

# FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

## RECESS MEETING

December 20, 2023

10:00 AM



Fulton County Government Center  
Assembly Hall  
141 Pryor Street SW  
Atlanta, Georgia 30303



---

## MINUTES-RATIFIED

---

**This document has been ratified or approved by the Board of Commissioners, and is not binding on the County or any officer.**

**Ratification Date: February 7, 2024**

---

**CALL TO ORDER:** Chairman Robert L. Pitts

**10:03 a.m.**

**ROLL CALL:** Tonya R. Grier, Clerk to the Commission

Robert L. Pitts, Chairman (At-Large)

**PRESENT**

Bridget Thorne, Commissioner (District 1)

**PRESENT**

Bob Ellis, Vice-Chairman (District 2)

**PRESENT**

Dana Barrett, Commissioner (District 3)

**PRESENT**

Natalie Hall, Commissioner (District 4)

**PRESENT**

Marvin S. Arrington, Jr., Commissioner (District 5)

**PRESENT**

Khadijah Abdur-Rahman, Commissioner (District 6)

**PRESENT**

**INVOCATION:** Reverend Clifton Dawkins, Jr., County Chaplain

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** Recite in unison

## ANNOUNCEMENTS

PLEASE SWITCH ALL ELECTRONIC DEVICES (CELL PHONES, PAGERS, PDAs, ETC.) TO THE SILENT POSITION DURING THIS MEETING TO AVOID INTERRUPTIONS.

IF YOU NEED REASONABLE MODIFICATIONS DUE TO A DISABILITY, INCLUDING COMMUNICATIONS IN AN ALTERNATE FORMAT PLEASE CONTACT THE OFFICE OF THE CLERK TO THE COMMISSION. FOR TDD/TTY OR GEORGIA RELAY SERVICE ACCESS DIAL 711.

**CONSENT AGENDA****23-0917 Board of Commissioners**

Adoption of the Consent Agenda - All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Recess Meeting Agenda for separate consideration. **(ADOPTED AS AMENDED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to adopt the Consent Agenda as amended by removing item #23-0927 for separate consideration as requested by Vice-Chairman Ellis and Commissioner Thorne. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Ellis

**Did Not Vote:** Barrett, and Arrington

**23-0918 Board of Commissioners**

Proclamations for Spreading on the Minutes. **(SPREAD ON THE MINUTES UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Proclamation recognizing "Bernice Johnson Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 2, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "She Leads America Appreciation Day." **(Thorne)**  
December 5, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Ballethnic 30th Anniversary Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 8, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "21 Savage Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 8, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Ambassador Andrew Young Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 8, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Alvin R. Dollar Remembrance Day."  
**(Abdur-Rahman/Hall/BOC)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Mary Martin Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Greg Pridgeon, Sr. Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Roderick Edmond Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Renee Knorr Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Sharon Ringo Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Devyne Stephens Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Glenn Lundy Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Kevin Willis Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Dr. Janie Lacy Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Gilbert Young Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Marie Diamond Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Sarah Blakely Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Queen Naomi Achu Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "King Honorable Majesty King Muja'Dib Jamel  
El'Oser-Sori Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 9, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "High Praise Deliverance Ministries Appreciation Day."  
**(Pitts)**  
December 10, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Gurwant Ohbi Appreciation Day." **(BOC)**  
December 14, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Bobby Leo Olive, Sr. Remembrance Day." **(Arrington)**  
December 15, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Eagle Scout Jack Maloney Appreciation Day." **(Thorne)**  
December 16, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Eagle Scout Saketh Podduturi Appreciation Day."  
**(Thorne)**  
December 16, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Kendall Minter Remembrance Day." **(Arrington)**  
December 16, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Randy and Irma Bell Appreciation Day." **(Arrington)**  
December 19, 2023

Proclamation recognizing "Mr. Everything Café Appreciation Day." **(Hall)**  
December 20, 2023

#### **Commissioners' District Board Appointments**

**23-0919** **Board of Commissioners**  
**ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING OFFICERS (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF**  
**THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Term = 2 Years

Two-year terms pursuant to Section 34-67(a) of the Fulton County Civil Service Act.

**Commissioner Thorne nominated Alex Kaufmann for a District appointment to a two-year term.**

**23-0920** **Board of Commissioners**  
**ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING OFFICERS (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF**  
**THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Term = 2 Years

Two-year terms pursuant to Section 34-67(a) of the Fulton County Civil Service Act.

**Commissioner Thorne nominated Kurt Hilbert for a District appointment to a two-year term.**

**23-0921 Board of Commissioners**  
**FULTON COUNTY REPARATIONS TASK FORCE (APPROVED UPON**  
**ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

The Reparations Task Force shall have the following members: Each Commissioner shall appoint two (2) members, for a total of 14 members. Each member shall be a resident of Fulton County at the time of the appointment. A member shall serve for a two-year term and subject to removal by the appointing Commissioner for cause. No member's term shall exceed that of the appointing Commissioner but shall remain as a voting member until replaced or reappointed by the successive Commissioner.

Term = 2 Years

Term below expires: 12/31/2023  
Carole Sykes (**Pitts**)

**Chairman Pitts nominated Carole Skyes for a District reappointment to a term ending December 31, 2025.**

**Open & Responsible Government**

**23-0922 Information Technology**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Information Technology, 21ITB0929B-EC, W-2, 1099, and Affordable Care Act Filing, Processing, Printing, and Mailing Services, in an amount not to exceed \$40,000.00 with National Payment Corporation (Tampa, FL) to provide a system to process, print, fold, and mail W-2 forms, 1099-Misc forms, 1099-R forms and Affordable Care Act (ACA) forms for employees, poll workers, retirees and vendors of Fulton County. This action exercises the second of three renewal options. One renewal option remains. If approved, this contract will be effective January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0923 Finance**

No action is requested. This reporting is being provided to meet the quarterly reporting requirement for monetary transfers amount budget funds per Board Resolution #09-1262. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0924 Finance**

Ratification of November 2023 Grants Activity Report. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

---

**Arts and Libraries****23-0925 Library**

Request approval of a Resolution of the Board of Commissioners to accept a grant, donation, or gift from the Atlanta Fulton Library Foundation (Foundation) in an amount not to exceed \$13,140.00 for the license fees and up to twelve participant scholarships for attendance of the Smart Horizons Career Online High School (SHCOE), and to approve the agreement between Fulton County on behalf of its Library System, the Foundation, and SHCOE, as it may be amended by the County Attorney as to legal form, for Library patrons to attend an online high school from which students receive both career-based online high school diplomas and a workforce certificate. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**Health and Human Services****23-0926 Senior Services**

Request the spreading on the minutes of (1) the County Manager's renewal, for a five (5) year period pursuant to Resolution 18-0325, of a Memorandum of Understanding with Friends of the Dorothy C. Benson Senior Multipurpose Complex, Inc. and (2) the County Manager's renewal, for a five (5) year period pursuant to Resolution 18-0325, of a Memorandum of Understanding with Friends of Bowden, Inc., non-profit organizations which support multipurpose and adult day programming through fundraising efforts; and authorize the County Attorney to approve the renewal agreement as to form and make necessary modifications thereto prior to execution. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0927 Community Development**

Request approval to amend the award of \$250,000.00 in the FY2023 Budget to Atlanta Public Schools (APS) to transfer said award to the APS foundation, Atlanta Partners for Education (APFE). Effective upon BOC approval. **(MOTION TO APPROVE FAILED)**

**ITEM REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA FOR SEPARATE CONSIDERATION AS REQUESTED BY VICE-CHAIRMAN ELLIS AND COMMISSIONER THORNE**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion failed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Nay:** Pitts, and Ellis

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0928 Community Development**

Request approval to amend the contract between Fulton County and Wellspring Living in the amount of \$500,000.00 in American Rescue Plan (ARPA) funds for construction purposes. The original effective dates of the contract were May 17, 2023 through December 31, 2023. This amendment will extend the contract term until December 31, 2024. This Agenda Item is 100% grant funded and funds will be disbursed during construction. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0929 Community Development**

Request approval to amend the Community Development Block Grant CV-3 contract with the City of South Fulton (\$330,000.00) to extend the contract end date from December 31, 2023, to December 31, 2024, and increase the amount of rent, mortgage, and utility assistance to allow program participants to receive a maximum of six months of assistance per household. The County Attorney is authorized to approve the contracts as to form and make changes thereto prior to execution. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0930 Community Development**

Request approval to amend the Community Development Block Grant CV-3 contract with the City of College Park to extend the contract end date from December 31, 2023 to December 31, 2024 to allow the city additional time to provide citizens in need with rent, mortgage and/or utility assistance. No additional funds are requested. The existing funding level for the contract will not change as a result of this amendment. The County Attorney is authorized to approve the contract amendment as to form and make changes thereto prior to execution. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0931 Community Development**

Request approval to amend the Community Development Block Grant CV-3 contract with the City of East Point (\$626,427.50) to (a) extend the contract end date from December 31, 2023 to December 31, 2024; and (b) to provide additional funds in the amount of \$43,630.60. The County Attorney is authorized to approve the contract amendment as to form and make changes thereto prior to execution. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**Infrastructure and Economic Development****23-0932 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of an Indemnification, Maintenance, and Land Use Agreement for Private Improvement (Indemnification Agreement) between Fulton County, Georgia and D.R. Horton, Inc. for the purpose granting conditional approval to allow stormwater infrastructure to remain within a portion the County's existing sanitary sewer easement at 0 Butner Road, South Fulton, Georgia 30213. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0933 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of an Indemnification, Maintenance, and Land Use Agreement for Private Improvement (Indemnification Agreement) between Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, and Liberty Communities, LLC for the purpose granting conditional approval to allow stormwater infrastructure to remain within a portion the County's existing sanitary sewer easement at 0 Jones Road, South Fulton, Georgia 30213. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0934 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of a Water Line Easement Dedication of 1,066,085 square feet to Fulton County, a political subdivision of the State of Georgia, from JBGL Atlanta Development 2014, LLC for the purpose of constructing the Wards Crossing Phase 2 Project at 5435 State Bridge Road, Johns Creek, Georgia 30022. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0935 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of a Sewer Easement Dedication of 1,066,085 square feet to Fulton County, Georgia from JBGL Atlanta Development 2014, LLC, for the purpose of constructing the Wards Crossing Phase 2 Project at 5435 State Bridge Road, Johns Creek, Georgia 30022. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0936 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of a Water Line Easement Dedication of 1,066,085 square feet to Fulton County, Georgia from JBGL Atlanta Development 2014, LLC, for the purpose of constructing the Wards Crossing Phase 1 Project at 5435 Jones Bridge Road, Johns Creek, Georgia 30022. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**23-0937 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of a Sewer Easement Dedication of 1,066,085 square feet to Fulton County, Georgia from JBGL Atlanta Development 2014, LLC, for the purpose of constructing the Wards Crossing Phase 1 Project at 5435 State Bridge Road, Johns Creek, Georgia 30022. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

**Justice and Safety****23-0938 District Attorney**

Request approval of a Sub-recipient Grant Contract between the Georgia Coalition Against Domestic Violence (GCDV), BJA FY 2022 Upholding the Rule of Law and Preventing Wrongful Convictions Program, U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Office for Victims of Crime, Grant No. 15PBJA-22-GG-03909-WRNG grant and Fulton County, Office of District Attorney, Conviction Integrity Unit (CIU) named as a sub-awardee in the Grant in an amount not to exceed \$245,000.00. Effective upon BOC approval through the term of the Grant. 100% grant funded. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**



---

**RECESS MEETING AGENDA****23-0939 Board of Commissioners**

Adoption of the Recess Meeting Agenda. **(ADOPTED AS AMENDED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Arrington, to adopt the Recess Meeting as amended by moving up items #23-0967 as requested by Vice-Chairman Ellis, #23-0969 as requested by Commissioner Thorne, #23-0964, #23-0965, #23-0966 as requested by Commissioner Arrington; and with a majority vote adding item #23-0971. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Ellis

**23-0940 Clerk to the Commission**

Ratification of Minutes. **(RATIFIED)**

Recess Meeting Minutes, November 15, 2023

Regular Meeting Post Agenda Minutes, December 6, 2023

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to ratify the meeting minutes. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Ellis

**23-0941 Board of Commissioners**

Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. **(PRESENTED)**

Proclamation recognizing "Bhargavi P. Ladekar Appreciation Day." **(Thorne)**

Proclamation recognizing "Braille Education Awareness Day." **(Barrett)**

Proclamation recognizing "Southern Snow Seekers Ski Club Appreciation Day." **(Hall/Abdur-Rahman)**

Proclamation recognizing "Mojo Appreciation Day." **(Arrington)**

Proclamation recognizing "Fred Cool Breeze Bell Appreciation Day." **(Arrington)**

\*Proclamation recognizing "Organized Noize Appreciation Day." **(Arrington)**

\*Proclamation recognizing "Jermaine Dupri Appreciation Day." **(Arrington)**

\*Proclamation recognizing "Dallas Austin Appreciation Day." **(Arrington)**

Proclamation recognizing "JaMahr Backbone Williams Appreciation Day." **(Arrington)**

Proclamation recognizing “Codaweb Accessibility Appreciation Day.”  
**(Abdur-Rahman/BOC)**

*\*not presented/recipients not in attendance*

**PUBLIC HEARINGS****23-0942 Board of Commissioners**

Public Comment - Citizens are allowed to voice County related opinions, concerns, requests, etc. during the Public Comment portion of the Commission meeting.

**Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, whether such persons are commenting in-person, via emails or via Zoom or other electronic media (i.e., phone call). Non-Fulton County citizens will only be heard after all in-person Fulton County citizens, representatives of business and organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, have been heard and the time allotted for public comment has not expired, except as otherwise provided in this code section. County staff shall verify the residency of each public speaker prior to such person being heard by the board. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. Members of the public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The Public Comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes at the Regular Meeting, nor will this portion exceed thirty minutes at the Recess Meeting.** In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Similarly, written comments (that were timely submitted) not previously read, may be read at the end of the meeting. For more information or to arrange a speaking date, contact the Clerk's Office. **(CONDUCTED)**

**18 Speakers: Judge Cassandra Kirk (Item #23-0967); Ravi Windom (Arts Funding); Lisa Adler (Arts Funding); Pat Snipes (Before Slavery Museum); Timothy Freeman (Arts Funding); David Weiss (Arts Funding); Jennifer Jenkins (Arts Funding); Conrhonda Baker (Arts Funding); Jovan Paige (Arts Funding); Jessyca Holland (Arts Funding); Freddie Ashley (Arts Funding); Karina Teichert (Arts Funding); Christopher Escobar (Arts Funding); Destiny Renee (Arts Funding); L.A. Pink (Item #23-0967); Dwon Hart (Jail Funding/Voting Rights); W. Imara Canady (Arts Funding) and Susan Ross (Arts Funding)**

**2 Zoom Comments: Ben Howard (Senior Housing) and Lucia Frazier (Elections)**

**6 Emailed Comments: Robyn Donaldson (Item #23-0967); Greg Fann (FY 2024 Budget); Donna Timmers (Northside Library); Kimberly King (Item #23-0967); Helen Butler (Item #23-0967) and Sherry B. Williams (Arts Funding)**

**COUNTY MANAGER'S RENEWAL ITEMS****Open & Responsible Government****23-0904 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 21ITB130447C-GS, Janitorial Services for Selected Fulton County Facilities (Groups E, F, G, H & I) in an amount not to exceed \$1,092,157.00 with (A) Chi-Ada Corporation, (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$533,355.00; (B) Quality Cleaning Services, Inc. (Douglasville, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$261,756.00; and (C) American Facility Services, Inc. (Alpharetta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$297,046.00, to provide cleaning services for selected Fulton County facilities for Janitorial Groups E (South Libraries), F (Other Offices North and Other Offices South), G (South Senior Centers), H (Arts Centers), and I (North and South Service Centers). This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**23-0905 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 21ITB131067C-GS, On-Site Door Repair and Overhead Door Preventive and Predictive Maintenance Countywide in an amount not to exceed \$215,000.00 with (A) Overhead Door Company of Atlanta, dba D.H. Pace Company, Inc., (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$170,000.00; and (B) Piedmont Door Automation, dba Piedmont Door Solutions (Dawsonville, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$45,000.00, to provide on-site door repair and preventive and predictive maintenance services on an "as-needed" basis Countywide facilities. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**23-0906 Registration & Elections**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Registration & Elections, 22ITBC031722MH-C, Ballot Printing in an amount not to exceed \$560,000.00 with Tattnell Journal, Inc. dba Tattnell Ballot Solutions (Reidsville, GA), to provide ballot printing services for the 2024 elections: Presidential Preference Primary (PPP), Presidential Primary Election, Presidential Primary Run-off Elections, Presidential General Election and the Presidential General Run-off Election. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**23-0943 Information Technology**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Information Technology, 21ITB1007B-PS, Network Equipment Maintenance & Support, in an amount not to exceed \$3,137,962.45, with Presidio Inc. (New York, NY), to provide provisioning, maintenance and support services of network and physical security equipment countywide. This action exercises the second of two renewals options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**23-0944 Information Technology**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Department of Information Technology, 22ITBC1006B-PS, Fulton PC Refresh Enterprise Workstation in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000.00 with CDW Government (Vernon Hills, IL) to provide enterprise business class desktop personal computers (PCs), laptops, monitors and docking stations, specialty computing devices to include iPads, iMacs, Microsoft Surface Pros and supporting peripherals. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**23-0945 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 21ITB130241C-CG, Standby Plumbing Repair Services in the total not to exceed amount of \$350,000.00 with (A) Liquid Services & Logistic, LLC formerly Talon Property Services, LLC (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$100,000.00; (B) J2 Connect, Inc. dba J Squared Plumbing Co., Inc. (McDonough, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$125,000.00; and (C) B & W Mechanical Contractors, Inc. (Lawrenceville, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$125,000.00, to provide on-site standby plumbing repair services on an "as needed" basis for Fulton County facilities. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

**Arts and Libraries****23-0907 Library**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Fulton County Library System, 22ITBC134505K-DB, Shelf Ready Book and Best Selling in an amount not to exceed \$1,000,000.00 with Brodart Co. (Williamsport, PA) to provide popular shelf ready books. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024.

**(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

---

**Health and Human Services****23-0946 Behavioral Health and Developmental Disabilities**

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Department of Behavioral Health and Developmental Disabilities, 22RFP038A-CJC, Fulton County Behavioral Health Network in the total amount not to exceed \$13,363,410.93 with (A) River Edge Behavioral Health Community Service Board (Macon, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$4,208,688.44, to provide Minority AIDS Initiative (MAI), Core Adult Outpatient - Center for Health & Rehabilitation, Permanent Supportive Housing (PSH), DUI - North Fulton Service Center, Center for Health & Rehabilitation & South Fulton Service Center, Misdemeanor Mental Health Court (MMC); (B) Chris 180, Inc. (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$3,587,901.00, to provide School Based Mental Health - 38 Fulton Schools, Text 4 Help, Core Child & Adolescent Outpatient - Adamsville & North Fulton, Clubhouse for Youth, Re-Entry - Fulton County Jail; (C) The Summit Counseling Center, Inc. (Johns Creek, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$924,054.53, to provide School Based Mental Health - 28 Fulton Schools; (D) Grady Memorial Hospital d/b/a Grady Health System (Grady) (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$2,969,430.00, to provide Core Adult Outpatient - North Fulton Service Center & South Fulton Service Center, Re-Entry (Women on the Rise), SRU - Fulton County Jail; (E) Health Connect America (HCA) d/b/a Georgia Hope (Woodstock, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$800,000.00, to provide Core Child & Adolescent Outpatient - Oak Hill; and (F) Step Up on Second Street, Inc. (Decatur, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$873,336.96, to provide Permanent Supportive Housing (124 units). This action exercises the first of nine renewal options. Eight renewal options remain. Effective Dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington



**23-0908 Senior Services**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Senior Services, 21RFP000016A-CJC, Alternative Senior Transportation Services in the amount of \$3,134,178.00 with Common Courtesy (Atlanta, GA) to provide transportation services/ride sharing to eligible Fulton County residents aged 60 and above. This action exercises the second of four renewal options. Two renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED AS AMENDED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve as amended to include means testing and no cap on monthly ridership. The motion passed by the following vote:

Vice-Chairman Ellis offered a friendly amendment to adopt staff recommendation of means testing and a cap on monthly ridership.

Commissioner Hall did not accept the friendly amendment.

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

**23-0909 Senior Services**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Senior Services, 21RFP000027A-CJC, Senior Transportation Services in the amount of \$6,780,913.83 with Transdev, Incorporated (East Point, GA) to provide transportation services for Senior Services and Behavioral Health programs. This action exercises the second of four renewal options. Two renewal options remain. Effective January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

**23-0910 Senior Services**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Senior Services, 23RFP137326A-CJC Food Services Management in the amount of ~~\$1,059,840.00~~ \$1,049,303.76 with Piccadilly Holdings, LLC (Baton Rouge, LA) to provide food service management and purchasing of perishable and non-perishable food items for the four senior multipurpose facilities and three training centers. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**23-0911 Senior Services**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Senior Services, 22RFP035A-CJC, Aging Services in an amount not to exceed \$4,363,792.43 with (A) Senior Services North, Inc. (Alpharetta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$1,779,844.50; (B) South Fulton Senior Services (College Park, GA) an amount not to exceed \$1,469,171.63; and (C) Visiting Nurses Health Systems (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$1,114,776.30 to provide Aging Services for Fulton County seniors aged 60 and above. This action exercises the first of four renewal options. Three renewal options remain. Effective date January 1, 2024, thru December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**23-0912 Senior Services**

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Department of Senior Services, 21RFQ000007A-CJC, Senior In-Home Services in a total amount not to exceed \$1,030,166.32 with (A) Southern Homecare Services dba Always Caring Home Care (Roswell, GA) in amount not to exceed \$540,642.91; (B) Help At Home LLC (Newnan, GA) in amount not to exceed \$115,990.92; (C) At Home Atlanta, LLC (Roswell, GA) in amount not to exceed \$216,288.76; (D) Trusted Hands Senior Care (Stone Mountain, GA) in amount not to exceed \$157,243.73, to provide In-Home Services to eligible Fulton County seniors aged 60 and above. This action exercises the third of four renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective date January 1, 2024, thru December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**23-0947 Public Works**

Request approval to renew an existing contract - Public Works, 23ITB139005A-JWT, Standby Utility Pavement Patching & Paving Services in an amount not to exceed \$300,000.00 with the K&E Group USA LLC (Atlanta, GA) to provide standby utility pavement patching and paving services. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

---

**Justice and Safety****23-0913 Sheriff**

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Sheriff's Office, 21ITB1122B-EC, Prisoner Transportation Services in an amount not to exceed \$554,730.00 with U.S. Corrections, LLC (Whites Creek, TN) to provide national prisoner transportation services. This action exercises the second of two renewal options. No renewal options remain. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23)(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve items #23-0904, #23-0905, #23-0906; #23-0907, #23-0910, #23-0911, #23-0912, #23-0913, #23-0943, #23-0944, #23-0945, #23-0946 and #23-0947. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

**COUNTY MANAGER'S ITEMS****Open & Responsible Government****23-0948 County Manager**

Presentation of the Fulton County Operational Report. **(PRESENTED)**

**23-0949 Finance**

Discussion: FY2024 Proposed Budget **(DISCUSSED)**

**23-0950 Finance**

Request approval of the FY2024 Water and Sewer Budget. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0894**    **Registration & Elections**

Request approval of a statewide contract - Registration and Elections, SWC# 99999-001-SPD0000136, Temporary Staffing Services - Clerical & Light in the total amount not to exceed \$12,831,466.31 with (A) Abacus Corporation (Morrow, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$5,190,476.43; and (B) Dover Staffing, Inc. (Smyrna, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$7,640,989.88, to provide temporary staffing services for the Presidential Preference Primary (PPP), Presidential Primary Election and the Presidential Primary Run-off Elections. Effective January 1, 2024, through June 30, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:**                                Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, and Hall

**Absent:**                            Arrington

**Abstain:**                        Thorne

**Did Not Vote:**                Abdur-Rahman

**23-0895**    **Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of a statewide contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, SWC99999-001-SPD0000154-0001, Facility Maintenance Services for the State of Georgia Department of Human Services (DHS) in the amount of \$121,875.00 with CGL Facility Management, LLC (Fayetteville, GA), to provide preventive and corrective maintenance services for the County-owned facility currently leased to the State of Georgia Department of Human Services located at 5710 Stonewall Tell Road, College Park, GA 30349. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through July 14, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:**                                Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:**                            Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0897**    **Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of a statewide contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, SWC#99999-001-SPD0000164-0002, Natural Gas Services Provider for Firm Accounts in the amount of \$700,000.00 with Scana Energy Marketing, LLC (Atlanta, GA), to provide natural gas services to all Fulton County facilities to include the Fulton County Jail Complex. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:**                                Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:**                            Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0896 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of a statewide contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, SWC 99999-001-SPD0000154-0001, Facility Maintenance Solutions in the amount of \$406,771.00 with CGL Facility Management, LLC (Fayetteville, GA) to provide facility maintenance services for the new Fulton County Animal Services Facility located at 1251 Fulton Industrial Boulevard, NW, Atlanta, GA 30318. Effective dates January 1, 2024 through July 14, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0898 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of a statewide contract - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, SWC90816, Motor Vehicle Maintenance & Inventory Management Services, in the amount not to exceed \$755,000.00 with Automotive Rental, Inc. (Mt. Laurel, NJ), to provide repairs and maintenance for specialized heavy equipment and other fleet vehicles for Fulton County. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024. **(HELD 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0951 Information Technology**

Request approval of a statewide contract - Information Technology, SWC98000-MNS1-0000001102 GTA, Telecommunication Services, in an amount not to exceed \$3,250,000.00 with AT&T Corporation, (Atlanta, GA) to provide telecommunication services and products countywide. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through June 30, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0952 Information Technology**

Request approval to utilize cooperative purchasing - Information Technology, City of Atlanta, SP-S/DAIM/2210-1230127, On-Call IT Services, in an amount not to exceed \$750,000.00 with uWork.com, Inc. d/b/a Covendis Technologies, Inc., (Atlanta, GA) to provide support for IT services and operation. Effective January 1, 2024, through August 11, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**Did Not Vote:** Hall

**23-0953 External Affairs**

Request approval of a recommended proposal - External Affairs, 23RFP139170A-CJC, Communication and Engagement Services with AVA Top Right, LLC (Atlanta, GA), in an amount not to exceed \$407,875.00 to provide communication and engagement support services effective January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with three renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts

**23-0899 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 23ITB138287C-JNJ, Asphalt/Concrete Pavement Maintenance and Repair Services in an amount not to exceed \$200,000.00 with Complete Contracting Partners, LLC, (Austell, GA) to provide asphalt/concrete pavement maintenance and repair services on an "as needed" basis for Fulton County. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with two renewal options. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0954 Real Estate and Asset Management**

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, 23ITB138872C-JNJ, Towing and Wrecker Services for County Fleet in an amount not to exceed \$60,000.00, with CSS Transportation LLC (Smyrna, GA), to provide towing and wrecker services for the County fleet. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with two renewal options.

