

**FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS
RECESS MEETING**

March 15, 2023
10:00 AM



Fulton County Government Center
Assembly Hall
141 Pryor Street SW
Atlanta, Georgia 30303



MINUTES-RATIFIED

This document has been ratified or approved by the Board of Commissioners, and is not binding on the County or any officer.

Ratification Date: April 19, 2023

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Robert L. Pitts **10:01 a.m.**

ROLL CALL: Tonya R. Grier, Clerk to the Commission

Robert L. Pitts, Chairman (At-Large)	PRESENT
Bridget Thorne, Commissioner (District 1)	PRESENT
Bob Ellis, Vice-Chairman (District 2)	PRESENT
Dana Barrett, Commissioner (District 3)	PRESENT
Natalie Hall, Commissioner (District 4)	PRESENT
Marvin S. Arrington, Jr., Commissioner (District 5)	PRESENT
Khadijah Abdur-Rahman, Commissioner (District 6)	PRESENT

INVOCATION: Reverend Clifton Dawkins, Jr., County Chaplain

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Recite in unison

ANNOUNCEMENTS

PLEASE SWITCH ALL ELECTRONIC DEVICES (CELL PHONES, PAGERS, PDAs, ETC.) TO THE SILENT POSITION DURING THIS MEETING TO AVOID INTERRUPTIONS.

IF YOU NEED REASONABLE MODIFICATIONS DUE TO A DISABILITY, INCLUDING COMMUNICATIONS IN AN ALTERNATE FORMAT PLEASE CONTACT THE OFFICE OF THE CLERK TO THE COMMISSION. FOR TDD/TTY OR GEORGIA RELAY SERVICE ACCESS DIAL 711.

CONSENT AGENDA

23-0173 Board of Commissioners

Adoption of the Consent Agenda - All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Recess Meeting Agenda for separate consideration. **(ADOPTED)**

A motion was made by Vice-Chairman Ellis and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to adopt the Consent Agenda. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Arrington

23-0174 Board of Commissioners

Proclamations for Spreading on the Minutes. **(SPREAD ON THE MINUTES UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Proclamations recognizing "Atlanta St. Patrick's Day Parade." **(Pitts)**
March 11, 2023

Commissioners' District Board Appointments

23-0175 Board of Commissioners

RESIDENTIAL CARE FACILITIES FOR THE ELDERLY AUTHORITY OF FULTON COUNTY **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Seven (7) directors appointed by the Board of Commissioners for initial terms of 2, 4, and 6 years, and thereafter for staggered terms of six (6) years. In the event of vacancies (RCM January 18, 1989, item #29) the Board of Commissioners shall appoint a person to serve.

Term below expired: 12/3/2022
Barbara McKee **(Abdur-Rahman)**

Commissioner Abdur-Rahman nominated Tonjie Clark to replace Barbara McKee for a District appointment to a term ending December 3, 2028.

23-0176 Board of Commissioners
**COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT (CDBG) ALLOCATION PROCESS
CITIZEN REVIEW PANEL (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT
AGENDA)**

The CDBG Allocation Process Citizen Review Panel shall consist of fourteen (14) citizens. Each Commissioner shall appoint two (2) members from his/her district for a two (2) year term, subject to ratification by the Board of Commissioners. Such term shall not extend beyond the term set for the Commissioner who made the appointment. Panel members may be reappointed to serve additional terms.

Terms below expired: 12/31/2017

- Priscilla Davis (**Morris**)
- Patricia Templeton (**Morris**)
- Daphne Jordan (**Arrington**)

Commissioner Barrett nominated Lauren Waits for a District Appointment for a term ending December 31, 2023.

23-0177 Board of Commissioners
**FULTON COUNTY REPARATIONS TASK FORCE (APPROVED UPON
ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

The Reparations Task Force shall have the following members: Each Commissioner shall appoint two (2) members, for a total of 14 members. Each member shall be a resident of Fulton County at the time of the appointment. A member shall serve for a two-year term and subject to removal by the appointing Commissioner for cause. No member's term shall exceed that of the appointing Commissioner but shall remain as a voting member until replaced or reappointed by the successive Commissioner.

Commissioner Thorne nominated Mike Russell to fill the vacant position for a District appointment to a term ending December 31, 2023.

**23-0178 Board of Commissioners
FULTON COUNTY ARTS COUNCIL (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE
CONSENT AGENDA)**

The Arts Council shall be composed of fifteen (15) residents of the county. Initially, each member of the board of commissioners shall appoint two persons to serve on the council, one person to serve for a one-year term and one person to serve a two-year term. No term of any member shall extend beyond the term of the District Commissioner who appointed the member to serve on the Arts Council Board; thereafter, each year, each member of the board of commissioners shall appoint one member for a two-year term. Each member may continue to serve beyond his/her term until replaced. The chairman of the Arts Council shall be appointed to a two-year term by a majority vote of the board of commissioners. The council shall elect a vice-chairman and a secretary from its membership.

Terms below expired: 12/31/2022

Onaje Henderson (**Hall**)
Joan Compton (**Hausmann**)
Marie Willsey (**Hausmann**)
Catherine Fox (**Morris**)
Sadie Talmadge (**Morris**)

Commissioner Thorne nominated Nilendra Chanda to replace Joan Compton for a District appointment to a term ending December 21, 2024.

**23-0179 Board of Commissioners
COMMISSION ON DISABILITY AFFAIRS (APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF
THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

The Commission on Disability Affairs shall consist of a total of sixteen (16) members to serve staggered two (2) year terms and appointed as follows:

Each member of the Board of Commissioners shall appoint two (2) members; one of them said appointees shall have an initial term, of one (1) year; No term of any member shall extend beyond the term of the District Commissioner who appointed the member to serve on the Commission for Disability Affairs; The Commission on Disability Affairs shall appoint two (2) members, who receive the consent of the majority of the members of the Commission on Disability Affairs and one (1) of the appointees shall have an initial term of one (1) year.

Term below expired: 12/31/2020

Sheneice Willis (**Carn**)

Commissioner Abdur-Rahman nominated Rometta E. Powell for a District appointment to a term ending December 31, 2024.

Open & Responsible Government**23-0180 Finance**

No action is requested. This reporting is being provided to meet the quarterly reporting requirement for monetary transfers amount budget funds per Board Resolution #09-1262. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0181 Finance

The Georgia Department of Human Services, Division of Family and Children Services operates a federally funded Low Income Household Water Assistance Program (LIHWAP). Finance is requesting Board authorization to continue to contractually participate in the program which will allow eligible Fulton County water and sewer customers to enroll, as approved by the Board of Commissioners last year. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0182 Finance

Request approval to renew existing contracts - Finance, 21RFP102521C-MH Property and Casualty Brokerage services in the amount of \$94,500.00 with Edgewood Partners Insurance Center (EPIC) to provide professional insurance brokerage services. This action exercises the first of two renewal options. One renewal option remains. Effective dates: April 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0183 Finance

Ratification of February 2023 Grants Activity Report. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Arts and Libraries**23-0184 Library**

Request approval to award a contract without competition, Fulton County Library System, 23SSN137406B-RT, Public Performance Licensing in an amount not to exceed \$16,166.00 with Swank Motion Pictures, Inc., to provide for federal copyright licensing. effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Health and Human Services**23-0185 Community Development**

Request approval of a Substantial Amendment to the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) 2021 Annual Action Plan to incorporate HOME ARP funding in the amount of \$2,428,588.00 in the County's HOME-ARP Allocation Plan; to authorize the Chairman to disburse funds and execute and administer the contracts, and other related documents consistent with the federal program requirements of this Board action. Funds are 100% grant funded. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0186 Department for HIV Elimination

Request approval of a contract with The Networked Planet, LLC located in St. Petersburg, Florida for website development and maintenance pursuant to the Ryan White Part A Program and the Ending the HIV Epidemic Funding for services to be provided in Grant Year 2023 and Grant Year 2024 in an amount not to exceed \$20,000.00 in Grant Year 2023 and \$8,000.00 in Grant Year 2024. There is no required County match and the project is 100% grant funded. Request authorization for the Chairman to execute contract with selected subrecipient. To protect the interest of the County, the County Attorney is authorized to approve the contracts as to form and substance and make any necessary modifications thereto prior to execution by the Chair. Effective March 1, 2023. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

Justice and Safety**23-0187 Juvenile Court**

Request approval of a recommended proposal - Juvenile Court, 22RFP048A-CJC, Specific Evidence-Based Delinquency Prevention Programming in the amount of \$396,707.00 with Evidence-Based Associates, LLC (EBA) (Powder Springs, GA) to provide ART-Aggressive Replacement Therapy; Trauma-Focused Cognitive Behavioral Therapy (TF-CBT); Functional Family Therapy (FFT) and Multisystemic Therapy (MST). Effective July 1, 2022, through June 30, 2023; with two renewal options. This contract is 100% grant funded. No county funding is required. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

23-0188 Police

Request approval of the 2023 Equitable Sharing Agreement and Certification with the U.S. Department of Justice for the Fulton County Police Department, establishing the requirements for participation in the Federal Equitable Sharing Program and the restrictions upon the use of federally forfeited cash, property, or proceeds. **(APPROVED UPON ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT AGENDA)**

RECESS MEETING AGENDA**23-0189 Board of Commissioners**

Adoption of the Recess Meeting Agenda. **(ADOPTED AS AMENDED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to adopt the Recess Meeting Agenda as amended by removing items #23-0197, #23-0198 as requested by the County Manager, #23-0210 as requested by Chairman Pitts; and moving up item #23-0208 as requested by Chairman Pitts. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

23-0190 Clerk to the Commission

Ratification of Minutes. **(RATIFIED)**

Recess Meeting Minutes, February 15, 2023

Regular Meeting Post Agenda Minutes, March 1, 2023

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to ratify the meeting minutes. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

23-0191 Board of Commissioners

Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. **(PRESENTED)**

Proclamation recognizing “David T. Howard Middle School Girls Basketball Appreciation Day.” **(Hall/Ellis/Thorne/ Barrett)**

Proclamation recognizing “David T. Howard Middle School Boys Basketball Appreciation Day.” **(Hall/Ellis/Thorne/ Barrett)**

*Proclamation recognizing “Education and Sharing Day.” **(Hall/Ellis/Thorne/ Barrett)**

**added during the meeting*

PUBLIC HEARINGS**23-0192 Board of Commissioners**

Public Comment - Citizens are allowed to voice County related opinions, concerns, requests, etc. during the Public Comment portion of the Commission meeting. **Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, whether such persons are commenting in-person, via emails or via Zoom or other electronic media (i.e., phone call). Non-Fulton County citizens will only be heard after all in-person Fulton County citizens, representatives of business and organizations located within Fulton County, including their employees, have been heard and the time allotted for public comment has not expired, except as otherwise provided in this code section. County staff shall verify the residency of each public speaker prior to such person being heard by the board. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. Members of the public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The Public Comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes at the Regular Meeting, nor will this portion exceed thirty minutes at the Recess Meeting.** In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Similarly, written comments (that were timely submitted) not previously read, may be read at the end of the meeting. For more information or to arrange a speaking date, contact the Clerk's Office. **(CONDUCTED)**

11 Speakers: Judge Cassandra Kirk (Item #23-0209); Judge Nancy Mau (Item #23-0209); Judge Todd Ashley (Item #23-0209); Judge John De Foor (Item #23-0209); Judge Cathelene "Tina" Robinson (Item #23-0209); Judge Wesley B. Taylor (Item #23-0209); Judge Ashley G. Drake (Item #23-0209); Judge Debbie-Ann Rickman (Item #23-0209); Judge Linda Borsky (Item #23-0209); Julie Allen (City of Buckhead) and Rev. Lydia Meredith (DFCS Compensation/Homelessness)

5 Zoom Speakers: Robby Caban (Lifeline/Fulton County Animal Services); Kevin Muldowney (Commissioners Debate); Amanda Brennan (Lifeline/Fulton County Animal Services); Ben Howard (Senior Services) and Matt Rowenczak (Commissioners Debate)

Not Sounded/7 Emailed Comments: Joseph Brown (City of Buckhead); Douglas Reid (City of Buckhead); Deanna Kauten (City of Buckhead); Paul White (City of Buckhead); Meredith Bateman (City of Buckhead); Lindsay Bender (City of Buckhead) and Douglas Daniel (City of Buckhead)

COUNTY MANAGER'S ITEMS**Open & Responsible Government****23-0193 External Affairs**

Presentation of 2023 Legislative Session Update. **(PRESENTED)**

23-0194 Finance

Request approval of a Resolution of the Board of Commissioners of Fulton County, GA authorizing the distribution of a Preliminary Official Statement, Notice of Sale, and Official Bid Form for the 2023 Tax Anticipation Note. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

23-0195 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of spending authority - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, North Georgia Fuel Cooperative (NGFC) Contract #BL 113-20, Gasoline and Diesel Fuel in an amount not to exceed \$2,331,442.00 with (A) James River Solutions, LLC, (Ashland, VA) in an amount not to exceed \$940,000.00; (B) Colonial Oil Industries, Inc. (Savanah, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$451,442.00; and (C) Petroleum Traders Corporation (Fort Wayne, IN) in an amount not to exceed \$940,000.00, to provide gasoline and diesel fuel for Fulton County fleet vehicles. Effective dates: March 1, 2023 through February 29, 2024. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

23-0196 Real Estate and Asset Management

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Real Estate and Asset Management, ITB22110K-DJ, Furniture, and Installation Services for the Fulton County Central Warehouse in an amount not to exceed \$1,160,245.01 with The Hon Company, LLC C/O Milton Jones Company, Inc. (Muscatine, IA.), to provide and install office furniture, workstations, and related components for Phase I (Registration and Election) for the Fulton County Central Warehouse. Effective upon issuance of Notice to Proceed for 270 calendar days or completion of project as determined by Fulton County. This is a one-time procurement. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Arts and Libraries**23-0197 Arts and Culture**

Request approval of a Memorandum of Understanding (“MOU”) between Fulton County and the Chattahoochee Nature Center, Inc. for the purpose of providing funding in the total amount of \$700,000.00 (\$200,000.00 recurring for environmental education programming, \$500,000.00 non-recurring for capital improvements). The term of the MOU is effective upon execution through December 31, 2023. **(HELD)**

23-0198 Arts and Culture

Request approval of a Memorandum of Understanding (“MOU”) between Fulton County and the Bear Creek Nature Center, Inc. for the purpose of providing funding in the total amount of \$500,000.00 for non-recurring capital improvements. The term of the MOU is effective upon execution through December 31, 2023. **(HELD)**

Health and Human Services**23-0199 Senior Services**

Request approval of a recommended proposal - Senior Services, 23RFP137278A-CJC, Comprehensive Nutrition Services in an amount not to exceed \$1,727,156.58 with Open Hand Atlanta, Inc. (Atlanta, GA) to provide congregate and home delivered meals, meal delivery, nutrition education and nutrition counseling for Fulton County residents aged 60 and above. Effective dates April 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023 with four renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Thorne, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Pitts

23-0200 Senior Services

Request approval to close out a contract - Department of Senior Services, 18RFP11228A-FB, Aging Services Contracts in the amount of \$71,633.06 with Senior Services North Fulton (Alpharetta, GA) to provide Aging Services for Fulton County seniors aged 60 and above. Effective upon BOC approval. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Barrett and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Pitts

23-0201 Senior Services

Request approval to increase spending authority - Senior Services, 21RFP000016A-CJC, Alternative Senior Transportation Services in an amount not to exceed \$1,800,000.00 with Common Courtesy (Atlanta, GA) to provide transportation services/ride sharing to eligible Fulton County residents aged 60 and above. Effective upon BOC approval. **(HELD)**

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. **(NO VOTE TAKEN)**

b. A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to hold. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

23-0202 Senior Services

Request approval to extend an existing contract - Senior Services, 19RFP117031A-FB, Food Services Management in an amount not to exceed \$247,733.25 with Piccadilly Holdings, LLC (Baton Rouge, LA) to continue to provide food service management and purchasing of perishable and non-perishable food items for the four senior multipurpose facilities and three training centers for an additional 90-day period. Effective dates: April 1, 2023 through June 30, 2023. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Pitts

23-0203 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 22ITB076A-JWT, Water Meter Testing and Repairs, in the amount of \$354,260.00 with Reed and Shows Meter Solutions (Carrollton, GA), to provide water meter testing and repairs effective January 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023, with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve items #23-0203 through #23-0206. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

23-0204 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 22ITB075A-KM, Sewer Line Chemical Root Control Services, in an amount not to exceed \$349,996.36 with Duke's Root Control Inc. (Elgin, IL), to provide sewer line chemical root control services. Effective dates: April 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023, with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve items #23-0203 through #23-0206. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

23-0205 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder - Department of Public Works, 22ITBC089A-JWT, Manholes, Frames, Grates, and Accessories, in an amount not to exceed \$360,742.45 with Ferguson Waterworks (Norcross, GA), to provide manholes, frames, grates, and accessories. Effective April 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023, with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve items #23-0203 through #23-0206. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

23-0206 Public Works

Request approval of the lowest responsible bidders - Public Works Department, Standby Miscellaneous Construction - Water in a total amount not to exceed \$2,400,000.00 with: (A) Site Engineering, Inc. (Atlanta, Ga) in an amount not to exceed \$1,200,000.00 and (B) Wade Coots Company, Inc (Austell, GA) in an amount not to exceed \$1,200,000.00 to provide standby miscellaneous construction services for the Fulton County water system. Effective April 1, 2023 through December 31, 2023 with two renewal options. **(APPROVED)**

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, to approve items #23-0203 through #23-0206. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

COMMISSIONERS' ACTION ITEMS**23-0207 Board of Commissioners**

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners to support the adoption of Legislation by the General Assembly to create transparency in policing and to address police brutality and excessive use of force perpetrated against African Americans and other persons of color; and for other purposes.

