confused because I thought that we had something on the agenda before about appointing Che' Alexander, but I couldn't -- I couldn't remember exactly. I know we had a lot of discussion."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I believe it may have been a peripheral issue to previous discussions; but this particular item which is following a statute that permits the Clerk of the Superior Court to appoint a chief deputy has not previously come before the court, to my knowledge."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, so, this item -- does this item only appoint an appointee to the Clerk of Superior Court or to both the Clerk of Superior Court and Magistrate Court?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "So this particular item speaks only to the Clerk of the Superior Court. The other side issue is currently under review and we'll have a full memo provided to the Board prior to that issue coming to a head at the end of June."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Oh, then this needs to be held then because if you look on page 2 of the legislation details, the paragraph at the top, look at the last sentence. It says, Che' Alexander further accepts the additional clerk roles currently held by the incumbent Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Courts and shall assume such roles to the extent provided by law. So..."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "So in the agenda summary, it says as permitted by law and that is the issue that the Board will be taking up as a secondary matter after it receives our opinion."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. So that's something that's being worked on right now?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes, Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, so then this item should be held so you can do the further work that you're doing on that particular legal issue?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I believe the Board has two options. You can either take action today on the appointment as Superior Court Clerk pursuant to the statute, which actually -- you wouldn't even be taking action. It's just being spread on the minutes. So that's all that's happening today. And then you could take up the issue -- your position, determining your position on whether or not that also entails acceptance of the Magistrate Court Clerk's position as well at a subsequent meeting."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, but this literally says in here, 'and shall assume such roles to the extent provided by law'. So you're saying even though it says Superior Magistrate Court, that it doesn't include the Magistrate Court functions?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "So the way that's written, it's conditional upon what the law permits. So the fact that the appointee does not object to such additional duties doesn't automatically place those duties with her if the law doesn't otherwise permit."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "But does the law permit?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "So I am working on it, and at the risk of doing the same thing as last time and telling you what I believe it's going to say, is that that will be at the option of the Board."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. Well, that's too much ambiguity for me. So I'm going to leave that alone. I believe it needs to be held. I see an approval on there."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Hold on one second. So the motion on the floor there's a motion to approve by Commissioner Barrett; it's seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Go forward."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No, no. Just a minute. You're making a substitute motion to hold? So you're not making -- all right, just a minute. Just a minute, everybody. You're not making a substitute motion to hold? All right, Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Madam County Attorney, I just want to clarify the specifics of this particular agenda item because I'm reading it as this appointment has already happened. It happened March 2nd 2023, and that there was a requirement just to spread that appointment on the minutes; and that all we're actually approving with this vote is to spread that appointment on the minutes. We're not actually approving the appointment. We're approving putting it on our minutes as having happened March 2nd; is that correct?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes, Commissioner Barrett. You're only accepting it being spread on the minutes because the statute always ready permits the Clerk of the Superior Court to make the appointment, which she has done."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. So based on that, I just wanted to make that, you know, clear for myself and just clear for anybody that's paying attention that this is not us actually approving the appointment, we are just allowing that to be put on the minutes of our meeting. So I am all for supporting this and I hope my colleagues will join me."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah, I was just going to ask technically, do you vote on the spreading on the minute's item? Or is it just placed on the agenda?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We normally vote."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I mean, we originally anticipated this would be on the Consent Agenda and, therefore, just a bulk vote. The fact that has been brought out as an individual item is the only reason it's coming up for vote, but we view it as a pro forma vote just to allow it to be on the minutes."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. We're going to vote on it. So, the motion on the floor is to approve -- let me -- I want to put this all in perspective. This issue has been going on and it's not going away. I want to make a prediction here. Hopefully, you all are familiar with what's called a kabuki play. And what that is, in Japan, you go to the theater not to see what the ending is going to be, but to watch the performance of the actors. We know how at least -- I know how this is going to play out. If you've been around, if you've been paying attention to this, each of you should know how this is going to play out. It's been messy from the beginning, and it's still messy. I tell you why it's messy: Even though the statute allows for this, I guarantee you what's going to happen, and Ms. Alexander is probably a fine person; but I can tell you what's going to happen. When Ms. Robinson retires, Ms. Alexander is going to come back under contract with Ms. Alexander 50,000, 100,000, 200,000. Who knows? And doing what? In addition to

that, Ms. Robinson made what, \$350,000 on passports. Mark my word and watch the actors in this. I'm telling you now what the conclusion is going to be even though the statute may permit this. I'm not suggesting that Ms. Robinson has done anything wrong. She made some changes originally. She was going to be some special assistant. Now they've changed it to comply, make it a Chief Deputy. But in the final analysis, I'm telling you how this is going to -- you may be, okay, with it. I'm not, okay, with it, even though it may -- the statute may provide for it, it doesn't smell right and it doesn't taste right, and it sounds like it's unethical to me no matter what the statute says. Commissioner Ellis"

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT:
"May I speak?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis, do you want to --"

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT:
"May I speak, please?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Sure."

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT:
"Chairman, I have -- I'm troubled by what you just said. The County Attorney's Office represents the Office of the Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Courts. Currently, I hold the Office of the Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Court. My name is Cathelene Tina Robinson. I have worked for this county since April of 1974, almost 50 years. It's time for me to retire, and I would like to do that in decency and in order. What you have just said is very disrespectful. It's insulting and it's untrue. The County Attorney's Office advised what the law dictates I do, and that is to spread the appointment of the Chief Deputy Clerk who will serve upon my retirement that I so richly deserve. So if there is a problem, this is what the County Attorney has advised and I assure you, Chairman that I will retire and sit at home with my mama -- my 87-year-old mother -- that is the reason that I am retiring. My mother is aging. I am going to sit with her, take care of her, what I currently do, but I'm going to do it a little better. And I resent your statement. I truly do. I deserve better. I have given this county almost 50 years of my life and that may mean nothing to you, but I assure you it means a lot to the constituents that I've served."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's it?"

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT:
"No."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Continue."

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT: "I would like an apology from you, because you have made a prediction based on what; I don't have a clue. I would like an apology. That was very insulting. I have done

nothing. You have seen nothing that would dictate your prediction. I don't deserve it. Ms. Alexander doesn't deserve it. She has had -- she has had a consulting firm that the county just got an award for in Savannah. That was her expertise; that was her product, and you're going to insult me and her at this juncture? I would like an apology from you because you made the statement."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Anything else?"

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT:
"Am I going to get an apology?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Not from me. You have the floor."

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT:
"Okay. All right, sir. All right, sir. Good."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Commissioner --"

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT:
"Again, these constituents that came up here during public comment -- the constituents that came up for Commissioner Thorne, the saga continues. When is this going to stop? When? What gives you the right to say what you said? Just because you're sitting in that chair?"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Clerk Robinson, I have the floor. Let me -- with all due respect --"

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT: "I am upset."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I know you are. I apologize to you -- the Chairman has his opinions, he has a right to his opinions, but so do I. I apologize to you. I thank you for your service of 50 years to this county. Have I always agreed, no? Have we had a relationship that we could talk; yes, we have. And so, thank you for your service. And Che', you already know, we appreciate the work that you have done. And so, what I say to you in this moment in time, as someone who has served Fulton County, I appreciate your years of service of this county. Che' Alexander, I appreciate the hard work that you have done with Fulton County when others were at home and you were working late at night until 2 and 3 in the morning. See, sometimes we have to be careful what we say, because sometimes it may not come out the way we intend it. And that's no disrespect to the Chairman, because the Chairman has his opinion, but I have mine as well. And so, I apologize to you as one elected official to another, but more importantly, as a woman of color. And you represent the Fulton County taxpaying citizens. They elected you. So you owe nothing to anybody else, but to them. So I

apologize. I thank you for your service. I pray well for you and your family. And Ms. Alexander, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Barrett, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "You have my thanks for 50 years of service obviously. I've been here for four whole months of it, but thank you. And I know what it feels like to be personally attacked in a professional environment, so I'm sorry that that's happening. I just want to reiterate -- and I want to express my frustration, I think that every time the word Clerk comes up any agenda item, we seem to want to turn it into this whether or not the Clerk of Superior Court should or should not be the Clerk of Magistrate Court. This is not the issue before us today; we should not even be discussing this today. This is merely -- what should have been a Consent Agenda item to spread on the minutes, something that has already happened. So whether you agree that the Clerk of Superior Court should be the Clerk of Magistrate Court or not is irrelevant to today's agenda item. And again, I'm just going to reiterate that I support this, and I think we can have that conversation another day."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you for your comments. Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Absolutely, thank you for your service, you and Che'. But I can't support this, because there's too much ambiguity, and the County Attorney's Office has worked with me long enough, not just these five and a half years that I've been Commissioner, but also the six years that I was Chief of Staff to Commissioner Garner, and she knows that I wait for the final word of the County Attorney, so. But thank you absolutely for your service, and that's all that I'm looking for in this. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I just want to be brief. And, you know, I'm new, but the little bit of time that I've worked with both of you, I just want to thank you for your 49 years you've done, and I want to congratulate you, Che', and the award you got down in Savannah working on Project ORCA. And just know you're appreciated, and I wish you would stay on longer to get me through the next few years, but I look forward to working with you, Che'."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Any other comments? All right, the motion of the floor is to --"

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT:
"Chairman. Chairman."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."

CATHELENE TINA ROBINSON, FC CLERK SUPERIOR & MAGISTRATE COURT: "I just want to say again; this item is on this agenda because it was said that I had to do it."

I've done my part. I requested that it be spread on the minutes. So whatever you all do is what you do. But I have done what I have been required to do by law."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's correct. All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 7, **23-0309**, Real Estate and Asset Management: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$330,218 to provide medical and clinical general cleaning services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to approve by Commissioner Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0310**: Request approval of a recommended proposal in a total amount not to exceed \$1,476,729 to provide janitorial services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0311**: Request approval of a recommended proposal in an amount not to exceed \$150,000 to provide real estate, development planning, and consultant services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Cast your vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "Under Arts and Library, **23-0312**: Request approval for usage of Beltline TAD fund, funding in the amount of 101 -- I'm sorry \$1,550,000 to replace and refresh end of life and end of support network equipment."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approve by Commissioner Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I'm sorry, Commissioner Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Just one quick question. And probably more for financing, but you might know this, Ms. Holloman. What is the amount of projected amount of funds we receive every year, you know, for this purpose, and then do we have a balance as well?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Commissioner Ellis, we received \$1,350,000 on an annual basis, and we'll continue to do so through 2031."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay. And is there -- is there an outstanding balance that exceeds this 1.55 million?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Yes, sir. We have roughly \$11 million that remains in a contingency fund that's been received under this agreement."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay, all right. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 8, under Health and Human Services, **23-0313**, Public Works: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$7,536,975 to provide all labor material and equipment to remove and replace gravity sewer pipe."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, a favorable motion by Commissioner Thorne; it's seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "23-0314: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in the amount not to exceed \$175,589.69 to provide duct tile, iron pipe, restraining gaskets, and tapping saddles."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne; it's seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "23-0315, Senior Services: Request approval to decrease spending authority in the amount of \$123,864.03 to reduce the contract award amount to exclude the project income amount."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, favorable motion by Commissioner Thorne; it's seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Cast your vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays. Six, with Commissioner Hall."

CLERK GRIER: "23-0316: Request approval for the finance department to enter into a contract to provide liability accident and excess automobile liability insurance coverage for senior AmeriCorps volunteers."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to approve by Vice Chair Ellis; it's seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "Next item is on page 10, Presentation, Select Fulton, 23-0322, Select Fulton Workforce Development Update."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes, sir."