**(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**Health and Human Services****23-0900 Public Works**

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 23ITB08232023A-JWT, Emergency Sewage Cleanup Services in the amount of \$101,349.40 with Above All Cleaning & Restoration, LLC (Tucker, GA), to provide emergency sewage cleanup services. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with two renewal options. **(HELD 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0955 Public Works**

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 23ITB08142023A-JWT, Large Water Meter Installation, in an amount not to exceed \$500,000.00, with Jewel of the South (Conyers, GA), to provide large water meter installation services. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington



**23-0956 Public Works**

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department Public Works, 23ITBC100523A-KM, Water Meters in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000.00 with Delta Municipal Supply Company (Braselton, GA) to provide water meters. Effective January 1, 2024, through December 31, 2024, with two renewal options.

**(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0957 Community Development**

Request approval of a contract between Fulton County and Atlanta Partners for Education in the amount of \$250,000.00 to support three critical priorities supporting efforts around Atlanta Public School's 150th anniversary-whole child intervention, college and career readiness, and signature district-wide events. Funds are essential for continuing work during this milestone year and will allow Atlanta Public Schools to scale beyond 2023. The term of this Contract shall be upon BOC approval through December 31, 2023. **(MOTION TO APPROVE FAILED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion failed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Nay:** Pitts, and Ellis

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0958 Public Works**

Request approval to adopt the Model Adoption Resolution and the local amendment to the Georgia State Minimum Standard Plumbing Code for water efficiency pursuant to O.C.G.A. § 8-2-25(c)(1). **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts

**23-0959 Senior Services**

Request approval of a statewide contract - Department of Senior Services, SWC99999-SPD0000136-003A, Temporary Staffing Services in an amount not to exceed \$116,270.06 with New World Employment (Tucker, GA), to provide staffing services to support the operation of the Department of Senior Services facilities. Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through June 30, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**23-0960 Senior Services**

Request approval to amend and renew a memorandum of understanding with Friends of the Harriett G. Darnell Senior Multipurpose Facility, Inc. and Friends of Mills, Inc., non-profit organizations which support multipurpose and adult day programming through fundraising efforts; authorize the Chairman or any other duly authorized official to execute the amended memoranda of understanding; and authorize the County Attorney to approve the amended memoranda as to form and make any necessary modifications thereto prior to execution. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**Justice and Safety****23-0902 County Manager**

Request approval to increase the spending authority - Office of County Manager, Project ORCA Program Support with Ankobia Group, LLC (Atlanta, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$175,000.00 to provide program support services for the County Court Backlog Reduction Plan (Project ORCA) in an effort to address the significant backlog of court cases due to Coronavirus (COVID-19). Effective dates: January 1, 2024, through June 30, 2024. **(HELD ON 12/6/23) (APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts

**23-0961 Sheriff**

Request approval to re-program the use of unspent emergency capital funding in the amount of \$1,362,563.00. This funding is in the Fulton County Sheriff's Office capital fund budget. The FCSO proposes to utilize \$595,032.45 of the funds for Brown & Root Industrial Services (\$585,032.45) and Khafra Engineering Consultants Inc (\$10,000.00) for the Staff Toilet Upgrades at the South Annex Jail. The restrooms at the South Annex Jail meet ADA requirements to moving back in. This leaves a total of \$767,530.55 to be re-programmed. **(MOTION TO APPROVE FAILED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion failed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Nay:** Ellis

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts

**23-0962 Sheriff**

Request approval to re-program the use of unspent capital funding in the amount of \$1,362,563.00. This funding is in the Fulton County Sheriff's Office capital fund budget. The FCSO proposes to utilize \$718,371.83 of the funds to Johnson Controls, Inc for the required Surveillance Enhancements at the South Annex Jail. This leaves a total of \$49,158.72 to be re-programmed. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**Did Not Vote:** Ellis

**23-0963 Superior Court Administration**

Request approval to increase the spending authority - Superior Court Administration, 18RFP090618A-CJC, Jury Management System in an amount not to exceed \$151,000.00 with Catalis Courts and Land Records (ICON), for increased printing and mailing of juror summons due to the volume of high-profile and RICO trials. This increase will be used to close out the current contract. Effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

---

**COMMISSIONERS' ACTION ITEMS****23-0964 Board of Commissioners**

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners directing an external review of the Board of Ethics; and for other purposes.

**(Arrington) (MOTION TO APPROVE FAILED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion failed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Hall, and Arrington

**Nay:** Thorne, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Pitts, and Ellis

**23-0965 Board of Commissioners**

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners to revoke every action taken by the Fulton County Board of Ethics from January 1, 2014, through December 20, 2023; and for other purposes. **(Arrington) (HELD)**

**ITEM HELD AS REQUESTED BY COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON****23-0966 Board of Commissioners**

Request approval of an Ordinance to amend Chapter 2 (Administration), Article II (Officers and Employees), Division 2 (Code of Ethics) of the Fulton County Code to disband the Board of Ethics and to replace it with a slate of Ethics Hearing Officers; and for other purposes. **(Arrington) (MOTION TO APPROVE FAILED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion failed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Hall, and Arrington

**Nay:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

**23-0915 Board of Commissioners**

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners to dissolve the Housing Authority of Fulton County; and for other purposes.

**(Arrington) (HELD ON 12/6/23) (HELD)**

**23-0967 Board of Commissioners**

Request approval of a Resolution to redirect funds from the budget of the Magistrate Court to the Superior Court; to seek expedited legislation to expand the role of Judicial Officers in providing support to the Fulton County Superior Court; to seek expedited legislation to provide that the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County be appointed rather than elected; and for other purposes. **(Barrett/Ellis)**

Commissioner Arrington requested division of the separate issues in the item.

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Chairman Pitts, to call the question. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Hall, and Arrington

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve redirecting funds from the budget of Magistrate Court to the Superior Court. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, and Barrett

**Nay:** Hall, and Arrington

**Abstain:** Abdur-Rahman

c. A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve seeking expedited legislation to expand the role of Judicial Officers in providing support to the Fulton County Superior Court. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

**Nay:** Hall, and Arrington

d. A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve seeking expedited legislation to provide that the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County be appointed rather than elected. **(NO VOTE TAKEN)**

e. A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to hold seeking expedited legislation to provide that the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County be appointed rather than elected. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Hall, and Arrington

**Commissioners' Full Board Appointments****23-0968 Board of Commissioners  
BOARD OF ETHICS (APPROVED)**

Each member selected after the initial terms of office have expired shall serve a term of three (3) years or until the termination of his or her membership in the organization from which he or she was selected. The chair shall serve as chair for the remainder of the calendar year and until a successor is chosen. (See Fulton County Code of Laws, Section 2-80).

Term = 3 years

Term below expired: 2/12/2023

**Daraka Satcher (Gate City Bar Association)**

**The Gate City Bar Association recommended Daraka Satcher for a Full Board reappointment to a term ending February 12, 2026.**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**COMMISSIONERS' PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION ITEMS****23-0836 Board of Commissioners**  
Discussion: Update of activities of the City of Atlanta and Fulton County Recreation Authority (AFCRA). **(Arrington) (HELD ON 11/15/23 AND 12/6/23) (HELD)****23-0969 Board of Commissioners**  
Discussion: Election Update **(Thorne) (DISCUSSED)**

**EXECUTIVE SESSION****23-0970 Board of Commissioners**

Executive (**CLOSED**) Sessions regarding litigation (**County Attorney**), real estate (**County Manager**), and personnel (**Pitts**).

**PRESENT IN THE EXECUTIVE SESSION REGARDING LITIGATION, REAL ESTATE AND PERSONNEL: Chairman Pitts, Vice-Chairman Ellis, Commissioners: Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman; County Manager Dick Anderson; County Attorney Y. Soo Jo; and Clerk to the Commission Tonya R. Grier.**

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to enter into Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Barrett, and Hall

**Did Not Vote:** Ellis, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve the requests for representation in items #1 and #2 as discussed in Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Arrington

c. A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve a second extension of the Lease Agreement with the City of South Fulton for use of the Wolf Creek Amphitheater from January 1, 2024 through December 31, 2024, under the same terms as the current agreement. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

**Did Not Vote:** Ellis

**ADDED TO THE MEETING****Items Added to the Agenda****23-0971 Arts and Culture**

Request approval of a contract between Fulton County and Neranenah 2023 Operational Support Funds in the amount of \$15,600.00 Fulton County Department of Arts and Culture - Contracts for Services to provide a non-profit cultural event series with roots in Jewish culture and musical traditions. Neranenah entertains and connects diverse audiences through the exploration of Jewish contributions to music and the performing arts, celebrating its intersections with other cultures and communities. Neranenah means to come together and sing. The contract period may vary. **(APPROVED)**

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve adding item #23-0971 to the Recess Meeting Agenda. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Ellis

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve item #23-0971. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Yea:** Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

**Absent:** Thorne, and Arrington

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:15 p.m.



FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONER'S  
RECESS MEETING  
DECEMBER 20, 2023  
10:00 A.M.

Alexander Solution, LLC  
*"A Court Reporting Firm"*

(Whereupon, the meeting was called to order at 10:03 a.m.)

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Good morning, everyone. And welcome to the meeting of the Fulton County Board of Commissioners. Today is December 20th, 2023. It 10:03 a.m. Please rise for the evocation followed by the Pledge of Allegiance. I'm sorry, hold it. I got ahead of myself. Let's call the roll. Is this on? Is this on? All right, call the roll, Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Chairman Robb Pitts."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Present."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Commissioner Bridget Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Present."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Vice Chairman Bob Ellis. Commissioner Dana Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Present."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Commissioner Natalie Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Present."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Commissioner Marvin Arrington, Jr."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Present."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Commissioner Khadijah Abdur-Rahman. Mr. Chairman, you have a quorum."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Thank you, ma'am. Now, the invocation, followed by the Pledge of Allegiance."

(Whereupon, the invocation was given by Reverend Clifton Dawkins, Jr. followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.)

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 2, Consent Agenda, **23-0917**, Adoption of the Consent Agenda, all matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission, and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Recess Meeting Agenda for separate consideration. Mr. Chairman and

Members of the Board, we have one item to be removed from consent and added to the -- for separate consideration and added to the Recess Meeting, on page 6, Community Development, request approval to amend the award \$250,000 in the Fiscal Year Budget --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Which item? Which item?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0927, on page 6, 23-0927, Community Development request approval to amend the award of \$250,000 in the Fiscal Year 2023 Budget to APS to transfer award to the APS Foundation, Atlanta Partners for Education. This item was request to be removed by Vice Chairman Ellis and Commissioner Thorne."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Anything else, Commissioners? All right. I'll entertain a motion to approve the Consent Agenda as amended. Motion to approve Consent Agenda as amended by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Natalie Hall. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; for yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 8, Recess Meeting Agenda. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have an item that has been requested to be added to today's Recess Meeting Agenda. **23-0971**, Arts and Culture request approval of the contract in the amount of \$15,600, Contract for Services to provide a nonprofit cultural event series with the roots and Jewish culture and musical traditions."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. What's the emergency?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Mr. Chairman, this is a Contract for Services group that was awarded a contract during the contract in process. However, because they had a name change, we had to get all of that squared away before we could bring the contract forward. The funds expire at the end of December, so we want to bring that forward today so that they can receive the funds they should be awarded."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "But what's the emergency?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "The funds expire, and they would not be able to receive the funds if we don't approve it today."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Can you read the amount again, because what's on the screen says 5,000. I thought you said 15."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Yes, that is \$15,600."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "So is it five or 15?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "It's 15, yes, sir."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "So the emergency, I'm not sure that I understand."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So Mr. Chairman, each year the Department of Arts and Culture runs a competitive process."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yes."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "And we award nonprofits arts funding."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yes."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "This year, this particular organization when they were awarded the funding, they had the name Atlanta Jewish Music Festival. Their name changed, and so we had to change the name first, which we did on December 6th, and then we had to bring the contract back today. Because these are 2023 funds, if we do not award this organization the funds in 2023, they will not receive any of the funding that they were awarded."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. All right. This requires a supermajority vote. Let's vote, please, on whether or not to add this request to the agenda."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "That's -- go ahead."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0939**, Adoption of the Recess Meeting Agenda. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have two items to be moved up, requested to be moved up to today's agenda. First item on page 19, Discussion, Election update, Commissioner Thorne has requested to move this item up to be heard after item 23-0950 on page 14. Second item to be moved up, as requested by Vice Chair Ellis, on page 18, 23-0967, Request approval of a resolution to redirect funds from the budget of the Magistrate Court to the Superior Court to seek expedited legislation to expand the role of judicial officers and providing support to the Fulton County Superior Court to seek expedited legislation to provide that the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County be appointed rather than elected, sponsored by Commissioners Barrett and Ellis. This item has been requested to be moved up to be heard after the Sheriff's item on page 14, 23-0913."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Any other items, Madam Clerk?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "That's all I have."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Commissioners, any other items?"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Yes. I would like 09 --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Which page, Commissioner?"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Page 18, 0964, 0965, and 0966 moved up as well."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Anything else, Commissioners? All right. I'll entertain a motion to approve the regular meeting agenda as amended. Is there a motion? Motion to approve by Commissioner Natalie Hall, seconded by Commissioner Arrington. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0940**, Ratification of Minutes, Recess Meeting Minutes November 15th; Regular Meeting Post-Agenda Minutes, December 6th, 2023."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Natalie Hall, seconded by Commissioner Bridget Thorne. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0941**, Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. The first Proclamation is recognizing Bhargavi P. Ladekar Appreciation Day, sponsored by Commissioner Thorne."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. We have ten -- we have 30 minutes for Proclamations. We have ten, five minutes each, that's about almost an hour by the time people walk down. So if we keep our acceptance speeches to a minimum, I would appreciate it and keep us on schedule. First Proclamation. All right, let's go. All right. Commissioner Thorne, is this your Proclamation?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yes."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Let's go."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "It is. On behalf of the Fulton County Board of Commissioners and the Public Works Department, we held a 2024 Art Calendar Contest. And it was a huge success, as you can see. And these are all the award winners. The Annual Art Contest is a great tool for engaging our youth on water resources stewardship. And this year's theme was cycles of water, highlights the value of water and the importance of protecting our water resources to ensure clean and healthy water supply for years to come. A total of 215 students representing 33 schools from Fulton County submitted artwork for the contest. Twelve of the 22 winners are from District 1. Today, we commend all the students on their contributions in promoting environmental stewardship of our water resources. So it is my pleasure to do a Proclamation for this great art contest that we have. WHEREAS, the Board of Commissioners of Fulton County finds that the protection of the environment is vital to the health welfare and economic process -- progress of Fulton County and its citizens. And WHEREAS, the Department of Public Works seeks to protect the health, safety, and welfare of Fulton County citizens by providing high-quality and cost-efficient services related to the delivery of water, the collection of wastewater, and the conveyance of storm water and by complying with federal, state, and county regulatory requirements. And WHEREAS, Public Works has successfully promoted environmental awareness and consciousness of water resources, water conservation, water quality, and pollution prevention through school presentations, media prevention, through school media campaigns, educational seminars, workshops, festivals, and community outreach programs. And WHEREAS, Public Works sponsored the 2024 Art Calendar Contest, which was open to all students, grades K through 12 attending a public, private charter, or homeschool within Fulton County. Students were asked to create artwork promoting better water quality and water conservation uses and practices. And from the 215 submitted drawings, 22 were selected to be featured in the 2024 Water Art Calendar. And WHEREAS, in recognition of her exemplary artwork, Bhargavi P. Ladekar, an eighth-grade student at Web Bridge Middle School was selected as the grand prize cover recipient of the 2024 Water Art Calendar Contest. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes the environmental contribution of Bhargavi P. Ladekar and her contribution of promoting environmental stewardship of water resources; and does hereby proclaim, Wednesday, December 20, 2023 as Bhargavi P. Ladekar Appreciation Day in Fulton County, Georgia. Congratulations, Bhargavi. Do you want to say anything?"

**BHARGAVI P. LADEKAR, RECIPIENT:** "I just wanted to say thank you to my parents and Fulton County for arranging this contest. Thank you so much."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Thank you. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "10:14."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I do want to present the certificates. So now we're going to present the certificates to the other winners."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "10:19."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "So from District 1, I have Lai Jia -- wait. Congratulations. Oh, and then I have the winner, Bhargavi Ladekar as well. Here you go. And Lai Jia is a third-grader from Lake Windward Elementary School. The February winner was Saanvi Bajaj, a seventh-grader at Web Bridge Middle School. Congratulations. We have a June winner, Michaela Rose, who isn't here, an eighth-grader at Taylor Road Middle School. For September, we had Hope McMichael, 12th-grader from Valor Christian School. But here today, we have the November winner, Minakshi Chilagani, a seventh-grader from River Trail Middle School. Congratulations. We have some honorable mentions here as well. Andre Harlow from -- who is an eighth-grader at Taylor Road Middle School. Congratulations. We have Aaryesh Mishra, a fifth-grader from New Prospect Elementary. You're right down the road from where I live. We have Imaan Rizvi from ILM Academy, an eighth-grader. She had to leave, okay. And then we have Shriyansh Nigam, a fifth-grader from Creek View Elementary School. And then here today, we have Hannah Allen, a fourth-grader also from Creek View Elementary School. And Sofia Yun Yu couldn't be here today. But she's a first-grader from Dolvin Elementary School. So you want me to do -- okay. So from District 2, which is right next door to me, the March winner was Vivian Nguyen, a ninth-grader Fulton Science Academy. The April winner was Mikael Abdulkareem, a fourth-grader at Ison Springs Elementary School. The July winner was Amelia Abdulkareem, a first-grader also from Ison Springs Elementary School. And the August winner, Anamika Prapithu, a third-grader from Woodland Elementary School. In Honorable Mentions, we have Pratyusha Soni, a sixth-grader from FCS Innovation Academy. And that's it."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "And on behalf of the Fulton County Board of Commissioners, we commend all of the students for their exemplary artwork and for their contributions in promoting environmental stewardship of water resources. And at this time, it's my pleasure to present the winner from District 4, Tim Wang."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Good morning, everyone. It is my pleasure this morning to present the winners from District 5, Nia Blount, and Jonah Simmons."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Let me take this time to thank you, parents. These are superstars up here. And we always want to uplift the children. So thank you for your patience. Thank you for allowing this Body to recognize all these superstars. For District 6, I take pleasure, she was a winner last year, she's in the 12th grade this year. Sage Mae Lima-Jeffries, please come forward. This is the last time I'm going to see you. So you know I'm going to cry. Thank you."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Good morning, everyone. I'm very excited to be able to present a Proclamation today for the Blind and Low Vision Community here in Fulton County. And this year, I had the opportunity to work with the Chairman of our Commission on Disability Affairs and my appointee, Derrick Tuff. They are doing



incredible work on a variety of different issues. But in particular, they've done incredible work raising awareness for blind and low vision folks. So I wanted to take this moment to appreciate and recognize them, and in particular, their work around Braille education. So with that, I will read the Proclamation. WHEREAS, Braille is a unique tactile writing system that enables blind and low vision people to read independently. And where Braille enhances literacy skills and effectively demonstrates proper grammar, syntax, and spelling. And WHEREAS, Braille empowers blind and low vision people to maximally participate, contribute, and succeed in academic and professional settings. And WHEREAS, specialized Braille education programs are needed in schools to give blind and low vision students the same opportunities to learn as their sighted peers. And WHEREAS, the Fulton County Commission on Disability Affairs has worked tirelessly to advocate for the statewide implementation of a Braille education program for blind and low vision students. And WHEREAS, the Fulton County Commission on Disability Affairs continues to coordinate with the Georgia Resource and Advocacy Center for Empowerment and the National Federation of the Blind of Georgia in advocating that the state adopt the Blind Person's Braille Literacy Rights in Education Act. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Board of Commissioners of Fulton County recognizes the Fulton County Commission on Disability Affairs for their commitment to the blind and low vision residents of Fulton County, and does hereby proclaim, December 20th, 2023 as Braille Education Awareness Day in Fulton County, Georgia."

**RECIPIENT:** "On behalf of the Commission on Disability Affairs, the Georgia Resource and Advocacy Center for Empowerment, and the National Federation of the Blind, Commissioner Barrett, we thank you for sponsoring this Proclamation, and the Board of Commissioners. We firmly believe that every blind and low vision child deserve access to Braille education. And on January 4th, 2024, we will raise awareness about this critical issue. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER:** "The next Proclamation is recognizing Southern Snow Seekers Ski Club Appreciation Day, sponsored by Commissioners Hall and Abdur-Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Snow Seekers, come on down. Come on. Prepared is always best. Come on, spread out on over to this other side. Let's even it out. Wait, is that for me? Okay. I was about to say, you guys about to push me down the hill. Everyone who's supporting the Snow Seekers, come on down. Okay, that was smart. But all right. Well, you know, it is an honor and a pleasure to present this Proclamation to the visionary thought leaders who thought it a great thing to start this Southern Snow Seekers Ski Club. And being from Chicago, I think I might join this. Yeah, thank you. Thank you. And the Proclamation reads: WHEREAS, the Southern Snow Seekers Ski Club is a 501C 7 nonprofit organization, and one of the largest ski clubs in the south. The Atlanta Chapter of the National Brotherhood of Snow Sports, NBS, was established in 1983 by visionaries to introduce and promote the exhilarating sport of snow skiing to the African-American community. And WHEREAS, the mission of the club is to identify and fund high-caliber youth skiers capable of winning a berth on the US Olympic ski



team, it manages an affiliate youth organization focusing on its youngest members and adults new to the sport. And WHEREAS, the Southern Snow Seekers Ski Club and its members, have overcome racial injustices while breaking the color barriers on the slopes and participating in annual community projects. Dedicated members continue to place competitions, while representing Atlanta and African-American skiers. And WHEREAS, the 1983 founding members are Paul Brown, Terry Brown, Necia Cunningham, Bryon Fresno. Okay, I see some pointing going on, Fresno; Marsha Fresno, Anita Jackson, Roy Jackson, Brenda Long, Edith Mauldin, Reginald Mauldin, and Roberta McGill. And WHEREAS, as the Southern Snow Seekers celebrate 40 years of service, it is well-positioned under the capable leadership of President Michelle Vinson-Kirk to continue its tradition of highly-competitive, well-trained, and well-respected teams. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes the Southern Snow Seekers Ski Club for their vision and dedication to exposing all sports to local youth, and does hereby proclaim, Saturday, December 16th, 2023 as Southern Snow Seekers Ski Club Appreciation Day in Fulton County, Georgia. Congratulations. Y'all better listen. You guys better listen to Ms. Sherry Williams over here. Come on over, Edith."

**EDITH MAULDIN, RECIPIENT:** "Good morning, everyone. I'm Edith Mauldin, and I'd like to thank Commissioner Hall for this honor. Forty years ago, we started a -- our Southern Most Club, which was affiliated with the National Brotherhood of Skiers, which was Afro-American skiers. And our goal was to put an African-American youth on the Olympic ski team. And we're still working toward that. It has been a real challenge for 40 years. But we just appreciate you honoring us, the recognition. Because today, a lot of people didn't know that Black people ski; however, now you do. Thank you."

**RECIPIENT:** "I just want to be able to say thank you, Board of Commissioners and Commissioner Hall. We are making you an honorary member of our Ski Club. We have the commemorative pin that we wanted to present to you, as well as a T-shirt as well. So we'll see you on the slopes."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Thank you so much. And I -- I'm admiring the jacket. That jacket is beautiful. Thank you. So let's take the picture."

**CLERK GRIER:** "The next three Proclamations recognizing Mojo Appreciation Day, Fred Cool Breeze Bell Appreciation Day, and JaMahr Backbone Williams Appreciation day, sponsored by Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Okay, yes. All right. So it is my pleasure to present these next three Proclamations. They, as we continue to honor 50 years of hip-hop, Frederick Calhoun Bell, better known as Cool Breeze. Thank you. Good to see you. The Proclamation reads as follows: WHEREAS, Frederick Calhoun Bell, known by his rap name Cool Breeze, was born on August 12th. And WHEREAS, Fred began his rap career in 1999 with his debut solo album, East Points Greatest Hit under the Interscope Records label. The most critically-acclaimed track, Watch for the Hook,

featured various members of the Dungeon Family and soared to Number 1 on the Billboard Hot Rap Song's Chart. And WHEREAS, Fred's musical contributions and deep love for his craft have been an inspiration to his fellow artists, as evidenced by his work on the 1996 Billboard Hot 100 Single, Dirty South from Goodie Mob's debut album, Soul Food. And WHEREAS, a proud product of Martin Homes in the city of East Point and Fulton County's District 5, Fred is a kind and generous person who brings joy and happiness to his family and to the many friends, neighbors and East Point veterans, who have the greatest pleasure of knowing him. And WHEREAS, Fred has witnessed a dramatic change in the world over the course of his lifetime. And we salute his contribution to its progress by his own hard work and his tireless effort on behalf of his community and extended family and. And NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners, in honor of the 50th anniversary of hip-hop, commends the cultural impact of Fred Cool Breeze Bell and his contributions to the music and entertainment industry, and does hereby proclaim today, Wednesday, December 20th, 2023 as Fred Cool Breeze Bell Appreciation Day in Fulton County, Georgia."