(Arrington) (APPROVED AS AMENDED)

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve with a friendly amendment offered by Commissioner Barrett to include "everyone, especially people of color/minorities" in the language. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Thorne

23-0208 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners authorizing the Fulton County Attorney to file a complaint with the Department of Justice (DOJ) requesting that it investigate Wellstar Health System for Health Care Redlining; and for other purposes. **(Pitts) (APPROVED)**

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Thorne

Abstain: Ellis

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to call the question. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Thorne

Abstain: Ellis

23-0209 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution urging the consolidation of certain Fulton County Clerk of Court operations under the Fulton County Superior Court Clerk; directing the County Manager to assist with facilitating such consolidation; and for other purposes. **(Pitts) (HELD)**

a. A motion was made by Chairman Pitts and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve. **(NO VOTE TAKEN)**

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Arrington to overrule the Chairman and County Attorney's ruling regarding hearing this item in Executive Session. **(FAILED FOR LACK OF A SECOND)**

c. A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Arrington and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to add to the Legislative Agenda and ask the General Assembly to adopt a local law pursuant to the statute to provide clarity on this issue. **(NO VOTE TAKEN)**

COMMISSIONER HALL WITHDREW THE SECOND MOTION FAILED FOR LACK OF A SECOND

d. A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to hold. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Arrington

Did Not Vote: Pitts

23-0210 Board of Commissioners

Request approval of a Resolution consenting to the de-annexation of the property located at 1250 West Garmon Road, NW, Atlanta, Georgia and 1290 West Garmon Road, NW, Atlanta, Georgia from the City of Atlanta; and consenting to the annexation of the property located at 1250 West Garmon Road, NW, Atlanta, Georgia and 1290 West Garmon Road, NW, Atlanta, Georgia into the City of Sandy Springs; and for other purposes. **(Pitts) (REMOVED)**

Commissioners' Full Board Appointments

23-0211 Board of Commissioners

City of Atlanta-Atlanta Public Schools Joint Committee **(APPROVED)**

Created by a Resolution by Atlanta City Councilmember Byron D. Amos amending Resolution 14-R-4314 which established the City of Atlanta-Atlanta Public Schools Joint Committee to enhance educational outcomes, improve quality of life, and produce economic vitality in Atlanta for the purpose of amending the membership; and for other purposes.

Resolution 14-R-4314 which established the City of Atlanta-Atlanta Public Schools Joint Committee amended to include in the membership one representative from the Fulton County Board of Commissioner and one representative from the Dekalb County Board of Commissioners.

Commissioner Arrington nominated Commissioner Hall as Fulton County's Representative.

A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Arrington, to approve. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Arrington

EXECUTIVE SESSION

23-0212 Board of Commissioners

Executive (**CLOSED**) Sessions regarding litigation (**County Attorney**), real estate (**County Manager**), and personnel (**Pitts**). (**APPROVED**)

PRESENT IN THE EXECUTIVE SESSION REGARDING LITIGATION, REAL ESTATE AND PERSONNEL: Chairman Pitts, Vice-Chairman Ellis, Commissioners: Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington and Abdur-Rahman; County Manager Dick Anderson; County Attorney Y. Soo Jo; and Clerk to the Commission Tonya R. Grier.

a. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Commissioner Hall, to enter into Executive Session. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, and Abdur-Rahman

Did Not Vote: Thorne, and Arrington

b. A motion was made by Commissioner Thorne and seconded by Vice-Chairman Ellis, to approve the settlement in the matter of Fulton County versus William Odrey, et al., regarding Tax ID No. 06-0367-0001-1, Civil Action File No. 2020CV337327, in the amount of \$175,000.00. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

c. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve the settlement as set forth in item #4 of the Executive Session Agenda, in the matter of Fulton County versus R. Freddie Stewart, Jr., et al., regarding Tax ID No. 14F-0143-LL-053-3, Civil Action No. 2017CV296455, in the amount of \$43,000.00. The motion passed by the following vote:

Yea: Pitts, Thorne, Ellis, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:59 p.m.

FULTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS
RECESS MEETING
MARCH 15, 2023
10:00 A.M.

Alexander Solution, LLC

(Whereupon, the meeting was called to order at 10:02 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Good morning, everyone and welcome to this meeting of the Fulton County Board of Commissioners. Today is Wednesday, March 15th. It is exactly 10:01 a.m. Madam Clerk, please call the roll for purposes of a quorum."

CLERK GRIER: "Chairman Robb Pitts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Bridget Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Vice Chairman Bob Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Dana Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Natalie Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Marvin Arrington, Jr."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioner Khadijah Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Present."

CLERK GRIER: "Mr. Chairman, you have a quorum."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Madam Clerk. Please, rise for the invocation followed by the Pledge of Allegiance."

(Whereupon, the invocation was given by Reverend Dawkins followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 2, Consent Agenda, **23-0173**, Adoption of the Consent Agenda - All matters listed on the Consent Agenda are considered routine by the County Commission and will be enacted by one motion. No separate discussion will take place on these items. If discussion of any Consent Agenda item is desired, the item will be moved to the Recess Meeting Agenda for separate consideration."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, any items on the Consent Agenda, Madam Clerk? Commissioners, anything on the Consent Agenda? If not, I'll entertain a motion to approve. Motion to approve by Commissioner -- Vice Chair Ellis, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "Bottom of page 6, Recess Meeting Agenda, **23-0189**, Adoption of the Recess Meeting Agenda. Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have amendments to today's Agenda; items to be removed from the Recess Meeting Agenda. On page 8, 23-0197, Arts and Culture: Request approval of an MOU with Chattahoochee Nature Center for the purpose of providing funding for environmental education programming. Also, on page 8, 23-0198: Request approval of an MOU with Bear Creek Nature Center for the purpose of providing funding for capital improvements. Both of these items will be moved to the April 12th Regular Meeting Agenda."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, any other items?"

CLERK GRIER: "Also on page 10 -- bottom of page 10, 23-0210. This item is being removed as requested by Chairman Pitts. Request approval of a Resolution consenting to the deannexation of property located at 1250 West Garmon Road, Atlanta, and 1290 West Garmon Road. And we have on page -- also on page 10, an item to be moved up to be heard after public comment, 23-0208: Request approval of a Resolution authorizing Fulton County attorney to file a complaint with the Department of Justice requesting that it investigate WellStar Health System for healthcare redlining; and for other purposes sponsored by Chairman Pitts. This item will be moved up and heard after public comment."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Any other items? Commissioners, anything else? All right, a motion to approve the agenda as amended. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Vice Chair Ellis. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "23-0190, Ratification of Minutes, Recess Meeting Minutes, February 15th. Regular Meeting Post Agenda Minutes -- that should be March 1st, 2023."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 7, 23-0191, Presentation of Proclamations and Certificates. First proclamation is recognizing 'David T. Howard Middle School Girls Basketball Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. All right, Marcel? No, no. Come on down. Okay. All right. After being closed during the pandemic and actually being renovated and rebuilt into the beautiful school that it is today, the students returned for their first full year in person classes, and the girls varsity basketball team showed us how much and how important sports are; and how important being together it actually is. And the proclamation reads: WHEREAS, on Wednesday, February 8th, 2023, at Frederick Douglass High School, the boys and girls varsity basketball teams from David T. Howard Middle School competed for the Atlanta Public Schools Basketball Championships. And WHEREAS, the girls varsity basketball team was the first ever, David T. Howard Middle School Girls Basketball team, to reach the Atlanta Public Schools Championship Game, where they lost a hard fought contest to King Middle School by the score of 41-28. And WHEREAS, the girls varsity basketball team: Ayumi Abraham, Katherine Dziurma, Nora Goodman, Nevaeh Hambrick, Dru Jeckewicz -- your coach is not here. Come help me, Gail Johnson, Myla Marshall -- am I doing good so far? All right. Juliana Richmond, Blakely Roberts, and Abigail Taylor, culminated their historic season with a 14 to 1 record. And WHEREAS, the girls team under the strong leadership of their head coach, Ben Abernathy, and Assistant Coach, David Peterson, brought home the first girls basketball trophy to start building the foundation of David T. Howard Middle School's basketball in excellence. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners congratulates the boys and girls basketball teams at work -- and their hard work, and their outstanding season and camaraderie that propelled them to Atlanta Public School's Middle School basketball championship and runner-up results; and does hereby proclaim Tuesday, February 28th, 2023 as 'David T. Howard Middle School Girls Basketball Appreciation Day' in Fulton County, Georgia. Congratulations. And I want just to say how important team sports are because I played middle school basketball until they told my mother I had water on the knee and they had to break my kneecap to drain and she said, no, that's, okay, she'll just go in the choir class. So come on over coach."

BEN ABERNATHY, RECIPIENT: "Again, thank you again, Commissioner Hall, for this amazing honor. She did come to our school and surprise the ladies during our banquet and she gave them that same story about her playing basketball, and you could just see the lights just light up in their eyes. So as the athletic director of David T. Howard I do accept this on behalf of our principal, our alumni, and all of the David T. Howard family. Thank you."

CLERK GRIER: "The next proclamation is recognizing 'David T. Howard Middle School Boys Basketball Appreciation Day' sponsored by Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Come on down. Hey, good morning. Good to see you again; so glad to see everyone today. Now, Marcel you're going to come down here and take a picture? No, give it to TJ right there next to you. He'll do the picture. TJ, please get his camera. Come on. You got to stand next to this tall young man. You're not going to stand next to your son? All right. It's so good to see all of you today. When I came to the school, there were only a few of you here, so welcome and thank you. All right. Okay. And the proclamation reads: WHEREAS, on Wednesday, February 8th, 2023, at Frederick Douglass High School, the boys and girls varsity basketball teams from David T. Howard Middle School competed for the Atlanta Public Schools Basketball Championships. And WHEREAS, the boys varsity basketball team defeated Sutton Middle School by the score of 40 to 28 to capture the first ever Atlanta Public School Basketball Championship by David T. Howard Middle School by opening up an 11-point lead in the first quarter and maintaining their lead for the rest of the contest. And WHEREAS, the boys' varsity players: Rocco Azzam, Chayse Beadles, Mylik Benoit, Dorian Fox, Kingston Glover, Daniel Harper, Theodore Letting, Promise Palmer, Keylan Pope, Kemari Reed, Korben Reed, Galen Roberts, Stephen Shields, and Myles Swint culminated their historic championship season with a 14 to 1 record. And WHEREAS, the boys varsity team under the strong leadership of their head coach, Freeman Jones, and Assistant Coach, Cameron Bentley, brought home the first boys basketball championship trophy to start building the foundation of David T. Howard Middle School's basketball excellence. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners congratulates the boys and girls basketball teams at David T. Howard Middle School for their outstanding seasons and the hard work and camaraderie that propelled them to the Atlanta Public Schools Middle School basketball championship and runner-up results; and does hereby proclaim Tuesday, February 28th, 2023 as 'David T. Howard Middle School Boys Basketball Appreciation Day' in Fulton County, Georgia. And thank you Marcel. He's a shy one, but thank you, Marcel. He has been a resident and a force in the community on Boulevard for years and years. I'm not going to say how many years, okay? All right, come on up, coach."

FREEMAN JONES, RECIPIENT: "I would like to thank the Fulton County Commissioners for celebrating the team for their hard work and determination and drive. I would like to thank the principle of David T. Howard as well along with the Atlanta Athletic Director, Coach Abernathy, and Mr. Marcel for making this happen and bringing it to full fruition. So we thank you all for the support; from the families of these young

man and also the families of David T. Howard as well, and the alumni also. So thank you all."

BEN ABERNATHY, RECIPIENT: "Thank you again. I do accept both again on behalf of our principal, Ms. Hollis, our David Howard community; and all the alumni that has come before us. We constantly want to reach out to everyone to kind of bridge the gaps and to build our community. And all of these kids are an example of what we're trying to do with and for our community; and we thank everyone for their support. Thank you."

CLERK GRIER: "Mr. Chairman and Members of the Board, we have one last proclamation included on today's Recess Meeting Agenda. Proclamation recognizing 'Education and Sharing Day' sponsored by Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. All right. Rabbi Levi, it was great to have that meeting with you and learn more about what is happening with the young Jewish group in Atlanta; and to find out about the Education and Sharing Day; and to be able to sponsor and proclaim this day. And I'm going to do the best I can with pronunciation, all right? The proclamation reads: WHEREAS, the basis for the continuity of any society is education. And in the great state of Georgia, the education of our youth is a priority. And WHEREAS, in order to achieve its highest goals, education must not only impart knowledge, but also teach the students how to live, forming and strengthening their moral character to make a better life for themselves as individuals and for society as a whole; imparting moral and ethical values that have been the bedrock of society since the dawn of civilization. And WHEREAS, a global spiritual leader and leading advocate for the advancement of education, the Rebbe, Rabbi Menachem M. Schneerson of righteous memory stress that a moral and ethical education empowers every individual to develop their full potential in making the world a better place. And WHEREAS, such an education can nurture the unity of diverse peoples through encouraging increased acts of goodness and kindness imbued with the awareness that even a single positive act of an individual can change the world and usher in an era of global peace when there will 'be peace within your walls, serenity with your mansions'(Psalms 122). And WHEREAS, Education and Sharing Day is observed each year on the Rebbe's birthday in recognition of his outstanding and lasting contributions toward the improvement of education, morality, and acts of charity around the world. A day to pause and reflect on our responsibility to ensure our youth have the foundation necessary to lead lives rich in purpose and fulfillment through service and good works. And WHEREAS, April 2nd, 2023 will mark 121 years since the Rebbe's birth capping a year in which thousands of new institutions and initiatives were launched throughout the world in tribute to the celebration. And this year has an added significance as a year of 'Hakhel', a biblical event of unity, education, and spiritual growth emphasizing how every person is crucial to perfecting the world. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fulton County Board of Commissioners calls upon everyone to work together to create a better, brighter, and more promising future of all; and does hereby proclaim Sunday, April 2nd, 2023 as 'Education and Sharing Day' in Fulton County, Georgia. Thank you and congratulations."

RABBI LEVI, RECIPIENT: "Thank you everyone. Thank you, Commissioner Hall, for bringing forth this proclamation. We are, as we just read, education is not only about information; nowadays we all carry around the knowledge of the world in the palms our hands; but nevertheless we don't always make the right decisions or the correct decisions. So, education now is more about what to do with information that we have than providing more and more information. It's very aligning in timing that we are bringing this proclamation today just a few weeks before Passover. Passover is where Jewish people celebrate freedom; and freedom is one of the bedrocks of our country. Even in our personal life, freedom has to be not only something that we live in our society, but us as human beings, we have to be free. Free in the sense that using all of capabilities and all our talents for the good for ourselves and for those surrounding us. So I want to present Commissioner Hall with the matzoh. This is a flat matzoh, for this is the unleavened bread that the Jews ate when they left Egypt. Well, this is not the same one. This was baked this year, but the same concept. And these are present as though its bread. As you can see from the picture here, it's flat. That's representing that the ego that we have or that we might have, needs to be totally removed; and all that pompousness and all that fluffiness that we put ourselves or we think about ourselves. Sometimes we need to recognize that we are in service, and that we need to see ourselves flat just like a matzoh. So, thank you very much for this proclamation, and let's educate not only the younger generation, but even ourselves. We're constantly growing, so thank you very much."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Madam Clerk. Let's see, it's -- now, Commissioners, you know we have a very packed day today, and it's my goal that we will adjourn this meeting at 12:45 after recessing for lunch and Executive Session, coming back to take action on any items from Executive Session. But the goal is to adjourn this session at 12:45 -- strike that 1:45 and head upstairs for the Special Call Meeting for the retreat to begin promptly at 2:00. That being said, I would respectfully ask that we keep our comments on the issues that are before us today so that we can adhere to that schedule. All right, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "Continuing on page 7, Public Hearings, **23-0192**, Public Comment - Citizens wishing to participate in public comment will be allowed to appear in person or may choose to participate virtually via Zoom videoconferencing, or by submitting their comments in writing by registering on the county website www.fultoncountyga.gov. Priority for public comment will be given to Fulton County citizens and those individuals representing businesses or organizations located within Fulton County. Speakers will be granted up to two minutes each. The public will not be allowed to yield or donate time to other speakers. The public comment portion of the meeting will not exceed 30 minutes. In the event the 30-minute time limit is reached prior to public comments being completed, public comment will be suspended and the business portion of the BOC meeting will commence. Public comment will resume at the end of the meeting. Mr.

