# FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS RECESS MEETING



November 15, 2023 10:00 AM

Fulton County Government Center Assembly Hall 141 Pryor Street SW Atlanta, Georgia 30303



# **MINUTES-RATIFIED**

This document has been ratified or approved by the Board of Commissioners, and is not binding on the County or any officer.

Ratification Date: December 20, 2023

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Robert L. Pitts 10:01 a.m.

**ROLL CALL:** Tonya R. Grier, Clerk to the Commission

Robert L. Pitts, Chairman (At-Large)

Bridget Thorne, Commissioner (District 1)

Bob Ellis, Vice-Chairman (District 2)

Dana Barrett, Commissioner (District 3)

Natalie Hall, Commissioner (District 4)

Marvin S. Arrington, Jr., Commissioner (District 5)

Khadijah Abdur-Rahman, Commissioner (District 6)

PRESENT

PRESENT

**INVOCATION:** Reverend Clifton Dawkins, Jr., County Chaplain

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Recite in unison

#### **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

PLEASE SWITCH ALL ELECTRONIC DEVICES (CELL PHONES, PAGERS, PDAs, ETC.) TO THE SILENT POSITION DURING THIS MEETING TO AVOID INTERRUPTIONS.

IF YOU NEED REASONABLE MODIFICATIONS DUE TO A DISABILITY, INCLUDING COMMUNICATIONS IN AN ALTERNATE FORMAT PLEASE CONTACT THE OFFICE OF THE CLERK TO THE COMMISSION. FOR TDD/TTY OR GEORGIA RELAY SERVICE ACCESS DIAL 711.

#### **CONSENT AGENDA**

#### 23-0796 Board of Commissioners

Adoption of the Consent Agenda - All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Recess Meeting Agenda for separate consideration. (ADOPTED AS AMENDED)

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to adopt as amended by removing item #23-0810 for separate consideration as requested by Commissioner Thorne. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Hall

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

#### 23-0797 Board of Commissioners

Proclamations for Spreading on the Minutes. (SPREAD ON THE MINUTES UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

Proclamation recognizing "Lou Gossett, Jr. Appreciation Day." (Pitts) November 4, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Georgia Military Veterans Hall of Fame Appreciation Day." (Pitts)

November 4, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Shrine of the Immaculate Conception Appreciation Day." (Pitts)

November 5, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Operation Green Light for Veterans Appreciation Day." (Thorne/Abdur-Rahman)

November 6, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Student Leadership Johns Creek Appreciation Day." (Thorne)

November 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Alpharetta High School Girls Volleyball Championship Team Appreciation Day." (Thorne/Pitts)

November 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Bone Crusher Appreciation Day." (Hall) November 11, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Joseph L. "Jerry" Moore Appreciation Day." (Abdur-Rahman)

November 11, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Elgintine Dudley Appreciation Day." (Hall) November 12, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Transitioning Our Heroes Appreciation Day." (Hall) November 13, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "South Fulton Retired Educators Appreciation Day." (Arrington)

November 16, 2023

### **Commissioners' District Board Appointments**

#### **23-0798** Board of Commissioners

ANIMAL WELFARE HEARING BOARD (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

The Animal Welfare Hearing Board shall consist of seven (7) members appointed by the Board of Commissioners. Each Commissioner shall appoint one member to serve for two years. Thereafter, all members may be appointed for an additional term of three years and until their successors are appointed.

Term = 2 Years/3 Years

Term below expires: 12/31/2023

Laurel-Ann Dooley (Hall)

Commissioner Hall nominated Laurel-Ann Dooley for a District reappointment to an unexpired term ending December 31, 2026.

#### 23-0799 Board of Commissioners

# FULTON COUNTY REPARATIONS TASK FORCE (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

The Reparations Task Force shall have the following members: Each Commissioner shall appoint two (2) members, for a total of 14 members. Each member shall be a resident of Fulton County at the time of the appointment. A member shall serve for a two-year term and subject to removal by the appointing Commissioner for cause. No member's term shall exceed that of the appointing Commissioner but shall remain as a voting member until replaced or reappointed by the successive Commissioner.

Term = 2 Years

<u>Term below expires</u>: 12/31/2023 Karcheik Sims-Alvarado (Hall)

Commissioner Hall nominated Karcheik Sims-Alvarado for a District reappointment to a term ending December 31, 2025.

#### 23-0800 Board of Commissioners

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY AFFAIRS (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

The Commission on Disability Affairs shall consist of a total of sixteen (16) members to serve staggered two (2) year terms and appointed as follows:

Each member of the Board of Commissioners shall appoint two (2) members; one of them said appointees shall have an initial term, of one (1) year; No term of any member shall extend beyond the term of the District Commissioner who appointed the member to serve on the Commission for Disability Affairs; The Commission on Disability Affairs shall appoint two (2) members, who receive the consent of the majority of the members of the Commission on Disability Affairs and one (1) of the appointees shall have an initial term of one (1) year.

The Commission on Disability Affairs appointees shall be made for the purpose of maintaining diversity.

Term = Staggered two (2) year terms

<u>Term below expired</u>: 12/31/2022 Kenneth Haider-Bardill (Hall)

Commissioner Hall nominated Elaine Osby for a District appointment to a term ending December 31, 2024.

# Development Authority of Fulton County TEFRA (Tax Equity Fiscal Responsibility Act)

#### 23-0801 Board of Commissioners

Execution by Chairman Robert L. Pitts of a TEFRA (Tax Equity Fiscal Responsibility Act) for documentation pertaining to the proposed issuance of its Development Authority of Fulton County Georgia Tech Facilities Revenue Bonds, Series 2024, in an amount not to exceed \$65,000,000.00 (the "Bonds").

#### (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

#### **Open & Responsible Government**

#### 23-0802 Human Resources Management

Request approval to renew an existing Independent Contractor Agreement between Fulton County and E. Anthony Daniels, P.C., to provide legal counsel/representation to the Grievance Review Committee in the amount of \$35,098.00. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024 through December 31, 2024. (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

#### 23-0803 Finance

Ratification of October 2023 Grants Activity Report. (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

#### **Arts and Libraries**

# **23-0804** Library

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Fulton County Library System - 22ITB0210B-EC, Shelf-Ready Foreign Language Books for Adults in the amount of \$36,520.00 with Multi-Cultural Books and Video (Madison Heights, MI) to provide foreign language books in multiple languages to all 34 library locations. This action exercises the second of three renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, to December 31, 2024. (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

# 23-080<u>5</u> Library

Request approval of a Resolution to accept the donation of an outdoor bench honoring former Roswell board volunteer member David James Lyon. Mr. Lyon has been a permanent fixture in the Roswell community working on development projects such as Southern Post and City Green. (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

#### **Health and Human Services**

# **23-0806** Department for HIV Elimination

Request approval of a Business Associate Agreement between Fulton County and CAI for the sharing of Protected Health Information. To protect the interest of the County, the County Attorney is authorized to approve the Business Associate Agreements as to form and substance and make any necessary modifications thereto prior to execution by the Chair. (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

# **Infrastructure and Economic Development**

# 23-0807 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a Sewer Easement Dedication of 9,755 square feet to Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, from Pulte Home Company, LLC for the purpose of constructing the Briar Creek Subdivision Project at 0 Butner Road, South Fulton, Georgia 30349. (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

# 23-0808 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a Resolution approving a first amendment to a lease agreement between Fulton County, Georgia (Landlord), and Comcast Cable Communications, LLC (tenant) for the purpose of extending the lease term at 10735 Jones Bridge Road, Alpharetta, Georgia 30202; to authorize the Chairman to execute the First Amendment to Lease Agreement and related documents; to authorize the County Attorney to approve the First Amendment to Lease Agreement as to form to make modifications thereto to protect the interests of Fulton County; and for other purposes. (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

# 23-0809 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a Sewer Easement Dedication of 16,044 square feet to Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, from Stonewall Tell Home Builders, Inc., for the purpose of constructing the Sandtown Falls Phase 2 Project at 0 Campbellton Road, South Fulton, Georgia 30331. (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)

#### **Justice and Safety**

# **23-0810** District Attorney

Request approval to process outstanding and current invoices via purchase order, District Attorney, in the amount of \$79,234.26 with H&M Development and Management, LLC dba Decatur Atlanta Printing (Decatur, GA) for providing printing services for the preparation and operation of materials for the Office of the District Attorney. Effective upon BOC approval. (APPROVED)

# ITEM REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA FOR SEPARATE CONSIDERATION AS REQUESTED BY COMMISSIONER THORNE

A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Thorne, Ellis, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Pitts

#### **RECESS MEETING AGENDA**

#### 23-0811 Board of Commissioners

Adoption of the Recess Meeting Agenda. (ADOPTED AS AMENDED)

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to adopt as amended by moving up items #23-0788 as requested by Commissioner Barrett, #23-0832, #23-0779 as requested by Chairman Pitts; removing item #23-0833 as requested by Commissioner Arrington; adding item #23-0839 to the Recess Meeting Agenda with a super majority vote and moving it up as requested by Commissioner Thorne . The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Arrington

**Did Not Vote:** Hall

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington to remove item #23-0833 from the Recess Meeting Agenda.

Motion failed for a lack of a second.

#### 23-0812 Clerk to the Commission

Ratification of Minutes. (RATIFIED)

Recess Meeting Minutes, October 18, 2023 Regular Meeting Post Agenda Minutes, November 1, 2023

A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to ratify the meeting minutes. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Hall

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts, and Arrington

# 23-0813 Board of Commissioners

Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. (PRESENTED)

Proclamation recognizing "Pancreatic Cancer Awareness Month." (BOC)

Proclamation recognizing "Hammonds House 35th Anniversary Appreciation Day." (Hall/Arrington/BOC)

Proclamation recognizing "Heaven Billboard #1 Gospel Airplay Appreciation Day." (Arrington)

Proclamation recognizing "Coy Dumas, Jr. Appreciation Day." (Abdur-Rahman)

#### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

#### 23-0814 Board of Commissioners

Public Comment - Citizens are allowed to voice County related opinions, concerns, requests, etc. during the Public Comment portion of the Commission meeting. Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, whether such persons are commenting in-person, via emails or via Zoom or other electronic media (i.e., phone call). Non-Fulton County citizens will only be heard after all in-person Fulton County citizens, representatives of business and organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, have been heard and the time allotted for public comment has not expired, except as otherwise provided in this code section. County staff shall verify the residency of each public speaker prior to such person being heard by the board. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. Members of the public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The Public Comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes at the Regular Meeting, nor will this portion exceed thirty minutes at the Recess Meeting. In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Similarly, written comments (that were timely submitted) not previously read, may be read at the end of the meeting. For more information or to arrange a speaking date, contact the Clerk's Office. (CONDUCTED)

41 Speakers: Deirdre Orange (Salary Increase); Dustin Rutledge (Salary Increase); Mekeal Hadley (Salary Increase); Jennifer Bell (Salary Increase); Shane Johnson (Salary Increase); Robert Thompson (Arts Funding); Darius Bowdry (Business Funding); Prophet Curtis Martin Hairston (Homelessness); Julie Allen (Item #23-0839); Lee Foster (Arts Funding); Stephanie Owens (Arts Funding); Oronike Odeleye (Arts Funding); James Caldwell (Arts Funding); Rachel May (Arts Funding); Rodney J. Simpson (Arts Funding); Natasha Rice (Arts Funding); RA Bivins (Arts Funding); Malika Garrett (Arts Funding); Anne Dennington (Arts Funding); Joseph Wilson (Property Taxes); Jennifer Dobbs (Arts Funding); Leonard Morrow (Removal of Member); Lolita Grant (Removal of Member); Barbara Duffy (Removal of Member); Tanray Garcia (Removal of Member); Hank Harper (Removal of Member); Andy Patterson (Removal of Member); Debra Allen (Removal of Member); Antavius Weems (Removal of Member); Michael Collins (Fulton County Jail); Donna Nunn (Arts Funding); Collins Desselle (Arts Funding); Tiffany Felix (Arts Funding); W. Imara Canady (Arts Funding); Doree Henry (Arts Funding); Kathleen Bertrand (Arts Funding); Waverly T. Lucas II (Arts Funding); Amari Franklin (Arts Funding); Ficara Akins (Arts Culture); Dr. Aduke Aremu (Arts Funding) and Kenya Mitchell (Arts Funding)

2 Emailed Comments: Steve Kramer (The Library System) and Ivan Crosling (Retention Ponds)

#### **COUNTY MANAGER'S RENEWAL ITEMS**

#### **Arts and Libraries**

# **23-0815** Library

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Library, 21RFP0210B-EC Shelf-Ready Books for Shelf-Ready Books for Adults with Baker and Taylor, LLC, (Charlotte, NC) in the amount not to exceed \$800,000.00 with Baker and Taylor Inc to provide adult, young adult, and children's books, and adult best-selling lease books. Effective January 1, 2024 to December 31, 2024. This action exercises the third of four renewal options. One renewal option remains. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve items #23-0815 through #23-0821. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Abstain:** Arrington

# **23-0816** Library

Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$203,450.00 between the University of Georgia Cooperative Extension and the Fulton County Board of Commissioners to continue to provide research-based education in the areas of Agriculture and Natural Resources, Family and Consumer Sciences, 4-H and Youth Development to Fulton County citizens. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve items #23-0815 through #23-0821. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Abstain:** Arrington

#### **Health and Human Services**

#### 23-0817 Public Works

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Public Works, 22RFP134460K-JAJ Professional Services for Airport Consulting and Engineering Services Design/Engineering/Construction in the amount of \$715,000.00 for the Fulton County Executive Airport - Charlie Brown Field with Michael Baker International to provide design, engineering and construction inspection services for updating, modifying and implementing the Capital Improvement Plan at Fulton County Executive Airport - Charlie Brown Field. This action exercises the first of four renewal options. Three renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve items #23-0815 through #23-0821. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Abstain:** Arrington

#### 23-0818 Public Works

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Public Works, 22ITB075A-KM, Sewer Line Chemical Root Control Services in the amount not to exceed \$349,996.36 with Duke's Root Controls, Inc. (Syracuse, NY), to provide sewer system chemical root services. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve items #23-0815 through #23-0821. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Abstain:** Arrington

#### 23-0819 Public Works

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Department of Public Works, 21ITB081321K-CRB, Standby Miscellaneous Construction Wastewater System Services in a total amount not to exceed \$12,700,000.00 with (A) Site Engineering, Inc. (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$3,300,000.00; (B) Wade Coots Company, Inc. (Austell, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$3,200,000.00; (C) Sol Construction, LLC (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$3,100,000.00; and, (D) Kemi Construction Company, Inc. (College Park, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$3,100,000.00 to provide standby miscellaneous construction wastewater system services. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve items #23-0815 through #23-0821. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Abstain:** Arrington

#### 23-0820 Senior Services

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Senior Services 23RFP137278A-CJC, Comprehensive Nutrition Services in an amount not to exceed \$2,628,672.92 with Open Hand Atlanta (Atlanta, GA) to provide congregate and home delivered meals, meal delivery, nutrition education and nutrition counseling for Fulton County residents aged 60 and above. This action exercises the first of four renewal options. Three renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve items #23-0815 through #23-0821. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Abstain:** Arrington

# **Justice and Safety**

#### 23-0821 Medical Examiner

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Medical Examiner's Office, 22ITB135453C-MH, Pickup and Removal of Deceased Remains in an amount not to exceed \$168,000.00 with Thompson Mortuary Services LLC. (Atlanta, GA) to provide pickup and removal of deceased remains services. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve items #23-0815 through #23-0821. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Abstain:** Arrington

#### **COUNTY MANAGER'S ITEMS**

#### **Open & Responsible Government**

#### 23-0822 Finance

Presentation of FY2024 Proposed Operating Budget. (HELD)

# 23-0779 County Manager

Request approval to increase the spending authority in an amount not to exceed \$1,646,735.00 with A & A All County Monitoring Services, Inc. (Lawrenceville, GA) to continue to provide electronic (ankle) monitoring and services for defendants eligible to be released pursuant to the electronic pretrial release and monitoring program. Effective upon BOC approval. (HELD ON 11/1/23) (APPROVED AS AMENDED)

- a. A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. **(NO VOTE TAKEN)**
- b. A substitute motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Chairman Pitts, to approve as amended by not adding new individuals, re-bid the contract, and revisit the program; with a friendly amendment by Commissioner Thorne to cap the number of individuals at 1,518. The motion passed by the following vote:

Commissioner Thorne offered a friendly amendment to include a limit on the number of individuals on the program.

Vice-Chairman Ellis did not accept the friendly amendment.

Commissioner Thorne amended her friendly amendment to cap the number of individuals at 1,518.

Vice-Chairman Ellis accepted the amended friendly amendment.

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Barrett, and Arrington

**Abstain:** Hall

# 23-0823 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of a statewide contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, SWC# 99999-001-SPD0000100-0083, Office, Computer and Educational Furniture in the total amount of \$320,872.68 with Spacesaver Storage Systems, Inc., dba Patterson Pope, Inc. (Fort Atkinson, WI), to provide delivery and installation services for new Evidence Storage Locking Systems for the Fulton County District Attorney's Office. Effective upon BOC approval. This is a one-time procurement. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Ellis

# 23-0824 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 23ITB073123C-MH, Elevator and Escalator Maintenance Services in an amount not to exceed \$400,000.00, with Mowrey Elevator Company of Florida, Inc. (Marianna, FL), to provide on-site preventive and corrective maintenance services for all passenger and freight elevators in Fulton County facilities. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with two renewal options. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts, and Ellis

#### **Health and Human Services**

#### 23-0825 Public Works

Request approval of a recommended proposal - Public Works, 23RFP052223K-JA, Design-Build Services for Camp Creek Water Reclamation Facility in the amount of \$9,725,000.00 with Reeves Young/GMC, JV to provide design-build services for the Camp Creek WRF North Plant. Effective upon issuance of the Notice to Proceed for seven hundred (700) consecutive/calendar days. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Ellis

#### 23-0826 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 23ITBC139448A-JWT, Truck Mounted CCTV Sewer Pipe Inspection System, in an amount not to exceed \$240,183.13 with Schwalm USA LLC, (Greenville, SC), for the purchase of one (1) truck mounted CCTV sewer pipe inspection system effective upon BOC approval. This is a one-time procurement. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Ellis

#### 23-0827 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 23ITB08012023A-JWT, Water Quality Monitoring in the amount of \$100,512.00 with Integrated Science Engineering, Inc. (Newman, GA), to provide water quality monitoring services. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with two renewal options. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Ellis

## 23-0828 Public Works

Request approval of a Contract Item Agreement (CIA) between Fulton County and the Georgia Department of Transportation (GDOT) for the adjustment of 6 sanitary sewer manholes associated with the resurfacing of Project M006461 SR 14/Roosevelt Hwy From SR 138/Beverly Engram Parkway To CR 542/Delano Road, in an estimated amount of \$23,000.00. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Ellis

#### **Justice and Safety**

#### 23-0829 Police

Request approval of a recommended proposal - Police Department, 23RFP139745B-EC, Armed and Unarmed Security Services in an amount not to exceed \$7,200,000.00 with Universal Protection Services dba Allied Universal Security Services (Atlanta, GA) to provide armed and unarmed security services for various County departments. Effective January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with two renewal options. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts, and Ellis

#### 23-0830 Sheriff

Request approval to amend an existing contract - Sheriff's Office, 17RFP07012016B-BR, Inmate Medical Services with NaphCare of Fulton County, LLC (Birmingham, AL) in the amount of \$1,200,394.20 to provide physical and mental health services to inmates at the south Annex and one FTE medical escort officer to support court-mandated mental health programming at the Atlanta City Detention Center. Effective July 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Ellis

### 23-0831 Sheriff

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Sheriff's Office, 17RFP07012016B-BR, Inmate Medical Services with NaphCare, Inc. (Birmingham, AL) in the amount of \$33,791,785.73 to provide physical and mental health services to inmates at the Fulton County Jail and other locations in addition to the annual medication pass through costs estimated not to exceed \$5,500,000.00. This action exercises the sixth of nine renewal options. Three renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Chairman Pitts, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Ellis

#### **COMMISSIONERS' ACTION ITEMS**

#### 23-0788 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution consenting to and ratifying the use of Fulton County AD Valorem Property Tax Increment for two projects located in Westside Tax Allocation Bond District Number 1 - Atlanta/Westside. (Barrett) (APPROVED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Arrington, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Ellis

#### 23-0832 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of an Ordinance to amend the Code of Laws of Fulton County, Georgia, as amended, specifically to amend Subpart B - Code of Resolutions, Chapter 146 - Law Enforcement, Article III. - Jail, Division 2. - County Jail Welfare Fund, Sections 146-81 ET SEQ. regarding the establishment and use of the County Jail Welfare Fund, also known as the Inmate Welfare Fund by abolishing Division 2. - County Jail Welfare Fund, in its entirety; to provide that all funds generated at the Fulton County Jail facilities using County Property, facilities, or other resources shall be deposited into the Fulton County General Fund; and for other purposes. (Pitts) (APPROVED)

a. A motion was made by Chairman Pitts and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Barrett, Hall, and Arrington

b. A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to table. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yea: Barrett, Hall, and Arrington

Nay: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, and Abdur-Rahman

c. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to call the question. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Hall, and Arrington

**Abstain:** Barrett

# **Commissioners' Full Board Appointments**

#### 23-0833 Board of Commissioners

BOARD OF ETHICS (APPROVED)

Each member selected after the initial terms of office have expired shall serve a term of three (3) years or until the termination of his or her membership in the organization from which he or she was selected. The chair shall serve as chair for the remainder of the calendar year and until a successor is chosen. (See Fulton County Code of Laws, Section 2-80).

Term = 3 years

Term below expired: 2/12/2023

Benjamin E. Fox (Atlanta Bar Association/BOC)

The Atlanta Bar Association recommended Benjamin E. Fox for a Full Board reappointment to a term ending February 12, 2026.

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Arrington

**Absent:** Barrett

Did Not Vote: Hall

#### 23-0834 Board of Commissioners

BOARD OF HEALTH (FULTON COUNTY) (APPROVED)

The Board of Commissioners has four appointees, pursuant to HB 885 (2016) and Georgia Code Section 31-3-2 (2016). Fulton County appointments are as follows: One member shall be the chief executive officer of the governing authority of the County and shall serve as a member while holding their offices as chief executive officer of the governing authority of the County. One member to be appointed by the governing authority of the County shall be a physician actively practicing in the County; however, the governing authority may appoint a person licensed as a nurse or dentist under Chapter 26 or 11 of Title 43, or any other person having a familiarity with and concern for the provision of medical services in the County. One member to be appointed by the governing authority of the County shall be a consumer, a representative of a consumer, or a person from an advocacy agency or group, which member will represent on the Board the County's consumers of health services. And one member to be appointed by the governing authority of the County shall be a consumer member who will represent on the Board the County's needy, underprivileged, or elderly community. Initial terms are staggered. After these initial terms, members appointed shall take office the first day of January immediately following the expiration of the immediately preceding term of that office and serve terms of six years and until their successors are appointed and qualified.

Term = 6-year terms, after the initial terms

<u>Term below expires</u>: 12/31/2023 Jack Hardin (**BOC Position #6**)

Chairman Robb Pitts nominated Jack Hardin (BOC Position #6) for a Full Board reappointment to a term ending December 31, 2029.

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Arrington

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Hall

#### **COUNTY MANAGER'S PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION ITEMS**

#### **Open & Responsible Government**

#### 23-0835 External Affairs

Request approval of 2024 State Legislative Agenda. (APPROVED AS AMENDED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve as amended by including a change in State Law to allow for change in the eviction set-out process for the Marshal's Office . The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Barrett, and Arrington

#### **COMMISSIONERS' PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION ITEMS**

#### 23-0836 Board of Commissioners

Discussion: Update of activities of the City of Atlanta and Fulton County Recreation Authority (AFCRA). (Arrington) (HELD)

#### 23-0837 Board of Commissioners

Discussion: Public Defender Newly Identified Operation ABA Requirement and Standards and Needs for 2024 (Hall) (DISCUSSED)

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

#### 23-0838 Board of Commissioners

Executive (CLOSED) Sessions regarding litigation (County Attorney), real estate (County Manager), and personnel (Pitts). (APPROVED)

PRESENT IN THE EXECUTIVE SESSION REGARDING LITIGATION, REAL ESTATE AND PERSONNEL: Chairman Pitts, Vice-Chairman Ellis, Commissioners: Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman; County Manager Dick Anderson; County Attorney Y. Soo Jo; and Clerk to the Commission Tonya R. Grier.

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to enter into Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Hall

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve the request for representation in items #1 and #2 as discussed in Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts

c. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve the request for authority to dismiss with prejudice the two lawsuits at Cobb County, DeKalb County, and Fulton County v. Bank of America, et al. Civil Action File No. 1:15-CV-04081; and Cobb County, DeKalb County, and Fulton County v. Wells Fargo & Co., et al, Civil Action File No. 1:21-CV-1800 with parties all bearing their own fees and costs. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Arrington

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Pitts, Ellis, and Hall

d. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve participation in multi-district litigation in item #6 as discussed in Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Thorne, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts, and Ellis

- e. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to reconsider Executive Session item c. (NO VOTE TAKEN)
- f. A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to reconsider Executive Session item c. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Thorne, Ellis, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Arrington

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts

g. A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve the request for authority to dismiss with prejudice the two lawsuits at Cobb County, DeKalb County, and Fulton County v. Bank of America, et al. Civil Action File No. 1:15-CV-04081; and Cobb County, DeKalb County, and Fulton County v. Wells Fargo & Co., et al, Civil Action File No. 1:21-CV-1800 with parties all bearing their own fees and costs. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Arrington

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts

h. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve to approve participation in multi-district litigation in item #6 as discussed in Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Thorne, Ellis, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

Did Not Vote: Pitts

i. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to increase compensation for the Clerk to the Commission to the amount of \$150,000.00 annually. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Thorne, Ellis, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts

j. A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to adopt the recommendation of the Housing Authority of Fulton County to remove the member that is preventing them from conducting any meetings. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yea: Hall, and Arrington

Nay: Pitts, Thorne, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Ellis

k. A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Chairman Pitts, to hold the recommendation of the Housing Authority of Fulton County to remove a member. The motion failed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Arrington

Absent: Barrett

**Did Not Vote:** Ellis, and Hall

#### ADDED TO THE MEETING

#### Items Added to the Agenda

#### 23-0839 Board of Commissioners

Discussion: Election Update (Thorne) (DISCUSSED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve by adding item #22-0839 to the Recess Meeting Agenda. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

Absent: Hall

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:21 p.m.

# FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONER'S RECESS MEETING NOVEMBER 15, 2023 10:00 A.M.

Alexander Solutions, LLC "A Court Reporting Firm"

(Whereupon, the meeting was called to order at 10:00 a.m.)

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right. Good morning, everyone, and welcome to the November 15th, 2023 meeting of the Fulton County Board of Commissioners. It is 10 o'clock a.m. Madam Clerk, please call the roll."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Chairman Robb Pitts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Present."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Commissioner Bridget Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Present."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Vice Chairman Bob Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Present."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Commissioner Dana Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT**: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Natalie Hall. Commissioner Marvin Arrington Jr."

**CLERK GRIER:** Commissioner Abdur -Rahman:

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Present."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Mr. Chairman, you have a quorum."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Thank you. Please rise for the invocation followed by the Pledge of Allegiance."

(Whereupon, the invocation was given by Reverend Dawkins followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.)

\*

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER**: "On page 2, Consent Agenda, **23-0796**, Adoption of the Consent Agenda. All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Recess Meeting Agenda for separate consideration."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Anything, Madam Clerk? Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "I want to remove item 23-08 --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- what page? What page?"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "10 -- page 6."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. On page 6; which item?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "With District Attorney: Request approval to process an outstanding and current invoices via purchase order in the amount of \$79,234.26."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Wait a minute. What's your request?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "I want it removed off the Consent Agenda."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Oh, off the Consent Agenda. Oh, okay. All right. All right, anything else?"

**COMMISSIONERS**: (No response.)

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right. I'll entertain a motion to approve the Consent Agenda as amended. Motion to approve by Vice Chair Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER**: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*

**CLERK GRIER**: "On page 6, Recess Meeting Agenda: Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have an item requested by Commissioner Thorne to be added to today's Recess Meeting Agenda, 23-0839, Discussion: Election Update."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "And I would like to have that moved to be after Public Comment."