**FRED COOL BREEZE BELL, RECIPIENT:** "Thank y'all very much. First off, I'd like to thank, Marvin Arrington, Jr., the Commissioner and the County of Fulton, the state of Georgia, thank y'all very much. Southern hip-hop is a real big thing in the south, of course it is. And I'd just like to thank the south, because you know, I did coin the phrase. And one thing I do want to say to the South is we're real strong. And we know how to stand up and march when it's the right time. And I witnessed it, you know, I saw us fight, and I saw us do it. And I'm your number 1 witness. I love you. Thank you very much, state of Georgia. Thanks, man."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "If you will, hang around so we can do a big group picture. Next Proclamation is in honor of Mr. JaMahr Backbone Williams. The Proclamation reads as follows: WHEREAS, JaMahr Backbone Williams, also know as Dr. Bartholomew Funk, was born in Atlanta, Georgia and is a member of the internationally-acclaimed Dungeon Family First Generation. And WHEREAS, Backbone earned his name as one of the founding and chief supporters of the Dungeon Family. He can be linked to many of the notable hits behind OutKast, Goodie Mob, and other Dungeon Family artist. WHEREAS, with the release of Concrete Law in June of 2001, Backbone's talent was escorted to the forefront, and introduced the world to his musical genius as a solo artist. His next solo project is titled, Eternal the Flesh, Volume I. And WHEREAS, Backbone's launch of Plateau Entertainment Group gives creatives a platform to express their art under the tutelage of a seasoned veteran. This new and innovative grovement consist of many talented individuals in their regard. And WHEREAS, the objective of this alliance is to embody the energy of good music, art, culture, consciousness, and communal empowerment. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes JaMahr Backbone Williams, in honor of the 50th anniversary of hip-hop, for his many contributions to the music and entertainment industry, and does hereby proclaim,

Wednesday, December 20th, 2023 as JaMahr Backbone Williams Appreciation Day in Fulton County."

**JAMAHR BACKBONE WILLIAMS, RECIPIENT:** "First, giving honor to God, the Almighty, the ancestors, city of Atlanta, the County Fulton, in which I was raised. It's a very special day to even receive this Proclamation to be acknowledged in such a sense. And as Cool Breeze mentioned, because we're from the same coalition of MCs, to be notarized at this point, being over half a century old, is very respectable and very honorable. I am greatly appreciative of this moment, and I don't take it lightly. Thank you all. Praise the Lord."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "All right. And last Proclamation, we got -- we need everybody to stand up for this one. This guy, Mr. Edwin Lyons, Jr., Mojo, the first rapper in Atlanta. Yeah. It's -- we have -- since we're celebrating 50 years of hip-hop, to be able to honor this pioneer is certainly a pleasure. And my mom actually taught him over at Booker T. Washington High School. So, crazy how we have all these connections. The Proclamation reads as follows: WHEREAS, Edwin Lyons, Jr., professionally known as Mojo, grew up in Atlanta's West End, and is a 1982 graduate of Booker T. Washington High School, Waldlin High, for those in Atlanta. And he made his debut as a rapper the same year. And WHEREAS, Mojo's passion for music began when he was six years old and learned to play the drums. And by age 12, he was an accomplished piano player. He went on to play the drums on the Washington High School Marching Band. And WHEREAS, Mojo was inspired by the ground-breaking 1979 Sugar Hill Gang hit, Rapper's Delight, he memorized the lyrics and rapped the song to his fellow classmates at Washington High School, who were all impressed with his performance. And WHEREAS, Mojo took his act to the Old Ashby Theater, and turned it into Mojo's Disco Lounge. His performances drew crowds from every corner of the city. And WHEREAS, Mojo's signature hit song, Let Mojo Handle It, became the first rap song by an Atlanta artists to be played on WAOK Radios live broadcast. When artist like, Run DMC and the Fat Boys performed in Atlanta, Mojo was the first choice to open the show. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners, in honor of the 50th anniversary of hip-hop, recognizes Edwin Mojo Lyons for his pioneering contributions to the music and entertainment industry in Atlanta, Georgia, and does hereby proclaim, Wednesday, December 20th, 2023 as Edward Mojo Lyons Appreciation Day in Fulton County, Georgia."

**EDWIN MOJO LYONS, JR., RECIPIENT:** "Thank you. Thank you, Commissioner Arrington. I tell you, you know, it's been a busy year celebrating the 50 years of hip-hop. And -- and I was doing an interview, I think with the AJC, and they asked me, they say, with all this recognition you're getting, how does it make you feel? And of course, I am honored, and are very flattered. But it seems like I'm being honored for just having a good time. Because that's all we did in 1982. I'd like to thank my good friend Stafford Lightfoot for hanging out with me, Big Pun. And back in, you know, just to paint a small picture for you, the year was 1982. There was nothing going on in the city of Atlanta. We had just -- the child murders had just ceased. We -- the curfew had been lifted,

because we had to be off the streets at 11:00 o'clock back then, they need to do that again, but that's another story for another day. But we had to be off the street, so the curfew had been lifted. So me and like, Lightfoot and all of us, we said, we're going to make Atlanta just as a fun town as New York or any other place. And of course, I came out with my first song, and there was not a lot of party places 1982. Because we didn't go to Buckhead because at that time, Buckhead did not -- did not gear towards people of color. So we was in Midtown at the Sans Souci, Phoenix, Charles Disco, Mr. V.'s Figure 8, Marcos, Ciscos, Campbellton Road, and that was it. And let me remind you that in 1982, the population in Atlanta was 900,800, according to Darlington, across from Piedmont. I'll never forget it. And so we wanted to make Atlanta just as good as New York. All my New York rappers, they had a lot of respect for me down here doing what I was doing. But people from New York did not like me, because they felt that I was -- I was biting on their style. So I had problems with the people from New York. But let the data speak for itself, 1982, 900,800; 2023, 6 million. With that being said, mission accomplished. Thank you, Marvin Arrington. Thank you, Commissioner. Thank you, Fulton County. I love all of you."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And glad to have Young Dro join us as we make this celebration for the 50 years of hip-hop. We're going to have to bring him back, make sure we get one for him as well."

**CLERK GRIER:** "The last Proclamation is recognizing the Codaweb Accessibility Appreciation Day, sponsored by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "I'm sorry, I was letting Mojo handle it. Can I get the Codaweb team? Are they here today? Well, we're going to go ahead and present this since we are -- this is a full Proclamation, Board Proclamation, and this is the last meeting of the year. WHEREAS, Fulton County Government uses web accessibility to ensure that Fulton County communities use web accessibility for people with disabilities to contribute to building and maintaining a healthy community in every aspect of life. WHEREAS, Fulton County through its public agencies and with Cooperative Assistance of Accessibility for Life, Disability Awareness Now, Sense of Equity, and other accessibility advocacy organizations to facilitate the expansion of web accessibility for and greater acceptance of persons with disabilities to have the choice to fully participate in all aspects of life. And WHEREAS, Fulton County law also calls upon employers, both public and private, to be aware of and utilize web accessibility as a means to give the Fulton County citizens the choice to fully participate in Fulton County in every aspect of life. And WHEREAS, every citizen should be aware that the law requires that instructions for using indoor and outdoor paths of travel must be provided to the public by websites that meet the requirement of web accessibility of Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners recognizes that web accessibility is essential for all citizens including those with disabilities for a high quality of life, and does hereby proclaim, Wednesday, December 20th, '23 as Codaweb Accessibility Appreciation Day in Fulton

County, Georgia. And like I said, this is a Full-Board Proclamation, and we thank those associated with the Codaweb Accessibility Day. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Colleagues, it's 10:52. Continue, Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 9, Public Hearings, **23-0942**, Public Comment. Citizens wishing to participate in public comment will be allowed to appear in person or may choose to participate virtually via zoom videoconferencing or by submitting their comments in writing at [www.FultonCountyGA.gov](http://www.FultonCountyGA.gov). Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. The public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The public comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes. In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we'll start with the speakers here in Assembly Hall. We have received 19 speaker cards. Will the first five speakers please come forward: Chief Magistrate Judge Kirk, Ravi Windom, Lisa Adler, Pat Snipes and Timothy Freeman."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Those of you who plan to speak, two things, when you have two minutes remaining -- strike that. When you have 15 seconds, rather, remaining on your two minutes, I will simply say 15 seconds. And that's your key to conclude your remarks. That applies to everyone except elected officials. It is 10:54; we have 30 minutes for public comment. And with, what, 19 or 20, we're obviously going to exceed the 30 minutes."

**CHIEF JUDGE CASSANDRA KIRK, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Mr. Chairman, Members of the Fulton County Board of Commission, my name is Cassandra Kirk. I stand before you, not just as the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County, but as a dedicated guardian of the community's democratic values and judicial integrity. I'm here to voice my opposition to Resolution 23-0967, a measure that transcends policy. It's a reflection of our commitment to the people we have sworn to serve. In 2013/2014, following the comprehensive 2012 Task Force Study, supported by the voters of Fulton County and government transparency groups alike, we embarked on a crucial transformation, transitioning the Chief Magistrate position from an appointed to elected. This change was more than procedural. It was an acknowledgment to our Fulton voters and an affirmation of our collective democratic principles, empowering Fulton citizens and the selection of those overseeing our court system's critical functions. I'm honored to have been elected and reelected by the people of Fulton County, a clear testament to their trust in me and our judicial process. However, the proposal by Commissioners Dana Barrett and Vice Chairman Bob Ellis to revert this democratically elected role to an appointed one, severely undermines the progress Fulton residents have fought for and the public trust within juris -- judiciary. Negating the voice of our citizens and the gains we've achieved, this is a miss -- there's a misleading argument in the resolution



regarding the increased budgets and decreased case disposals since 2019. Let me present the facts. From January 1, 2019 to December 11, 2023, our court -- people have filed over 342,000 cases in our court. Our Judges and staff have closed over 305,000 of those cases. That is an 89-percent closure rate. This efficiency is further highlighted after a recent meeting, particularly on Friday with County Manager Anderson and COO Adams, where our Judges submitted, reviewed, and impressively processed over 2500 case closures from those cases identified as 2015 to 2018. At that meeting, we learned the number was 10,000. As of today, our Judges have completed over 2500 closure rates in less than five days. Furthermore, our court's commitment to justice and efficiently were nation -- were recognized statewide by a statewide case clearance award that we received in 2020 for a 245 percent case closure rate for cases from 2017 to 2019. Our court's evaluation conducted with the support of the National Center for State Courts Civil Justice Improvement Grant assessed the number of cases on court calendars. This study focused, not just on numbers, but on the quality of the process, ensuring parties had an opportunity to be heard. It is based on that measure that we set the number of cases per calendar. I also want to mention that I would never arbitrarily jeopardize court operations by cutting off immediately, the provision of judicial services to Superior Court, as has been relayed. As for the Magistrate Judges you propose to defund, who each serve four-year terms, as the Magistrate Court Counsel of Georgia noted yesterday, under O.C.G.A. 15-10-20, the JQC alone Judicial Qualifications Commission, is the sole authority for disciplining or removing Judges in Georgia. This separation of powers is critical for maintaining judicial integrity. Converting judicial officers to perform these functions requires legislative action. And in the meantime, must -- work must be done by Judges qualified to do that work. I strongly urge you all to urge the Superior Court to return to our posture of completing an MOU as we stood as of yesterday at 1:55 to best serve the Fulton County citizens and those while we wait in the legislative process. The attempt to merge the Magistrate and Superior Court Clerk roles, which are part of this hastily-constructed legislation, is premature, especially given the incomplete audit initiated by these same two Commissioners which began on June 15th, 2023. Such actions lacking thorough assessments are premature and potentially harmful. Justice is not merely a commodity measured by percentage and budgets and case disposal rates. It's a fundamental right we are here to uphold. The proposed changes disrupt the Chief Magistrate Judge independence is a step back from the path of progress and inclusivity that we have chartered for our judiciary. The diversity and qualifications of the Judges I have appointed reflect our commitment to a judiciary that mirrors our community's rich diversity. The impact of our court on the community from Bang the Gavel to our Magistrate 101, to our community town halls and food drives is substantial and multifaceted. While I will not go on to list all of our achievements, rest assured that our actions have significantly benefit the citizens we serve. I urge you, esteemed Members of the Board, to reject this resolution outright. It is hastily, ill-considered proposal that does not serve the best interest of our citizens and lacks a foundation and a comprehensive assessment or an understanding of our court's needs. If outright rejection is not feasible now, I implore you to at least delay this vote for a thorough, unbiased assessment of the Magistrate Court's operations. I ask that we lest base our

decisions on a comprehensive and analysis, not on expedient political maneuvers. In conclusion, I ask that we approaches changes to our judicial system with careful consideration and open dialogue. As elected leaders, we fight for our budgets vigorously, knowing the importance of resources and community impact. But I would prefer to sign over millions to the BOC than to eliminate the collective voice of our citizens, our Fulton voters. We trust them to elect us, and when they don't, we must respect their choice to find leaders who fulfill their expectations. As I close, I'd like to read a statement by the Atlanta NAACP, which was forwarded to me this morning. The Atlanta NAACP strongly opposes the measure to strip the voters' ability to elect the Chief Magistrate Judge. It is undemocratic and works to suppress the will of the people. We hope the Commission will vote this proposed down today. I thank you."

**RAVI WINDOM, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning and happy holidays to everyone. My name is Ravi Windom. I am the Education and Programming Consultant at the Hammonds House Museum, which is also affectionately known as the West End Gym. This year, we were able to celebrate 35 years of artistic excellence culture and community. Thank you for supporting us for 35 years and giving us the proclamation. That was in a previous a board meeting. With your generous support and funding this year and previous years, we have been able to create, provide, and sustain programs centered around people of African descent as well as present artist, both locally, nationally and, internationally, like Tokie Rome-Taylor, Carrie Mae Weems, and our beloved Radcliffe Bailey, to name a few. In closing, as I walked down the halls right outside of these doors up here, I admired the beautiful work of artist, Tony Smart. And it just made me pause, and I also saw another person doing the same thing. It made me notice that art makes you stop and breathe. It calms your spirit; it changes your entire vibe. And so with that, in the midst of this crazy world and times like this, we need art. With that being said, I ask that you would please, please, please continue the support of the arts and specifically, continue to -- your continued support of the Hammonds House Museum so that we can be around for another thriving 35-plus years as well as our sister organization, The National Black Arts Festival. Thank you so much."

**LISA ADLER, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning. Thank you, Fulton County Commissioners. I'm here to thank you for your longtime support of the arts and culture community here in Atlanta. I don't know how many people are going to get to speak in this 30-minute window. So I'm just going to acknowledge everybody in the house that is here supporting the arts. Just wave up there, people, yay, in my community. I'm Lisa Adler; I'm cofounder of Horizon Theater Company in Little Five Points, Inman Park. This is our 40th season in presenting professional contemporary theater for adults and children. We have been there for a long time. We serve over 20,000 people a year with 180 performances and hundreds of artist every year get supported by us as well. Horizon would not truly be here if it was not support of Fulton County. From the very beginning of our company, we've been supported. And it's not the amount; it's that it happens, and that it leverages other funding for us throughout our ability to be able to raise funds from the community. I'm here today to encourage you to continue your support by renewing the Fulton County budget at the \$3 million level. This was last

year's level, and that was the first time we've been at that level since 2002. 2002, there was a 3-point million budget, after that it declined. And we were so grateful to have it come back. This is a very difficult time for the arts. And we truly appreciate the continued support. I brought with me as a little gift for you, 630 petitions from audience members who signed them to give to you in support of Fulton County that we collected at one of our last shows. All right while we are doing two shows. So I have one of my little girls here from Madeline's Christmas, a family show for kids. And in collaboration with Dad's Garage, the Hallmark Christmas, we will serve over 8,000 people this December at our theater. I want to thank you because the --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**LISA ADLER, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "-- arts enriched Fulton County is a major employer in Fulton County, an economic generator, and something that brings our community together across race, class, gender, and every other way. Thank you so much."

**PAT SNIPES, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning, and thank you Chairman and esteemed Board. My name is Pat Snipes, and I'm here representing the Before Slavery Experience Museum. This is a new Black History Museum that we have been working towards to open here in the Metro Atlanta area, and is a museum that is focused on the history of African-Americans before the Transatlantic slave trade. So while most museums focus on slavery, civil rights, on inventors and -- and the like, we focus on the history of the people. Where did they come from? How did they live? How did they govern themselves? How did they raise their children? And so I'm here today, because this is something that we think will -- actually, we know will be a destination, a destination venue for our metro area. But it will also be a gift to the local residents in the sense that we will offer dance classes and arts and crafts, computer literacy for seniors, robotics for children, lectures, presentations, family tree research, and the like. So that is in addition to the tour of the experience itself. It is definitely a plus for --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**PAT SNIPES, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "-- for the Metro area. We're seeking the assistance of the Board for a building to house the museum and its associated arts."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Thank you."

**PAT SNIPES, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Next five speakers, please come forward. David Weiss, Jennifer Jenkins, Conrhonda Baker, Jovan Paige, and Jessica Holland."

**TIMOTHY FREEMAN, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Thank you, everybody. My name is Timothy Freeman. And first of all, I want to say do support the arts, the arts are very



important. And to see Mr. Mojo and other people came for you to show how things progress in Atlanta. I grew up in that era, I remember that era. I remember the struggles, the projects of being a vital part of our community. Right now, I live in the Northwest side of Atlanta. And I'm mostly concerned about the resolution to change the court system from a -- what is it, 23-0967? I talked to -- I come here as a liaison for my community, which is the Grove Park Community on the Northwest side of Atlanta. And not everybody over there is so politically connected and conscious. So I try to let them know the things that are going on in laymen terms. And I'm asking the Commission here today to please not do this. Because the feedback that I get from my community is that, that the white folks is just trying to take over. The dominant power structure that has always suppressed us is ramping up its efforts to put us in a -- in a further bind. And the Magistrate Court has done a very good job over the -- over the lead of Cassandra Kirk, Judge Kirk, has done an excellent job. And I'm not speaking just for myself; I speak to the people in my community. And while not all of us see this, the majority of us do see this. So they have done a wonderful job. And it doesn't make any sense to me to take a position where, we the people get to vote on this position and put it in the hands of an appointee. If somebody can explain to me, don't have to explain it to me now. But no one has been able to really do that to me. So personally, I think this is just social economic engineering, something that was working for the lower income Black people --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**TIMOTHY FREEMAN, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "-- and is now being taken away. So I employ you to say, no to this resolution. And I thank the audience for being here to listen. And thank you for your consideration. Please say, no."

**DAVID WEISS, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Hello, Commissioners. I just want to thank you for your funding for the arts. As Lisa Adler talked about and you mentioned that, you know, uplift the children. I just want to give one example; this is my daughter, Alexa. She is full of innovation and creativity and awesomeness, but she was a little bit not self-confident to put that out there to the world. We want to take a -- she took camp and classes at Horizon Theater, in a year and half, she just performed yesterday of in front of 200 people, did an amazing job at the theater, and is like out there, even I don't have the self-confidence to go on, perform in front of people like that. So I just want to say that arts funding is not just a painting, a performance, a drawing, it's like, life. Like, you're changing kids' lives, you know? And she's just one of 28 girls in her cast in one theater of all the different theaters in Fulton County. So as, like, a Fulton County resident, and then just as dad, you know, thank you so much for what your funding has allowed for my daughter to grow and be so much more confident. And just please continue that funding, and don't cut that funding because it's really affecting the lives and doing so much. I would also -- one last thing, I really think it's probably, out of the whole budget, is a relatively small amount of the greater budget. I would argue that it's probably one of the best bang for your buck, if you will, that you're going to get out of the -- for that relatively small amount, how much you enrich lives so --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**DAVID WEISS, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "-- please, please just continue that. And thank you so much for what you've already done."

**JENNIFER JENKINS, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning, (multi-language greeting). I'm Jennifer Jenkins, and I am proud to be born and raised here in Fulton County. And I'm here with my sister, Pat Snipes, in support of the Before Slavery Museum. We're requesting that the location that will -- is soon to be opening up on Roswell in Sandy Springs, that it be considered for the location of this extraordinary museum. Those of us, including my husband, who are proud native Atlantans. And for four generations of my family, we are tremendously grateful to your leadership on behalf of our great city and our global legacy. I was honored, in fact, to serve as Honorary Consul for the Republic of Botswana and as Dean of Africa Consuls here in the Atlanta Consular Core for seven years. I'm emerita now, but I continue to passionately support the cooperation and partnerships between the people of the continent of Africa, and here, our native town of Atlanta. So we ask you to please support this. Those of us who were born and raised here and public school graduates, we were blessed that we are also honoring the 50th anniversary of hip-hop, but also the 50th anniversary of Roots, and how transformational that was in our lives and of our generation. And we would like for this next generation of young people to be able to embrace their roots, that is all of us in our multicultural city. So please consider supporting. And it's so great to see all of you, and God rest the soul of your dad. Thank you so much, all of you for your leadership. And we hope that we can continue this partnership, particularly in terms of the cultural arts and in community service for the Sandy Springs area, but the entire Fulton County and in fact, greater Atlanta area, the home of Pan Africanism. Thank you so much."

**CONRHONDA BAKER, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Greetings, distinguished County Commissioners. I'm Conrhonda Baker, Program Officer for Arts, Culture, and Creative Enterprises at the Community Foundation for Greater Atlanta. The power of arts and culture extends beyond aesthetics. It's an economic force that builds stronger, more livable neighborhoods. Across Fulton County, creative businesses beautify our cities and fuel innovation. According to the Arts and Economic Prosperity Six Study, it is estimated that in the city of Atlanta alone, our vibrant sector supports over 6,500 jobs, provides over \$360 million in personal income, and generates \$7.5 million in city and county tax revenue. Arts and culture are not just sources of inspiration. They are economic kindling, enticing people out of their homes, and resulting in substantial event-related spending. In Atlanta, attendees on average spend \$42 per person, per event on top of buying tickets. This creates a ripple effect that extends to local businesses, hotels, restaurants, transportation and more. Therefore, funding the arts is not a frivolous pastime, but a strategic investment in an industry that stimulates economic growth. As you discuss the budget, I urge you to remember the broader context. Now, more than ever, we must recognize that the arts are not luxury, but an essential force that uplifts our residents and stimulates economic growth. By investing in the arts, we

invest in an industry that goes beyond the canvas and stage. Your commitment to funding the arts is not merely a line item in the budget. It is fueling interconnectedness that makes Fulton County the cultural capital of the South."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**CONRHONDA BAKER, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "I thank you again for your support of arts and culture in prior year budgets. And encourage you to continue funding so we collectively can continue to influence everything."

**JOVAN PAIGE, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "It's more for time. It's random, right? You're like, what's going on? But I got your attention. So my name is Jovan Paige, and my 9:00 to 5:00 is being the Program Officer for Power and Leadership for the Community Foundation for Greater Atlanta. But my 5:00 to 9:00 is being a motivational speaker. Now, in lieu of giving you numbers and data that you'll probably forget by lunch, I decided I was going to give you a quick story. So I met a young man named Marquis. I asked Marquis, hey, Marquis, what do you want to be when you grow up? I said do you want to be a doctor? You want to be a lawyer? He was like, no. I said, oh, you want to be a motivational speaker, like Mr. Paige? No, that's lame. Well, dang, what do you want to be? He said I want to be a Power Ranger. We're learning primary colors in our after school program, and I learned all the colors, but I want to be a Power Ranger. I said, why, is it your favorite color? No, I want to be a Power Ranger because Power Rangers can fight. Okay. Yeah, they -- and I have to fight sometimes because I think I'll have to fight back from my mom because her boyfriend beats on her. Like, ah, I didn't expect that. I don't know what to say. I thought we were talking about Power Rangers. So, well, if you need anything, here's my card. He's like, no, no, no, you're being weird. I'm just trying to tell you why I want to be a Power Ranger. I said, okay, well, why else do you want to be a Power Ranger? Well, I want to be a Power Ranger because I know I'll be able to save my mom and her my mom's boyfriend got her addicted drugs. So now, I'm talking to a young man, he's only six years old, this is true story. And he told me that he is in a domestic violence situation, and he doesn't have somewhere to live consistently and his mom is on drugs. So what do I do, and how does arts pertain to this? Well, I lied to you about a couple of things. One, I told you I wasn't going to give you no numbers. I'm going to give you some, all right? Now, somebody who is involved in a domestic violence household is six times more likely to commit suicide, 50 percent more likely to be addicted to drugs. However, arts programs, those people are 70 percent less likely to have a low propensity to be involved in those things. The second thing I lied about is, Marquis. Marquis is my middle name."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**JOVAN PAIGE, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Thank you so much for your time and investing in the arts is an investment in us. Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Next five speakers, please come forward. Freddie Ashley, Karina Teichert, Christopher Escobar, Destiny Renee, and L.A. Pink."

**JESSYCA HOLLAND, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning, Commissioners. My name is Jessyca Holland. I am the Director of Organization and Community Initiatives at South Arts. Just a little bit of background about South Arts. I come today, really wearing a little bit of our funder hat, speaking funder to funder. In 2022, South Arts granted nearly \$10 million throughout the southeast, with \$4 million going directly to artists. We make this kind of investment because we understand, like my colleagues have pointed out, the return that that money and investment gives to the community. For example, we know that on average for every dollar that is invested in a community, \$7 are returned back in total economic impact. One of our goals at South Arts is to grow private investment in the southeast. I don't know if you know this, and you may, but we are woefully underfunded regionally. And so our giving back to the community and investing in the community, is with not only the direct hope that we will spur artistic innovation and audience appreciation, but also that we can't stand as an example to other government entities. Americans for the Arts has research that help support the fact that when government invests in arts and so do private investors. And in fact, nonprofits that don't receive federal funding compared to their sister nonprofits who do, tend to earn less revenue of from private investors by about 25 percent less. So your investment is really important."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**JESSYCA HOLLAND, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Because it helps amplify the rest of the investments that are out there from the private realm. So thank you very much, and thank you for continuing fund arts in Fulton County."