SAMIR ABDULLAHI, DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "Yes, sir. Commissions, Samir Abdullahi, Director of Select Fulton; the Economic and Workforce Development arm for Fulton County. Traditionally, we -- before our contract renewals for career services, we come before the Board to do a quick update on our past year's performance and success before taking this voting action. Next slide, please. So today, we'll go through

our performance success. Some of the strategic planning we've done last year and ongoing program priorities. Next slide, please. So just a reminder note: We got two new Commissioners on the Board here. What we do in terms of workforce development, is really focused around career training for three broad groups; adults, dislocated workers which are recently unemployed, and youth. Youth is really in the box of students who dropped out of school, didn't pursue their high school degree. We're trying to get them converted through the GED program so we can get them through on the adult education side of things. One of the more recent things that we've added to our portfolio is around business services, helping to get companies, address their workforce development needs, providing some funding to offset some of that. Next slide. And to harp on this slide a little bit: I think one of the fundamental things that have helped make this workforce development program successful is leadership. We took over workforce development back in 2018. I was talking to Commissioner Barrett yesterday, a lot of bad agency articles; we were hemorrhaging money. We didn't know where the money was going; we were not delivering on performance, so a lot of really chaotic things happening. And I think through really strong determined, inclusive leadership, we have turned that around. One, it starts with our workforce development board. I want to thank our chief local elected official, which is under the -- that we owe our legislator, Chairman Pitts, who has helped us seat and reseal essentially our entire workforce development board with what it was always supposed to be made up of; business and community and education leaders. And we have gotten such a great list of great individuals that serve on that board that are involved, not only in our quarterly board meetings, but in between those board meetings we have committees -- subcommittees, a finance committee, a performance committee and others that help to drive the work of the full workforce board. Our meetings used to be three, four, or five hours, they're one hour. They're good. They're condensed. They're held at industry events or industry training centers or at large employers. So we try to take them on the road to see the work in action. I want to harp on Brett Lacey, someone we've brought in from the State of Georgia who we've recently promoted to our Deputy Director from the Executive Director of Workforce Development who's really led the charge in reshaping our work force development efforts, rebranding us with the State of Georgia and our federal partners, so that we have come from kind of that lower quadrant to the tip of the spear. I mean we are the model for the State of Georgia and probably the southeast and we get called upon to do that and speak on our changes that we've had. And then a point of probably personal privilege for the both of us: Despite labor force challenges and everything else, we have maintained a consistent 11-person staff throughout the pandemic. We didn't lose people. We didn't have to rehire individuals. We actually grew the team a little bit. So, I'm very pleased with, again, the leadership of the group. It's helped on the administration of the grant, but again, I think to the service and the outcomes of the individuals that go through our program. And I'll transition over to Brett Lacey to talk a little a bit about our performance and priorities."

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "Next slide. Again, Brett Lacey, Deputy Director for Select Fulton. We like to take this opportunity to again champion the success that we've had over the last year and then look a little bit toward

on what we're looking on for the next year to continue to grow and build upon that success. We highlight this for you guys pretty much every year because we're very proud of the outcomes that we're doing and the impact that these programs have on Fulton County and their residents. And again, over the last year these numbers and I'll caution you, are just this program years since July 1. We're going to see these numbers go up before really the state or the federal government looks at our performance for the year. We know these numbers are going to increase by then. So, currently there's about two months left in the program year, 150 Fulton residents interned into employment. It means they've already went through their training. We have a whole really in the funnel more that completed their training and we're working with them on employment skills to be able to go through that job search process. That pipeline is about 336 that are in training, plus a good handful that have completed training, and they're just, you know, in that job search. To date, here today, we are to \$2.6 million in annual earnings. So that is individuals that have been placed in those jobs, have generated 2.6 million in salaries in Fulton County. Think about the direct, indirect and induced impacts of those dollars turning over in our communities. When we look at what that outcome is, about \$31,000 per individual, for every dollar we spend on them, they're generating about \$5.94 in salary. So it's a pretty good return on investment that we spend a dollar to help put them through training. We see about \$6.00 returned in the form of salary and impact on that family and those lives in Fulton County. Next slide. And again, to what Samir was talking about, I want to highlight really the work that our board has done, because the state does hold us up as Samir noted, really as a high-performing board. As an example, just recently we had the chance to share with their regional office of the Department of Labor what our board has done to focus on strategy. To focus on the impact that we are having, not just bodies through the door, not just numbers like you're seeing. But really, what's the strategic impact of these efforts? So we took the chance in January to pull that board back for some really strategic thinking. Look forward to the next year and how the board wants to leverage the funding that we have to the highest and best use. They really want for us to look at in a time where we're seeing budget cuts, braiding our finding with other opportunities, finding new innovative funding sources so we're not limited by just the federal funds; that we can continue to grow that impact. And specifically we're looking at priority groups such as opportunity youth, such as working mothers, such as individuals with exposure to the justice system to really make that impact on those individuals and those families and get them back in to the labor force. Next slide. So again, the focus with that and with the board, you're seeing in action some of the ways that we're already doing that. We're the first -- I'm very proud of this point -- that we're the first local work force board to enter into agreement with the State Department of Human Services to co-enroll individuals receiving SNAP funding into programming. It's not done across the State of Georgia. It is a huge opportunity, and for us to be the ones that DHS has chosen to partner with, really sets the standard of what they think we can do, and that we're going to be the model for them to roll this out statewide. So very proud of that partnership that we've already begun. The mobile unit is out and about. You'll see it around the community. We're at the county libraries, we're at MARTA, we're thinking about where we can put that in the next year to maybe make some more

impact in which communities and neighborhoods we are going to. Then again, you see we're always proud of the actual -- what our customers tell us. And we have an 87 percent customer satisfaction that we get back on that. They're very happy with the work that we're doing and how they've been receiving those services. So at this time, I will open it for questions from the Board."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, thank you guys. Great presentation. Commissioner Hall followed by Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. On page 5, I was reading through this, and I was really happy to see the 154 gained employment, 336 currently enrolled in training, the 2.66 million in annual earnings; and I got to the \$5.94 in salary for every \$1 we spend; but then, I looked at the median salary, and I said hold on, wait a minute, that is not a living wage. And it was very disappointing to see that. I was like nobody can be self sustainable on a salary like that. So I want to ask you, what are we doing to improve this, and why is it so low?"

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "Thank you, Commissioner Hall. I can always count on you to check my math. So, I won't get into the full data work of how we drive that number. That median salary, you're correct, it is below what a living wage is in Fulton County. Part of that is driven by some of the jobs that we're entering into. Some of these entry-level jobs, you're talking CNA's, truck driving -- you can still get a good salary, but you're earning really entry-level. And some of the --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- you said truck driving, like CDL, 18-wheelers? I was married to a truck driver before, and he made six figures back in the 1980s. So I don't understand that."

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "You can get there. Some wages -- some industries have not kept up, really, with inflation, and where wages need to be for those individuals. So what we've done is really look back and try to work with those individuals and encourage them to come back, you know, for instance, a CAN, some of these other IT jobs you may be in, not necessarily where you think you can be. Get a couple years of experience, come back and see us for more training and upgrade from a CNA to an LPN. Start out with your initial sort of coding certificate. Come back and get specific languages, become a web developer, a security developer. To get some of these jobs that are advertised at \$50, 60, \$70,000, to try to encourage them to continue to use our programs even after they've completed training and entered into employment. And then we are also talking to employers about what jobs they need if they have talent gaps, where are their salaries at? Are they keeping pace with the market to try to make sure that we're finding opportunities to families to enter into self-sufficient wages."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "What is the hourly wage for this 31,387? That's like \$15 an hour or something like that? I think you can go work for Chick-fil-A for more than this, if

I'm not mistaken. Was that you, Mr. Hermon, who told me your son went to go work for Chick-fil-A and you said he made a good hourly wage? I couldn't believe it."

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HR OFFICER: "I wished he got a job at Chick-fil-A. No, Commissioner, I told you they were advertising \$19 an hour at the Chick-fil-A."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Oh, they were advertising. Thank you. So, I just don't get this. You know, \$19 an hour at Chick-fil-A, and we're median salary of \$15 an hour. We do have some work to do, yes. But thank you for all of your hard work."

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "I agree and we continue to welcome your help on that."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Thank you, Commissioner Hall, for asking that question. That was on my list. I'm on page 5, too, and I agree with what you're saying, and I guess what I was going to ask was just a follow-on to that is: Not only what can we do about it, but what -- first of all, you know, what is the median salary that these folks would make without the training? Because I think to Commissioner Hall's point, it doesn't sound like their necessarily doing better having gotten the training, at the median at least. But more importantly, I think going forward, what are the matrix and goals here? Because to say we're going to do better is one thing, but to say we need to reach a median salary of 50K or whatever the right number is, so do you have that sort of in your strategic planning?"

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "We do. So, we have a number of measures that we're formerly evaluated on again at the end of every year. We're happy to show you where we're currently at with that. Our board really focuses on some other additional key indicators that really show us we're making an impact. One thing we look at is an earnings change, so exactly what you're speaking of, because we do have individuals that are coming to us basically with \$0 income. So you're going to see a very substantial earnings change in just six months when they go from unemployed no income, to now having \$15, \$16, \$17 an hour. We also have a population of individuals who have had careers and have been laid off through no fault of their own. The earning change for them is usually not very substantial, because they're basically starting over sometimes in a new career track in a new industry; but we do measure some of those earning increases to make sure that we, you know, that the treatment of training is making an impact on their earning potential. We can share some of that data with you, if you'd like, and show you where we're at and what we track specifically with our board for those indicators."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yeah, I would love to see that. The other question I have is really about the number of people served and, you know, I just want to ask a little bit about the scope because, you know, while it's great that, you know, we've got 154 that have gained employment and 336 currently enrolled. We have over a million people in the county. So I'm assuming there's more than 336 people that could use these services. So again, I guess the question here is, what is the goal from a scope perspective? Are all the people that -- obviously can't serve everybody, we only have so much budget. But, you know, what is the plan to sort of get more people who need these services to these services?"

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "Outreach continues to be one of our strong challenges getting the word out, where our services are. I think access is also a challenge. That's why we have the mobile unit out so much to really try to get into neighborhoods and communities that need to be utilizing our services. I will note, so these numbers -- Board of Education just covers the areas outside of the City of Atlanta. So the City of Atlanta's work source program. When you add in those numbers, you're probably talking seven to eight hundred currently enrolled total served. So, in training, plus those who have exited over the last year, closer to a thousand, 1,100 just over the last year. And then there are some eligibility guidelines. We can't serve everybody. You got to meet that criteria. But we're fairly full in terms of our pipeline and budgetary constraints of how many we can serve. But we are continuing to try to get into, at again, those priority populations of who we're focusing on to make that impact. But we're out, you know, social media, flyers, you know, going to events to really drive in individuals to make access to these programs."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Commissioner Barrett, you sound like me over the past years. I think they probably had some flashbacks, because you literally ask questions that I've asked over the past couple of years. I do want to just say thank you for your e-mail response, because I asked a bunch of questions like where do these residents live? What companies are employing them? What kind of training programs? And who -- where do the 336 live, because seeing that really shows us where's the concentration of population that we're actually serving, because we need to always make sure that we're providing equitable service across the county. We hear, you know, a lot about North Fulton, South Fulton, and all of that; well, we need to absolutely make sure that we're serving all those areas. And I'm glad you brought up the point about the mobile unit. Because as, you know, I advocated for that mobile unit, but I did not know that you were going to get the mobile unit, and then only have certain employees who are not general fund employees, working that mobile unit. So that is the reason why it cannot be used in the City of Atlanta. And Commission -- yes because you cannot utilize the funding in the City of Atlanta because the City of Atlanta gets the same funding. So I've always said we need general fund employees, so that we can utilize this across the

county and not leave anyone out. Can you tell me at this point how many general fund employees do you have left? Because I know you have none less."

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "We've transitioned everybody into the grant."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So that's why they can't serve the City of Atlanta, unfortunately. But I have asked in the past for us to allocate general fund dollars and have some general fund employees put back into that area so that we could just serve wherever the service needs to be provided. It just has not happened yet. So maybe we can get together and make that happen. All right, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, y'all just stay tuned on this Fulton County versus the City of Atlanta. We're working on something that we can't talk about now. All right, Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "You mentioned the criteria to join the program. Can you give that criteria just in case there's someone out here that's looking for a job?"

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "Yes, so we are federal funding in three buckets. The first would be youth, so those are individuals 14 to 24. Typically, that funding is going to be directed to an individual, a youth who is disconnected from the school system, so either they've completed their high school diploma and haven't moved onto postsecondary, or they've withdrawn from the school system. So you're really looking 16 and up on that. And so, our focus there is that high school equivalency or GED, and then further education or employment. But that's our first group is youth and their programming. And then we kind of bundled together adult and what's called dislocated worker. So an adult is 18 and up, unemployed typically, is the simplest way to dilute that. You qualify as an adult if you're unemployed, come see us. The dislocated worker is for things like individuals that are affected by a mass layoff, so a plant closure, an office closure, and we're -- basically a transitioning military. So if you've got your DD214 and you're entering retirement from the military, you qualify. If you are a stay-at-home mom, maybe you've left your job to become a primary caregiver at home during the pandemic and now you're wanting to come back to the work force, you qualify as a dislocated worker. Or if you're a long-term unemployed, so you've exhausted your employment benefits and you still have been employed for 18 to 20 weeks, you would qualify under that."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "So, I imagine, if you're giving an employment to 14- to 16-year-olds and they're still working on their GED or whatever requirement they had, that that might pull your medium salary down?"

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "Somewhat, it more just pulls down what we're spending. Some of them do well when they turn 18, they'll enter

into employment. But it's really -- when we spend that just under \$3 million. We're including the dollars we're spending on youth programming."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay. Great. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Other comments or questions?"