Chairman's and Members of the Board, we will start with speakers here in Assembly Hall. We have received ten speaker cards."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Ten?"

CLERK GRIER: "Ten."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay."

CLERK GRIER: "Will the first five speakers, please come down: Judge Cassandra Kirk, Judge Nancy Mau, Judge Todd Ashley, Judge John De Foor, and Judge Ashley G. Drake."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Now, these are the rules: Two minutes. When you have 15 seconds remaining, I'll say, 15 seconds. That's your cue to terminate your remarks. Also, if what you are going to say has already been said by someone else, please don't feel that it's necessary to repeat. We hear very well. It is now 10:30 exactly. At 11:00, given the schedule that we're on today. It's 10:30 now, at 11:00 that will conclude the public comment section today."

HONORABLE CASSANDRA KIRK, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Mr. Chairman, as a point of order?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What?"

HONORABLE CASSANDRA KIRK, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Mr. Chairman, as a point of order -- yes, sir, so I'm an elected official. I'm asking that you excuse, as you have traditionally, the two-minute timeframe for elected officials."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, I don't need to be lectured to. You already know that you have -- you can use the whole 30 minutes if you choose. For the public, its two minutes each, and when we have 15 seconds left, I'll say 15 seconds."

HONORABLE CASSANDRA KIRK, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Thank you. I appreciate the clarification. Honorable Members of the Board of Commission, good morning. Allow me to introduce myself. My name is Cassandra Kirk. I serve as the Chief Magistrate Judge of Fulton County. I am here today to request that the Board halt its consideration of the efforts to consolidate the Clerk of the Magistrate, State, and Superior Courts that is agenda item number 23-0209. The Magistrate Court has experienced it, and the results are waste, inefficiency, and shoddy service to the subordinate court. My comments today are for the court users and the taxpayers. For us to continue in this manner, we are now in as a disservice to the taxpayers of Fulton County. This is not about personality. It is not about two women who cannot get along. It is about protocols and processes. As you know, I was appointed under a new statutory scheme for the Magistrate Court. I was tasked to create a newly independent constitutional court. I

chose to use my almost 30 years of varied legal experience to redesign how this court serves the citizens of Fulton County. I've been accountable to the citizens of Fulton County. I have appointed over 45 judges in this role. I have won elections in 2018 and 2022, to continue to serve in this role. We have a staff of 26 judges, 13 staff, seven of which are ORCA funded and any number of interns. As a whole, we have worked together to improve this Magistrate Court. This court is less than ten years old. The corporate consolidation model proposed may work elsewhere, where the respected chief judges agreed to the clerk. However, Fulton has evolved differently, and our citizens, taxpayers, and our court deserve more. As I mentioned in my nine-page memorandum to each of you about the deficiencies in the current structure, I have obtained a grant from the State Justice Institute to once again study the Magistrate Court. This would be one of the many studies of the Magistrate Courts which has been undertaken as a result of the 2012 task force that demanded accountability and independence of the courts. I'm not a stranger to you all. In fact, during the pandemic, I recall many of you cheering the case closure successes of the Magistrate Court. Let me update you all on those case closure numbers. Contrary to the allegations of some, from January 2019 to March 14, 2023 there have been 282,841 cases filed in the Magistrate Court. The court, our judges, and its administrative team have ensured that we have closed 244,391 of those cases. We have a closure rate of 86 percent. I've provided the specific breakdown to you all in the packets left in front of you this morning. This number could be greater with the appropriate clerk and adequate resources. For me, our court, our mission, how we treat and respond to the public, this is blood, sweat, and tears. For you, this may be amusement. It is not funny. There is nothing funny about allowing or encouraging the current level of dysfunction to continue. I asked that you rescind the original Resolution, that you allow the state to proceed with legislation, and I have provided a copy of that to you this morning; and I'm asking that you allow this Magistrate Court to show you how we can continue to be effective and remain on this turnaround pad that was created in 2013 and 2014. Much hay has been made of my decision in 2016 to appoint the Superior Court Clerk to serve as the Magistrate Court Clerk. These are two different courts with two different jurisdictions, in different roles for the clerk. The court's enabling legislation did not identify or structure a clerical staff. I am the only elected official for Magistrate Court. My goal in 2016 was to save the county and taxpayers money by appointing the clerk. I understood that and was made aware that it was a wave of the future, and I trusted the Gwinnett model. That trial run has failed. We have been complaining since 2018, and have been asking for a structure more akin to that of Cobb or even one like Juvenile Court, Probate Court, or State Court here in Fulton County. Our duty is to the taxpayers. I trusted this clerk with 39 employees. Those employees were handpicked by State Court and Hakeem Oshikoya to implement the Magistrate Court. The County Attorney assured me that the role of the clerk in Magistrate Court is different from that in the role of Superior Court, namely that those duties would be assigned by the chief magistrate. We have not met one of the goals of having this clerk perform basic statutory duties. In an unheard move, all of the full-time judges, all of whom are with me here today, have signed a letter of no confidence in this clerk. I'm asking that all the magistrate judges, if you all would stand, please. Those that are not at the podium are coming down. Thank you.

Instead, Commissioners, the Magistrate Court has been robbed. I trusted this clerk with 39 people, enough according to State Court to staff and stand up the entire Magistrate Court. While the number of people working in Magistrate Court has increased over the years, HR was only able to identify 33 magistrate designated staff and could not locate crucial administrative staff originally given to the clerk. The county has a valid concern about budget; and I agree with you on how this can be fixed in a budget-neutral manner, which makes this request to separate more crucial. There are people working in those roles now and those roles should, in fact, be given back to Magistrate Court. This is not about two women fighting. We ask that you not downplay the importance of an efficient, effective process for the taxpayers. The clerk is a nice person, but she is not efficient for this position. She was elected for Superior Court, and I thought that she would be perfect for this role. I was wrong. We are unable to plan for and implement a systemic model of maturity for Magistrate Court. As good stewards of the court and county funds, I ask for your help in creating a model of strategic growth and sustained health. A reengineering study was conducted at this court in 2013 and 2014. An internal study of this court was conducted in in 2015, and the study by the Carl Vinson Institute of Government was conducted in 2016. An additional study was conducted in 2018 by the National Center for State Court associated with our civil justice initiative grant. To be a viable option, consolidation must serve a benefit to all the parties. It must be predicated on knowing the current state. I argue that you do not have all the facts to assess the current state, and have made no effort toward me or any of the other chief judges of your action to propose a consolidated model without our consent. I spoke with each of them on Friday and Monday, and neither of them were aware that this was the proposal at the time you placed it on the record. I would urge an audit of all the financial technology and human resources in the current clerk's office. I'd urge you to support the current consultant study underway by the Magistrate Court with the State Justice Institute Grant; and I'd encourage your consultant to read all the previous studies of this court. Our lived experience of consolidation respectfully requests that you consider another route. One that separates rather than combines the offices of the court of the clerk. Thank you for your consideration."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam Clerk."

HONORABLE NANCY MAU, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning. My name is Nancy Mau and I serve as a full-time magistrate judge under the leadership of Chief Judge Cassandra Kirk. I practiced law for 34 years. I'm a graduate from Mercer Law School. I started my career here in Fulton County in 1990 as a Fulton County public defender. I have served as a prosecutor, a public defender, now a judge. I've been a private practitioner at times. I have appeared in every court in this jurisdiction and many courts throughout the State of Georgia. I have visited more clerks' offices and had interactions with more clerks than I can even count. Now, I am a judge and I believe that I bring a perspective that I hope that you will consider valuable, given my years of service to this county and not only as a resident, but as a citizen as somebody who has devoted now 34 years of my life to the citizens of Fulton County. I'm here today to join my voice with my colleagues and that of our Chief Judge, Cassandra Kirk, and I'm asking you to follow

the recommendations of our Chief Judge, Cassandra Kirk. At this time, I'm asking that you not proceed with consolidation until there has been a viable study and analysis of whether this is even feasible let alone possible. The disruption that it could cause to not only our bench, but to the citizens of Fulton County. I'm asking that you in any part of this process be fully transparent, and I know that --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

HONORABLE NANCY MAU, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- and I know that transparency is important to this Board. I also ask that you seek input from people like me before you make your decision, so that you make an informed decision that best serves the citizens of Fulton County going forward. Thank you for your time."

HONORABLE TODD ASHLEY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Mr. Chairman and Commissioners, good morning. My name is Todd Ashley, I am a resident of Roswell Georgia -- oh, my bad."

HONORABLE WESLEY B. TAILOR, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- I hate to do this. I didn't sign up with a card."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- well, just a minute, sir. Just a minute. Just a minute, sir. Madam Clerk, find out what he's talking about. Continue, sir. Just a minute. Just a minute. Just a minute. Sir, sir, sir, sir. Thank you. You have the floor."

HONORABLE TODD ASHLEY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Okay. Thank you. Mr. Chairman and Commissioners thank you for the opportunity to be here today. My name is Todd Ashley. I'm a resident of Roswell, Georgia. I love Fulton County. I'm a Fulton Guy: Roswell High School, Georgia State and John Marshall. I previously served as the Chairman of the City of Milton Ethics Board. I was in the district attorney's office for 12 years; and despite what anybody else may say about Fulton County, I love my county and I respect and appreciate the service of those who offer themselves for public service because the sacrifices are great and the rewards are sometimes few. This is true for Judge Kirk. This is true for those of us who work this court. It's probably true for the Commissioners and staff as well. And I believe it's probably true for Clerk Robinson and her team. It is a difficult thing to work these courts. Why is consolidation a bad idea? Here's what I would argue. The timelines and the statutory responsibilities of each one of these courts is different. For example: in Magistrate Court, there is no civil discovery. There are no juries. There are no divorce cases. There are no felony trials. In State and Superior Court, they don't have to deal with landlord-tenant or abandoned motor vehicles or civil small claims where the overwhelming majority of the parties are pro se. Each court operates differently. The timelines for us, a lot of things are seven days or 30 days. And the other courts, they can be much longer. They can be months long. I think it's unfair to the citizens; certainly, unfair to the courts. It's probably unfair to the clerk to ask the team to coordinate this under one roof at one time that can only lead to more heartache for the citizens and the courts. Thank you for the opportunity."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Mr. Chair."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes, sir."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Could we -- just a point of privilege: Could we -- I think we have two other elected officials that were in the queue to speak. Could we give them --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- yes, sir. What I plan to do, if there are no objections, at the conclusion of those who've already signed up, there were a couple who signed up late, to allow them to speak. One of them is the Clerk of the Superior Court and others."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Mr. Chair, I think your chief judge probably has a case or something they probably need to get back to, so if we can make an accommodation, it probably would be --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- without objection, all right, let's hear from this gentleman and then we'll have Ms. Robinson and the Chief Judge. Continue, sir."

HONORABLE JOHN FORD, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Commissioners, good morning. My name is John De Foor. I'm Deputy Chief Magistrate Judge with the Magistrate Court of Fulton County. I have the honor of serving under the leadership of Chief Magistrate, Cassandra Kirk. I'm in a line with the chairman's directives; I will not repeat what my colleagues have said or what the Chief Magistrate has said. I will only say that I support Chief Magistrate in her request to this Board. The Magistrate Court of Fulton County is a unique court. We're one of the busiest courts in the state, if not the country. I like, Judge Mau, have practiced -- started practicing in this court in 2001 and the improvements under Chief Magistrate Kirk have been outstanding and stellar. She has an understanding of what this particular court needs; and, again, I think that it is important that she be allowed to continue to improve this court with her recommendations. And I urge you to accept her recommendations for continued study before you move forward with the consolidation as proposed. Thank you very much for your time this morning."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Madam Clerk, where are you? Come on up, and Judge Taylor. Both of y'all come on up."

CATHELENE "TINA" ROBINSON, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. Thank you so much for this opportunity. My name is Cathelene "Tina" Robinson. I serve as the Clerk of Superior and Magistrate Courts. I have been a long-time employee of Fulton County, almost 50 years. I have been a lifelong resident of Fulton County. I have with me, the team -- some of our employees, would you please stand? Who work tirelessly to support both courts, Superior and Magistrate Courts. There is no clerk of Magistrate Court or deputy clerks of Magistrate Court. There is a clerk of Superior and Magistrate Courts and deputy clerks of Superior and Magistrate

Courts. They are cross trained, they work together to get the job done for the citizens that we serve. As mentioned earlier, Magistrate Court is the busiest court in Georgia. And as the judges have so articulated, everybody does a good job in the cases that they hear. There's a lot of work that has to be done before they step into that courtroom and after they leave out of the courtroom. And that is what my team does, and they do an excellent job. I know that this is March Madness; however, I have -- this is beyond madness to me. Both Judge Kirk and I are elected. I am not appointed; I am elected. I chose to serve as the Clerk of Magistrate Court. I have collaborated with department heads, other elected officials, other judicial partners since I worked for the former clerk in 1989 -- beginning in 1989. And I will tell you this is the first time I have experienced anything like this. I have reached out to the Chief Magistrate as early as July -- after our memorandum of understanding was signed, July of 2020. I continue to reach out. I continue to be as gracious as I can. I continue to be as patient as I can. But you cannot have a conversation with a person who chooses not to talk to you. You cannot work out what you need to do to serve the people who elected the both of us. I have a role as the Clerk of Superior Magistrate Court. The Chief Magistrate nor the -- or nor the magistrate judges have any idea what that is. The clerk role has never been with Magistrate Court, as has been said over and over and over again. The Magistrate Court Clerk was the clerk of State Court prior to 2016, when I chose to serve as the Clerk of Magistrate Court. I could say and act the way that the Chief Magistrate has chosen to do by coming up tarnishing my name, my brand. Saying what I'm not doing and I'm not doing my job, but that is a lie. I could say the same thing for her that her incompetence has caused Magistrate Court to be where it is, and it has nothing to do with me. I could say that, but I've tried not to. I've tried to take the high road, but this is just too much. We have over 80,000 cases that come through our court, and they're just not seeing when a judge decides to sit on a bench. I do not determine when these judges sit. The Chief Judge determines when they sit, through her order of business. She determines what cases will be heard by the magistrates; I do not. As the clerk, I provide reports to her as to how many cases are coming through the clerk's office to be heard by her magistrates. I have informed her on several occasions that the number of slots on the calendars do not accommodate the number of hearings that are required. I have informed her -- well, she's had several court administrators, the court administrators have been aware -- over the last two years, I think there have been four. We have informed them of the magnitude of this issue and the fact that there are customers, landlords, and tenants alike that cannot hear -- get their cases heard. We are a year behind on those types of cases. I'm not talking about the other time. I'm just talking about evictions. And her order of business dictates how those cases will be heard. So, I say to you that this is a black eye, not just on me and the Chief Magistrate. This is a black eye on Fulton County. But, Commissioners, in all due respect, there's a lot of work to be done, and for either one of -- because I haven't come over here to talk about anyone. I have tried to do my job, and that's a lot of work, and we need to get over there and get the work done. But I ask you to -- what I ask of you is to consider what I have said, and that is I have no control over her magistrates. But my team has worked very hard to do the clerk's role. We do our jobs, and if you ask any justice partners, any department heads that report to the County Manager or the County

Manager himself. I assure you they will all say that Cathelene "Tina" Robinson is a team player. Cathelene "Tina" Robinson collaborates. Cathelene "Tina" Robinson gives to all -- what she can. So, I ask that you allow me to do my job that I chose to do; that you allow me to continue to serve the citizens of Fulton County, not only in the capacity of the Clerk of Superior Court, but also in the Clerk -- the capacity as the Clerk of Magistrate Court. I ask that you try to not just listen to my side, listen to all sides, and come to your own conclusion. But know that my team is doing a fantastic job, and I appreciate your time."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Judge Taylor."