**FREDDIE ASHLEY, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning. My name is Freddie Ashley, and I am the Artist Director Actor's Express here in Fulton County. We've been producing theater here for over 35 years, and have been able to do so much, as Lisa Adler said, in large part due to your support. As a matter of fact, there was a certain time in our organization's history that we would have actually potentially gone under, if not for the support of Fulton County. The arts were probably the, one of the hardest hit industries from the pandemic. And our recovery has been among the slowest. We've had an interruption and disruption to attendance, which thankfully, is starting to turn around. But also philanthropic support for the arts at this already critical time has been slashed in almost every corner. If not for the thoughtfulness and generosity of Fulton County or some of our other public partners, who else will do it? And what do the arts bring? You're going to hear, and you have heard, all kinds of very well-researched, studied, presented and shared statistics about the power of the arts on the economy, on education, on quality of life. All those are true and have been consistently true for a number of decades now. But I want you also to think about the personal impact that the arts have had potentially on you and people that you love. Where else can you go where a bunch of people from different walks of life backgrounds, experiences, beliefs,

gather together on purpose, to share something significant? Think about the personal impact on each of those people and then the aggregate impact on those --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**FREDDIE ASHLEY, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "-- dozens, hundreds and thousands more, who've had the same experience. The arts don't just bolster and improve our community, and they do, they also create community and are in desperate need of your support. Thank you and happy holidays."

**KARINA TEICHERT, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning, Commissioners. My name is Karina Teichert. I'm a Fulton County resident, and I'm a recent Georgia Tech grad and a colleague of Jessyca's at South Arts. Outside of work, I'm a musician, writer, and art curator. As a very creative student at a predominantly STEM school, I realized I was largely bereft of opportunities to get involved in the arts at my school. As a result, I turned to the wider Atlanta area in order to get said opportunities that I so desperately needed. I found myself welcomed into the music and arts communities with open arms. And I can truly say that getting to experience the rich tapestry of art and history that this county has to offer has changed my life significantly. Cutting funding to these vital communities would not only be a great disservice to Fulton County constituents, but also to the depth, diversity, and vivacity of the city that we all love. Speaking as a young person and an artist, I urge you to please continue your support of my future and the future of my peers through the funding of the arts here in Fulton County. Thank you so much."

**CHRISTOPHER ESCOBAR, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning and thank you for your long-standing support of the arts. But I'm not here to point out why that's been important from a cultural standpoint. Instead, I'm here to offer a case study. See, I'm the Executive Director of the Atlanta Film Society. My name is Christopher Escobar, and we're the nonprofit that produces the Atlanta Film Festival. And back in 2011, the city and state arts funding was at an all-time low. The organization had gone down to one full-time employee, and it would have certainly closed were it not for the dependability of Fulton County funding, typically about 20,000 annually. This is when I came along, and we had a challenge on our hands. At the same time, The Plaza Theater, Atlanta's oldest movie theater, was also on the verge of closing. We got together to see how we can help each other, and indeed, we did. We moved the Atlanta Film Festival there. We worked with them to turn things around, and by 2016, the theater's revenue had more than tripled. And there was a renewed sense of vibrancy at the corner of Ponce and North Highland Avenue. 2017, the Center was purchased for the first time in 78 years for a hefty \$18 million. The Center's new owners regularly referenced how the Plaza Theater is an anchoring part of the shopping center, going as far as renaming Briarcliff Plaza as the Plaza on Ponce. And here's how far we've come, in employment numbers and full-time equivalents, the combined Plaza and Atlanta Film Society have gone from five to 25. Property taxes, for the portion that Fulton County alone gets for that property has increased by \$20,000 annually, and in sales tax, an



increase of over \$147,000 a year. So it's safe to say that without the Plaza Theater, that center would not be the same. And it's accurate to say that without the Atlanta Film Society, the Plaza Theater would not be here today. This case study is not an outlier, it's instead, a typical example of the economic impact you see when you look at the nearly other 200 other artist organizations that Fulton County funds. These aren't cultural assets, these are investment assets in a portfolio that --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**CHRISTOPHER ESCOBAR, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "-- is paying returns. Thank you so much."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Last four speakers in Assembly Hall, please come down. Dwon Hart, W. Imara Canady, Susan Ross, and Sherry B. Williams."

**DESTINY RENEE, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Greetings everyone, I am Destiny Renee, the Education Director and representative of 7 Stages Theatre in Little Five Points, here to speak in opposition of reducing arts funding in 2024. As we know, Atlanta is a large influential center of the United States, influential cultural center of the United States. And arts play a major role in the development of culture. 7 Stages is heading into our 45th season. As a nonprofit theater, is a part of our mission, vision, and values to create accessible and affordable arts programming that will benefit our community. We rely heavily on grants and government funding to continue that important work, offering art and education to those in need. And we cannot do that without your support. American theaters are struggling nationally, and I would even say theaters are struggling internationally as well. And it is my hope that we all continue to fight for its survival. Thank you."

**L.A. PINK, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good evening, I am the President and First Lady of Street Groomers. And I come here today to speak with Dana and Bob based on their accusations against Chief Magistrate Judge Cassandra Kirk. I stand here as an organization, sadly and disappointed in words that were spoken out about our Commission -- our Judge and the things that she needed to step down for. I don't think that you went and did a background check, and since she gave you one, there's no need for me to speak on that. I can only speak on her outreach of the things that she's done with us, personally in the community. But I want to ask the question, why wasn't the same energy -- and this question is to Dana, because I seen you on the TV speaking. Why wasn't that same energy given to Commissioner Hall, running around here chasing balls inside this building? There was -- you haven't asked her to step down at all, and that concerns me. So there wasn't no call for recon -- for her to resign directly from you at all. When we even came to the meeting, you never spoke out about it. But then here it is, you have so much to say about a Judge that have done so much inside of our community. Foot washing, what Judge do you know wash the foot of the homeless? Have you ever done that? Have you? Have you done that? Not only do she take care of inside of Fulton County with making sure that she brings an impact to

the Judges here that she stands for, but the outside as well. So you're coming for a Judge that --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**L.A. PINK, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "-- has a background that you can't even touch. Half of the things she's probably done, you haven't even remotely come close to doing. So please, step off."

**DWON HART, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning, guys. How you doing, Commissioners? My name is Dwon Hart, they call me Young Dro. I represent a group called It Still Takes a Village. It Still Takes a Village is centered on community, empowerment, and mental health. And we also have a diversion program for people like me. My comment is on funding I seen -- I see being cut in jail and court. Well, first of all, I'm out here and I see these evictions. And I don't understand much about politics, not at all, and I don't want to pretend like I do. But if we're not appointing Presidents, we should not be appointing Judges. Voting rights are very important, and as for jail goes, I've been in Rice Street myself. And they had me on this day called a boat. And a boat is a bed that you pretty much put wherever you got space at. And I had to sleep by a room that I smelled feces and piss and all that type of stuff all day long. And it played a number on my mental, and the jail is deteriorating. And you can literally just pull anything from anywhere and make a weapon. So I feel like funding for this is -- need to be heavily considered. Thank you for your time."

**W. IMARA CANADY, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Should I start? Okay. Good morning, Commissioners. It's good to be with you again, as we close out this year and in the thrust of this holiday season. I -- of course, I'm here to talk to you about the importance of the arts. But quite honestly, you've already done that work for us. So, Commissioner Thorne, thank you. As we already saw, every sector of Fulton County was represented through these wonderful young artists, and them being celebrated through this wonderful calendar. So we visually got to start off today's meeting, seeing how every corner of Fulton County is impacted. And this is just a personification of the reality of the 200-plus arts organizations that Fulton County has supported again this year, and that we encourage you to at the same level, support for 2024. You know, in only a few short days, one of the most celebrated films of our country, The Color Purple, will premiere in theaters across this country. And you know, the good news is 95 percent-plus of that was filmed right here in the state of Georgia, with most of it being in locations throughout Fulton County. \$125 million project that was funneled into funds right back here. Now, why was that possible? Because there are artists that were trained at these institutions that Fulton County funds. There are artists that live here because they want to live in Fulton County. And I share all of that in the big picture and dwindle down. And it all comes from the continued support that you all support in Fulton County. So we say, thank you for that support. We encourage you to continue to that support. And as my colleague and dear friend Chris said, it's not just a cultural asset,

it's an economic investment. Thank you. Happy holidays, and continue that good fight for the art and culture. God bless."

**SUSAN ROSS, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Hello, my name is Susan Ross. And I'm a resident, long-time resident of Fulton County. And I know many of you personally. I am here as an artists, as a -- as a retired city employee, as a senior citizen, and probably three or four other hats. But I'm here to encourage you to continue Fulton County's outstanding support for arts funding and senior funding. I think it's very important that we -- we recognize that the arts are what enriches our lives. And then for those of us who have given so much over the years to Fulton County, we deserve to have some services that affect us as we are seniors. And so I think it is highly important that this Board take on -- take on continuing its historic responsibility of supporting the arts and seniors. I am -- I've been up before as a Member of the Nature Girls. I know we were honored by the Fulton County. And all of us are senior citizens, who regularly use the facilities around the county, on all sides of the county. I want to -- and as a -- as an artist, I exhibit regularly from the North of Fulton County, down to the South, from Johns Creek down to almost -- almost down Clayton, but down to the end of the county. We do exhibits all over the county. And I want to strongly encourage that you continue to support those nonprofit organizations and individuals that make this county great. Thank you very much."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have three speakers on Zoom and five emailed-in comments."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. It's 11:34, quickly."

**RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "The first person to speak is Ben Howard. Ben Howard. Okay, the next --"

**BEN HOWARD, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Greetings. Commissioners, staff, and special greetings, fellow citizens. Ben Howard, Senior Advocate, Public Policy Analyst. They were rolling merrily along; doling out millions of dollars in the dark, until one day a newly-appointed Housing Commissioner arrived. Instead of softly making a motion, the newcomer insisted, what have you Board Members been doing to increase affordable public housing? Uh-oh, trouble in the house. Shutdown that Zoom, in-person meetings only. We're heading to the Fulton County Commission to get them to get rid of this troublemaker, as the county seek two voices move to throw the so-called troublemaker out. A third voice moved to put the matter on hold until legal advice has been given to the Commission. But then came a call to throw the baby out with the bathwater, saying let's get rid of that whole Housing Authority. Oh, no, not yet. The media is covering this mess on air and in the Sunday papers. The can of worms has been opened. We need to let the worms fall out."

**RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "The next person to speak is Lucia Frazier."



**LUCIA FRAZIER, PUBLIC COMMENT:** "Good morning, everybody. My request today is something that's probably already been paid for, and maybe overlooked. It's been really hard to come and communicate with the BRE in person anymore, now that they've moved to the furthest part of the county. And I've asked about having Zoom comment, and it sounds like they don't have the ability. But I don't see how that is, since we paid so much money for that new facility. So I'm just requesting that somebody just look into that, and see if we could make that a possibility in the future. Thank you."

**RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "The next person to speak is Marie. Marie. And with that said, that concludes our Zoom public comments."

**MODERATOR, PUBLIC COMMENTS:** "We have five public comments from email. The first public comment by Robyn Donaldson: I'm a resident of Fulton County and I live at the Old Fourth Ward. I want to make sure that you are aware of I am opposed to resolution 23-067. Second public comment by Greg Fann: Good morning, I regret I could not be in attendance for today's meeting. I'm attending former Fulton County employees Captain Hattie Cotton-Tookes mother's funeral. I want to express my support for the 5 percent raise and to increase the minimum entry-level salaries for all Fulton County employees as well as the Fulton County Marshals parity pay. As you know, all, there is a homeless issue in our county. Many of Fulton County employees that work for you are struggling to pay rent and keep a roof over their heads for them and their children. My hope is that you seriously consider raising the entry-level pay for all employees so those that are struggling can make ends meet and continue to provide for themselves and their families. The third public comment by Donna Timmers: Please remove the barrier from the concrete work at Northside Library. We cannot get to the drop-off it has been there for weeks. The fourth public comment by Kimberly King: Good morning, Fulton County Board of Commissioners. As a Fulton County resident, I am disappointed that resolution 23-0967, sponsored by Commissioners Barrett and Ellis, has reached today's agenda. It appears that an open conversation between the Commissioners individually or collectively with Chief Magistrate Judge Kirk would have been and would have demonstrated better use of County's Resources. Today, I'm asking other Commissioners to oppose this resolution for the following reasons: Funding of the Magistrate Court is already within the BOC's authority. Cutting funding would hurt the county's most vulnerable citizens who rely on the county's operations and resources. Moving positions to -- and funding to Superior Court would not yield a better outcome for Fulton County residents. If that is not your intended outcome, I encourage you to instead, find ways to seat the Magistrate Court, such that it may continue is exceptional service. Number two, seeking legislation to make Chief Judge an appointed position, removes the voice of the people. In Fulton County, the vote is viewed as sacred. As constituents throughout Fulton County's selected and elected, each Commissioner, why would we not want to exercise our voting rights and select the person we want to led the Magistrate Court. More than once, we have selected Cassandra Kirk. Why? Because she's gets the job done. The third, there is an uncertain value in creating new judicial officer positions in Superior Court with increased criminal responsibility. Sure, this topic deserves discussion --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Fifteen seconds."

**MODERATOR, PUBLIC COMMENTS:** "-- just not before the BOC has enough information to make the decision today. Under Judge Kirk, Fulton County Magistrate Court has been recognized numerous times by numerous organizations as an accomplishment all residents should celebrate."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Thank you. Anymore?"

**MODERATOR, PUBLIC COMMENTS:** "The last public comment by Helen Butler: The Georgia Coalition for the People's Agenda strongly opposes any proposal to eliminate the voters of Fulton County ability to elect any position in the county, especially that of Judge Kirk. This concludes today's online comments."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. 11:41, colleagues. Continue, Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Bottom of page 9, County Manager Renewal Items under Open and Responsible Government. **23-0904**, Real Estate and Asset --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Hold on one second here. So the next 15 items are all renewing existing contracts. And if there are no objection, I'd like to take those as one vote. If you just sound the captions. If anyone would like any explanation as we go through --"

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0904**, Request approval to renew existing contracts in an amount not to exceed \$1,092,157 to provide cleaning services. Page 10, **23-0905**, Request approval to renew existing contracts in an amount not to exceed \$215,000 to provide on-site door repair and preventative and predictive maintenance services. **23-0906**, Registration and Elections request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$560,000 to provide ballot printing services for the 2024 Elections. **23-0943**, Information Technology request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$3,137,962.45 to provide provisioning maintenance and support services of network and physical security equipment countywide. **23-0944**, Request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000 to provide enterprise business-class desktop personal computers, laptops, monitors, and docking station, special computing devices. Page 11, **23-0945**, Real Estate and Asset Management request approval to renew existing contracts in a total not to exceed amount of \$350,000 to provide on-site Standby Plumbing Repair Services. Arts and Libraries, **23-0907** Request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$1 million to provide popular shelf-ready books. On page 12 under Health and Human Services, **23-0946**, Behavioral Health and Developmental Disabilities request approval to renew existing contracts in the total amount not to exceed \$13,363,410.93 to provide permanent supportive housing. **23-0908**, Senior Services request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$3,134,178 to provide

transportation services, ride sharing to eligible county, Fulton County residents of age 60 and above. 23-0909."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Mr. Chair."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yes."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "0908 and 0909, can we pull those out --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yes."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- for a separate discussion?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yes. Continue."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay. On page 13, **23-0911**, Senior Services request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$4,363,792.43 to provide aging services for Fulton County seniors aged 60 and above. **23-0910**, Request approval to renew existing contracts in the amount of 1,049,303.76 to provide food service management and purchasing of food items for four senior multipurpose facilities and three training centers. **23-0912**, Request approval to renew existing contracts in the total amount not to exceed \$1,030,166.32 to provide in-home services to eligible Fulton County seniors aged 60 and above. **23-0947**, Public Works request approval to renew an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$300,000 to provide standby utility pavement patching and paving services. On page 14, **23-0913**, Sheriff request approval to renew existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$554,730 to provide national prisoner transportation services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. I'll entertain a motion to approve 13 of those 15, the two exceptions being those requested by Vice Chair Ellis on page 12, 0908 and also on page 12, 0909. Those are the two, Vice Chair?"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yes, sir."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve 13, those 13, with those two exceptions. Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Back to 0908 on page 12, sound that one in its entirety."

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0908**, Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$3,134,178, with Common Courtesy to provide transportation services, ridesharing to eligible Fulton County residents age 60 and above."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Vice Chair."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yes, Mr. Chair. I know that we got it late yesterday, a presentation by, I think, Senior Services, on this topic. And I'm not necessarily the asking them to go through it in its entirety. But you know, my main concern with this -- and I'm in support of this program, because it -- I worked with the group to originally put it in place, is on our current trajectory, is it sustainable in terms of the cost trajectory of it, without thinking about some sort of mechanisms of cost sharing within it? You know, hoping to provide -- read my numbers correct on this, this -- our expenditure for this on 2021 was about 1.38 million, is that -- does that sound about right?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** Yes, sir.

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** And then -- and then it's -- and this is -- and then it jumped in 2022. And then now, we're at, the ask here is for 3.13. Is that for this one?

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** Yes, sir.

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** Yeah, so, I mean, just the -- at some point, I mean, the pace of increase does become potentially unsustainable on this. So that's -- that's really, you know, what I thought we should have some level discussion about. And I know you all had put some sort of discussion in this, I believe in this presentation. And I thought it might be worth sharing, having to spend a few minutes on that."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Thank you, Commissioner -- Vice Chair Ellis. So the department has worked on a sustainability plan. In October, we brought the matter to the Board to request approval for additional funding because we did not have any mechanism in place to control ridership. We presented recommendations at that time, and we received feedback that included looking at a means-share model, a means-testing model. And so the department went back to work through that means-testing model. And we have included that in the presentation today. And if we want to skip straight to that, I think it's important to frame this by starting off on page 6 of the presentation. We'll back up a little further, just to show some trends in ridership, page 4, we'll start there. What we are demonstrating here is the continued escalation in ridership for the Uber/Lyft service. This program, again, has become very popular for a variety of reasons. And the department has done a tremendous job in managing the program. And so I'll turn it over to Ladisa Onyiliogwu to talk about the continued increase in the -- in ridership and the projections over the next -- for 2024, along with the means-testing model that we would like to present for your consideration."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Dr. Roshell, before we -- before you go further with it, is what you're going to present, is that assumed in the contract renewal that we would adopt these recommended means test, or is that a separate --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "It is not, no, sir."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- decision? Okay."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So it is not considered. It is a way for us to manage the program within the budget that the Board approves."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Got it. So we could adopt it with this amount, the money may run out --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- or we could adopt potentially a means test, and potentially get, you know, more --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- expanded usage and allow more people to kind of benefit from it."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "That's exactly right."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Got it, okay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Anything else, Commissioner?"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "No, I mean, that's it for me. And I think they -- if you wanted to kind of pace through that fairly quickly, that's fine."

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "Will do. Good morning, Ladisa Onyiliogwu, Director, Department of Senior Services. Joining me is Kweli Rahied-Henry, and she will present on the means test. The slide before you is clear, ridership continues to increase for Uber/Lyft. And this time -- as of 2022 total number of rides provided was 145,000. As of October, 135,000 trips were provided through Uber/Lyft. And as of November, we recently received that invoice, 149,000 trips. Next slide. The ridership unduplicated total number of seniors who use the Common Courtesy contract, Uber/Lyft, was 2,061 in October. So you can see the significant increase from January 2023, through October. And as of November, we had an unduplicated number of 2,068. Next slide. So this is the cost before you today, agenda item 23-0908, Request approval for renewal at 3.1 million. That means that we'll be able to provide 13,000 trips monthly. There will be a service reduction to 1,670 riders. And this is the -- if the funding is -- remains here, then the department will work to manage the contract within the compensation amount. Remember, as of October 2023, we had already provided 15.6 thousand trips. And that's up to 2,061 riders. Senior

Services has requested \$1.5 million in enhancement for the 2024 budget. If that is approved in January, we will be able to provide up to 17,000 trips per month. And that will allow us to service 2,320 seniors. Now, if we use the 2-percent increase, which is a trend that we've been tracking, then we could amass a total of 2,872 riders by the end of 2024. And that means no restrictions, no spending controls, or caps are implemented. Next slide. Now, some of this sustainability measures that we are able to take regarding TransDev, is to analyze fuel costs. So Senior Services, through the partnership of DREAM, has installed the EJ hard -- EJ Ward hardware onto the buses that TransDev uses to transport seniors to senior centers, adult day centers, and behavioral health. We're going to determine whether or not using county-fueled sites will save us some costs, or if there's actual cost savings built into the contract with fuel. The second thing that we're going to explore is the feasibility of transferring dialysis clients to Common Courtesy. This will free up buses, the TransDev buses to meet their on-time performance objectives. They'll be able to get the seniors to the centers quicker, adult day, support behavioral health more. And for dialysis clients that are eligible and can use Common Courtesy, we would like to transfer them. There's one thing we would have to work with Purchasing on, which is to make -- to determine what can be done with the contract if we have to re-solicit. Because the dialysis parts require more trips than the 16-month allotment. The third sustainability measure is to reestablish MOSST. MOSST is an acronym for Mobility Options Supporting Senior Transport. And this is where we do a detailed assessment of seniors. Not automatically placing them into service, but asking them a series of questions, and then determining which type of program is most appropriate for them. And an assessment takes some time, significant amount of time, and requires additional staffing in the Transportation Program within the department to accomplish that. The last sustainability measure, which Dr. Roshell referenced, and Kweli is going to talk you through that quickly, is to consider a means test, which will be applied to the Common Courtesy contract, and that will require a Board decision and approval. Kweli."

**KWELI RASHIED-HENRY, SENIOR SERVICES:** "Good morning. Next slide. Next slide, please. Okay. So as part of our means testing, we looked at sliding scale fees that are established by the census, using the federal poverty guidelines levels. And we established four scales, starting with the status quo cost share that we typically have in place, that we do have in place now, which would represent 100 percent of the federal property level, which is about \$14,000 a year, annual income for a single individual. The second scale would be at a \$2 cost share, and that would take it up to 200 percent of the federal property level, and below. And that's about \$29,000 year for a single individual. The third scale is 247 percent of the federal poverty level at \$3, and that's \$36,000 a year, and below. And the fourth scale is at 247 percent above the federal poverty level. And that would be a \$5 cost share. So anything -- anyone making over \$36,000 a year would be required to pay the \$5 cost share amount. Next slide. So this is a breakdown of what I mentioned in terms of the different sliding scales that we established according to the cost share amounts. Next slide. And so in terms of the means test and thinking about the eligibility, we anticipate that there would be some cost savings, and this is a breakdown of the monthly cost savings per trip according to



the cost share that the client would be responsible for. Next slide. And so -- you want --

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So, thank you. So the recommendations that we have before you, Commissioners, outline three options. One is to renew the contract as it's presented today, maintaining the 16 one-way trips. We would need to reduce the ridership and impose a cap of 1,670 riders and include a means test. The next option would require \$1.5 million in additional funding, which would make the Uber/Lyft contract with Common Courtesy 4.6 million. We would maintain the 16 one-way trips. We would have a cap, but we would be able to serve more constituents, 2,320, and we would impose a means test. If option one or two are not approved, we anticipate needing to come back to the Board in the beginning of the fourth quarter for an additional 2.6 million, which would allow us to continue the one-way trips. And we anticipate the ridership at that time would be 28,000 -- 2800, and we would impose the means test."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "So Dr. Roshell and team, maybe this is a better question for -- the budget as it's currently construction right now, what's the assumption in the proposed budget? Is it the 3.1 --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- or the 4.6? It's the 3.1."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "3.1, yes, sir."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay. Yeah, in -- if we approve 3.1 today, would your approach then to be to start to manage it as if that's all that's going to be, you know, kind of allowed for, or to manage it in a way that it's been doing, plus add the means testing, and then, you know, there's -- the funding gets tighter, then come back and seek more funding at that point in time. Sort of which -- or is it maybe more of an art than a science on that."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So Vice Chair, if the Board approves the 3.1 million along with the means test and no cap, we would manage the program to the 3.1 million, and then we would need to approach the Board at such time that we've projected that the funding will be exhausted. And we would then present as we did in October, what resources would be needed to continue the service through the end of the year."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay. But what we have before us in terms of approval is, there is no means test within it?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So the contract does not include a means test."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "That is a policy decision above the contract."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "And so it wasn't required to be included in the contract. But the department has the discretion to manage the program as the Board approves the policy to do so. And so we are presenting for consideration --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Which --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "-- the means test."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay. But it sounds like regardless of the dollar amount that we would wind up in terms of availability of funding, whatever that is, whether it's 3.1, additional million and a half, or -- or more, it's the department's recommendation that we move to the means-testing model?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, it is."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "And the department is also respectfully requesting consideration of a utilization cap."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "So you would like that -- your -- you would like to see from us, the utilization cap and the means test be added?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay. Okay. What I would -- I would offer a friendly amendment to the proposal that's here to adopt the recommendations from the -- from the staff of the cap and the means test."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I'll second it."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Well, it has to be accepted by the -- it's just a friendly amendment. It's a motion to approve and second that's on the floor, so."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Any objection?"