COMMISSIONERS: (No response.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Continue, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "Bottom of page 8, under Infrastructure and Economic Development, **23-0317**: Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$125,000 to provide the coordination and facilitation of a one-stop operator service."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, a motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne; it's seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Commissioner Hall, you have a question?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. My question was who are we serving with the One-Stop Shop? And now that I have Hapeville, College Park, and East Point in my newly drawn district, I'm very much concerned about making sure that we are serving those who need to be served. Can you answer that? Because I was reading page 2 of the legislation details and I'm just -- I don't see anything. And I really can't precisely say what exactly this is doing. It just rambles on about coordinating the provisions of (inaudible) and what does that mean?"

BRETT LACEY, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SELECT FULTON: "yeah, this is one of the fund challenges that federal legislation gives us, is that the law mandates that we go and procure an independent mall manager, is the easiest way to explain it. So this is an individual who sits in our in our comprehensive One-Stop, which is the South Fulton Service Center. And it essentially is there to ensure that all required partners are in place, they help facilitate basically our infrastructure agreement. It's a bunch of administration fund. It's not directly tied to serving individuals. It's to make sure the doors are opened and the computers on when a job seeker comes into do a job search, and it's something that is required by law that we basically put out to bid for a contractor to offer their services."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, thank you so much."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, the motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: On page 9, **23-0318**: Request approval to renew existing contracts in the amount of \$1,725,125 to provide audit and dislocated career center services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, a motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0319**: Request approval to renew existing contracts in the amount of \$600,000 to provide youth career center services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, favorable motion by Commissioner Barrett, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nay."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioners Action Items, **23-0253**: Request approval of a Resolution directing the County Manager and the County Attorney to develop a plan for the Board of Commissioners consideration for legislation authorizing a countywide special local option sales tax to support healthcare, infrastructure, and foster stabilization of healthcare services countywide sponsored by Vice Chairman Ellis."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to approve by Vice Chair Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Speakers are as follows: Vice Chair Ellis, Commissioner Barrett, and Commissioner Hall."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I will be brief as we've spent a lot of time talking about this at a prior meeting. But we all know we have significant expenditures before us related both to healthcare as well as public safety. They're staring us down over the next several years; justice alone talking about \$2 billion in healthcare expenditure certainly exceeded \$100 million. And placing this, you know those funding needs on the backs of the property taxpayers given the collective millage rates that our citizens pay when it comes to cities and schools in the county. We all know about the significantly high cost of home ownership in the area that we're in, and that increasing burden that they're facing. I think we need to turn over every rock possible to consider how we offset, you know, placing these burdens on our property taxpayers. So this is just simply quite asking for our management team to present back to us a plan within 90 days for all non-property tax revenue options that was part of the amended motion that we considered last time. Not only just a special -- well, not just a

T-SPLOST, but all the non-property tax revenue options to us for consideration within -- once they have that ready within 90 days. And, you know, I just would tell, you know, when we went through the importance of having them act and starting to do the research on this. This doesn't happen overnight. It took us; you know well over almost a year, I think to work through T-SPLOST. So when you're considering these things, it requires a significant amount of work, and I think it sends a signal for us to direct them to do that to our taxpayers that we're looking to turn over every conceivable rock possible to be able to fund, you know, some of these initiatives and some of these asks that we have before us over the next several years."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I want to direct a couple of questions to the county management team. To be clear, this is a Resolution that has not passed yet, and I just want to clarify. You all have already begun to look into all of the funding options for our healthcare needs; is that correct?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So that includes sales tax options, not property tax options. All -- anything that might be done. We have yet to discuss it as a group, correct?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Yes, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yeah. So, I just want to bring that up because at the last meeting when we held this item, we held it because we were meant to be having a deeper conversation and getting some more information from our county management team at the retreat. And as our retreat agenda shifted a little bit, we have not yet had that briefing. And so, that I believe is scheduled, Mr. County Manager, correct me if I'm wrong, for the next retreat?"

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Yes, ma'am. On the 22nd of May."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yeah. And so, whether or not we pass this Resolution, that is not going to stop you all from continuing your efforts in researching all of our funding options be it sales tax, property tax or whatever else there is."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "No, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. And so, what I -- you know, the way I see this is one of two ways. Either we hold it, which we could do, and wait until after the retreat when we've had the briefing and, you know, we had a majority approved to hold it for exactly that reason last time; and that reason hasn't changed. On the other hand, what I think approving this does, at this time, is -- as a Resolution is send a signal to the

public that we've already decided on a funding source of a sales tax, and I don't think it's responsible for us to send that message at this time, because we have not been briefed on all of the options -- I'm not making a motion to hold. I'm not going to support this Resolution, so I just want to be clear, it's not that I think a sales tax is a bad idea, and it may be ultimately what we choose. But I think, you know, putting this in Resolution form leads us down a path of having people believe this is what we've already have selected, and we have not. So I'm not going to support this Resolution at this time."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. So, let me make sure I got this right, because my question was also about the fact that we requested that the County Manager explore different options and bring that back to us. And I believe I -- yeah, I think I left -- I had to leave early during the last retreat, so I missed the last part of, and I didn't know that you didn't cover it. So, May 22nd is when we're going to cover it?"

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Yes, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, all right. Thank you. I would rather get all of the information that we need. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Thank you, Chairman. I actually did have a meeting with the finance team, and they kind of outlaid different scenarios that we could go through on financing and what if this happens, what if that happens. And I look at this as just a tool in our toolbelt. Because it takes probably a year to get this, you know, to go before the vote. The citizens have to vote. So I don't think we're sending a message that we're going to have a sales tax. We're just looking at having the option available to fund something. If an opportunity comes where we can get a hospital and we need to purchase land in South Fulton, we would have that option, if we had a big expenditure along with the jail, along with our renegotiating our Grady contract that we're going to have to do, along with this Morehouse Clinic, along with multiple Morehouse Clinics that will lead to a step to a hospital. So, I want to have a tool, a tool that we could be used. We're not saying we're going to use it. Just to look at it and say that we potentially can have this option instead of raising the millage rate three or four points to accommodate."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Just a couple points of clarification. Again, this is to explore all non-property tax revenue options. Okay? Not just sales-tax mechanisms. And also I will point out, you know, we would put our management team on the clock several weeks ago, and they would have been working on this with more diligence and we'd be closer to having something. We would do this, to discuss this, at the first retreat session we had, didn't get to that. Due to discuss it at the second, didn't get to that, and we've

got a lot of topics to cover at the next session and we may not get to it then. And we're not going to be able -- they're not going to be able to accomplish and achieve all of the research they're going to need to be able to do when it looks when to consider, you know, kind of the entirety of that. They're going to need more time than that, you know, just based alone in terms of what we know already with some of the times that we have gone down the path of looking at other revenue options other than property tax. It takes time. So we ask for them to go do the work, send the signal, and bring it back to in sort of a full plan for consideration. We can delay it, you know, and we'll just keep on delaying it, and we'll be further behind the eight ball when it comes to trying to figure out how -- what we're going to be able to do to fund the things that we know are going to be coming down the pipe. So, hopefully I just ask you again for your favorable consideration on it."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "With all due respect, Vice Chair, this is not going to slow them down, because I just asked the County Manager and he confirmed that they're already doing this work. So this just feels like an unnecessary Resolution when the work is already being done."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Cast your vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; two yeas, two nays, and one abstention."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0320**: Request approval of a Resolution adopting desired goals and standards for criminal cases handled within the Fulton County justice system; urging all elected and appointed officials serving in a Fulton justice capacity to focus their efforts towards meeting the standards; and for other purposes sponsored by Vice Chair Ellis."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: All right. The motion on the floor is to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Vice Chair Ellis. Commissioner Ellis, Vice Chair, you have the floor."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Thanks, Mr. Chair. Just a few brief remarks on this particular item. I doubt any of us are particularly happy in terms of where we are right now in terms of overall outcomes of our court system, and we certainly saw that, you know, kind of today in terms of the public comment, and some of the stuff that, you know, has happened over the course of the past several months. And that's, you know, a statement that's made without casting aspersions or blame on anyone. I just think

sort of collectively we're certainly at a place where we got to do better for our citizens overall, you know, and do something to re-instill a level of confidence, you know, from our citizens when it comes to sort of -- when it comes to justice outcomes. And I don't think that's for lack of trying. I think we've sought to do a number of things. I think the Project ORCA is a great concept. I think we've got a lot good results out of it, but also within that, I mean, we're still somehow not quite getting to where we need to be; and we've had a lot of data that's been shared with us and that sort of thing. I think it's almost at times sort of too much data. And I think we just need a simple scorecard that we can look at, just tells us sort of how we're doing. And, you know, that old maximum of what gets measured, gets managed, I do think holds true. And this Resolution basically presents sort of five standards for us to ask our management team to update us on monthly, publish them on our website, share with our elected officials, gives us yard markers that we all can sort of look at. And they're aspirational probably in some respects, but they give us the sense of kind of what our progress is. And are we making progress or are we stalling out? I guess this is stuff we can share with our citizens that they can look at. We're all sort of collectively can be transparent about and held accountable for. You know, certainly there is a big monetary component of is. I think, you know, hey, they're taxpayer funds and we've got to certainly exercise great diligence on that. But it certainly well goes beyond money. You know, this matters; the effectiveness matters to people's lives. I mean we've heard that. I mean public safety outcomes, due process for the folks that are accused. Justice for -- timely justice for victims; and we know that, you know, the length of time that somebody spends sitting in a jail just, you know, results in, you know, deterioration and increase recidivism. So I mean, there's just so many reasons for us that we've got to, you know, all commit to working towards a world class justice system. The five measures, there's three of them that are straight out of measures that were promulgated by the National Center for State Courts. That's an independent organization that's been around for 50 years. It got significant, you know, folks with justice experience within that. Those three measures are the clearance rate measure of no less than a hundred percent, which basically, you know, saying, hey, that you're not for the building upon a backlog. So, ideally, we want to see that number at 100 percent or above, certainly in our case over a hundred percent. The two other measures are 90 percent; disposition of felony cases within 180 days, and 98 percent of those within 365 days. And I would tell you too that those are slightly below what the ABA standards are. But those three standards come from the National Center for State Courts. The two other measures, one is average length of stay from no greater than 30 days. We learned from a recent feasibility study that that was a standard for, you know, for well-performing justice systems, and then the last measure is the percentage of the jail population that's unindicted, being at or less than 10 percent. And that number is the number where we were at pre-pandemic. So we know it's a number than we can reach. So that's the content of the Resolution, and I would ask for your favorable consideration of that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Vice Chair. Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'm a bit confused, because I'm sitting here holding all these e-mails that were flying around as it relates to this particular Resolution. And the one that is really confusing to me is the one where Judge Glanville is saying that he spoke to you, Commissioner Ellis, and that you agree to hold this and allow him and those affected parties to meet with you about the Resolution. Was there a conversation beyond this e-mail where you took that back?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yes, I'll speak to that later if you want me, too."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. Because the only thing I see is that they all want to speak to you about this and their concerns with the Resolution, and they expected you to hold it. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne. Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I have a couple of questions for Mr. Adams. On this, what are the current goals and standards that are in place?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "Specifically for Fulton County?"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yes."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "Because what Commissioner -- Vice Chair Ellis is referring to is that there are standards that represent goals established by the association that he's mentioned that have -- that are held up as metrics that should be used to measure how well a court system is performing. We have a lot of that data currently on the website, lots of data, right. And even individual Judge information. And I think what, as I understand, what Commissioner Ellis is trying to do here is to make that a bit more formal. And none of those measures, even though he and I have talked about whether some of the numbers -- the targets are may need to adjusted based on what's going on and what's happened in the system. But the targets themselves, right, clearance rate, the number of cases that get resolved in a one-year period are fairly well-established and well accepted as aspirational goals for a high-performing court system. And what I believe we're talking about is just making it a bit more formal, and have -- and you asking me, right, and we've already talked about this -- to bring that information forward on a monthly basis so that we understand how well we're tracking to those. In my opinion, the ask itself is not a very big departure from the tracking of the information we currently do. What we're going to try to do is hone in on some specific measures that, in fact, represent how these systems -- how these systems should perform."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. So let me make sure I understood that answer."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "Okay."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So basically, you're saying these national standards have been known for a long time, that our justice partners are already trying to do their best to work towards these aspirational goals, I think you called them, and we already do reporting, correct?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "We have data out on the site, that's correct. I will say the last time, for example, we looked at these standards, pre-COVID that instead of us resolving 98 percent of our criminal cases in a 365-day period, we were tracking at 77 percent. When you do that, you automatically create a backlog, and you create a lot of pressure on the system. Now that having been said, I don't believe that you are necessarily calling out the Judges when you say that, we ought to be, as a system, aspiring to that. Because there are a whole lot of factors to play into that, the rate of indictments, right, the types of crimes that individuals are accused with. So, this isn't necessarily calling out any particular part of the system, what they're saying is that as a Fulton County system, which we all share a part of, there are some particular goals that we should be aspiring to in terms of the performance of it. So, I don't know if I'm answering your question. It's a -- but I guess the point is -- and if we were a private enterprise, we would get measured on certain things, right? If we're a cooperation, we'd get measured on did we hit our revenue numbers? Did we deliver on our profitability numbers? Did we, in fact, meet the engagement scores for our employees? All we're saying is setting up the equivalent types of measures for the system that basically takes 30 to 40 percent of our annual budget every year from Fulton County."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Have you spoken, Mr. Adams, to the justice partners who this directly affects?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "I haven't had a conversation with them. I -- you know, this is something that -- let me step back. We have ongoing conversations with the justice partners every single week about a whole number of things associated with trying to improve our system. On any given day, we have 25-30 different initiatives, some of which I've shared with you and members of the Board of Commissioners. I haven't talked to them about this particular resolution. It's not particularly my place, right? It -- but so, I haven't -- I haven't had a conversation with them about this particular resolution. However, these measures and the fact that they are used to, in fact, measure the performance of a court system isn't new to anybody in the justice system."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. There is, in the resolution, there are two items, I believe two that are listed as something we want to be reporting on that are not from the national standards, but rather from the Jail Feasibility Study. One being, average length of stay, and the other being, the unindicted member, I think; is that correct?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "That's correct."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "And I just want to discuss the unindicted number for a moment because it is a complicated number. And we've had a lot of back and forth about the validity of that number and how one calculates that number. And so, if for no other reason, I think that line in the resolution is a no-go for me because I think we need a lot more data. I think just putting that number without explanation or further detail, is telling a story that is not the complete story. And what I mean by that is, as we have heard many times from our various justice partners, there are folks who have multiple charges, and some have been indicted and some have not. So, to be clear on which people we're talking about here, we're not talking about bond here. The people -- there are a lot of unindicted and indicted people who are out because they got bond. And there's people, the people who are in the jail did not get bond, and they did not get bond for a reason. So, unless we're going to also express the reasons why they were not given bond and that they are in jail unindicted, we're not telling the full story of what's going on. So, you know, at the minimum, Vice Chair Ellis, if I were going to even consider moving forward on this, I would request taking that metric off of this report unless -- or changing it to something that is a more complex story. And I'll also add that, you know, I would love to hear your response, not only to that, but to why we're even having this conversation today. Because I, along with Commissioner Hall, was under the impression that this was going to be held because I think there are a lot of our justice partners who would even be here right now if they thought this was going to be discussed. And I think they have a right to be heard on this."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "Commissioner, if I can -- I'm sorry, I'm just going to respond to your comment about the unindicted. That's one of the charts that we were going to bring forward the next -- the next update to you in the next meeting. Because you're correct, these are -- these are complicated things that are interrelated. What we're going to present though, is just basic data that says, for example, pre-COVID, we had about 10 percent of the individuals in our jail who were unindicted. And unindicted meaning, without any other charges, so second clarify -- so, you're right, the definition is important. And today that number is 26 percent. Not blaming anyone, but what we're trying to say is that that -- because that number is so high, what it does is it increases the population because it takes the longer for them to get through the system. So all it says is, hey, one of the things we ought to be looking at or thinking about is how do we measure and how do we look at the unindicted that also has implications for the length of stay and how quickly an individual gets to have their case heard. So that's -- it's really just a measure, here again, are there opportunities for us to press levers to improve the overall performance of the system."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. Well, one more comment on your one more comment, if I may. You know, I think it's also worth noting that the previous District Attorney had a, from my understanding, a practice that involved indicting very quickly based on the information that was passed over to him from the police departments as these cases were being delivered to him. And the current DA has a different process