HONORABLE WESLEY TAILOR, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Thank you, my name is Wes Taylor. I'm the Chief Judge of State Court of Fulton County; and Chairman Pitts, let me first start out by apologizing to you. I didn't mean to cause a disruption. I didn't realize how this works. I've never been up here in this situation before, so I apologize to you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No problem. No problem"

HONORABLE WES TAILOR, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "I also want to start out by thanking the Commission for your years of support of State Court. I think y'all have been behind this and really do appreciate all that you have done for us over the years. Now, as to the proposed Resolution before you, I want to start out by saying that it was a long time ago, but I do have an undergraduate degree in business administration, and I concentrated in economics and finance. So I do understand that theoretically speaking, consolidation is a good idea in organizations where there are similar functions. But what I also know is, having graduated way back when in the nineties, early nineties, is that that's not always true in real life. And if that were, there wouldn't be consulting firms that were needed to figure out whether consolidation was needed. And all that I'm going to ask of y'all, and I'm not here to get into any of what's going on here earlier. I can tell you, I don't have any issues with either. In fact, I'm friends with Tina Robinson. I can tell you she's been over to my house numerous times, so I don't have any problems with the Superior Court Clerk and any idea of how she's running her shop. But I will ask you to ask yourselves, as to this Resolution, was there any organizational study done that suggested that this is a good idea? I'll offer, no. If you look at all the organizational studies across the justice system in Fulton County that have been done, they have not said that you should consolidate the clerk functions. That is not one. There's been mentioned of one of the clerk's offices in a neighboring county, but was there a survey done of all the various counties in the State including the Metro counties? I would offer, no. And just how Gwinnett does it, is not how most counties do it. I would ask you to ask yourselves, was there an analysis of which clerk's office function and structures are most efficient for court users and taxpayers across the various different organizational setups? And I would offer -- I haven't seen one. I don't know of one. I would ask you to ask yourselves, have you received any constituent complaints about the State Court and how it's run, and the clerk function? And whether you brought those to the State Court? I haven't heard any, and I asked the previous chief judge, and she hasn't heard

any from y'all. So I don't know of any complaints about how State Court is operating. I asked you if you've heard any issues with the State Court Clerk's office? That it's inefficient. That it's too expensive to the taxpayers. That it's not meeting constituent demands. I don't know of any. They haven't been brought to my attention or the former chief judge's attention either. And I did read about the Resolution, the reasoning behind the Resolution, and I can understand the frustration. But does this Resolution address that issue? No. It just brings in State Court into a situation and could make the issue worse than what it is. So finally, I will offer that if you think back to the last time that clerk functions were changed, did that save the taxpayers any money? No. It ended up costing more money when that change was made. So what I'm just going to say is this, and I'm going to wrap up real quickly, is that the State Court and the State Court Clerk's office works diligently to fulfill its role within the justice system. We do that at relatively minimal cost to the county. If you look at what we do compared to the cost, compared to most other jurisdictions, and we do it without the drama to you. And we work well with other justice partners to help solve the issues that aren't even our issues as you all can talk about with the County Manager and with Mr. Adams. And so, I ask you not to bring us into a situation that's already a volatile situation that doesn't fix the problem that I know y'all are dealing with. If you have any questions for me, I'm happy to answer them, but otherwise that's all I have."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Judge."

HONORABLE WES TAILOR, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Thank y'all."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Who's next?"

HONORABLE ASHLEY G. DRAKE, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "All right, good morning, Honorable Chairman Pitts, Vice Chairman Ellis, and to my honorable commissioners Thorne, Barrett, Hall, Arrington Jr., and Abdur-Rahman. Thank you for what you do, for the county where I was born, where I attended college and law school, where I got married, where I live in Commissioner Barrett's district, and where I serve the public. It is an honor to be a Magistrate Court Judge in Fulton. I began my term in 2020, in the middle of the pandemic, and so I know that my office and I can persevere through anything. We are hard-working. We are team players. I recognize that questions related to policy are not part of my role as a judicial officer, and I think that Chief Judge Taylor said everything best. And out of respect for your time, I'm not going to repeat the statements that he made; but instead I would like you know how I approach important decisions like the one that you have to make today on 23-0209. I approach my cases fairly and impartially in accordance with precedent, viewing each matter with an open mind after making sure that I fully understand the facts; after making sure that I have diligently researched the issue ensuring that all interested parties feel heard and respected. My court room is always open to you. Yours in service for a better Fulton, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, colleagues, it's 11:02. The 30 minutes -- how many more speakers are there?"

CLERK GRIER: "Here in Assembly Hall, we have five more speakers."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "And then Zoom?"

CLERK GRIER: "Fourteen on Zoom and seven e-mail comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, we have a tight schedule today, so what's your pleasure?"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Chairman, with all due respect, I believe the people that are here should be heard. I know we have a tight schedule. I'm very respectful of that, but I believe the people here should at least be heard. This is a serious issue. It's an issue that I really wish that we didn't have to deal with, but I think out of all fairness, we can at least hear the ones here."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Any objections to hearing who's here? All right, come on down."

CLERK GRIER: "Judge Bobby Wolf, Judge Debbie-Ann Rickman, Judge Linda Borsky, Julie Allen, and Reverend Lydia Meredith."

HONORABLE DEBBIE-ANN RICKMAN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. Let me first start by thanking all of you for what you do for the citizens of Fulton County. My name is Debbie-Ann Rickman. I am a full-time magistrate judge here in Fulton County. I am only here to speak on the administration of justice. The services provided by the clerk, when I was appointed in 2019, are no longer being provided to us. As a result, our courts are no longer running efficiently. Namely, there is a delay in filing of case dispositions which currently affects and indirectly affects the litigant's ability take the step in their cases, especially in dispossessory actions. I ask that you all consider how the citizens of Fulton County will be affected by this decision. I ask that you support our Chief Judge Magistrate Court Cassandra Kirk. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes, ma'am."

HONORABLE LINDA BORSKY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Mr. Chairman. Good morning, Commissioners. Thank you for the opportunity this morning to address you. My name is Linda Borsky. I serve with John De Foor as the Deputy Chief Magistrate Judge. In that capacity, I am on the receiving ends of a lot of frustrations and complaints and on how the system is operating. I do not want to repeat some of the comments that were made by my colleagues, so I am just going to tell you that I am here because our court is not working efficiently or -- is not working in an efficient or productive manner at this time. We as judges are not being provided with some of the very basic services that we need to run our court rooms. Just to give you some very

quick basic examples: we have no deputies -- we have no courtroom clerks in our -- we have no clerks in our courtroom right now. Now, prior to taking the bench, I practiced law for 33 years. I'm licensed in three different states. I have practiced throughout the Metro area for over -- this Metro area for over 20 years. I've practiced throughout the country, and I have never been in a situation where I have walked into a courtroom and there were no clerks to support the judges or to process the paperwork. That is what we are facing right now, and that is why I am here today because I want to impart to you that the court right now is --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

HONORABLE LINDA BORSKY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- is dysfunctional. So I am just asking as my colleagues have, before you make any decisions, I'm asking you not to pass this Resolution. I'm asking you to come down to our court. Let us show you what we do every day so that you are in a position to make an informed decision on what the needs of the --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Who's next?"

JULIE ALLEN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, I'm Julie Allen. Ten Georgia state senators went against the will of their constituents on SB14, the Buckhead vote. Each of these districts voted overwhelmingly in favor of giving Buckhead the right to vote on the May 24th Republican Georgia statewide primary. The average overall in these ten Senate Districts were 79 percent in each. This was a very clear message to each of these ten senators to authorize Buckhead to vote. Why am I here? I'm a City of Atlanta resident outside of Buckhead. It does not serve me to risk a tax increase bond rating downgrade, et cetera; but Buckhead deserves honorable representation they simply do not get from political operatives as representatives. While I now live in Atlanta, I moved to unincorporated North Fulton in 2005 in what became the City of Johns Creek in 2006. I'll never forget how the North Fulton Citizens represented by the Commissioners and the minority on this Board were abused by the Metro majority. The night and day difference was stunning when residents were given local control and incorporated as the City of Johns Creek. Notably, roads saw major improvements that were previously perpetuated in a state of construction, virtually unusable, damaging to local business, and a complete eye sore with workers never present. In the same way, week after week, I and others have appeared before this Board to speak on issues of importance to all, specifically election management concerns. You knew that and know now that Nadine Williams was a terrible choice for Elections Director. Loads of data, election worker observations, and voter experience were completely ignored when you held a backroom vote in Executive Session after having delayed the vote until a public appeal was made via the Democratic Party for public comment to support Nadine Williams. You played your hand that it's all political manipulation with this Board, and the public knows your games more than ever. Partisan majorities that abused constituents is why unincorporated areas incorporated to protect the --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

JULIE ALLEN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- current abuse by this Board in the same way the Resolution opposing Buckhead City was self-serving denying citizens the right to vote, the right to local control to avoid abuse by political majorities that ignore the needs of all Fulton County constituents. Thank you"

LYDIA MEREDITH, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good morning, Commissioners. First, thanks to the Office of Commissioner Natalie Hall leading this initiative to remove the 13 percent ceiling to increase DFCS staff compensation in Fulton County. Fulton County has the heaviest load -- caseload in the State without adequate compensation when other counties in the state do not have such a ceiling. Again, thank you, Commissioner Hall. Now, I'm here today advocating for leadership and resources to end hoteling for DFCS foster care children and youth. It grieves me that after decades this issue is still a statewide, countywide problem. I'm here to advocate for every poor child in this state and the DFCS staff tasked with serving these poor children. I have appeared numerous times before the Fulton County Board of Commissioners and state public officials and will continue to appear for public televised record of elected officials responses to this matter. It is unfortunate when we fail to put ourselves in the shoes of citizens we represent regardless of ZIP Code and incorrigible behaviors, this matter must be handled. If your child were being hoteled, it would take less than two hours, not two decades before your child received sanctuary. We are tasked to provide safety and environment to thrive for these children, an environment that hinders and engenders behavioral modification. The solution is not rocket science. Research tells us what is needed for these children to thrive. We know what's wrong. We need two things to cure this problem: leadership and resources. We need appropriations to fund and retrofitting of existing vacant facilities like 475 Fairburn Road in Atlanta and staffing with wraparound social services and competitive pay for staff to serve our children and youth --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

LYDIA MEREDITH, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- Krista Tolliver, Region 14 Director, presented an excellent facility plan. We wish that you would pay attention. Immediate action is needed for these children. Pay now for leadership and resources or pay later for elevated crime, legal, or justice costs. Thank you so much for your consideration."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No more in Assembly?"

CLERK GRIER: "No, more speakers."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. So how many -- how many are there on Zoom?"

CLERK GRIER: "We have 14 on Zoom, seven e-mailed in comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. So consistent with our rules, you have 30 minutes for a total for public comment and when that time expires, so the rest will take care of everyone that's here. The Zoom comments, we can package them and hear them at the end of the meeting. Continue."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 10, item that was moved up on today's Agenda under the Commissioners' Action Item, **23-0208**: Request approval of a Resolution by the Fulton County Board of Commissioners authorizing the Fulton County Attorney to file a complaint with the Department of Justice requesting that it investigates WellStar Health System for healthcare redlining; and for other purposes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. So very quickly, it is 11:12 now. So what this Resolution is asking us to do, is to take a position that was consistent with the position that was taken at a press conference that I was invited to participate in last week with Senator Orrock and other state senators and representatives regarding the devastating effect of the closure of WellStar of the central facility as well as their southside facility. The two complaints that came out of that meeting that were filed, one was to the Department of Health and Human Services was Civil Rights Title VI violations. The second complaint was to the IRS to ask any IRS to look at their nonprofit status as a result of certain violations that we believe certain violations. So what's before us today is a continuation of that effort. This one though will go directly to the Department of Justice which has more teeth. It has a serious strong enforcement division, and I would respectfully ask that there would be hopefully -- that it is approved. I'd like to see it approved unanimously because we all know what has happened as a result of the closure of those two facilities by WellStar. Two things: it's created a healthcare desert in Central and South Fulton County; and number two, it is a classic example of healthcare redlining, not only here, but this is a problem nationwide. So, Madam County Attorney, would you describe what specifically is included in the legislation and what the next steps would be if approved."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "This proposed Resolution provides for my office to prepare a complaint to the Department of Justice on the basis of Title VI violations by WellStar Health Systems. There are facts that have come to light recently that raised the question about their motivation in closing the South Fulton and downtown locations; and those can be lawfully explored in the context of the complaint to the appropriate authorities. One of them was HHS, which has already received a complaint. They also enforce Title VI in terms of pulling federal funding, if an entity is found to be in violation. The complaint that is proposed to DOJ would be on a similar basis, Title VI, and we would also research any other applicable basis to include in our complaint. The DOJ has different enforcement mechanisms from HHS to include judicial enforcement. They can request injunctive relief, specific performance, and they have other available remedies as well, so that is what is being proposed."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, we have a motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Natalie Hall."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I requested to speak."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. The motion is on the floor. Commissioner Thorne, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Thank you. Thank you. I appreciate it. I just wonder have we really talked to WellStar? Has anybody on this Board -- anybody on the staff? Has anybody talked to WellStar? Thursday morning I went to a breakfast -- a legislative breakfast, and that was the first I heard about your press conference, Chairman Pitts, and how you are representing us as a Board."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute. That's not correct. I was representing myself not the Board."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Okay. It was -- I'm sorry, I misunderstood, but that's what I was told. So, I did some diligence and tried to reach out to WellStar to see what their position was. So AMC has long served the vulnerable patients in our city without public financial support. They have done this critically important work without any additional funding. They could not sustain their operations in combination with an aged infrastructure at AMC. WellStar is a safety net provider in every market that they serve. They don't just serve South Fulton County; they serve eight different counties. As a result, they've provided more indigent, charity and other unreimbursed healthcare than any other system in the State of Georgia. Over the last six years, they've invested 350 million dollars in capital investments at AMC, and they sustained operating losses more than three times their annual investment in capital improvements compared to historical averages. WellStar purchased AMC in 2016. Did we think they were redlining then? They jumped in to try to help. They thought they could build a sustainable solution to serve the community and care beyond the walls of the hospital and usher in a new healthcare model. This included purchasing much needed medical equipment, new operating rooms, new computer hardware and software systems, new phone system, and extensive investments in the building and renovations including long-term investments like new boilers, roofs, new elevators. In addition, their staff hired more doctors and nurses and raise their salaries. Still, they operated under substantial losses that they cannot sufficiently invest in alternative care models like preventative care, which was much needed. They couldn't address the community's underlying health problems and prevent expensive repeated emergency room visits. In addition, they were unable to attract the whole community, including those who had commercial insurance, to seek care at their hospital. No hospital can survive without having insured patients come to their facility. The challenges that they face were multifaceted. They needed to replace AMCs buildings to meet the new care standards. They had a low utilization with the occupancy of only half the licensed beds resulting in insufficient revenue. The lack of public and private philanthropy support while caring for the city's

most vulnerable population was unsustainable. AMC treats the same patients as our good friend Grady down the road, but they do it without the 50 to \$60 million that we subsidize them. Grady could not and would not survive without the money that we provide them. And as well, AMC could not survive without the same help, and they've gotten none. WellStar is a nonprofit organization, and the health systems' net revenue is reinvested into our mission to enhance the health and the well-being of every person they serve. Since 2016, WellStar has invested more than 350 million in capital improvements, \$107 million in losses just in the last 12 months, and their trajectory is only going downward. Revenue has decreased and inflationary costs have increased. Staffing and supply costs dramatically. The Medicare and Medicaid programs don't pay for the cost of care, and the gap is only increased due to inflation over the past several years. The pandemic and the intense financial headwinds are straining all healthcare organizations right now, but it has only made matters worse at AMC. No one can continue to operate a full-service hospital under these circumstances. WellStar continued to operate AMC with significant losses to support the community during the pandemic. And provide more time to find a partner or a buyer or any other creative solution for the hospital's future. Their search was not a secret, it was heavily publicized. No one came forward to help. No one wanted to acquire and operate the facility. Not Fulton County, not Grady, not any other health system in the country. Discussed decisions with local, regional, and national players yielded no interest in anyone operating AMC given all the challenges. A stable outlook for the system at large does not address the issues that this hospital specifically, which threatened the stability of the system and which go beyond the low utilization and unsustainable operating losses to include an aging infrastructure which would require substantial more investment to address. Modern care standards would require that the hospital be rebuilt at a cost of 1.5 to 2.0 million per bed. And we all know that from our jail study, that's out of sight. To rebuild AMC to a fully licensed capacity to over 400 beds would cost a billion dollars. Even to rebuild it at half the size, it would cost 500 million. And without any additional financial support from the County, the State, or the local foundation, the investments would be lost. We look at today the national -- on a national level, we're helping bail out banks, but we're not helping bail out hospitals. When they acquired AMC, they invested substantially into the facilities. Unfortunately over time, it became clear that AMC campus was not equipped to accommodate the latest care technology, nor was it built in a way that is cost-effective to renovate. The infrastructure could not be sustained in today's complex, inpatient, and emergency care without being demolished and rebuilt. A third-party analysis of the building found that almost the entire hospital facility, which includes several buildings, have significant structural issues due to their age; and many of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems are at the end of the useful life. The assessment of AMC's infrastructural limitations were shared by every organization that they sought to partner with. They have a low utilization, 50 percent of the patients access care through the emergency department. For AMC, the uninsured pair mix is 17.4 percent, while the commercially insured is 14.8 percent. That is a model that can't be sustained. WellStar has been open about the challenges facing AMC, and they need to find a sustainable path forward for the hospital's future. In February of 2020, WellStar publicly announced a formal search for