**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "No, sir."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. It's accepted."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Commissioner Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Sorry, I have a question about that amendment. So you're adding the means test and the cap, but not specifying the dollar amount at this point?"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Correct. Well, the dollar amount is in here, yeah. And obviously --"

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Well, 3.1 million you were saying --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Right. And we can obviously --"

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "-- keep that for now, but --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "For now, right."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "'-- but go ahead and implement the means test and the cap? Okay, I got you. I just had a couple of questions. On the number that you're estimating on, option 2, the 1.5 million additional, the number of the 2,320 riders. Is that number because that's what you think will be at the end of this year, and that's why you're capping that? Like, where does that 2,320 come from?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So the 2,320, we calculated what and how many constituents we could serve if we added the \$1.5 million investment that was added in October. That, still based on our projections, would not take us to the end of 2024."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "No, I meant like, right now, you said as of October, we were at 2160, I think?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "And so that -- I'm asking if by including the upticks that you're expecting in November -- or that you may have already had in November and what you're expecting in December, does that get us already to 2,320?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Very close."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Okay. The reason I'm asking is just because I know you and I had a conversation earlier this week about what -- about grandfathering people in if we were to limit the program. And so I was just curious if that is sort of where that line would be at the end of this year? We then start -- those people would be grandfathered in, anybody else would have to wait until somebody drops out of the program, essentially."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So as a matter of how we would execute the policy, we would recommend grandfathering in the 20 -- the 2,000 or so, constituents. We certainly would not want to cause a hardship on people that have relied on this transportation. We would then implement the means test for any new riders. New riders would be anyone after Board action that is new to the program."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "But it's likely that we would be full already?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "The cap would be reached and we would be full at the beginning of 2024, and wouldn't be able to accept anybody new until somebody drops out of the program?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "That's correct."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Gotcha. Have we looked at -- and I wasn't here for the inception of the program when it began, obviously, but I'm just wondering about the 16 rides. And I think maybe we have talked about it since I've been here a little bit. But is that the magic number decided on based on some kind of assessment of need, or how did we come to that?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So yes, it was based on need. But what we're trending at is half of that."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Okay."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So the average rider over time is only taking approximately eight trips."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Okay."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So we can certainly could consider, in addition to the means test and a cap, that reduction in the number of rides. Because our average is approximately eight at this time."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "That does seem like that would be a good choice. I don't know how much -- does that impact these numbers at all if we were to do that?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "It definitely would give us additional riders. We could serve more people with fewer rides per person."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "I mean, if they're not using it anyway. And we -- the program's been going on for how many years now? Is it two?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Three."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Three?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "2017."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "So we've got some -- we've got some data over time. And over time, it looks like that's what the usage is, I would love to see what that looks like. Because if we could reduce the number of rides, which are not really getting used anyway and serve more people, that seems like a good thing."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "And in thinking about that, however, the data that we've shared is based on the half, the eight rides. So it's not going to get us much."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Okay, gotcha."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "But we could certainly consider that. But the -- all of the utilization, and the -- the fiscal impact is based on the average rides, which is approximately eight. So if we reduced the 16 to eight, it will not get as much more, because that's really where we're operating now."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "And obviously, average is not everybody. So I wouldn't want to go all the way down to eight, but maybe we could go to ten or 12, at least --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "-- start new people out at that level something. I guess the other question I had is on the means test, there at the amount over 36,000 a year, anybody after that is paying \$5. Does it -- would it be helpful at all to have a cap at which you just don't qualify. In other words, if we went to 500 percent of the poverty line, which is people making 72,000 and change, could be say anybody over 500 percent of the poverty line just doesn't qualify for the program?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Certainly, we could."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "I don't know how much difference, again, that would make in the cost. But it does seem like the whole goal of this is to serve the seniors that need it not just to give a discount."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Correct."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "A subsidized, you know, three quarters of the price discount to people that don't need that subsidy."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So we certainly could include additional eligibility. Right now, the only eligibility is that you're a resident of Fulton County, and you're 60 years or older. So if we use the means test in other health, health and human services, the means test is used to determine eligibility and ineligibility. So adding that component would certainly be helpful."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "All right, I have one more question about this, the decision making around this. And I'm just wanting for my own edification to understand the age 60, also. I mean, I feel like a lot the various senior services that exist in the world have different starting ages. Did we pick 60 for a particular reason?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Because our primary funding from the federal government has an age of 60."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Okay. Gotcha."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "And so we just use that because it's uniform across all of the services like home-delivered meals, in-home care, that's the age. And so we thought, using that standard age to align with our federal funding would make sense."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Do you have a concept of the average age of the current users, just out of curiosity?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Once they determine the eligibility based on age, they have not tracked the age, but I'm sure would go through the client records and give you that information."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Again, just thinking about how we might serve more people that need it, and thought being -- I'm fully with you that we should grandfather in anybody that's using the service so far. I mean, we certainly don't want to take something away from people that are relying on it. But if we said for people joining new, it's 62 and over, or -- I just don't -- I don't know if it would materially make a difference. And so I would just be curious to see some of those, you know other options considered. That's all I have."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Thank you, Chairman. Understand that we need to -- we need to be fiscally prudent with this. Whenever we have conversations surrounding seniors and transportation, I want to go on record as us doing everything in our power to not only make sure that the ones that are getting service are getting it, but the ones who are hitting that 60, or the ones that -- who have not been getting out, and part of the fact that they are able to get out now, they have a better mental health status. I know that the seniors in my district really do utilize this. The seniors in my district enjoy it. And you know, sometimes I cringe when we have the discussion because it comes down to dollars and cents. And when you're talking about seniors, those that have worked and given to Fulton County all of their lives, something just does not sit right with me. When we're talking about individuals who have helped shape this county, who has helped raise children, who have helped mentored, who have help the arts and culture community, who have helped with so many different things, it may just be a personal pet peeve of mine, and I'll be candid with you, maybe it is. But when we're talking about our seniors, we're talking about individuals that a difference of not making a trip, could be the difference of a maybe, socially not coming out, that's a problem for me. Now, full disclosure, I know that Fulton County has a great transportation for seniors. I know that we lead the way. And I appreciate what you all were doing. But I would ask all of my colleagues, especially the Chairman, that we make sure when it comes to transportation for our seniors, let them be on the back burner when it comes to these cuts, if at all possible. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Natalie Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I want to be clear on exactly what we're voting on right now. So if the Clerk could sound exactly what we're voting on right now, since we have an amendment."

**CLERK GRIER:** "The motion is to approve the 3.1 million with the friendly amendment from Vice Chair, to include the means and the cap."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** Which means and which cap?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So the cap in option 1 is the 1,670."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So that's the cap."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, ma'am."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "No, I did not accept the amendment. But the Chairman did, even though he's not the one who made the motion. So you're recommending number 1 instead of any of the other ones, even though we are presented with 1, 2, and 3?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So Madam Commissioner, because the department is charged with requesting approval for the budget, as it is structured, we certainly are doing that with option 1. As you can see in option 2, we have already considered the actions of the Board from this year, and are and have requested an enhancement of 1.5 million through the budget process, which of course, would not be approved until January. But today, our option was to -- our recommendation is to present for approval or recommend for approval, the contract as it's currently written.

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** And the contract as it is currently written, is specifically for the 3.1-plus million dollars --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, ma'am."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "-- without a cap?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes. And the only reason we included the cap is to ensure that the department could manage within the 3.1 million. But as we did later in the fourth quarter this year, one with no cap, we simply presented to the Board what our utilization was and an option to add additional resources to the program."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So currently, what is the ridership?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "It is --"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Where does it fall in this cap?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "It is between one and two. It's approximately 2,000 and --"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "2,061 as of October. And then the recent invoice is 2,068."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So it's closer to number 2?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, ma'am."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So why would we go backwards? Why would we decrease when we know that the current ridership is higher, and that our seniors need this? That doesn't make sense. And no, I do not accept the amendment, friendly or not, because that's not friendly to our seniors. You're going to cut out people who are already riding. It's a higher number. And yes, this could be a detriment to a senior. They use this for everything, for going to the doctor and everything. It could be -- it could mean a senior's

life. They could miss a doctor's appointment, which could be very important to their health. So why would we go backwards? So no, I do not accept the amendment unless that amendment is going to include who's already riding. I'm not going to cut seniors out."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Dr. Roshell, what do you want to do?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "This is not complicated. What do you want to do?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "We can -- if we move forward, the contract does expire in December. We can move forward with the 3.1 million as it's presented here for Board consideration. We can include the means test, we can include some of the recommendations or the feedback that we received from the Board here today to flesh out that policy, and bring that back for approval to include things like, do we want to include ineligibility and things of that nature. We can bring back to the Board, a request for additional resources if needed, which we would need based on our projections, if that's the will of the Board, and not impose the cap."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Is that acceptable? All right. Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I think I heard someone say that there was average of eight trips --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- per month."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "So an average of eight trips per month, and that's eight one-way trips?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Or eight -- so the reason you got the 16 is because you're doubling --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Round trip."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- that eight."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir. And Commissioner Arrington, the projections that we have provided and the funding that has



been used by our ridership is based on that average. So as a Commissioner Barrett was asking, if we reduced the number of trips, would we see any significant change in our ability to serve more constituents. We don't think so, simply because all of the projections as far as what we project to spend is based on that, that eight or so ridership now. Not every single rider of the 2,000 riders is using only eight trips. But that is the average. So they do all have access to 16."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And it -- are -- is there any way that -- do they offer round trips?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Are round trips less?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "It's 16 trips -- no, sir. It's whatever the -- right now, the \$1 cost share is \$1 to go and \$1 to come back if you choose a round trip. So if we moved to the means test using the federal poverty guidelines and impose that, we would have some riders paying one, and some riders paying all the way up to \$5 per trip. So some riders, based on the income, would paid ten for a round trip, and some would pay two."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "So I like the means testing. But I don't like the reduce in cap. And, you know, and I wonder what it would look like if it were ten one-way trips per month instead of 16, or 12 instead of 16, and what -- what type of room there. But I agree, I wouldn't want to cap the ridership at 16 to 1670. So --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "We can, Commissioner Arrington, we can certainly run the analysis on your suggestion and Commissioner Barrett's suggestion to reduce the number of trips to see what the impact would be on the budget."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "All right. Well, I guess what I'm trying to understand is, right now there is a motion to approve. And I guess I'm going back to the question that Commissioner Hall asked, what -- what -- I don't -- I'm unclear as to what we're being asked to approve. What was your motion, Commissioner Hall? Let me ask you."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "To approve the current contract at the 3.1-plus million dollars. I had no earthly idea that we were trying to reduce the ridership below what it already is. So no, I was not making a motion for that at all."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "So -- so is it your -- so is your motion to approve the contract, the 3.1, and maybe allow for the means testing, but not the -- to reduce the cap --"



**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Absolutely for the means testing, yes, but not reducing the ridership."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And so the means testing, basically, using that sliding scale of people may be having to pay up to \$5?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Which creates more room for other people."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "We anticipate a savings to the program by increasing the cost of the cost share over time. So yes, the means test would allow us to save additional dollars within the budget because we would -- all of the means-test funding goes to the contract or to reduce the costs to the county. So having more resources for means testing would help us ultimately serve more constituents. If we also include a means test that has an ineligibility component, then that would also help control utilization."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Ineligibility for whom?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So we can -- the way we presented the means test today, we have the -- the categories based on income. What we didn't say is that if you are over 247 percent of poverty, that you are ineligible. So if the Board would like us to move forward in that direction, we certainly can. Or we can leave it as we presented it today, which is, you have various levels based on income. And those constituents, regardless of what their income goes up to after 247 percent of poverty, would pay \$5. So everyone would be eligible, basically, for the program based on age, based on living in Fulton County. Everyone would have a different cost share, however, based on income."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "All right. Yeah, I'm not sure about that ineligibility, but maybe that makes sense. Okay, so I'm fine with the means test. I would like to maybe get some additional follow up on, you know, what, reducing the ten or 12 trips per month? I mean, you know, I don't know how many times somebody -- I don't -- let's say somebody goes grocery shopping once a week, that's four times."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And maybe they've got, you know, doctor's appointments, maybe another four times. Maybe that, that's what gets us to the eight and the 16."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "But --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "It certainly varies."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Yes, so -- but I'm fine with the means testing. I just want to make sure that we are giving you, you all clear direction as to what we are approving, and frankly, make sure that we understand what we are approving."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Ellis, Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yeah, I'm fine with the, the means test approach, and then not doing the cap, per se, right now. But, yeah, when you come back with recommendations. I'm not okay with, you know, the ineligibility piece. I think if you're going to -- if you're going to do that, I mean, look, you want to have accessibility for people regardless of their income. And this is a service to help people kind of manage that who may not be able to manage it otherwise. I think if you were going to consider something, just have a higher -- have a separate tier, right --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Okay."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- for people with a higher income level versus making them purely ineligible, so."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So Mr. Chairman, I believe we're clear. The direction that the department would move, if the Board approves the \$3.1 million contract today, we would implement the program as it currently stands, with no cap. We would impose the means test based on income only. There would be no ineligible provision. And at such time, we are projected to exhaust all of our funds, we will come back to the Board for a review at that time."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Commissioner Thorne. Now, Mr. Adams, you will be eligible now."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Mr. Chairman."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yes."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "The other amendment to my comments in reflection regarding what you -- your direction is, we'll also run the analysis on a trip reduction to see if that makes any significant -- provides any significant savings."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Everybody clear --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "But won't -- we will not implement that."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Yes. And I would also like to see the analysis on the ineligibility as well."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Oh, yes, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Before we get to that point where we're about to run out, right? I'd like to see that, that and the other analysis."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Okay."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Sooner -- sooner than later."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir. And Mr. Chairman, for a point of clarification, is the Board supportive of grandfathering in all existing constituents, and imposing the means test on new applicants?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Is that a, yes?"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I mean, I think you do it universally. That's me, personally. I just think you do it universally."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Yeah."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So you like for us to run the means test on the 2000 constituents?"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "How long do you think it's going to take y'all to implement means testing? Because like, I imagine that's something that can't be done overnight, and probably won't start to January."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "It wouldn't start until January. But it would be relatively easy if we're only implementing it for new riders. If we need to go back and ask the 2,000 constituents that are currently receiving services for their income and run the means test on all of them, then yes, that would take a significant amount of time."

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "It would be assessing everyone registered. And we didn't have -- I didn't have that in the slide. But we have about 5,000 or so registered, remember the presentation from May. And so we're just

presenting the number of seniors that actually ride and scheduled trips. So the time for assessment for all of those individuals will take a significant amount of time."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "So how do they register for the program? Do they call, or is this like something that's done online?"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "They call. Everything starts with our Star Line, (404)613-6000."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And you're saying you think it'll take eight months to --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "To assess 5,000 --"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "Yes."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "-- yes, sir."

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "When we -- when I crunch the numbers, yes, the time it takes to walk them through getting the information, determining how we're going to prove the income. Seniors who would have to mail it in. We got to work with Legal first before we even implement this to make sure that all of our ducks are in a row and that we establish a protocol with county leadership, with Dr. Roshell's guidance. So it will take some time to make sure we have a solid program to implement the means test, and then begin testing."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Okay. Maybe it's easier to do it just on the new ones then, I don't know. If it's going to take eight months, that'll be the end of next year. I was hoping there something online and/or, you know, even though the phone call that, if you call, okay, what's your income? You know, but obviously, you can't verify that that quickly, so."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "And that depends on the number staffing that will support the means testing. So that's -- we're looking at the current structure personnel structure in transportation. So if we add, then we could reduce that number, that length of time, Commissioner."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yeah. I'm acceptive of the means test, I think it's great. Thank you for the work you guys have done in trying to reel in these expenses. Maybe

it's something we can start collecting that data, I don't know, as they apply for other senior services. If they use our senior center, if we can start collecting it. And then maybe have a goal of even the grandfathered ones, at a certain date, we'll be able to turn them over. Would that be a possibility?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "We don't -- this would be the only means testing program."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "It is?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. It seems like at our senior centers that it'd be good to have a means testing, you know, to see the type the demographics that we're serving anyway, so that we can see if we need to assist these people that are below that are below that poverty level in other ways."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So Commissioner, we don't means test in the senior centers. But we do provide access to benefits on a regular basis. So the Senior Services team has individuals from all sorts of nonprofit and other state agencies come to the senior centers to apply for SNAP benefits and other benefits. So we do provide access for seniors that need it, we just don't means test every single senior. So one thing that we could do, perhaps what we could do is flesh out the entire means test, let the Board understand what the policy would be. We could do things like ask questions, are you eligible? Are you receiving SNAP? That would automatically qualify you for one of the tiers in the means test. So we could implement the program as it currently operates, work towards a means-testing program, not impose a ridership, run the analysis that has been requested, and bring the means-testing program back to the Board so that we're clear that we're supportive with the -- in total policy for that program. So 3.1 million, if we run the program as we did in 2023, we have several months ahead of us to work through this. So it's not like there would be any immediate implications for the riders that we currently have. So if the Board does approve the 3.1 million as presented, along with a means test to be determined when to be implemented, I think that we can get there."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "It doesn't like me today. Just for clarification, on the senior ride program, there's limitations like the hours and the types of eligible trips. Could you outline those?"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "For the Common Courtesy contract that is 100 percent demand response. So that is the type of service, community trip, trip to the pharmacy, trip to the doctor's office. So our definition for a trip type and service type is demand response for Uber/Lyft."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "So they could take it anywhere, basically?"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "There is a mileage threshold as well for community trips and for medical trips, but, yes."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "And does it operate during certain hours, or is it 24 hours?"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "Monday through Friday, 8:30 to 5:00. You're welcome."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Thank you, Chairman. I don't want to belabor the point. I think Dr. Roshell, you just said what I'm comfortable with. As far as the grandfathering, you're going to come back with more information. Only reason I'm hesitant about the grandfathering, I don't know what the unintended consequences of before or against would be. And so until I'm clear on what it would be, I would not be comfortable with that. But with the means and the no cap and the 3.1, I would be able to support that, okay? All right, thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Barrett. Okay, Commissioner Natalie Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I'm glad you mentioned the Star Line, because I have received so many complaints about the Star Line, and the seniors not being able to get through to that number. And so I'm questioning how is it set up? Is there literally, a group of people that answer the phone like a call center? Or what -- what is happening? Because I went to the SCLC Women's and the union had a huge senior holiday party. There were over a thousand seniors there. And just about every single one that stopped me, complained about that Star Line, in addition to the fact that many of them are now being told that if you choose Uber and Lyft, you cannot choose anything -- any other transportation. If you choose TransDev, you cannot choose Uber and Lyft. They're telling -- they're being told that they have to select one or the other. So I -- and I did bring that to the attention of Dr. Roshell and our County Manager. So and I know you worked on that. Thank you so much."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "You're welcome. Yes, ma'am. Right now, the way the policy for trip provision is that once you register, you are able to switch the type of transportation once during the year. And the reason that we do that is so that we have one constituent who is registered in two programs when we're having an issue with utilization. So we just try to manage that in that way. But they are able to switch the service."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "All right. And then as -- thank you for that --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "The Star Line?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Yes."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So -- and I'll -- Ladisa and Kweli can certainly chime in here. So a couple of things impact the Star Line. One, I believe we have three -- five, we have five constituent -- five employees. It is a call center setup. These calls on average, I would say, take anywhere from average probably 20 minutes, could go even longer because they're assessing a situation. When, with the number of seniors in Fulton County and the popularity of the Star Line, when the constituent is unable to reach someone, they're on the phone with another constituent talking through their situation. It's an assessment. And so it rolls over to a telephone voicemail, and then all of those staff will then return the calls for the seniors. So it's just been an issue of trying to manage the volume with the number of staff that are there because of the popularity and because of the complexity. We have calls from other states, where the child or the loved one lives in another state, their loved one lives here. And so they're pretty complex. It's normally not just, what's the number to a senior center, it's a situation that requires an assessment. And so the amount of time that each of these staff are on the phone is significant. And that is why, in many cases, you may not get a live person on the very first call. But they are five live people that answer the phone."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "And they're calling people back on --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "-- it's, they need to leave a message though?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, ma'am."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So that they can get that call back."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "That's right. And I know they get -- the seniors get frustrated with needing to leave a message, or the fact that the phones are tied up for significant time. But the staff do a really good job of calling back and providing that same care, time, and attention to that senior when it's their turn."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Good. Thank you so much."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I'm listening to this process of the Star Line. Is that -- is there an alternate online method available?"



**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "We certainly could create that. We do have our Fulton Cares app and some other web-based access points. The feedback that we get from most of our seniors is they want to talk to someone. But we certainly can direct them to that as an option."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I -- because I just wonder if that may, you know, cut out 20 or 30 percent of those calls --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- and callbacks, which would free up more time. And then to Commissioner Thorne's point, it might also help us create a database, a master database of seniors, so then we could be in a position where we wouldn't have to take eight months to do an assessment. We could just go through the database and know who qualifies or who doesn't."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And so, I think we can likely use technology to our benefit to make the process more efficient. And so, hopefully, we can -- we can look into that as well."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So the department does use a database. We just don't collect the income because it's not required for any of the other programs. When a senior registers for program, we use a web-based system to enter that information because we also use that to request reimbursement for our grants. And so, we do have to actually have information in a database. What we don't have is the -- the income information that would be required for the means test."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "So for small home repairs, you don't have to -- there's no income --"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "No, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Okay. All right, I'll leave it there. But I think it would be great for us to look at maybe trying to find a way to make that more efficient, creating a master database of seniors so that we can make that information readily available. And then, I mean, it would seem to me that we could make an announcement or let everyone know that they need to reregister by April. Like, I can't imagine it'll take eight months to do that. Hey, we're setting an April 1st deadline. If you want to still use this service, you need to reregister and give us your information, right?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And that, I mean, you know, eight months that, I mean, good God. There has to be a more efficient way to set a deadline and to still service everyone, and still allow everyone the time to reregister. And I would imagine that an April 1st deadline would allow enough time for that to happen."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "So we certainly can look at how we could make the process more efficient. Thank you, Mr. Commissioner."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay, real quick. I like that part about setting a deadline. So I think that's one approach. And I think the other thing to consider is if you get into, you know, the means testing stuff, and it becomes too difficult to administer, you just consider going to a flat rate across the board, you know, for -- for everybody, you know. And maybe it's somewhere in the middle of that, if that's what a lot of other jurisdictions do. I don't think that's probably that uncommon in this area. So I guess that's another alternative to explore as you get -- if you get into the study of it, it looks like, hey, you know, this is going to cost more to administer than, you know, than the practicality of it. "

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "So I'll leave it at that."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Other questions or comments? None? Nothing."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I like that idea. Maybe, it goes from a dollar to \$2.50 for everybody and then that still is another way to create more without rocking the boat."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote, please."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0909**: Request approval to renew an existing contract in the amount of \$6,780,913.83 with Transdev to provide transportation services for senior services and behavior health programs."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, Dr. Roshell, you want to start us off?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS:** "So, Mr. Chairman, this service is a part of the presentation that we just provided. This program provides the bus transportation to seniors going to different activities in the community, but more importantly, to our neighborhood senior centers, adult day, and our multipurpose facilities as well as our developmental disabilities training centers. We do not have a utilization or any concern with -- without -- with overspending on this contract. So we don't have any recommendations for adjusting it in any way today."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "What is the split between the number of users that use the bus service versus the number of users that use ride shares?"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "About 906 unduplicated Transdev riders total for this year and consider the 2,061 that just used Uber/Lyft in November. So the split is more seniors use Uber/Lyft than they do the Transdev service."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "That's an interesting dichotomy. We're spending twice as much for the service that's used twice as less. We're spending six million for 900 people, and we're spending three million for 2,000 people. Let that sit for moment. We're spending twice as much for half as many people. It might be better to go with all ride share."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir. The way we ended up with adding Uber/Lyft as another option, which is leading toward outpacing the cost of Transdev is just what you said, the cost of that program. What we did is we had a period of time that we shifted as many riders as possible to the Uber/Lyft program, but we do have a group of constituents that are unable to use Uber/Lyft; namely the adult day, the behavior health, and developmental disabilities clients; our clients that are going to dialysis. And so, as we ran the analysis, we were unable to shift every constituent to Uber/Lyft. And so, we needed to maintain the Transdev service so that we could serve what is much more of a unique population with special needs."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I mean, I think certainly the special needs people that might need special transportation it makes sense. But I'm just looking at the, you know, this trip cost of what, \$19 to \$20 per person on Uber/Lyft."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir, one way."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "So that's basically \$20, so about \$40 per person for round trip?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "On average. And it does fluctuate based on peak times of the day and things of that nature. But, yes, sir, that's correct."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "And so that means about \$80 per trip for those - and so, the only one of those -- are all 900 special needs?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "No."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Do we know the percentage of the 900 that are special needs?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS:** "We can certainly give you the breakdown of the developmental disabilities, dialysis, and the adult day. The other riders are community riders who, as with Uber/Lyft, grocery store, medical appointments, pharmacy, things of that nature; and attending our neighborhood senior centers, which is a vital connection for many of those seniors. They are a bit more frail than the seniors who are in multipurpose; and then the other component of that ridership are those that go to the multipurpose facilities. But we can give you the analysis of which -- what that breakdown of ridership by those service times."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you."

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "And the majority of the neighborhood senior center participants do heavily rely on the bus service to get to and from the centers."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you. And that will make me ask though, what -- if it's only 900 people and you say that's the majority of the people that use it. So then I want to know: what's the number of people going to the neighborhood senior centers? Because it's only 900 people who we're talking about."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS:** "We certainly can provide the performance data on the neighborhood senior centers. We certainly saw a decline post COVID. Our vendors have been working to reestablish the connection with seniors in the community for the neighborhood senior centers."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Good question, Commissioner."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Dr. Roshell, is it true that this is our most vulnerable population that we're talking about?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS:** "For Transdev?"

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Yes. When we're talking about the 900 -- are these not individuals that are going to dialysis; the individuals may need additional -- I don't want to say special handling, but I just can't articulate what I'm feeling right now, so I'm trying to -- trying to choose my words carefully."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS:** "Most of them need -- they use Transdev because of -- for a variety of reasons they may need. We have a bus monitor on Transdev. And so, that's important for many of the constituents that ride. We also have the chairlift, things like that."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Exactly. These are not particularly people just standing there waiting to be picked up and get on. These are some individuals that may need some type of assistance."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS:** "The majority of them do, but we do provide the service for any constituent."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Okay. I just want to -- I want to be crystal clear what we're having a debate or conversation about. And with all due respect, if we're talking about a -- a group of individuals that would not have this service, probably if Fulton County did not provide it; to me, that is more detrimental. And so, let's -- let's be objective when it comes to the dollars and what we're spending, because we're talking about a more vulnerable population; a population that probably has to have bus monitors or the additional help in getting on/off into their destination. And so, let's, here again, with all due respect, dollars and cents. I don't want to talk dollars and cents when it comes to people who, in Fulton County, did not have this. More than likely, they would not get the services that they need. And so, here again, I want to be crystal clear where I am on this. Fulton County is the leader when it comes to individuals needing to get out, needing that special accompaniment or whatever it is in order to get back and forth. And so, I understand there's a dollar amount to everything that we do; however, the less of these -- please understand that's what we're talking about, colleagues. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yeah, I mean -- I was going to say a lot of what Commissioner Arrington has said that, you know, this is -- to me, the issues here are separate from the other one, right? I mean if this is -- you know, this is something that we need to do, we get lot a grant money for this, right? More so than we get for the Common Courtesy stuff, correct?"