with intake, in which, she does a full investigation before making an indictment. And I'm looking at you because I'm -- this is sort of an open, correct me if I'm wrong, sort of question. But I believe that that -- a lot -- that there are people that are staying in an unindicted state longer because she's doing a more thorough investigation before making any indictment. And what I have learned through my conversations with her office is that, you know, there were people in, you know, with the previous method who were being, you know, indicted unfairly that were sometimes the victim even. And there were also indictments made in which the investigation was not done thoroughly at the time. And by the time the court -- the case is moved through, the video evidence was gone or the witnesses were gone and those kinds of things. So I believe the DA has put a system in place that is making it look like there are far more indictments. But it's because she's doing the pre-work to make sure we're indicting the right people. Because I think we all know that once you have an indictment on your record, life changes. So in any case, correct me if I'm wrong, sir."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "Well, here again, you know, these are complex topics. And first and foremost, the DA, the Sheriff, the Judges, they're my clients, right, so I'm not trying -- I don't cast aspersions on what they're doing. What I do is present the data, right, in terms of how we can measure our progress. You're absolutely right, the DA is taking a different approach to the way she indicts individuals. That having been said, as we approach 3700 individuals in our jail, potentially, 4,000 by the end of the summer, what we are trying to do is look at any of the levers that could potentially impact that. And indictments are one of those, the types of charges are some of those, the ability to have some of the individuals who are treated for mental health issues and move them to Atlanta Regional are some of those. None of these, in and of themselves, are going to solve the entire problem. But looking at all of them in totality, and maybe, maybe moving the lever on them a bit, will allow us to make some progress. So I think that that's the spirit of what's being offered here. It's not my resolution, right, but I think the spirit of what we're trying to do here is say, are there four or five things we ought to be looking at that represent how well the system is performing. Forget about whose job it is, because it's all of our jobs. And maybe we need to clear that up, we all share responsibility. I share some responsibility, right. So this isn't about pointing a finger, this is about how well are we doing, and can we do better."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Vice Chair Ellis -- sorry, strike that. Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Thank you, Chair. I'm all about efficiency. And as a lot of the public comments made, they said that it seems like we just keep throwing out money and nothing's getting fixed. So I am all about having a simplified just tracking five points, or maybe we can have asterisks or something, where explanations could be made if a number is high at some point. But some way of tracking the money and our investment, so we can show the improvements that are made. I do believe, you know, currently, what is our average length of jail stay, 58 days?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC, PSS: "I haven't looked at it in the last month or so. It's higher than -- here again, higher than certainly it was before. The issues we had with COVID and the increase in the population. And it's moving -- it's moving down, but it's clearly not where we would we like it to be."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Yes. So, I think it'd be great to have monthly data, have it where the public can see it simplified. I watched in previous -- last year, when you give ORCA presentations and the data came differently every time, the charts were different, the individual Judges were laid out. And it was, as a citizen, it was kind of hard to understand. But just having five bullet points and maybe some explanations can be given, pro or for, you know, pro or against a high rate. So -- but I'm open to holding this resolution as well if we need to talk to our justice partners."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "The -- I originally, I was going to, but some of them said that they had no desire to meet, that they saw no value in it. So, I brought it forward. I will be meeting with some of them that did want to meet to further discuss it. I did tell Judge Glanville that I was going to continue -- I was going to most likely bring it forward today. You know, again, and this is not an indictment anybody. These are really just system measurements that you're looking at. It gives you something to track progress. Any measurements have stories behind them, you know, you discuss them -- but whatever. But if you don't see it on paper and really look at it over time, you don't know how you're doing. I mean, this is not, again, it's not -- it's not like casting dispersions on anybody. It's just, give us some simple scorecard mechanisms to look at to see how we're doing and really stack up against that, and ask the questions that we need to ask and have our citizens need to see what they need to see, in the hopes that we get to what is the world-class justice system that we all want. So -- and on the percentage of jail population unindicted, Mr. Adams, you know, just -- you know, annotated that very well. These are without any other charges. And he has that data where they've scrubbed that out in terms of unindicted with other charges and unindicted without any charges. And this would be percentage of jail populations unindicted without any other charges, so."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I want ask -- I'm going to humbly ask that this be held, and the reason why is because I think, in my opinion, here ago -- again, we do a disservice to our legal partners even if we don't intend to. And even though I can support, in theory, what the intended -- the intent of this, based on the amount of calls that I got, and you just said, you were willing to meet. I think given what we saw today, you know, with the family of Lashawn, and given the heartbeat of what we're dealing with, I would question -- and question may not be the correct word. But I would want us to make sure that we're not being me knee-jerked, but we're also not treating our people like numbers. Because at the end of the day, they may be numbers to us, but they're

human beings to someone else. And so, the situation for me personally, is twofold, I want to support, in theory, what you're trying to do, Vice Chair Ellis, because I think I get what you're trying to do. But I also want to make sure that our legal, you know, partners have a say and weigh in on this. And we understand what they say, and take it to heart. So I would humbly ask to hold this until we get the information we need back from them --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Just a minute. Are you -- is that a motion, Commissioner --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "That's a motion to hold."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion on the floor now -- strike that. The motion on the floor currently, is to improve. Substitute motion is being offered by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. It is seconded by Commissioner Hall. Any comments on the motion to hold? All right. Let's vote on the -- I'm sorry, Commissioner Ellis. What's before us now is a motion to hold."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah. I mean, look, I mean, the meeting with people is more about how we're going forward and how we're working towards targets. These targets are already established. I mean, I didn't make these up, right, I mean, these came to us from standard-setting bodies, et cetera. You know, I offered to meet with people. And one of the responses I get is, what is this? Why would I participate? Is this a serious effort to assist in anything? This has no merit. Okay. So I don't know what it behooves me to sit down with an elected official that's offered back that opinion to me. So, you know, I don't really -- they obviously, don't feel that they has value to move forward. This isn't necessarily something that we're telling them they have to do. These are just measurements that we're looking to kind of look at a track and see how we're doing and strike ourselves up against. So, you know, I'm going to meet with the folks who, you know, that offered to meet with me, you know, regardless. So, that's going to take place. But I see no reason not to, you know, adopt this as sort of scorecard measurements we're going to look at. So, I mean, because it's not -- there's no basis for any new, new standards to pull forth. I mean, these are just, again, these aspirational standards, you're tracking yourself against how much progress you're making."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Again, the motion on the floor, substitute motion on the floor is to hold. Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. My concern is that Judge Glanville made it very clear that he has concerns. And I think that in any case before moving forward with approving any type of resolution that we should hear people out who are going to be impacted by this. We're not the ones that have to carry this out, they are,

and we need to hear from them. He said he has concerns. There are others that are going to be impacted by this that have concerns. And even if someone says that they don't want to meet with you, so be it. Eventually, if they're going to have to be a part of it, let them talk to who they want to talk to. But we still need to hear everybody out."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Last comment on this. I mean, I respect our justice partners. These are standards that are out there. It doesn't do us -- there's -- they're not going to change after discussion with them. It's more just about why we may not be at that, right, I mean that was the stuff that Judge Glanville and I talked about, which we'll have further discussion on. This doesn't force them to do anything. I mean, this is just -- all we're asking to do is just to report it to us on a monthly basis at BOC meetings, put it on our website, and share it with them, so that they see what the measurements are, that's it. And I'm more concerned, less about any of our elected officials, I'm most concerned about our citizens. That's what I'm concerned about. And the further we delay, not leaning into this, the more opportunity for harm that exist to our citizens."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion on the floor is to hold. Any other, any further comment? All right. Let's vote on the motion to hold."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open on the motion to hold. And the motion passes; four yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. It's 1:20, colleagues. I will entertain a motion to recess for lunch, Executive Session, where we will discuss items real estate, litigation, and personnel. Let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

(Recess for Executive Session at 1:20 p.m.)

(Back in Regular Session at 2:23 p.m.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Without objection, we will resume the regular order of business. Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "Any items from Executive Session?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Items from Executive Session."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes, Chairman Pitts. Is there a motion to approve the request for representation with conditions as set forth in Item Number 1 of the Executive Session agenda?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "A motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "And is there a motion to approve the request for settlement authority set forth in Item Number 3 of the Executive Session agenda?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "The vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "No further action items from Executive Session."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Madam County Attorney."