a partner, a buyer, to preserve access to inpatient care at AMC. They said that it was unsustainable and they needed help. They reached out to us. Through an exhaustive search, they connected with healthcare organizations locally, regionally, and nationally. More than a dozen potential partners expressed some initial interest, but ultimately, after learning more details about the hospital's condition and the finances, none were interested in acquiring the hospital or pursuing partnership with WellStar to operate, either at the main hospital campus or AMC South. We also discussed the future of the AMC government officials and community leaders, but no funding was offered or made available. They were left without any other options. WellStar discussed the financial challenges at AMC and the need for support in order to keep it open in Fulton County officials on multiple times. Yet they were offered no support and no solutions. By signing this -- oh, I just want you to know that WellStar approximately \$1.2 billion in unreimbursed care they've provided, 531 million of charity care to those who cannot afford to pay. In 2021, the numbers were over \$915 million in total unreimbursed and under reimbursed care, and over 475 million in charity care to those who could not afford to pay. And if you want to compare it to Grady, Grady's total under in unreimbursed care totaled 373 million in 2020 that's the last audited report that they have filed. By signing this Resolution, Commissioners, what message are we sending? Who -- what hospital would want to come in to Fulton County now? What message are we sending? AMC came in and couldn't sustain and now the basic purpose of this Resolution is to hurt them, to lash out, to pull their nonprofit status out. Yes, they'll have to pay tons of legal fees and the IRS and the DOJ. They'll have to step away from their care, the care that they continue to provide to underprivileged citizen across the state. The people of South Fulton need help, and we need to sit down and we need to come up with a solution. We don't need to lash out and punish. This Resolution is not a solution, and that's what the poor people in South Fulton and Fulton County need."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman followed by Commissioner Arrington followed by Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Let me apologize right now, because with all due respect, Commissioner Thorne, you need to educate yourself on healthcare redlining. When you asked was there anybody on here that had conversations with WellStar, I know for a fact, Commissioner Hall, I know for a fact that Chairman Pitts for years, okay, and myself. And it could be others, but those are the ones that I know for a fact. Also, facts versus fiction that you just put in to that mic, I, as well as Commissioner Hall, as well as Commissioner Arrington, served the districts. We've taken the calls of the individuals who have suffered because they were looked at as a dollar sign instead of a human being. When you look at the accessible healthcare below I-20, coming into the south, that alone should have prompted you to have a conversation with your colleagues. Because at the end of the day, whether WellStar manages to get out of this without a black eye or not, the fact still remains nonprofit. The fact still remains what was told to us under the leadership of the Chairman differed from what we found out to be facts. So, I would say to you to have a conversation with your colleagues, especially the colleagues that live south. Your colleagues did not take the calls when the

grandmother died because she couldn't get to the hospital in a timely manner, or was turned away. Your colleagues didn't take the call when that baby life was in jeopardy. And I am personally offended by your white privilege. You don't live in my district. You don't live south, and for you to come up here do a false dissertation on what we have not done, I am upset. Because we took the calls before you were in office. We talked to the individuals. We talked to WellStar. A lot of situations -- and I understand, bottom line it comes to the dollar; I get that. I've worked in corporate America, but when you have individuals -- elected individuals like Chairman Pitts and Commissioner Hall and others, as myself, who had conversations with WellStar, who brought in other entities to try to see if we could save it for our constituents -- I will not sit here and listen to your white privilege. Because guess what? Your white privilege does not cross over to I-20, south. So I say to you, I am offended by even you sitting up here saying what you said, and did not have a conversation with the people who represent the District. We have been healthcare redlined, and whether what the Chairman has done, whether it helps us or not, it has to be said. Just like fair housing has to be said. Just like going to school, integration, has to be said. Just like women rights has to be said. These are uncomfortable conversations, but these are conversations that we have to have, because I'll be damned if I'm going to sit here and watch somebody try to say that this was a decision made and had no input from my colleagues. That is a fallacy. That is a lie, and I will not let you sit up here and say it. Chairman, I'm finished."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. That sounded like a paid advertisement that you just read. I guess your check is in the mail. None of what you said is true. None. Not one word. They never approached us. They never talked to us. They never asked us for any money. That is an absolute falsehood. The first thing that we've noticed that we got was that they were closing the WellStar in East Point; and they said oh; don't worry, because we're going to keep the one in Midtown open. But you know what the people in Grady told me? They said they're closing the one in Midtown in six months. And guess what they did, they closed the one in Midtown in six months. None of what you said was true. Not one conversation. All of that is a falsehood. To say that they approached us and asked us for help, you weren't even here. They might have approached you as a citizen living in North Fulton. I don't know why they would have approached you as a citizen in North Fulton about hospitals. You were not a part of this Board. How in the world could you say they approached us? Or we did something? You weren't a part of we. We did not. And so, for you to fabricate a story through a paid advertisement that we were approached and that we got that information, is beyond comprehension. That is beyond comprehension. What we have is exactly what the other Commissioner just said, is white privilege. You've got eight hospitals in North Fulton, so you don't care that there are zero south of I-20. You have that privilege because you have those eight hospitals available to you. We don't have that privilege. There is no way in the world that if they had come to us and asked us for some support that we would have not given them that support in lieu of them closing one or both of those hospitals. And so, for you to assert otherwise is befuddling. That's

why I say it must be a paid advertisement, and your check must be in the mail because, again, you weren't here. I was here. I'm happy to have a conversation with you to tell you what transpired. I'm sure anyone up here will tell you what happened that was here. Commissioner Ellis was here. Commissioner Hall, Commissioner Pitts, I was here. Commissioner Hausmann was here. You could call her and ask her. But please, don't come in here reading prepared statements, talking about we and us, when you weren't a part of we and us. You don't know what happened. You don't know what they did; and you're reading the statement like you do, like it's a fact. Please, ma'am, please don't do that. Please, don't do that. Please, please, please."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I just want to weigh in and say that I appreciate Chairman Pitts', your Resolution and your interest in defending the citizens of our county who deserve healthcare and to ensure through this actions that if there was healthcare redlining, that we address it appropriately, so I appreciate your efforts on that front. I appreciate Commissioner Abdur-Rahman's comments about healthcare in her district and the calls that she has received. I appreciate Commissioner Arrington's comments and I concur that that sounded quite like a paid advertisement for WellStar. You asked in your lengthy comments what message are we sending? And I would ask you, what message are you sending when you said not one word about healthcare in Fulton County? You said not one word defending the citizens of Fulton County. You said nothing about your role as a County Commissioner, but rather sounded like you were a lawyer defending WellStar. That's not the job you were elected to do. That's certainly that not the job I was elected to do. So I support my colleagues and I support this Resolution, and I'm sort of on -- Commissioner Abdur-Rahman said when I say I'm appalled by your comments, Commissioner Thorne."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Well, that was the whole opening and why we have not had a discussion as a Board. I get blasted with this on Thursday morning not prepared, and it's on the agenda the next day -- put on the agenda. We have not had a sit-down discussion. We have not called WellStar in here. I am not informed. I just simply presented facts. If you can tell me what facts and the numbers that they have presented and the numbers and the losses, it's under audited --"

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "-- Commissioner Thorne, with all due --"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "-- excuse me. Excuse me, I have the floor."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You have the floor, Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "They have facts. They have had a \$107 million in losses. There's a reason no other hospital wanted to come in. I can read to you from

the CEO. The suggestion that WellStar in any way discriminated against patients and care in communities of color is shameful and false. We are a diverse group with 24,000 caregivers caring for diverse communities every day across Georgia. We must set the record straight about why WellStar had to close AMC and why we are exploring options in Augusta. In fact, our efforts to find another health system partner and work with government officials to find a solution started well before our decision was announced to close AMC in 2022. We spent more than two years trying to do so. This is included, direct discussions with policymakers in Fulton County including Chairman Pitts as early as February 2020. Unfortunately, local policymakers did not provide any support to AMC as they rightly had and do with other safety net hospitals in Atlanta. They're committed to full transparency on these issues and are launching a website to inform in town halls. Now, to address the white privilege, I guess being Hispanic -- I'm a white privileged person and I don't understand. I have been trying to go down to South Fulton and visit and meet the people of South Fulton and understand their needs. I am down there on a weekly basis trying to learn the wants, the needs, and the people of South Fulton. And Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, with all respect, I resent that you plead that simply because I'm white, which I'm really Latino Hispanic, is that I don't understand. I do understand and I want a solution, and I don't think punishing a hospital without having a roundtable discussion exactly what are they doing, presenting the facts, letting them be down here to defend themselves. No, we get presented with a one-sided and then, oh, you simply don't understand and everything you're speaking is falsehood. I did not make this up. I try to speak. I try to stay the path, but there's a different rule for me because I'm white up here. I'm even told at meetings that there's certain words that I can't use because I am white and privileged. On this Board, I should be able to speak the same as anybody else, but I'm told that I'm not, and I resent that. To me, I want to help the people of South Fulton. I want a hospital to go in there. I want them to have the best care. I just think this Resolution is not going to solve the healthcare issue in South Fulton. It's only going to get tied up in courts. It's only going to be an expensive litigation; it's all going to hurt the people of South Fulton, and that's exactly what I don't want. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. Well, when I saw the lineup of speakers, Commissioner Khadijah Abdur-Rahman, Commissioner Marvin Arrington, Jr., and Commissioner Dana Barrett, I knew that they were going to say everything that needed to be said before it got to me. So, I just paused and put my name in the queue at the end of that list of people because I knew they were going to address everything that needed to be addressed. And yes, I am one of those Commissioners who WellStar contacted and spoke with, and, let me see, the best way I can put this is pretty much everything they told me turned out to be incorrect. I won't say a lie; I'll just say it was not correct information. And as Commissioner Arrington stated, we were told oh well, we're going to keep the WellStar that is in your district, Commissioner Hall on Boulevard, in the Old Fourth Ward; it will remain. And then I had to find out from the street, from the street committee, from the gossip, that it was closing. I even had Dr.

Bernice King call me and tell me, and I'm like, how do you know before I know? That should never happen. WellStar has not been a good partner, and they have not been honest with us. And you know there's a saying that a lot of people say and it goes like this: The only thing necessary for the triumph of evil is for good men, and I'm going to alter this saying by saying for good men and women to do nothing. And so, today with Resolution 23-0208, this is good men and women coming together to do something to triumph over evil and to stop evil. Thank you, Mr. Chair."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I'm not really sure what implications you're making about not being allowed to speak as a white woman or a white person on this Commission. I can only speak to my own experience as a white Jewish woman on this Commission that I've been treated with the utmost respect by all of my colleagues. And I am completely allowed to say whatever I want to say. I've never been made to feel otherwise, so I'm not quite sure where you're coming from on that. And I also want to say, if you had spent maybe more time reading the Resolution proposed by Chairman Pitts and less time reading, you know, nonfactual information presented by WellStar, you might recognize that this is not an attempt to quote "solve the problem of healthcare in South Fulton." It is rather an investigation, a request for the DOJ to investigate WellStar for possible healthcare redlining period. And if there was healthcare redlining by WellStar, we need to address that, period. So your whole defense of WellStar here has nothing to do with healthcare redlining. You're talking about dollars, you're talking about profit, nonprofit, attempts to get money or not get money; all irrelevant to the Resolution at hand, which is that we're asking the DOJ to investigate healthcare redlining. That's what Chairman Pitts is asking of us, that's what we need to do. So let's do that because if the citizens of Fulton County are being treated inappropriately because of their race, we have an obligation to address that, period."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Let me be crystal clear about my position on this: White privilege can turn in to white tears at any moment. White privilege can turn into white tears at in any moment. The problem I have, Commissioner Thorne, I respect you as a Commissioner, but I think you may need to have a conversation with whatever Commissioner you are comfortable with because you need to have a conversation before you come and read a statement the way you did. Because when these hospitals were closing, when Chairman Pitts, as well as others, were trying to fight, you weren't here. You didn't get the calls, and I stand by my statement, because I as well as other Commissioners over here got the calls. We know people whose lives we're loss simply because they were poor and of color. If you want to talk about Medicaid dollars, go to the State and lobby for Medicaid expansion. Why don't you do that, instead of coming down here reading something that I took offensive because I was on the front line, as well as other Commissioners, trying to save a hospital that brown and black people got to beg. We have tax dollars like everybody else. But let's be crystal clear about

healthcare redlining. And like I said, me and the Chairman -- there's a lot of stuff that we do not agree on, but this I wholeheartedly agree on because I've seen the effects of it. So moving forward, have a conversation with me. Have a conversation with the rest of your Commissioners even if they don't have a conversation with you, because this job as an elected official nobody's going to come and sit anything in your lap and say this is Politics 101. You have to have the conversations. You have to build the relationships. You have to educate yourself. I get statements all the time. I get e-mails. Some e-mails I get, you would think the dogs in Fulton County are just being euthanized and everything else. So I have to go on my own and find out the truth of the matter. This is the problem I have with your statement because you've acted as though it was truth. You've acted as though you were here, and you acted as though you represented our communities who are being held hostage for healthcare. I take issue with it today, I took issue with it yesterday, and I'll take issue with it tomorrow. Communication is the key. If I offended you in anyway by what I said, I gave an opening apology, and I am going to give you an apology for the rest of the year, because when it comes to people of black and brown, not having a seat at the table, I'm a big whopping seat for them and I want you to understand that. We worked hard to try to save healthcare in Fulton County. And so, I'm asking you to get the facts before you come down here and say things that are offensive to me, because I was here trying to save. I saw how hard the Chairman. I saw Commissioner Hall go to meetings. I went to meetings. So I would ask that you would have a conversation with your colleagues whether solicited or not."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Commissioner. Commissioner Arrington followed by Commissioner Thorne again. Now, we've been talking about this -- I want a -- motion on the floor is to approve, and then Councilmember Antonio Lewis who is here from the City of Atlanta is here as well. So after -- wanting to be heard of this matter, so after Commissioner Arrington and back to Commissioner Thorne, I'd like to hear from Councilmember Antonio Lewis who requested to speak on this issue. Mr. Arrington, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Point of order: I was getting ready to call the question, but you said you got a councilmember here that wants to speak, so."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Let him speak now."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I will yield."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Come on down, Councilman Lewis."

COUNCILMAN ANTONIO LEWIS, CITY OF ATLANTA: "Thank you, Chairman, for allowing me to speak. Thank you, Board of Commissioners. I couldn't help but to come by today because I represent the area in which the first AMC -- well, I grew up on the street, on Cleveland Avenue, and I represent the neighboring city in which the first AMC was closed. After I saw it close myself, we issued a statement. We requested other bodies in the state to look at AMC -- I mean, look at WellStar, to look at them in a

different way and to ask them to no longer close these hospitals. Six months later, they closed the other one. And so, today when I come in, I see some good work done by the Chairman, good work down by the Board requesting that we look at redlining. Because the statement I put out said we have no hospitals below I-20. It seems like the entire Fulton County is speaking on the same accord; speaking with one voice. We're saying that the only way we can save this stuff is if the Governor -- if we all lobbied our Governor to expand Medicare and Medicaid, that's one way, and to go and look and see if hospitals are redlining us. And so, I stand wholeheartedly with that. I represent the area. You're speaking to a person who's lived only that area right now. We don't have access to hospitals. That hospital had their lights off the entire time on Cleveland Avenue. We've never felt comfortable going in. It was really never open for us. Right now, what we're doing, going to look at, actually looking at their books. We want to see the e-mails. The Department of Justice is going to do a different kind of scope to see exactly what they were doing to see if they always knew they were going to close us down. So I want to say I appreciate you for allowing me to come to speak today, and I hope that we take this as a notice that the way we save these hospitals as a major city, Atlanta, that we call ourselves the -- we call ourselves, we are the beloved community that Dr. King talked about. The reason why he talked about it was because black people, white people, Latinos, no matter what your race is, you came here. You're a part of a community and a family; we took care of each other. There's a saying Alex Tuckerfield said, America is great because America is beautiful. If America ever ceases to be great, America ceases to be beautiful -- I mean, good. Atlanta is great because Atlanta is good. If Atlanta ceases to be good, Atlanta ceases to be great. I think with the hospitals and the healthcare redlining, because other folks are messing with us, messing with this group project, were messing it up. We need you to come on the right side of the table to help us be great, and help us to be good as we are. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I would like to call the question."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Is there a second?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, properly moved and seconded. Let's vote on the call of the question, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open on call the question. And the motion passes; five yeas, one nay, one abstention."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, there's a motion on the floor is to approve. Let's vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; five yeas, one nay, one abstention."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Continue, Madame Clerk."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Mr. Chairman."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yes."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Could you just give me just one --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- you have the floor, Vice Chair,"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "And I didn't have the opportunity and I chose not to speak in this on advice from our County Attorney. But I just wanted to go on record as to why I abstained. WellStar has advisory boards for their local hospitals. And I'm currently the term serving the one for -- the one in North Fulton, which I have nothing to do with the decision that was made by this group, and far as just an advisory board giving input into that local community hospital. But nonetheless, as I was talking it through with our County Attorney, she advised me to recuse myself and not engage in discussion while, you know, while the debate was taking place and the vote occurred. But I just want to go on record to say, you know, there are -- there's always time -- it's never too late to do the right thing, and I really would encourage WellStar to reengage in a different fashion in which they've chose to engage so far. You know, I had a loose tie to them in that community in terms of, you know, being on this advisory board; and I can say I never was reached out to individually as a Commissioner and advised of this particular discussion related to AMC. We were provided a lot of notification relative to discussion around East Point, but not around AMC. You know, there are a lot of good points and some stuff that were raised today, you know, but when you're a health system that operates under the basis of a certificate of need, and you were given pseudo-monopolies in areas in which you operate, you carry a higher degree of responsibility which you choose to do within your footprint in which you operate. This is not a solo hospital, it's a hospital system, and I think there are some distinction that needs to be made with that. So, you know, it's a conversation that, you know, does need to continue. The other thing I just wanted to also kind of note, you know, on the heels of this sort of ugly discussion, we had a very positive thing that took place the other day with the opening of the Grady Pavilion, and Grady ran into a lot of troubles, you know, really preceded except for I think Chairman Pitts really kind of -- all of our time in public office. But when those troubles emerged, a lot of people kind of got together and make that work including the corporate community, and we heard that again yesterday at the opening of the Pavilion the involvement of the corporate community. You know, so there are multiple stakeholders that when you're operating a hospital that you're required to reach out to, you know, just by moral and ethical obligation, and try to work things out, you know. You know, unfortunately, that did not occur here, and we are where we are."