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS/PUBLIC WORKS:** "Yes, sir. At one point, the Aging Services grant did provide certain money for our Uber/Lyft. They discontinued

that, so all grant -- the grant is primarily now only for Transdev, or it is only for Transdev."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "So part of that does go to kind of what Commissioner Abdur-Rahman is saying is -- this program, while everybody's technically eligible really, what it was set up for, was to get at folks who were particularly vulnerable, you know, who did need special assistance with transportation, right? So, I would caution us to be -- caution us to try to do too much to try to force on that issue. We did go through the whole process of seeing who was eligible for either -- who could fit for Common Courtesy, because well, they're plenty of people that would not be a good model for them to be taking their trips on, so. What portion of this is roughly grant funded right now, of this particular contract?"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "About 1.4 million is grant funded."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "That includes the state money we get from --"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "That includes the State Older Americans Act funding and the Department of Human Services funding."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "And that includes ARC? We get some money for ARC, too, right?"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "From?"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Don't we get some money from Atlanta Regional Commission?"

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "The Atlanta Regional Commission is the -- yes, that's the Older Americans Act."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Got you, okay. All right, thank you."

**LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES:** "Federal and State."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Other comments or questions? All right, the motion on the floor is to approve. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays -- unanimously with Commissioner Arrington."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Item moved up by Vice Chairman Ellis on page 18, bottom of page 18, **23-0967**: Request approval of a Resolution to redirect funds from the budget of the Magistrate Court to the Superior Court to seek expedited legislation to expand the role of judicial officers in providing support to the Fulton County Superior Court, to seek expedited legislation to provide the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County be appointed rather than elected, and for other purposes, sponsored by Commissioners Barrett and Ellis."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, Commissioner Arrington followed by Vice Chair Ellis."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Mr. Chairman, I'm going to do a motion to divide. This is like at least three or four different issues. And so, I'm calling for --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "-- you can ask for a division."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Yeah. A division of all of these, they're separate issues."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. So what's first?"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "It looks like there's a -- the first one is approval of a Resolution to redirect funds from the budget of the Magistrate Court to the Superior Court. It looks like the second division is to seek expedited legislation to expand the role of judicial officers in providing support to the Fulton County Superior Court; and it looks like a third is to seek expedited legislation to provide that the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County be appointed rather than elected."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Let's take -- those are the three items that are contained in this legislation. Request has been made for a division which the Commissioners can make that request. It does not require a vote. Let's take the first one first. Repeat the first one, Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Request approval --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Let's limit our comments to this first one."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Request approval of a Resolution to redirect funds from the budget of the Magistrate Court to the Superior Court."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, Commissioner Arrington you still want to --".

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "-- yes. It is a sad day in Fulton County. And I'm going to lay the blame at my feet and our feet. The Magistrate Court has been asking, literally begging for additional funding and additional staff, and additional resources for at least five years. We have paid for at least one, if not two, mediations. Some tried to



make this out as if it were a personality conflict between two people. I don't think it has anything to do with personality; this is frankly, a lack of resources issue. The judges of the State Court and the Superior Court both have staffs of four or five people each. The Magistrate Court judges don't have any staff. And some will say, oh, well those are noncomplex cases; but the volume of the cases that they have -- even if their cases themselves are noncomplex -- the volume of the cases and the paperwork that is required for those cases would seem to mandate that they would have the same staff as other judges. And so, it's also a failure of this Commission for not adopting the recommended millage rate, because if we had the recommended millage rate, we probably could provide the bodies that are needed. And so, I'm not going to be able to support this because number one, the language that's included in the Resolution I don't agree with. I don't believe any of it is true. In fact, I know some of it is untrue based upon my experience of being here and serving as a practicing lawyer in Fulton County for the last 27 years. This is a lack of resources. Someone comes down and begs for additional staff for five years and, at one point, we actually gave an extra 19 people. When the Magistrate Court Clerk function went from state court to Superior Court, pursuant to the appointment by -- by the Chief Magistrate of -- Ms. Robinson as the Clerk of Superior Court as the Clerk for Magistrate Court. There were 39 positions that were transferred that were previously been dedicated to the Magistrate Court. And I believe a year later we allocated an additional 19 staff members for Magistrate Court that's a total of 58 positions. And yet, when there was this dispute over staff and people, no one wanted to provide any additional resources to the Magistrate Court. A court that handles more cases than the other two courts combined. More cases than the other two courts combined. And so, I'm not going to be able to support it. The language in the document, again, is just inflammatory and inaccurate. The other thing we have to consider is that there are -- we're potentially setting ourselves up by doing this to having to pay two people. I mean, these magistrates are on four-year terms. So we're going to have magistrates -- we're going to pay for magistrates and judicial officers at the same time? Because just because you go hire some judicial officers doesn't mean you don't have a four-year contract with these magistrates over here. We received previously in years past, all of the data from the Magistrate Court and why this stuff was necessary. Frankly, this is retaliation. This is retaliation against our Chief Magistrate because she decided to appoint a clerk, and she is allowed to do by law. There is a specific law that allows the Chief Magistrate to appoint the Clerk of Magistrate Court. It is the only law that exists. She is the only person that can appoint a Magistrate -- a Clerk of Magistrate Court. There is a law that allows the Superior Court Clerk to appoint a successor as Superior Court Clerk. That law does not say that a Superior Court Clerk can appoint a Magistrate Court Clerk. In fact, there is no law in the state of Georgia or the United States of America that allows a Superior Court Clerk to appoint the Magistrate Court Clerk. It doesn't exist. It does not exist. Now, arguably, when a Superior Court Clerk appoints a successor, arguably, you can say that that person may take over the roles and duties of that former clerk that they are succeeding, but that doesn't mean that that person can be called the Clerk of Magistrate Court. That might mean that they were assuming those duties, but only the Chief Magistrate has the authority and the ability to appoint a Clerk of Magistrate Court; that is the law. It is plain

and it is simple. Not anyone here could cite to you anything that says a Superior Court Clerk has the authority to appoint the Clerk of the Magistrate Court. No one can cite any law, rule, or case that authorizes such. It doesn't exist. But there is a law that allows the Chief Magistrate to appoint the Clerk of the Magistrate Court. And so, this is an attempt -- or this is an act of retaliation against our Chief Magistrate for doing what she's allowed to do under the law. And it is a shame that we are doing that, or that there are people that are doing that instead of giving her the resources and the people that she's been asking and begging for, for the last five years."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. As a reminder now, the issue before us now, the first of the three, is to redirect the funds from the Magistrate Court to Superior Court. Vice Chair Ellis, you have the floor."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yeah, Mr. Chair, I understand that you request that we speak on one issue at a time, but I think they're so interwoven it's going to be hard to kind of do that, so."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Not really."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "No, they kind of all kind of go together, and I think particularly, you know, the first three of them sort of go to -- two of the three particularly go together. So, you know, this is a sad day, and this Board shouldn't take any responsibility whatsoever for why we're up here talking about this today. This is something that's been plain and simple. A distraction has been created by the decisions of one individual in the way that they've chosen to conduct themselves. So this action is not been hastily put together or developed. But instead, it's been well earned by the behaviors of unfortunately, you know, our Chief Magistrate Judge, and her inability to work with others in the judicial system and the complaints that we've had. None of us was seeking out this issue. But it's come from the complaints -- the multiple complaints we've had from different people in the judicial system including memos and so forth that we received from our Chief Judge of the Superior Court, other appointed court officials, citizens whose lives who have been impacted by the actions or inactions of this particular court. In fact, this court has received additional resources. In fact, significant additional resources, to the tune of over the past several years, you know, we've increased specifically the Magistrate Court's budget 73 percent since 2019. Seventy-three percent, that's a fact. Allocated personal resources are up 44 percent, fact. Civil case disposals, you think that they would be up, but they're on target to be seven and a half percent less than they were in 2019, okay. You know, so, we have an infrastructure that's in place that the Magistrate Court can choose to operate within and be efficient within. And there've been moments in time where there's evidence that that works. But apparently, she's chosen to slow it down by cutting down on court-appointed slots, et cetera. Her funding has been there. As respect to the actual clerk itself, let me read something from that we've received from our County Attorney. In the Resolution that's here, it speaks to really four different issues. In the first issue, it speaks to is this issue of the clerk and who handles the clerk's responsibilities. This Board took action in 2016,

via Resolution 16-0263, to appoint the Clerk of Superior Court to serve as the Clerk of Magistrate Court. That function was previously part of the State Court. This was done at the request, ironically, of Judge Kirk. Okay, so that's where it rested. It's not with the individual, but with that particular office. The fact that there's a new party in that office doesn't mean a hill of beans. She's still the clerk of that. So this order that -- this so-called order that Judge Kirk is supposedly pushing out there is moot. It's irrelevant and a distraction. And it's impractical to say you've got to unwind. Whatever it is 40 or 50 people, and move them over somewhere else, all that's impractical. And the back-and-forth of that, you want to talk about something that's a personality conflict; it appears that that's where the personality conflict lies, in her inability to not get along with other people, all right. So there is legislative, you know, precedents for us, to do what we did; we put the clerk -- you know, we've assigned this court responsibilities to the clerk of Superior Court, that's where they rest, that's where they lie. This order is moot. The Resolution speaks to that. Second, we received a letter from -- a memorandum from our Chief Judge of the Superior Court. And the second two items were to deal with this particular issue, both the transfer of funds for the equivalent of three full-time Magistrate Judges, to the Superior Court so they can handle these Superior Court noncomplex cases, and also as for expedited legislation relevant to judicial officers. I'm going to read to the public so they have it, so they understand this isn't us up here making this up. This is the Chief Judge of Superior Court who is a superior, you know, officer in terms of the judicial pecking order, and the Chief Judge of the Magistrate Court. And this thing comes from not only him, it comes from the vote of his entirety of the Superior Court elected judges who all are all elected, okay. As a bench, we have unanimously -- let that sink in -- voted to respectfully ask you to redirect funds for Magistrate Court to Superior Court, and to support expedited legislation to expand the role of judicial officers in providing support to the Fulton County Superior Court. We take no position on any legislation that seeks to change the elected status of the Chief Magistrate Judge. I wanted to send a quick note dispelling a possible misconception. Superior Court is no longer in discussions with Magistrate Court about renewing and extending the judicial support Magistrate Court has provided our court over the last decade or so. After recently receiving word from the Chief Magistrate, the critical support might be cut off or drastically reduced; I did have several conversations with the Chief Magistrate about ways to possibly salvage the program. However, those meetings left me and my colleagues un-persuaded that Superior Court could reasonably rely on continued support from the Magistrate Court, and that it would be the wiser, sounder, and more dependable option to pursue funding for our own independent judicial officers to preside over preliminary hearings -- hearings in our noncomplex division. Our colleagues in State Court charted such a court several years ago, and it has served them well. We hope, with your support, to do the same. So the first of the two items that are requested here, one was -- the first piece just reasserts like it was upset about the Clerk to Superior Court serves as a Clerk of Magistrate Court end of discussion. The second two have to do with the specific requests that were made to us by the Chief Judge of Superior Court which I just read and we've all received memos on. The fourth is on the elected piece. I'll stop talking, I won't go into that particular discussion, and we can have a separate discussion on that, but I did think the other three were relevant."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Commissioner Dana Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Thank you, Vice Chair Ellis for giving such a thorough breakdown of how we ended up in this position. I don't have a lot to add, I just want to reiterate the fact that this was in response to the memo we received -- the original memo we received from Chief Judge Glanville that's dated December 12th in which he conveys that the Chief Magistrate announced in front of witnesses that support would be eliminated or reduced significantly for preliminary hearings and noncomplex division cases and asking specifically for three -- the funding for three justices be moved to his budget and, again, the legislative change that Vice Chair Ellis laid out. But I also want to share the consequences that Chief Judge Glanville shared with us if the Chief Magistrate were to eliminate or reduce those services significantly, and they were not picked up with that additional funding by Superior Court. What he said was, and this is directly from his letter: Three things will flow from this unwelcomed change if some other source of judicial assistance is not found. First, the noncomplex division will be shut down. They cannot function properly without two judicial officers. Second, criminal cases will move much more slowly as each Superior Court Judges docket will be 50, 60, 70 percent more congested. Third, the jail population will grow. The jail population will grow. Reversing the current positive downward trend as slower case processing resulted in longer waits for dispositions. We have made great strides in reducing the jail population in particular over the last month, month and a half, two months. Judge Glanville is specifically saying the actions announced by the Chief Magistrate will cause the jail population to grow. This memo was the impetus for Vice Chair Ellis and I to take action. The issues about the clerk and not the clerk are secondary by far, if not tertiary, or really not relevant to this, especially this divided now issue that we're talking about. We're talking about responding to an entire bench of elected Superior Court judges who have asked this funding to be moved to them so that these services are not significantly reduced or eliminated by the Magistrate Judge thereby causing the jail population to grow. That's what we're trying to achieve with this, and I agree with Vice Chair Ellis that we could've taken the first two together because both of the first two parts of the Resolution we put forward are directly in response to the entire bench of the Superior Court. And I think it speaks for itself. So that's all I have right now."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "You know, I have received so many calls, many e-mails. I have actually been in stores and people have stopped me with this issue. As much as we want to take this separately, we've got an issue here -- let me deal with the bigger issue. The bigger issue is the lack of an understanding whether it was something that lapsed and we didn't get on top of it. When I say we, I mean this Body, I do not mean me. And it has made it a very sad situation in that the relationship is damaged. I can promise you some things I agree with Judge Kirk on, and some things I don't. But just as sure as my braids are blonde and I love snacks, she not going

nowhere. Judge Kirk is not going anywhere. And so, it would behoove us as this Body to find a solution. We can point fingers all day long as to how we got here; however, who is going to come with the solution. I don't have a dog in this fight, but when you're talking about actions that affect another court, I have to look at that separately from the personality; I have to look at that separately for the call for resignation; I have to look at that differently. And like I said to Judge Glanville, my phone has rung on this issue, and this issue has become bigger than it should be. It has been convoluted, because individuals have been irresponsible with their responses. Now, whoever you want to say those individuals are, I will leave that to your imagination, but I don't want to get in the fray with anybody. What I want to do is find out if, in fact, I support the funding to go to Judge Glanville what they need over there, does that mean I'm supposed to be punitive to Judge Kirk? Does that mean I'm not supposed to listen to any cries that she has for budget concerns? Does that mean that we are supposed to not look at our duty of trying to make things better for the taxpaying citizens of Fulton County, because I promise you there's a chance we may end up in court about this; and it should not rise to this occasion. Now, I may be alone on an island saying that, but guess what, I've been alone before, so it doesn't matter to me. What matters to me is that I'm having to answer questions dealing with race when this should not be an issue about race. I'm not even saying that it's an issue about race. But perception becomes reality in our community when we are not prudent in our responses. This is an elected judge that has supporters in the community; and to call for her resignation caused unintended consequences and problems that we should not be dealing with. We should be looking for answers. So I'm going to go on record asking the County Manager -- I don't want to put you -- or maybe I should do it to Sharon, I'm going to put Sharon on the hot seat -- but y'all have been on the hot seat before: If, in fact, they way this is written, if we in fact pass this today, does that mean that we cannot look at any funding of anything with the Magistrate Court of what Judge Kirk may need?"

**SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER:** "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, if I understand your question: If the Board passes this Resolution today, it would direct us to move the requisite funding from the Magistrate's office budget to Superior Court. Because the Board has not acted on the budget in its final form, I do not think it would preclude the Board from taking some subsequent action for funding for the Magistrate Court or the Superior Court."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "That's what I needed to hear. My position on this is that we do what we need to do and, Chairman, I feel you're looking at me, but I going to say it anyway: We do what we need to do for this situation with Judge Glanville to be put to rest, and we some kind of way open up the lines of communication with an elected judge, whether you like her or not, whether you think she's not doing her duty or whatever is not the issue at hand. The issue at hand is this Body must get past this. And so, I'm asking -- I will support what we need for Judge Glanville. I will not support turning this into an appointed position because I believe that gives us a precedent that we should not have. I believe the voters of Fulton County are smart enough, and they have a duty to vote their mind up or down. So I'm going to support this with the



understanding in this public forum that because we have not finalized the budget, that we are open to a conversation with Judge Kirk of what we're taking away; but right now, I have to do what I need to do, and that is to support -- I don't like being put against one judicial partner against another. I think that we -- when we begin to take that posture, we start advocating our duties. This is my personal opinion. And so, what I would ask, do what we need to do for Judge Glanville and the Superior Court, keep the door open for actual -- what Judge Kirk may need, and I can support that. Thank you, Mr. Chairman."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Again, the issue before us now whether or not to direct the funds from Magistrate Court to Superior Court. Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "One thing that was kind of mentioned by Commissioner Ellis that -- that we've increased the spending 73 percent since 2019. And I remember, I wasn't a Commissioner then -- but I remember Judge Kirk coming down here asking to retain some positions, and looking at her record of case closed and cases open and how well she did in 2020, she had a total number of cases, filed 49,437 cases closed, 49,237. That just left -- that was a 99.6 percent closure rate. And she still has all this money, and so it puzzles me how this year we're not in COVID, and now she has a 64.45 percent closure rate. Did someone mention that it was intentional? Like what, does anybody know what the evidence there is to why she has 26,000 cases open right now, given the funding that she has right now? Last year, she only had 7,284 open. She had a 90 percent closure rate. Now she's at a 64? I just see there is a lot of dysfunction in our court system, and it really is frightening to think that our jail population is going to increase more. So, if we can take actions to prevent that from happening to get our -- all of our courts working better and better together, then I will support this. Unless I can get some explanation as to increasing our funding is going to all of a sudden bump up her closure rate, getting her own clerk is going to up that, it almost seems that it is intentional that her clearance rate isn't as good this year as opposed to last year, and especially when she did so well in 2020."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I talked about how sad this was when I first started, and I don't know whether to laugh or cry. It's funny. It's really funny, because what is being proposed right now isn't even allowed under the law. They got to go try to seek to get the legislature to pass something to allow these judicial officers to hear it. So they want to transfer the money away from someone who's allowed to hear the cases in the hopes that the legislature will pass something that will allow someone else to hear it and then hope that the Governor will sign it. Do you know how many blocks down the chain that has to go? And they're going to take away money from someone who's actually providing the services now? In hopes of getting the legislature to pass it, in hopes of getting the Governor to pass it, when does that happen? They're not even in session. When does that happen? When is this session over? When does the Governor sign it? Who hears the cases until then? You take the money away from

Magistrate Court, who's going to hear the cases until the law passes? Until the Governor signs it? Who's going to hear them? It's crazy. This is insanity. Perhaps it might make sense if the law got passed and the Governor signed it, it might make sense to propose this. But to propose taking money away before there is a law that is even passed; to propose taking money away before the Governor signs that law -- signs that bill into law; it doesn't make any sense. We don't know when that would happen. We don't even know the effective date. That could be June or July before it becomes effective, but we've transferred all the money away. It makes no sense. You don't put the cart before the horse. You put the horse in front of the cart."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Natalie Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I think it was stated that Judge Glanville is in need, and I'd like to know what he's in need of? Anybody? I'm sorry?"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "I think it's in his memo that he sent to all of us, what he specifically asked. What I just read. It's in the Resolution. I mean, so if he's crazy, I guess --"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "-- oh, he asked for this Resolution?"

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "He asked for what's in the first two components of this Resolution are straight from his memo that he asked us for."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So, I don't --"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "-- and if he's crazy, go ahead and tell him."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I don't have anything to do with that statement, but anyway none of the nonsense and childishness. But if Judge Glanville is in need of something, we need to address it, but taking something for one court and giving it to another court is not what we need to do. If Judge Glanville needs something, I'm all for supporting, giving him what he needs, but I'm not in support of removing what is needed for another court to do the job that they are doing. So, if we could address Judge Glanville's needs separately, then I'm all for that, and you can say what you want, you can word it the way you want to, but this is literally taking from one court and giving it to another; leaving the court that is no longer going to have what they need in a bind. That's not something that I want to be responsible for. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay, first off, this is not creating something. This is just moving the responsibilities that one-person and party is supposed to be doing with the funding that they have for it, to the other court who will now be taking it over. So, if you're taking responsibilities away, it's fair to move money away, that's what life's about."



We've over complicated this thing, this isn't a personal issue. I think our Chief Judge has clearly laid it out, so if he's crazy, then you can go tell him that. But I think the wording on these two items are proper, in order, and let's vote on it."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "So I just want to be crystal clear. To seek expedited legislation to provide that the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County to be appointed rather than elected that is out of -- that is not what we're voting on right now, correct?"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Correct."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "That's correct."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Okay. That's what I want to be crystal clear about. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I'm going to call the question."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Is there a second? All right, I'll second. Let's vote on the call of the question."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay. And the vote is open on call the question."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Madam Clerk?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open on the call the question. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, the motion on the floor is -- actually, the motion on the floor is to approve by Commissioner Barrett. Is there a second? Seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Let's vote. The motion is to approve."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Point of order, Mr. Chair --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "-- no discussion on this. No discussion."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "We have to know what we're approving, because we had division."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "We're voting on the first one, the first item here, redirecting the funds."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "That's all."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the motion to redirect funds passes; four yeas, two nays."

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "I'm sorry, for some reason, my abstention did not take."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And one abstention. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Next item, number 2 in the Resolution."

**CLERK GRIER:** "To approve to seek expedited legislation to expand the role of the judicial officers in providing support to the Fulton County Superior Court."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Barrett. Is there a second? Seconded by Vice Chair Ellis. Any discussion? All right, the motion is to approve. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, two nays. And to approve to seek expedited legislation to provide that the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County be appointed rather than elected."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, motion to approve by Vice Chair Ellis. Is there a second? Seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** (Inaudible.)

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "No? Comments or questions? Any comments? Commissioner Abdur-Rahman?"

**COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN:** "Are we -- are we able to -- are you all open to a hold? I really do need to get some additional information before I vote on this. Are you open to hold? Yeah, I want to make a motion to hold this."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. There's a substitute motion to hold. Is there a second? Seconded by Commissioner Barrett. All right. Vice Chair do you want to be heard?"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yeah, I'm fine holding the discussion, but I do want to go on record and just say this about this, because there's a lot of misinformation about this. Look, prior to, I think 2015, this was not an elective role in 2015, 2016."

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY:** "That's correct, 2015."

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "Right. So we had this structure of a nonelected Magistrate Court Judge that was appointed by the State Court. Bear in mind, the State Court, those judges, they're all elected, right? So there's representation. It's just -- hey, this hasn't worked, right? We had something that would have worked a whole lot better. This is a train wreck. And, you know, I think we should consider just going back to what we had. It's still managed by elected officials. You know, this wasn't -- you know -- ironically, this was put forth by, you know -- a funny thing, you know, people try to paint this as sort of a racial issue was put forth by a white Republican legislature -- legislator, and ran through by the Fulton County delegation who had control at that point and time. So, you know, to try to paint this as some sort of a race issue is, you know, that's a -- that's a nonstarter. This, you know -- the concept behind this would be really to say, hey, would this not operate better, you know, under a structure where it sits under the management of State Court like it did before, you know. I think we can have further discussion on it. Obviously, legislation takes some time so, you know, so -- so be it on that. You know, hey, the legislature, they could choose to take this action without our asking for it, you know, as well as well. So that's what they did in the past, so I'm fine holding."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, the motion on the floor is to hold. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. It's 1:37, next item."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Back on page 14, County Manager's Items, 23-0948: Presentation of the Fulton County Operational Report."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Well, wait, I thought there was another. There was another one that was to be moved up."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Do you want to do that one now or?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, what's your pleasure? It's 1:38. Do you want to recess now? All right, I'll entertain a motion to recess for lunch and Executive Session. We'll take up items of real estate, litigation, and personnel."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open."

(Executive Session began at 1:40 p.m.)

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, without objection, we will resume the regular order of business. Madam County Attorney, items for Executive Session."

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Thank you, Chairman Pitts. Number one is there a motion to approve the request for representation in items one and two of the Executive Session agenda?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Barrett, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes, six yeas, zero nays."

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "And regarding item number five of the executive session agenda, is there a motion to approve a second extension of the lease agreement with the city of South Fulton for use of the Wolf Creek Amphitheater from January 1, 2024 through December 31, 2024, under the same terms as the current agreement?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "We have a favorable motion by Commissioner Barrett, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas zero nays."