**CLERK GRIER**: "So noted."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right. To add that, let's see, that will take a vote. All right, let's vote on adding that to the agenda. All right, the motion to add is by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "That's the Elections Update? That's what you're talking about? All right."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*

**CLERK GRIER**: "23-0811, Adoption of the Recess Meeting Agenda: Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have amendments to today's Recess Meeting Agenda. Item to be moved up on page 11, as requested by Commissioner Barrett, 23-0788: Request approval of a Resolution consenting to and ratifying the use of Fulton County Ad Valorem Property Tax. This item has been requested to be moved up to be heard after Public Comments as well. Also, on page 11, Commissioner Arrington has requested to remove item 23-0833, the recommendation of the Atlanta Bar Association to reappoint Benjamin E. Fox for a Full Board Appointment."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "To remove, Commissioner Arrington? What's --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "Mr. Chair, be careful what you ask for. Do you want me to go through that right now?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Well -- well, not necessarily. Okay, but not yet. Let me -- the only things – I'm just --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- I'm happy, too."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Okay. Hold on a second. The Bar Association has a right to nominate someone to this Body for approval. We can accept their nomination or reject their nomination, but I think we're required to hear it."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "They have made a nomination -- they made their nomination, so they've fulfilled their duty; and I have asked that this item be removed. And if you want me to go through the litany of reasons, I'm happy to do it."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "But first, before we get to that, I don't think it's a Board appointment, and I think that our rules would suggest or require us to discuss it, debate it, then vote their nomination up or down when it comes before us. But I think we have to have it on the agenda."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "Which rule is that? Which rule are you talking about? Because they -- I also have a right to ask for it to have it to be removed. There's a rule that says I can ask for it be removed, and that's what I've done."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right. Well, I'm going to rule that that request is out of order and we can vote -- let's vote to add that."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "Madam County Attorney, I need to get a ruling on that."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "So previously, the Board decided to suspend action on this Board until certain matters were resolved, but that action -- that Resolution has since been rescinded, so currently there's no legal impediment for the Board to consider this matter."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "Yes, ma'am, that's not the question. The question is, can I ask for it to be removed? Do I have the right to ask for the item to be removed?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "The agenda has already been approved as amended previously, and this was not part of the --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "-- the agenda has not been approved. That is exactly what this item -- right up there on the board --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "-- I see."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "23-0811: Adoption of the Recess Meeting agenda. I will --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Just a minute. Just a minute. Everybody, calm down. I will rule that Commissioner Arrington has the right to ask that this item be removed. He has that right."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes, that's right."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "I'm saying that we will -- that this organization has the right to submit a nomination to us and once it's submitted to us, then we have a right to vote for that nomination or vote against it. So I think it's duly before us and it needs to be on the agenda today. Now, that being said it, I will entertain a motion to remove this item from today's agenda. Is there such a motion?

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "Wait, there needs to be motion? I'll make the motion, absolutely."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right, is there a second to the motion?"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "I thought that's what I did when they printed it on us here and says item to be removed."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right. Is there a second to the motion to remove the recommendation -- the nomination of the Atlanta Bar Association from today's agenda?"

**COMMISSIONERS**: (No response.)

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Is there a second?"

**COMMISSIONERS**: (No response.)

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Is there a second? Is there a second? All right, that motion fails for lack of a second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "Okay, we need a motion to adopt today's Recess Meeting Agenda."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "No, we need to move it up, because we got -- now colleagues, this is a huge budget discussion today for us and with your support, I'd like for us to take care all of the action items and then save as much time as possible for the budget because not only are we going to be making some decisions about the budget 2024, but for 2025 and beyond based upon your actions today. So we need to spend as much time as possible on that. So if we could move up -- what are those -- the Inmate Welfare Fund legislation, the other one dealing with the ankle bracelets after the two that have already been moved up. All right. Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "Just going to ask Commissioner Thorne is there -- since the Election Update was more of a discussion item, could that be moved to the -- is there some pressing reason for it to be at the front of the agenda?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Patrice, the chairman, Patrice Perkins Hooker, requested that she's going to attend this meeting and asked if we could do it at the beginning of the meeting, so as a courtesy to her."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Okay. Motion to adopt the agenda as amended. Motion to adopt by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, one nay."

\*

**CLERK GRIER**: "23-0812, Ratification of Minutes. Recess Meeting Minutes, October 18th. Regular Meeting Post Agenda Minutes, November 1st, 2023."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Barrett; it's seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

**CLERK GRIER**: "23-0813, Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. The first proclamation is recognizing 'Pancreatic Cancer Awareness Month' sponsored by the Full Board of Commissioners."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, there are four? All right, it's 10:12 -- okay."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Are the pancreatic cancer -- someone here from the -come on down. So, pancreatic cancer, thank you for coming here today to receive this proclamation. Wow. It's a very deadly form of cancer and it's amazing the research that is gone through so that people can actually survive this cancer now. It used to be a death sentence, so it gives me great honor to do this proclamation. WHEREAS, pancreatic cancer has the highest mortality rate of all major cancer; and is the third leading cause of cancer related deaths in the United States after lung and colon. And without any early detection, it is expected to become the second leading cause of cancer related deaths in the US by 2030; and WHEREAS, in 2023, an estimated 64,050 Americans will be diagnosed with pancreatic cancer in the US and over 50,550 will die from pancreatic cancer. This marks a six percent and a five percent increase respectfully; and WHEREAS, pancreatic cancer is one of the few cancers for which the survival rate has not improved substantially over nearly 40 years. The combined fiveyear survival rate for pancreatic cancer is a very low, at just five to 10 percent; and WHEREAS, stage IV pancreatic cancer has a five-year survival rate of just one percent, pancreatic cancer has the highest mortality rate of all major cancers with 80 percent of all patients dying within the first year of diagnosis; and WHEREAS, pancreatic cancer is the leading cause of cancer death largely because there are no early detection tools to diagnose the disease, in it's early stages when surgical removal of the tumor is still possible. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Board of Commissioners of Fulton County express their support of the Joseph C. Monastra Foundation for Pancreatic Cancer Research which funds research towards finding tools that will lead to early detection of pancreatic cancer; requests businesses, buildings, monuments, and structures show support by lighting up in purple; and does hereby proclaim Thursday, November 16th, 2023 as 'World Pancreatic Cancer Awareness Day' and the month of November of 2023 as 'Pancreatic Cancer Awareness Month' in Fulton County, Georgia. And I'm sure Commissioner Khadijah will like to light up purple."

**KIRK, RECIPIENT**: "My name is Kirk. This is Giovanni. This is a family organization. We've lost four family members to pancreatic cancer. And in teaming up with John Hopkins University, we've been able to do some great things in trying to come up with more ways to early detect and to, you know, try to save lives. So on behalf of the family and the foundation, we're very thankful."

GIOVANNI, RECIPIENT: "Thank you so much."

**CLERK GRIER**: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'Hammonds House 35th Anniversary Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Hall/Arrington and the Board of Commissioners."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "Come on up. Anybody affiliated with Hammonds House, come on down. Everybody supporting arts and culture and -- well, I better not say that. I just thought about it. Good morning. Well, it was an honor to actually attend the event at the Ray Charles Performing Arts Center, and the woman who was singing the jazz was just amazing. I can't remember her name, but that -- say her name?"

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: "Jean Baylor with the Baylor with the Baylor project."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Jean Baylor was awesome, and I just have to commend her and her husband who was playing the drums. And so, this proclamation means a lot because the Hammonds House is a museum in Atlanta in the West End, that Fulton County supports wholeheartedly and we will always continue to support it. And to present this proclamation to you for 35 years is simply an honor. It reads: WHEREAS, for over three decades the Hammonds House Museum nestled in Atlanta's Historic West End is a gathering space that annually attracts thousands of visitors to explore the cultural diversity and legacy of artists of African descent; and WHEREAS, the Hammonds House Museum boasts a permanent collection of more than 450 works of art dating from the mid 19th century to contemporary artists of African descent; and WHEREAS, the Hammonds House Museum is host to a variety of artistic events including visual arts and expeditions by significant artists, artist talks, panel discussions, workshops, and art camps for young people as well as literary events and music concerts; and WHEREAS, Dr. Otis Thrash Hammonds, MD, the museum's namesake, was an African-American visionary who actively promoted the relevance of art and cultural preservation; and WHEREAS, upon the passing of Dr. Hammonds in 1985, the Fulton County Board of Commissioners under the inspired leadership of its then chairperson, Michael Lomax, established Hammonds House Museum in 1988 for the purpose of collecting, documenting, preserving, interpreting, exhibiting, and providing informational resources on works of art by peoples of African descent; and WHEREAS, the Hammonds House Museum is celebrating their 35th anniversary with museum patrons and supporters of art and cultural from across the country to celebrate the accomplishments of the past and the promise of the future endeavors in support of the

arts and specifically black arts. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes the Hammonds House Museum's 35th Anniversary and 35 years of hard-working commitment to the arts in the Atlanta community; and does hereby proclaim Friday November 3rd, 2023 as Hammonds House Museum Appreciation Day in Fulton County Georgia. Thank you so much."

IMARA CANADY, RECIPIENT: "Good morning. We can do better than that. Good morning. Yes, my name is Imari Canady and I'm so blessed to serve as the current president of the board for Hammonds House Museum. And I want to say I know that Dr. Hammonds is smiling down, knowing that continued support that this Body will have in this community for art and culture because that is what he gave his life for besides obviously the medical work that he did. But I also want to say that we're honored to share in this 35th anniversary; not only is Hammonds House Museum, but with our sister organization, the National Black Arts Festival, but I think more importantly, this is not a Hammonds House Museum story, this is not a National Black Arts Festival story, this is a Fulton County Legacy story. So the commitment that each of you all have continued to make to art and culture throughout Fulton County continues to ensure that the stories of what happens at Hammonds House Museum, the stories of what happens at the National Black Arts Festival, the stories that happen at the Johns Creek Arts Center continue to thrive and grow. Because of your support, we're able to ensure that we're nestled in West End, but the collaboration happens as far north as Alpharetta and as far south as the city of South Fulton. So this is a celebration of the commitment of art and culture for this community. And we thank you for recognizing Hammonds House Museum as a piece of the pie, and that we will continue to make you proud each and every day, thank you."

**CLERK GRIER**: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'Heaven Billboard No. 1 Gospel Airplay Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "All right. Welcome, welcome. It is certainly my pleasure to be able to present these proclamations today. Fulton County is doing big things, and as our Chairman says, Atlanta influences everything, but everything is in Fulton County. And so, it is an absolute pleasure to present this plaque to Anthony David and Algebra Blessett, and based on their humongous success, number one on Billboard gospel airplay. So the proclamation reads as follows: WHEREAS. Anthony David an Algebra Blessett, also known as ADAB, are the dynamical music -- dynamic music duo who are taking the music industry by storm. Their soulful voices and incredible songwriting talent have captivated audiences around the world; and WHEREAS, Anthony's smooth vocals and heartfelt lyrics perfectly complement Algebra's powerful and emotional singing style. Together they create a harmonious plan of R&B soul and neo-soul that's both timeless and contemporary; and WHEREAS, their meteoric rise to fame was catapulted by not one, but two chart-topping singles, 'Forevermore,' their first No. 1 hit, resonated deeply with listeners showcasing their ability to craft soulful and timeless music; and WHEREAS, their remake of 'Heaven' by

BeeBee and CeeCee Winans brought a fresh, contemporary twist to the classic song; earning them another chart-topping success as the No. 1 spot on Billboard's Gospel Airplay. Their rendition demonstrates their unique approach to reinterpreting beloved classics while keeping the essence of the original intact; and WHEREAS, these No. 1 hits along with their other incredible work, showcases the undeniable chemistry between Anthony David and Algebra Blessett; leaving an indelible mark on the music industry. Their music is a testament to the enduring power of soulful melodies and heartfelt lyrics. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes Anthony David and Algebra Blessett for their continued success and their contribution to the music industry and the arts and culture community; and does hereby proclaim today Wednesday, November 15th, 'Heaven Billboard No. 1 Gospel Airplay Appreciation Day in Fulton County."

**ANTHONY DAVID, RECIPIENT**: "How you guys doing? Good morning. Yeah, I didn't know you can get recognized for stuff like this. We're plugging away for the city, Atlanta is a music city, a music town, you know, and we're just doing our part. Appreciate y'all."

**ALGEBRA BLESSETT, RECIPIENT**: "Hi. Good morning. This is a big thing for me. I've always said I'm from Zone 3. I grew up in Summer Hill. I went to Ralph McGill Elementary School, Martin Luther King, Jr. Middle School, and North Atlanta High School, and Morris Brown College. And now, this is my city, and I see so many of my family and friends in here, so thank you for the appreciation."

**CLERK GRIER**: "The last proclamation is recognizing 'Coy Dumas, Jr. Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "Mr. Dumas and his lovely wife and any other supporters, I would ask to make sure that the County Manager is up here as well as the Chairman. This is a great day in Fulton County. We know that Mr. Dumas was actually recognized earlier, but we always want to give people their flowers while they're living. And so, we are recognizing him today and as he makes his way down here, if I become full, let me tell you why: Me and my children rode on the bus with this operator. As a domestic abuse survivor, that needed to catch the bus that needed to get to work, that needed to get to the babysitter that needed to do all the things that I needed to do as a young mother, this gentleman poured into me. He often times would see me at the bus with my child in a stroller, took the bus and parked, get off the bus, and help me on. And I don't imagine that he had to do some refereeing sometime in the SWATs; but when you have someone who poured into the community -- and thank you, Mr. Dumas, we know that the strength and the wind is behind the wings is you. We know that, and we thank you for allowing him to serve us. But I just want everyone within my voice to know you broke the mold. We appreciate you. We pray that there are others in the ranks at MARTA that will continue to do what I call the ministry, because it was just not getting on and off the bus; it was pouring into your community and making sure we were safe and got from point A to point B. So with that, this proclamation: WHEREAS, Mr.

Coy Dumas, Jr. is a native of the Adamsville community of Atlanta, Georgia. And in 1972, joined what was then called Atlanta Transit as a bus operator; and WHEREAS, Mr. Dumas has run routes solely in West Atlanta over the past 50 years and currently operates route 853 out of the Westlake Station on the blue line; and WHEREAS, MARTA officials estimates that Mr. Dumas has carried -- listen to this -- approximately, 2.8 million passengers on his bus as he began his career in transit 50 years ago. You all can clap for that if you want to; and WHEREAS, Mr. Dumas boasts a spotless driving record over his career, and has never had a traffic accident having driven over two million miles across the city of Atlanta; and WHEREAS, as MARTA's most veteran bus driver, Mr. Dumas wears operator badge No. 1, and has been a mentor to countless bus operators over the past five years, and he leads the mentorship program out of the Perry bus facility; and WHEREAS, Mr. Dumas was honored by the MARTA Board of Directors with a MARTA bus wrapped with his photo in commemoration of his unprecedented 50 years of dedicated service. Now, after 51 years of dedicated service to the citizens of Atlanta and Fulton County, he has decided to retire -- I'm crying now -but continue training new drivers as a consultant. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that I humbly present this that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes Coy Dumas, Jr. for his outstanding example of service, dedication, and professionalism with MARTA, and celebrates his retirement after 51 years of service; and does hereby proclaim Wednesday, November 15th as 'Coy Dumas Jr. Appreciation Day' in Fulton County, Georgia. Would you, please put a hearty applause and a standing ovation for this great citizen of Fulton County. Thank you."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "Mr. Dumas, you know, it is -- I'm shocked you're retiring, because we just honored you and I sponsored the proclamation very similar to that at the beginning of the year when we had your wrapped bus out here for everyone to see. And I'm sad to see you go, but I know it is a well-deserved -- well-deserved retirement. And I know, Mrs. Dumas, you're going to enjoy having your beloved husband with you. And, yes, you're welcome. So I'm honored to stand here today in honor of your retirement and all the work you've done in the community. Thank you."

COY DUMAS, JR., RECIPIENT: "First of all, good morning. I want to thank my heavenly father, first of all, for all the blessings that he's bestowed to me and my family, and it's really been a blessing. The Board of Commissioners -- I don't even know what to say, but it's an honor and a pleasure for me and it's also a blessing. My beautiful wife, as I refer to as my Queen of Queens, for almost 45 years. She gets up with me every morning at 2, 2:30 -- I can't say that enough because I believe there's been some hard days. Yeah, I'll retiring; but actually Friday is my last official day. But my grandpa would say you're moving on to the next season, son. So I'm coming out of winter and going into spring, and I'm going to take some and roll with it. But I'm going to stick around and I've been bless to contract, train new operators in different areas and make sure we can get another Coy Dumas. But it's really been a blessing, and I cannot say thank you more than enough. This is my family you see down here. My bus is out front. It may be double parked, but it's out front. My team members are out there with it now.

They was going to be in, but they didn't want to leave the bus, but they want somebody to ride around the city impersonating me, okay. But I cannot say thanks to the Board of Commissioners and my best friend here more than enough. I'm not going to hold you long with a long conversation. This is probably the most you're going to get out of me at any time other than welcome to the Westlake Rail Station, East/West Rail Line. But I want to thank you. I want to wish everybody continued blessings and many, many more. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right, Madam Clerk, continue. That took -- we had four proclamations for 26 minutes; you have 30 minutes for proclamations. Madam Clerk."

\*

CLERK GRIER: "Continuing on page 7, Public Hearings, 23-0814, Public Comment - Citizens wishing to participate in public comment will be allowed to appear in person or may choose to participate virtually via Zoom videoconferencing or by submitting their comments in writing on the -- registering on the county's website www.fultoncountyga.gov. Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. The public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The public comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes. In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we will start with the speakers in Assembly Hall. We have received 45 speaker cards. Will the first five speakers, please come down: Major Orange, Dustin Rutledge, Lieutenant Hadley, Deputy Bell, and Shane Johnson."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right, as always, when you have two minutes -- strike that, when you have 15 seconds left, I'll simply say 15 seconds. That's your key to conclude your remarks. We have actually 53 speakers, and 53 speakers is about two hours. We have 30 minutes for public comment. And I plead with you, if someone has said what you were going to say, please don't feel it necessary to repeat what's already been said."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Mr. Chair."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Now, there are about eight from police -- various public safety, 34 people from the arts, and three on the elections, and eight from the Fulton County Housing Authority. So that's two hours of public comment, and we only have 30 minutes. Vice Chair."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "Doesn't it say priority should be given to Fulton County citizens?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It does."

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "How would you describe that? Should we allow citizens to speak before we allow employees to come forward?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Probably should, but I mean, it's been so loosy-goosey, Commissioner. That's why I've been working with Commissioner Barrett here for us to have that meeting about our internal rules so we can come to some agreement as to how we're going to handle not only proclamations, but public comment as well, because apparently, the 30-minute rule does not work because every time there's more than that, we accommodate everybody, you know."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "We're going to vote to suspend the 30 minutes or stick to it?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "I'll just -- Commissioner, let's let them speak today, sir, so we'll get ready at some point to have that meeting. And one of my recommendations gone be to start the regular meeting at 1 o'clock. We can have public comment and proclamations all morning."

VICE CHAIR ELLIS: "All right, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Yes, ma'am. First Speaker"

MAJOR DEIRDRE ORANGE, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. I'm Major Orange with Fulton County Marshal's Department and I've been with the department for 25 years. And I am simply coming not only as an employee, but as a citizen of Fulton County asking that the salaries for the Marshals Department be increased. Previously, we've seen applications from ranging from 300 to 400 people. Now, we can't get anyone to apply for positions in the Marshals Department because our salaries are so low. So we are just simply asking that you all consider increasing our salaries during this budget session. Thank you."

Lieutenant Rutledge with the Fulton County Marshals Department. I've worked for the Marshals Department approximately 14 years. But I've been a part of the county for nearly 35 years, because my father started with the county as an officer when I was just three or four years old, so I've seen a lot of changes in this county. There was a time when Fulton County was the gold standard in law enforcement; one of the top in the state and one of the top in the country. We had competitive pay and a great pension, which attracted talented people from all over the country who wanted to be in law

enforcement. Unfortunately, this is no longer true. We serve the most populated county in the state, and there's no reason why we should not be setting the standard in law enforcement pay for the state or really the entire Southeast. For the Fulton County Marshals Department, it's hard to compete with other agencies when we're the lowest paid agency in the county. Other agencies offer much higher pay and incentives which makes it hard to recruit good talented people to the Marshals Department. For example, you have the Sheriff's deputies making \$60,000, detention officers making \$54,000. Detention officers are making \$4,000 more than our sworn law enforcement officers. So when people get on the county job postings, where do you think they're going to apply? Not to the Fulton County Marshals Department. We can't continue to compete with the other agencies right here in the county, much less other agencies in Metro Atlanta. I've got other examples in Fulton County: Palmetto PD starting at 55,000 with incentives in education. They can start there at \$60,000. That's \$10,000 more than what we make at the Marshals Department starting pay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Fifteen seconds, sir."

**LIEUTENANT DUSTIN RUTLEDGE, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "DeKalb County Marshals, 73,000. That's 23,000 more than us. The lack of pay and incentives makes it extremely hard for us to recruit and retain good deputies."

LIEUTENANT MEKEAL HADLEY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. I'm Lieutenant Hadley with the Fulton County Marshals Department. The Fulton County Marshal's Department is severely suffering due to retention and funding issues; the department not being able to match the salaries or incentives of surrounding agencies is causing a lack of interest of applicants. The lack of candidates has caused a significant strain in the productivity on the Marshals Department leaving us not to be able to meet the needs of the county. The county is continuing to grow, and our department has declined in numbers since I started 16 years ago. Currently, the eviction division has a total of 3,388 writs with a total of four vehicles serving the county, which requires two deputies per vehicle for safety precautions. We have eight deputies assigned to the division and are having to pull from other divisions which are also short staffed to perform evictions. This takes away from the production of the other divisions as well. At the current time, the division is averaging between 100 to 120 evictions per week. Please note we are receiving a hundred plus writs a week. We, as a department, are operating at a deficit; all while walking in to unknown environments and conditions, making cases involving violent criminals, barricaded subjects, finding drugs, weapons, wanted persons, as well as pressing additional charges. This interferes with the number of evictions completed daily and causes an (indiscernible.) of evictions. Due to understaffing, we have not been able to perform other aspects of our departments. For example: we have a warrant division that we are unable to utilize because we don't have the manpower at this time. This leaves wanted subjects walking around our county because of the lack of manpower --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**LIEUTENANT MEKEAL HADLEY, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "-- in our department due to salary and retention. At the current rate, the Fulton County Marshals Department is operating at a hole – it's not operating at a whole, and we would never be able to catch up and fulfill our duties to the county. Thank you."

**DEPUTY JENNIFER BELL, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Good morning, I'm Deputy Bell with Fulton County Marshals Department. I've been a part of the department for two years. As a new mom in my position as a deputy, I just do not make enough money to be an active parent. With my current salary and inflation rates, I am forced to seek outside employment in order to ensure that I can provide an adequate life for my child. The rate of daycare, the rate of formula, is at an all-time high, but my salary is not yet increasing to help out with that change. With having to work six to seven days a week, I'm not able to be present in my child's life. I love my job and my current position as a court deputy in the DUI division working with individuals that have the desire to get their life back and recover from past drinking and drug use. Even while I was on maternity leave, I was still communicating with participants because it's just not a job to me. It's bigger than coming to work and clocking in; but it's about making an impact on the community. While doing this, as mentioned before, we're short. So we're pulled in so many different directions, but we're not being compensated at the same time. So it's not a want for more money, but it's more so a need for more money, because I love working here, but financially it's putting me in a bind to where I have to look elsewhere because I just don't make enough money. And for someone who loves their job, I feel like we should be able to stay in our department, but we need more funding. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Next five speakers, please come down: Robert Thompson, Darius Bowdry, Prophet Curtis Martin Hairston, Julie Allen, and Lee Foster."

DEPUTY SHANE JOHNSON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning everybody, morning Commissioners of Fulton County. Hi, how are you doing? My name is Deputy Shane Johnson. I'm originally from Miami. I moved here in 2019 at the starting salary of \$42,507. I thought it was a great salary at the time, but I was quickly learned that it was really difficult for me to survive, because I was making about \$1,100 every two weeks, where my rent was at 1,300. So, two checks would have to pay for one bill. And I'm not going tell you about all of my financial situation; but here I am at 51,000 annually, and it's still not enough. Essentially, inflation has taken all of our bills up, but the checks are not following, and essentially it is becoming a deficit as far as the deputies. Not only myself, but other deputies involved trying to live and survive as we carry out our duties, right? I'm the manager over the social media department and I'm trying -- constantly trying to recruit more individuals. As of recently, we went to north Georgia to do a recruiting event where we're speaking to college studies who are getting ready to come out, and they sound really excited. They see the Marshal's positions. They follow the page. They see a lot of the cool stuff that we do, but that interest quickly dwindles and it

quickly deflates as soon as they see our starting salary. Especially, when we have two other public safety agencies that are here, that are making five to 10,000 more in comparison to our salary, right? At the time that I got hired, there was 106 applicants that went through the PT process and the whole process and now we're struggling to get less than 10 -- we're struggling to get at least ten -- ten to five applicants on any given day. And a lot of PT sessions and a lot of hiring sessions that we're having, they're now getting canceled because we do not have appropriate applicants to apply. So again, I didn't mean to take up too much of your time; but in closing, I strongly encourage, Commissioners, if you can see that, us as law enforcement officers, both as a citizen and a law enforcement officer living in Fulton County, it's really difficult financially for us to survive and thrive as we live and work here. Thank you for your time."

ROBERT THOMPSON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Robert Thompson. I'm a resident of Fulton County and I've also been associated with the Hammonds House Museum for the last 13 years. I just want to add a little bit on to what our president of our board said, that the Hammonds House Museum is not just a Fulton County gem, but I've been a docent at the museum for the last 10 years, and we've received people from not only Fulton County, the state of Georgia, but from all over the country and all over the world. Just last week, we got some business visitors from Japan. We've had curators from the Smithsonian Museum come to see some of our shows. So I just want to let you know that the Hammonds House reach is beyond the Fulton County, beyond the state of Georgia. It has an international/national worldwide collection that we make available to the public over many, many times. Thank you very much."

**DARIUS BOWDRY, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Good morning. My name is Darius Bowdry and I represent Darius Cash Company, LLC, professionally known as Darius Cash. I am a hip-hop artist, author, and clothing designer. I had the pleasure of meeting Commissioner Khadijah at the 44th Annual Memorial for the Atlanta Missing Child -- Murdered Missing Child, and I had a conversation with her about getting my book into Fulton County libraries in DeKalb, and I really just want to make sure or ask for the support of the Commissioners along with Commissioner Khadijah. Thank you."

CURTIS HAIRSTON MARTIN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "How's everybody doing today? This is Prophet Curtis Hairston Martin. Again, I mean, we're celebrating homelessness like it's going out of style while y'all be serving Christmas dinner folk dying on your streets. Thirteen people died in Fulton County have died in Fulton County jails. A guy just got killed in DeKalb County Jail. What are y'all celebrating? Now, again, I said as we've said before, this government is judicial -- well, let me let y'all know I know what I'm talking about and the legislative board that make the laws and get the money. Now, I've said before, you know, you can do this right way or we can do the other way. Now, like I said, people are dying on your streets. Nineteen folks froze to death on your streets, Fulton County, DeKalb County. Fifteen people done died because of cops.

Thirteen folk died in your jail cells; in the jail cells. What are y'all celebrating? I don't want to raise my voice. Because when I raise my voice, the building starts shaking. Do the math. Like I said, I'm a prophet of God. I'm not coming to play no more. Sex trafficking is number one in Atlanta, Georgia Fulton County/DeKalb County. If that's number one, then some of y'all involved. Some of y'all involved. Preachers are involved, too. I don't play -- I'm not playing with preachers. I'm not playing with City Council. I'm not playing with government. The Bible says this, he told Moses, if you're on God's side, get over here; if you're not, get over there. Do the math. Do the math. Let it be said today that a prophet got you straight --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**CURTIS HAIRSTON MARTIN, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "-- let it be said today, let it be said this day, this day right here, that a prophet told you that a man of God in Jesus's name, in Jesus's name, Jesus Christ. Jesus Christ, in that name."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, sir. Next speaker."

JULIE ALLEN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Julie Allen. While the CDC is out there marketing the updated COVID vaccines as a way to protect yourself and your loved ones, FDA's Peter Marks admits the current vaccines don't reduce transmission in a meaningful way. He hopes we can find a vaccine that will reduce transmission even by 50 percent. But the CDC says the shots stop transmission and will protect families at Thanksgiving. When will this Board hold Dr. Paxton accountable for her marketing message of COVID vaccines that is inconsistent with protecting the public health? Please note America's public health experts somehow missed the biggest crisis in recent history, the cratering of US life expectancy to near three decade lows per recent data from the organization for economic cooperation and development. Please note that Texas Governor Abbott just signed SB7 to ban employer vaccine mandates in Texas. It's plain we need new experts; the ones we have are literally killing us. Thank you, Chair Pitts for your measured action as this Board's leader. I've seen it as I've attended these meetings. Of notice, this week's politically motivated action by Commissioner Dana Barrett to attempt to remove Bob Sheeley from the North Fulton CID board, which is out her Buckhead district. No other Commissioner's signed on to her politically-motivated agenda. Last week, why did taxpayers -- or lastly, why taxpayers pay for criminal attorneys, Don Samuel and Amanda Clark to represent the Fulton County Board of Elections? Why have they now resigned? Why has there been resistance to an audit of Fulton County ballots? Where are the 150,000 still secret 2020 unfolded mail ballots with the perfect ovals protected by court order? For anyone doubting the legitimacy of hand-counted paper ballots, look at the 11/07 election where Valdosta's machines failed to record 300 votes out of 5,758 ballots cast, a five percent error rate."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Fifteen seconds."

**JULIE ALLEN, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Meanwhile, Milton posted their hand-counted results by 12:54 a.m. Judge Amy Tottenberg has issued a decision that there are sufficient reasons to believe Georgia's electronic voting machines have substantial flaws. Dr. Haldeman's report identified seven primary vulnerabilities he found in the -- thank you."