CLERK GRIER: "On page ten, Commissioners' full-board appointments. **23-0254**, Hospital Authority of Fulton County Northside, Board of Trustees of the Hospital Authority have submitted the following slate of names for the Board of Commissioners consideration to fill the unexpired term of Dr. Thomas Gable ending April 1st, 2024. Dr. Kenneth Kupke, Dr. Mark Soneshine, and Dr. Jennifer Amerson."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion on the floor is to approve by Commissioner Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Now, I will just report to, we still have not received any information about the operations of that authority. I spoke with Commissioner Ellis. He's going to -- he said he was going to assist in getting information and I, through the County Attorney that I've been requested, that's number one. Number two, the process, though, still is -- the appointment process is that we -- the nominations originate with us and go to them, not from them to us. So I urge us not to approve today, and hopefully, with Commissioner -- Vice Chair Ellis' support we can get some information from this group about what they're doing. Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Just a quick question. Do you -- how do you want us to move forward in terms of coming up with a slate of three names that we can present?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, if you -- if -- well, come up with three names and the Board can choose from the names."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So I think one of the -- I think I'm sort of seconding what you're saying here, supporting what you're saying --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Or, I mean, or you could -- we could accept these are ours and submit them to them, reverse this process, new names. Now, if we follow what the code requires and what the bylaws of the authority require, I will have some names to recommend to the Board."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. So but --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Or anybody could."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So we've sort have been, you know, quote, always doing it this way, or doing it this way for a while. But the real way it's supposed to work is, we present three names, and they choose one of the three. I'm sort of looking at you, Madam County Attorney, but --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's correct. That's correct."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "-- yes?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes. The process is that the Board presents a slate of three to the Hospital Authority."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yeah. And I think, maybe to your point, if we don't have the full picture of what they're doing, how often they're meeting, and what they're working on, it's sort of hard to get somebody, you know, to explain to somebody you're asking to be in this slate of three, what we're even asking them to do. So I think without fully knowing how that organization is operating, the frequency of meetings, you know, the length of time, all that, it's hard to ask somebody to commit to something without knowing what you're asking them to commit to. So, you know, from that perspective, I think we do need more information in order to put, you know, to put together our own slate of three."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah. This raises questions. We can't even get basic information from an entity that bears our name. I mean, that's -- what's going on. Commissioner -- I mean, Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I'm going to stand by moving forward to have them approved today. And this is a summation of names, it's a slate that's put forth by me, you know, with insight and recommendations from them. So, I think we've complied with the way the process works. And then if there are outstanding information that's desired, I would like it written, spelling out of what that information is because that's not been provided to me. And what has been communicated to me is that we have provided with -- they have provided the information that we've asked for. If indeed,

there was a specific written ask that they've not complied with, I would like to see that in writing to me and I will obtain it."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. I'll get that to you, sir."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I'm sorry, Chairman, I did want to speak. Yeah, I don't have a problem with any of these individuals. But I do have a problem with the process. And I -- before I can get behind this, I want the process in writing. I want what our responsibility is and moving forward. Because from what I see, I don't know whether we've been doing it incorrectly, or whether we thought we were doing it the right way or not doing the right way. But I know, having been on this Body going to my third year, sometimes we make an assumption that we're doing something correctly, and we may not be doing it correctly. So if we're not doing it correctly, Madam County Attorney, you can chime in, what is the correct way, and can we get it in writing? Because I really do want this put to bed, but I want us to not keep throwing this back and forth. Do you understand the point I'm making?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes, Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. And we will follow this up in writing. But what I will say is, this is a situation where I believe everyone is correct. The process is that the first step is that a slate of three individuals will be put forward from the BOC to the Hospital Authority. However, because there is no specific guidance on how that slate of three is assembled, and because this body perhaps has limited Hospital Authority experience, the origin of the slate has typically come from -- originally, the suggestions of the names have come from the Hospital Authority itself, because it has more insight into the type of work that it does and the type of background that an individual may need in order to serve. So I believe that's the origin of this practice, which is not prohibited, of having the slate assembled at the Hospital Authority provided to the BOC. The BOC votes whether or not to adopt that slate in order to comply with the only guidance there is as to the procedure, which is the BOC will put forward a slate of three to the Hospital Authority. So, it may be that you would like to have more detailed guidance in terms of where the names would originate, but currently there is no specific guidance on how this slate is assembled. It is officially adopted with -- by the BOC, sent to the Hospital Authority, they may choose one person from there or reject it. If they reject, another slate of three will come from the BOC to the Hospital Authority, and then they must select someone from that second slate."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Okay. Now, I understand that, but Chairman, and here again, this is my opinion, so let me say that first. It has been other boards up here that we have been critical about them not giving us information, not sending in things that we've required or asked of them. And then we either dissolve them or we shut them down. And so I think if that is valid that that is happening, I think that should

be something that's addressed. Chairman, I don't think it's fair to have that of other boards. You're going to say other boards need to send stuff in, they need to do this and all of that, and then you have this particular board that has not. Now, I don't know, I don't handle the correspondence, so let me put that out there. So, I can only go by the information that I have been that they haven't sent in the information. So that needs to be cleared up as well, Chairman and County Attorney. So, I think in a sense of fairness, if we're going to hold other boards to that mantle of making sure, when we make a request and they send it in, we should hold it to this one as well."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Thank you, Chair. On one of the emails where they recommended this slate, Ms. North, who is an attorney for Northside Hospital said if you had any questions, reach out to her. So I reached out to her with the questions. In my understanding, she sits on the board, but not as an attorney, the board has a separate attorney. She just an attorney for Northside. And she said they did it, kind of, as a courtesy to us because we aren't familiar with who needs to be placed on the board, Northside, the type of person and the role that needs to be filled given that there's different gifts on that board. So they put forth the slate of names, that's how they came with the slate of names. And she said it's kind of been legislated that way. Maybe we need to look at some different legislation moving forward. But I looked at it, not as them trying to circumvent us and our authority, but more as to help us provide them with a knowledgeable board member."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote. Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; two yeas, three nays, and one abstention."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. I'll make a motion to hold. Hold it, hold it. Yeah, my motion to holding, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Let's vote on the motion to hold. And I'll comply with Vice Chair's request. Motion on the floor now is to hold."

CLERK GRIER: "The vote is open. Motion to hold passes; four yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "Bottom of page 10, County Manager's Presentation and Discussion item under Health and Human Services, **23-0321**, Senior Services Presentation and request approval of the Senior Transportation Uber/Lyft Program update and implementation."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "And just briefly, oddly, Dr. Roshell is out with COVID. So hopefully, doing better by now, but not back -- not anticipating to be back until Friday. We've worked with Senior Services staff to look at the Uber/Lyft Program. This is kind of one of these things of a victim of our own success. In other words, I think when the Board authorized this substantial amount of subsidy for ridership of Uber and Lyft by seniors, it was an unproven service, or certainly not highly adopted by seniors. Now, it of course, is widely known to be a good service for all consumers. And what you'll see is the demand for is going up exponentially. And more importantly, of course to us, is with the subsidy, which is almost 95 percent of the cost of an Uber or a Lyft ride right now, we will, once again, exceed this budget. So we can't get ahead of the demand and then the budget requirements. About the only -- and we'll present the facts. It will really fall to you, what decision to make, because certainly, we could implement controls that will bring it in under budget or at budget. That though, will keep some people out that otherwise would have rode. Or we could raise the prices, which is the classic way to tamp down demand. But neither of those are not going to bring some pushback from seniors. But you'll see, it's pretty significant. And also, from talking to Anna Roach, we, number one, we do more for senior transportation than any other county metro Atlanta, so historically, we have. That's a good thing. But secondly, they've just been noticed that ARC that FTA, which is the Federal Transit Authority, where this funding comes from, will not allow for Uber and Lyft reimbursements to be part of ARC's commitment to us. So it really is a general fund expenditure. So Ladisa will present the facts, and then seek your -- seek your guidance."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Thank you, Mr. County Manager. Good afternoon, Ladisa Onyiliogwu, Director for the Department of Senior Services. And joining me is our Deputy Director Kweli Rashied-Henry. Today, we will present updates on the Uber/Lyft Senior Transportation Program managed through the Common Courtesy contract and department recommendations. Next slide. The slide deck includes information on program data, ridership, and budget trends, projections, and recommended Board actions. Next slide. Over 5,000 seniors have registered to use this program. In March, 33 percent of registrants or 1,824 seniors scheduled trips. 35 percent of the trips are medical and 65 percent are personal or community trips. A noteworthy data point is that the average monthly trips taken by a senior is 7.4. And the contract allows up to 16 trips per month. Next slide. Page 3 of your slide deck presents program trends regarding ridership volume. Last year in June, our department presented the average trip cost, which was about \$19. In March, the average trip cost was \$21. So this is a 10 percent increase. The monthly ridership increased by 5 percent between January and February of this year. Between February and March of this year, the increase was about 3 percent. But if we use the higher rate as a projection for what could happen absent controls, we project that by year end, monthly ridership could amass to 2,691 riders in November. And this would be reflected in the December invoice. So the graph shows an unduplicated number of projected individual riders based on that 5 percent increase. And this is potentially, a 58 percent increase by year end. Next slide. The fiscal year '23 budget is 3.1 million. 99 percent of that budget is through the general fund. We have spent 39 percent of this year's budget

based on the January through April invoices. Based on the recent invoice of 340,000 and considering the previous slide and 5 percent projections over the next eight months, May through December invoices, we are projecting a deficit of 1.5 million by year end at that 2,691 ridership. Next slide. This gives a visual of our spending trend. The bar graph shows, the anticipated month at 3.1 million budget will be an exhausted. The upward trajectory in spending will be in a perpetual state without constraints. Next slide. This is the final slide and includes Board recommendations. Number one, we can either bring the program back in line with allocated funding for this year. Number two, we can modify the parameters for use and/or a combination of both. The first recommendation is to set parameters at up to eight one-way trips per month, and this is a reduction from the 16 one-way trips. Thirteen ride -- 1300 riders per month, suspend new registrations, implement a \$5 cost share. And if approved by the Board, implement by June. The second recommendation would result in possibly a \$400,000 deficit by year end. We would change the ridership allocation from 16 to eight one-way trips per month, hold the ridership at 1,824, increase the cost share from \$1 to \$5, suspend new registration, and implement controls in June. The third recommendation for your consideration is to establish an eight one-way trip per month allocation, hold the ridership at 1824, maintain the \$1 cost share, suspend new registrations. The fourth recommendation is to maintain the program as is with no controls implemented. And this means that the riders are able to schedule up to 16 one-way trips per month. We could experience a 5 percent monthly ridership that changes. We did just get the newest invoice for April rides, and it's not included in this presentation. But the \$1 cost share would remain the same, and we could possibly have up to 2600 seniors scheduling trips. And that concludes today's presentation."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Questions? Commissioner Hall, followed by Vice Chair Ellis."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you. Thank you for this, we really needed this. The only thing that I couldn't find were hours of operation for this type of transportation. And I would also like to know the hours for all other senior transportation that we offer."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Yes. The hours of operation are Monday through Friday, 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. And it does not include 12 major holidays. And for Transdev, will start a little earlier because of dialysis, probably 7:00 o'clock in the morning through the afternoon for any afternoon appointments. But the primary hours for the second type of transportation is early as --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Wait. You said Transdev starts around 7:00 a.m.?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "It should start around 7:00 for dialysis appointments. And it primarily goes through the end of the day, 5:00 p.m., maybe six if there's an appointment that goes later."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Or 6:00, okay. All right. Because, you know, we have been receiving these extra types of requests for transportation from our seniors. We just recently received one for up to 30 seniors from two locations in the downtown neighborhood to attend an event during the daytime. And they, I think they requested it from you first, and then they caught me on TV at City Hall during a proclamation presentation and verbalized it across the airways, saying we need transportation, and the county needs to provide us with senior transportation. So, I did receive your email saying that we were not able to do that. But I do recall, I want to say sometime last year, when the Mayor started the Midnight Basketball that we received requests from about 15 seniors who wanted to attend Midnight Basketball, and they needed a ride. And that's when we found out that we did not have the transportation to provide that as well. So my question is, are there any efforts to address providing support and services for these types of transportation requests from the seniors?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "The transportation request did come from the city of Atlanta. So --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "You said what, I'm sorry?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "The request that I had received was from the city of Atlanta for the same event for today. I believe it was an Older Americans Month event; is that what you're referring to?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "From the city of Atlanta, who?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "The 30 trips that you were --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "No, I mean, what --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- talking about?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- what department -- was it a department that contacted you?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "There's an event that we partnered with in the past. So to answer your question, are the efforts to work with partners, we have done that in the past. So those were the requests that I'd received to see we could use our transportation service to go to senior high-rises, pick up seniors --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Right."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- and transport them to an Older Americans Month event --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- as a group trip."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "So that was the request that I had received. And we were unable to support that today. Are there efforts? Not currently, because we want to make sure that we are able to fulfill our commitments to seniors who have already scheduled rides either through Transdev or Common Courtesy. But we have been able to collaborate and support some requests in the past. Planning is very important, and the more notice that we had in the past, I think, the greater ability that we were in position to support."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So what type of notice do you need in order to fulfill this type of request?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Notice is one factor. Right now, we wouldn't be able to support that. In a perfect world, I would say, a three-month planning to let our transportation providers know on the bus side. And for Uber/Lyft, I don't believe that conversation is -- we will be able to fulfill that type of request because of today's presentation and the state of play for alternative transportation and our inability to even service all 5,000 that are registered."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I'm just trying to keep the seniors from coming down here. So, I think that we need to figure out a way to try to think of a plan, a future plan for addressing these types of requests. And, you know, it is just -- it's -- we all have our own work that we have to do. And fulfilling the requests that we have right now is just part of the job. So we cannot use that as an excuse as to why we're not planning ahead for things that we see that are arising right now."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Commissioner, point of clarification."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Are you referring to a specific request from a senior or from a partner interested in using county transportation?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I just said --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "I just want to make sure I was answering your question correctly."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Well I said, I was literally at a proclamation presentation at the City, and the seniors blasted across the airways that the County needed to provide them with senior transportation to get to their event. I did not know at the time that it was Older Americans Month because I didn't know what event they were talking about. But they did say it was being held Wednesday morning, I -- that part, they did say. And so, you know, being put on the spot like that, I didn't quite know what the situation was. But they said that they request -- they were requesting it, and they needed it. And then later on after we had the email exchange, I saw where you were saying you got a request that was similar in nature. But these requests are starting to come in. And I think it's something that we need to -- to try to get ahead of before the seniors actually come down here and start getting on this microphone before us, complaining. So we know it's a situation, we know that these are requests that are coming from them. And it would just be best for us to be proactive, yeah."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Thank you, Commissioner."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "You're welcome."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah. It seems like what was being discussed here was more group transportation, which I think was a Transdev contract. But just specific around the Uber/Lyft Common Courtesy Program, right, we were talking about?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Correct."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah, I'm in favor of something like option one. I mean, I think, you -- looking at this, and just having relatives in other areas of the state, which seek out other services. They all had a cost share, and higher than -- it was higher than \$5. It was more like \$10 a trip kind of thing for, you know, for that kind of transportation. So, I think, you know, that's sort of a minimum to me, sort of bid on that would be five to get to something that creates sustainability. And I think, you know, you don't want to contain yourself to a small number of folks given the demand. So I think, in hearing that we've said, the federal partners have said they're not going to support this as a program that they're going to allow federal funding for, right, that's what we've heard from our -- two things I would -- two other things I would suggest or would be interested in to whether y'all looked at, was if in terms of the scope of what the trips were for Common Courtesy because it's -- bear in mind, I believe this started more as an alternative means for -- well, I know this is how it started. It started as an alternative means for people to get to the centers versus using Transdev. And then it expanded, you know, from there into, you know, these other types of trips, you know, that's the way the pilot had originally started, and it sort of, you know, mushroomed out into this. I would be interested to see, you know, we -- have we potentially looked at, not only a co-pay type