But again, you know, it's not too late for WellStar to engage differently and do the right thing."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Commissioner. All right, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "Back on page 7, bottom of page 7, County Manager's Items under Open and Responsible Government, **23-0193**, External Affairs: Presentation of the 2023 Legislative Session update."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, it's 11:58. We got 47 minutes; that's the schedule."

JESSICA CORBITT, DOMINGUEZ, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "That's all for me, Chairman, thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No."

JESSICA CORBITT, DOMINGUEZ, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Good morning, everyone. I will try to keep it brief, because I know you have a work session to get to and I'm going to go through the slides. Commissioner Hall, thank you for recognizing the Howard students this morning. My son is a seventh grader there and it is a wonderful community."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Ms. Corbitt, let's go."

JESSICA CORBITT, DOMINGUEZ, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "I know. I hear you. I'm just giving them a minute to bring the slides. Next slide, please. This is our last legislative update before sign and die; and I just want to remind everyone of our priorities, and I'm going to really focus on those today. Next slide. The big news for us is that the funding for our behavioral health crisis center was in the full funding, six months of full funding was in the budget that was passed by the House and crossed over last week. We are continuing to advocate in the Senate. Next slide, please. This is just an update on the delegation meeting. Next slide. Here we are on our budget. So again, continuing to monitor that in the Senate. We've met with several senate members. Next. So here we are: these are the bills that were part of our adopted package and just want to share an update on these and a couple of slides. House Bill 460 related to child attorney's office crossed over. House Bill related to the State Court judges' retirement plan, that is a local bill, and it has moved forward. It was introduced on the 1st. The Senior Homestead Exemption Bill does now have a number; that is Senate Bill 303, our thanks to Senator Halprin for her leadership on that. I'm going to cross down to House Bill 30, which did cross over. That is the bill addressing anti-Semitism, and House Bill 188, 'Miriam's Law' also crossed over last week. House Bills 432 and Senate Bill 82, those were the Crown Act. Unfortunately, those did not cross over. Senate Bills 113 and 114, which this Board opposed, those also did not cross

over. And I wanted to mention two of the areas that this Board adopted as priorities that we will be continuing to work on for the next session. One of those is related to the commercial tax -- commercial assessment, and specifically looking at the appeals process. And then the second of those is the MARTA Board representation. So, we are continuing to have conversation there. Next slide, please. This is just an update on -- again on a couple of other ones that this Board supported: House Bill 662 creates a technology fee to support Probate Court. House -- Senate Bill 19, that Bill is related to the application or the fees for passports. And again, we just talked about the Crown Act a few minutes ago. Next slide. And these were the two bills that you all opposed related to the Buckhead City -- City of Buckhead. Next. And I think, Mr. Chairman, unless there are any others, again, those are really our priority areas. There are many other bills in the written report that we -- and we're glad to take any questions."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Commissioners, any questions for, Ms. Corbitt?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Mr. Chair, I have something that I want to add to the legislative agenda, but I'm going to wait until it comes up on -- as an item later."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, thank you, Ms. Corbitt."

JESSICA CORBITT, DOMINGUEZ, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Thank you, very much."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Continue, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 8, **23-0194**, Finance: Request approval of a Resolution authorizing the distribution of a Preliminary Official Statement, Notice of Sale, an Official Bid Form for the 2023 Tax Anticipation Note."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0195**, Real Estate and Asset Management: Request approval of spending authority in an amount not to exceed \$2,331,442 to provide gasoline and diesel fuel."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0196**: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$1,160,245.01 to provide and install office furniture and related components for the Fulton County Central Warehouse."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, it's seconded by Commissioner Hall. Cast your vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "On page 9, under Health and Human Services, **23-0199**, Senior Services: Request approval of a recommended proposal in an amount not to exceed \$1,727,156.58 to provide congregate and home-delivered meals."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to approve by Commissioner Hall, it's seconded by Commissioner Thorne. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0200**: Request approval to close out a contract in the amount of \$71,633.06 to provide aging services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You have a motion to approve by Commissioner Barrett, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0201**: Request approval to increase spending authority in an amount not to exceed \$1,800,000 to provide transportation services."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, a favorable motion by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Commissioner Thorne followed by Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I just want to say that I looked at this Common Courtesy, and it seems like it's an excellent organization. It's a nonprofit operated by Bob and Ann Carr, and I'm glad that we are aligning with them."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So, in my Homestead Exemption Town Halls, I got some comments from seniors at the senior center, and I've spoken with Dr. Roshell about some of them. But the -- I also got one in reference to transportation and the fact -- this was at the Fairburn Senior Center, and they said that they -- well, they said the buses are always late; the buses are always late, and that they can't use the Uber or this ride share, because they take them somewhere and then they get stuck there and they can't get back. And so, we need to try to look at those issues, and I think we're going back out to the Fairburn Center in a month. But that was certainly one of the issues that was expressed. And so, before we approve a contract for \$1.8 million, I want to know why they always late?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "Commissioner Arrington, Ladisa Onyiliogwu, Senior Services Department, Department of Senior Services Director. This particular agenda item is for the Common Courtesy contractor. The point that you are referencing pertains to the traditional bus service. That contractor is Transdev. Our team just met with the Transdev contractor a week or so ago to talk about on-time performance, and we are monitoring that. But this particular agenda item addresses the additional enhancement that the Board approved the Department of Senior Services for fiscal year '23, and so it's separate."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Okay, well, why are our seniors getting stuck somewhere when they're using ride share through Common Courtesy?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "They're getting stuck with the ride share or with the bus?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "They're getting stuck in a location, they can't get back. They say ride share doesn't work. They get a ride to the place where they're going. They get stuck in that location, and they're unable to get a ride share back home. So, before we approve a \$1.8 million, I want to know why are our seniors getting stuck somewhere."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HSS: "So, Commissioner Arrington, thank you for those -- the feedback from the Town Hall. As you indicated, you and I have spoken and we'll address the matters that you raise or that the constituents raise. This based on the feedback that you received is also a performance issue. I understand your concern, and we will have a performance conversation with Common Courtesy as well, and we'll provide the feedback."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Okay. Is this time sensitive? If not, I'm going to make a substitute motion to hold.

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HSS: "It's not."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It's not."

DR. PAMELA ROSHELL, COO, FC HSS: "It's not time sensitive."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Motion to hold."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to hold. Is there a second?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, properly moved and seconded, and the motion is to hold. Madam Clerk? Motion to hold by Commissioner Arrington, seconded by Commissioner Hall? Ready? Let's go."

CLERK GRIER: "Okay. And the vote is open on the motion to hold. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0202**: Request approval to extend an existing contract in an amount not to exceed \$247,733.25 to continue to provide food service management."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, a motion to approve by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Commissioner Hall, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I did not know that Piccadilly was still open. Chairman said him either. I mean, seriously, it is. Is it just for this service to us, because I haven't seen a Piccadilly anywhere."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "My aunt and my other aunt just went to eat there in DeKalb County, so they're open somewhere."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. Okay, because there used to be one right in -- well, on the very outside of my district. But are we ensuring that they're getting the healthiest of foods?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "The contract does outline the types of meals that are to be provided. This is for the multipurpose or for independent seniors and it also supports behavioral health. So, I believe that they are -- we do conduct surveys of the meal service and the experience from seniors and

communicate that to the provider as well, but we can provide additional information to you regarding the nutritional facts and how the meals are developed."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "You're welcome."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Is this a time sensitive contract?"

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "This is. The current contract is extended through March 31st. There is a solicitation that closes today, Commissioner. If the Board does not approve this today, we will not have a contract in place beginning April. We anticipate bringing forward a recommendation to the Board next month, but we will be without a contract if you do not approve this today."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Okay, so last night I had another Town Hall in Palmetto: Commissioner Arrington -- this is the question that I was asked -- why at the Darnell Center can anybody come and eat food for two dollars? I thought that food was for the seniors? And the lady next door, next to the man, said oh, yeah, my boss just went down there. They got that good food, Commissioner Hall. So apparently it tastes real good. But anybody in the world can go there and get food for \$2.00. So who is in charge of making sure that our seniors -- because we're not paying this money for me and you to go down there and pay \$2.00 for lunch."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "You're correct."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "We're paying this money for our seniors, and I don't mind if other people -- if it's that good, look, maybe you and I do need to go down there. But if it's -- those lunches don't need to be subsidized, but more importantly our seniors need to be prioritized. I don't care if we sell food to them, but they need to be paying the regular market price. And if we need to have a priority line for our seniors, they shouldn't have to wait behind people from the general public coming in there to eat, because that is a senior center primarily for them. If this wasn't time sensitive, I'd do another motion to hold, because -- and it may not be their fault, right? It may not be in their contract; that may be our fault. That may be us that needs to monitor that, right? But apparently it's some people pulling up there right now."

LADISA ONYILIOGWU, DIRECTOR, SENIOR SERVICES: "Commissioner, we will follow up with the Board and confirm that this contract is for seniors, and we'll respond to the concerns that you received and definitely confirm that this is supposed to be for seniors."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, the motion on the floor is to approve by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0203**, Public Works: Request approval to --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- okay, Commissioners, the next four items are all approval of lowest bidders; any objection to taking the four of these together? They're all Public Works, lowest bidder. Just sound them, Madam Clerk."

CLERK GRIER: "23-0203: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in the amount of \$354,260 to provide water meter testing and repairs. 23-0204: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in the amount to exceed -- not to exceed \$349,996.36 to provide sewer line chemical root control services. 23-0205: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed \$360,742.45 to provide manholes, frames, grates, and accessories. 23-0206: Request approval of the lowest responsible bidder in an amount not to exceed 2,400,000 to provide standby miscellaneous construction services for Fulton County Water System."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. I have a motion to approve all four by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman. Please vote. It's the approval of all four."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes unanimously."

CLERK GRIER: "Commissioners' Action Items, **23-0207**: Request approval of Resolution to support the adoption of legislation by the General Assembly to create transparency in policing and to address police brutality and excessive use of force perpetrated against African-Americans and for other persons of color; and for other purposes sponsored by Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Colleagues, I would ask you for your support on this. We supported a similar Resolution for -- against anti-Semitism just recently, and I think this was as a result of my request to have similar legislation. Not only has there been an increase in anti-Semitism against Jewish people, but there's obviously been an increase in violence against people of color; particularly by police. So, I would hope that we could encourage -- I don't know -- the anti-Semitism one that we encouraged was attached to a bill that was already there, so we don't have that here. But my point at the

time was anti-Semitism isn't the only thing that we need to be urging them to take action on."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. Commissioner Arrington, I just want to let you know that I received a phone call saying that this is something that is being addressed in other states as well, Illinois to be exact, is one of those states where they're looking at the same type of policy, so you're right on board. You're right in line with that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I just had a quick question, and I think it's really more for Jessica just regarding the timing of this, because given that we've already passed Crossover Day -- by the way, Commissioner Arrington, I fully support the sentiment of this 100 percent, so I just want to make that clear. I agree with you that this is something we should be talking about. I'm just questioning Jessica, how you would handle this from a timing perspective, because obviously we've passed Crossover Day, and there's not a specific piece of legislation here."

JESSICA CORBITT, DOMINGUEZ, DIRECTOR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Thank you, Commissioner Barrett, and thank you, Commissioner Arrington, for bringing this forward. I think what we would do is first communicate this to our delegation, which will be meeting tomorrow, and to let them know that this is a priority for this Board. This is the first of a two-year biannual session, so bills introduced this session carry forward, and typically we have, as we do this year, some things that didn't gel or didn't happen that we work on over the summer to carry forward for the next session. So, that's something we would work with Commissioner Arrington and others to work on some legislation that we could bring forward."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I agree. I totally like no one is really against the spirit of this legislation. I think that, you know, excessive force shouldn't be used on anybody, you know, black, white, Asian, anybody. And when you look at statistics; yeah, there has been an increase, but the number one killer of black men and women -- the sixth leading cause of death. There's drug overdoses is number one. I hope we can address that; motor vehicle traffic death, suicides, homicides, heart disease and cancer. So I am totally for this if we could make it for everybody. When I talked -- I'm just -- I'm still in the learning phase, but I've been talking with our justice partners. I've met with the police -- Fulton County Police. I've met with our Marshals; I've met with the Sheriff. I've met his staff, and we have some -- and the Atlanta City Police, I've met with them as well the

past couple months. And we have some great police, law enforcement officers that are here today that are working for us. And I hate to make it look like we don't support them, because they are trying to do everything that's right. They are trying to promote transparent policies. They have been reporting -- I think there's a POV report that the police report to the GBI and the FBI. They've been doing everything in here to make sure that it's totally visible and their law enforcement policies are totally transparent. So again, I kind of look at what message are we sending by doing this? Are we saying that we're going to come down harder? Are we saying if you suffer abuse and you say not to redline -- I mean not to, excuse me, that was the last conversation -- to racial profile, but then you're saying the racial profile, if it comes to abusive situations. So that's kind of where I have a little bit of tension. You know, I just totally support the police and, you know, I feel like we're having a hard time getting people hired. The Sheriff is short, I don't know, a hundred positions, and we keep training people, and they keep leaving. Every officer we train is \$90,000 and they leave and go somewhere else. So, I want to send the message that we want to support our police, not come down on our police. So that's my only option."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Yeah, I think one thing to note is sort of, you know, you have a discussion around topics like this which, you know, they're not -- they're not comfortable, but police brutality is not comfortable either -- that, you know, you can be in support -- full support of public safety and full support of transparency policing, you know at the same time. You know, one of the things that, you know, a couple of our Commissioners were not here at the time, during some of the events that took place within 2020. We actually had all of our different law enforcement agencies that are involved in day-to-day policing; Marshals, Police Department, Sheriff's office came and presented to us and gave us -- we did a review of their use of force policies; and, you know, I felt like we all felt like they were in pretty good order in terms of, you know, kind of the way they're trained, their procedures. So, you know, I don't think with Commissioner Arrington's request here that you're citing anything about Fulton County government. This is just more of a request of, you know, we'd look at this more on a statewide basis. So, you know, I think Fulton County in terms of our law enforcement agencies, and I think there's several around the Metro area that fall in the same category as well and across the state; they do a good job of this and that we are model of it. So, I don't think that they should be viewed in any sort of way as being anti-law enforcement, you know. In fact, I think it actually -- the more of these clear policies you have in place actually it does -- it fosters, you know confidence in law enforcement and our citizens. So, you know, it's obviously the dialogue, and this can get -- can go different directions and get to places where it doesn't need to be. But I think, you know, we focus on, you know, just sort of the core aspects of policing, transparency within it, you know, the things -- this type of discussion can ultimately be healthy from a public safety standpoint."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. First off, Commissioner Thorne, I'm happy to accept a friendly amendment that says excessive use of force perpetrated against any Georgia citizen, especially against African Americans. I -- you know -- you know, I think we have to be careful, right? I would like to fully support our police, and I think we probably -- we have probably 99 percent of police that do good. But I know you didn't mean to say you fully support the police. You can't support those police that killed that man, Tyre, in Memphis, right? So you can't say you fully support them; and 99 percent of them are good. There's always a bad apple, right? At least one bad apple and one bad apple leads to another, right? The whole bag doesn't rot at the same time. One apple rots first and then it affects the rest of the bag. So, I'm happy to accept something, because you are absolutely correct, it should not be using excessive force against any person. The issue is though; we haven't seen 10 or 20 young white men get killed by police. And so, that's the reason why there should be and is an emphasis against excessive police force against African-Americans. Again, for whatever reason, young white, young Latino men are not killed in that same fashion as young black men are by the police."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I appreciate that. You know, I haven't had time to look over stats, but during the Georgia Floyd days, the riots, I was deeply disturbed by what was happening. What was happening in our country and the unrest that we had, and I did go back then and pulled up stats and actually given the proportion of the races that we're actually encountered police and the proportions that were killed. It was statistically that a white you were more likely to be killed, and that -- given that perspective, I haven't kept up to date, I haven't had time to pull stats. You know, I have some stats that I didn't."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I want accept your friendly amendment if you don't want me to."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "No, no. You can make -- I just don't know, even with that, I feel like the message that we're sending to police is not good, and I don't see -- I mean, I think everybody is against the force that perpetrated against anybody is bad. But to single out one group, Latino men are greater than white men, Native American, and Alaskan peoples."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "That's what I said. I would accept your friendly amendment to include all people."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "But you're singling out, especially for persons of color, like just leave out the persons of color and put just everybody. Because you don't want redlined -- you don't want -- I'm sorry. You not want racial profiling to go on, but then you want to racial profile when you say especially persons of color."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, so you're accepting her friendly amendment?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "No, I'm not accepting it.