LEE FOSTER, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. Chairman Pitts, Commissioners, my name is Lee Foster, and I am the Director of the Rialto Center for the Arts at Georgia State University. I'm also a resident of District 6. So, one of the things about advocating for arts funding is that there is so much tragedy these days. There's so much pain, and one of the things that I named the Rialto season was 'holding the light', because I see the Rialto as almost like a lighthouse where we can help those of us in the community that need to protect all that goodness in our hearts. I think it's critically important. Fulton County assisted the Rialto so much when we closed for 21 months, and I lost 50 percent of my staff and 50 percent of my funding. Everything was closed including our Rialto jazz for kids and all of our Rialto series and all of our programs, but we survived. And even though we are a type of organization that also has to make what we spend, you may be surprised by that, since we're part of Georgia State University. It is a critical part of what we do and so important to the community. The Rialto provides unique programming that you cannot find anywhere in Atlanta other than at the Rialto. And I think many of you know that. We do international, we do international dance and of course, fabulous jazz, and it absolutely exists as a Rialto lighthouse. I joined my other arts organizations to really plead with you that you maintain the arts funding for the arts because it's such a critical part of our hearts, our minds, and our mindset --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**LEE FOSTER, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "-- so I thank you so much for listening to me today, and I hope that all of you will come to 'Take Six' in January. Thank you so much."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Next speakers, please come down: Stephanie Owens, Oronike Odeleye, Rick Ross, Rachel May, Rodney J. Simpson."

STEPHANIE OWENS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Stephanie Owens, and I serve as the Executive Director for National Black Arts Festival, a legacy partner of Fulton County. I stand here with my staff today and on behalf of the Board of Directors to express our sincere thanks for your continued support of the arts and specifically for the funding that you've made to our organization over our past 36 years of existence. We're grateful to each of you, Commissioners for your support. Thank you to Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, Commissioner Arrington, Commissioner Hall, Commissioners Thorne and Barrett particularly for showing up to our events and supporting. We thank you, Chairman Pitts, for your very vocal declaration to continue to support NBAF and the arts. And so, we're thankful to each of you, and we just ask you

today to vote to not cut the arts funding. We need your support more than ever. Without the arts funding, we would not be able to make a significant impact that we do through our youth arts education programs, through our community public programs, and artistic development opportunities. Your funding enables us to provide equitable economic empowerment to our artist community and create pathways into creative arts industry which result in significant economic impact for the county."

ORONIKE ODELEYA, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Hi, my name is Oronike Odeleya, I am the Artistic Director of National Black Arts Festival. And in 2022, NBAF awarded over \$70,000 in artists grants to 60 artists supporting their careers and artistic endeavors that have added to the life of this city and this county. We've spent over a hundred thousand dollars in contracts in teaching artists, commission event producers, performers, and to the local vendors and contractors we use to present dynamic year-round programming. Without Fulton County support, we like many arts organizations, would have to make cuts to the financial support we provide upon which many Fulton County businesses and artists rely to survive. Arts organizations don't just contribute to the cultural life of a city; we create and sustain local jobs, and drive economic activity through our spending. To cut funding for the arts is to threaten jobs for nonprofit cultural workers, individual artists and artisans, creative entrepreneurs, and all the other businesses that we support. Arts organizations are job generators. According to the Atlanta Regional Commission, local jobs in the creative industries are growing at a faster rate than all other industries. To support creative jobs, we need a healthy and sustainable arts community with training for artists, ongoing professional opportunities so that artists will continue to make Fulton County their home. Again, I thank you for your continued support of NBAF and all of the arts organizations that you fund and urge you not to cut arts funding in the 2024 budget. Thank you."

JAMES CALDWELL, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, everybody. My name is James Caldwell. I'm the executive director of the music education group. I just want to come before you this morning to say thank you for your continued support of arts-based organizations. I also wanted to remind you guys that an investment in the arts is really an investment of your future economic development. Funding the organization provides training in all areas from fashion design, piano, visual arts; in our case, careers in music, film and digital media. Your funding for us this year allowed us to hire 13 young people this summer, ages 14 to 23 and provide them with on-the-job training. These young people will ultimately go on to have careers in our industry. We want to make sure that we're able to keep these vital resources in Fulton County. And so, we just want to say with everyone else, yet we appreciate your continued funding of economic arts. Thank you."

**RACHEL MAY, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Hello. My name is Rachel May, cofounder and producing artistic director of Synchronicity Theater. We are a professional theater company in Atlanta, in Midtown in Fulton County, focusing on uplifting the voices of women and girls. The business case for the arts has already been made, that one

dollar spent equals \$8.00 for the county is a very real number. They are sustainable, and they are what makes companies want to locate here because a thriving arts community is essential for that. But more importantly, the need is great in that we are all coming back from the pandemic. We know as arts organization that's been a devastating and difficult time and Fulton County has been a leader in a state where per capita funding for the arts is 50th in the nation. So we appreciate the incredible support Fulton County has given, especially in the last couple of years. And to remove that and go back to a budget that was much smaller, would take away a lot of the gains of equitable funding for arts organization that have been made over the last couple of years in this especially difficult time. And the other thing I just wanted to say is we have programs across the community on our stage, but also in a lot of middle schools, elementary schools, and community centers including working with girls who are refugees and girls living in group homes. And the power of the arts in those spaces cannot be underestimated. This is a time when we need community; this is a time when we need empathy; this is a time when we need to learn how to listen and speak to one another, and the arts do that across the county, across the state, and they are critical for us to come together as a community in what continue to be --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**RACHEL MAY, PUBLIC SPEAKER:** "-- fractured times, thank you. And the last thing I wanted to say is we have seen tremendous, tremendous increases for mental health in young people when they participate in the arts which is really needed at this time as well. Thank you so much."

RODNEY J. SIMPSON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. How you guys doing this morning? All right, my name is Rodney Simpson. I am the owner of Fame Live Magazine. I just have a few things to say about this. When they took, like band and entertainment out of the schools, that's when you started having all these issues with all the kids running around with guns and all this other stuff that's going on. So I think if you decrease the budget for Fulton County for arts and entertainment culture, you're going to directly affect those children. They are already affected -- there already being affected as it is, but if you take more away from them you going to make it even worse. I mean programs like Face have done major things for not just for Atlanta as a culture, but as an entertainment force in the business, because Face focuses on fashion, arts, culture, and education. So if you guys take away the money, you're going to take away the opportunities for children to get involved with things that evolve -- they love to get involved in. When I was a little kid, I loved playing with my crayons and coloring books, you know what I'm saying. Let's bring that back to the children because at the end of the day it's about them, it's not about us. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Next five speakers: Natasha Rice, RA Bivens, Malika Garrett, Anne Dennington, and Giovanni Tortacia."

NATASHA RICE, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "I want to first of all thank the Fulton County Commissioners for ongoing support of the arts. I want to echo all of the champions who have spoken before me on behalf of the arts and culture and the support that Fulton County has given. As the president and CEO of the Chattahoochee Nature Center, we see a tremendous number of patrons throughout the Metro area, but about 40 percent of the folks are coming from Fulton County directly. The funding that we get allows us to outreach to multiple agencies including Fulton Intellectual and Developmental Disability centers, Fulton County Art Centers, the Fulton County libraries, the District Attorney Junior DA program, Los Ninos Primera, to name a few. We see on average 7,000 kids that are all of the second grade programming from the Fulton County School District. The funding that we've received allows us to offset the funds that we were able to support for numerous people throughout the county. Without this, we would not be able to reach Metro Atlanta. We would not be able to share the wonderful resource, which is the Chattahoochee River. Seventy percent obviously of Metro Atlanta is getting their water from the river, and it's important for the children, as well as the adults, in the county to understand and revere that resource along with all of the natural elements we spoke about earlier with mental health and awareness of oneself in this community. So thank you very much for your support and we hope that you are able to continue that into the future "

RA BIVENS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. My name is RA Bivens. I am here with my coalition. We all have several foundations to support the youth initiatives globally. One of the things that I feel that it's very important to address is we have to be intentional at creating solutions that's creating the problems. I think the collective agenda of the coalition that I work with, along with my foundation which is Hip-Hop Ether, Mr. Duguay, the national multicultural community organization, and Take Time Foundation. We all are collectively working together. We also have partnered with the Twelve Factory which is an event space here in Fulton County, in the Piedmont Road Area. We're opening our facility to be a headquarter hub for giveaways, support, and I think the proactive agenda for myself and the team is to create opportunities that's going to give these young people opportunity, whether it's creatively, mental health, just personal support, if they have an opportunity to do something different, they will. We can't change the situation that we're dealing with, community wise with the crime, the death, and the trauma that comes with these things; we have to create something that's going to be supportive in the solutions. Everybody has a great idea and a great agenda, but what we are doing for that? So the financial support from the county and the Commissioners and the city and everybody who's going through something. I think this is a very supportive campaign for us to take advantage of, and we all have very significant agendas that really tap into that can help the youth, the young adults, and young professionals. So I appreciate the support and the funding that the Commissioners --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "--15 seconds."

**RA BIVENS, PUBLIC SPEAKER** " -- Fulton County has given. We would like to continue that, and please feel free to tap into our facility, to come in and join forces with our coalition to help the community and help the County of Fulton County. Thank you."

MALIKA GARRETT, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, everybody. My name is Malika Garrett. And I am thrilled to be here actually to talk about something that's very near and dear to my heart and it should be near and dear to yours, too. I came here as an international student in 1985 in a small town called Macon, Georgia. And since then, I have an art degree. I am an artist and have – there's about 200,000 Indians in Fulton County, just so you know that. And Fulton County has been a big part of promoting and helping me get our art in front of the children, front of the communities. South Asians are huge in growing population in Fulton County, and part of that I have had shows in Alpharetta. I've had shows in the Woodruff Art Center. I was one of the first Indian artists to ever have a solo exhibit there. Recently, we had an art exhibit here, 16 Asian artists exhibited right here. All of that would not be possible without your help. And arts is a very important -- everybody's been talking about the same thing that I'm saying except I think bringing in international aspect and reaching out to the community, which is now made up of a whole lot more. The world has gotten much smaller, than back here when I came in '85. I need your help. I need your leadership; we need leadership in the arts. I need just for South Asian dysphonic to grow, and the communities are hungry for this. I'm just telling you this, the communities are hungry for this and it's not going to be possible if you take this money away from us. So ultimately promoting the arts --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**MALIKA GARRETT, PUBLIC SPEAKER:** "-- and improved efforts, so thank you again for doing this, I hope you continue to do it. Thank you."

ANNE DENNINGTON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Hello, my name is Anne Dennington. I'm the Executive Director of Flux Projects. I live and work in District 5. Flux Projects produces temporary public art projects, and we've been doing this for 13 years, and Fulton County has been our most steadfast partner in this work. We work with, obviously, an amazing group of arts organizations in Atlanta, and you've heard the business case, you've heard the impact, you've heard our economic impact, our mental health impact. I wanted to share a story. A couple years ago, y'all asked us to look more broadly through the county. And this past summer we did a project in East Point called Ghost Pools. It was with Hannah Palmer and it built memorials to two pools in East Point that were closed during integration. One was a white pool; one was a black pool in the segregated black neighborhood. One of the gentlemen that joined us for the opening of those was a gentleman named Jim Grayson. His father, Roy Grayson had been the head of parks and recreation in 1954, and when the black pool had been opened. In '59, there was a drowning, and he instigated a water safety course. During that period, one of the white's instructors got into the black pool, and the backlash was

immediate. He was fired, Roy Grayson was fired. They lost their home. They were essentially run out of the city and run out of the county. Jim vowed never to return; he was a teenager the time. He joined us for the opening. He had seen on social media the story about the project and he came to see it in person, and he joined in that one segregated space. People from the black community, people from the white community, and they shared stories. It was touching --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**ANNE DENNINGTON, PUBLIC SPEAKER:** "-- it was happy. He came back with his brother and his wife for the closing. This is the kind of impact that y'all are having, one person at a time, at a time when we need so much empathy and so much understanding and so much healing. Please help us to continue this work. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Next speakers, please come down: Kurt Bolding, Jennifer Dobbs, Joseph Wilson, Lolita Grant, and Leonard Morrow."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Okay, come on down, ladies and gentlemen. So the 30 minutes have expired. We've heard from 20 speakers. We've got 33 more to go, so that's about another hour and some change. So come on down."

JOSEPH WILSON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Hello, my name is Joseph Wilson. I come before you to complain about my tax bill. Although I'm talking about something personal, it has something to do with all of the city of Atlanta citizens. I have been a member of the city of Atlanta for over 79 years. I believe the fair market value assessment is excessive for my property. It went from \$167,600 to \$242,500 in a period of one year. That's \$75,000 over -- increase in one year. There has not been no changes in the property at all. I believe that I should not be penalized for the assessors not removing the homestead assessment of the previous owner. The tax assessor should have been notified of a new owner when I filed my P61. They're removing the tax exemption which I did not ask for. It made my tax bill increase from a few hundred dollars to over \$10,000. Furthermore, they stated that they can go back three years. In looking at my bill, it appears to me that I've been -- am being penalized for four years. I'm asking that I do not be penalized for the tax assessor's failure to maintain proper records and keep their assessments up-to-date annually. Hopefully, there are not too many other seniors of low income, personnel in the city of Atlanta that are receiving this type of treatment. Thank you for your assistance."

**JENNIFER DOBBS, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Pleasure to meet all of you. My name is Jennifer Dobbs. I'm the Executive Director of Arts Bridge Foundation. We serve approximately 20 to 30,000 students every year throughout our arts education programming. More specifically, about 26 percent of the students we serve are from Fulton County. I can give you a lot of wonderful qualitative stories, but I want to give you some quantitative stats: 7,500 students on average are served by us every year

from Fulton County. In the past 15 years, 112,500 have been served. Most of them are Title I or underserved. We provide financial aid subsidies. That means we've spent -- provided 1.125 million in admission to them. We've provided them with funding close to \$575,000 in bussing, \$7,500 per year in snack packs because we're not only trying expose them to the arts, we're also trying to assist in the fight against food -- food insecurity. We've also been very glad to have students who have blossomed because of our arts programming. As a matter of fact, one now who participated in our five-time Emmy-awarding program the Schiller Awards, is a teacher at Langston Hughes, and another one just signed with DEF Jam Records, and a third young middle schooler and was able to get a free summer camp with the Harlem -- the Dance Theater of Harlem. What am I asking? I'm giving you stats to show how much we impact Fulton County, and if you can believe it, we've never received an ounce of funding. I think it's time to not only have your support in word, but also indeed. We would greatly appreciate --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**JENNIFER DOBBS, PUBLIC SPEAKER:** "-- that so that we can partner together in continuing to serve our beloved K-12 students. Thank you so much."

**LENOARD MORROW, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Good morning. My name is Leonard Morrow. I'm a housing authority of Fulton County Commissioner District 1. And I'm speaking in response or as a follow-up to a letter that we penned to the Fulton County Commission regarding a Commissioner who has been disruptive such that we cannot have regular order in our meetings. And we're asking that you take the action required to see to it that we can proceed with our meetings in regular order. According to the letter that we submitted, asking that he be withdrawn and another person be appointed to the Housing Authority of the county. Thank you very much."

LOLITA GRANT, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. I'm Lolita Grant. I am the Interim Executive Director of the Housing Authority of Fulton County. I've served in that position since 2022, and Commission -- our Board of Commissioners meetings prior to the appointment of the Commissioner had been effective. We've been able to conduct business prior to that appointment. Since that appointment, our meetings have been disruptive. We have not been able -- we had to stop the meetings or reschedule the meetings. We've had to even hire security. I have staff that have some concerns, so we're asking for you to just consider the request to have that Commissioner replaced. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Next five speakers, please come down: Barbara Duffy, Tanray Garcia, Tank Harper -- Hank Harper, Deborah Allen, and Andy Patterson."

**BARBARA DUFFY, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Good morning. My name is Barbara Duffy. I live in District 1 -- or 2, and I have been on the Housing Authority of Fulton County for over 20 years. I have never experienced the kind of disruption that we have been

existing with, with a fellow Commissioner. And I ask you please, please read the letter that we've sent you. We held a hearing at your direction. We went with a Fulton County judge. All of that has come to you, and we ask for your help. We'd like to serve the residents of Fulton County with their housing needs, and we can't do it in the current climate. Thank you."

TANRAY GARCIA, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. My name is Tanray Garcia. I am the Deputy Executive Director for Housing Authority of Fulton County, and I was a victim of sexual harassment by the Consent Commissioner that we're asking to be removed. We did have a hearing. We sent a thumb drive as well attached with that letter to you asking for his removal. Since the harassment has occurred, he comes to the meetings -- he still comes to my office. He's still doing things that are completely inappropriate, and I'm just wondering why we haven't heard from you because this letter and the thumb drive of the hearing was sent a couple of months ago. I'm afraid sometimes to leave. I'm nervous on Commissioner when we have our monthly meetings. And I'm just asking that you please remove this man, because there is a serious safety concern for me, and our request has been ignored. So I'm asking you please, so that I can do my job as effectively and safely which I am entitled to be able to do so. Thank you."

HANK HARPER, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. My name is Hank Harper. I am a Fulton County Housing Authority Commissioner as well. And I concur with our young lady that just got through saying about this particular Commissioner. I actually am a former Florida legislator as well as a Housing Authority Commissioner here for over 20 years, a decade of service. And I have never in my life of service had a gentlemen ever become what I consider disrespectful comments, taking my food off of my plate, and doing things that made me extremely uncomfortable as a man. Trying to get his room next to mine and inviting me into his room; things that are just very unfair to anyone; and I just think I would have ask you to please consider removing this Commissioner because one of the things that I did not do and I had a right to do was file a lawsuit because of the sexual disrespect that I have witnessed as well as Ms. Garcia. So please consider removing this gentleman from the commission so that we can move forward in a healthy, happy situation on behalf of the residents of Fulton County. Thank you."

ANDREW PATTERSON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Andrew Patterson. I am an attorney. I represent the Housing Authority of Fulton County. As you've heard, the Board of Commissioners of the Housing Authority voted to have Commissioner Ron Shakir removed on the grounds that his behavior has been disruptive, that he's exhibited conduct unbecoming of a Commissioner, and because of allegations of sexual harassment. He was given notice of these charges. We held a public hearing that was notice provided on the agenda for the public to attend that hearing. He was specifically given notice of the hearing and chose not to participate. The hearing was conducted by the Honorable Thelma Wyatt Cummings Moore, retired

Superior Court Judge. She heard testimony. She sustained the charges and recommended that he be removed, and we have transmitted this information to the Fulton County Board of Commissioners, and we're asking that you accept or reject these findings. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Next five speakers, please come down: Antavius Weems, Michael Collins, Donna Nunn, Collins Desselle, and Tiffany Felix."

DEBORAH ALLEN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Deborah Allen. I am a resident Commissioner for the Fulton County Housing Authority, and I have been for 18 years. And I am here to ask that -- please consider removing this particular Commissioner for our Board because it has been disrupting. Never in my life with the Fulton County Authority have I ever seen a Commissioner like this. From day one, the first meeting that we had, he disrupted it as if it were a purpose for him to be there to do it. I'm very upset with him because we can't get anything done because of the disruptions. Different things that he's done: calling our chairman out of his name. I mean, being very disrespectful, and it's hard to get business done working with someone like that. And we're asking you please, please consider removing him."

ANTAVIUS WEEMS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Antavius Weems, Attorney Antavius Weems. I serve as the chair of the Housing Authority of Fulton County. Taking food off of someone's plate, trying to go into someone's room, representing -- misrepresenting himself as the spokesperson of the Housing Authority in DC to elected officials, taking pictures unsolicited of staff, going into staff members' offices, we are potentially facing two lawsuits on behalf of staff members against the Housing Authority because we have failed to act to protect them against Commissioner Ronnie Shakir. This authority has been notified on more than one more occasion of what he is doing. We've had to cancel meetings, specifically have to cancel the meeting tomorrow, because I literally can't be there. I have to travel to Seattle. I'm the only person that can generally try to get him to some type of order other than Attorney Patterson. He can't be here, so when the two of us can't be here to babysit him, we literally have to cancel the Housing Authority meeting. That means the business of the county cannot be accomplished. And we really genuinely need your help to remove Mr. Shakir. Maybe he's best served in another area, but certainly not in the Housing Authority. Thank you for your time."

MICHAEL COLLINS, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Hi, my name is Michael Collins. I'm from Color of Change. I'm here to talk about the Fulton County Jail. It's become clear that there is a culture of silence and obfuscation when it comes to the jail. You know it's very disappointing that there was no operations update published to date as there usually is every month that would give us detailed information about the jail. We know that there has been a substantial drop which we are appreciative of, and from 3,618 people on the 4th of September to today where there are 2,912 people. That's a drop of 20 percent, but we want to know, you know, what's driving that, what's going on, why we're without

an operations update from the boards; that's really hard. And we were also troubled by the article in the AJC last week on the DA and the grand jury process where it was reported that the DA had blocked the grand jury from issuing subpoenas to the Sheriff's office to investigate the jail, something that is their statutory right to do. As another example of this culture of silence and obfuscation we're seeing in the county around the jail, it was interesting to see that the grand jury in their report did say that there are \$40 million worth of repairs, which is a lot of money, but it's substantially lower than the cost of a new jail, and that was something that they also pointed out. We're also having a lot of trouble with the magistrate's process with gaining access to --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**MICHAEL COLLINS, PUBLIC SPEAKER:** "-- first appearance hearings as well. And then the latest, you know what we've seen around the Sheriff and the inmate's welfare fund is very challenging as well. So I urge you to pursue more accountability with respect to the jail. Thank you."

DONNA WATSON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. I'm Donna Watson and I'm the managing director of the Hammonds House Museum. And I just want to take a couple minutes to share my appreciation with you for your invaluable support, you know, to the Hammonds House Museum. Your Board has consistently provided support for us, and your dedication to the arts and continued backing of our museum has been instrumental in our ability to thrive, especially in this post-COVID-19 rebuilding -- arts rebuilding phase with what all cultural organizations have gone through across the country. The funding support that you have extended to the Hammonds House has allowed us to maintain some and enhance other programs, exhibitions, and educational initiatives for our members and patrons. We look forward to building on the foundation that has already been established. The support from your Board is a vote of confidence in the role that the arts planning in enriching our lives and strengthening our communities. You're ongoing commitment to our museum along with our legacy partner organizations, NBAF, Johns Creek Art Center, and the Chattahoochee Nature Center serves as a testament that you understand the importance of cultural institutions. So thank you again for your unwavering dedication to the arts. We're truly excited about what lies ahead. Thank you."

**COLLINS DESSELLE, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Good morning. I'm Collins Desselle. I work for the Alliance Theater which is part of the Woodruff Arts Center in the heart of District 3 of Fulton County. We are celebrating 55 years right in the middle of Fulton County. For those of you, I haven't met yet; it's so wonderful to see new faces. For those who are old friends, I'm glad to see you all are still here, and you're all looking wonderful and you haven't aged a day. And I hope you'll extend that same grace to me. But anyway -- like I said, I am with the Alliance Theater. I echo every single thing that my fellow artists and arts colleagues have said about the importance of arts and culture both as we were heading into the pandemic, through pandemic, and now thankfully on

the other side. Because of Fulton County's funding, we were able to navigate what I am hoping is a once in my lifetime pandemic event that I never see again. We were able to keep people on payroll, produce theater and shipping containers down near Georgia State, continue working in the Department of Juvenile Justice, continuing to work in all of our partner schools in Fulton County when everything was shut down; and that was all due to funding from the county. Now that we're all back in person, our teachers and partners see us as an instrumental partners who did not leave them behind during the pandemic, and we are welcoming children in droves to field trips to see a Christmas Carol, Into the Borough, and Knock-Knock. So we've got three shows running right now, and I invite you and your families and friends to please come over the holiday season and celebrate with us --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**COLLINS DESSELLE, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "-- Thank you. And I just wanted to wish you all a happy holiday season and just advocate for the continued art support. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Next five speakers, please come down: W. Imara Canady, Doree Henry, James Caldwell, Waverly T. Lucas, II, and Kathleen Bertrand."

TIFFANY FELIX, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. Thank you so much for all the work that you do for Fulton County for the opportunity to share my voice. My name is Tiffany Felix. I am coming in support of FACE. This group, Fashion Arts, Culture, and Education Atlanta, has a vision for Atlanta that is transformative. At the intersection of fashion arts, culture and education, you find tech and finance. You find inspiration. You find movement that elevates and touches all layers of our society. These are the very reasons that people relocate here and enrich art, history, and culture. I'm here in Atlanta, i.e., Fulton County, come with the conversations along with New York and Paris, not only putting Fulton County on the map, but also on world stage. This summer FACE sent two Clark Atlanta students to Paris fashion week. That singular experience will touch lives, will touch communities, will touch generations. It's a story -- it's the story and the energy that bring back the trust -- that they bring back to trust an intimate spaces into homes, among the children against the backdrop of our elders to create legacy. Through the education of a very tangible experience, you show another way. You ignite generational dreaming, and that builds generational wealth. At one of their events, I met a fashion designer who shared with me that he could not read until he was in 11th grade. He made to the 11th grade through memorizing what he needed to pass. Fashion provided him another way to communicate beyond words and perfect sentence structure, but he had a teacher who noticed that and helped him shift the paradigm. She got him into home-ec classes where he was able to learn to sew, and now he can stand and contribute fully as a husband, as a father, as a brand in a business that will create jobs, pay taxes, and build in the very spaces --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**TIFFANY FELIX, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "-- creating space and opportunity for him to thrive. Take away funding -- in taking away funding, we would be setting a fire to a bridge, an infrastructure that cannot be easily replaced. Please make a real effort to truly understand the critical nature of art and culture and the value that they bring to Fulton County. Thank you so much."

W. IMARA CANADY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning again. It is good to be with you this morning as we celebrate again as I say the Fulton County story. You know, as someone who's been blessed to sit at the right hand and the helm of some of our nation's greatest leaders and our committee's greatest leaders, I, probably better than others, know the challenges that you all face as public servants to really ensure that you represent the voice of all people throughout Fulton County. Well, as I think that has been manifested today, the voice of the people across Fulton County is saying art and culture matters from the furthest corner north to the furthest corner south and everything in between. I know that when people have come before you, there's sometimes that this false understanding that when we're talking about the part of arts and cultures, that that support is looking solely in terms of the parameters of the city of Atlanta, but what I want to say to you, and I think you've already heard, is that we're talking about a Fulton County story that impacts every corner of this community. You know, I want to speak, Commissioner Ellis, to you and just tell you about a conversation I had with some of your constituents just last night that were surprised that arts funding was even being considered to be cut because of the thriving community of artists that live in your district and the same with you, Commissioner Thorne. These folks may not be able to physically make it down here, but they are wanting to ensure that their voices are heard. I want to give this to the Clerk as a representation of close to 500 individuals that signed up saying we can't make it here at 10 o'clock, but our voice matters. I want to make you aware of ongoing online petitions from artists from the northern part of our corridor that are saying arts and culture matters --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**W. IMARA CANADY, PUBLIC SPEAKER:** "Thank you, Commissioner -- Chairman. But what I just really want to say to you is art and culture -- investing in art and culture is investing in community. You are here to serve the public and we know that you'll make the right decision for this year and for future years. Thank you and God bless."

**DOREE HENREY, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commissioners. My name is Doree Henry. I'm the Chief of Staff for State Senator Donzella James, who represents District 35, which are all of the cities in South Fulton and all of Douglas County. I'm here today on behalf of Senator James who regrets for not being here. She, unfortunately, is out of town at a funeral, but she sent me on her behalf. She wants to put on the record her support for youth outreach funding. I know

that that's a line item that's in your budget, and specifically the Royal Arts Charity Gala. This is an annual fundraising event aimed at raising funds for entertainment projects that reflect young people's lives and experiences; and their goal is to enhance academic and artistic enrichment through creative and original projects. Senator James has been a long-standing supporter of that particular initiative, which is very critical for our youth these days, you know, if they don't have anything to keep them occupied and busy, they get in a world of trouble. So this particular event is an annual event. It's held on -- it's going to be on February the 18th of 2024. And I just wanted to point out the state has its own budget for, and has a Council of Arts for 2024. There's \$3.5 million that's allocated for that program, out of that 3.5 million none of those projects are directed toward youth. So we're asking you to please to continue to support youth outreach projects and help our youth in Fulton County stay sustainable and get the help – help them to continue to thrive. Thank you for your time and consideration."

KATHLEEN BERTRAND, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. I'm Kathleen Bertrand, founder and executive producer of BronzeLens Film Festival, a nonprofit organization that will be celebrating its 15th year this year. I've stood before you on other occasions about other issues; even been honored here in this very weld. I want to say that for all that I've done over the years I want to just show appreciation for the support that you have given and especially today, the support that you have given BronzeLens Film Festival. Arts and arts organizations are part of the very fabric and lifeblood of this county. But many of us are just getting back on track post pandemic; many of the smaller organizations. So from the diversity of the kinds of organizations that are in the city, dance organizations, performance venues. You've heard from NBAF and Rialto. What you have to understand is when there is a cut in the funds, it's not just affecting the organizations, it affects the vendors, the people that we go out and hire to help us to put on our events, and it affects the programs that we want to present and, finally, it affects the people that we hire as team members or as staff. Everybody gets affected when there is a cut. I'm grateful that you are generous and you're giving to the arts and culture of the city and of this county over the past few years, and I'm here to join with the voices of the other organizations that you've heard from this morning to ask that you please maintain --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**KATHLEEN BERTRAND, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "-- and do not cut arts funding. Thank you so much. Have a great day.