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "No further action."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, continue, Madam Clerk."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay, the next item moved up on page -- page 19, Commissioner Thorne's discussion item, **23-0969**, Election Update."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, Commissioner, you have the floor."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Can I wait for --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "-- is that Ms. Williams?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yes. No, no we got to -- she was up here. Yeah, in the corner. Should we go to the next item then?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "So, where would you like to go, Mr. Chair?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Let's go to page -- let's go -- on page 14 --"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Point of order, my item was moved up and it's Open and Responsible Government item -- my three items were moved up."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "That's correct."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay. On page 18, Commissioner's Action Items, **23-0964**: Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners directing an external review of the Board of Ethics; and for other purposes sponsored by Commissioner Arrington."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay, Commissioner Arrington, you have the floor."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I believe that we need to have an audit of the Board of Ethics and their past decisions for the last ten years. They have shown a pattern of not following their own rules of not following Georgia law, the Georgia Constitution, the United States Constitution, the Georgia Open Meetings Act, the Georgia Open Records Act. And so, we need to have an audit of their past decisions and procedures to ensure that they have been following the rules which I know they have not because they don't know how to follow the rules. They make up rules as they go."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Is there motion? Motion to approve by Commissioner Arrington. Is there a second? All right, Commissioner Hall, you have a question?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I have a question about auditing our boards and authorities. Is this something that we regularly do for other boards?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "I'm not aware of a regular audit schedule for boards and authorities."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "For none of them?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "I'm not personally aware of any audits of a board and authority. It may have been done before my tenure."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Oh, it may have been done before your tenure?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "We should note that there's a caveat. The financial audits are done, but not audits of their substantive active actions."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Has there ever been a board that did not go by the Rule of Law and that went against what it's actually supposed to be doing? Has there ever been a report of something like this in the past?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Although I'm sure that most Bodies have engaged in some actions that may not be strictly compliant with all of the rules that apply, I don't know of another situation that's analogous to this one."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So as our County Attorney, do you agree that this board has done things that do not comply as it relates to what Commissioner Arrington has cited?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "This board, meaning the Board of Ethics?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "That's what this is about, right? Ethics Board?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Yes. I do agree with that. That as I've observed their handling of certain matters, recent matters that have been before them over the past two years, there have been instances where they have failed to comply with their own rules."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Ooh, okay. Thank you so much."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, other questions or comments? All right, the motion on the floor is to approve. Seconded by Commissioner Natalie Hall. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. The motion fails, two yeas, three nays."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Next item. Ms. Williams, come on up. What? Okay. Hold on Ms. Williams. We're going to finish with Commissioner Arrington."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0965**: Request approval of a Resolution to revoke every action taken by the Fulton County Board of Ethics from January 1, 2014 through December 20th, 2023, and for other purposes."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I wanted to do this based upon the results of the audit, but I guess there was no affirmative action on the audit. I guess I could just hold this action -- this item. "

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. We have a motion to hold. Without objection, it's held. Next one."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0966: Request approval of an Ordinance to amend Chapter II, Article III, Division II of the Fulton County Code to disband the Board of Ethics and to replace it with a slate of ethics hearing officers; and for other purposes."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you, Mr. Chair. I originally proposed -- had a different piece of legislation at the last meeting that would have allowed them the current groups that make recommendation to the Ethics Board to make new recommendations. The County Attorney thought that having hearing officers was a better approach similar to what we did with the personnel board. And so, I'm bringing this back for the Board's consideration. Again, they have violated the ethics codes on numerous occasions. They violated the procedures on numerous occasions. They violated the Georgia Open Meetings Act, the Georgia Open Records Act, the Georgia Constitution and United States Constitution including the Fifth and 14th Amendments by denying due process. There is no way that anyone in our county can have any belief that the Ethics Board is operating ethically if they do not follow their own rules. And so, as a result, I think they must be disbanded. Further, they have an absolute conflict because of the pending ethics complaint that I filed against them because of the lawsuit that they filed against me and one of my legal clients; and because of the lawsuit that I had to file against them on this Monday to prevent them from trying to listen to -- to prevent a group of lawyers and the judge from trying to listen to -- from trying to violate the attorney-client privilege. Imagine that. A group of lawyers including a former judge want to violate the attorney-client privilege. They have violated the attorney-client privilege today; somebody's going to violate their attorney-client privilege tomorrow. But either way, this board is absolutely dysfunctional, bias, or incompetent. They cannot follow simple rules. If there's a determination of probable cause, the complaint shall be dismissed and they shall send notice to the parties. What's difficult about that? How could that not be something simple that could be done by a group of lawyers and a judge? So, I hope that we will disband them and remove them. If not, then I'll just have the judge do it."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Other comments? All right, the motion is to approve by Commissioner Arrington. Is there seconds? Commissioner Hall, do you want to be heard?"

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I do have a question. So please explain the difference and why you suggested the hearing officers?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "They're really practical reasons. First, hearing officers would afford more than one panel, so that if there is any kind of conflict with one of the officers, they could recuse themselves and it would go to another officer; whereas, having just one Board of Ethics, if there is any conflict of any kind whether it's self-created by the board or just something that's in existence given the parties in the case; there is no place for the matter to go. The other was a concern about the fact that



these are term positions. And so, converting to hearing officers means that the position no longer exists; and, therefore, you don't need to wait until the end of the term in order to make a transition."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, any other comments? All right, the motion on the floor is approve; seconded by Commissioner Hall. Commissioner Ellis."

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "Just a couple of other questions for County Attorney. Do we -- are there examples of other Metro counties that have a hearing officer structure?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "There may be, but I'm not aware of any specific county that has it. The Board of Ethics is a creation of the Board of Commissioners; and, therefore, you could constitute it in any form that you so choose."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "But you're not aware of, you know, X, Y, fill in the blank, county that has this structure."

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "No, I am not."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "So some -- I mean -- are there -- we create, I guess -- it looks like we created -- we, being some Board of Commissioners many years ago created this construct. But other places has it been created by local legislation?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Okay. So I believe DeKalb County is an example of a place that's been created by local law."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "I mean, I'm potentially intrigued by the -- by the hearing officer concept. I'd want to see an example of, you know, metro county that's utilizing that and how it's set up and structured to better understand it. You know, so that's -- you know -- so I'm not prepared to act on this -- this kind of structured today, but I would be interested, you know, to learn a little bit more about that."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, Commissioner Barrett."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "I just have a question also. I'm not prepared to support this, given the language and a lot of what's in it, and it is a very dramatic move, but I am concerned that we don't have any way to enforce all of the Board's authorities and task force and such that we've created as a Body when they don't follow their own rules and procedures or the rules and the procedures that are set forth in their establishing legislation. So I guess my question is what is the mechanism to force compliance? Because we have a situation where, you know, you and I have spoken about this off line, Soo, and we agreed that they have -- and you even said here today -- made, you know procedural, and, you know, missteps and they have, you know, not followed their

own rules and there's certainly allegations of more of that in this -- in some one of these -- one of these three or all of them, Resolutions. And so, what we do if a board that we have isn't following open meetings, open records? I don't necessarily need you to answer it now, but I think maybe if, in the next meeting, you could come back with some kind of answer to what the mechanism is in general because if we don't have it for this board, we likely don't have it for any. And so, we need to be looking at all the enabling legislation and making sure there is recourse?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "So we can definitely do a survey of the enabling legislation for all of the boards to let you know what accountability is built into it. I would say that for the boards in which the members serve at the pleasure of this Body, that it's certainly an enforcement mechanism that's available. It just so happens that with the Board of Ethics that is not the way that they were established."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "So I guess the other question is, if we didn't go down this path of hearing officers, is there something that could be done to the, you know, to modify the legislation that, you know, that is the rules and procedures for the Board of Ethics such that there are consequences under its accountability."

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Certainly, we could look at changing the way in which either the members are appointed or build in accountability and measures. We'd have to research when that could apply and, certainly it would be prospective, but I have to research whether or not it applies after the end of the term of the folks who are in office now, so there would be those details to research, but we can include all of that in our report back to the Board."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Yeah, and the only other question I have is, has there been conversation back and forth with the current Board of Ethics in which they have acknowledged the procedural wrongdoings? Have they made any efforts to fix their processes so that this won't happen again?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "I'm not aware of any acknowledgment of the procedural deficiencies or the failure to follow their own rules and certain state laws."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "So they haven't acknowledged that they did not follow the rules?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "I will say I have not called them to ask if they will acknowledge it, but I have had some incidental communications with members and their attorney, and I have received no acknowledgments of these in part."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Okay. All right, thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The answer to your question, Commissioner Barrett, is that they are digging a deeper hole by now lying and trying to cover up their procedural errors that they made, which shows a present intent to deceive. And so, that is what really makes it worse that, you know -- it is frankly unbelievable what they have done and what they are doing. This is year four of a complaint that should have been dismissed within six months pursuant to the rules. The complaint shall be dismissed. I don't -- or investigation terminated. So they either should have dismissed the complaint or they should have terminated the investigation. There's no way around that. There's nothing that they can say, and they have no defense. And so, you know -- you know, I was looking forward to having hearing officers -- I did want to mention a couple of different things. One of the things that the State Bar does, is they separate the roles. They separate the investigative role from the judicial role. And the JQC does the same thing. They have officers that investigate the allegations, and then after those officers investigate the allegations, they then turn it over in the case of the State Bar to a Special Master. And so, we should, Madam County Attorney, look at splitting the investigative role from the judicial role. I think that will help as well. The other thing -- there was something else I wanted to say -- separating the roles, the investigative role, from the judicial role. I can't think of it at this moment. It slipped my mind. Hopefully, I'll think of it in a momentarily and get back in queue."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yeah, I just love -- the only thing also I just want to say is I would just -- I think it's worthy certainly of us to have a conversation around concept of hearing officers versus a board. But I do think we should dissolve, very carefully sort of tread into this with an entity which was set up to be an arbiter of complaints which could be leveled against us as well. So us taking action to alter the course of this or whatever, you know, it's -- we should just proceed with a lot of caution, you know, as we move forward with that and do it in a way that, you know, is responsible. I just -- you know, I think we just need to be very cautious as we go down this path. I recognize that there is a lot of frustration related to, you know, some existing matters in the way some of that stuff has been handled. But I also think we need to be very careful about our reaction to that and the pathway forward with it. But I do think that this hearing officers are something that merit some level of consideration, but I do think we need to -- it would be useful to see some other entity that's like us that's operating under that kind of structure, and to be able evaluate it and say, yes, this works and would be a responsible alternative to this. So that's what I'm looking at here."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Arrington."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Madam County Attorney, you mentioned DeKalb as a possible example of another group that might have hearing officers?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "No, as an example of a Board that was established through local legislation versus board action -- Board of Commissioners."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "But I don't know that DeKalb is -- is going to be the best example for you or for anyone to use. Didn't the court demolish that board because of the way that it was structured?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Yes, because there was an unconstitutional delegation of appointment. Powers to private groups, but I think when I mentioned them, it was in response to the question of are other boards of ethics created by local legislation."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "But why would you give an example of a board that's been dissolved by the court because it was done wrong?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Because it was established by local legislation. I think that was separate from the matter of hearing this."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Before or after the court got rid of it?"

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Commissioner Arrington, my question to her about were these things a creation of a county government legislation or a state legislation was more to get at the question, did we have -- would we have the authority to change this versus would some outside entity have to be required to act. That's why I asked the question."

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "I mean, I understand that, but I mean, the enabling legislation is a Fulton County legislation; it's our legislation. But I'm trying to understand -- I'm trying to understand was it created by local law or local -- by the delegation prior to or after the court blew it up? Because I think that would be relevant to knowing whether that was done or not. The court did, in fact, get rid of the DeKalb County Board of Ethics, correct?"

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY:** "Correct."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "I'm asking the question more in relation to can we be the one to alter course on this or does the state body need to, regardless of whether or not DeKalb handled their issue rightly or wrongly. That's the reason I asked that question, so. I agree that DeKalb generally is not a good example for (inaudible) reasons,"

**COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.:** "Well, I mean -- you know, instead of -- the groups that we have make recommendations to us and then we make a final determination. In DeKalb, they had the groups making direct -- they didn't have to even report back to the board. And so, even if that was done by local legislation or by the county, I don't think it's relevant because the court blew it up. They got rid of it because

it wasn't operating properly, which is the same thing we need to do here. Additionally, we've been waiting all year, and I hear you say -- what you're saying, Commissioner Ellis, about we need to move with caution, I thought that's what we had been doing this whole year when we didn't make those appointments that they were asking for. I thought that's what we were doing now. How long? Do we have to wait four more years? Do we have to wait 97 more years before we take action? How long is too long? How long can an ethics complaint stay open after it's supposed to be dismissed? How long? A month? A year? Ten years? This is year four and they're filing suits that they don't have the authority nor the standing to file. There's nothing in the code that says that they can file something against one of the parties that they're judging. Imagine any judge in America presiding over a case and filing a lawsuit against one of the parties that they're hearing in the case. You can't hear -- you can't file a suit against someone -- against someone and stand in judgment of them at the same time. You obviously are biased because you're filing a suit against them. The statute does provide for the parties or the board to have subpoenas enforced or squashed by filing with the Superior Court. They can file to enforce or squash subpoenas. That is the only authority that they are given. And if that is done, it is done under the name of the parties, the complainant and the alleged violator. It's not done in the name of the judge versus one of the parties. I have as much time as I goddamn want. Shit. Talking that shit. Look, these people have to go, they need to resign. They are wrong. They have violated every rule possible. They have violated the United States Constitution. They have violated the due process of law. They have violated the Georgia Constitution. They have violated the Open Meetings Act. They have violated the Open Records Act, and they have violated the Fulton County Ethics Code. They are illegal; they are unethical, and they all need to resign immediately."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I just want to clarify that the County Attorney has reviewed this and she has provided the input necessary to make sure that it is a responsible piece of legislation."

**Y. SOO JO, COUNTY MANAGER:** "It is a piece of legislation that this Board is authorized to pass if it so chooses."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "All right, thank you so much."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Thorne. All right. All right. The motion on the floor -- is she coming? The motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote. You still want to be heard, Commissioner Thorne?"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "No."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Madam Clerk."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; two yeas, five nays."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Next item."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Back to page 19, Discussion: Election Update, **23-0969**."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Thorne."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I just wanted Nadine to give us an update since she just completed the 2023 Election process."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Good afternoon. We're happy to give an update today regarding the December 5th Runoff Election. We conducted a Runoff Election for the city of Atlanta, East Point, Braswell, and South Fulton. Advanced voting location processed over 7,500 voters, absentee by mail processed over 2,500 ballots; all of our Election Day sites, we have a 111 locations that opened on time. We thanked the staff and poll workers that processed over 14,400 votes on Election Day; and our board-certified election on December 8th. And we'll take the questions at this time."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "So thank you for coming down here, and I'm sorry you came down here last time and you couldn't get through and we couldn't hear you. You were unable to make it for the recap of the normal Municipal Elections. So I just kind of want to review -- I'm not going to kill everything but Patrise did a great job of answering a lot of things. But the one problem I do have is with redistricting. You know, we talked about it in January, and I asked what was gone to be done to solve the redistricting issues that happened in 2022 May Election. And I just wanted to see if you've come up with solutions to fix redistricting errors that you had pop up once again in these Municipal Elections."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Right. So we're redistricting, some cities did do redistricting. We sent them a list -- a street maintenance list they were supposed to confirm and they did. Unfortunately, some of that data was incorrect. So that's where those problems stem from for this particular election. But, of course now, there is redistricting for 2024 through maps that we're waiting to get approval in regards that affects Fulton. We're working with GIS in regards to that. Although it is not a Municipal Election, we're still going to conduct maintenance -- street maintenance of all the cities again before 2024, so all of those concerns should be addressed."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay, great. So we should have no redistricting issues in 2024?"



**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "That is our goal."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "That's great. That's great. Okay. And one quick question on the recount. We had close races in East Point and city of South Fulton, and you decided to go down to do a recount since those races were so close. And the numbers changed a little -- well, first you lost -- or a box of ballots didn't get scanned and you had to go back and do another recount. And Patrise said you're going to set up some checks and balances so that wouldn't happen again. And then the second machine or the final machine count came up with a little bit bigger differences. So my question is, if the machine count one, counts them one way, and machine count two has a little bit differences in it, but you certified machine count two versus -- or do you know what happened, why the accounts were different?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Okay. So for all elections, when you see the results on election night, those are from the memory cards that are uploaded. The reason why we always ask for a recount from municipal was because we had margins of victory in one vote or 12 votes. And inside of those machines -- inside of the scanner, sometimes ballots can be trapped, sometimes they can be in the emergency bin. There also could be incidents where the poll manager could not scan the ballots at the time, so those have to be scanned in, so that's why the results change. For large elections, it's small, but it's always small. But for municipals, because like I said, the margin of error is so close, it could possibly change the election results. That's why we did the recount to reconfirm the elections results for -- for those elections. We actually had gotten requests from many candidates to do a recount, so we went ahead and honored that. And we would have had to do one anyway because some of them were within the margin of -- if it's within half a percent, you have to honor the recount."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "That triggers a recount, correct. So you said like ballots could be -- so the counts could be different because ballots could be trapped in emergency ballots box bins. Do you know where they were? Were those ballots --"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "We did not lose any ballots. What occurred with the recount there was one box that was omitted from the recount. It was there. It was never lost. It was omitted from the recount. So when we realized the numbers were -- there was a large difference, we went ahead and double checked and scanned that box in."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "But the count was different when you had all the ballots. The count was different from election night to the final count that you certified. It increased a little bit."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Yes. It increases -  
\_"



**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "-- and do you know where those extra ballots were? I mean it was only a handful I think for some reason."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "It was a handful. Like I said, those would be the ones that were in the scanners, and the managers have a green bag if they were not able to scan the ballots, they have a bag that they turn those un-scanned ballots into. So by the time we do all of those things, the numbers do change slightly."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. Because as a manager, I would have it written on there if I had any emergency; and before you could scan if you took them out of the emergency box and you scan them. The problem I had with our elections is -- and maybe you've changed this; you don't have the managers count the ballots before they turn them in. Actually physically count. They tell you just to write the numbers on whatever the machines are and stack the ballots up. I would always count my ballots in case there was one stuck in the scanner somewhere, in case there was one in the emergency bin, in case there was one that was foiled that somehow got lost, but that accountability needs to be there. But maybe the Secretary of State doesn't require you to physically count the ballots."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "No, it is not required."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay, Mountain Park. Could you discuss what happened in Mountain Park?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "For Mountain Park, there was a candidate who had withdrew from the race in the midst of advanced voting. That particular candidate did get some votes, maybe the second and third day of advanced voting; so when we did the count, his name was removed, but those votes have to go to him. So we had to put him back to make sure that his votes didn't go to anyone else."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. So that's good because I think DeKalb had issues. So you didn't remove his name or disable that candidate in the RTR module from getting votes, correct?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "No."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "You went ahead and let him get them."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "He was -- it was our -- advanced voting had already commenced when he withdrew from the race. So as per code, we are required to post notice that he has withdrawn. Any votes that go to him would not count, but those were posted as required."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. Okay. Well, thank you. So, I mean, this kind of falls into the next -- the next item on the thing, so we can maybe talk more about that. Milton elections, they're under attack, you know. Supposedly they didn't save as much money as they were supposed to save. You know, we had a Fair Fight and Democratic lawyers going to their meetings now. We have AJC, Up in Media, and Rachel Maddow bashing Milton elections, but they ran a rather successful election. They had about 3,600 people vote. They had no issues. I know the AJC hates to hear that. They finished counting. It took a little bit slower to do a hand recount. They finished at 12:30, and they spent \$115,000. If they've gone with Fulton County Elections, they would have been charged \$216,000. Have you come up with the MOUs for the cities?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "I have not. But we are more than happy to do any city's elections within our border. Any city that wants to do their own, we will support them. We're still required to support them in some capacity; so any city that's within our borders, we'd be more than happy to do their elections or support them if they choose to do their own, but I do not know what the cost was for Milton."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. Okay. I would just -- I would just encourage us to try to trim our costs as much as possible, and I believe if we can get away from the temporary staffing model that we could do that so that cities will want to come to us to run their elections. So that's it."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Thank you. Thank you, Ms. Williams. Madam Clerk, continue."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay, which items would you like to take up next?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Well, in order."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Can we do the temporary ones since Nadine is here?"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Yes. Ms. Williams, hold on."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay, on page 14, **23-0894**, Registration and Elections: Request approval of a statewide contract in the total amount not to exceed 12,831,466.31, to provide temporary staffing services."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I'm sorry. So I just had a question about this contract, because -- are you aware in 2021 what the state auditor's report said about temporary staffing, Carter Jones report?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "I believe the Carter Jones report stated that we were not to rely solely on temporary staffing, but none of our temps are managers. Because of the size of Fulton County, we will always need temporary staff which is the decision -- or the recommendation of this Board to diversify, which we have done. So there will be two staffing agencies and some of the employees will also come through the Fulton County HR."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yeah but, can you tell me why -- this is 12, almost 13 million. Back in 2021, it was a \$7.7 million contract. And now that we've diversified, it's almost double. So it's almost like we're doubling down on the Secretary of State's recommendation not to rely so heavily on temporary staffing. And that this contract is now almost \$13 million, up from 7.7 back in 2021."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "So we've increased -- I don't believe the Secretary of State's was referencing the cost -- the Carter Jones report. But nevertheless, we've increased the wages due to cost-of-living increases just to make us more attractable and to bring in more employees that want to work. We've increased like wages. So that should be reflected in that total."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay, but it's almost double, and that's only for six months, so are we looking at 26 million for the year next year and temporary staffing?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "This is for three elections that we're requesting approval for, for the March, the May, and the June election."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "So, and then for the General Election, the big election in November, you have to come back to us for more?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Yes, we will."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "At what point does it become profitable -- more profitable for us to operate in-house doing this like most counties do, because we're paying a 30 percent -- the staffing companies take about 30 percent."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Most counties use temporary staffing."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yeah, most of them use them for part of their things like logistics, but not for accepting and rejecting votes. Accepting and rejecting absentee ballots. Accepting and rejecting -- accepting or rejecting voter registrations. We use it for all aspects, so basically our election process."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "We do. And all of our elections is open and transparent. All of our employees take an oath. All of our

employees are supervised by permanent staff. And again, we're the largest county, and it would be very hard for us to do that with permanent employees that work year round. We would not have enough people to do all these functions with just --"

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "-- do all your employees abide by the laws of this state that they have to be a US citizen?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Yes."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "That they have to be over 16 years of age? That they have to live in our county or a neighboring county?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "I don't believe that the county requires you to be a U.S. citizen; that I'm not aware of. But all of our employees are US citizens, to be clear."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. The thing with this one staffing agency, Abacus, when we approved the contract this year, it was out of Morrow, but now it's out of Baltimore."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "They have two offices; their local office is in Morrow."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "So, but is the Baltimore office going to be running the staffing contract?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "We coordinate with the Morrow staff."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay, because when I worked and you guys had to quarantine the entire warehouse, there were people from Baltimore, Washington DC, all over the place, working in our warehouses. Is that going to happen again?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "I don't recall people from out-of-state be in our warehouse. That was three years ago, and I do not recall."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I think you were quarantined and Tia Bennett was running in your place, and airport bartender by the way. Are you going to have -- you mentioned having provisional clerks in every precinct?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Yes, we did. I put that in an informative memo."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "And what's the purpose of not -- as a manager, you can easily have an assistant manager be a provisional clerk."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "I understand it's been three years since you were a poll worker, but a lot has changed since then. There's been legislative changes. There's been -- there's a new voter registration system. So as a proactive measure, we've installed provisional managers to be there to assist voters. And, for the record, we've never have a voter complain and there were too many people there to assist them."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "I just -- see, as it comes to a cost issue because we're paying for 255 provisional poll clerks. You can easily run a precinct with six people; a manager, two managers, and three others, and then you always have the other local Fulton County employee in your precinct."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Right. But if the poll manager is assisting a provisional voter, that could take some time, and they won't be able to service other voters in the precinct. Therefore, we have that person there to assist the voter, call downtown, do what they need to do to verify them to avoid them having to vote provisional if possible. If not, then we -- so like I said, I do not want to have the other employees take away from the other voters that are currently on site."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "So the max provisional's I've ever had was when we had to keep the polls open and everybody had to be provisional after 7 o'clock, and maybe had eight provisional voters all day. Typically, it's two or three. So we're hiring a person for an entire day to sit there in case they have to do a provisional on Election Day."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Yeah, but the lower the number the better. Honestly, if even though we installed provisional managers, if that person is there and assisting voters, you would not see that number reflected because then they would've called downtown, verify the voter, and the voter would have voted on the BMD. So although you see a low provisional number, that doesn't mean the provisional manager had no work duties."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Well, they should all be in the poll votes. They should all be redistricting. It shouldn't be an issue. We shouldn't need these provisional. Are you going to recruit from a particular agency like you did absentee clerks, when you put absentee clerks in every precinct? You aren't going to be using the ACLU again, are you?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "No, we do not plan to have an absentee clerks."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Yes, but are you going to be employing the ACLU, the staff for the provisional."

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "No, we will not. They were very helpful, but, no, we will not need this this time."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "And you're going to have special training of the ACLU for poll workers, correct?"

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "I am not aware of any special training that the ACLU conducted."

**COMMISSIONER THORNE:** "Okay. So this just a big trust issue in elections, and I think if we could try to work around it like other counties, not have to pay overtime, we can bring the cost down significantly considering we're looking at spending maybe \$20 million on temporary staffing agencies. And we're paying them what, five, six million, to staff our elections. I just think it brings a tremendous amount of trust from the questions I get. And for years now, it seems like we've been saying let's get away and it just seems like now we're just hiring more and more. That's it, thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Thank you, Ms. Williams. "

**NADINE WILLIAMS, DIRECTOR, REGISTRATION & ELECTIONS:** "Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. The motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion fails."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Hold on, hold on, hold on."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, Madam Clerk, continue."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the motion passes; four yeas, one abstention. Four yeas, one abstention."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Next item on page 14, **23-0948**: Presentation of the Fulton County Operational Report."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Mr. Manager."

**DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Good afternoon, Commissioners. We've provided a new format to this report, and this will be the format going forward. You'll see that it's got three primary sections. One will cover

one of our strategic areas to highlight information. The other two will be constants, that will be on justice and safety, and then finance and purchasing. With Alton Adams transitioning now to focus on the replacement jail in early January, the justice section will be prepared by our strategy team; so that's Mike Rowicki and Steve Nawrocki. But the questions really should be directed to an appropriate justice partner that has responsibility and information in that area. So, hopefully, if you get the report prior to the meeting and you have a specific question, we'll be able to have that person here. We think this new format will give you a much more balanced view than one that's been heavily focused on justice, and it allows for us to talk about the strategic areas without having to have a separate item. Of course, we'll have finances, vacancies, emergency purchase orders, and contracts below a hundred thousand listed in the report, and I think that's good hygiene. For example, today, we're going to focus on health and human services as one of those strategic areas, and we'll have Dr. Roshell take you through a series of very quick updates on the behavior health crisis center, the South Fulton Development Disabilities Center, HHS at 4700 North Point, the clinic at Morehouse. So there's a lot of activity in 2024 and much to do. The one that, of course, that has been getting the majority of our attention this year has been the behavior health crisis center. Under Dr. Roshell's leadership, we go through a forced march on that every Tuesday. It's really looking at the three-dimensional problem of legislative funding which still we need additional funding for even though we had the major breakthrough with Jessica's leadership and the entire team and Pro Tem Jones' sponsorship, but we still need more building construction, which is now well underway and then staffing which is always going to be a challenge, but being led by Grady. ORCA continues, as you're well aware of, we're moving over 120,000 cases now. We do now have -- we're down to having 27,000 to dispose of. I think Alton will comment on this today, but you'll see 1,100 being removed in November, 27,000 to go. That pace will need to pick up and can pick up during the first part of '24 and then into the middle of the year. Keeping the hiring window open at the end of November really only netted to zero, with the exception of the magistrate adding four additional positions. So the broader justice system scorecard, however, does show some improvement in length of stay, that's good news for the jail. Unindicted percentages and clearance rates, and most importantly 700 in population drop at the jail, now under 2,000 at Rice Street is very good news. The jail blitz plan continues, and Joe Davis can comment on that when we get there. We've learned a lot in the first one that we went through at One North. It took about three months, now with much better coordination with the various vendors; we've completed Two South in one month. That's about what we anticipated. So we'll continue with that program going into 2024. We're also working about 1,100 work orders a month and continue to deal with vandalism on an ongoing basis. So Joe again can comment on that if there any questions. One of the things that we are -- and we always include in this report and we're taking on as a review of the ARPA budget. It's appropriate at this point in that we're nearing the end of that program. All those dollars either have to be spent or committed during 2024. We anticipate that we'll finish that review this week, bring back something the first of January before you decide on the budget. And we're looking at things like an ORCA extension as one use of those funds. Another would be a creation of a health reserve, which is mentioned a meeting



or so back. I think that it be a great opportunity. We can see some things that that can be used for, and then even something like summer youth. So we're trying to look across the portfolio of things, perhaps not included in the budget formally as submitted, but could be funded with reallocation of ORCA. And then obviously today, we do have another section on the 2024 budget. We look for and hope to having more feedback from you today. We did provide responses and actions that would have to be taken based on the last meeting again on our way to an approved 2024 budget. So, Mr. Chairman, what we're going to do today is going to shift to Dr. Roshell. We're going take again in this new format. I'll give you some highlights on Health and Human Services initiatives, and then we'll get any of the highlights that Mr. Adams wants to bring forward or Joe Davis in justice and jail blitz. And that should be a pretty succinct report."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, HHS:** "Thank you, Dick. So the entire group of HHS departments really delivered very high and impactful services in 2023. However today, I will focus on the projects that will deliver services to constituents that will assist them with getting the healthcare that they need. So the first project that you are aware of is the behavioral health crisis center. Our data tells us that there are over 50,000 --"

**DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER:** "-- can we move to page 6, Madam Clerk? There we go."

**DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HHS:** "50,000 constituents in Fulton County living with a behavioral health issue. So this facility will be the first in Fulton County. A recent study by the state indicates we actually need behavior health crisis centers in Fulton County to meet the demand. But this is, of course, an excellent start. We will provide 24 crisis beds and 16 crisis chairs. There will also be coordinated care in connection to community resources. As the County Manager indicated, \$15 million of ARPA funding has been dedicated to the infrastructure and construction for this project, and we currently have 11.2 million in state funding to support this project. Construction is underway. DREAM has done an amazing job with managing our construction contractor and keeping us on schedule to a substantial completion date of March 2024. We have selected Grady as the operator. They have significant expertise in this space. They actually manage inpatient behavioral health services at Grady Hospital. And so, with the suite of behavioral health services that we currently provide, all of those are outpatient services, and now we will now have an inpatient opportunity to serve constituents in Fulton County. As we have also indicated previously, this campus will be unique in that public health services that are currently operating from this facility will continue. That includes the WIC call center and administration of the WIC voucher, the Maternal Child Health Program administration, and the early hearing detection intervention program. We have also identified a community meeting space in the facility so that constituents in the community that have been accustomed to meeting at Oak Hill will continue to be able to do so. Next slide. Moving on to 4700 North Point Parkway, the schematic design for this facility has been completed. The department, DREAM has worked very closely with each of the departments to determine what kind of footprint

they will have in 4700. We will focus on moving services that currently exist in to 4700 first. We will prioritize those, and then we will evaluate how much we can do based on the bids that come in from for the design build. As you, I'm sure have heard, construction costs are continuing to escalate, and so we will make further decisions about how we will move forward with any additional components of this operation based on those bids. And so, what we're planning to move into the facility will be from North Fulton Service Center, all of the health services, public health, behavior health, and the DUI Court from our Royal Drive public health facility, the public health primary care services. From North Fulton Training Center, developmental disabilities will be moved into that location, and we are proposing to add senior services and additional wraparound services. The first component of construction is going to be updating the HVAC and mechanical system. That should be completed in March of '24 with the expected completion date of the entire facility in the first quarter of 2025. Moving on to our primary care clinic in partnership with Morehouse School of Medicine, Morehouse Health Care; we were able to open that facility on time as projected in October. That facility currently has a little over 100 patients who have come from two places, primarily from the community who are out of care, and then we have constituents who have chosen to receive their primary care services at the Buggy Works or this new facility because they are familiar with the brand. The services that we're offering are, of course, primary care, behavioral health screenings, preventative screenings, and other types of behavioral -- primary care services. We are going to be expanding the hours starting in January and the community health worker component. Those employees have been hired and are starting to do their work with the first constituents that are being served by this facility. At the five-year mark, we anticipate over 7,500 constituents will be receiving services and over 1,800 client visits per year. Moving on to a very new initiative, we are pleased to announce a Medicare mobile wellness program. One of the outcomes of the project care work that we've concluded earlier in the year was this notion of many Medicare beneficiaries who are simply not taking advantage of a primary care preventative, rather benefit, that's being offered by Medicare. Some of the reasons they don't take advantage of this, they included transportation and just lack of access points. So the Department of Senior Services, with the help of the purchasing department, released a solicitation for a partnership in the community that would bring the opportunity to take advantage of this benefit that's free to Medicare beneficiaries to our multipurpose facilities and our neighborhood senior centers. So starting in January, any senior who has Medicare or anyone who has Medicare, because some Medicare beneficiaries are disabled and not just by age, will be able to take advantage of this annual benefit which will include wellness screenings. It will also include a very important depression screening in connection to advance care services. Less than 25 percent of the 79,000 Medicare beneficiaries in Fulton County take advantage of this benefit every year, and so we are extremely excited to have the opportunity to make this benefit more accessible. Again, all of the four multipurpose facilities will be a part of this program, and we will also include the Dogwood Neighborhood Center, the New Beginnings Neighborhood Center, the Southeast Neighborhood Center, and we have future expansions planned for South Fulton for 2024. Mr. Chairman that concludes the update."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Are there any questions? All right, no questions. Thank you, Dr. Roshell."

**DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Mr. Adams, any comments on Project ORCA?"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS/IT:** "Thank you, County Manager. Mr. Chairman, what I will do is take three minutes and run through this very quickly. I will try to avoid repeating the update from the County Manager. Very quickly, on page -- if we can, page 17, 18, one more, one more. There you go. Today, we have disposed of -- as of November 30th, we have disposed of 121,000 cases of the initial 148,000 that we started with at the beginning of the project. It's a bit over 80 percent, and we continue to make -- to make progress. At this point in time we have 27,000 -- 26,943 pending, open, and active cases remaining in Project ORCA. The next slide shows the current status of the cases broken down by agency. I'd like to point out a couple things; one, is that the district attorney and the solicitor are a couple months away from disposing of all their cases in their particular category. That's significant, because what it means is that at that point in time, the individuals whose cases were made up the 148,000 at the beginning would, in fact, have that day scheduled for court, and that is a big milestone. And scheduled probably in advance of -- it would be two years or so that it would have taken had we not launched Project ORCA. The other thing I'd like to point out is that the largest remaining category is Magistrate Court, Judge Kirk's point earlier today; I believe that her team has identified some older cases that can in fact be closed out. So I expect that next month we'll see a significant decline in the number of remaining cases in Magistrate Court. The next slide, please. This gives you a quick sense of the pace of progress in the various agencies. I won't go into detail here. What it does point out is a couple of things: One, we continue to move ahead of plan as shown in variance column at the very end. And the very second, she's made good progress in November. We had a bit of a challenge in Magistrate Court, but hopefully we'll get back on track, because that's the largest remaining tranche of cases in the ORCA program. The next slide. As the County Manager alluded to, for the month of November, we basically had a net of four positions, and those were in the Magistrate Court. So the Magistrate Court is now fully staffed and, as you can see, for the most part, the departments are at or near the maximum that they'd been for 2023. Next slide, please. One more. As the County Manager mentioned, we've made an improvement in a number of the measures certainly versus the baseline. As he indicated, the average length of stay continues to decline. The number of individuals indicted or in jail without that or unindicted is about 24 percent. That's down from a high of approximately 35 percent a couple months ago. Clearance rates for felony criminal cases have continues to move in the right direction. Next slide, please. One more, thank you. Gives you a sense for the jail population. It is, in fact, particularly in Rice Street, the lowest that it has been in quite some time achieving pre-COVID numbers in terms of Rice Street. And as we sit here today, I think one of the things I'd like to point out is that there is no one sleeping on the floor at Rice Street, which is something that we have aspired to for a couple of years now. And

something that I think the Sheriff's Department and the justice partners ought to be proud of in terms of that being fixed, so to speak. As of today and actually this is of 12/13, we have about 2,770 individuals in the jail. That's down from a peak of roughly 3,700 people three or four months ago. A number of those individuals have, in fact, been released on electronic monitoring. It's also been a number of bonds and so on as the DA and the Sheriff and the public defender and the courts continue to work through cases and, in fact, identifying individuals whose cases they can in fact expedite. The next slide is just a chart representation of that graphical data. Page 27, next slide. Just gives you a quick look at the bed availability at the various facilities. This is monthly information. So it's as of November 30th, but it does give you a sense of the utilization of the beds at the various facilities that we use to house Fulton County detainees. Next slide gives you a sense for the breakdown of individuals -- oh, you skipped one. That's all right. We'll stay there. The next slide gives you a sense of the breakdown of unindicted individuals and their days in jail. Fifty percent of the individuals who are unindicted have been there 90 days or less, which is actually a good metric. We obviously would like to move the number down in terms of number of detainees who have been there between six and six months and a year; but certainly we appear to be moving in right direction. You, in fact, want to have that 90 days or less be the highest number possible. Next slide. Quick update here. You know we've talked about -- about the fact that the reducing the jail population moving through the cases through the system is often a function of singles and doubles and triples rather than homeruns. This represents a number of initiatives that we started seven or eight months ago. And I'm happy to report that each one of them in and of there in their own right have actually made significant progress. So, for example, we have one senior justice that has disposed of more than 80 cases. We added four senior judges a number of months ago. Forty-two superior court cases have actually been moved to state court. State Court says we'd like to take those on and they resulted in a number of dispositions. The C3 program, we've had 79 defendants, 124 indicted cases that have been represented by contract attorneys that Fulton County paid for. That's allowed us to move some of these multi-defendant cases along. We have partnered with weekend court, and we're trying to find a way to continue that -- to do that on a regular basis. Perhaps one of the more interesting things is the fact that we launched the competency docket, which is something that there are a couple of counties in the state that do it, but none to the scale that we hoped to do it at and we've identified more than a hundred inmates whose cases we hope to be part of that docket. So a big deal for us in terms of dealing with individuals who have mental health challenges who are in the Fulton County Jail. So, finally, in terms of -- one more slide. There you go, thank you. Finally, in terms of priorities, we continue obviously to focus on resolving and accelerating ORCA cases. I've mentioned a multiagency jail reduction plan that continues to be managed on a very regular basis. Obviously, we want to prevent any additional backlog, post ORCA backlog. As we look ahead for 2024, as the County Manager alluded to, and that will be a part of the -- I believe a budget discussion finalizing ORCA funding. How much and for how long would that be extended, we will continue to provide ORCA and justice system tracking and shift primarily the discussion with performance regarding the justice

system to discussion specifically with the individual agencies and justice partners. So that concludes the report. Happy to take any questions."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Any questions? Commissioner Barrett?"

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Yeah, I just have a couple of quick things. First of all, I just, Mr. Adams, want to say thank you for all of your hard work on this project. I know you're going to be so around as it relates to the replacement jail and the feasibility and the things that relate to that, but thank you for all your work on this. It does not go unnoticed."

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS/IT:** "Thank you."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Of course. And great work on some of these numbers tool. To all of the justice partners and as their sort of liaison to us to you as well. Nobody's sleeping on the floor is incredibly great news. I just have another question that is a broader question. It doesn't necessarily have to be answered right now, and it's maybe a question for Mr. Rowicki. He's going to take over some of this report we're providing. But I was thinking about the issue of the ankle monitors as it relates to what we get reports on, and I was wondering if there might be some way to look at the entire pretrial population as opposed to just the jail population, so we could see things like how many on ankle monitors, how many on signature bond; until we can get a sense of the scope of the entire number of people that are being delivered into the system and how many are at what stage. And so, no urgency in getting this done by the next meeting or anything, but I'd love to have us explore that if possible."

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS/IT:** "And we did do that on a one-time basis a couple of years ago. We looked at a number of individuals who are getting signature bonds and the other types of bonds and, in this case, it would be looking at electronic monitoring as well. So I won't speak for Mike, but having worked with his team, I think that's something that could be generated and reported on a fairly regular basis."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "I appreciate that. And one of the things that, you know, I've become more and more aware of is that study, what's going on with our justice system. I know we've talked about this briefly. You know, I think everyone knows about the Atlanta Police Foundation and sort of the private money that's going into supporting the front part of justice in our county. And so, you know, I think it's important for us to see the scale of all the people sort of being delivered to us because that has changed over time as well. So I just appreciate you all looking into that and we'll see what we get when we all see those numbers. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "I just want to clarify, so I just want to make sure I understood the County Manager right. So going forward, we're still going to provide --"



you're still going to provide this data. We just won't cover it may be in as lengthy of a discussion or whatever. The ORCA data we'll continue reporting on?"

**DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER:** "Yes, sir, and the justice scorecard as well. My suggestion would be if there's an area of particular interest, if you -- you could either let me know or directly let the justice partner that you think is responsible for that. So if there were unindicted cases, it would be somebody from the DAs office or, you know, average length of stay might be the judicial system and her or the judges and her."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "But you more -- would this -- otherwise, unless we want to talk about it it's going to go on the Consent Agenda or it's just a report?"

**DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER:** "No, I would still -- our plan would be to continue to provide this report and have it for presentation. I'm just not going to be prepared to answer every question like Alton Adams has been."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Got it. Got it. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Thank you. Anything else, Mr. Manager?"

**DICK ANDERSON, COUNTY MANAGER:** "No, sir. I think that can conclude this report."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Thank you, sir. Madam Clerk."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Continuing on page 14, **23-0949**, Finance, Fiscal Year 2024 Proposed Budget."

**SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER:** "Mr. Chairman, we do not have a presentation or anything for the Board. This is just an opportunity if there's any further discussion from the Members of the Board. We did send a memo out summarizing the feedback that we heard at the last meeting and are continuing to process transactions through the end of the year so that in January we will be prepared to bring back to you on the meeting on the 10th an updated booklet that will include final year-end results as well as any required amendments related to timing issues. Obviously, the change for the Magistrate Court that was approved earlier today; and also, inclusion of the inner welfare fund."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Thank you, ma'am, continue."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0950, Finance: Request approval of the Fiscal Year 2024 Water and Sewer Budget."

**SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER:** "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. This is the final presentation for the water and sewer budget. We are required under our existing bond conveyance to approve the budget in its final form and before the end of the Fiscal Year."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Natalie Hall, seconded by Vice Chair Bob Ellis. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 15, 23-0895, Real Estate and Asset Management: Request approval of a statewide contract in the amount of \$121,875 to provide preventive and corrective maintenance services for county owned facility."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. We have a motion to approve by Commissioner -- what? Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0897: Request approval of a statewide contract in the amount of \$700,000 to provide natural gas services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0896: Request approval of a statewide contract in the amount of \$406,771 to provide facility and maintenance services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Natalie Hall."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*



**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0898: Request approval of a statewide contract in the amount not to exceed \$755,000 to provide repair and maintenance for specialized heavy equipment and other fleet vehicles."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "We a motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. The motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0951, Information/Technology: Request approval of a statewide contract in an amount not to exceed \$3,250,000 to provide telecommunication services and products."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "We have a motion to approve by Commissioner Natalie Hall, seconded by Commissioner Dana Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0952: Request approval to utilize corporative purchasing in an amount not to exceed \$750,000 to provide support for IT services and operations."

**CLERK GRIER:** "Favorable motion by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Hall."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 16, 23-0953, External Affairs: Request approval of a recommended proposal in an amount not to exceed \$407,875 to provide communication and engagement support services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. We have a favorable motion by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Any questions? Ms. -- what's her name? Ms. Corbitt, come on up, please. Commissioner Barrett followed by Vice Chair Ellis."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "I just want to see if you could kind of run us through this, Jessica. And also -- is this in the base budget or is this an enhancement? This is a 2024 contract, so where does this fall in terms of the budget would be my question."

**SHARON WHITMORE, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER:** "Thank you, Commissioner Barrett, I'll answer that. It's included. It was programmed in as part of the communication piece associated with the jail bridging plan, but really related to the replacement jail."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Okay, because that's not the impression -- I mean, I felt like it was going to be more broad based than that, but I'll let you explain."

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "Thank you, Commissioner Barrett. This process began after the 2022 engagement with our cities, and we really had a lot of awakenings during that process and a realization that there were definitely some opportunities to raise awareness about our programs and services. And so, we began this year with the intention of releasing RFP and seeking some additional support to help us take a fresh look at the way we communicate those things and help us develop some tools and educational opportunities. Over the course of this year as the jail feasibility study was presented to this Board, and you all have taken some policy actions to move forward with our largest capital project in history that has really become our primary focus. Certainly, there are other communication needs and really, our large strategic initiatives need a look. But as we go into 2024 with potential of a sales tax referendum, if we are successful in seeking that legislation or regardless of that, needing to educate Fulton County residents about the financial impact of again, a very large capital project, we know this Board needs tools to be able to communicate with their constituents, fact sheets, talking points, really good materials to help the public understand why are we making this investment. Why is this necessary? Why now? What is the impact, and what comes along with that? So that has really been a primary focus and I think that is why that funding source was identified, but you are correct it was our intention. And as we kind of move through this process, we hope to be able to leverage support for other, again, large strategic initiatives. This is not meant to replace the work we do day-to-day with departments; with, you know, on any number of things. But, for example, the work that Dr. Roshell is doing around health equity and that, you know, what does this mean for investments this Board is making in health care. We think that we need to have some additional support and ideas about how we can communicate those kinds of things as well. I hope that answers your question."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Thank you. I recall a part of the conversation we had was this group that you were wanting to engage with here has the ability or has, you know, a practice of polling and surveying the community to get specific issues, concerns that the community might have so that our communications are more targeted to what the actual concerns are of the community. Is that built into this contract?"

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "Yes, it is. There is a research component to this and really understanding public opinion, these are large complex social issues that people have many valid concerns about and very diverse perspectives. So we think it's important that we understand that we do not really have the capacity to do polling, but really want to understand what are the concerns people

have? What kinds of answers do people need so that we can deliver that information to people? And so, that is -- that was one of the distinguishing factors as we went through this selection process, and that was very attractive to us."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "All right. One last thing, I know I asked this when we were considering the other contract a while back that was supposed to be more specific, about deliverables. And this one has -- what you gave us here has a little bit more information in terms of the scope, but it's still a lot of money per month. And I just want to make sure that you all are comfortable as the, you know, management team running this, that we are going to -- that this is going to be worth the money we're putting into it, because it is not inexpensive, so."

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "I agree and I'm very sensitive to that. I think that the good thing is that these are -- work product is very much built into this. There are deliverables throughout the process, both, for example, interviews on the front end with key stakeholders, maps, talking points, message development, and then deliverables throughout that. So yes, I am comfortable with that, but that's certainly something as we finalize the agreement that we'll pay special attention to. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "So this contract will be with external affairs, and your team is managing this contract specifically, right?"

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "Yes, sir. That's correct."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "So it's not really a -- and it's more about communication and engagement as opposed to crisis response, right? This is the scope of this is communication and engagement."

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "That is absolutely correct. There is a piece of it that would help us with things like template development and things like that, so we could be prepared; but the real focus is on communication support. I want to mention that this RFP was prepared probably around June, so it was before we were really in to some of the issues that we're experiencing now."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay. So in the event like -- so it's done with, you know potential new construction of a new jail in mind. If the timing of that is more -- I mean let's just -- I'm not predicting something's going to happen, but let's just say if the timing of that were to get pushed out or whatever, and maybe it's not as much of a focus for us this year, is what we think it is right now, but this -- could this contract be adapted to shift in to other needs that you think we have?"

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "Yes, absolutely. Again, we -- we began this year with the expectation of preparing RFP. We really kind of modified it as the results of the jail feasibility study were presented. We modified our expectations there. But I think Commissioner -- or Vice Chair, you were -- you were part of the last negotiation team."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Don't remind me."

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "So you're very sensitive to -- yes. And those are decisions we would report back to you all on."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Got you. All right. So it's more kind of like -- the scope of this sort of emerged out of that discussion, and then the jail piece was more, you know, adapted into that conversation."

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "Yes, sir."

**VICE CHAIR ELLIS:** "Got it. Okay. Got it, thanks."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Other questions? Motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Next item."

**JESSICA CORBIT, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS:** "Thank you, Commissioners. Merry Christmas."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0899**, Real Estate and Asset Management: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$200,000 to provide asphalt concrete pavement maintenance and repair."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. We've got a motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0954**: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$60,000 to provide towing and wrecker services for the Fulton County fleet."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0900**, Public Works: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in the amount of \$101,349.40 to provide emergency sewage cleanup services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0955**: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$500,000 to provide large water meter installation services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0956**: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000 to provide water meters."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 17, **23-0957**: Community Development: Request approval of a contract between Fulton County and Atlanta Partners for Education in the amount of \$250,000."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Yeah. I think we've had this discussion really related to -- what we're talking about a similar measure for the Fulton County school stuff, which we did not approve and, you know, well, I don't think anybody would dispute, you know, kind of the aims that the APS Foundation may have in terms of the funds that they get, they're all good causes. Asking Fulton County taxpayers to make a \$250,000, in essence, charitable contribution to an entity that they are paying significant taxes into that has a \$1.92 billion available resource budget and a -- it doesn't really make a whole lot of sense. And I can't support that, you know. They run their own operations, we run our operations. You know, why are we doing cross funding with, you know, taxpayer money does not make sense. So I can't support this one."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the motion fails; three yeas, two nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0958**, Public Works: Request approval to adopt the model adoption of Resolution of the local amendment to the Georgia State Minimal Standard Plumbing Code for water efficiency."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0959**, Senior Services: Request approval of a statewide contract in an amount not to exceed \$116,270.06, to provide staffing services to support the operation of the Department of Senior Services."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0960**: Request approval to amend and renew a Memorandum of Understanding with Friends of the Harriet G. Darnell Senior Multipurpose Facility Inc. and Friends of Mills, Inc."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0902**, County Manager: Request approval to increase spending authority in an amount not to exceed \$175,000, to provide program support services for the County Court backlog reduction plan."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Is there a second at this point? Seconded by Vice Chair Ellis. Commissioner Barrett, you have the floor."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "I just had a question on this, Mr. County Manager. The detail is pretty vague, and I'm just wondering what this is actually for?"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS/IT:** "Commissioner Barrett, this is a renewal of a contract with the firm -- actually, the firm with three people who support us that provide all of the data and support for ORCA. So it started -- actually started this engagement three years ago. So the data that you see coming out -- the answers to the questions regarding what's driving some of the dispositions, basically our single source of truth is developed by this group. The reason that we have it for six months is that our plan is to bring that in-house. And so, ideally, July 1st, some of the team that does this externally will be part of Fulton County. They used to be part of Fulton County before they went off and became consultants. So this to allow us to have some consistency in terms of the reporting, and be able to address questions while we go through the process of having them become a part of our strategy and performance group."

**COMMISSIONER BARRETT:** "Got it. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Commissioner Hall."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "I thought I was clear until you started trying to explain."

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS/IT:** "That happens."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "So you said these were county employees who left the county and form their own business?"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS/IT:** "Let me -- let me. One of the individuals, Quatar, who is actually the point person who provides all of this support and information that we get for Project Orca, she was with the county years and years ago. The only reason I brought that up is because we have talked to her about coming back in-house as



opposed to doing that as an external -- as an external resource. So she knows the county, and that's quite frankly how she became very adept at moving her way through the Odyssey system."

**COMMISSIONER HALL:** "That makes sense. Thank you."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion is to -- Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Question. So, we'll pay for this through ARPA?"

**ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS/IT:** "That is correct."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Okay, thanks."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** All right. Let's vote. Motion is to approve."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Next item."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "**23-0961**, Sheriff: Request approval to reprogram the use of unspent emergency capital funding in the amount of \$1,362,563.00, to utilize \$595,032, for the staff toilet upgrades at the South Annex Jail."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right, a motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; three yeas, one nay."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "On page 18, **23-0962**: Request approval to reprogram the use of unspent capital funding to utilize \$718,371.83 for the required surveillance enhancements at the South Annex Jail."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Enhance surveillance? All right, is there a motion? Motion to approve by Commissioner Natalie Hall, seconded by Commissioner Dana Barrett. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; four yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0963, Superior Court Administration: Request approval to increase spending authority in an amount not to exceed \$151,000 for increased printing and mailing of juror summons."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas; zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "The next item on page 18 is Commissioner Arrington's. Did we want to --"

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Which one?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "23-0915, Housing Authority."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "He's not here. We can hold it without objection."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay. On page 19, 23-0968, Board of Ethics. The Gate City Bar Association has recommended Daraka Satcher for a full Board reappointment to a term ending February 12th, 2026."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Let's vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. Yes, okay. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Next item is discussion item, Commissioner Arrington."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Hold."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Okay. Then we're back to the Consent Agenda. Item removed for separate consideration. On page 6, 23-0927: Request approval to amend the award of \$250,000 in the fiscal year 2023 budget to Atlanta Public Schools or transfer award to the APS Foundation, Atlanta Partners for Education."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Vice Chair Ellis."

**VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS:** "Given the failure of the related item, I think this -- I think this item is moot."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "Okay. Let's vote. Motion is to approve."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion fails; three yeas, two nays."

\*\*\*\*\*

**CLERK GRIER:** "Add-on item, **23-0971**, Arts and Culture: Request approval of a contract in the amount of \$15,600. Contracts for services to provide a nonprofit cultural event series with roots in Jewish culture and music musical traditions."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "All right. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

**CLERK GRIER:** "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, zero nays."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "No further matters to come before us?"

**CLERK GRIER:** "No further items."

**CHAIRMAN PITTS:** "No further items come before us. We are adjourned. Thank you."

(Whereupon the meeting concluded at 4:20 p.m.)