mechanism, but also that our trips be focused on either medical or trips to our centers for activities, and what might that look like in terms of allowing for critical access, but also, you know, access that's to our activities that we're seeking to fund or we're seeking to grow participation in. Was that something you had looked at?"

LADISA ONYILOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "We have. The medical trips for the most recent invoice totaled about 4,056. And this is the invoice that I received yesterday afternoon, it's for April services. And so the ridership was 32 percent of that entire invoice. And so that looks like about maybe, 568 riders or so. So that would definitely keep us within the budget. We would have, possibly, an underrun of about 300,000, where we could increase the number if we set the parameters for medical only as an option. And we can go back and test that if needed."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "What about medical only, plus trips to our centers? That's to me -- I mean, to me, that's where we started was trips to the centers. And then it went into medical, then it went into this sort of loosely-defined personal trips, you know. So that's what I'd -- that's what more I'd be interested in is, sort of those two components, you know, I think sort of, one's a basic, you know, critical need, you know, with the medical stuff. And then the other is, you know, increasing participation into programs that we are funding."

KWELI RASHIED-HENRY, SENIOR SERVICES DEPUTY DIRECTOR: "Thank you, Commissioner Ellis. Kweli Rashied-Henry, Deputy Director for Senior Services. And I just wanted to add a little more context to your question. In terms of those community trips, we're seeing things like, going to churches, going to banks, going to pharmacy --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I understand that."

KWELI RASHIED-HENRY, SENIOR SERVICES DEPUTY DIRECTOR: "-- going to salons, right."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah."

KWELI RASHIED-HENRY, SENIOR SERVICES DEPUTY DIRECTOR: "And so, in terms of our alternative goal with this program to make sure that we also are combating against social isolation and making sure that seniors have a place to go in the community, that's something that we're very conscious of as well."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah, I --"

KWELI RASHIED-HENRY, SENIOR SERVICES DEPUTY DIRECTOR: "So, I just want to share that --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "-- understand. Yeah, I understand that context. But that context isn't fund -- isn't something that we can fund on a massive scale the way that it's

set up right now. And that's not the way the program was originally set up. It was set up for trips to our centers, and then it was expanded into medical. And then we got into something that's very loosely defined, and then it's not -- this long term, it's not supportable. I mean, we all know that. So, I think we have to be just, you know, clearly honest about that."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "And thank you so much, Kweli. Because the pilot was through the Friends of Benson."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Right."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "And it was strictly for that center. When the department took it over, then we placed it on the umbrella of the --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I know what we did. But from growing it for that same purpose --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "I know --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "-- trips to the centers. And then it mushroomed out into this. And now, we've got something that's financially not sustainable. I mean, regardless of whether or not it's as good -- this is financially not sustainable."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Agree. Understood. We -- yeah, we --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Right. So, my ask is to say, what would it be -- what would - if you paired it back to trips to centers and medical trips, what would that allow you to be able to do?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Well, I think if we could also entertain the other trip types, and possibly prioritize what will help the senior avoid isolation or premature institutionalization. Is it a trip to a center, or is it a trip to pick up their medicine from a pharmacy? So, we will definitely go back and look at trips to centers, like you said, and --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Right."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- trips to medical appointments. But then we would also like to look at the other trip --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Well, how about a three-tier price --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- types as well."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "You know, how about a two-tier pricing? You know, one set it's \$5 per cost share. And then the other it's basically, a full cost, but we're the facilitator of it, so they don't have to -- so, they've got an easy administrative, you know, piece to it. You know, that's -- you know, it's more like they don't have the ability to do it, they need somebody to do it for them. We could play that, but it needs to be more of a full cost share."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Okay. Sliding scale, almost income based, similar to other counties? Okay. Thank you, Commissioner."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I want to make sure that those that are listening understand that when you're talking about seniors and when you're talking about transportation and when you're talking about isolation and when you're talking about depression and when you're talking about making decisions that we know and understand, here again, I can only speak for my district. And I know, if we, as a Board, take the position that they can only go to the doctor and only go to the senior -- the center that is going to have a devastating effect on my district. And the reason that I can say that with clarity is because I am, not only in my district, but other districts. And I have talked to the seniors and I've talked to the seniors who have dealt with mental health. I know we are in a crunch, but I would like for us to look at all options. If, in fact, the federal funding is off the table, I wanted to make sure that we have went to all of our resources. Because I know for a fact, it is going to be devastating to my district if we put those parameters in place, only to medical and only to the center. Now, let me ask you this, are we saying that mental, they would not be able to go, or does that fall under medical?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Mental health appointments?"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Exactly."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "We would need to come up with a definition for mental --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Exactly. Exactly. So, in this particular case, I would have to really ask that we keep in mind that we have a senior population that is highly at risk. And I do understand when we're talking about sustaining, and I do understand when we're talking about budgets. I'm not going to do it on the back of our seniors, I'm just not. And I would hope that we can task you, as a Body, to look at every possible thing that you can look at. Because I know in my district, it is going to have a devastating affect if we only say to seniors -- I know what was originally planned, and I know the deviation, and I know why. But I, in good conscious, cannot not not voice for our seniors because I know how it affected them, and I know how it will affect them. So,

I'm asking two things. One, have we looked at all funding options? Whether it be state, federal, private, whatever, have we did everything in our power? Because if one senior suffers from this, it will not be worth it. Two, what do we define as medical? Does pharmacy trip fall under medical? Does mental health appointments fall under medical? This is not anything that should be entered into as a widget. And I'm not saying that anybody has taken that position, let me be very clear. Because I think this is something that's important to all these Commissioners. But I will be remiss if I didn't say, for my district, I know it will have a devastating effect. So I want us to make sure that we have looked at all funding sources, we have looked at all partners, and we have looked at the unintended consequences to our seniors, our most vulnerable population, the one that we have had the highest rate of suicide since the pandemic has been in place. And so, here again, I'm going to be passionate about it. And I'm asking for those questions to be answered. Thank you."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "You're welcome."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall. Go ahead."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "No, sir. I was just --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. In case there was any type of confusion about the discussion that we had prior to this, I just want to ask you a question. Would you prefer 30 seniors call the Uber/Lyft line to go to the same event, or would you prefer that they contact us and get one or two larger vehicles to go to an event? Which one is easier and better?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Do the seniors live in the same location?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "To -- go with the two different locations."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "In terms of convenience, it's easier to pick up a senior -- multiple seniors from one location and take them to a second location, so --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "On a bus --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "One vehicle."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- or Uber and Lyft?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "I cannot answer that right now."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "But I believe the bus would probably be best. But I can definitely come back to you --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- and confirm."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I'd like to know."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "In terms of cost --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- 30?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Um-hmm. I'd like to know which is easier. That may help us --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "The bus."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "-- in resolving some issues. But also, you stated that this program -- or should I say, the pilot program started at Benson. And then once we opened it up and spread across the county, needs changed; is that correct?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "We did apply the transportation pilot to meet a different type of need in addition to the senior center trips, yes. So it's to main -- make sure that they can age in place, get to certain appointments, remain active in their communities, yes."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. So that is -- that makes sense because clearly, seniors at Benson would most likely not have the same needs as seniors on the northwest side or the southwest side. They may need more services because they don't have any type of transportation or support. So I would expect, and wouldn't you expect that the needs would probably be even more, they would have more needs than maybe from Benson's standpoint. Their seniors probably didn't need everything that our seniors need. And I want to make sure that -- because I heard some, yes, over here about, you know, we can't afford this. And I want to make it very clear that as far as I'm concerned, I'm elected by the residents to be a voice for the residents. That's why they voted for me. And I will continue to be that voice. And so, this is their tax dollars. This is not our purse strings. This is not our money. This money belongs to the taxpayers. And whatever they say they want to use it for, that's what we're supposed to use it for. So all of this, you know, what we can and can't afford, if the taxpayers tell us that they

want something, then that should be what we're trying to address. And as far as I can see, the seniors' needs are expanding. Ever since the pandemic, all I hear from the different apartment complexes and high-rises and managers of our facilities is that the seniors really want to get out more. Because they were in so long, and they're ready to just do stuff. And so, if that's their need, we need to try to meet it. So I appreciate that you are going to go back and try to figure all this out. I know you have a lot going on in your department. We have a aging population that is huge and still growing. And -- but, you know, if you need some help, that's why we have a budget cycle, budget season. You ask for the help that you need to hire more people. But in the meantime, I really appreciate that you are trying to get ahead of this. Thank you."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Thank you, Commissioner. And there -- we don't define need by geographical locations. Seniors everywhere throughout the county, south, central, north, may have a need to use it. So because of the incubator at the Friends of Benson, we were able to take this great program. And it did definitely meet a need there. It still continues to meet a need, not only there in that part of the county, but throughout. But we definitely will take all of your feedback into consideration."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. We have three more speakers. Now, what's before us, the presentation, which we've heard. Second part of this, request approval of the senior transportation Uber/Lyft Program update and implementation of such. So at some point, the rhetoric is going to have to stop. Madam Thorne, followed by Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "So, when did you roll out the program?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "2019. 2018, it was probably piloted first before it was a department program. But we began tracking it, the numbers, in 2019 for this program."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "And then, what did seniors do before then? Did they just solely rely on Transdev?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "We had one contract for the traditional bus service. And so, seniors who needed to schedule a ride would call our Starline and be assessed. And then if eligible, they would use that one contract."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay. Yeah, because I don't have a senior center in my district. So I'm not familiar with anybody -- not to say that seniors in my district don't use it. But I worked a lot in senior homes in my area. And I know senior services up there -- you know, I worked Meals on Wheels that type of stuff, delivering dog food on Fridays at the end of the month and doing all the daily things. So I saw a lot of seniors, but it seemed like the -- in my area, the community really reaches out to get seniors -- help

seniors in any way they can, repair homes, or do whatever. And the Common Courtesy, the company you use, they're a nonprofit that started for that very thing, correct?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "For supporting seniors, yes."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Supporting seniors. So, if we don't provide, let's say, I wouldn't go just to doctor's appointments and to community centers, maybe essential trips versus having an open slate, they can go anywhere. But would Common Courtesy work with our seniors, especially those that are really homebound to provide additional trips that we can't provide?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "That service is in place for Common Courtesy, so it's outside of our contract. Similar to another contract we have for meals. So, most of the providers that the Board approves have different types of models in place to service the needs of the community."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "So, I can only speak to what our contract --"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Yeah, you can only speak to what you know. But, you know, perhaps Common Courtesy would be willing to -- if we had seniors that are really in need to get places that we can maybe, make that commit -- hire them as a community service partner with a budget that they can manage for that. And then when I was looking over your data for trends, are your riderships higher -- is it seasonal? Is there a seasonal element to it, when the weather is bad or trying to get to a MARTA station might be difficult?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "There is no rhyme or reason to the ridership. There was a high point last August, but then it continued to -- it leveled out at the end of the year. February, was about 1300, but since the fourth quarter of 2022, the ridership has been increasing. There was a slight drop in the invoice that I just received yesterday, which was 1,787 seniors, compared to the 1824 that's in the slide deck and presentation that was prepared before that invoice."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "And is there any type of vetting or limitation to make sure that the -- the seniors that really need it are getting what they need? Do we -- or is it just open, you're over the age of, you know, 60, or is that the age limit?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "We have talked about the most assessment, which is mobility option, supporting senior transport. So our team members do conduct some form of assessment to determine if the Common Courtesy