**WAVERLEY T. LUCAS, II, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Greetings. My name is Waverley T. Lucas, II, and I'm cofounder, codirector, and resident choreographer for Ballethnic Dance Company in East Point, Georgia. We are a southern cultural treasure, and recently Ballethnic Way will be our street that we've invested in. And as I speak of investment, I want to thank you for your investment in Ballethnic because when I go back, I look at the times when we were here outside the Arts Congress, at the Atlanta

Civic Center with Maynard Jackson, so forth, and we had basically just started an idea. We left the Dance Theater of Harlem, my wife, Nina and I, and joined the Atlanta Ballet. We made history as the first time that you had five black African-American ballet dancers, professional black ballet dancers, in a ballet company, and that's significant. More history. My wife, Nina, is the only female cofounder of one of the three professional black ballet companies in America here. And I'm going back in history because I just had to share a quote of the great Marcus Garvey who is the image of our urban nutcracker doll, said there is no future for people who deny their past. We have our past. There's no Ballethnic without Fulton County, the funding for that. So I want you to understand how important what you do is and how it will live beyond you because Fulton County is who supported us when no one else would, who saw that vision. There are many Ballethnic, but then there are many like organizations like ours who are now at 30 so many."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Fifteen seconds."

**WAVERLEY T. LUCAS, II, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "And we need that continued support to continue to thrive instead of just survive. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Last five speakers in Assembly Hall: Amari Franklin, Ficara Akins, Alex Lex Perry, Dr. Aduke Aremu, and Kenya Mitchell."

AMARI FRANKLIN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Hi, everybody. Good morning, my name is Amari Franklin. I go to Clark Atlanta University. I'm a senior, and I study fashion design and merchandising. I'm here to talk on behalf of FACE, and I just also want to thank you guys for allowing us to go to Paris, France to experience this. It was a very pivotal moment for myself and my colleague, Ficara. It was my first time traveling out of the country, so I thought that was a really big thing, and my mom was very proud. I ask that you guys would please continue to support Mr. David Manuel because this is something that could help a lot of students as myself and people of my disabled community to be able to show them that you can do anything no matter what circumstances that you face. And I would just like to say a very big thank you again and I'm very grateful. God was definitely with us while we there and with you guys as well, and I just pray that you guys do continue to support Mr. David Manuel, because without him, neither of us, or I don't think any other people would be able to afford or be able to get out there, to be able to fulfill their dreams; and just to be able to see the world and have such a great time. So again, thank you so much for listening to me, and I'll pray for you guys, because I know you guys have a lot more speakers, but have a good one."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Amen."

**FICARA AKINS, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Hi, my name is Ficara Akins. I am the second participant of the trip that FACE allowed for us to go to. I just would like to say thank you for the opportunity. It is extremely pivotal and critical for you all to keep FACE within

the Fulton County community. While I am not from here, I do attend Clark Atlanta University with my colleague, Amari Franklin, and we really were exposed to something that we've never seen before. It was, too, my first time traveling outside of the country, and so what David Manuel, along with others within the FACE department, what they created, it was something golden. And considering the fact that we were the first ones, I really truly do hope that you all continue this program, that way other students can experience what we were able to. So I would just like to say thank you."

DR. ADUKE AREMU, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. Thank you for affording me the opportunity to speak to you today. My name is Dr. Aduke Aremu, and for the last 30 years I have produced, facilitated, advocated arts and culture for young people. Since I've arrived in this wonderful county and in the state of Georgia, I have formed a coalition of other artists, producers, and entertainment folks whose sole purpose is to produce and present projects for our young people solely. We also have acquired the film studio in Fulton County which has donated their entire staff and team to the production of film for young people, dance projects for young people, music for young people, et cetera. I ask you today to support the initiative of continuing vigorous funding for our young people productions, which is film and music, dance, et cetera. I also ask you to support us. We have formed a tremendous movement and coalition which will be at the Fox Theatre February 18th, in which artists from all over the state of Georgia will come together to shout in one voice, we support young people productions. At that event, your honorable director of arts and cultural David Manuel, will be honored along Commissioner Larry Johnson, Commissioner Oz Nesbitt, Commissioner Jane Andrews, and many of our powerful leaders of this particular state who are coming together to say please support projects for young people in film, music, art, and dance. We are solely concerned --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds"

**DR. ADUKE AREMU, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "-- thank you, sir. We are solely concerned with the proliferation of these projects for our younger audiences that are morally imperative positive and give them a sense of self-esteem. Thank you to this wonderful board."

**KENYA MITCHELL, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "Hi, my name is Kenya Mitchell, and I'm here representing Take the Time Foundation, because they matter, as well as working closely with Dr. Aduke and the arts program, as well as Rock for Hip-Hop Youth, that is gun violence, as well as arts and music. My father's foundation as well, that was big at the Sweet Auburn Festival, Just Blues. So working with all of those together, I believe that we can stop the things at the root of the problem. If we put the money at the root of the problem, it can save us money in the long run. Because a lot of these speakers, it all comes from the root of the problem, which are the children. If we pour into the children, they won't become adults that are complaining about pay and not having confidence to go perform in arts. Arts, music, mental health, healthy coparenting classes, all of that

together works to bring out a healthy adult in our society that can have entrepreneurship opportunities. Having music and art, it really makes you feel alive; it makes you feel like you have a purpose. So that's really important for children. Like I said, putting the money at the root of the problem which is the children. Once you instill the confidence and the leadership skills and healthy homes and healthy households, we can eliminate a lot of the problems that we're hearing today from the adults because we're all just the children from the beginning. And if we stop those, I'm really -- I stand firm on that. The children need the funding. They need the time. It takes a village. That's where it starts. It's imperative, the youth. We won't have these problems complaining about pay --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

**KENYA MITCHELL, PUBLIC SPEAKER**: "-- because they'll have entrepreneurships to create generational wealth. They'll have the confidence to go perform on Broadway, all over the world, and it'll give them a reason; a purpose and creativeness. Thank you so much for your time."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Mr. Chairman, we have 13 speakers on Zoom and two e-mailed in comments."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right. It is almost 12 o'clock. We'll take the Zoom and what are the others?"

**CLERK GRIER**: "E-mail."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "E-mails at the conclusion of the meeting, if there are no objections. Continue."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Okay, the next item will be the add-on item that was moved up, 23-0839. Discussion: Election Update, sponsored by Commissioner Thorne."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Ms. Patrice Perkins Hooker."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "I just wanted to --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Thorne, go ahead; you have the floor?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "I just want to say Fulton County's traditionally always got an election update following an election. So I believe we need to take this opportunity to discuss it, especially since we had some issues that required a recount. Typically, our Director of Elections would give us this update. She is unavailable, which I find very

disappointing, but I thank you, Ms. Hooker, for coming down here and giving us that update."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Thank you. No problem, that's what we're here for, is to make certain that your questions are addressed. The Fulton County election cycle for municipal elections was perfect with regard to the Election Day and what happened in spite of challenges that we'd informed you about as it was going along. Challenges created from two sources; one for redistricting efforts of some local municipalities, and the impact on voters. And the second one what was the GARViS system. And the system, basically communication glitches that impacted the vote ballots for people. All 147 Fulton County voting precincts were open, operational, and equipped. They all had no problems with regard to wait lines, and we had no legal action needed in order to extend the election's time frame. And what I mean by the elections went perfect, the elections did run smoothly. We had the issues that were impacted, and I think in the memo that we provided to you, we showed you the few voters who were impacted by those districts, by districts, by city, because we could identify by virtue of going through the recount at our own initiative, what was the impact on an election. We were very concerned to make certain that every vote would count and where we could fix the votes and could fix the districts. We went through a detailed analysis of those districts that where questionable in their street assignments and we spent that time doing that recount to make certain that the votes where accurate as cast. And so, that's why we did the recount. It was not mandated by anybody, but ourselves. And in the process of the recount, we observed that there was a discrepancy between the number of advanced voting ballots, and those advanced voting ballots when the recount number was 300 less than the original day of elections. And we went again to do a deep dive to see what was the cause. We are committed to trying to ensure accuracy before certification, and we did it, and we got the results out. They were sent to you all today. They are not due to the state for another couple of days, although we sent it to the Secretary of State's office in advance. So I'd like to address any questions that you think were problems. Commissioner, since you were the only person who talked to the e-mails and questions, like six of them yesterday."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Yes, I'd like, too. Thank you for coming down, first of all. I really appreciate you covering for us so -- so I guess you explained Wednesday, you sent us an e-mail on Wednesday with just glowing results. The election was great, just a few little minor redistricting issues, but all in all everything was great."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE**: "And the Secretary of State said so, too."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Hold on."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "So then Thursday, after our agenda was already due, we get an e-mail -- a notification of a recount with no explanation from the director. I

questioned, you know, why are we doing this recount? You answered, she has the right to call for a recount, but you got to understand, calling for a recount is kind of a big deal, and had this been a big election, like in 2024, it would be headline news. So that was very concerning to me. On Saturday, Mariska Bodison sent us an e-mail with an explanation as to why they're doing the recount. But I had all day from Thursday night through Friday till Saturday, with no explanation, and I think that's kind of uncalled for. And then yesterday, we get notified that you're having to do another recount because you were missing some votes, the 300 some votes. I listened to the Board of Elections meeting. There was no real hard questions asked, so I want to know how did we miss these votes? How did we -- what happened? The results were uploaded on November 13th at 10 something at night, and then we had to do another recount before certification. And I took it as it was absentee ballots, which it wasn't, it was advanced early voting ballots. So I want to know. We just built this beautiful warehouse where everything can be in one location and nothing can get lost, and there's a chain of custody. So I'm concerned what happened."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Well, nothing got lost. What it was not scanned at the huge facility where everybody could see the entirety of what we were doing. There were stacks of 31 boxes clearly labeled in blue, which is the absentee -not the absentee, the advanced voting code. There were 31 boxes, each of them representing a quote unquote, precinct four, that the election results. Those 31 boxes, unfortunately, due to human error, were all stacked up in one little row with two boxes. two -- double high. And then they had adjacent to that, a pallet where they were supposed to be transferring the boxes from one area that was like this close to another area that was this close, after they were scanned. So they went from one area publicly visible, to the counting, the scanning room, back to the pallet. They did not -- because of the close proximity, they put one box on the pallet before it had been scanned. So it never was lost. It just wasn't scanned. When we observed it, that night, in fact, I stayed up with them to 12 o'clock at night trying to figure out what we needed to do. My commitment is to make certain it's accurate. So my commitment was to tell the executive director you need to rescan the advanced voting because we know it's there, because it had already been reported in the election results. So we went back and recounted just that advanced voting ballot and saw, made sure all 31 boxes got counted. So they didn't go anywhere, they didn't move. Chain of custody was right there in front of monitors, observers, the world. But they were all stacked up and, due to human error, one box was not scanned."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "So the question about the chain of custody: so normally you have a box, it's sealed, it has a chain of custody form. You open that box and whoever opens it has to sign on the chain of custody. You scan it, then you reseal the box, and then you put the date, the person, the chain of custody when you seal the box back up again. So if you missed a box, wouldn't you be able to see, oh, this one was never opened, the chain of custody's still the same, it hasn't been resealed. I don't understand how -- you should be able to say, okay, this is the one we never sealed.

There should have been checks and balances to make sure all of them were sealed, unless you broke the chain of custody with the ballots."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "That's not correct. Your description of the process is correct, but the chain of custody, if no one is looking at the actual boxes after they are resealed to see if there was an additional signature or change in signature, you wouldn't have caught it, and that's what happened. The volunteer who was working or the person assigned to that -- not volunteer because everybody was getting paid. But the person who was working within that area, just didn't note that it had not been scanned. So we maintained chain of custody the entirety of the time. They were resealed, and if they're already sealed, you would note that it hadn't been resealed unless you were actually going through that. And we would not just rescan one box after we had concluded the election. The process is you have to do a recount of the entirety of the tabulation for that particular type of ballot. So that's what we decided to do early in the morning on Wednesday. I'm losing all my days, I guess on Tuesday, to make certain that we can make the deadline by 5 o'clock for the certification of the elections. So they just did that one series, and we could have just ignored it and gone back to certify the numbers from the existing election, but that wouldn't have been right, from my perspective, because I wanted to make certain that they were a 100 percent accurate."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay. Is there a process in place so that this doesn't happen again?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Yes, there is, and a great question because of the fact that I am, you know, one of these Georgia Tech industrial management majors. I put into place a quality control process such that after that election, I told them we need to make certain somebody's just doing QA/QC. So somebody's job is to pick up a box. Three people were scanning, another person's job is to stack them up, and somebody is watching it. So at the recount, we implemented that quality control process, and we will be using that process for every category of election ballots. But it had never happened before to the county. They didn't know about it, and that's what we end up doing as a result of that, but it didn't result in anybody's vote being taken out of that room, that warehouse, nor did it result in the votes being lost; the box was just not scanned, and we identified that discrepancy on our own and took corrective action."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "So to move on to another errors that were made in redistricting, this is a big concern of mine, and I addressed these concerns with Nadine back in January, because I personally had issues with redistricting people going to vote, and my name wasn't on the ballot. My race wasn't on the ballot. And then Commissioner Arrington had issues with his district, too. So I asked her moving forward, what are we going to do to make sure this doesn't happen again? She told me it was a conspiracy theory, but I said it wasn't. We need to be double checking, triple

checking, making sure. But here, it happened again. And not only in South Fulton and East Point, Atlanta had issues. There were other issues across the county, so I wanted you to speak on the redistricting errors."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "You have the redistricting issues, and we've tried not to call on our partners as committing errors. They would have the same type of concerns with their databases. We conduct elections for municipalities. We do not take the data of a municipality and alter it. We take that data -- they send it to us, we take the data, we build a ballot form based upon the streets and the districts that they have notified us had been redistricted. We then send that information back to them to be confirmed. It was done for the city of Atlanta; it was done for East Point. It was done for all of the municipalities for which we conducted an election. I think it was day two of advance voting, I got a call from the mayor of East Point indicating that there were some problems with some of her constituents who had gone in to vote in advance voting, and they did not have a race on their ballot, and they were -- it said that they were in one district, but they were -- there may have been another. We then worked with the city of East Point to try and figure out what was causing the problem, and we weren't absolutely certain; but then we realized that we needed to get our teams together. So our team went to work with the GIS folks, and the team from the Clerk's office in East Point, to try to address that and reconcile where the problems were identified, the precincts. We put signage up to let them know to check their ballot to make certain that there was an issue with regard to their district, or they're concerned about their district, please let us know, then they would supposed to be given a provisional ballot, but sometimes the provisional ballots might not have reflected the same district that was still a concern by some citizens who were adamant that they were in a particular district. But that district map didn't reflect it just point-blank and period. So we went back and forth for another week with the city of East Point. We finally got it together, but you see on the memo you got, the number of 16 ballots that were impacted solely from the redistricting. And then we worked with the city of Atlanta,. They got theirs straightened immediately. The city of South Fulton discovered their error really as a result of some print revelations from the Commissioner later on. They didn't catch it in the very first week of advanced voting. But by the time of the Election Day, all of the issues that we could address on their behalf we did, which included three absentee ballots who had voted and sent them in, and they were at the wrong district. We send new ballots out to them, and those three voters did get the correct ballot. So there were issues with that, but that issue was also compounded by the database issues coordinating and communicating from the state office through GARViS and no link with our poll pads, and that was probably the problem related to some of the problems that you all had in the county election, but in the county election, we were responsible, and we could manipulate the database. In the city elections, the city is responsible so we didn't have the abilities to go and change their data willy-nilly."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "So basically, 16 South Fulton and six East Point voters were disenfranchised. They didn't get the correct ballot."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "They did not get the correct ballot, that's correct."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "So I received a report from somebody in actually District 3 that went and looked at my voter page, looked at their ballot, decided who they were going to vote for, went to their precinct to vote, and they didn't get the right ballot. There is a lot of conversation back and forth with the manager calling in the call center. Eventually, the voter, the manager had to give her the correct ballot by pulling it up on the BMD using the combo codes. Using her admin card, pulling it up, so she could vote. The entire process took about 45 minutes long, which a lot of people going in just for small municipal elections don't have 45 minutes. Which turned out her husband went in later that day and was put through the same process. Unfortunately, he didn't have the 45 minutes to wait, so he just didn't vote. So that's voter suppression, and we've got to do better about making sure people go to vote and they have the correct ballot. And you said in your meeting that you went through just East Point and South Fulton kind of checking to see who got the wrong ballot, who got the right ballot, but if a manager pulls it up on a BMD, the ballot, you will still think that they voted whatever's in the poll pad, because that combo code, there's no way of reconciling what combo code was pulled up to put to mark that ballot with that voter, that particular voter."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "There is no way to mark a ballot with that -- for that particular voter; however before that manager got that combo code, they had to call the elections hub to get the combo number, and they had to explain and document why they needed it. So we're not able to track these ballots like we did the ones for those cities where we knew that there were redistricting errors, and we could track it that way. That particular person's problem and that person was a friend of one of the state election board members who actually came to observe the election night vote on Tuesday, and she reported that to us at the time, but that was a result of GARViS system not having that particular voter assigned to that precinct, even though the My Voter page had the right precinct information, but the GARViS now link situation has to be resolved. We're working with our partners at the Secretary of State's office to get this resolved. We wrote letters to the Secretary of State's office before the election, and it's not a problem for just Fulton County, Commissioners, the commissioners of Cobb, Gwinnett, DeKalb, Clayton all went to the Secretary of State's office and said, hey, we have a problem here, Houston, and it's going to be a bigger issue in the 2024 election when you don't have just one or two off, but you could have a possibility of people having long lines waiting for that process to take place. I am sorry for that voter's problem. We're not trying to keep people from voting, but we have to make certain that the data that's in the system makes sense with what they're voting for, and we do have to work on the component parts; and we're trying to work on it. But that one is not one we're going to be able to fix ourselves. The municipalities, we can work with our municipal governments and try to get their data correct before 2024, because they're not going to do another redistricting. But that particular situation happened often

-- frequently at different polling precincts, and I appreciate those who were tenacious enough to wait for us to try to get the information in a way that the poll manager could create a ballot form, but it took a process. And one of the processes just to let you know that we're trying to do going forward, is just to go ahead and get the provisional ballots done at the beginning, so they come in and out of the poll pads. Because we've seen this now, we know what it looks like, we know how random it is, here's your provisional ballot. And then you have to convince a voter to take a provisional ballot, because a lot of people really want to vote on the machine and they give us pushback on it, but we're working through trying to get them an opportunity to vote, but that was the only way we could --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "-- but you can only get a provisional ballot on Election Day, which a majority people are doing advanced early voting, so what are we going to do to solve the advanced early voting people that are getting the wrong ballot?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE**: "I do not know right at this point, because of the fact that there is no way for us to determine in advance that they have the wrong ballot until they go to a precinct, any precinct that's an advanced voting precinct, and then they let us know about the problem, and then we'll have to keep working with the Secretary of State's office, that's all we can do."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "And speaking into hiring provisional managers for every precinct, as a manager you have two assistant managers. I think every manager needs to assign one of their assistant managers to be strictly a provisional ballot clerk, but they can do other duties, because typically you only have -- I sometimes have zero provisional voters. The most I've ever had, I think is eight, and that was when we had to keep the polls open two hours longer because Fulton screwed up and the judge mandated that we had to stay open too, and everybody had to vote on the provisional list, our vote emergency ballot. But I was looking at your e-mail, and it said there were 30,091 provisional ballots cast in this election."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "That's what the report reflected that you asked for on election night."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Isn't that an exceptionally large number of provisional --"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "-- well, they weren't provisional ballots. The provisional and absentee are included in subcategory. So the numbers might have been reversed but absentee ballots and provisional are totaled together and treated the same way."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay. And can you -- when the second recount when you decided you had the missing box and you had to recount all 31 boxes, did you notify the Secretary of State immediately?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "Yes, they were told before every recount, and they were made aware of every recount results."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay, because I had conflicting information, because I had reached out to the Secretary of State's office for something."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "Remember, I sent you an e-mail of the actual notification of the recount -- no, the transmittal of the votes, which you asked about; but we also notified -- I mean, Blake was aware. That's who we're doing with. I don't know who you're dealing with."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay. I would double check to see if Blake was aware of that. In your meeting, did a convicted felon vote?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "At our meeting? A convicted felon did not vote."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "You have a challenged voter who was a convicted."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "Frank, Frank somebody had said at the meeting on yesterday, there was a hearing held for a felon who we were notified by the Secretary of State's Office was a felon that we needed to decide to remove him from the roster. He was given notice of the hearing and he failed to show at the hearing."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "But don't we get a list of convicted felons and we're supposed to clean our voter lists of those convicted felons? Did we fail to clean the list because Mr. Johnson, a few meetings ago, mentioned why aren't we getting convicted felons?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "We are getting notification from the Secretary of State's office about felons. This one from yesterday was one of the ones that we were notified about. But they are given an opportunity to have a hearing. They're given an opportunity to provide documentation of the fact that they've cleared their record; they have finished probation and any other type of payments. So we send out letters to them once we get the information from the Secretary of State."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "But he should've been on a list and should have been cleaned off, shouldn't he?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "No, he shouldn't until we actually have a meeting to give them an opportunity to be heard. There's a due process or to --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "-- he has to have it because he was challenged --"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "-- no, he wasn't challenged --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "-- and you should be getting a list of convicted felons that are removed and it should be routine maintenance of the voter rolls. So my question is, are we doing routine maintenance of the voter rolls by removing felons, convicted felons, from our list?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Commissioner Thorne, Fulton County never does an independent search for anybody: dead people, felons, people who live out of state. The Secretary of State's office sends Fulton County a daily list of issues. People who are dead, they need to be removed; people who are felons that need to be removed. It is our obligation, once we receive that, to send a notice even to the dead people to let them know that we found a live person who the Secretary of State had reported dead and the person came to the hearing, and say, what do you mean, I'm not dead. We don't have the -- we don't have the right to remove anybody's privilege to vote without a hearing. So that person came to a hearing for the first time, and yesterday, that person's rights -- he was removed from the roster. And that did come from the Secretary of State's office and not a challenge. We have had a challenge with another person who was using someone else's address, but that person was removed as well. So we are systemically following the process. We are not, on our own, initiating any investigation of our voting rolls to remove anybody."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "The person you removed, did he vote in the last election?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "Yes, he did. He voted every -- he's voted the last three of four years."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "So he's a voter that we allowed that shouldn't have been on there?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "No, we allowed the voter to vote until his rights were removed."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay, regarding cell phones in the warehouse, we need transparency. We are lacking trust in our election system, yet when some people entered the warehouse yesterday, they were told they couldn't bring their phones in, they had to leave them in the cars or they had to check them in. Where are we developing these policies? The policy seems to change throughout the day. I was in communications with you, our attorneys. Who's setting these policies? We had people with -- I know a Democrat candidate who was able -- she was notified that 72 hours before if she had applied, she could get into these certain areas. But her challenger didn't know and wasn't able to go past certain tables. Now he called his attorney, they

wrote a letter, and he was eventually allowed to go to other areas of the warehouse, but we've set up the warehouse to make it fully transparent, to make it visible for people, then yet, we have these random, okay, you need to check your phone in, you can't take pictures, but you can have your phone in and you can get right up here, but you can't get right up here. So I want to know who's setting these procedures. I want to know how are the candidates -- how are the public aware of these procedures, and are we following the law?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Okay. Let me tell you where we are. Commissioner, your ten minutes are up on this particular item -- so let's --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "-- I believe like people have talked a lot longer than ten minutes."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Just a minute. Just a minute. Let's hear, we have two more speakers, and then we'll come back to you. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and Commissioner Ellis, and then we'll come back to you."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "Thank you, Chairman. Chairwoman Patrice Perkins-Hooker, you did not identify who you are even though we all know who you are, there may be someone listening and would you please identify who you are?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "Yes, my name is Patrice Perkins-Hooker. I'm a resident of District 6, 5. That's your district, right, 5. And I am the chairperson for the Fulton County Board of Elections and Registrations since June."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "And why are you here today?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "I am here today because there was a request to have an elections update, and because the elections director, was not able to attend. There are only a couple of people who have the authority to speak on behalf of the department, and I'm one of them, and I volunteered to come to make certain that the Commissioners were granted an opportunity to have their questions addressed."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "Thank you for coming today. So you came here as a request, someone requested someone to come from, and so that's why you're here, and it was added on in order for you to be here, right?

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Yeah, well I presume so."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "Thank you. Did we have any problems, any glitches, anything that happened during this election that would have changed anybody's race as to whether they would have won or lost?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "No, and that is why we did the recounts so I could stand up here look y'all in the eye and say, no."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "So is it true to say that you were proactive in any things that may have happened?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "We tried up to the extent that we could to be as proactive as possible and then to double check to make certain that what we did do not impact any race."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "Is it also true that the municipalities as well as the Secretary of State have responsibility in getting correct information to you all?"

CLERK GRIER: "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "Okay. Does sometime they do not do that correctly?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "Okay. Is it also true that sometimes you have to do due process when there's somebody who is either deceased, name change, whatever the information you've given you have to do due process to make sure that that person is not being disenfranchised?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Yes, that's required on the federal and state law."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "Okay, my last question to you, in your career here, dealing with the elections, have you ever have an election that went so smoothly that you did not have one problem?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "No, we have not, in my experience in the last ten years of dealing with elections or because of the fact that Fulton County has had problems that are repeated -- reported by news people or complained about by citizens, those particular problems that I alerted you all to, as soon as they occurred, I told you, and then we worked through ways to try to do what we could on our end."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN**: "In time because of the Chairman asked that we move on, I just want to go on record saying, thank you. I was made aware of some of the problems. I was given information. I appreciate you all being proactive. There is no hidden agenda to take, steal, destroy, hide, or anything in Fulton County. Were there some mistakes, yes. Were there mistakes that were out your control, yes, but I thank you for being proactive, and I thank you for being here today."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right, Vice Chair Ellis, and then back to Commissioner Thorne, and I'm going to sum up here."

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "Yeah, Mr. Chair, I mean, just based on our rule, we normally don't have a time limit on discussion items. I mean, I don't -- if Commissioner Thorne could wrap up her comments, I'd like to give her back the floor and let her wrap up and then close with my questions."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We do have. You can speak just about ten minutes."

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "I know, but there's not really -- I don't think our rules call for a time limit when we're in a discussion item."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah. But I keep track of not the responses."

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "I know. I know. I know. I mean we've definitely have had -- I just want to give the courtesy to her to wrap up."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We're back to her now?"

VICE CHAIR ELLIS: "Do you want me to --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No, no, no. You have the floor now, Vice Chair."

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "I will keep my stuff relatively brief. Ms. Hooker thanks for being here. Really sort of two -- two things, okay? You did come in here and say everything was perfect, right? So it wasn't --"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "-- the operations."

VICE CHAIR ELLIS: "-- perfect, I would caution us just sort of -- be careful about the language we use, in terms of when we describe things that's perfect, and recognize this is a large logistical effort and that sort of thing. I do -- the one -- the one thing I will say is like we've had, maybe we're making progress to where this will not -- we won't have this issue at all come the next time. We had some previous elections where we missed some batches of votes. We certified it, and the Secretary of State had to come back and said, oh, you missed a few precincts or whatever, right. All right, so this time we do a recount, we've missed a batch of things, we catch it on our own, you know, maybe there's a different way you communicated that. But the key thing is it's happened now on multiple occasions. One time we caught it before it got certified. Other times we didn't catch it before it got certified. So we talked -- this process we talk about, we're talking having a process related to this many times ago, right? So there's obviously, and we were assured that there that there was going to be a process, it wasn't a

process. It happen again, you caught it before it got certified better, but the next time it doesn't need to happen at all, right? I guess that's where I'm hoping -- that would be my hope that if we do have a process, let's make darn sure we have a process and it's followed, okay, on that particular point. On the -- oh, shoot. Now, I lost my whole train of thought on this whole thing. I'm going to let Commissioner Thorne -- well, one more thing. On this issue of the people that -- that we get supplied the list of, it should be removed from the rolls. Do we remove them and send them notice and say, if you object to this, then come in, or do we wait to have them respond before we remove them?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "The letter actually reads: you have been -- we've been notified by the Secretary of State's office that you are a felon and they request that you be removed from the rolls. Please provide us with any documentation or information that you have that may address the issues. And then we said you have a right to appeal this particular decision by coming and request a hearing by the Board, or get a hearing before the Board, and we put it on the next Board meeting agenda to deal with."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "What is the standard practice with election's boards? Do they remove the person and then send notice and say, hey, if you object to this, come in here and show why you shouldn't be removed, or is it -- let's wait; let's give the person an extended period of time to respond before they are removed. Do you understand the distinction?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "I understand the distinction."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "What other boards -- what do other local elections boards do?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "I don't know, but they do everything. They don't have a -- there's no set mandate on what you do as an election board with regard to your hearings on matters that are challenged or matters that notify. We, as Fulton County, follow the process I told you, which is that we tell people when they have been --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "-- could we ask for some direction from the State Elections Board about what they would deem to be a consistent practice?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "I guess you all could, but we would follow our rules until got any --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "-- okay, so in essence, you're telling me there are some election boards they may say, hey, we get the notice from the Secondary of State, there's a convicted felon, we pull him off, we send him a letter and say if you object to it,

you can provide us with additional information. Some folks may do that, some folks may do this."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "That's correct."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "So there may not be consistently from county to county on that?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "Yes, there is not consistency from county to county, Commissioner."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "There is not consistency from county to county on that, okay. All right, my last thing is on the redistricting piece, so we had that issue twice now. One time, if I heard you say correctly, that was more of the responsibility fell upon us. This time, if I'm hearing you correctly, you're suggesting that that responsibility fell more on the municipalities. We are going to have another redistricting, right? There's going to be a special session, there's going to be another redistricting, right?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "That's correct."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS**: "So I'm not asking you for the answer right now, but we, I think, do need to hear from you all about how you are aggressively going to, you know, deal with that and make sure that with this next round of redistricting adjustments, that we're not going to have, you know, the issues we've now seen now in two cycles, right? You know, because it just has the potential to be a lot more of a magnified issue with this particular set of redistricting. So I'm not looking for an answer on that, that's more just a request."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "I actually think that that is very good request, Commissioner Ellis, and we will continue to work with the County Strategic Team, but we have that brain trust going on that has helped improve the process already in Fulton County elections; and we need to have collective input on how to do that, because it is not our goal to have any problems. So we will be working with them to try to how to figure how we confirm -- the issue is actually in the confirmation of the new lines."