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I'm going to make my own."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. So, Commissioner Hall, you have the floor. Are you through, Commissioner Thorne? All right, Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you, Mr. Chair. Yes, Commissioner Thorne, please go back and look at the statistics and then you will understand why Commissioner Arrington said, and especially African-Americans. It will give you very clear understanding as to why especially African-Americans. And perhaps, before you go public with statements, you should always read the statistics. And let me say this, when we were having the riots and we were seeing very clearly on videotapes that were shared via social media and the news and seeing the police brutality against African Americans, we addressed much of that right here at this Board of Commissioners meeting. And I remember clearly our Sheriff saying that he agreed with putting measures in place to ensure that no officer ever thought that it would be, okay, to have brutality against anyone. And he wanted to make sure that measures were put -- I think he asked for a bunch of the body cameras at that time as well -- but, he was very in-line, Commissioner Thorne, with us putting in measures. So this is not something that he would take as a negative toward him or his body of Sheriffs as well as the chief of police. He has stated as well that we should take measures to ensure that there is no police brutality, so this is nothing that would be offensive to either of them. Thank you, Commissioner Arrington, for bringing this forward, and I hope you have a good amendment."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "Thank you, Commissioner Hall, for your comments. Commissioner Arrington, for being so open and flexible in your wording; and thanks to Vice Chair Ellis also for his comments. I will accept that original friendly amendment that you suggested that's saying everybody and especially. I like that, so I would like to have that in, if you're willing."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Absolutely willing to amend it to say everyone, but put the emphasis especially on -- we could even say those of color, right? I mean, minorities, right? I mean, you know, it doesn't have to be one specific group, right?"

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I like the way you said it, and I think Commissioner Hall's mention of statistics is on point. This is meant to specifically address, you know,

the disparity here and the brutality against black people, and I'm good with that, but I do like the general purpose we don't like excessive force with that addition, so spot on."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Thank you, I accept."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Oh. Commissioner Thorne, do you know what a Karen is?"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "You sound like a Karen up here. All day today."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. The motion -- I'm sorry, Commissioner Thorne, do you want to be heard?"

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I want to respond to that, because I get called a lot of names, I'm privileged, I'm a Karen, and it's all based on my appearance. And nobody knows what my upbringing is. So I kind of resent that people can judge me by the color of my skin, and they don't know my character. They don't know that my friends are all nationalities. I was raised by a mom who was a bilingual educator. She taught kids out of hundreds of different countries and worked with migrant kids over the summer. Personally, my best friends are all colors. I ran track --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- I knew it was coming."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "I know. I ran track at Georgia Tech."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "That's what they all say."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, she has the floor."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "My best friends are of all different colors and backgrounds, so I kind of resent the whole Karen statement and that I'm sounding like a Karen. To me, I am a statistical person and I do remember cases being brought up that people pointed out where white people suffered brutality at the hands of police. They just aren't advertised. They aren't just magnified by the news media. So I wish, gosh -- I wish we could live in a day where we weren't judged by our color, but I'm experiencing it now firsthand, and it saddens me. And Commissioner Barrett, you know, I know you haven't experienced it yet, but I told that I can't say certain things because of my color and especially -- and especially because I'm not --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Who told you that?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Who told you that?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "No, we're going to get to this -- we're going to get to the bottom of it. Who told you that? Someone up here told you that?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please, sir."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "You better tell the truth."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Thorne, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "And especially not -- let's get to the fact. It's because I'm a Republican."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Stop lying."

COMMISSIONER THORNE: "But I am limited by my view points and my speech, and that saddens me, because I want to represent all the people of Fulton County. I want to reach out south of town. I want to understand. I don't want to sit up here and pass legislation that is really not going to serve any good, but to further divide us; and that's what I kind of feel like what we're doing right now. And I apologize if you guys -- you guys can disagree with me, that's fine, but that's my honest opinion and, thank you, Khadijah, for saying that. And I want to stand my ground."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Barrett."

COMMISSIONER BARRETT: "I just want to say again, that I believe, you know, you're not saying anybody specific that's, you know, trying to censor you. But I believe that the only response in the negative to your words have to do with your words, not the color of your skin or, you know, national origin or any of that. So I think we need to put in a context here that any complaints that are being levied by anybody, and I can't speak for the other Commissioners, but my sense of what I'm hearing has to do with your words and nothing else."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Let's vote. The motion on the floor is to approve. Motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Hall. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open to approve as amended. And the motion passes; six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next item."

CLERK GRIER: "**23-0209**: Request approval of Resolution urging the consolidation of certain Fulton County Clerk of Court operations under the Fulton County Superior Court Clerk; directing the County Manager to assist with facilitating such consolidation; and for other purposes sponsored by Chairman Pitts."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, I'm going to move approval. Can I get a second, please? All right, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. So, you heard quite a bit today, but the research only because it's 12:36, and Mr. Adams and Ms. Thomas, where is she? We heard quite a bit today, but the trend nationally is for a consolidated unified system. There is a very perfect example that's working here which was referenced as Gwinnett County. Several of us went there and talked with them. We all came away impressed, very impressed: I, my Chief of Staff, County Attorney, and Mr. Adams. So I ask you to seriously consider this. We cannot continue with these two women fighting, bogging down the system. I'm just not going to hear from this at every meeting. So, either we go forward or we maintain the status quo and let this fester for the next six months, 12 months or whenever. So Mr. Adams, would you explain?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Point of order, Mr. Chair. Mr. Chair, I believe that this item requires us to have discussions that we should have in Executive Session. There's a potential for litigation, there is past litigation between the parties. And frankly, pursuant to the statute that we were sent by the clerk, we don't have the authority to take any action, only the General Assembly does. So, I -- and maybe we need to get the County Attorney to rule on this, but I absolutely submit that this is a matter that we need to discuss in Executive Session."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. So, let me -- my ruling will be, and I'm subject to be overruled, it's never happened in almost 40 years, but that's, okay, that this is not a matter that is eligible to be discussed in Executive Session. We cannot legislate -- go in to Executive Session based upon a threat. We are threatened every day. So my ruling is --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- wait you sent us an e-mail yesterday; you want the retreat to be Executive Session. You don't want staff to come to the retreat. So how do you get to choose and decide when you want something to go to Executive Session and not? We can have a vote, but you don't get to make that decision. Mr. Chair. You don't get to decide what -- when we go into Executive Session or not, and you can't send me an e-mail telling me that no staff or nobody can come to this retreat afterwards and it's an open meeting. I'm not going to participate. I'm not going to violate the Open Meetings Act. So if that's what you're gone to do, you can do it by yourself, but you can't come in here and try to pick and decide what's gone be Executive Session and not, and who's going to be excluded, and when they're going to be excluded. This Board can decide, but no one individual can make that decision."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, may I finish, Commissioner? My ruling as Chair is that this is not eligible for Executive Session. I have to certify and the Clerk has to certify that the items that we discuss in Executive Session are eligible to be discussed in Executive Session. That's my ruling. The County Attorney is the Parliamentarian, not me as Chair. So Madam County Attorney, what's your opinion? Now, if the Board disagrees with me, disagrees with the County Attorney, you can take a vote, and by majority vote that will prevail."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Thank you, Mr. Chairman. While I understand Commissioner Arrington's concerns, and there has been an intimation of potential litigation, a potential litigation has to move from the realm of speculative and possible to real and tangible; and I believe in its current posture this particular item, especially is not at that juncture where we need to take it into Executive Session, especially as the threat of litigation is conditioned upon an action that is now being proposed in this item."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. Anything else on whether or not this should be discussed here? All right, it's 12:40. Just a minute."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Oh, yeah."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "I'm in the queue next, Chairman."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I didn't even -- I didn't make a point of order. I didn't even begin to talk about the timing."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Right. So I guess -- so on your point of order, it says no -- I'm ruling that it's not eligible for Executive Session. County Attorney, who is the Parliamentarian, has agreed."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So do we vote on that?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "If there's a motion to overrule, you can."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Oh, yes. So I make the motion to overrule you and the County Attorney. You're both wrong."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, is there a second?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I have a question."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Is there a second? All right, it fails for lack of a second. Commissioner Ellis, do you want to be heard?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Just a point of clarification: The item that we have before us is an urging Resolution. It does not actually affect --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- that's all it is."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "-- put anything into effect?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Correct."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Correct? All right, thanks."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It's an urging Resolution. Mr. Adams, what I'd ask you, if you would give us briefly -- you were asked at the last meeting to come back to us with whether or not assigning these -- whatever that number was, 20 plus employees to Judge Kirk, whether that was revenue neutral or not; and you've also done some preliminary work on a consolidated -- a consolidated situation. Can you briefly explain what you found so far?"

ALTON ADAMS, COO, FC PSS: "Well, Mr. Chairman, we are still in the process of doing the analysis. As I understand it, the question was a couple of things: one, what would be the cost of establishing a separate clerk function for Magistrate Court? And that analysis includes looking at the actual clerks as well as the administrative functions that would be required to support a stand-alone clerk for Magistrate Court. We're in the process of doing that analysis. We expect to have that completed by the second meeting in April. Initial analysis though would indicate that that would not be revenue neutral. It would, in fact, cost us a measurable sum. And so, we're in the process of finalizing that. The second question, as I understand it, is what are the benefits; how it will potentially work; and what would the potential cost savings be as well as other efficiencies if we were, in fact, to proceed with something like the Gwinnett model, which incorporates -- which has a consolidated administrative function as well as a single clerk. Not necessarily recommending that that would necessarily be the model that we would advise. Our initial analysis, however, indicates that if you look at some of the counties surrounding Fulton County and other counties in Georgia, there are very few that have a fully consolidated system; however, with the exception of one other county, there are none that have three separate clerk functions for Magistrate, State, and Superior Court. That having been said, as I understand it, it is your request to us and the Board's request in this particular request is to come back to you with some analyses, not necessarily with a recommendation, but to bring back some information that will help support that and that's where we are at this point in time. So we respectfully request that we have the time to finish the analysis and bring that back to the Board of Commissioners."

HONORABLE CASSANDRA KIRK: "Chairman Pitts, if I may be heard --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute."

HONORABLE CASSANDRA KIRK: "Yes, sir."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "No, no, no. Commissioner Arrington, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Okay. Thank you so much. I'm so glad that you guys had an opportunity to go visit Gwinnett one time. As a practicing attorney for the last 26 years, not only have I visited more than one time, I actually have had interactions with the Clerk of Gwinnett, the Clerk of Clayton, Cobb, DeKalb, Henry, Fayette -- the list goes on. I think I practiced in virtually every county, in this state over the last 26 years. Certainly, I want to echo what Judge Taylor said before. Certainly, in theory, the idea of a unified clerk makes sense: less resources, less people: someone who can serve three offices instead of one. That idea makes sense in theory. However, the reality -- the practicality is that these two people cannot work together. They've proven that they cannot work together, and they should be divorced. Now, the question becomes how do they get the divorce? My reading of the statute -- the statute is OCGA 1510.105 -- 1510.105A begins by saying, the General Assembly by local law -- let me repeat that again. The General Assembly, by local law, that's what 1510.105A says. That's not what Marvin Arrington says. That's what the law says. The General Assembly by local law. People, we are not the General Assembly. Colleagues, we are not the General Assembly. We do not have the ability to adopt a local law. We need to immediately urge the General Assembly to act on this today as soon as they can. This is urgent. This is a problem that's been existing for at least four years. So, I'm going to make a substitute motion that we add this to our legislative agenda and that we ask the General Assembly to adopt a local law pursuant to the statute so that we can have some clarity on this issue; and that is my motion."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Is there a second?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Second."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, properly moved and seconded. And I would strongly urge us not to approve this substitute motion. This is a Fulton County Board of Commissioners matter. We need to solve it --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "No, it is not. Ask the County Attorney."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please. Commissioner Arrington, please. Commissioner Hall. It's my opinion that we need to solve this matter here, and I don't want to go into everything that's been said, we all know. I just think it would be a terrible mistake, and I would not be supportive of asking the General Assembly."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Mr. Chair, I respect you --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- that's the motion that's before us."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- that is just -- you are absolutely wrong, and you're going to subject us to litigation."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's the motion --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- which is why we should have been in Executive Session."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's the motion that's before us. Any other discussion on the motion to ask the General assembly? Commissioner Hall."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes. Madam County Attorney, can you please weigh in? Did you see the e-mail from Clerk Tina Robinson?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I did. I had a chance to review those and, as to the General Assembly's ability to provide for the Magistrate Court's clerk's function, that is true that they may provide for that by local law. But in the absence of local law, the county authority -- the county governing authority, has the ability to designate, and that is a mechanism whereby --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "That's not true. That's not true."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute, Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "That's not true. It's inaccurate."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "May I finish?"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Please be accurate."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "That is the mechanism whereby the clerk's office function for the Magistrate Court was moved in 2016 from the State Court Clerk where it had been provided to the Superior Court Clerk with the consent of those two clerks. And while it was at the request of the Chief Magistrate Judge, it was within the authority of the Board of Commissioners and, therefore, it was by the Board of Commissioners' action in the absence of local law."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "And in absence of the Superior Court -- no, wait. No, the law is the law. No. It was also in the absence of the Superior Court clerk serving as the clerk of the Magistrate Court. The statute is clear. The language of the

statute is clear. It says that if the Superior Court clerk, 1510.105C, OCGA 1510.105C specifically states if the Superior Court --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Or the State Court Clerk is not serving. If those -- the Superior Court or State Court Clerk is not serving as the Magistrate Court as the clerk, then the governing authority --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "So you are inaccurate, ma'am, and I believe that you're doing it intentionally."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, you are out of order. Madam County Attorney, you still have the floor."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "That's not the first time."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "I believe it may be helpful if you indulge me to read the --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- plain language of the statute."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "The plain language of the statute."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes. I'm trying to read. So subsection C of OCGA 1510.105 which Commissioner Arrington is referring to says, if the clerk of the superior -- excuse me. If the clerk of the Superior Court or the Clerk of the State Court does not serve."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I know what it says."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "As the clerk -- may I please finish?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "I know it says that. That's what I just --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "After you lied about it."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Can she read the whole thing, please?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "If the clerk of the Superior Court or the clerk of the State Court does not serve as clerk of the Magistrate Court, then the county governing authority may provide for the appointment by the Chief Magistrate of a clerk to serve at the pleasure of the Chief Magistrate."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "That's what I said."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "That is not applicable to us, because we already have the Superior Court clerk serving as the Magistrate Court's clerk. So, we are actually under subsection B, which says with the consent of the Clerk of Superior Court, the county governing authority may provide that the Clerk of the Superior Court shall serve as Clerk of Magistrate Court and shall be compensated, and the rest is about compensation. So under that authority subsection B, in 2016, this Body appointed the Clerk of the Superior Court to serve as Clerk of the Magistrate Court and that is where we are now."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Right now, the Clerk of the Superior Court serves as the Clerk of the Magistrate Court. So section C is applicable, because it says if the --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- Commissioner Arrington."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "No. It --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute. All right, please."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- it's the clerk of Superior Court serving as the clerk of the Magistrate Court; yes or no?"