contract and Uber/Lyft is the best type of service for them or if they would be more better served with the bus service. So there is a form of assessment that is in place."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay. Thank you."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "You're welcome."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So, just to clarify on that point, that's not a needs-based assessment, though, that's a usage-based? Like, you -- I think --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "It's not income based. It's not --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Right."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "It's based -- it's just a question/answer, just asking what their need -- it is needs."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yeah, so it's needs based, it's not financially --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Correct."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "-- based, okay."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Not income based."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I just wanted to clarify that."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Right."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I just have some questions around -- and this is definitely me, as a, you know, four-month in Commissioner. But you talked about the ridership and the, you know, popularity of this service going up. How does that look when you -- at the -- in combination with the Transdev data? Like, is that interest going down? Are there less people using that, or are they both on the rise?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "It is not. Our recent count for Transdev riders is about 663 unduplicated. It supports neighborhood senior center, trips from a senior's home to the center, back to their home, as well as community trips and medical trips. The Common Courtesy contract is just different and unique, because there is a built-in customer experience because of the convenience of scheduling a same-day trip, word-of-mouth has spread. So I think that's probably another reason or a couple factors behind the level -- the popularity in the increase --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yeah, and is there --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- is different from Transdev."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Sorry, didn't want to interrupt you."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Sorry."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "No, no, I was -- my fault. Is there a cost share on the Transdev side or, no?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "No."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So do you think -- I mean -- and I know we're just guessing here a little bit. But do you think if we do the \$5 cost share, are going to see people saying, well, that's more than I want to spend, I'll use the Transdev instead, or is -- or you don't think that -- you think the convenience is going to overshadow that?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "It's difficult to say without conducting a survey of the seniors. I mean, based on demand principles, if the cost share does increase, it may impact the interest in use or -- what we -- what we don't want to do is to cut out those that cannot pay it at all."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Right."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "So we have to consider all of those in place. But would they go from Uber/Lyft to Transdev? We had a process, an exercise a few years back, where seniors who would be better served, were shifted over to the Uber/Lyft program. So, in a sense, what we would be doing is transferring them back and doing that exercise in reverse. And that was not the intent of having two separate, different types of services for seniors."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. And then I'm just -- maybe, I'm the only person who didn't understand this, probably, I am. But what are we -- how are we -- are you looking for us to pick one of these options?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "I am looking for the Board to establish a decision path for our department. And these are your constituents, we serve them, we love them. I just received a testimonial about the program this morning. My task is to present back to you what we're funded, what's happening because controls have not been approved by the Board, and that we need to put in place, or to seek Board feedback to address a potential deficit by year-end."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. The only other question I have just sort of is related to the number of registered senior riders. Because the first statistic I think you

shared was 50 -- or 5.4 registered -- 5.4 thousand registered, but only 33 percent of scheduled trips. Is it the same registration based, or do you have separate registration for Transdev and separate for Uber/Lyft?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Separate."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So, okay. So, of the 70, whatever -- 60, whatever, 7 percent of people that are not using it, is it just that they signed up and decided they didn't need it? Do we know what that number is about?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "This is what's special about the program, seniors pay a one-time registration fee of \$15. Some seniors will sign up for the program because their car is in the shop. And so, it's in the shop for a couple weeks, they use Uber/Lyft, they're still in our database, but they don't need the service anymore. There's flexibility built into the Common Courtesy contract. And I think that's another reason why it's been so popular."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Well, I think the reason I'm asking, I think, is there's a concern on my end that if you shut down new registrations, there -- you may be shutting out somebody who really needs it, or somebody who's currently registered and they're only using it once or twice a year because it's a convenience, but they don't really need it. So that, you know, I'm fine with the cost share going up a little bit to help add -- you know, to help lower the cost. Because, you know, as much as I don't want to limit what the service is, I do think there are people who, for whom \$5 is not a problem. And it would help us be able to do a lot of the other things we need to in the county to not spend additional money. I mean, I think we all understand that, but --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "Commissioner Barrett, may I respond to that?"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Please, of course."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "There may be an opportunity for us as we're defining medical trips, what does that mean? We could consider an idea of a unique rider for that senior, who may need it on a temporary basis, or they may have just been recently discharged from hospital, they can't drive, so they'll need it for a limited amount of time."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yeah. I mean, I would just -- I would just hate to be very, you know, cut and dry about, no more registrants because of budgetary reasons, when, you know -- okay. Well, that was -- that was -- those are really all my questions. I'm sort of curious what my colleagues are thinking about, which option they want to go with here. Because I know you -- some of you have spoken in favor, and I know Vice Chair Ellis, he's spoke specifically about which one you were comfortable with, I think. But I didn't hear anybody else say specific options. So I'm just -- I'm just sort of -- you

know, this is, I think -- to your point, Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, your neighborhood and your community really is going to be hurt if we limit this too much. So I'd love to hear your thoughts on which -- which way to go here."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Let's try and close in on a decision here today. Now, you're asking, you want a decision today, or is there more work you need to do?"

LADISA ONYILOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "We run out of time --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, I'm just saying, now, do you want it today, or do you want more -- because you said you want --"

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "I mean, yes, we would like to get a direction, which is a --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Let's do it. Let's do it."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "-- no controls or some level of control."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Let's do it. You got four on the board and there are others. Four up there, or some other."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So, I guess I technically still have the floor, yes, no?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah, you can still -- go ahead."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Do you have a -- are you recommending one of the four, or are you just -- I mean, I feel like this is the TGI Fridays' menu, like, you're giving us a lot of choices here, so, maybe --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "The choice is not up."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Well, you know, having been a party to this discussion many times over, this four is like a tenth of the number of options that we probably presented to try to control, but provide this service. I mean, it's a -- I think it's a difficult decision. But about the only thing you can do, my belief, is begin to raise the pricing, and let it be self-limiting. If you wanted needs test that further, if you could do that, that's kind of one prime, I guess. But I think all other ones, what ends up happening is, demand's going to continue to increase, generally. And so, these deficits are going to continue to grow. So it really -- but to Commissioner Hall's point, it is a prioritization decision. You can decide that this is more important than other things and push more resources into this. So to me, it's a, if we're doing it managing the budget, then we need to implement some level of either control or price or it will exceed its budgeted amount. And will continue to exceed its budgeted amount."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So we spent about 6 million a year in senior transportation; is that right?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "6.3 million for Transdev, and 3.1 million for Common Courtesy."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So that's nine, nine-something total. Just put it in perspective. All right, what's your pleasure? Continue as we are? Double it?"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What? You still have --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Yeah. I just wanted to ask the County -- the County Manager, I would not have a problem -- I understand the cost share, okay, I get it, I get that. The problem that I have is what do we define, medical versus mental. What do we define as what they can be used for. And as far as the implementation of controls. And that's -- and Chairman, with all due respect that is -- that's a stickler for me. Because if we don't get a clear understanding, or if I don't get a clear understanding, then my phone -- my is already blowing up right now. It's just on silent. And so what I'm asking is, I guess, County Manager, what in your opinion, would be a happy medium today, given my concerns? And I think that Commissioner Hall and even Commissioner Barrett, to a certain extent, those are valid concerns. What could be a happy medium since this is time sensitive? And I know given if I don't -- if I don't -- if I -- we're going to say, they can only go to senior center and they can only go to medical, that's going to have a devastating effect on my district. I can tell you that already. And so, what I would need to know is what would be happy medium, and is there any tinkering or anything that we can actually get today, definite as to what we won't do or what we won't, you know, look at as saying, no to? I guess -- do you understand, County Manager, what I'm saying is that needs to be a little bit more to defined? I'm going to yield the floor to Commissioner Hall. But I'm hoping I'm actually articulating this, because this, I'll be honest with you, this has me scared, it does. It has me scared. And so, I want to be crystal clear that I understand the \$5 cost. And I'm willing to stand behind that and articulate. But the other part of it is going to have a devastating effect on my district, and I want my colleagues to know that."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "None of those scenarios limit -- right, none of them limit trip type. That was just my -- that was just me, that's not in --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "No."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Okay. Vice Chair, don't scare me like that. Okay, thank you."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "But limiting the trip type, you know, potentially takes two-thirds of this out, right. If you limited it to medical, that's a third of the trips. Now, if you expanded the definition of medical to be, which would seem very reasonable to me, behavioral health or even the pharmacy, then I don't know what that number might be. But it would be a significant limitation of this service, and probably make it financially --"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "A little under 600 --"

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "-- sustainable."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Commissioner."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I'm going to -- Commissioner Hall, I'm going to yield to --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. Thank you. So let's go to the funding question. When will we receive the midyear mid-cycle report that tells us about the savings and all of that? Because there was a lot of money requested during the budget and, you know, when you don't immediately hire the people, create the programming and the services, you're literally creating savings. So when do we hear about that?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Commissioner Hall, probably either the first or second meeting in August."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. Oh, that's a long ways off. So, well, but that is -- that is to be considered when we're talking about funding needs because that can offer us a way to have some funding. I would not want us to limit this, limit the trip types. Because as Commissioner Khadijah consistently says about her district, you have to remember that that her district is my former district. So, I know she's literally talking about my constituents that I used to serve. And she is absolutely correct in their needs. And now, with my new district that I used to serve when I was Chief of Staff to my late boss, Joan Garner. Southeast Atlanta seniors need all these types of trips. I mean, you can just look at the senior center that's right by the penitentiary, those seniors are in dire need. So I wouldn't want to see us cut any -- the trip types. But we do need to figure this out. And let me just -- I had a flashback to Commissioner Darnell sitting up here saying how we have to be careful about raising the cost of the seniors. Because \$5 to us might not be a lot, but to a senior who's eating cat food because they're trying to keep their cat with them because that's the love one that they have in their household. And so then and their cat are eating the cat food together because the senior can't afford anything else. I think we need to take those things into consideration when we're sitting up here talking about the difference between a dollar and \$5."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So that's my 2 cents. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Got two more, and I'm going to make a motion after we hear from Barrett and Vice Chair Ellis."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I just want to -- I agree with what my colleagues are saying. But I do -- I do want to say that it does -- there is the free option of Transdev. So for people who really can't afford the Uber/Lyft option, there still is another option. We're not saying, they wouldn't have a ride at all, right. We're just saying, they would have to use the Transdev option, if they can't afford the \$5, is what I'm saying."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "The second contract is there. There are still limitations to both programs --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Sure."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "-- in terms of routes."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. So -- right, so it may not solve everybody's problem in that scenario. And maybe we need to find out, kind of, how many people are going to be affected by a price increase. But putting that aside for a moment, the options that are here, there's only two that show the \$5 increase. So I guess, I'm wondering, if we did just the \$5 increase without the limitation of the new registrants or the limit on the number of trips, and agree that there shouldn't be -- I think it's really too hard to try to legislate where people should be able to go. Because what, you know, what is -- going to church every week, might be what is keeping somebody healthy, or you know, visiting with their family or whatever it is. I don't like the idea of limiting what they can use it for. That said, I do understand the limitation of our money. But if we just did the \$5 and kept, you know, number 4 otherwise except with the \$5 essentially, what does that do from -- to the deficit? I'm not a math leader or I would have done it myself. But is that a number that you all have?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, SENIOR SERVICES DIRECTOR: "No. We had actually crunched -- did we do that -- we did not, Commissioner, but we can do that for you."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Because I guess what I'm thinking is -- and I don't know what your thoughts are on this, Commissioner Hall. But I guess my thinking would be, you know, could we try this in sort of a tiered approach and start with raising the cost share to \$5, and not put any additional limitations and kind of see what our numbers look like, you know, two months -- three months into that, and then sort of assess from there. Or you know, doesn't feel like this should have to be an all-or-nothing sort of moment. And that's just a question."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "Yeah, definitely doesn't have to be an all-or-nothing moment. I mean, I think, again, pricing is the most obvious way, but it's difficult because of the client that we're trying to serve."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Right."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "But we could certainly try that, and then bring -- and I think Commissioners Hall's point, there's also a resource allocation decision that you could make in the next couple of months."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Sure."

DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER: "We're not going to run out of money between now and June/July."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yeah."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I mean that would be my recommendation is just to do the \$5 cost share and see how it goes. If we're losing too many people that are, you know, not getting services, I know you guys are going to get the calls and you're going to know about this -- that and can let us know. So that's what I would say for now."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Is that a motion?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "No, seriously."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Okay. Motion to do just the \$5 for now."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Is there a second?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Second. Second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Properly moved and seconded. Anybody want to say anything? All right. We say we love our citizens -- seniors. And we -- this is going to tell the tale. Motion on the floor is to approve. Which one is it?"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Just the \$5."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just the five --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Just the \$5 increase with no other limitations right now."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Effective June --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Yes, sure. Effective, whenever y'all say."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk. Now, I'll be honest, I'm comfortable with it -- what? I'm comfortable with it where it is."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Commissioner Hall, what did you --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "It's not listed as one of the existing options, Commissioner Hall. It's just, I'm just saying, take -- I'm saying, don't add any other controls, just -- just the \$5 cost share, no other limitations, yeah."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So that's what's before us. And I'll be honest with you, we've talked about how much we love our seniors today. And this is where you prove that."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "So, are you saying this means we don't love them?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I didn't say that. I'm just saying that there's another option. If the \$1 cost share, which is what we have now, is going to mean a \$1.5 million deficit, we can cover that deficit by cutting out some other foolishness that we fund."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "We're using the same -- (off-mic.)"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's correct. You got other options."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "All right. Well, then I'll -- I'll take my motion off the floor."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, you -- is there -- Commissioner Thorne seconded your motion, she'll have to remove her second."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Well, we can't -- don't even have the buttons, so we can't do it."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Commissioner Ellis seconded."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Seconded, this is a --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "On the board."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Ellis."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Oh, you did the -- okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Y'all let me provide -- provide -- preside, we'll get through this."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Go ahead, Chairman."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "The motion made by Commissioner Thorne, it was seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Now, you want to remove your, motion to approve, but the in order for that to happen, Commissioner Ellis has to withdraw his second."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I'm not down here as a second."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "No, it's --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "This is not correct, what's on the -- Commissioner Ellis --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I already voted, so --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I already pressed my button, so, I can't remove anything. I'll say, the vote -- put the vote on the floor, and then you can something else you want to vote on if it fails."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

CLERK GRIER: "Okay. I understand. But Commissioner Thorne hit the button first. But do you want her to have it as --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "The motion -- it's -- so, just a minute. Just a minute. Just a minute. Clear this."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Clear it."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Because if I had my way, we wouldn't use the machine anyway. We would have been gone by noon. But we have to be stuck with the machines."

CLERK GRIER: "So you want the motion --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Clear the machines."

CLERK GRIER: "-- cleared, so there's no motion on the floor."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No motion on the floor. Now, your motion --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I withdraw my motion."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "And I withdraw my second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Then I'll make a motion. Mr. Ellis, you want to make a motion? I'll make mine. All right. Well, I'll --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "So, are you just saying that you want to -- you what to absorb the one and half million?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "So, what we're going to do, I'm going to cut a million and a half dollars of the stuff y'all allocated last week?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Or some other stuff, yeah."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I'm not comfortable approving something that we've not identified where the cuts are going to come from."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, my motion --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And I'll take this opportunity to make a motion. My motion will be to keep it where it is, which would be --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Are we going to holler it out, or we're going to press the button?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I'm going to put -- so they understand the motion. Just minute, everybody. Just a -- we're going to vote on the machine. I'm recommending number 4, that's outlined here, which would result in a \$1.5 million deficit. It keeps the fare at \$1 cost share, which is what it is now. And I'm suggesting that that \$1.5 million deficit, we can find that other places in the budget. That's pretty straightforward. Now, that's my motion. Is there a second?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Press your button. She pressed her button. Okay, there we go."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's a -- yes."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay. It's 1.5 million, but the trend is it's been escalating. Because at \$1, it's a popular program. And I think it's going to be 1.5 this year, it's going to be 3 million the next year --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner --"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "-- it's just going to grow in popularity unless we try -- constrain the program. And the sooner -- I was in for the price increase because --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "You can't constrain need."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Just a minute. Just a minute. We have motion on the --"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Well --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "-- we're saying --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne, you have the floor. Let me get her to let you talk."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "So, I think if we -- if we just do the raising of the price, due to basic supply and demand, your demand is going to down because your price has increased. People might think a second thought of, oh, it's not costing me a dollar, it's costing me five, maybe I better not, you know, go to Midnight Basketball tonight, or whatever. But I do think that Common Courtesy will step in, being a nonprofit that they are, to help seniors. And I think that's a natural response to people in need. It should be taken advantage of. So I think a simple raising of the price, okay, so maybe not five, maybe five's too big of a jump, let's do three. I believe that's what DeKalb County does with their --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So, you're speaking against my motion to approve --"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Um-hmm. I'm speaking against your motion to approve."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. That's fine. That's fine."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Offer a substitute."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I offer a substitute to do a \$3 increase."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Is there a -- she wants make a substitute motion for \$3. Is there a second to that?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Properly moved and seconded. You've heard the substitute. I hope you'll vote against the substitute and go back to the main motion, which is number 4. Let's deal with the substitute. No, we haven't got there yet. This is on the substitute motion. No. We haven't got -- it's not -- please, I know it's late. Y'all can't be this tired. Commissioner Thorne made a motion, take it \$3, it was seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Let's dispose of that on the screen. I hope you'll vote against that."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "You're jading the vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; two yeas, three nays, one abstention."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Now, back to the main, which is to approve number 4, which was \$1 cost share, which will result in a \$1.5 million deficit. This keeps the program as is."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And new registrants?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes. All of that, as is."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "Back on the Consent Agenda on page 3, Commissioner Thorne -- I'm sorry -- Commissioner --"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I asked to pull it off."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Barrett removed item **23-0292** for separate consideration. Administrative Hearing Officers, Commissioner Thorne has nominated Alex Kaufmann and Kurt Hilbert for appointees -- appointments to two-terms."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Colleagues, I asked --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Clear the machine, please. Go ahead Commissioner, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Good. Colleagues, I asked to pull this off the Consent Agenda because, while I acknowledge that we normally, sort of grant each other courtesy of just accepting each other's appointees, the two people that Commissioner Thorne has appointed to this are very high-profile people. Alex Kaufmann and Kurt Hilbert were both legal counsel for Donald Trump in his lawsuits challenging Georgia's elections, and were both on the January 2nd call between Donald Trump and Brad Raffensperger, in which Trump asked the Secretary of State to find over 11,000 -- to find over 11,000 votes. The January 2nd call is the subject of the Fulton County DA's current investigation into whether Donald Trump and his legal team, and his legal team, attempted to criminally interfere with the 2020 election. I believe that appointing these two people to paid positions of authority in Fulton will be disruptive to the business of the county. And I do not want us to be in a position to have to defend this choice. So I'm going to vote, no, on these appointments. And I hope you -- my colleagues will join with me with a, no, vote on this."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Okay. You know, I got the information. I've been in Washington, and when I got in late evening, my calls and emails were being blown up about this. And I decided to do my own investigation. And these individuals, however, they may be qualified. But I remember when Rodney Littles was put forward and this Board did not want Rodney Littles to be my district appointment because there was an ongoing investigation. Now, the investigation wasn't -- was never of Rodney Littles. The investigation was of somebody else. But the fact that it was an investigation going on, was enough for this Body to say, hey, we need to not touch this. This appointee, we're not going to do it. So we got to -- if we're going to do it for one situation, we need to be fair and do it for all. And so, if there's an investigation going on in any way, shape, or form, and these individuals' names are loosely or tightly connected, I don't know. I would rather for that investigation to be over, and then one the investigation is over, then that to be presented. Because you can't have one set of rules for one Commissioner and have another set of rules for another Commissioner. And so, what I would say, since there is an investigation going on, now, that's one thing that I did verify by 8:00 a.m. this morning that there is an investigation going on, and the names have come up. And so, unfortunately right now, with all due respect, because I know that district appointments are honorable and they should be honored. But in this case, I'm going to have to say, I can't support this nomination at this time."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "So, Rodney Littles, I wasn't here for that. The fair and do it for all, I believe we appointed somebody to the Beltline Tax Allocation District that had been disbarred. But we gave him a chance. I don't want to disparage anybody by mentioning by name. The Constitution provides the right for counsel. And Fulton County Defender's Program does that every single day. Both of these Judges are well known and have an AV rating from Martindale-Hubbell, a peer review from attorneys

and judges. That's the highest peer rating standards that you can get. This is given to attorneys who are ranked at the highest level of professional excellence for their legal expertise, communication skills, and ethical standards by their peers. Both of these were witnesses and both did not receive target letters in the Trump special grand jury by Madam DA Fani Willis. These lawyers don't necessarily represent the view of their clients, they represent in legal matters. Alex Kaufmann was never counsel of record in any of the cases that were mentioned. Kurt Hilbert was named counsel and his law firm was established in Fulton County in 2009 in my district. They're lifelong residents of Fulton County. They are extremely prominent community members in my district. Can list a few honors that -- I mean he's got a plethora of -- Mr. Hilbert's got a plethora on his resume of things that he does for small businesses. He was a Georgia Super Lawyer in 2021. He was America's Top 100 Civil Defense Litigators in 2020 and 2021. He's an ALM Legal Leader. He's America's Top High-Stakes Litigators, 2019 through '20. Best Attorney in North Fulton, 2014 to '20. He's a Georgia Rising Star Super Lawyer in 2009, 2011, 2014. He was a finalist Small Business Person of the Year Award, Greater North Fulton Chamber, 2016. He's a Certified Civil Trial Advocate, National Board of Trial Advocacy; a Certified Mediator, Supreme Court of Georgia; Certified Neutral Georgia Office of Dispute and Resolution; Georgia Trial Lawyers Association, Real Property Section; Georgia Bar Association, Trial and General Practice Sections; Georgia Bar Association Board Member of Brookfield County Club Board of Governors; Board Member, The Cottage School, which serves kids with disabilities; North Fulton Chamber of Commerce, a Member of Roswell, Inc.; a former President Board Member of Homestretch, one of our community service partners of Roswell; a former President of the Roswell Attorney Project RAP, R-A-P, a 501c3 nonprofit; and the founder of Hilbert's Heroes. These gentlemen, both of them, I reached out to them and said, sure. I later came back and said, hey, I think you get paid. So they aren't doing it for money, they're doing it out of, they have a heart for the people Fulton County. They have both served the people of Fulton County. They are admired by all of the residents in Roswell. I also want to say that this role, being an Administrative Hearing Officer, is not political in any stretch or form. These individuals play a pivotal role in resolving administrative cases related to classified employees, who may have been either suspended, demoted, or dismissed from their positions. And I believe these people deserve the best that we can give them. And these are both really good men and leaders in our community. And I hope that my colleagues will realize that and know their hearts and minds that they've been in my community for decades serving the community. And I would hope you allow them to serve the employees of Fulton County. Yeah, motion to approve."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Is there a second? All right. Commissioner Abdur -- motion on the floor now is to approve. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Chairman, I'll be brief. When my appointee was put forward, the difference is, you had an opportunity to say something then about his disbarment. He went through a process here, he went through a lengthy process at the City Council with full unanimous vote. And so it -- it would behoove me as to why you didn't say anything then, because clear -- clearly, you could have said something

then because I'm saying something now. I'm not disparaging these gentlemen character. I said that, but I could not, in clear conscious, vote for them until whatever litigation that they may or may not be a part of is over with. So let me be crystal clear that this is not a tit-for-tat with anyone. And this is not to disparage those individuals. But clearly, this Body in previous, has said, okay, if there's an investigation, if there's anything that looks or hints like an investigation, we should wait to an investigation is going -- is over with. And so it is in that spirit of what this Body has done previously that I'm bringing up that if we're going to do it for one, we need to do it for everybody. So that is not to say anything political about these people, that's not anything to say that these are bad people. We can't have one set of rules for people on one side of the county, and one set of rules for people on the other side. And so, it is that reason only that I cannot, at this moment, support. That does not mean that once it is over with that I won't. And I want you to be crystal clear, since you decided to bring up the disbarment, which you could have decided to bring that up when it happened. And so please understand, note taken. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I didn't bring it up because it happened ten years ago. And I figured that he was a good appointee. But I'm bringing it up now because we had somebody with a past, he was disbarred as a lawyer. And neither one of these are under investigation right now. And if you're going to pass some high bar that they might be at some point under investigation, then I'm probably not qualified to be a Commissioner up here."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "No, kidding."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Because to this day, I might get called, being as someone who complained before the election to the Secretary of State, before I know who won or lost, because you -- because I was an eyewitness and I testified at the Senate Hearing, you're saying that I wouldn't be qualified to be a Commissioner. So, I take that to heart. I just hope that we can move beyond this and look at these men that decided to step up. And they didn't really need to be paid. They just step up because they want to help our community."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Other comments? All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Cast your vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; two yeas, two nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "No further items."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. No further matters to come before us today, we are adjourned. Thank you."
(There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:57 p.m.)