VICE CHAIR ELLIS: "Right, right."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "And making certain that they correspond to our GIS information, and then our databases. So we will work with that team and try to figure out a process. We are working through conceptually a plan, and I think we do need more people on there."

VICE CHAIR ELLIS: "All right, thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Commissioner Arrington?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you, Madam Chair for being here today. It's refreshing to receive this type of response to questions. I would -- I guess, I would want to know your take on whether we should maybe take that to our -- include this as part of our legislative agenda, the uniformity of how people are removed, you know. When I hear you say the words, due process, I would hate for someone to take my -- any of my rights away, before offering me a hearing and an opportunity to contest the allegations. And so, I can't imagine that anyone -- it's scary to think that there may be other counties that are immediately removing people without giving them a hearing. That's unconstitutional. So, Ms. Corbitt, we need to make sure that that's part of our legislative agenda. We need to ask our state legislators to make sure that the different counties have some uniform policy as to how convicted felons are removed. And I assume that our state legislature would not pass a law that would be unconstitutional and it would remove someone's rights before giving them a hearing and an opportunity to be heard on whether the allegations are true or not. So thank you again. I hope you come back every time."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "I do want to say that this process was not something that started on my watch. This is how Fulton County has handled these types of challenges beforehand."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay. On the hearing, he was scheduled to have a hearing, it was delayed. You've reached out, contacted him to make sure because you guys didn't want to clear him because he didn't show. So this is the second time he didn't. And in that time frame, he voted."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "You keep saying -- he would be entitled to a vote until there's an actual --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "-- but you had a hearing scheduled in the meeting before, and he didn't show up, and you guys reached out to him. His phone had gotten disconnected, so you reached out to him via mail. You went through great efforts to contact him."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "We do that."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Which is appreciative, but then you ended up removing him anyway. So a convicted felon that you had documentation that he was a convicted felon, he had not served his sentence yet was removed. You legitimately removed him from the rolls, but he got the opportunity to vote because of a delay. So I'm just going to

leave that there. In regards to transparency in the warehouse, that's kind of where I left off. I want uniform rules. I want them written. I want them somewhere on a website. I want them access to everybody so everybody knows what to expect when they come to our warehouse. The purpose of videotaping, it was set up to protect voters in the precincts while they're voting, because nobody wants pictures being taken while you're voting. Nobody wants pictures of their ballot, how they're voting. So for privacy, that was the intent of the law. Maybe the law needs to be codified, but once a ballot is cast, it's anonymous. We don't know who cast it. It's just a bunch of ballots. It's a bunch of paper. So there shouldn't be all this hyper concern about people having their phones out. I had an incident where an older gentleman was going to his training class for early voting, he's worked early voting for years. It's like his joy. He's retired. His wife passed away. He's working early voting all 19 days. And last minute in the class, they were going to go over the GARViS system. It was 22 pages long. So he's like gosh, I'm not going to catch on to this in 15 minutes. I better record everything the instructor said. The instructor got mad for him recording in a class going over the GARViS system."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "It's not allowed."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Why? Why is it not allowed?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Because those are our policies. Unlike what you prefer, our department has had -- developed policies, procedures, notification rules, in conjunction with the Secretary of State's office to protect the integrity of the process. A classroom instruction should not be taped, filmed, and they are told not to bring cameras or any recording devices. That is part of our policy, so the teacher was following our policies. Whether or not you like it to be different, our policies and procedures are designed in a way we're running the department. So the issue with the cameras and you're correct, we changed that process because of consultation with my esteemed colleague, the County Attorney, because we were following guidelines that were put in writing under the Secretary of State's the SCB regulations with regard to no cameras, videos, and recording devices allowed in tabulations. They view the recount as tabulation, and so they were -- nobody could bring it in. We then found out that the public area that is screened from the tabulation area could have their cell phones, and we went out -- and thank my vice chair, Michael Heekin, went out and announced to everybody, if you've been told to not have your cameras and phones in this area, you can go get your cameras and your phones. But we didn't have monitors who were able to - they're credential tabulation observers, they still did not have their phones. Now the problem is, those of you who've been to the warehouse, it's huge, it's open. You can see everything for like 60,000 feet, it's huge. So the front area is quadrant off with police barricades like for parades, steel barriers, and those folks in there could have their cameras and we made that correction, okay."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Yes, it was around 4 o'clock."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Well, it was earlier than 4 o'clock. We made that correction earlier than that because I left by 4, that's the reason I know it was earlier than 4 o'clock, on the date that we made that change, which was on Tuesday. But they had been using that process in Fulton County forever. We had actually asked the Secretary of State's office, they sent us the code section. There is ambiguity in the code section of whether or not it applies to just absentee or advanced voting or day of voting. We are trying to develop, in fact, Nadine is working on that now, a standard little brochure, flyer, announcement about what we are going to do in Fulton County publish it. So again, the consistency and the transparency to publish it, and that way we'll know who can and when carry whatever devices. That doesn't mean that someone may challenge us or not challenge us because of the fact they think it should be interpreted a different way. But the County Attorney can tell you it's ambiguous. So we had developed policies and procedures that weren't in writing, but was applied. So we are going to still take the position that you cannot bring a camera or a phone or any recording device into the tabulation zone, I'm going to say zone -- but you can bring it in the public area. Until we are told by the court or the Secretary of State's office that our approach is inappropriate because we always abide by any advice we get for that."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Soo Jo, would you like to comment on that, what your findings were with the law?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "During the conversations yesterday, our office did recommend that the observers be allowed to bring cameras into the public viewing area, but I do agree with Ms. Perkins-Hooker that the current statute leaves some ambiguity in that absentee vote – absentee ballot tabulation, you are not allowed to have recording devices at all. With regard to tabulating the regular ballots, there is a prohibition of taking a photograph or recording the ballots themselves, and therefore that leaves the question of at what point would you be able to see if you take a photo, would you be able to zoom in and see what is on the ballot. That's still statutorily prohibited. So our practical, I guess, solution to that ambiguity and just kind of filling in the blanks, was to allow people to film from a distance, the same distance, that the press is allowed to photograph, but not in the actual tabulation area so as not to be in danger of violating either of those provisions."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay, which I'm going to work legislatively because it makes no sense, the ballots are anonymous, the Secretary of State releases ballot images, so you can do an open records request and get all the ballot images if you want to. So it really makes no sense, it's a convoluted law. And in regards to the -- you certified the election before 5 o'clock, correct?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "We certified the results of all municipal elections with the exception of Mountain Park -- city of Mountain Park."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay, Mountain Park is still hanging out there?"

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "No."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "It was certified, okay."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "It was certified. It was just at 6:20."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay. And you gave us these results this morning, correct, at around 8 o'clock."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Yes, ma'am."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "So how come the results aren't uploaded into the system? When I checked on our system, it's still -- the upload date is 11/13/2023 at 10:37 p.m. So the public doesn't have the results, correct?"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "When I inquired about that this morning, they are working with the -- there's a CSC or a CES system that's a computer electronic system, that's a state system, to try to get that communication link set up, but we have published them, we've sent them to the Secretary of State's office and we're waiting for that communication system to figure out how to do that. We ran into that problem while tabulating, too. We had to work with them so we could get the scrolling screen to reveal the results. So they should be up to date. There's no reason to delay that. I think it's on our website, but we're trying to get it --"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "-- I checked just a little while ago. It's still not uploaded."

PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE: "Okay. We're trying. We're working on that right now."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay, and on a side note, the provisional ballot thing, if I go in, they're going to assign me the same provision. If I have the wrong ballot on the screen, chances are, in the precinct, depending if you're a split precinct or not, you're only going to have two ballots to choose from. So chances are, even if my race wasn't on my ballot, they're not going to able to give me a ballot to vote provisionally, so I don't think that's a solution to the issues."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "It worked this time because the issues with the redistricting were down the centerline of a street. So on the one side of the street, you're in one ward and on the other side, you're in the other ward. So, it worked this time, but you're correct that there is a problem if you are in a totally different quadrant."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "You're not in the right precinct basically"

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "That's right, not in the right area for the poll."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay, I'll just wrap it up; I know I've taken so much time. I appreciate you coming down here and, you know, the city of Milton was criticized for running their own elections. They had their count on Tuesday night at 12:34. I think they approved their results, and they're good for a week now. So I just want to applaud the city of Milton in their efforts that they did in running their own election. It seemed to go really well, but I appreciate you coming down here. And our next meeting, I'd like for Nadine to come down, because we'll, by that point, have finished the runoff, correctly."

**PATRISE PERKINS-HOOKER, CHAIR, FC BRE:** "She is planning on trying to make that now that she knows that that is going to be the expectation. She will, at least, try and work her schedule to do that, but I didn't want you not to have anybody today."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Yes, yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "We're glad that you enjoy coming down here."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Ms. Patrise."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.**: "Some people act like they don't want to be here having to answer any questions."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk."

\*

**CLERK GRIER**: "Next item moved up on page 11, 23-0788: Request approval of a Resolution consenting to and ratifying the use of Fulton County ad valorem property tax increment for two projects located in Westside TAD Allocation Bond District 1."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right, Commissioner Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT**: "Colleagues, I only ask that this be moved up because I have a flight to catch this afternoon, so I just wanted to make sure I was here to explain it when it came up. Essentially, this is an item that Invest Atlanta sent over to us to have

on our agenda for approval. It is because there is sort of a cork in the law as it relates to the Westside TAD that is not in any of the other TAD enabling legislation that requires this approval whenever money is going to be spent out of the Westside TAD, so there's no net cost to us. This is already money that exists in the TAD, and these are just three of the projects that the TAD money will be spent on. So I basically just ask for your support in getting this through so the Westside TAD can continue to do the work that it's doing. You should have had an e-mail from Dr. Clement just explaining this situation with the ordinance that makes this mandatory, and also we have Jennifer Fine from Invest Atlanta in the audience if anybody has questions about the projects."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right, we have a motion on the floor to approve by Commissioner Hall. It is seconded by Commissioner Arrington. Any questions at all? If not, let's vote. I'm sorry, just a minute, Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Did she want to come up and speak since she's here?"

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT**: "If you have -- I can try to answer it. If not, Jennifer can come down. Jennifer Fine is here from Invest Atlanta."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "But my understanding is this Westside TAD is special, so maybe we need to tell the public why it's a special TAD because we extended the life of the TAD, correct? So now we have to go back and approve every little expenditure that they make out of the TAD; is that correct?"

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT**: "I will let you take that, Jennifer."

JENNIFER FINE, INVEST ATLANTA: "Thank you, good afternoon. Partially correct, partially a little subject to interpretation. So as Commissioner Barrett said, the language dates back to 1998 when the Westside TAD was, in fact, expanded. It was created in '92, then it was expanded in '98, and that's when this language was first in place, and I think we all kind of interpret that to mean is at the time, projects were primarily funded by issuance of new TAD bonds, and this language really ensured that prior to that happening, kind of these presentations would be made to Fulton County Board of Commissioners to chime in about their support of issuing new debt. So that's kind of where the language started. Now, we don't really fund projects by issuing new debt. We're using existing increment to fund smaller projects. So it is more kind of a hold out language, but we want to be respectful of that and kind of let you know all the projects that have gone to the Invest Atlanta Board and have been approved by the Invest Atlanta board, specific the Westside TAD."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Great. I mean, I'm in support of the expenditure. I just wanted the public to know as well as virtually all the TADs we have are in the city of Atlanta, pretty much, aren't they?"

**JENNIFER FINE, INVEST ATLANTA:** "So the TADs that Invest Atlanta has purview over. Obviously, are all in the city of Atlanta. We have nine current TADs. Fulton County has other TADs that are outside the city of Atlanta boundaries."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE**: "Okay. Okay, I'm good. I just wanted to get that explanation because it was a bit convoluted. The e-mail, I wasn't sure if I was interpreting it correctly."

**JENNIFER FINE, INVEST ATLANTA:** "Yeah, I know, I think you are. It is a bit of a hold out language. It's unique to the Westside TAD, but I don't think there's any grand reason for that. It's just because that TAD happened to be expanded in '98. None of the other TADs had expanded like that, which is what makes it unique."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay. Okay. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, the motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Continue, Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER**: "Back on page 7, County Manager's Renewal Items under Arts and Libraries, 23-0815: Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount not to --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "-- wait a minute. Wait a minute. We're going to move up the -- on page 11, 0832."

**CLERK GRIER**: "23-0832: Request approval of an Ordinance to amend the Code of Laws of Fulton County, specifically to amend Subpart B - Code of Resolutions Chapter 146, Law Enforcement Article III, Jail Division, County Welfare -- County Jail Welfare Fund regarding the establishment and use of County Jail Welfare Fund, also known as the Inmate Welfare Fund, by abolishing Division II County Jail Welfare Fund in its entirety; to provide that all funds generated at the Fulton County Jail facilities using county property, facilities, or other resources shall be deposited into the Fulton County General Fund; and for other purposes, sponsored by Chairman Pitts."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "Thank you, Madam Clerk. I want to move approval. Is there a second?"

VICE CHAIR ELLIS: "Second."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right, properly moved and seconded. Colleagues, what this does is abolishes that County Jail Welfare Fund in its entirety, and all funds that will be generated at the jail from commissions, from the commissary, the telephones and funds that we don't know anything about, that they will be deposited into our general fund. It's pretty straightforward. That's the motion on the floor. Commissioner Arrington, Commissioner Hall, Commissioner Barrett, Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Commissioner Ellis, I'm going to borrow something I just heard you say because I think it's appropriate. If there's a policy, let's make sure we're following it. That's what he just said about this election's thing to chairwoman of the elections committee. We have a policy; let's make sure that we're following it. So we have a policy for an Inmate Welfare Fund. Let's make sure we're following it. No one even knew that the policy existed, and now upon learning that the policy exists, instead of wanting to follow that policy, we want to abolish the policy. I don't think that that is in the best interest of the inmates to abolish the Inmate Welfare Fund. Does it need more oversight, absolutely. Does it need the people that are on the committee to know that there is in fact a committee and to actually meet and discuss, yes. Does the fund need to be abolished; I don't think so. I mean, have y'all seen how hard Sharon holds on to that money? She won't let that money go for nobody. The Sheriff can't get the money for the jail; the DA can't get no money. Man, if we give that money to Sharon, she'll be holding it until kingdom come. I would just say, you know, we all see that there were some discrepancies with the Inmate Welfare Fund, but I don't believe that that is grounds for it to be abolished. I believe what I heard Commissioner Ellis say earlier about the elections, if there's a policy, let's follow it. There's a policy. We now know that there's a policy. Let's follow it. Again, whose fault was it that we didn't know that there was a policy? I wasn't on the committee. Is that the Sheriff's fault? Is that the Chair's fault that they didn't know that they were on the committee or that committee existed? Or does it matter whose fault it is? It just matters that we fix it, and we've got a policy; I would rather follow the policy or amend the policy than to just abolish it altogether. Unintended consequences. Unintended consequences. Have we had time to think about what unintended consequences there may be? Has anyone sat down with the Sheriff to talk to him about what the unintended consequences may be? It sound like the same people that want to remove someone's right to vote without giving them a chance to contest whether the allegations are true or not. No hearing, you don't get a hearing. You don't get a hearing. You don't get a chance to follow the policy. We're just going to eliminate it altogether. We're going to eliminate any possibility of anything ever happening. Does that hurt the inmates? What type of needs and what type of things are actually needed? How many other policies -- how many other funds are there with policy committees that we don't know about? We should be very careful. These knee-jerk reactions to stuff in the paper is not the way to govern. That is not the way to properly govern. You don't just react to something because it's in the news. I would submit, Mr. Chair we have a policy, let's follow it. And with that, I'm going to make a substitute motion to table this."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "All right. Substitute motion to table. Is there a second?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL: "Second."** 

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, substitute motion to table; seconded by Commissioner Natalie Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I'm in the queue."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Y'all let me preside now, Commissioner Arrington. Now do you know what you want to do? He made a motion to -- he made a motion to table and you seconded the motion. You have the floor. Do you have questions on your motion?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "I have questions about a whole lot of stuff, but first I'm going to ask, because I see the Sheriff's office here, that Chief Johnson and Colonel Curtis Clark come up, please, because they are here and present and can answer some of these questions."

CHIEF ANTONIO JOHNSON, CHIEF DEPUTY SHERIFF: "Good afternoon, Commissioner. Chief Johnson. I have with me the Interim Chief Jailer, Colonel Curtis Clark here. We're here to answer any questions you all might have for us."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "Thank you so much. Commissioner Arrington, said a lot, and I agree wholeheartedly with everything that Commissioner Arrington said. We need to follow policy. This -- is it a committee or a board? I don't even know because it's totally new information to us that we received during the last BOC meeting; but it was told to us no one knew it existed or that it was supposed to be a meeting, and I think that it should at least meet and follow the policy, and a decision should be made by that committee or board -- whatever it may be. Also, during the last meeting of Fulton County Audit was requested, was it not?"

CHIEF ANTONIO JOHNSON, CHIEF DEPUTY SHERIFF: "Correct."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "Okay, I think so. So can someone tell me when that Fulton County audit will be complete, because shouldn't we at least allow the audit to take place especially since it was requested, I believe it was requested by Commissioner Ellis. Can I get an answer on -- oh, Mr. Nicks, thank you so much for joining us. Can you tell us how soon would the audit actually be complete?"

**ANTHONY NICKS, FC COUNTY ADUITOR**: "Mr. Chairman, Mr. Vice Chair, other distinguished Members of the Board, Anthony Nicks, County Auditor. Upon hearing the request last week, I took the liberty to reach out to a couple of potential companies that might be able to do that work. Out of those two, I have received a proposal. The original proposal was not detailed enough so I requested additional information. I

receive that information on yesterday. I would imagine that if, in fact, the Board wanted to move forward with this, it would probably take something in the area of, you know, eight to 12 weeks to get this done."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "All right. Thank you so much, Mr. Nicks."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "May I add to that, Commissioner?

**COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes, sir."** 

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Just for the record, Sheriff Patrick Labat agrees with the forensic audit; is that not correct?"

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: That's correct. That's correct."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Jailer Clark, just for the record."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "All right."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS**: "We both agree that this will clear the air if a forensic audit were done. He agrees."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "That's outstanding. I never thought that he would disagree. So, a couple of things: I could not figure out, there's a lot. I have a lot of documents, I mean. I don't even know where all of these came from. I know some of them were provided to us by Commissioner Ellis and some by the Sheriff, but there's a lot here, and I was just trying to figure out what exactly is the total amount of funding that is in the Inmate Welfare Fund?"

**COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER:** "I don't have that exact number. To my last recollection, it was \$6 million."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "Six million? Because when I looked throughout here, the last amount that I saw was 14 million, but it doesn't say if that is the current amount. Is the 6 million that you're approximating due to those things that we're already purchased out it?"

CHIEF ANTONIO JOHNSON, CHIEF DEPUTY SHERIFF: "Yes. That's correct."

**COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER:** "A combination of those and again, what we consider to be proper."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "Okay. So is it generally about \$14 million every year give or take?"

**COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER**: "It varies. You know the operation of the jail, we have -- when we have emergencies, you know, we have to make big purchases; we have a fire, if we have outages of water supply or airconditioning or electricity it creates an emergent situation where we have to have flexibility basically to be able to respond to those outside of the normal county purchasing process, and that's really where this fund affects us the most."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "Okay. So you just said this Inmate Welfare Fund is used toward air-conditioning."

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: "Not for the repair of the air-conditioning. Director Davis and his team takes care of that. But like this past summer, we had an outage for several days, and we had to purchase ice, water. We had to purchase items that we could utilize to put that water and ice in to keep it cold, to keep IT frozen. And so in situations like that, which unfortunately happen more often than not in that facility, because of the nature of the facility. I think that that flexibility, that ability to go outside of the normal purchasing process that the county has employed, is beneficial to us. I won't sit here and say that every situation that we deals with is not going to appropriate. I think there are a lot of things that we are currently doing that would fit into the mold of the normal processes, but there needs to be a certain level of flexibility or I use the term agility for us to be able to be responsive to that type of stuff."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "Yes, I would definitely consider that situation an emergency situation if you're having faulty air-conditioning issues and you need to keep the inmates cool and some of the other things that you mentioned. Those are emergency situations. And then reading through all of this, I want to make sure I'm clear that the funding comes from the commissary sales and commissions; is that correct?"

**COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER**: "That's correct. It comes from the purchase of commissary by the inmates through our commissary vendor as well as our inmate telephone and video system."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "So this is -- some of this funding is literally coming from the inmate's purchases?"

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: "Correct."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So it's their money going up to --"

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: "Essentially all of it."

**COMMISSIONER HALL**: "All right, thank you. And they deserve to receive it back when they need it. And I had a question about if -- well, we're going to vote to table, so

I'll leave those questions alone because I needed to know how will it be used if this goes into the general fund, and who will be in charge of it and just a whole host of questions about what this particular Resolution was doing. But we will vote and see how that goes. Thank you so much for your time."

**CHIEF ANTONIO JOHNSON, CHIEF DEPUTY SHERIFF:** "Thank you. Thank you, Commissioner."

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: "Thank you, Commissioner."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Hold on, gentlemen. The motion on the floor here by Commissioner Arrington is to table; it was seconded by Commissioner Natalie Hall. So let's dispose of that motion. You want to be heard before we dispose of that motion beforehand? You have the floor, Commissioner Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I understand the inclination to want to shutdown something that is not working right. And clearly, there have been issues with the way the fund was managed. But I do worry about, Commissioner Arrington called them, unintended consequences. And I do worry that, you know, the intent of having an Inmate Welfare Fund is exactly what it sounds like. And that if we just eliminate that, I know Michael Shoats sent us some information about just some unintended consequences around the contracts and things of that nature that might, you know, be a problem if we shut this down without working through all of that. But in addition, I have a, I think, real concerns about the inmates' welfare. And in this, you know, really troubling times with the jail, my concern would be that if we do away with the fund altogether that some of these things like you mentioned, the ice in the water, and things of that nature, maybe it's blankets when it's cold, or whatever the case may be that those would get -- not get handled quickly enough or at all. So I guess, I just for some further clarification, I think what I would like to see happen, and that is not neither tabling or approving, I guess, although I guess, tabling would do it. But I would like to see us put more guidelines around what the fund can be used for. And maybe there's a certain dollar amount over which if it's not needed, it goes to the general fund at that point. You know, I would like to see more guidelines around the committees, so that if there's a policy about the committee meeting. We did some research in office and found a dialogue at a County Commission meeting from 2000, in which the Commissioner at the time had no idea there was a committee and was wondering how many votes they had missed or what have you. So this seems like it's been a decade's long sort of ignored committee certainly. So I would like to see a better version of the Inmate Welfare Fund. So I just sort of want to be on record as not really wanting either of these two options. I don't really want it tabled, and I don't really want it passed. I sort of want to change the whole process. And I'm not sure how that fits into this discussion."

**COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER:** "Essentially, what I wanted to ask for it today would be that if we could table it and allow for the County Manager's Executive Team to meet with the Sheriff's Office team and come up with a more cohesive way that we can make -- even if it were to go into the general fund, and we have access to adequate funding to provide for these inmates. Since I went to the jail in April, the conditions that I saw when I went in there -- I was part of the team that moved us into that facility in 1990, so was the Chief."

CHIEF ANTONIO JOHNSON, CHIEF DEPUTY SHERIFF: "Yeah, telling our age now."

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: "I spent most of my career outside of the jail. I've been with the agency for 34 years. But when I went back earlier this year and what I saw just, it shocked me. And I have worked tirelessly to try to make change. I don't disagree that things happen that shouldn't have happened. I mean, that's quite obvious. But I also know through my career that we have operated that fund without issue for the majority of that -- the time that I've been here, and probably, I think the -- I think the fund was created after I came, I think in early 2000. And so we're talking about a short period of time in history where this has happened. We've identified the issue, we've identified remediation processes. And so moving forward, we still need that agility, that flexibility that I talked about to ensure that we can get adequate, you know, health and safety items for these inmates. I am not opposed to change. But what I read in today's legislation just troubles me, because -- and this is not to disparage anyone because I've worked with all of these individuals in here at some point in time through my career. And I'd like to be believe that I have a little bit of credit with them in terms of my ability to work through problems. And this just one of those things we have to work through. And we need the time to do so. You know, I'm not even certain that we include it, or how we would include something like this into our 2024 budget requests because we didn't know we were going to end up here when we were putting our budget together. So where do we land come January? Am I back over here begging to get mattresses or T-shirts or underwear? You know, I should say begging, asking for, my apologies. But I just think we need to have those processes in place before we make the change. And that's all I'm asking for is table, enough time for us to work for the County Executive Team and come up with these practices that we can employ to ensure, number one that we get the items we need for the inmates; number two that there's devices in place to prevent what happened earlier this year and last year."

CHIEF ANTONIO JOHNSON, CHIEF DEPUTY SHERIFF: "And the Colonel and I, we had a long discussion about ways that we can improve. We're very transparent, and I have worked along with a lot of people in this county. And I know that we could work together and come up with a great proposal to the Commission. And so we could be really successful on both ends of the situation that we're in. So we are asking for you all to consider tabling it, give us a chance to sit down with the County Manager, his team, so we can come up with a proposal for you all to consider for this Inmate Welfare Fund."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Just one more follow-up question, really more for the record. But could you just talk about some of the things, you've mentioned several of them, the water, the ice, you mentioned mattresses, underwear, things like that. Could you just sort of talk about some of the things that you feel like this should be used for and should be available for?"

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: "Well, the intent initially of the fund, as I understand it, was to buy inmate items, such as mattresses, mattress covers, blankets, shower curtains, anything that we use in the housing area of the jail, anything that supports for the proper environment in the facility. And that's primarily what we have used it for since I've been here. I think there's been some bumps in the road along the way, but nothing to the scale of what we're looking at now. And I think if you look at the correlation of things and how they -- when they happened and how they happened, it didn't take a genius to figure out where we may have gotten off track. But since then we've gotten back on track. And so I'm really leaning on our history here to kind of support the fact that, you know, I think there needs to be changes. I don't disagree with that. I am not -- I would not come up here and argue that fact. There has be changes, but in today's legislation, it does not afford for us to have a level of comfort to be assured that we're going to get access to the funding that we're going to need next week, well, outside of the 14 days, which would put us out, you know, because I think legislation says within 14 days, you all will -- it will transfer over. So what happens on that 15th day if I need to get a bunch of mattresses because we got a zone that has mattresses that have lice in them or that have been destroyed, which is a typical thing. We have a very destructive inmate population, if you haven't figured that out already. I know that we've reported this up to you all consistently. I mean, it's just a dangerous, violent, and destructive population for the most part. And so we're constantly repairing things, replacing things, and so we constant inventory flow. And all that stuff is -- and I mean, the jail is basically run off of this fund. There's no other funding line for this jail other than for staffing. And so I am deeply disturbed, as the Interim Chief Jailer that, you know, in 15 days, where do I stand? Who do I go to and where do I -- where do I make my argument that I need to get this today, or I need to get this order so that it can be delivered within a reasonable a lot of time? And that's all I'm looking for. And I need to be able to reassure my staff who are working their butts off. Everybody knows we're understaffed, overpopulated and understaffed. And, you know, I take my hats off to those individuals to come back the next day because I know it's got to be hard. And I need to be able to reassure them and I need to be reassured that we're going to have the funding available, however it comes to us, that we're going to have that funding available so we can keep this operation going in the right direction."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Well, I want to thank you both for being here. And, you know, I agree that the best thing right now might just be to table this for the time being. So, thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. The motion on the floor is to table. Let's dispose of that motion before going forward. Motion on the floor is to table. Let's vote, please."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open on the motion to table. And the motion fails; three yeas, four nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Then back to the main motion, which is to approve."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I'm going to call the question."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Question has been called. The main motion is to approve. Question is being called, is there a second to calling the question? All right. Properly moved and seconded, let's vote on the call of the question."

CLERK GRIER: "Hold on. Got to get the motion to call the question."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Ellis."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open on call the question. And the motion passes; four yeas, two nays, one abstention."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Main motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open on the motion to approve. And the motion passes; four yeas, three nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "Back on page 7 --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Interim Jailer Clark."

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I'd like to see you when we get finished here."

COLONEL CURTIS CLARK, INTERIM CHIEF JAILER: "Absolutely."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next time."