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "She --"

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "-- so if she is then we can act."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Yes."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Madam County Attorney, Commissioner Arrington, please. Commissioner Hall has the floor."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioners, you have an opinion from our County Attorney. You have an opinion from one of our colleagues who is an attorney. So be mindful. Commissioner Hall, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "And to that, I want to say I am being mindful, and this County Attorney, the one before that, and the one before that, and then for all who's been around for very long time know that I will consult you on the most minute of things and you say well, why? Because I will never go against what the County Attorney says, whether they are wrong or right. It is now in record what you just said, and I withdraw my second. But I ask this question: who are we urging to do what in this Resolution? Are we urging the State? It doesn't say. Who are we urging to do what? Because Commissioner Ellis brought it to the attention that this is just urging. It's not doing anything, but that."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's correct."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "That is correct. This Resolution, if adopted, would urge the stakeholders, which is the State Court -- the Magistrate and the Superior Court are already combined in their clerk function. It would urge the State Court and the Superior Court stakeholders to cooperate and agree upon a combination to benefit Fulton County. But may I please respond to the final thing that Commissioner Arrington asked me, was does the Clerk of Superior Court serve as Clerk of the Magistrate Court? The answer is, yes. And that is why subsection C does not apply, because it begins, if the Clerk of the Superior Court or the Clerk of the State Court does not serve as Clerk of the Magistrate Court; therefore, subsection C does not apply."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, thank you. Now --"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay, so --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- just a minute, just a minute."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "That is so inaccurate and so wrong."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Arrington, please. Here's where we are. The motion to ask the legislation to weigh in on this matter was made by Commissioner Arrington. It was seconded by Commissioner Hall. Commissioner Hall has withdrawn her second. Now, is there a second to Commissioner Arrington's motion? Is there a second? All right, his motion fails for lack of a second. Now back to the main motion."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I still had another question."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "You still have the floor."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: Excuse me; I'm in the queue next. I'm just trying to -- I know we got a lot going on, but I'm in the queue next, please."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, Commissioner Hall had the floor."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Yes, thank you. No, but this is based on -- okay, yes, sir. Yes, sir. You explain it. So, my other question is -- well, let me go back to when you answered my question about urging who and to do what. And you said urging the stakeholders who is the State Court and the Superior Court. Well, we just heard from -- and he's still here. We just heard from the Chief Judge of State Court, and he said, no. Just as clear as day; he said, no. So why are we urging him and his court to do anything when he just stood here and told you what his answer is? It's not you. It's not all you. I'm just speaking to this Resolution."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Yeah, but the Resolution is quite, I think clear, crystal clear. It just urges a move towards a consolidated court, and the preliminary research as reported by Mr. Adams says that there will be a tremendous cost-saving, number one, but more importantly, the efficiency and more important than that, it will put an end to this nonsense at every meeting, that's become an embarrassment to the two of them, but it's also now beginning to reflect on us."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "Okay. I'm throwing this over to Commissioner Khadijah, and I'm going back in the queue after her."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Wait, I'm still in the queue. I never got to speak on this motion. I'm still number one in the queue, right in front of everybody."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Just a minute. Just a minute. It's 12:56, ladies and gentlemen. Now, just a minute. The motion on the floor now is to approve. This is the lineup: Commissioner Arrington, Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, back to Commissioner Hall and Commissioner Ellis. The motion on the floor to approve this urging Resolution. Mr. Arrington, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER ARRINGTON, JR.: "Colleagues, I urge you not to adopt this Resolution. It makes no sense. We have two people that have proven that they cannot work together. Yes, in an ideal situation, we should have a consolidated court, but we have two parties that have stated, again have proven time and time again that they cannot work together, and so we are going to try to force them to work together? And put ourselves in legal jeopardy and risk being sued when the State can act? Wow. You know, hey. Y'all can do what you want to. I'm going to sleep good tonight. I know what we need to do. The plain language of the statute is clear. It says that if the clerk is -- the Clerk of Superior Court and State Court is not serving, then the county governing authority has the authority to act. That's in subsection -- subsection C. Subsection A starts out saying the General Assembly by local law, okay? So it's real clear. And, you

know, I don't know why our County Attorney has a different interpretation, but the plain language -- just read it for yourself. Read the plain language for yourself. It specifically states that if the Superior Court or State Court Clerk is not serving, then the governing authority of the county has the authority to act. That's what it says. That's not Marvin Arrington saying that. That's what the legislatures says. And so, the idea that we would try to force people to work together that don't want to work together that haven't been able to work together that are creating a backlog in our system -- see everybody -- I'm not trying to blame anybody. I don't want to blame the clerk. I don't want to blame the chief magistrate. I'm not trying to blame anybody. I'm trying to solve the problem. How do we fix this? The way to fix it is to allow them to have a divorce. What is the process by which we can allow them to have a divorce? Pursuant to the statute OCGA 1510.105, the General Assembly by local law does this, period. And for anybody to argue or say anything else is ludicrous."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay. All right, the motion on the floor is to approve. Commissioner Arrington has spoken against it. Let's address the motion on the floor. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, you have the floor."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Thank you. I think whatever we do nobody is going to be happy. And more importantly, when we're talking about urging -- we can say urging, but you can urge me to lose 20 pounds, but unless I give up them Krispy Kreme doughnuts, it ain't happening. So I say that, even though that chuckle may be needed, we heard the State Court when this was on the agenda, the State Court reached out to me. They have valid concerns. They came this morning and pretty much said from what I understand, please don't put us in the middle of this. And I think it behooves us to hold this and do what we need to do because at the end of the day, this did not just pop up overnight. This has been an ongoing issue. And now to say, okay, it's an ongoing issue and the answer -- yes, I want to make a motion to hold this."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Just a minute. Commissioner Abdur-Rahman has made a motion to hold. Commissioner Hall has seconded that motion. All right, any other comment on the motions discussed? The motion to hold. Now, if there are any comment, it's pretty clear: The motion to hold by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Hall. All right, let's vote on the motion to hold. You want to be heard, Vice Chair?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Well, I mean -- I don't know. Are we going to have Groundhog Day on the subject again? I mean even if we're holding it -- I mean, there's some folks up here that would like to express some thoughts while we're on this subject. Are you amenable to some brief commentary and for the folks that are in the queue?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "For the folks who are already in the queue?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: Well, we're running out of where we've actually past. How many people want to be heard?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Like go back to what we had in the queue?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "It was just two, right? Hall, Ellis, and Barrett. But the motion on the -- her motion is to hold."

COMMISSIONER ABDUR-RAHMAN: "Well, I wasn't quite through with my comments, but my motion is to hold, and considering that we do have a retreat, I'll just hold my comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you, Commissioner. All right, the motion on the floor is to hold. Commissioner Hall, you want to be heard?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I'm going to hold my comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Okay, Commissioner Ellis?"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "First off, Judge Kirk, could you leave the weld? This is not in order with our rules that we have people just come up here in the weld."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Kirk? Matter of fact -- Judge Kirk --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "-- thank you."

HONORABLE CASSANDRA KIRK: "Yes, but I do want to be heard --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "-- no, no, no."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Judge Kirk --"

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "We don't walk into your court room and sit, you know, just to appear like that. That's not appropriate."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "We're not going to put up with this at every meeting from her, every meeting."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Call the police in here we'll do it. You have the floor, Commissioner Ellis."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I've asked you to leave the weld area, please. Thank you."

HONORABLE CASSANDRA KIRK: "Yes, sir. I want to be heard."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner -- Judge Kirk. Judge Kirk. Judge Kirk. Judge Kirk. Judge Kirk."

HONORABLE CASSANDRA KIRK: "(off mic) it's unfortunate that I'm screaming from here. I'm an elected official to this court. You are stripping me of the ability to run this court. I will stand here because I have asked you and I want you to know that you are doing something that is improper and incorrect. I've told you all Cobb County has this in three separate courts. No one listens to me, because you all are just saying it's a black woman with a bad attitude. I'm going to stand here and wait. I have two more points to wait -- to make, and I will stand here and wait."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Ellis, you have the floor."

VICE CHAIRMAN ELLIS: "I think we need -- I think we need to wrap up today."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. The motion on the floor -- do you still want to be heard? The motion on the floor is to hold. Let's vote, please."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open on the motion to hold."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, it's your motion to hold. She already voted."

CLERK GRIER: "And the motion passes; five yeas, one nay."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Anything else we need to take today?"

CLERK GRIER: "Yes, on page 11. **23-0211**: City of Atlanta, Atlanta Public Schools Joint Committee. Commissioner Arrington has nominated Commissioner Hall as Fulton County's representative."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What is this? Quickly. Can somebody explain this rather quick? Thirty seconds."

COMMISSIONER HALL: "I can just tell you that I was contacted by the City Council that they were putting this in place and nominating me for the seat."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "To do what?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "It's just a seat on a joint school board committee for Atlanta Public Schools, that's all."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What's the purpose, do you know?"

COMMISSIONER HALL: "To just to review and establish --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- whatever it is, you got it. The motion is to approve. All right, let's vote. What? I'll second. Who? All right, let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes six yeas, zero nays."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Now, I'll entertain a motion to recess for lunch and Executive Session. We have a 40-minute lunch and Executive Session. We'll come back here and take care of any items that we need to from Executive Session and immediately adjourn and go to the Special Call Meeting."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes five yeas, zero nays."

(Back in Regular Session at 1:46 p.m.)

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Without objection, we will resume the regular order of business; items from Executive Session, Madam County Attorney."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Mr. Chairman, is there a motion to approve the settlement in the matter of Fulton County versus William Odrey, et al, regarding tax ID parcel numbers: 06-0367-001-1, Civil Action File No. 2020-CV-337327 in the amount of \$175,000?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Motion? So we ready on the screen? Is it ready or not? What are we getting ready to do? All right."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "Should I repeat the motion after we start?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "That's okay. They can record it. All right. Ready? All right. Need a motion to approve. All right, motion to approve by Commissioner Thorne, seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Let's vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes, unanimously."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "And is there a motion to approve the settlement set forth in item number 4 of the Executive Session agenda regarding Fulton County versus R. Freddie Stewart, Jr., et al, tax parcel ID number 14F-0143-LL-053-3, Civil Action File No. 2 -- 2017-CV-296455 in the amount of \$43,000?"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right, motion to approve by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman, seconded by Commissioner Barrett. Please vote."

CLERK GRIER: "And the vote is open. And the motion passes, unanimously."

Y. SOO JO, COUNTY ATTORNEY: "No further action items from Executive Session."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Anything else, Madam Clerk?"

CLERK GRIER: "Mr. Chairman, we had some public comment that we need to hear if they're still online."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. How many? Are they online now? Going once."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "They're still online."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "What did he say?"

CLERK GRIER: "They're still online."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Well, let's go. First person."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Okay. First person to speak is Robby Caban."

ROBBY CABAN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Greetings, Commissioners. Again, I'm here to request that you take action, responsible action for animal control. I am a Fulton County taxpayer. I am an Atlanta resident. As you know, multiple municipalities, given Commissioner Arrington stated he visited Palmetto, including Palmetto, no longer want to accept our Animal Control Officers due to the deficiencies in our animal control. Now, I've sat here all day listening to you and your conduct. And despite all of you, all of you, having received six whistleblower statements executed where the CEO of our Fulton County vendor Lifeline, told you they were old and they are time stamped. You received that, you received corroborating witnesses, you received several comments from the public that were not allowed to be released, which appears to be some form of censorship despite time allotted. And you still have not called for an independent audit. In fact today on Zoom, a whistleblower, one of the six whistleblowers of many, include -- not including myself, wanted to give you commentary and she has also emailed you. And I heard Commissioner Rahman say that she's received emails about Fulton County and Animal Control and animals being euthanized and finding facts. In fact, I found that was fascinating, because in the other cases, the facts seem pertinent. But here in this case, Commissioner Rahman didn't even have the courtesy to respond to an email that she received. Instead what Commissioners are doing, Hall, Arrington, and others, are blocking and censoring their own constituents in Fulton County, including myself. And

to Commissioner Arrington's point, as an attorney, practicing attorney, separate from his position here in the Commission --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

ROBBY CABAN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- do you know what a dereliction of duty is? Please call for an independent audit. Safety is imperative. If you're discussing black and brown communities, we are not receiving the services --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next speaker."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "The next person to speak is Kevin Muldowney."

KEVIN MULDOWNEY, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good afternoon, Commissioners. To beat up Commissioner Thorne and dress her down with clearly racist comments, such as white privilege, is disgraceful. For a hospital to exist, they must have a path to pay for the care they provide. Bringing in a highly partisan DOJ to solve the problem will only compound the problem. Once again, dressing down a fellow Commissioner with racist comments should never happen. Commissioner Arrington, if you rec -- if someone responded to you with the comment, that's what you all say, you would have blown a gasket. We are all created equal regardless of race. And we all expect respect. Thank you."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Next speaker."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Next person to speak is Amanda Brennan. Amanda Brennan."

AMANDA BRENNAN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Hi, my name is Mandy Jo Brennan and I worked at Fulton County Animal Services for three years. I emailed all of you on February 27, 2023, advising that I resigned from my supervisor position in February 2023 due to the abuses and corruption throughout Fulton County Animal Control operations. As a mandated reporter and a supervisor, I felt complicit in the abuse, malfeasance, and corruption that were not corrected. My attempts to report abuse and criminal activity to Animal Control in Fulton County vendor Lifeline leaders have resulted in harassment and retaliation. The problems include, but are not limited to, a toxic, non-transparent regulatory corporate work culture mismanagement impacting the totality of Animal Control operational performance, animal abuse, neglect, and exploitation, at times, leading to the avoidable deaths of animals; Fulton County Animal Control Officers who carry illegal firearms, sell drugs out of the Fulton County trucks; Animal Control Officers improperly handling cases of abuse, theft of hours; Fulton County employees reporting to work under the influence, vendors lack of drug testing, substandard training, substandard oversight, lack of safety equipment, lack of adherence to violation to the county contract, failure to quarantine bite dogs, per the CDC requirements. After over

three years of employment at Fulton County, I can continue highlighting the deficiencies and current dangerous conditions because that leads to solutions. There are solutions that I am willing to provide to help you, as I have done with the county vendor Lifeline multiple times. However, I only have two minutes with you today; all of you will receive an additional email from me today with my contact information. I'm happy to brief you and your team on the overall Fulton County Animal Control operations and comprehensive solutions to get our county taxpayers funding contract compliant and our community safer. An independent audit is needed --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "-- 15 seconds."

AMANDA BRENNAN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "-- the other whistleblower statements, they are accurate. My passion and career for over a decade is animal welfare and humane law. Other Fulton County Animal Control Officers employees have resigned and were targeted for the same reason. No Fulton County employee or County operation should be subjected to hostile, unsafe, hectic work environment."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you."

AMANDA BRENNAN, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "The public --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Thank you. Next speaker."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Next person to speak is Ben Howard."

BEN HOWARD, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Greetings, one and all, Ben Howard, Senior Advocate, Public Policy Analyst. Seniors and friends of senior citizens, think about this, each member of the Fulton County Commission can appoint one representative to the Fulton County Commission on Elder Affairs. That representative has one vote on the Commission on Elder Affairs Board of Directors. Contrary to Commissioners voting by the way of ordinance 230-0051, the Office of Aging Management has allowed the Atlanta Housing Authority to have two votes. As a meeting of the Commission on Elder Affairs has been coming pretty soon to the Board of Commissioners, may be a request that each organization have just one vote, not two. Stay tuned."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "The next person to speak is Matt Rowenczak. Matt Rowenczak."

MATT ROWENCZAK, PUBLIC SPEAKER: "Good afternoon, Commissioners. I'll keep my words brief. I'm extremely disturbed by today's meeting. That's an understatement. To you -- for two of the Commissioners, instead of having a debate and a disagreement and, you know, even if it's a heated argument, to use the words, white privilege is disgusting. What it truly is, is, it's intellectual laziness. Instead of making your points, you resort to emotional attacks and name calling. We had a proclamation this morning with a Rabbi talking about morals and ethics, asking us all to achieve, you know, a

greater standard in terms of being more ethical, yet the County Commission today, didn't heed its own advice and behaved like wild animals. Heed your own advice, don't get intellectually lazy, and make your points. It is incredibly disturbing today. And Commissioner Arrington, you mentioned Tyree in the Memphis shooting, well, those officers were black. So let's use our brains and make arguments, even if they are heated disagreements. Heed you own advice. Thank you."

RICO DOLLAR, EXTERNAL AFFAIRS: "Next person to speak is Andi Stein. Andi Stein. Okay. The next person to speak is Caren Solomon. Okay. The next person to speak is R. Harris. R Harris. R. Harris. Okay. The next person to speak is William Swearingen. William Swearingen. That being said, that concludes the Zoom public comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Anything else?"

CLERK GRIER: "We have some email-in comments."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "Anything else?"

CLERK GRIER: "No further speakers. We'll forward those."

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. Any other matters to come before us?"

CLERK GRIER: "No further --"

CHAIRMAN PITTS: "All right. No further business before us today, we are adjourned. Thank you."

(There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:00 p.m.)