\*

CLERK GRIER: "On page 7, under renewal items, 23-0815 --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Wait a minute. Wait a minute. Where is the -- we had another item that was supposed to be moved up before Barrett has to leave. What was it? No, we didn't. It was on the -- what do you call those things?"

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Ankle monitoring."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes. Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER:** "That item is on page 9, under Open and Responsible Government, 23-0779, Request approval to increase the spending authority in an amount not to exceed \$1,646,735 to provide electronic ankle monitoring and services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. Commissioner Arrington, you want to be heard on this one? 081 -- no, it's 0779, Madam Clerk. On page 9, one, two, three, the third item. Is that it? All right. What's before us now, it's on page 9, item number 0779. It's dealing with the ankle -- what do you call -- ankle -- ankle monitors. Commissioner Arrington, Commissioner Hall, Commissioner Barrett, Commissioner Thorne. Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I think we made some good progress with reducing our jail population. I want us to be real clear. I want you all to be real clear in what y'all going to do if y'all pass this. They're 30 people in the jail right now that are waiting to get out because of Judges ordered Fulton County to pay for their ankle monitor, and there are no ankle monitors available. That's 30 people that should be out of the jail. But they can't get out because this didn't pass at the last meeting. This contract was not put in place by our Sheriff. This contract was put in place by Mr. Alton Adams and the County Manager to help decrease our jail population. If you all don't approve this, those 30 people are not only going to stay in jail, there is another 1500 whose monitors that have to be paid for. Do we have space for another 1500 people at the jail? Can we get 45 -- 4500 inmates in there? How many you think we can get in there? This is insanity. There are 30 people in a jail now that could be out. But this contract didn't get passed at the last meeting. That number goes up every day. I mean, it's bound to lead to a lawsuit. Someone should be out, but they can't get out because we won't pay for the ankle monitors. Hey, y'all can do what you want to. y'all just did it. I'm just telling you, this is insanity, this is counterintuitive. This is going to have the opposite effect of what we've been trying to do and reduce our jail population. And y'all are mad about this contract because this company bought out another company. It wasn't even this company, this was another contract. And then that company got bought out. Wow, so those 30 people won't be able to spend Thanksgiving with their families. I wonder how many more people won't be able to spend Thanksgiving with their families if y'all pass this."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Let me explain what this does. First of all, there's a motion on the floor to approve, not to deny, to approve. Motion to approve by

Commissioner Natalie Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett. The two components to this legislation, the first is, which I support, we are in arrears to this company for July, August, and September. So \$820,000 of this amount will go to pay what we already owe. Then we have the issue of October, which I understand, we have not been billed for, the October. Then the rest of this was to continue this contract through the end of the year, which would mean November and December. And the price of that was an additional \$826,000. And at the end of December, the idea is to rebid this contract as I understand it. Is that correct, Mr. Adams, what I just stated?"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS:** "Mr. Chairman, we haven't gotten direction on the rebidding. This is a carryover from the last BOC meeting."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Strike the rebidding part. We got to do something with it. But is the first part correct, July, August, and September, we haven't paid the bill that we owe, and --"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "That is correct."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "We are in arrears."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "That's 820,000, and it'll take us through -- for November and December, would be an additional 826,000. Therefore, you add those two numbers together, that's the total."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "That is correct."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. That's what's before us. And the motion on the floor is to approve. Commissioner Hall, you want be heard?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. A couple of things. I wanted to make sure that we did pay because at the last meeting, unfortunately, Alton was silenced and unable to speak. But he spoke up after the vote anyway, and kind of mumbled that they had not been paid and had said that if they did not get paid, they would shut them off. And I want to make sure that that is not even a possibility. There's no possibility that they would even shut them off because we have people who are literally no longer in jail who have these ankle monitors on that are in the public; is that correct?"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS:** "That's correct, Commissioner. A&A indicated to me that they would continue to provide the services for the individuals who are currently on the monitors. But wouldn't be able to add additional individuals based on the fact that they hadn't been paid for -- they overdue invoices to the county, that's correct."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "And we got a letter from Chief Judge Glanville. And he is basically asking us to please pass this. His -- first of all, he's saying that this Commission wisely invested in funding ankle monitors for indigent defendants, enabling the judges to fashion bond conditions that ensure the appearance of these defendants at future proceedings, while also keeping our community safe. And that should be what we're all here to do is to keep our community safe. But also, one of the questions that came up at the last BOC meeting that was never allowed to be answered was the fact that the recommendation was made for these two purposes, one, to reduce the overcrowding effort as part of the Jail Expediter Program slash Process. And number two, to ensure that no individuals were being detained based on their ability to pay the cost of monitoring, which was \$10 a day. So I'm hoping that we do pass this today, because it is seen to be a very useful tool for helping us with the jail overcrowding, and keeping the public safe. Thank you so much."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. One more time, ladies and gentlemen, this does two things, it pays the bills that we owe, and it gets us through December, and the motion on the floor is to approve. You want to be heard, Ms. Barrett? You have the floor."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "A couple of things. I'll be brief. I'm in support of passing this because we owe money, we need to pay the money we owe. So I think that's pretty straightforward. I have a couple of questions just -- and I don't necessarily need a long, detailed answer on it. And I'm looking at you Madam CFO, because, I don't know why, because you're the money person. But the reason I'm looking in the general direction over here is because it does seem like there's some kind of an accounting control that's missing. Because if we have a contract for X amount and a PO for X amount, how -- how was somebody authorized to keep spending and without, you know, going over that amount without it coming back to us and putting us in a situation where we're three months in arrears? So that, I guess, that's my question."

SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER: "Commissioner Barrett, the best that I can tell you is that we had a communication issue. It was identified that we were running out of spending authority. But the action that needed to take place, which was to bring the item to the Board for approval, did not come very timely. So basically, it's been a communication issue. And to the Chairman's point, this will carry us through the end of this year. And then we will need to have some guidance for how to proceed into 2024."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Thank you for that. So obviously, I know it's a challenging one because it's something that we're paying for, but it's implemented by our justice partners, the Judges ordering the ankle monitors and the jail allowing them to be there and put them on. So I don't know exactly how we shore up that communication, but I'm sure you're all working on it. The other thing I think we need to do as a Board here, as the sort of alongside of this, is to give direction on what to do. Because from my conversation with Ms. Strong-Whitaker, there is, you know, if we

extend this through the end of the year, which I believe we should, we need a solution starting January 1. And if we don't start looking into that now, put an RFP out, et cetera, et cetera, then we will have no solution on January 1, and we will have 1400-some-odd people who will have to, what, come back to the jail and go back in the jail? It seems unclear as to what would happen at that moment. So I think we not only need to continue this contract, but we need a transition plan to a new vendor, and we need to be looking for a new vendor. So that would be my direction. I don't know if anybody would disagree with that. But that's where I am on that. I think, you know, personally, given some of the -- I don't know what to call it -- tomfoolery that's gone on with Talitrix, it would be my preference that we not look at working with them in the future. So this, ending this contract and at the end of the year and/or through whatever we need for a transition to a new vendor, I feel like is appropriate. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Again, the motion on the floor is approve. Commissioner Thorne, you want to be heard?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yes. I, first of all, I just want to say, I approve of this program. And I believe we should -- I'm thankful the vendor didn't shut down on us in our delay. And with that being said, I think when we put an RFP up, we go with whoever has the best proposal that's put out there. If this company is doing a good job, then we keep this company. If there's -- we find that's that they're not for some reason, let's keep the playing field even. So I just want to make that statement. I don't believe we should just automatically X them out because they did acquire a company, and they don't have full control. I would also like to say that the cost for us to keep an inmate on the ankle monitors is 7.50 day. Things I was made unaware of was -- or I didn't think about was when someone is incarcerated, they lose their Medicare, their health insurance, a lot of people lose their jobs. And then immediately, we're having to pay for their care. If they have diabetes, all of their care comes on us. So I'm in favor of this program of trying to keep people, in they're qualified, out of incarceration as much as possible. I do have some concerns though that was brought to me by the Public Defender that maybe some people don't need ankle monitors at all. They could be released on a bond with no ankle monitors. So I would like to see us kind of look into that as well as the program in the future."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Thanks, Mr. Chair. Try to be brief. I do have some data, I do think it's important. I'd like to be -- some of this to go into public record too. Mr. Adams and his staff had supplied me with this late yesterday. So just want to share that with the other Commissioners. You know, one thing I would say to note, while it does have an impact on reducing the jail population, and there is some tangible benefit to it, we have now have 1,518 individuals on monitor, and that number has spiked and gone up quite considerably. If you go back to October of 2022, we had 733, it's double, right. So we also have here is, we've got -- we got an alternative prison system, right? You

know, so when you go on monitor, you're not -- you're not free, right? It's a -- it's not an easy life, right. And there's still this issue of case throughput that needs to occur. So the notion of a person being on a monitor for after six months, over a year, that's problematic. That's just almost as problematic as somebody being in jail for over a year, right. So, you know, this can't be a program where it's, let's just delay giving people due process and put them on an ankle monitor, regardless of whether we might be paying for it or not. And you will note in particular, in September and October, we added 238 individuals in September and 198 in October. Happens to correspond with a significant decrease in our jail population. So I understand it, the Public Defender and the DA got together, and they agreed upon a bunch of consent bonds. And they were all signed off on by -- by a Senior Judge, not necessarily a typical process you'd go through in terms of, you know, one-over-one looking at these, you know, this was sort of done in mass. So we just -- we just hit the -- we just took a big chunk swath of people and we moved them out and we put them on monitoring. Maybe that's the right decision, may not. I mean, there are some potential sort of public safety issues when you get this many people out on monitor. This is an excessive number. And I'm not the only one that sort of disagrees with the fact that this program, it may have run amuck. This is our Chief Judge saying, it is clear that the county-funded ankle monitor program needs more thoughtful and regular oversight. Too many defendants are kept on ankle monitors for too long. After a certain period, a history of compliance with bond conditions should result in monitor removal. This is not happening. But the court is committed to changing that with regular views of everyone on a county-funded monitor. So we obviously do need to pay our bills. And I, you know, I get all that. And I'm supportive of doing that. But I do think that this program needs a pause. We don't need to add any new individuals. They're not 30 people, I've heard there was 11. There are actually only three that actually would qualify. But this is just coming on the heels of dropping out about 400 or so. I do think the contract needs to be rebid. And I think we need to revisit the program. And we can have a discussion with the Judges, other folks, about how that we would regulate this thing. And that could be all revisited once these numbers come down to some sort of number that's -- appears to be a reasonable number. And the other thing you'll notice in here is you'll look at the aging of the people that are on monitors. We've got 62 that have been on here over two-plus years that we're paying for. 304, one to two years, and six months to one year, 100 and -- 405. So whatever that is, 700, you know, almost -- almost 800 of these have been on there over six months. So that batch of folks, in my estimation, if there have been no violations, et cetera, that needs to be aggressively reviewed by the Judges. Perhaps their orders need to be amended, you know, et cetera. At the same time, you know, it's my understanding that the bulk of these people -- we don't have a clear number on this, but one number I got on this was that 1,325 people of this 1,500 were unindicted. So we move that problem out onto ankle monitors. So we need to better understand that number. And there needs to be an aggressive sort of regulation of this, meaning it may have a good intended use. But this has gotten out of control, you know, and I think, most of our justice partners recognize that. So I'm going to make a substitute motion to approve it, but with the conditions that no new individuals be added and the contract be

rebid, and that we revisit the program once we've had the opportunity to have further conversations with the Judges, and that we've got the number down to an agreeable number that's manageable."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So your motion is to pay, first of all, to pay what's in arrears?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Right."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "And to provide for November, although we haven't been billed for October, provide for payment October, November, and December? And then --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Right. And just no new individuals be added to the program, and that this contract be rebid."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "And to rebid. And I think you raised some great questions that need to be -- I'll second that. That's the substitute motion. All right, Commissioner Arrington. We will be approving what's before us, but with a couple of conditions."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So I went to court earlier this week on behalf of a client. We were there, I was ready, and my client was ready. The opposing party was there, her attorney was not there. Her attorney had sent a conflict letter. I looked at the conflict letter, and I laughed, I said, wow, she's busier than I am. She was -- when attorneys have a conflict, when they have to show up to more than one court, we're required to send a letter outlining how we show up in court and which court we'll go to next. So we were going to be the fourth court out of nine appearances she had on that day. The case was reset to January. This amendment that y'all are talking about, proposed substitute -- this substitute motion, not adding any more people. There are people being added every day by the Judges. It makes more sense to close it out through December. They're already saying that they were going to rebid it in January or as soon as they come up with a transition plan. Hey, y'all can do what you want. I'm just telling you, this is going to exacerbate the problem. You don't add anybody -- no one else can be added. What about the 100 people that's supposed to get out today and the 100 people that's supposed to get out tomorrow and the 100 people that's supposed to get out the day after that? They can't get added. Y'all don't understand the court system. You don't understand the criminal justice system. Please listen to somebody that does."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "I support the original motion. I cannot support this as amended. You know, I'll sort of echo what Commissioner Arrington said, but you know, I think it's -- we haven't had time to think through the consequences of stopping this now for the next six to eight -- six, seven weeks, whatever it is through the end of the year. And Commissioner Thorne wisely pointed out, the cost to have somebody on an ankle

monitor is seven, six, \$7 a day versus over 100 per day for having them in our jail. So to me, if it's a financial reason to put it on hold, it makes no financial sense. So I would support it as it exists, but not as amended."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "First off, I may not understand the justice system in full. But I know damn well we hadn't been adding 100 people a day. I got the numbers here right in front of me. And the most that were ever added was in the last months, 238 and 198. Prior to that, we were the max was approaching about 100 a month, right. Now, we can look at this monetarily, we can look at it whatever way you want to look at it. But we got to note from our Chief Judge that says this program essentially is being abused, and it needs to be regulated, right. I mean, so now's the time to do it. And part of that would start with not adding anybody new on here until we've got a sense of how it should be regulated. I mean, there's no sense that -- I mean, I don't even know that the monitoring company that can monitor this many people adequately. We may be dealing with a whole nother sort of set of issues, where we got a bunch of unindicted people out there are being monitored triggered stuff that's required more judicial hearings. And more activity that's wasted by our Judges. So, you know, if you want to allow the idea putting it hold without anybody adding to it, is not growing what we have is an issue that's been identified by our Judges. We can come back and we can revisit, you know, that once we get some sort of agreement about how it's going to be regulated. What they're going to do to actually monitor this, no pun intended, collectively. So pass it as is without some sort of direction around it, I think that's the risk that we run."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I think the prudent thing for us to do, as Commissioner Barrett said, is to have some type of transition plan, again, knee-jerk reactions are not the most prudent course of action. We can have and instruct our County Manager and his team to come up with a plan of action to make sure that there's a transition. We can rebid it, we can do whatever. But that doesn't -that doesn't mean that there shouldn't be an orderly process that something shouldn't just abruptly stop, particularly as we stated that it would cost us \$100 a day to house these people in jail if the court orders require them to be on these ankle monitors. So I -- I mean, this is insanity. But hey, it's the world we live in. It's the world that we live in. Yeah, I certainly cannot support this amendment, and I hope that no one else will support the substitute motion as amended. We need to have an orderly transition. We can rebid if we want to rebid. But it doesn't make sense to say, we're not going to pay for these people. And my use of 100 people a day was an example, it was not the number of people. The point -- the number -- the number of people is, frankly irrelevant. The point is that there are people that will be prescribed to be or ordered to be on a monitor that can be added at any day by any of the Judges. And if there are people added, then they're either staying in our jail at \$140 a day, or they can be released at \$7

a day. We got to make up our mind. Do we want to reduce our jail population, or not? Are we going to talk about it, oh, we got to reduce our jail population and come in here and talk about the numbers and these numbers aren't going down, and these judges aren't doing what they're supposed to do. That stuff is crazy. Either we want the numbers to go down or we don't. We can't say we want them to go down and then take actions to make them go back up. I'm done."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yeah, I kind of struggle with shutting down the program immediately with no new add ons. Because what happens to the person who actually can't pay the \$300 a month for the ankle monitor, and it's a low-victimless crime. Ankle monitor would be perfect for them from a costs perspective. I really don't want them in the prison. I don't want, in the holiday season, we're going to be saying, okay, got to go to jail and be apart from your family. So I think that's kind of brutal this time a year to do that. But I was trying to think of a friendly amendment. Maybe that since we have 771 people that have been on this program for over six months, maybe we put a limit on how many we're willing to pay for per month for November and December. I don't know, we currently have 1,518 people, maybe that number is 1700. So that the courts can go ahead and those people who really qualify, they have that flexibility. But also encourage them to get these people that have been on these monitors off to free up space for people that do need to be on the program. So could I offer a friendly amendment, not to exceed a certain number?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I can't accept that. I mean, you know, the number should be going down. You know, maybe for every three people that go off, one person could be added. The number should be going down. I mean, I mean, they had said, they, being the Judges, that said, we have too many defendants on for too long. So if we're not going to do anything to incent them to do that review, remember, these are people that. They've been out there with monitors over six, seven, nine months. If they've had no, no issue, no trigger, why are they still on it? You know, I mean, so again, I'm not -and they have the ability -- we still have the ability for them to be added and for them to pay it, nobody's preventing that; am I correct? So it's not like the use of monitoring goes away. But at some point, we're getting to some it point of diminishing returns. And we're creating a public safety risk with that many people out there, there's a balance to it. So, I think putting it on pause, I mean, the number may be one to one, it may be three to one, it may be ten to one. I don't know what the right number is. But I think we need to give the Judges a chance to kind of come back to us and do some sort of review of this and advise us. I mean, they've told us, they told us in here, they've gone overboard. So why don't we want to perpetuate something?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "So you cannot accept the friendly amendment?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Not to continue the growth thing, no."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "I mean -- I mean, if you want to say it stays the same until we have a further chance to kind of get it, get this further, I mean -- I mean, no -- so it doesn't grow, you know, throughout the remainder of the year, it stays within that 1518. But I think we need to have some sort of, you know, further dialogue after that. But not, it should not continue to grow. I mean, one and one at a minimum until we have some opportunity to kind of get some further dialogue."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Mr. Adams, you want to be heard?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "If I can, Mr. Chairman. I believe based on my discussions with Judge McBurney and Judge Glanville that the Superior Court is actually looking at reducing the number of individuals who have been on there for, say more than 180 days. So I do believe that if we were to allow the number to stay where it is, we might be able to accommodate the individuals who would be added between now and the end of the year without necessarily -- and I need to confirm with them, but I think -- I think we might be able to accomplish both of those, is I guess, is what I'm saying. To Commissioner Arrington's point and to Commissioner Thorne's point, not restricting additions, but at the same time, with the Superior Court actually looking at getting individuals off who may have been there for more than a year, and I think they're doing that as we speak. Judge McBurney said they've already started that. So I think we may be able to accomplish both of those without necessarily keeping people in jail who are only there because they can't afford this. But at the same thing -- time, not necessarily adding to the rolls."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Modify your friendly amendment?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I'll modify my friendly amendment that we will allow 1,518 people --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Capped."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "-- to continue -- cap the program."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I'll accept that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Friendly amendment has been accepted. Commissioner Abdur-

Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Chairman, if you don't mind, this is such -- you know, as both of my colleagues, Commissioner Arrington and Commissioner Thorne and Vice Chair, all have valid arguments. I would like to hear -- I will look -- I'd like to be indulged to be -- to hear from our Public Defendant. I would like to hear from you because I feel this is too serious of a decision to be made at this point without us all looking at all our options and what's best for everyone. So since you are here, if you would just weigh in on this for me, I would appreciate it."

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "Good afternoon, I'm Maurice Kenner, Circuit Public Defender for the Atlanta Judicial Circuit, which encompasses all of Fulton County. I would ask that you all consider the original motion. I think there is a -- well, personally I think in some cases, the monitoring system is being abused. I do think there's a place for the monitoring system. And my concern would be that if the Judges aren't allowed to continue to use that, that that would stop the progress the District Attorney's team and the team that I have, that it will stop the progress of getting folks out of Fulton County jail into home."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "So my question to you, Mr. Kenner, is this, what would you consider a happy medium? Because in my mind, I understand what the Vice Chair is saying. If we go based on what Mr. Adams says, then there may be some middle of the road, some desire to get some people off, while bringing some on. Now my concern with that, which I can support, but my concern is, we have not done what we needed to do. And this is the result of it. And now we're at the holiday season, where at the end of the year when generally, stuff starts to slow down, stuff starts to, you know, people begin to take vacation time that they need to try to get out the way. And so I'm concerned that if one person is denied the opportunity, then it won't be worth it. And so I'm perplexed because I do listen very well. And you stated it might be a little abuse there, you know, maybe. And so I'm asking you while you have the mic, what you think you could advise as a happy medium?"

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "Probably, one half of the 1400 people that are on an ankle monitoring system -- or the 1500 people that are on an ankle monitoring system."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "So what you're saying is allow up to that amount; is that what you're saying?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "That's correct."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Okay. Anybody else have any questions for --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "No, I mean, but that's what we're talking about is a one for one. I mean, that's -- that's what's on, the motion that's on the floor --"

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "So was it -- Vice Chair, so what I'm asking, your motion with the amendment would suffice what he just said?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Caps it at the current amount."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I guess I do have a question then. I thought you were saying half of that, which would -- were you saying add half of the 1500 to the 1500? Or you're saying cap it at 700?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "Cap it at 700."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "It's already at 1500, so you want 750 people back in jail?"

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "No, I want the condition of the monitoring system reviewed --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah."

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "-- for each of those folks that are on. I mean, just look at the numbers that Commissioner Ellis said. We've got people that have been on the monitor for over a year, some for two years that are doing the right thing. There's no need for that to happen, people are losing jobs --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "There's no dispute about that, sir. There are 1500 people currently on monitors. And you're saying you want -- you want it capped at 750? You want it capped at half of that? When are those -- when is that going to happen --"

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "This is -- this is what I want, I want as many of my clients and folks that are in the Fulton County Jail to get out, whether it's by ankle monitor or straight bond or whatever. That's what I want. I don't want anyone else to be harmed in the jail."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Yeah, what you -- what you're -- the answer you just gave is going to get 750 of your people back in the jail, watch."

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "Wow."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I -- go ahead, you still have the floor, Commissioner --"

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Vice Chair, do you have -- do you have the capability of maybe revisiting Commissioner Thorne's amount of capping new ones, while working to reduce? I guess what I'm saying is, the will of this Board is that while

there will be an effort to reduce the amount at simultaneously, we will not allow more than 150 new. Is that the understanding --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "No."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "-- Commissioner Thorne?"** 

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Capping the number --"

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "The capping?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "It's the number of people on the monitor at the current point in time is 1,518. What Commissioner Thorne's amendment would say is that that number would stay at, be capped at 1,518. So I mean, hopefully, collectively the Judges and PD are working together so that that number drops well below 1,518. But there is a -- if there's an acknowledgment by our Judges that there is some work that needs to be done, there's acknowledgment by our PD that, hey, there's a lot of these people who's had their monitor and should be revisiting, then those numbers are going to come down. And you're going to allow new people to be added, but it's just not going to allow it to be -- it's not going to allow it to grow more than 1,518. It's just to require everybody in the system to do, you know, to regulate it. And then we'll kind of like, revisit it, once we kind of get a better sense of, you know, once these processes have been sort of tackled a little bit more robustly. Is that a fair proposal?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "It is."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Okay. Well, Vice Chair, and I guess, Mr. Adams and County Manager, I've -- for my understanding, we're going to work to remove individuals off there. And if there are new individuals, they would take their place, is that -- is that where we are now?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "To the extent that they would need it, that's correct. And Judge McBurney and Judge Glanville and team have already started that effort. They've already started at looking at individuals who have been on there for an extended period of time, and are working to basically remove the ankle monitor as a requirement as part of them being out of jail. So I think that process has already started. So I guess what I was trying to say is, I believe with that process having already been started and the need to add individuals, I think that will net out so that the 1,500 and whatever number it is today will actually allow us to do both of those things. That was my point."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Okay. So I think, Mr. Kenner, you see what he's saying that, you would agree that that more than likely will work with what we're trying to do? What I would ask from the County Manager and specifically you, Alton, is to let us

know when it's not working. Let us know if there's a hiccup, please. Because I think this entire Board, and I can't speak for no one but the Mighty 6. But at the end of the day, we want anybody on monitoring that shouldn't be on it. But we do so -- we do want somebody on monitoring if that is appropriate for them as opposed to be put in jail. And I think that we can do both if we work together. So I, in that respect, I can support it. I can support it. Thank you, Mr. Kenner."

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "Thank you, Commissioner."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Vice Chair, you're done? Commissioner Arrington. Commissioner Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Yeah. I mean, it seems like y'all are going to have the votes to do what you want to do. But I -- and I very much appreciate what you're trying to accomplish, Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. I get where you're coming from. I have deep concerns about us setting an arbitrary number as a cap. Because what about that one more, what about -- you know, I just feel like it is not our place to set an arbitrary number as a cap. And we have already had assurances from, you know, Mr. Adams that they're already working on this. Judge Glanville sent a letter, and they're working on it. So I think we should -- my opinion is, we should let them do with their jobs and work on this, knowing that, you know, we would like to see this number -- you know, we would like to not have so many people on for so long if that's not appropriate, as the PD said. But I would just prefer that we get more frequent reports, perhaps from Alton, or you know, whatever on -- on progress on this front. But I would rather not set an arbitrary cap. So I still am not going to, you know, vote to approve as amended."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Lord help us, all right. Commissioner Hall, Commissioner Thorne, Vice Chair Ellis."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I agree we should not set an arbitrary cap. We don't know how this might work out. We don't know how many arrests will happen. As Judge Glanville has clearly stated in his letter, they're already working on it. Allow them to work on it. Allow us to see how the progress goes. But don't cap the program and create unnecessary issues."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I'm sorry, Mr. Kenner, I was going to have you come back up. I couldn't get in the queue, push the button fast enough."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "You was supposed to holler it."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I know, I was going to holler, but -- can you describe someone who's on ankle monitor, like, the inconveniences of being on an ankle monitor for two years versus not having an ankle monitor at all?"

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "Someone that's been on an ankle monitor for that long more than likely, they're going to lose their job if they had it. Being on an ankle monitor creates a hardship, not just for the person that's on the ankle monitor, but that person's entire family. So, I mean, it just -- most of those ankle monitors come with curfews. A lot of those curfews are curfews that are real early. And it just impacts someone's ability to reach their full earning potential when they have an ankle monitor on. That's the bottom line."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Can you tell me -- when I met with somebody with the ankle monitoring program, they told me to recharge the ankle monitors, you physically have a cord that you have to plug into the wall with your monitor on and stay in that area; is that true?"

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "I do know that the charging of some of the monitors is an issue. I'm not 100 percent certain. I've never had an ankle monitor on, so I don't know the process of charging it."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yeah, I just heard --"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "And I hope to never get one."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "-- you have to -- I heard that you a cord and you have to physically plug yourself into the wall, so you're immobile until the charging is over with."

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "That's my understanding. But I've also seen on the internet that they have, you know, monitors that can be recharged in different manners. Some that you have to go to the company that -- that's managing the monitoring service and switch out the monitor. That's how they keep it charged. And others that you plug in, like you say. And I don't know which process the company that we're using uses."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I believe that's the process the company we're using uses. So maybe when we send an RFP out, we need to look at going to specifics on the type of ankle monitor that would be convenient for someone to hold a job, not saying, oh, I can't work because my ankle monitor needs to be charged. So I appreciate you coming down here. And I look at this resolution as we have 771 people that could possibly be inconvenienced, losing their job, because they've been on these ankle monitors for over six months and some two-plus years. And I look at this resolution as a way to incentivize our court system to say, hey, we need to get going, we need to review these cases, we need to get the people off that can be off, and then

move forward from there. And put -- add new people on it to free up space to add people on."

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "Since we're talking about it, I would suggest a three-to-six-month period. If someone is going to violate the terms of an ankle monitor, usually they do it right away. And if someone has been on an ankle monitoring system for, you know, six months and they haven't had any infractions, that's usually a pretty good indicator, they're going to do what they need to do to stay out of jail until their case can be handled."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yeah. I think I -- I think it's a great -- a great incentive because I'd love for people to have freedom and their families to have the freedom as well to be able to stay out past curfew over the holidays. So anyway, I thank you again for coming here."

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "Thank you, Commissioner."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Attorney Kenner, please don't walk away, sir. Can people be employed if they're in the jail?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "No."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "No, they cannot, huh? All right, now, would you rather have your clients on an ankle monitor or in the jail?"

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "There is no dispute for me that there is a place for the ankle monitor --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Well, hold on, sir. You find -- you can explain your answer after you answer my question. Would you rather have your clients in jail or out of jail on an ankle monitor?"

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "Of course, I would want my clients outside."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Okay. And don't the Judges usually allow the clients to leave, they say, hey, I will let him out if he goes on an ankle monitor, right?"

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "Just like I've said, there -- there's a place for the ankle monitoring system to be placed on a client or someone that we represent. I'm not opposed to ankle monitoring --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Be careful what you're doing, because you're going to --"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "No, no --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- get your -- you're going to have more of your clients in jail."

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "How do --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "You're going to have more of your clients in jail - \_"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "No."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- listening to somebody up here that's not talking into reality."

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "If all of our judicial partners are operating in good faith and doing what they're supposed to do --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Let's deal with what's before us now --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Hold on, this is my time. This is my time. I got the floor."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "You have the -- you have your floor, Commissioner, you have the floor --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Okay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "But this --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Okay, okay. I got the floor --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "If got the floor, I got the floor."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Try to --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Either I have it, or you have it? Who has it?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Try --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Which one of us has the floor?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Try to ask --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Me or you?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Try to answer his questions and --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Which one of us has the floor? Because if I have the floor, then you should not be talking."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Try to answer his question, please. Special rules for Mr. Arrington, you have the floor."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "No special rule. Either I have the floor or I don't. If you're talking then I obviously don't have the floor."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, I'm trying to get us through today --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** ""No, what you're doing is interrupting me, which is what you do all the time. That's what you're doing."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You have the floor."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I've been had the floor until you interrupted me."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "You have floor, Commissioner Arrington. We're not going to be argumentative up here."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I -- hey, look, I'm not the one interrupt -- I didn't interrupt you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You have the floor, Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Mr. Kenner, I will caution you, sir. I understand what you're doing, but you're answering a question outside of the context, in which it occurs. She's talking about, oh, these people going to lose their job because they on an ankle monitor. No, they going to lose they job because they're in jail. And most defense attorneys would rather have their clients out on an ankle monitor then to have their client up in jail. And so for you to answer a question to someone that doesn't comprehend what's really going on in a context in which ankle monitors are issued by the Judge, is misleading. And I guarantee you it will have the opposite effect. And more

of your clients will be in jail because the Judge is going to say, I'm not -- if they not going on an ankle monitor, then I'm not going to let them out."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Sir, you don't have to answer. Just listen to Commissioner, he has the floor. But I'm not going to have y'all going back and forth like in a courtroom up here. Anything else? All right, Ms. Thorne, do you have something that's relevant that you need --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I just want to say since I'm told I don't know anything up here. I just wanted to kind of defend myself. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman said, you're going to let us know if the program works out or not. Our next meeting is December 5th. If it's not working out, if for some reason these cases aren't clearing, you'll let us know, correct?"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS:** "Commissioner, we, in discussions with the County Manager and the Chairman, we will come back to you with an update on the adds and the individuals who moved off. I will be -- make sure I reach out to Superior Court. I meet with them tomorrow, as soon as tomorrow afternoon if they're available. And we also will come back to you with a transition plan as has been requested by a number of the Board."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay. I think that's -- that's good. Thank you for doing that. I know it's extra work for you guys. I appreciate you stepping up doing that extra work. I just want to say, we have got to look at these people, the 771 that are on ankle monitors now. And we've got to evaluate the program, and this will make sure that we're evaluating it immediately, not waiting until after the holidays, not waiting until next year. It's an immediate, and it's going to require an immediate action. And as Commissioners, we can't tell you how to operate your office. We can't tell the Judges how to rule, but we can control a budget. And I think we need to have that responsibility to try to reel in a program that they are saying is being abused. And this is the only control we have. So Commissioner Arrington, I respect your thoughts. I -- and your opinions, I just disagree."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I just want to publicly say, I'm going to support Vice Chair Ellis's actual, what he has put forth. But I'm also -- by December 5, before the next meeting, I want to know if it's working. You will -- you will know, Alton. I have all respect, County Manager, that you all will know if it's working or if it's not working. Because it's not working, I'm going to bring it back, okay. But I'm going to support it today. But I think we get too bogged down in stuff that we could just get an answer for, and we have to do something. So I'm going to support this today. But I want to know if we are doing what we need to get people off the monitor. Because I know for a fact people who've been coming out to job fairs, soon as that person sees that ankle

monitor, they don't hire them. They can say they do, but I know for a fact, I've heard the conversations. But the flip side of it, you said it yourself, there are abuses that you think should be addressed. So I'm going to support Vice Chair today. And with the hopes, County Manager and Alton, and I have all faith that you all will let me know if it's going to be a problem. Because I don't think you all want anybody sitting up in jail that shouldn't be there, or someone who is going to jail that we could put on an ankle monitor. I don't know anybody down here that wants that. So that, I just wanted to publicly say that. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yeah, I'll just say, thanks again for the Public Defender to kind of -- he's shared his insight. We've heard from the Judge again, I will quote it from his letter. It's clear the county-funded ankle monitor program needs more thoughtful and regular oversight. PD agrees with that statement as well?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "I do."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "And Chief Judge, again, we must put better controls in place. And we may even need to freeze the size of the program by temporarily adopting a no-growth ratio, such that one defendant must come off a monitor before a new defendant can receive one, which is right here before us. I think, I've spoken with the Judges, I, you know, before this letter. So I understand their perspective. I think this is a -- I this is a good way for us to sort of get at what we all sort of recognize this as a -- as legitimate concerns. I hope we'll approve it unanimously."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Anybody else? All right. The motion on the floor is to approve as amended. Please cast your vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open to approve as amended. And the motion passes; four yeas, two nays, one abstention."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Thank you. It's 2:14 now. The next seven items under Arts and Libraries are all renewing existing contracts. If there are no objections, take those as group, and we'll break for recess for lunch and Executive Session. Just sound the caption quickly, Madam Clerk. Thank you, sir."

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "Th	ank you."
****************	***********

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0815, Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount not to exceed \$800,000 to provide adult, young adult, and children books."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk, we're going to take the next seven together."

CLERK GRIER: "23-0816, Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$203,450 to continue to provide research space education in areas of agriculture and natural resources, family and consumer services for aging and youth development. 23-0817, Request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount of \$715,000 for the Fulton County Executive Airport to provide design, engineering, and construction inspection services. 23-0818, Request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$349,996.36 to provide sewer system chemical root services. 23-0819, Request approval to renew existing contracts in a total amount not to exceed \$12,700,000 to provide standby miscellaneous construction wastewater system services. 23-0820, Request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$2,628,672.92 to provide congregate and home delivered meals for Fulton County residents aged 60 and above. And on page 9, 23-0821, Request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$168,000 to provide pickup and removal of deceased remains services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "We have a motion to approve those seven renewal of existing contracts. Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, one abstention."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. It's 2:17; I'll entertain a motion for recess for lunch and Executive Session, issues of real estate, litigation, and personnel."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

Recess for Executive Session at 2:17 p.m.

Back in Regular Session at 3:48 p.m.

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Without objection, we will resume the regular order of business. Madam County Attorney, where are you? All right."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Okay. So are we be back on the record?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY:** "Okay. Thank you, Mr. Chair. We've got six action items. The first one is, is there a motion to approve the request for representation presented in items 1 and 2 of the Executive Session agenda?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Is there a motion to approve the request for authority to dismiss with prejudice the two lawsuits styled as Cobb County and DeKalb County and Fulton County versus Bank of America, et al, Civil Action File Number 115-CV-04081 and Fulton County, Cobb County, and DeKalb County versus Wells Fargo and Company, et al, Civil Action Five Number 121-CV-1800, with parties all bearing their own fees and costs?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; two yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Is there a motion to approve participation in multidistrict litigation as set forth in item 6 of the Executive Session agenda?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Mr. Chair."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."** 

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Can the County Attorney resound that second item?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes. The second item was two lawsuits in which we are seeking permission to dismiss with prejudice with all parties bearing their own costs and fees."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Continue."** 

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Could we recall the vote on that? I did not understand her."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Make a motion to reconsider that item."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Motion to reconsider."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Point of order, Mr. Chair. Point of order. Someone that voted for it would have to do that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's correct."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "It can't just happen like that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I'll make a motion to reconsider."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Just a minute. Just a minute. In order to make that motion you must have voted on the prevailing side. What was the vote?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "Two yeas."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Were the two yeas, so one of you two would have to make the motion to reconsider."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "She just did."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "I didn't hear, repeat it."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I made a motion to --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "And I seconded it."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

**CLERK GRIER:** "To reconsider."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Second to reconsider."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. The motion on the floor is to reconsider that item. It was just repeated. Let's vote to reconsider."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open on the motion to reconsider."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Point of order, Mr. Chair."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."** 

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I don't know that that's the prevailing side. I will go with your ruling. But I don't know in a two-to-one vote if there is a prevailing side. In order to prevail, you have to have four votes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Parliamentarian."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I don't know that there is a prevailing side in this instance because it wasn't. The action was not approved. If we had to pick a prevailing side, I would say that folks who voted in favor of -- I mean, excuse me -- against it, would have prevailed in that it did not move forward."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Repeat that again, please."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Did anyone vote against approving that item?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I did."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah, Commissioner Arrington."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Okay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "So your ruling is Commissioner Arrington would have to make the motion to reconsider?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I think it's unclear, but if I had to pick a side in an item that did not approve anything, I would go with the person who voted against it rather than for it."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "That make -- that's logical. All right. Commissioner Arrington, you plan to make that motion to reconsider?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "No, sir, I do not. I voted against it."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Continue, Madam Clerk."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "I want to appeal that ruling to give you a chance to rule on that, Mr. Chair."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, she has --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Because it's not a -- I would appeal it to you. She said she wasn't clear. She -- there wasn't any --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Well, it wasn't clear. But her logic makes sense to me that in that \_\_"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Doesn't make sense to me, that's why I'm appealing it."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yeah. So I would support the Parliamentarian's ruling, would be my ruling."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Is it a time sensitive -- I know what the issues are. My -- the question I asked you was, is it time sensitive?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "It is time sensitive in that there is a pending court motion that could be ruled upon prior to this action."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "All right. I'll make the motion then."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "To reconsider?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Is there a second?"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Second."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. Properly moved and seconded. Let's vote on the motion to reconsider."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "It's showing motion to -- oh."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open on the motion to reconsider. And the motion passes; four yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. It's before us. Now, what's the motion?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "The motion is to approve dismissal with prejudice of the two cases set forth in items 3 and 4 of the Executive Session agenda. That is Civil Action File 115-CV-04081 and Civil Action File 121-CV-1800, with the parties bearing their own costs and fees."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Vice Chair Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Is there a motion to approve participation in the multi-district litigation set forth in item 6 of the Executive Session agenda?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays. Five, with Commissioner Hall."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "And the final action item: Is there a motion to increase compensation for the Clerk to the Commission in the amount of 150,000 annually?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Point of order. Point of order, Mr. Chair."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I'm trying to understand why we're not voting on item number 8 from Executive Session agenda."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "08?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Housing Authority. Housing Authority."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Oh. Well, there's no recommendation coming -- what I recall is that there were -- a report is forthcoming from the review, it's forthcoming from the County Attorney."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Okay. I guess I don't understand the procedure or the policy then on how one of these items from this agenda gets voted on. How -- I don't understand, their items are on the agenda. We voted on some, but we don't vote on others? We can't vote back there, so we obviously didn't vote to not vote on one of these items. So either it -- it's on the agenda, it should get voted up or down."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Madam County Attorney, you want -- I know what I recall is that we're waiting for a review. But I would rule that a Commissioner can make a motion if he or she chooses to do so, and we'll vote it up or vote it down."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I agree."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Okay. I'm going to make a motion to adopt the recommendation of the Board from the Housing Authority to remove the member that is preventing them from having -- conducting any meeting -- any meetings?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Is there a second? Is there a second? Is there a second? Commissioner Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Do we have the authority to move forward based off of the recommendation of the Housing Authority Board to remove such appointee?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "The appointment of the members is within the purview of this Board, and therefore the removal is also within the purview of this Board as long as the due process requirements have been met."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "And have those requirements been met?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Initial -- on initial review, the notice requirement appears to have been met. We're still reviewing the entire transcript to ensure that that will be our recommendation."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Well, is there a second, first of all? You want to second it? Do you want to speak?"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Yes. In Executive Session --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Wait a minute, now let's -- we all --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Well, there --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Hold it, just a minute. Just a minute. Madam Parliamentarian, this was -- we're in public now, so --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Yeah."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- the vote is before us. But you're the Parliamentarian."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I'm sorry. What was the question on the floor?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "The question is, we're in a public vote now. We're no longer in Executive Session. But we're about to vote on a matter that was discussed in Executive Session, and certain facts may become public. We're in a public session, so."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "The matters that were discussed in Executive Session typically stay confidential until the Board, as a whole, decides to make them public, or the conditions that make it confidential are exempt from open meetings no longer exist. So are you asking me if you can discuss this matter in --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."** 

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "-- an open session now? I would -- I advise refraining at this point unless there's going to be a second and the discussion moves forward."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Repeat that."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "So if you have a second, there -- you really can't discuss the motion. If the motion becomes properly before you, you can't discuss the matter without discussing some of the subject matter that was discussed. But if there is going to be no second and there will be no vote or discussion, I would advise refraining from discussing it at this juncture."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "So we need to get a second or not and what did you say, before we discuss it?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Well, we already started discussing it."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "As a Board, you can choose to discuss."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "We already started discussing it. We're -- Pandora is already out of the box. Commissioner Hall was first in the queue, and she started discussing it."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. There's a motion on the floor to approve by Commissioner Arrington. I'll repeat. Is there a second? Is there a second. Last and final time, is there a second? All right, fails for lack of a second. Next item."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "There's a second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Who?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "It's right there on the screen."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Seconded by Commissioner Natalie Hall. You have the floor, Commissioner Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "(Off-mic comments.)"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "You don't want to speak? Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, you have the floor. Commissioner Hall has already spoken."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "And so it is my understanding that a report was coming from the County Attorney with a recommendation. And so if we are voting on that privy to your report, then we don't have all of the available subject matter that we need in order to make an informed decision if the discussion in Executive Session was that you will give a report."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes. Yes, that is correct. I had pledged to the Board that I would send up a detailed recommendation and review of the materials that we received from the Housing Authority by next week, and that the Board would have that for a full consideration."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "So I would ask that the colleagues hold this. I want to make a motion to hold it until we get a report from our County Attorney for all of the subject matter and the decisions that need to be made, so we all are fully aware of what we need to do."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. A substitute motion to hold, is there a second? Is there a second? All right, I'll second it, that's purposes of discussion. Commissioner Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I have a question. Do we have anyone here that can answer a question about the process for when an employee reports sexual harassment?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I think initially, our determine --"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Publicly?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY:** "Yes, yes. But I -- I would -- I would prefer not to give legal advice on that matter without knowing all of the facts in a public forum. Also, we would have to determine the actual status of the person who would potentially be the reporting party."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Did we not just have sexual harassment training sent to every employee of the county with several videos that we had to watch? Didn't we just do that?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "The general policy is to go to DCRC. But it's -- I would have to research that to determine if she is an employee who's covered under that policy."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Okay. So then I have a question about the sexual harassment videos that were sent to us because it was -- it appeared to be clear that if any employee, even a public resident, came to anyone and said that they were being sexually harassed that, that person needed to then go an report it; is that not correct?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Even a resident?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "It had public -- there were public things in there about if the public was even involved with a --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Was it in context of customers or clients of departments?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "It said even if they're out somewhere, if you were a county employee and you're out somewhere in a club or -- I forget the exact example."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I don't think I -- okay."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Did you see the videos?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I have not."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Oh, okay. That's --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I have not, so --"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Okay. Then that's probably the problem. I just saw them last week, so they're kind of fresh in my mind."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "What Ms. Martinez was saying to me was that our policy does cover certain members of the public in certain circumstances. But again, I would have to see what the video said in order to be able to give you an opinion on that."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So our HR department doesn't know? No?"

**KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM:** "The question again, Commissioner is what would the general public do in case of if they are being harassed by a county employee?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL: "No."** 

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "Okay."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "No, no. If a county employee or an employee even, we can add in a member of the public, reports to this Body and the whole world that they were sexually harassed --"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "Right."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "-- what are we supposed to do?"

**KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM:** "Well, DCRC is the -- is the body within the county's organization that would be the intake of that situation and conduct the initial investigation."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "And so what are we supposed to do?"

KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM: "Well --"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I want to make sure that we're doing what we are supposed to do."

**KENNETH HERMON, CHIEF HRO, HRM:** "Right. And I think in this instance, I think what's cloudy is trying to identify whether or not the individual is truly an employee. So that's the --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "And I would concur. DCRC is generally your point of contact for the employee or anyone who has concerns about these types of matters.

But we would have to look at the specific positions involved in this situation to determine if they're covered under the policy that would go to DCRC."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Okay. So you're saying that we're not supposed to do anything, to allow you to -- to the -- I'm trying to make sure that we're covered."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I'm saying that our obligation in this process is to employees who are covered under our policy. And I would have to research to see if these two positions involved in this particular situation are quote/unquote employees for purposes of our policy, such that they would be covered."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Okay. So you're basically telling us we have no obligation to do anything at this point, to allow you to do --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "That's actually -- what I'm saying is I will research these two positions to see if they are covered. And as I mentioned to you, if they are covered then I don't think I have a legal obligation, but I had already pledged to reach out to the person to make sure they are aware that they have the ability to go to DCRC if in fact they're covered."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "You're still not answering my question about what do -- what are we supposed to do as a Body?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I don't know of any mandatory-reporter obligation as it pertains to sexual harassment."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "We have no obligation to report it?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I don't know if any legal obligation for you to report someone else's allegations of sexual harassment."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Okay, thank you. Now, you've answered my question. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. The motion on the floor is to hold. Let's vote, please. All right, it's 4:09, ladies and gentlemen. We haven't gotten to the meat of the -- it's to hold."

**CLERK GRIER:** "The vote is open on the motion to hold. And the motion fails; three yeas, one nay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Back to the main motion, which is to approve. Let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; one yea, three nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "Two nays with Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Oh, no, two yeas."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Two yeas with Commissioner Hall."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Back on page 9, <mark>23-0822</mark>, Finance presentation of the fiscal year 2024 proposed operating budget --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Just a minute -- can we, Mr. Manager, let -- we have about four or five more items that shouldn't take long. I don't want to interrupt this budget when we get to it. If there are no objections, I'd like to just get rid of these items, then we can spend the time on the budget. So go to page 9, number 0823."

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0823, Real Estate and Asset Management request approval for a statewide contract in the amount of \$320,872.68."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0824, Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$400,000 to provide on-site preventative and corrective maintenance services for passenger and freight elevators."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Mr. Davis, this is the elevator contract, right, it includes it?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, DREAM: "Yes, sir, it includes elevators and escalators."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. Then quickly explain why that elevator in our atrium has not worked in probably three years. And we're a first-tier county in the country."

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, DREAM: "The escalator in the Government Center Atrium in 2020, DREAM put forth a capitol enhancement request to upgrade or refurbish the elevator. Given the financial scenario at the time that particular request was not approved. The escalator is a feature of convenience, rather than one of regulatory compliance. As such, since that time, we've attempted to parse together bits and pieces of capital dollars. But ultimately, we have yet to reach the dollar value needed for the complete overhaul of the escalator. The escalator will run, however, it is not deemed to be safe by the Department of Labor. And therefore it must be, as you have seen, cordoned off with warning signs."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. What is -- what does it cost to fix it? It's just horrible and looks bad."

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, DREAM: "\$806,000."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "806?"

JOE DAVIS, DIRECTOR, DREAM: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. Motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Page 10, 23-0825, Public Works request approval of a recommended proposal in the amount of nine -- \$9,725,000 to provide design-build services for Camp Creek Water Reclamation facility."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0826, Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$240,183.13 for the purpose of one truck-mounted CCTV sewer pipe extension."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0827, Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$100,512 to provide water quality monitoring services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0828, Request approval of a contract item agreement for the adjustment of six sanitary sewer manholes."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0829, Request approval of a recommended proposal in an amount not to exceed \$7,200,000 to provide armed and unarmed security services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0830, Sheriff request approval to amend an existing contract in the amount of \$1,200,394.20 to provide physical and mental health services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Is there a motion? Motion to approve by Commissioner Arrington, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 11, 23-0831, Sheriff request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$33,791,785.73 to provide physical and mental health services to inmates at the Fulton County Jail."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Is there a motion? Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne. Is there a second? Okay, I'll second it for discussion. Commissioner Natalie Hall has a question."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. So if you turn to the last page of this item, there is a page called Overall Rating Guide Professional Services. And do we have anyone here from the Sheriff's Department or anyone who can speak to this rating? Because it says under quality of design reports and deliverables, it says needs improvement. Is there anyone that can speak to this? Nobody here? Well, it's says lack of adequate physician coverage at the Fulton County Jail, see Fulton County NaphCare provider file. During a time period when the Medical Director was separated from NaphCare's employment, ongoing staffing issues, see 2308 Georgia-Fulton staffing report, file for an example. So I wanted to know, has this been cleared up? Because that sounds like a serious issue. We don't want any more issues at the jail. Nobody?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Commissioner, I'll share what I know."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, thank you."

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS:** "No one from the Sheriff's office here. I do believe that NaphCare, like a lot of other providers where they rely on nurses, have had challenges staffing. It's just one of those things. They continue to try to hire, and they lose, they lose staff. And it is an issue, I believe the Sheriff has worked with them and indicated to them that needs to be fixed. But I think -- I think, here again, not knowing exactly what they meant in this particular -- really, I think that's genesis of it, is that they have had ongoing staffing issues, kind of reflective of what's going on in the overall space when it comes to hiring and keeping nurses and nursing staff."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Well, was it staffing issues that caused an issue not too long ago, as it related to an inmate that had mental health issues?"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS:** "I can't comment on that. I'm not sure I'm supposed to only because of legal implications. But -- but I think it's fair to say that -- that the Fulton County Jail, like a number of other correctional institutions, have had challenges, not only retaining staff like correctional officers, but also medical staff as well. And NaphCare has been challenged by that, I think over the last, certainly since COVID began."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I didn't realize that there was some pending legal issue. Is that correct, Madam County Attorney?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I'm sorry, pending legal issue with what, NaphCare?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL: "With NaphCare."** 

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I'm not certain what Mr. Adams is referring to --"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS:** "Well, there was a question about an individual at the jail, who had an issue. And I know we've had legal issues, so I'm not sure, first of all, I just tried to comment on what I thought was the issue around the staffing. In terms of its implications and how that relates to individuals at the jail, it's just not something I'm familiar with, nor do I think I'm qualified to comment on it. That's really my point. I have no knowledge of whether the staffing led to an issue with an inmate, Commissioner, let me say it that way. I'm sorry."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, thank you."

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Yeah."

**COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you."** 

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, you want to be heard?"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "No."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No? All right. Let's vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Bottom of page 11, Commissioners' Full-Board appointments, 23-0833, Board of Ethics, the Atlanta Bar Association has recommended Benjamin E. Fox for a Full-Board reappointment to a term ending February 12th, 2026."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Let's see, is there a motion? A motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Commissioner Arrington, followed by Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Yes. I'm going to ask that this not be approved. Mr. Benjamin Fox is the Chair, former Chair of the Board. And as the Chair, he was responsible for making sure that the minutes -- that the meetings were conducted and that the rules were followed. He did not follow the rules. He violated the ethics code. He violated the Georgia Constitution. He violated the United States Constitution. And I have filed ethics charges against him and all other members. I'm going to ask right now on the record for all members that were responsible for filing a lawsuit against me and one of my legal clients, resign. Resign today. I am going to be forced to file a lawsuit against all of you. So, you know, you can do what you want to, but it's unethical to violate the Fulton County Ethics Code. And you -- y'all are -- these people are coming back up. Benjamin Fox is supposed to be a lawyer, he's supposed to be a lawyer, but he can't follow the home rules and apparently doesn't know the Georgia Constitution is, nor the United States Constitution. It is a shame that lawyer -- someone who is supposed to be a lawyer doesn't know how to follow the rules. And it's -- it is crazy, and I would just ask the County Attorney to -- if she will mention some of the rules that were violated and policies that were violated by this Board while Benjamin Fox was Chair."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "So, we've previously discussed this in previous meetings. There were procedural irregularities, as I've said. But there --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "What procedural irregularities?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "-- I don't know if any of that would prevent a vote on this today."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "What procedural irregularities were there? That's what I'm asking."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Regarding notices of meetings, regarding the filing of a lawsuit against a litigant before the Board, regarding --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "What is your --"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "-- notice --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- opinion on whether the Ethics Board has standing to file a lawsuit?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I do not believe they're an entity that is capable of suing, of filing suit."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And so that means they would have exceeded their authority if they filed a lawsuit?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "That is my opinion, yes."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Okay. Y'all going to do what y'all want to do anyway. I'm just telling you, this guy, Louis Levenson, Mercedes Miller, any of them people that were on that Board and voted to sue me and one of my legal clients, they're not going to ever be able to hear anything against me, ever."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 12, 23-0834, Board of Health, Chairman Pitts has nominated Jake Hardin for a Full-Board reappointment to a term ending December 31st, 2029."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Let's vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, one nay."

\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Mr. Chairman, we have an item that was removed from consent."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, where was that?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 6, **23-0810**, District Attorney request approval to process outstanding and current invoices via purchase order in the amount of \$79,234.26."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yes. I'll have Felicia, Ms. Strong-Whitaker speak on this. I was just confused as to why we are approving a former purchase that's already happened, an outstanding purchase, and then current purchases from the DA. Whereas, we normally -- nothing comes through us from the DA. So I think you can explain this."

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "Good afternoon, Commissioners. Felicia Strong-Whitaker. This is because I was notified by the vendor that there were a lot of past-due invoices that had not been paid. There was not a -- Purchasing did not do a procurement for it, so I am not authorized to approve 75 -- 79,000, it had to come

to the Board to authorize it. Part of the problem they have rectified. We've met with the DA's office. We're on the right track. We're going to move forward. But in this instance, this was printing services that had already been done, and the vendor needed to be paid."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "And how did they -- how are they rectifying the situation?"

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "So, we've had a meeting with them. We've done training with them. But I mean -- I believe, Dexter is here as well. We've done training with them. I think they have new personnel, so we went through the whole process. So they are -- we're working with them to make sure it doesn't happen again."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. Yeah, because I'm also confused because we've been spending a lot of money on outside counsel, or the DA has. And there's a code O.C.G.A. 15-18-20. And if she hires anybody, on Section A of that code, it says, it may be -- has be authorized by the governing authority or approved by us. Yet, she spending money on this Nathan R. Wade. Now, County Attorney Soo Jo tells me it has to be for a special purpose. But I do see him having a special purpose. Like, he's a special election law or something like that, there might be an instance where we don't have to approve it. So I was just trying to figure out how her spending authority is going without us. I mean, we -- we've constantly approving outside counsel in our Executive Sessions, and it's not running through us this time."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Mr. Chair, point of order."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes. sir."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "That's not germane to this agenda item."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Well, do you speak on the --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "It's not germane --"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Well, if they have --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "This item is about --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- print -- a printing invoice."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yeah, it is --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "This item is about --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "-- related to how purchasing -- I'm confused about items that are run through us and items that are not run through us. And now, this item --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Ma'am, you're asking --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "-- is having to go through us. So it all goes through Purchasing and what we are accountable for."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Ma'am, you're asking about hiring outside counsel."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "This agenda item is about --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioners, I'm --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- printing invoice."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, hold on for a second."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "This is a printing invoice. This is not about hiring outside counsel."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Ms. Strong-Whitaker, would explain this one more time?"

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "Purchasing does not have an outside counsel. This is, as Commissioner Arrington said, about printing services. There were outstanding invoices, and we needed an authorization in order for me to process a purchase order to pay the outstanding invoices."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yes. So I was just trying to understand what goes through us, and what doesn't go through us. But you guys have rectified the situation, correct? So we don't have to worry about having to approve every purchase. Would you like to speak and have your word since you came down here?"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "I came down if you did have a question. I do have a Commissioner here that's saying that anything that is done by the District Attorney Fani

Willis as it relates to outside counsel is covered under her prosecutorial discretion. That is not why I'm here today. And that is --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. Let's stick to consistent with what Commissioner Arrington is saying. Let's stick with this --"

DEXTER BOND, COO, DA: "That's correct."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- this is of printing."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "As relates to the conversation with DA's office and Purchasing, Felicia Strong-Whitaker, yes, we have rectified this situation. It's our position that this matter can before the Board and a vote could be had."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "And thank you for coming down. I wasn't expecting you to come down, appreciate that."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "So let's vote this up or down. And I would submit to you that this situation has not been rectified with the DA, nor with the Sheriff. Sometimes they've come through Purchasing, sometimes they don't. It's willy-nilly, and I think hopefully, that letter that we sent to the Sheriff yesterday will correct it from the Sheriff's point of view. But you can't have it both ways, to your point. All right. The motion on the floor is to -- Vice Chair Ellis. Commissioner Arrington. Commissioner Ellis, who is it?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Oh, no, I'm good."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Vice Chair."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "All right. So just explain this to me again. This is somebody expended something but they didn't have authority to do it, now we're just -- we're paying it because it's just due."

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "In order for a vendor to be paid, Commissioner, there must be a purchase order. And we had not issued a purchase order because we did not do a procurement for the printing services."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "But it was supposed to be a procurement for the printing services?"

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "It could be based on the spending amount. What happened was, the vendor contacted me to let me know that they had a lot of outstanding invoices. I contacted Mr. Bond, we worked through it. They'd had a lot of personnel changes, and so --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Who's had a lot of personnel changes?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Yes."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Who?"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Who?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Who's had -- who had the --"

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "The DA has had personnel changes."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "So that's the excuse, we had some personnel changes?"

DEXTER BOND, COO, DA: "If I may --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "My name is Dexter Bond, I serve as the Chief Operating Officer of the Office of the Fulton County District Attorney. A few things that I want to clarify. The first is, generally you're right, a purchase order needs to be acquired if there is some services. There are some exceptions. Those Exceptions include if the threshold is not being met. It's our position that you have before you \$79,000, but that is over 110 invoices. Those invoices could have been obtained and those services could have been attained without purchasing order. So I do not want you, Commissioner Ellis, to --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "-- think that a purchase is an order is needed. Because it's my position that that is not the case."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Do we agree with that?"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "The vendor --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "No, no, no, No, no, I'm asking -- is, from a Purchasing standpoint."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "In its totality --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Right."

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "-- it is \$79,000. Had they come to us individually, some of them are \$2,000, some of them are 500. Those could have been handled by a purchase order under our new threshold. Anything over \$5,000, has to go through a procurement process by us. And because by the time the vendor contacted me, their amount was 75,000, and then it was 79. So it was over a period of time, it's not just a one thing, it was several invoices."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "And if I can add, before you all are over 110 invoices. I submit that is 98 percent of those, would have been under the threshold, not allowing a PO."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "But just out of curiosity, one of the biggest ones on here I see, there's just -- just for kicks and giggles, I'm just wondering, for 12,695. I got a big glossy report, probably about 20 pages, 30 pages, color report from the DA, came in my mailbox at home. The June 21, 2023 invoice, is that what that was for, 12,695?"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "So as a Deputy of Operations, we have an agreement with our staff. Whatever they need in their office, it's my job to secure that particular service. And I don't go into the details. If an expert on someone and the Supervisor says that this is what they need, as long as --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "No, I know, I just --"

DEXTER BOND, COO, DA: "-- the law --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- do you think that might have been what that would have been?"

DEXTER BOND, COO, DA: "I cannot speak to the details. What I do know --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "-- is that my position is, we did not need a purchase order. And my position is that all rules have been followed. That's my position. As it relates to the nuances of the 12,000, I believe you have 110 invoices before you. I cannot speak to that one particular invoice, I'm sorry, I cannot."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay. It just happened to be the biggest one, that was why I asked. It sort of jumped off the page. And this is not necessarily really something for, specific to the DA, but just something for us to consider, right. I mean, we have operations which go through -- which have things that they need to routinely purchase. We set up standby contracts, we bid them out. Why can't we do some stuff like that relative to some of these other offices so we can avoid, I'll use the word, stuff like this?"

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "So Commissioner, to be honest, had we known with each one, like, if they were under 5,000. Our threshold is \$0 to 5000. We don't --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "No, but why won't we just have, you know --"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "We do --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "-- printing services up to, like, a specific amount? You got --

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "We do."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- standby vendors for, similar to the stuff in the Sheriff's office for, you know, toilet paper, mouthwash, and all this other crap that, you know, we got to see, you know. I don't know. Can we -- we got some work to do in terms of this whole contracting and purchasing stuff. And I think some of it can be simplified. And we avoid kind of this whole -- this -- these types of discussions to begin with, but also provide more transparency and comfort to people that, you know, that there's legitimate procurement going on."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "And so --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "That could be good for both sides of -- for everybody."

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "Correct. And if we know the need, we can help. We have statewide contracts we can use. We have a whole plethora of things that we can do. But we have to know what the need is, as I said, I did not know about the need until the vendor contacted me about the issue."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay, all right."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I don't want to assume that I know what your threshold is. So can you tell me what it is?"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "So there are three thresholds. And I'm going to answer it two ways. The first is \$2,500, anything under can be used on P-card. The second is 5,000, anything under \$5,000 you do not have to go get a -- you do not have to do a bid. Anything over 5000, you have got to do a bid. It's very important right here to let you know that these particular thresholds are uniquely for the District Attorney of Fulton County. No other DA's office has to deal with the three thresholds that I laid before you."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Okay. And so I'm trying to scroll, this thing is a little bit -- it's not touchscreen. So if you just bear with me for a moment. I'm trying to see how many are actually over the threshold. And I do not -- it's about four? Commissioner Ellis, you said it's about four of them?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "(Off-mic comments.)"

**COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay."** 

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "It's not over three. Is that what he said?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "How many are over the threshold?"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "Right now, it's my position that I -- I'm going to use you, Commissioner Ellis, and say that that was one that jumped over -- I, through your eyes, and I can echo him and say confidently, one. But I want you to know, before you, there's over 100."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I'm sorry?"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "On May 17th, they issued -- four --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Microphone, please."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. On May 17th, there's five invoices from the same company."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. I see."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "So if they break it down so that it does go under the threshold, but cumulatively it'll be way over the threshold. It would be approximately \$10,000."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So Mr. Bond, when these purchases are being made, are they being made by one person in your organization?"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "One person is approving, but no, it is not one person. As you know, there's several different divisions and therefore several different units. So if my Major Case Division needs something printed for court, they can route it through our Purchasing Department to have that done. If my Special Victims Division needs the

same thing, yes, they can. So if your question is, is only one person in the office initiating, the answer is, no."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Okay. That -- that makes sense. Because I was trying to figure out why would there be that many on May 17th. So you have different divisions who are just purchasing from the same contractor?"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "Absolutely. There's 16 courtrooms. So you know, Commissioner Hall, that there can be several different proceedings going on. And what you have before you are printing for trial boards, right. You have printing for several different things. So if Courtroom A needs some printing, they get the printing. As long as it's within budget, and well as -- as long as it's within law. So we can come several different ways. So what strikes you as alarming, certainly doesn't strike me as the same."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Well, it would have been alarming if you told me that this was coming through one person."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "That's correct."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Because then it would be that that person was separating these purchases to ensure that they fell under the threshold. But since you've explained it that these are -- these are from various divisions within your organization who are just using the same contractor then that's understandable. But what I -- the other question I have that it's -- you said there are 110 invoices. So how did we get here, where 110 invoices have remained unpaid until now? I know everybody has staffing shortages. But this is a lot. It's starting back in --"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "February."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "-- February."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "It is done in February, and Commissioner, I can offer you this, we were told once it hit a threshold of \$5,000 that we had to come in. Commissioner, at -- yes, there were some personnel changes in the Operation Division. But we were specifically told that in order for you, the Strong-Whitaker, to be able to approve, she couldn't approve anything under \$5,000 without solicitation. So we had to come here."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I don't --"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "No."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "That doesn't make sense to me. You know, I've worked with you a long time, back at City Hall, you taught me how to do an RFP."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Yes, ma'am."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "So --"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "So, I think there's some confusion. So we do have our thresholds, and our thresholds are in our Purchasing Code, and it is the law. If it's between zero and \$5,000 I could do it. We can process a purchase order for that division. If it's over 5,000, and that can be cumulatively, if it's over 5,000 and they're going to use that vendor a lot, we need to do a procurement, period. So I think there is some confusion there. When I found out about it, is when the vendor contacted me about a month ago to say, I have a lot of outstanding invoices, it was about \$75,000 at the time. I need to be paid. We don't have a PO that we've issued for the District Attorney to that vendor in order for them to process those payments. So we had to come to the Board, because I'm not authorized to just cut a PO for the DA for \$80,000. I can't do that without Board approval. And that's why we're here. And I think moving forward, we've talked about them using the statewide contract. There's a vendor on the statewide contract Registration and Election uses them. We could do a procurement for them. There's things that we can do for them, so moving forward, we're not here again."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Okay, good. Because that was going to be my next question. How do we prevent this from happening again? And so it's apparent the services have been provided, and these -- they need to be paid."

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "Correct."

**COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes."** 

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "And this is the only way I could --"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "That you --"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "-- process this PO."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Gotcha, okay. Thank you so much."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Thank you, Chairman. I'll be brief. You said it was several invoices."

DEXTER BOND, COO, DA: "Over 100, yes, ma'am."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Over 100. So let -- I just want to make sure we're crystal clear about that. But I would say given the nature of what we do down here, even today, we approved invoices for other vendors. So let's -- let's keep it in perspective. Whatever got us to get here, I would imagine maybe it's communication or something. And so I would just encourage the communication to be better. That way, when you're coming with over 100 invoices, I mean, that's -- it is what it is."

DEXTER BOND, COO, DA: "I agree."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "You see what I'm saying, so --"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "I certainly do. If I could respond. The reason why the vendor contacted Felicia Strong-Whitaker, Mrs. Felicia Strong-Whitaker is because she had already told me she needed to go to the PO, and it was at my bequest. We knew that we couldn't do anything else --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Okay, okay."

DEXTER BOND, COO, DA: "-- because -- number one --"

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Okay."** 

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "-- and number two, just because once we got above the threshold, there was conversations with the Finance Department, but they could not approve it, right."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I got you."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "And since we have a long-standing relationship with this particular vendor that dates well from 2017 to 2018, they continued to do the work, because that we knew that the statewide contract could not be to help us."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I got you."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "So I want to just --"

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Okay."** 

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "-- add that clarity that we knew we had to come here. And it was by my prompting to let's facilitate this conversation."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Okay, okay. So that's -- that -- I just don't want the taxpaying citizen that may be watching this, I want all the facts out there, I guess that's what I'm saying."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "Definitely, and I appreciate the question."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "And whatever we could do moving forward to make sure this doesn't happen again. I mean, things happen, so it is what it is. And our DA is handling a lot."

DEXTER BOND, COO, DA: "Correct."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "And so but -- I would say moving forward, whatever we can do to make sure that -- you all are so busy, I don't -- I don't want to see you coming down here for this. You understand the point I'm trying to make?"

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "I received that point. I can say, conversations have been made with the County Attorney's office as well as the Purchasing Director to make sure that we're not in this situation again."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Wonderful, thank you."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** "But I also will conclude by saying that this long-standing vendor does need to be paid."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Okay. I imagine so, yes, okay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "It's got to be something else."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I was --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Go ahead, Commissioner."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- just going to say, I can imagine if you're going to trial in the morning, you're not worried about no vendor and no statewide contract. You're worried about winning the trial."

**DEXTER BOND, COO, DA:** Certainly, if District Attorney Willis is -- was here, that's exactly what she was going to say. She certainly wouldn't be here to talk about printing. She has, like you said, Commissioner Khadijah Abdur-Rahman, she has things on her plate. She has business, she got justice --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And I'm also wondering why, why these invoices weren't paid individually. If it's 110 invoices, the only one we should -- that should be

before us is the one that's over -- that's \$12,000. All the rest of them should already be paid, because they're under the threshold. It shouldn't -- why are we stalling people out? We don't want -- we don't want the DA to win trials? We want murderers running free on the street?"

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "Commissioner, I did not get the notice until a month ago. And at that point, it was already \$75,000. I don't know what they did with the invoices. I can only tell you the vendor contacted me."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Yeah, but still, it's still 110 invoices. Is it one invoice, or is it 110 invoices? Somebody tell me which one is it --"

FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC: "It's --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Because it can't be both."

**FELICIA STRONG-WHITAKER, DIRECTOR, PCC:** "It's -- it's a lot of different invoices on a statement. I asked them to put them all in a statement so we can see all of the invoices. And it was attached to the agenda item."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It's 110 different ones."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "It's 110 invoices, 109 of them should be paid. This vendor should only be worried about the one that's \$12,000, that's over the threshold. I don't even understand -- this doesn't --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "I agree. All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Continue, Madam Clerk."

\*

CLERK GRIER: "Mr. Chairman, the next action item we have is 23-0835 --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "What page?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 12, Request approval of the 2024 State Legislative Agenda."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Ms. Corbitt, quickly summarize, please."

**JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We are back to present the 2024 State Legislative Agenda for your consideration and approval. Mr. Chairman, I would like to ask you to clarify if you'd like to vote on these items individually or as a group."

## COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Group."

JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Could someone, please bring up the presentation? All right. We will go ahead. The first item is the Behavior Health Operational Funding for 2024. We are requesting approval for the annualized funding for our Behavioral Health Crisis Center, as well as the additional continuing to advocate for funds for youth behavioral health crisis services and behavioral health resources for individuals with justice involvement, including people in the Fulton County Jail. I'm sorry, I don't know where the presentation is. So -- there we go, thank you. Next slide, please. Next slide, please. So this is our first and top priority, Mr. Chairman. So again, if you'd like to vote on them individually, we can, or we can just go through it. The next slide is -- or the next item is funding, seeking legislation to enable a justice Special-Purpose Local Option Sales Tax to offset cost -- provide voters with the opportunity to choose the funding mechanism to finance a replacement jail facility. Next slide, please. The next is about equitable property tax appeals. This is now one ACCG's priorities. And we're looking at several areas for change in the law regarding the appeals process and the 299(c) freeze for large commercial properties. Next slide, please. Please stop me if you have questions. The -- next, we're moving into kind of -those were the top three priorities, now we're moving into other priority areas. This one is regarding access to personnel benefits and retirement plan for State Court Judges. As we discussed previously, this is a change in the law that specifically prohibits State Court Judges from participating in one of the retirement plans. And this would carry over from last year's agenda. Next slide, please. This is a request to make adjustments in the equipment formula for Election Day, and to perform analysis of the voting patterns, which reflected more than half of our voters choose to participate in early voting. I did hear some other discussion today about other potential changes in elections that could we bring back another time after we do a little more analysis. Next slide, please. This is changes in the priorities for our justice system, specifically seeking, we have left this open as additional judgeship within Superior Court. That was a change that was requested at the last meeting to be more open as we advocate for that. Next is a pilot project in State Court that would allow for digital reportings. Next would be changes in potentially creating a -- an elected Chief Judge position, which is not currently -- that position is currently elected from among the Judges on the bench. And then lastly, I wanted to know, Commissioner Thorne had asked us about clarifying purchasing powers of constitutional officers. We did note here that this is something the County Attorney is working on already. So we would recommend that we get that analysis. And Ms. Jo, I think you mentioned that that's something that you're already working on. Thank you. Next slide, please. We also made some updates in this item since our last meeting to reflect our general support for healthcare access as a county,

and the investments this Board has made. So supporting updates in the certificate need implementation to allow beds to stay in the community, expansion of Medicaid, and generally resources to address the healthcare desert within Fulton County and healthcare access. Next slide, please. Again, we discussed this at the last meeting that we acknowledge that there were some changes in legislation that was introduced last year. That in talking with several members, there was a desire to address changes in the law related to anti-Semitism and anti-Islamic hatred, or Islamophobia. Next slide, please. As we heard at the last meeting, Commissioner Arrington asked us to address the HOA protections and transparency. And this is specifically requiring some meeting minutes and documentation transfer within HOAs. Next slide. We do have a few carryover items. And I'll go through these very quickly. Senior homestead exemption simplification, and we are working with the sponsor of this legislation and meeting as soon as tomorrow on this one. Next slide. We've also previously discussed our MARTA Board appointments. Next slide. National use of force data collection, again, this is one that the Board took a position on during the last Legislative Session. Next slide, please. Changes to the Superior -- Clerk of Superior Court passport fee item, again, this is one you all took a position on during the last session, and they're carrying forward. Next side. And then lastly, our support for the Crown Act, which is, again, this Board has taken a position on. So, Mr. Chairman, again with that, we could -- we're seeking the Board's approval so we can begin to communicate with our members about these priorities."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Entertain a motion to approve the Legislative Agenda. All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Natalie Hall. Vice Chair Bob Ellis, you have the floor."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "I thought I had raised this time, I don't see it in there unless I missed it as you were going through it. But also wanted to include change in state law to amount -- allow for change in the set out process for our Magistrates when it comes to -- I mentioned our Marshal when it comes to evictions."

**JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "Commissioner, I'm glad you brought that up. And I believe that may have been an oversight on our part. But I do recall that you pointed us to some changes in the Marshal's office. So we can go ahead, Commissioner Ellis and add that --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "-- as a note."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay."

**JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "And work with you on the language, if you're comfortable with that."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Is that the North Carolina law?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay. I think I mentioned that as well when we met."

JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Thank you, Commissioner."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. Any other comments?"

JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "The motion on the floor is to adopt. Let's vote."

**JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "As amended, is that correct, Mr. Chairman?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What?"

**JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "As amended with the comment that Commissioner Ellis just made."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Let's vote, please."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

JESSICA CORBITT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Thank you very much."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next, Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Mr. Chairman, would like to do the discussion items, or go back to the presentation for the --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah, I wanted to get discussions last. What discussion items?"

CLERK GRIER: "We have one --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Where is it? What is next?"

CLERK GRIER: "On page 12, bottom of page 12."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Sound that one."

CLERK GRIER: "The first one is Commissioner Arrington's, the --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's a report. He'll be back. Next, go to the next one."

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0837, Discussion, Public Defender new identify operations, ABA

requirement and standards and needs for 2024."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Mr. Kenner brought something to my attention that I was not aware of, and asked that he be able to report it to the entire Board. And so that's why he's here."

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "Thank you, Commissioner Hall. The three things that I wanted to discuss is, one, the introduction -- well, to introduce to you all the new caseload recommendation by the American Bar Association. To also seek an exemption from the criteria that was used to refer enhancements to you all for approval. I'm asking that we have an exemption so that I can extend the services that my office already provides. And finally, to give you all a quick update on what my office has been doing. Next slide, please. Historically, the county has funded my office in a matter that was consistent with the recommended number of attorneys that the ABA said that a caseload should have. Those standards that the ABA were using were set in 1973. We have come a long way since 1973. Next slide, please. Right now, my office has a caseload of over 20,000 cases. And that's in Superior Court, Juvenile Court, State Court, and Magistrate Court. We have a staff that provides a holistic representation and care to our clients. We have Social Workers and Investigators that help us carry on our mission. Next slide, please. Next slide. Right now, our PINC Division, what we call the Pre-indictment Noncomplex Division of Superior Court, has approximately 12,450 cases. Our Complex Division has approximately 3,859 cases. State Court, 3750, Juvenile Court, approximately 830 cases. The -- our needs are continually growing. And what's scheduled to happen next year is that we'll lose the ORCA-funded positions, and those positions are critical. Next slide, please. Right now, the old standard -- and that we use when we submitted our request to you all is listed above: Felony cases, the maximum that's recommended by the ABA is 150 cases per Attorney. And misdemeanor cases, 400 cases per year; mental health cases, 200 cases; juvenile cases, 200 cases; and appellant cases, 25 cases. Next slide, please. Again, like I said, my office is handling over 20,000 cases. The standard that was set is 50 years old, it was recently revised. In our PINC Unit, each Attorney has an average of

515 cases. Now, some of those cases are not active cases. But there nonetheless cases that my Attorneys are responsible for and have to keep an eye on while the case percolates through the judicial process. Next slide, please. The RAND Corporation in conjunction with the American Bar Association did a study over the past few years. And they came up with new standards and new recommendations on the caseloads that a Public Defender should handle. They looked at 17 states' caseloads, and came up with the recommendation. Next slide, please. Under the new ABA standards, and I think these came out in September of 2023, the standard is recommending in a homicide case, based on 2,080 hours a year that the number of cases an Attorney should be able to handle in terms of a serious murder case is seven to eight. And as you can see as the list goes down, this standard is significantly different from the 50-year-old standard. And you may ask, why. Next slide, please. One of the reasons is that in the 70s, we did not have all of the scientific information that we had to deal with. Nowadays, we have to deal with RICO cases, forensic scientist, blood-spatter analysis, DNA, digital discovery, body cams, cellphone data, social media data, geofencing, and other techniques that our Attorneys have to deal with. To give you an example on a -- some of the body cam videos that we get, it may be 30 hours long. And somebody has to review that, so that nothing is missed. Next slide, please. Right now, my office has 163 full-time general fund positions. And I'm happy to say right now, I'm at a 100 percent in terms of having those positions filled, the general fund positions. When I came onboard, we were down 33 Attorneys. Right now, we're down zero. We've been able to keep the attrition standard below 10 percent, and we -- we're making good strides. Next slide, please. And there again, 21 when I came, we were 33 Attorneys short. And there is where we stand now. We have zero vacancies. All of our general fund positions are filled. Next slide. Right now, because of the cranking up of the court systems and trials, we're just to the point that we need -- I foresee that we need additional staffing. In my request, I asked for 21 additional positions. And where that number comes from is two years ago, we unfunded and gave up eight positions. And we will lose 17 ORCA Attorneys next year. So that's 25 Attorneys that we stand to lose in September. I'm asking for 21 Attorneys and the support that goes along -- the support staff that goes along with handling or bringing on 21 new Attorneys as well as equipment and supplies for those staff members. Next slide, please. And this is probably the slide that will interest you all the most. We've calculated that to do what I'm asking, it would cost roughly \$5.1 million. And when you consider the role that we serve that we -- we're trying to keep families together. We're protecting folks' rights. We're seeing that the people we represent get the wraparound services that they need. I consider \$5.1 million to be a small slither, especially when you compare it to the almost \$2 billion that's going to go into a jail. Next slide, please. Bringing on additional Attorneys will all me to bring on Attorneys that have specialized skills. In other words, like the District Attorney's Office has divisions that handle sex crimes and youth crimes, it will allow me to recruit Attorneys that can do just the same thing, and allow me to keep proper staffing in general. Next slide, please. With proper staffing, everything works out smoothly. The trials can be conducted in a smooth manner. Every part of a case that we're involved in can flow smoothly. And the biggest impact will be to the community. The people that

we represent will be returned back to the community, they'll be productive, they won't be in jail, they'll have the wraparound services that they need. And our caseload should continue to decrease. Next slide. That's basically all I have. Are there any questions?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "No, I don't have a question. But I do have a comment for you. And you said that you can expect to lose 17 ORCA positions. Well, I would submit to you that you aren't losing any. It was crystal clear that all of those ORCA positions would sunset, period, go away. So you're not losing anything. Commissioner Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yeah. It's 5:08. We had a staff sit up to 1:30 in the morning, prepare a budget document, where we were going to have a meaningful discussion on it. We ain't had a lick of discussion on it."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Zero."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Mr. Public Defender, do you feel like your ask are more important than the ask of Emergency Services, E-911?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "I do."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "You do?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "I do."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Do you think they would say that their ask is more important than yours?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "I don't know what --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "You think they probably would, right?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "I think they probably would, but I --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Do you think your ask is more important than the people that came down here and talked about ARCH money?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "I do."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay. Do you think your ask are more important than the ask from the Tax Assessor?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "I do."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Board of Health?"

## MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "It depends on what section --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay. But my point is, they probably do as well. And they're going to come down here and make the same kind of presentation. And what we do by this is we make a mockery of our budget process. All right, now, that's not your fault that you necessarily came down here, right? But this is the kind of thing that this screws -- this just makes our whole budget process every year, a mockery. We have our staff. You presented all this stuff to them, right? They've seen this, this is not new to them, correct?"

## MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "That's correct."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Okay. They were charged with weighing out and balancing all those things out, right? They've given a footprint of money to work from at our direction, our direction. They've put together. They're making those value decisions on it. We haven't even had the discussion, but yet we've got other people inviting people down here to co-opt the damn discussion to push this item ahead of other stuff. Should we invite all 50 departments to come down here and do the same thing? Do we need to schedule four work sessions to have all of us go through that? And then we going to make a value decision around it? What are we doing? This is a joke. This is a absolute joke. Not your ask, okay. You made your legitimate ask just like other people will come and make legitimate asks. What's a joke is the process. So Mr. Chairman, we've got to have -- we've got to have some sort of a process that we're going to agree to operate under to give respect to our staff to make value decisions around priorities, not position and posit something above something, where they -- other people don't even have a voice. I mean, we've just spent 30 -- 30 minutes, or whatever it was, talking about this ask, when we've not talked about the entirety of whatever this is, \$850 million budget. And we're not going to have a meaningful discussion on it because we've got two people gone, and it's 5:10. People that ask where are our priorities, they got a good question."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, Vice Chair, I happen to agree with everything you said. We do have a process in place. We violate our own process. Not directed at you, sir. I'm surprised that Gammage is not here. I'm sure he's listening, because he'll be here. He takes the lead from everybody else. But that 8.87 generates a fixed amount of money, that's all we have. Unless four people up here are going to change their mind and vote to raise property taxes, and that ain't going to happen, we might have one. The only one that has the guts to say that he'll vote for tax increase every year is Commissioner Arrington, every year, he's the only one. So it's not going to happen. Not intended for you, but you just happened to be here today. You represent all the others that are listening and going to be coming. Money is not here, period. And I'm sick and tired of hearing about those ORCA positions, they're gone, or will be gone. Commissioner Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "We are elected to listen to everyone, period. And in the past, we have had departments and agencies come before us about their budget in this very forum. That is not unheard of. It is a process that we put in place before to address just this exact same thing that everyone has heard, period. That's not a new idea, that's something that actually happened. So Mr. Kenner, you had the right to come here. You had the right to request to come here. And I do not want anyone to make you feel like you did not have the right, okay?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "Thank you, Commissioner."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner -- you finished?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL: "I am."** 

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, we've heard your words. Commissioner Abdur-

Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Yeah, I might as well get on this train as well. You know, it's interesting how we differentiate different departments. Some people come down here, say they want something, they don't get a tongue lashing. So first of all, let me apologize. And I'm not saying that anybody did anything inappropriate. But I think is unfair for you to come here, present, and all those other folks that should have been doing it the right way, did it the way they wanted to do, nobody said anything to. So first of all, on my behalf, I can't speak for anybody else, I apologize that you have to go for that. Now to our listening viewers, this is dysfunctionality 101. Because you got individuals that's talking out of both sides of they neck. They say one thing to the constituents, they say another thing to the department heads. And then the staff gets caught up in the crossfire. So what I will say to you, sir, is we've got to tighten our belt. I know it's been a minute before your department has had anything. Whatever I could do, I will pledge to try to do. But I'm talking to all departments, and I'm talking to all of my colleagues. Either we going to be fair and cut across the board, or we going to listen to everybody, because we can't have it both ways. And what you do for one, you got to do for the everybody. And it's amazing to me that Mr. Kenner is here getting all this heat. You hot, aren't you, brother? Do you need me to give you a fan? You getting all this heat, but other folk came, nobody said anything to them. That's unfair. That's dysfunctionality 101. Either we going to bite the bullet and do what we need to do, which was to raise -- because even the Executive Staff told us what amount we needed to have to do what needed to do. And we told the Executive Staff, I know you said that, but ugh-ugh, I'm not going to raise nothing. I'm not going to do it. And then you come and say, well, Mr. Kenner, come down here. Even though, I said, no, to a increase in the taxes. And so what I'm saying to you, and I'm not fussing at you, you are an unintended consequence of the dysfunctionality. Because either we're going to do right by everybody, or we're going to do wrong by everybody. But I think we do a disservice

to the taxpaying citizens of Fulton County to charge our Executive Staff to go do a job, then when they do the job and come back, we say, ugh-ugh, nah, we -- sit down, be quiet. So what I say to you, sir, I will listen to what you say. Whatever I can do, I will try. But just know, the ask is there, but the ask is from all departments. And we're going to have to cut across the board if we're going to be able to do what we need to do going into 2024. But thank you for coming down here. I apologize that you -- unintended consequences of 5:00 o'clock."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Vice Chair Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah, and apologize too for you. And part of that, I was just trying to frame up, you know, of other people are going to be down here, and they're saying similar things. And we're in this position. And it's not your problem. The problem was, Commissioner Hall, this is an appropriate to bring forth. That's the problem. Because we do have a process, and you've not respected it, plain and simple. We do not -- that is not our process to invite ten different departments to come down here and do many presentations about their budgetary ask. That's not the process. And you violate it, it's not been the process. We had a clear process, we adopted it. And each time you've obfuscated and violated it, plain and simple. And you're the one that should be getting heat, not Mr. Kenner."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes, ma'am, you have the floor."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Thank you very much. That's your opinion. If anyone requests to be added to the agenda for a discussion, that's part of the process too, Vice Chair. So Mr. Kenner requested to present, and he asked me to put it on the agenda, and I did. And it was because of the ABA standard that is new that has not been presented to us. So he wanted to make sure that we knew and understood about this new ABA standard. And that's the bottom line. Everything else he wants to present, that's up to him."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Madam Clerk, anything else before the budget?"

MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER: "Thank you, Commissioner."

**CLERK GRIER:** "That is all except for Commissioner Arrington's item, if you want to hold that until next --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yeah, that's a -- that's just a report from the Recreation Authority. We can hold that. Mr. Manager, it's 5:18, we've lost two members, and one in particular needs to hear what y'all have to say about this budget. And others that are here need to hear it, because it's going to be one thing to sit here and, oh, I'm for this, I'm for this, you know, oh, poor people, poor children. But when it comes time to vote for the tax increase, you go to the bathroom. I'd recommend, Mr. Manager, we don't take it

up today. We take it up at the next meeting, and start with this. If we got to clear the agenda, everything else, because I want to make it crystal clear, not to department heads, but to the seven of us, what there -- what supporting these projects is going to be from a budgetary point of view, and from a millage rate point of view. And somebody is going to bring forth -- in fact, I think I'll make the motion to raise the millage rate, and see what the votes are. It'll be mine and Arrington's that will vote for it. I'm going to make it 15 mils. Arrington and I will vote for it. I can tell you who's not going to vote for it, but will want every program under the sun. Anything else today? Is that okay, Mr. Manager, can we --"

**DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Yes, sir. I think that would work much better."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "I appreciate y'all staying here last night late, well, actually working on it --"

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Yeah, Chairman, let's thank them, because they stayed here late."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "The reason I know, because they were -- some of them was here when I left at midnight. Thank you. Anything else to come before -- what? Anything else?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Mr. Kenner, thank you."

**MAURICE KENNER, PUBLIC DEFENDER:** "Oh, you're welcome. I was waiting for the Chairman to make that motion, so I could second it too."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Exactly."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "No other matters to come before us today, we're adjourned. And I want to get some work on this budget, because we're going to leave enough time for the budget at the next meeting."

**CLERK GRIER: "Understood."** 

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:21 p.m.